

# CITY OF YORK LOCAL PLAN

## Consultation Statement

Regulation 22(c) of the Town & Country  
Planning (Local Planning) (England)  
Regulations 2012 (as amended)

Annex 22: Schedule of  
Representations in Policy Order  
May 2018



**CITY OF YORK LOCAL PLAN**  
**Consultation Statement**  
**Regulation 22(c) of the Town & Country Planning (Local Planning) (England)**  
**Regulations 2012 (as amended)**

**Annex 22:**  
**Schedule of Representations in Policy Order**

<b>Policy/Site</b>	<b>Policy Name</b>	<b>Local Plan Document</b>	<b>Policies Map</b>	<b>SA/SEA</b>
Policy DP1	York Sub Area	Page 1	N/A	N/A
Policy DP2	Sustainable Development	Page 9	N/A	N/A
Policy DP3	Sustainable Communities	Page 12	N/A	N/A
Policy DP4	Approach to Development Management	Page 15	N/A	N/A
Policy SS1	Delivering Sustainable Growth for York	Page 16	Page 662	N/A
Policy SS2	The Role of York's Green Belt	Page 63	Page 663	Page 723
Policy SS3	York City Centre	Page 88	N/A	N/A
Policy SS4	York Central	Page 91	N/A	Page 724
Policy SS5	Castle Gateway	Page 101	Page 665	N/A
Policy SS6	British Sugar/Manor School	Page 107	N/A	N/A
Policy SS7	Civil Service Sports Ground	Page 113	N/A	N/A
Policy SS8	Land Adjacent to Hull Road	Page 117	Page 666	N/A
Policy SS9	Land East of Metcalfe Lane	Page 119	N/A	Page 725
Policy SS10	Land North of Monks Cross	Page 124	Page 667	Page 726
Policy SS11	Land North of Haxby	Page 129	Page 668	Page 727
Policy SS12	Land West of Wigginton Road	Page 145	Page 669	Page 728
Policy SS13	Land West of Elvington Lane	Page 154	Page 670	Page 729
Policy SS14	Terry's Extension Sites	Page 185	N/A	N/A
Policy SS15	Nestle South	Page 188	N/A	N/A
Policy SS16	Land at Tadcaster Road, Copmanthorpe	Page 189	N/A	Page 732
Policy SS17	Hungate	Page 194	N/A	N/A
Policy SS18	Station Yard, Wheldrake	Page 196	N/A	Page 733
Policy SS19	Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall	Page 200	Page 671	Page 734
Policy SS20	Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road	Page 210	Page 672	Page 735
Policy SS21	Land South of Airfield Business Park, Elvington	Page 216	N/A	N/A
Policy SS22	University of York Expansion	Page 220	Page 673	Page 737
Policy SS23	Land at Northminster Business Park	Page 225	N/A	Page 738
Policy SS24	Whitehall Grange, Wigginton Road	Page 228	N/A	Page 739
Policy EC1	Provision of Employment Land	Page 229	Page 674	N/A



**CITY OF YORK LOCAL PLAN**  
**Consultation Statement**  
**Regulation 22(c) of the Town & Country Planning (Local Planning) (England)**  
**Regulations 2012 (as amended)**

<b>Policy/Site</b>	<b>Policy Name</b>	<b>Local Plan Document</b>	<b>Policies Map</b>	<b>SA/SEA</b>
	E8: Wheldrake Industrial Estate	Page 236	N/A	N/A
	E9: Elvington Industrial Estate	Page 237	N/A	N/A
	E10: Chessingham Park, Dunnington	No representations received		
	E11: Annamine Nurseries, Jockey Lane	Page 238	N/A	N/A
	E16: Poppleton Garden Centre	Page 239	Page 675	Page 740
	E18: Towthorpe Lines, Strensall	Page 240	Page 676	Page 741
Policy EC2	Loss of Employment Land	Page 241	N/A	N/A
Policy EC3	Business and Industrial Uses within Residential Areas	Page 242	N/A	N/A
Policy EC4	Tourism	Page 243	N/A	N/A
Policy EC5	Rural Economy	Page 245	N/A	N/A
Policy R1	Retail Hierarchy and Sequential Approach	Page 247	N/A	N/A
Policy R2	District and Local Centres and Neighbourhood Parades	N/A	N/A	N/A
Policy R3	York City Centre Retail	N/A	N/A	N/A
Policy R4	Out of Centre Retailing	Page 249	Page 677	N/A
Policy H1	Housing Allocations	Page 251	N/A	Page 743
	H1 Former Gas Works, Heworth Green (Phase 1)	Page 275	N/A	N/A
	H1 Former Gas works, Heworth Green (Phase 2)	No representations received		
	H3 Burnholme School	No representations received		
	H5 Lowfield School	Page 276	N/A	N/A
	H6 Land R/O The Square, Tadcaster Road	Page 277	N/A	N/A
	H7 Bootham Crescent	Page 279	N/A	N/A
	H8 Askham Bar Park & Ride	N/A	N/A	N/A
	H10 The Barbican	Page 280	N/A	N/A
	H20 Former Oakhaven EPH	N/A	N/A	N/A
	H22 Former Heworth Lighthouse	N/A	N/A	N/A
	H23 Former Grove House	N/A	N/A	N/A
	H29 Land at Moor Lane,	Page 281	N/A	N/A



**CITY OF YORK LOCAL PLAN**  
**Consultation Statement**  
**Regulation 22(c) of the Town & Country Planning (Local Planning) (England)**  
**Regulations 2012 (as amended)**

<b>Policy/Site</b>	<b>Policy Name</b>	<b>Local Plan Document</b>	<b>Policies Map</b>	<b>SA/SEA</b>
	Copmanthorpe			
	H31 Eastfield Lane, Dunnington	Page 285	N/A	N/A
	H38 Land RO Rufforth Primary School	Page 287	N/A	N/A
	H39 North of Church Lane Elvington	Page 288	N/A	Page 744
	H46 Land to North of Willow Bank and East of Haxby Road, New Earswick	Page 300	N/A	N/A
	H52 Willow House EPH	Page 302	N/A	N/A
	H53 Land at Knapton Village	Page 303	N/A	N/A
	H55 Land at Layerthorpe	N/A	N/A	N/A
	H56 Land at Hull Road	Page 305	N/A	Page 746
	H58 Clifton Without Primary School	Page 306	N/A	N/A
	H59 Queen Elizabeth Barracks	Page 307	N/A	Page 747
Policy H2	Density of Residential Development	Page 308	N/A	N/A
Policy H3	Balancing the Housing Market	Page 316	N/A	N/A
Policy H4	Promoting Self and Custom House Building	Page 328	N/A	N/A
Policy H5	Gypsies and Travellers	Page 332	N/A	N/A
Policy H6	Travelling Showpeople	Page 338	N/A	N/A
	SP1 The Stables, Elvington	Page 340	N/A	N/A
Policy H7	Student Housing	Page 345	N/A	N/A
	SH1 Land at Heworth Croft	N/A	N/A	N/A
Policy H8	Houses in Multiple Occupation	Page 349	N/A	N/A
Policy H9	Older Persons Specialist Housing	Page 350	N/A	N/A
Policy H10	Affordable Housing	Page 355	N/A	N/A
Policy HW1	Protecting Existing Facilities	Page 360	N/A	N/A
Policy HW2	New Community Facilities	Page 362	N/A	N/A
Policy HW3	Built Sport Facilities	Page 367	N/A	N/A
Policy HW4	Childcare Provision	Page 371	N/A	N/A
Policy HW5	Healthcare Services	Page 375	N/A	N/A
	HC1 Extension of York Hospital Site	N/A	N/A	N/A
	HC2 Haxby Road Site	N/A	N/A	N/A
Policy HW6	Emergency Services	Page 378	N/A	N/A
Policy HW7	Healthy Places	Page 381	N/A	N/A

**CITY OF YORK LOCAL PLAN**  
**Consultation Statement**  
**Regulation 22(c) of the Town & Country Planning (Local Planning) (England)**  
**Regulations 2012 (as amended)**

<b>Policy/Site</b>	<b>Policy Name</b>	<b>Local Plan Document</b>	<b>Policies Map</b>	<b>SA/SEA</b>
Policy ED1	University of York	Page 385	N/A	N/A
Policy ED2	Campus West	Page 387	N/A	N/A
Policy ED3	Campus East	Page 388	N/A	N/A
Policy ED4	York St. John University Lord Mayor's Walk Campus	Page 390	N/A	N/A
Policy ED5	York St. John University Further Expansion	N/A	N/A	N/A
Policy ED6	Preschool, Primary and Secondary Education	Page 391	N/A	N/A
Policy ED7	York College and Askham Bryan College	Page 394	Page 680	N/A
Policy ED8	Community Access to Sports and Cultural Facilities on Education Sites	Page 397	N/A	N/A
Policy D1	Placemaking	Page 399	N/A	N/A
Policy D2	Landscape and Setting	Page 401	N/A	N/A
Policy D3	Cultural Provision	Page 404	N/A	N/A
Policy D4	Conservation Areas	Page 406	N/A	N/A
Policy D5	Listed Buildings	Page 408	N/A	N/A
Policy D6	Archaeology	Page 410	N/A	N/A
Policy D7	The Significance of Non- Designated Heritage Assets	Page 412	N/A	N/A
Policy D8	Historic Parks and Gardens	Page 414	N/A	N/A
Policy D9	City of York Historic Environment Record	Page 415	N/A	N/A
Policy D10	York City Walls and St. Mary's Abbey Walls (‘York Walls’)	Page 416	N/A	N/A
Policy D11	Extensions and Alterations to Existing Buildings	Page 417	N/A	N/A
Policy D12	Shopfronts	Page 418	N/A	N/A
Policy D13	Advertisements	Page 419	N/A	N/A
Policy D14	Security Shutters	Page 420	N/A	N/A
Policy GI1	Green Infrastructure	Page 421	Page 681	N/A
Policy GI2	Biodiversity and Access to Nature	Page 424	N/A	N/A
Policy GI3	Green Infrastructure Network	Page 428	N/A	N/A
Policy GI4	Trees and Hedgerows	Page 431	N/A	N/A
Policy GI5	Protection of Open Space	Page 434	Page 682	Page 748

**CITY OF YORK LOCAL PLAN**  
**Consultation Statement**  
**Regulation 22(c) of the Town & Country Planning (Local Planning) (England)**  
**Regulations 2012 (as amended)**

<b>Policy/Site</b>	<b>Policy Name</b>	<b>Local Plan Document</b>	<b>Policies Map</b>	<b>SA/SEA</b>
	and Playing Fields			
Policy GI6	New Open Space Provision	Page 439	N/A	N/A
Policy GI7	Burial and Memorial Grounds	Page 446	N/A	N/A
Policy GB1	Development in the Green Belt	Page 447	N/A	N/A
Policy GB2	Development in Settlements within the Green Belt	Page 451	N/A	N/A
Policy GB3	Reuse of Buildings	Page 452	N/A	N/A
Policy GB4	'Exception' Sites for Affordable Housing in the Green Belt	Page 453	N/A	N/A
Policy CC1	Renewable and Low Carbon Energy Generation and Storage	Page 454	N/A	N/A
Policy CC2	Sustainable Design and Construction of New Development	Page 459	N/A	N/A
Policy CC3	District Heating and Combined Heat and Power Networks	Page 465	N/A	N/A
Policy ENV1	Air Quality	Page 469	N/A	N/A
Policy ENV2	Managing Environmental Quality	Page 472	N/A	N/A
Policy ENV3	Land Contamination	Page 473	N/A	N/A
Policy ENV4	Flood Risk	Page 474	N/A	N/A
Policy ENV5	Sustainable Drainage	Page 477	N/A	N/A
Policy WM1	Sustainable Waste Management	Page 480	N/A	N/A
Policy WM2	Sustainable Minerals Management	Page 481	N/A	N/A
Policy T1	Sustainable Access	Page 482	N/A	N/A
Policy T2	Strategic Public Transport Improvements	Page 488	Page 683	N/A
Policy T3	York Railway Station and Associated Operational Facilities	Page 499	N/A	N/A
Policy T4	Strategic Highway Network Capacity Improvements	Page 502	Page 684	N/A



**CITY OF YORK LOCAL PLAN**  
**Consultation Statement**  
**Regulation 22(c) of the Town & Country Planning (Local Planning) (England)**  
**Regulations 2012 (as amended)**

<b>Policy/Site</b>	<b>Policy Name</b>	<b>Local Plan Document</b>	<b>Policies Map</b>	<b>SA/SEA</b>
Policy T5	Strategic Cycle and Pedestrian Network Links and Improvements	Page 510	N/A	N/A
Policy T6	Development at or Near Public Transport Corridors, Interchanges and Facilities	Page 516	N/A	N/A
Policy T7	Minimising and Accommodating Generated Trips	Page 519	N/A	N/A
Policy T8	Demand Management	Page 523	N/A	N/A
Policy T9	Alternative Fuel Fuelling Stations and Freight Consolidation Centres	Page 528	N/A	N/A
Policy C1	Communications Infrastructure	Page 532	N/A	N/A
Policy DM1	Infrastructure and Developer Contributions	Page 535	N/A	N/A
Gen	General Comments	Page 540	Page 685	Page 749
ALT	Alternative Sites	Page 643	N/A	N/A

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP1 York Sub Area

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID119/LC/DP1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	As discussed in our recent meeting, section 2.14 on Page 19 of the Local Plan Document does refer to an aspiration to achieve some of the aims of the Water Framework Directive. As discussed, it is still our view that specific policy wording should be present in the plan to require developers to meet the requirements of the WFD. It was discussed that wording could be added to Policy DP2. As it currently stands, if you incorporate some appropriate policy wording into your plan, we would have no reason to find the plan unsound for lack of consideration of WFD, however, if this wording is not incorporated then we would have to consider the plan unsound. Rep goes on to provide examples of wording which would be appropriate to meet the requirement to address the WFD. Also provides further information on Duty to Cooperate. (Please don't be too alarmed by the fact that we have consider the plan unsound. This is related to the fact that the plan does not currently contain an appropriate WFD policy. We discussed in our recent meeting that this will be included. Once an appropriate policy is included, we should be in a position to fully support your plan.)	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID378/LC/DP1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

#### Soundness

SID61/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	pg.20 Background affordable transport links - second bullet point, the word safe should be inserted between strategic and cycling. Final bullet point should refer to increasing park and ride schemes on the roads from wigginton and Haxby to the city.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/DP1/2		Not Sound	pg.21 Background viii What is the focal point reference of the city centre? Where is the measurement of 6 miles taken from?	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID118/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	In view of the fact that the natural environment is already adequately addressed in Criterion vii, it would be far simpler (and more accurate) if Criterion vi simply dealt with the historic environment. The historic environment also makes a significant contribution to the quality of life enjoyed by the City's communities and in making York such an attractive, distinctive place. These elements should also be recognised within this Policy. York's historic environment plays such a key role in the economic well-being of the City, in the quality of life enjoyed by its communities, and in making York such an attractive, distinctive place, that the conservation and enhancement of the City's heritage assets should be the starting point for any Development Strategy for this City.	Historic England - Ian Smith

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP1 York Sub Area

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	In view of the fact that the natural environment is already adequately addressed in Criterion vii, it would be far simpler (and more accurate) if Criterion vi simply dealt with the historic environment. The historic environment also makes a significant contribution to the quality of life enjoyed by the City's communities and in making York such an attractive, distinctive place. These elements should also be recognised within this Policy. York's historic environment plays such a key role in the economic well-being of the City, in the quality of life enjoyed by its communities, and in making York such an attractive, distinctive place, that the conservation and enhancement of the City's heritage assets should be the starting point for any Development Strategy for this City.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/DP1/2		Sound	Policy DP1, criterion viii and iii are sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/DP1/2		Sound	Policy DP1, criterion viii and iii are sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID165/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	Plan states its intention is to meet the development requirements of the city in full within the local authority area, it appears CYC have taken this policy position by default without any detailed consideration of the impacts doing so will have on the setting and special character of the city. This is contrary to national policy. The NPPF sets out a two-stage approach. The first stage is to assess what are the development needs of the City. CoYC has done this in its SHMA and ELR. The second stage is to assess the impacts of meeting these needs and deciding whether the impacts are acceptable or not. There is no documentary evidence that CoYC has carried out this second stage exercise. If it had done so properly, the Council may have taken a different decision about fully meeting needs. NPPF paragraph 14 states: "Local Plans should meet objectively assessed needs, with sufficient flexibility to adapt to rapid change unless: • any adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits when assessed against the policies in this Framework taken as a whole; or • specific policies in this Framework indicate that development should be restricted." Similar guidance for housing is provided at paragraph 47 of the Framework.	Richard Frost
SID165/S/DP1/2		Not Sound	On the first point - the cumulative impact of the developments proposed will greatly harm the open land setting of the city and additional traffic generated will make York a much less attractive place to live, work and visit. On the second - Green Belt is one of the specific policies of the Framework which is referred to by NPPF paragraph 14 (Footnote 9). Paragraph 79 makes clear the "great importance" which the Government attaches to Green Belts. If the level of land release required to meet development needs in full would be such as to undermine one or more of the five purposes of Green Belt as set in NPPF paragraph 80 (which, for emphasis, includes preserving the setting and special character of historic towns such as York), it would conflict with national Green Belt policy and so trigger the second exception set out in NPPF paragraph 14.	Richard Frost



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP1 York Sub Area

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID181/S/DP1/1			Objection is made to policies DP1 and DP2, not as a matter of principle but because of the failure of the Plan to meet the current and future needs of the population for the reasons explained.	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments
SID199/S/DP1/1			ST14 will create urban extension and breach existing green break. Objective vii will not be fulfilled through ST14 due to green belt not protecting special character of the city. Development would also be contrary to Objective ix) as it would exacerbate the poor conditions on the road network.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison
SID231/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	FPC considers that the Local Plan should be based on an OAHN of 706 dwellings per annum for the plan period to reduce harm to city. Provides no evidence that the plan is assessing the impact of meeting housing needs in accordance with the NPPF.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID318/S/DP1/1			Support of Policy DP1. Will ensure Green Belt will be specified and legally identified for the life of the plan.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID339/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	The aims of this policy is to ensure that the City of York functions within its role in the Leeds City region, and sets out a series of criterion as to how this will be achieved. Part iii of the policy states the following – “the housing need of City of York’s current and future population including that arising from economic and institutional growth is met within the York local authority area”. Whilst our Client welcomes the Council’s intention to deliver the housing needs within the authority, they object to the fact that the Council are not planning for the full objectively assessed need (OAN), which is set out in their own evidence base and subsequently DCLGs standardised housing methodology. As such, the Council will fail to meet the aims of part iii as currently drafted.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID357/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	We support these development principles set out in Policy DP1.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP1 York Sub Area

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID372/S/DP1/1		Sound	Gladman reiterate support for Policy DP1, especially the recognition set out in clause (i) that York will fulfil its role as a key economic driver within both the Leeds City region and the York, North Yorkshire and East Riding LEP area. Gladman also strongly support clause (iii) which states that the Local Plan will seek to meet the housing needs of current and future population including that arising from economic and institutional growth	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID378/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	It is recognised by CYC that in order to meet the development needs of the City, a new settlement is needed in the south east part of CYC's administrative boundary. For clarification Policy DP1 should refer to this new settlement.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID418/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	The wording of part viii is problematic. The words "historic city" should be replaced with 'City of York' to avoid confusion stemming from geographical areas defined in the heritage topic paper. This policy must apply equally to all of the plan area and not just to the area inside the city walls. The RSS revocation order required that detailed boundaries were drawn up in the Local Plan for both the inner boundary and the outer boundary of the Green Belt. The present plan provides a detailed inner boundary but does not provide a detailed outer boundary. If the inner and outer boundaries are defined with differing levels of precision it will lead to a fundamental unfairness. This will prioritise the removal of land from along the inner boundary without consideration of all reasonable alternatives, including land along the outer boundary. In setting the Green Belt boundaries, the Local Authority must have regard to the openness and the permanence of the Green Belt and ensure the boundaries will endure beyond the plan period. If the issue of the precise outer boundary of the Green Belt is not addressed by this Local Plan it will remain to be addressed by the next Local Plan. This will require a revision of the outer boundary. As such the Publication Draft Green Belt boundary can not be expected to endure beyond the plan period.	Save Windmill Lane Playing Fields - Chris Wedgwood
SID590/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	Policy DP1 sets the aim for York to fulfil its role as a key economic driver within both the Leeds City Region and the North Yorkshire and East Riding Sub-Region, but then sets out restrictive policies on employment and housing land provision that do not reflect this ambition and will hinder its implementation.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID590/S/DP1/2		Not Sound	The analysis presented in the Background and Vision Chapter is somewhat confusing and contradictory. For example, paragraph 1.24 starts by saying the City is in good shape, offering a superb quality of life to residents. But paragraph 1.31 then highlights that on the index of Multiple Deprivation 2015, the ranking indicates that the City as a whole has become more deprived.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP1 York Sub Area

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID590/S/DP1/3		Not Sound	The Background and Vision acknowledges the importance of the City's two Universities to the City's economic strength but later fails to allocate the land the University of York says it requires to accommodate its future growth.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID590/S/DP1/4		Not Sound	The Background and Vision explains that because of uncertainties in long term economic forecasting the Plan takes a cautious approach using the baseline forecast to inform the employment land requirements of the Plan. The Chamber fundamentallydisagrees with this cautious approach	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID603/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	Support aim for meeting housing needs of city, however housing target is politicised matter not backed by the evidence base, and maintain that significant weight should be given to the OAN methodology.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited
SID604/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	The Plan will not effectively meet the development principles of Policy DP1 aims, as set out above. It is well documented that the housing target set out within the publication Plan is notappropriately justified and should be increased to seek to meet the housing needs and economic growth in the area	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID605/S/DP1/1		Not Sound		Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Mr D Lancaster & Oakwood Business Park
SID609/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	The current plan fails to provide enough housing and particular affordable / social housing for the future, falling massively short of the minimum overall 1070 homes per year requirement the Government's draft 2017 proposals.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP1 York Sub Area

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID836/S/DP1/1			No justification for extending Green Belt to include Wheldrake.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO REV Sir T Forbes Adams Combined
SID61/S/DP1/1		Not Sound	pg.20 Background affordable transport links - second bullet point, the word safe should be inserted between strategic and cycling. Final bullet point should refer to increasing park and ride schemes on the roads from wigginton and Haxby to the city.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/DP1/2		Not Sound	pg.21 Background viii What is the focal point reference of the city centre? Where is the measurement of 6 miles taken from?	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID118/MOD/DP1/1			In view of the fact that the natural environment is already adequately addressed in Criterion vii, it would be far simpler (and more accurate) if Criterion vi simply dealt with the historic environment. Therefore amend:(a) Policy DP1 move Criterion vi to the beginning of the list of Criteria(b) Amend Policy DP1 Criterion vi to read:- "The City of York's outstanding historic environment will be conserved and, where appropriate, enhanced recognising its important contribution to the economic well fare of area, to the quality of life enjoyed by the City's communities and in making York such an attractive, distinctive place"	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/DP1/1			In view of the fact that the natural environment is already adequately addressed in Criterion vii, it would be far simpler (and more accurate) if Criterion vi simply dealt with the historic environment. Therefore amend:(a) Policy DP1 move Criterion vi to the beginning of the list of Criteria(b) Amend Policy DP1 Criterion vi to read:- "The City of York's outstanding historic environment will be conserved and, where appropriate, enhanced recognising its important contribution to the economic well fare of area, to the quality of life enjoyed by the City's communities and in making York such an attractive, distinctive place"	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID165/Mod/DP1/1			Local Plan development requirements should be reduced to levels that would not cause significant harm to the setting and special character of the City or its environment more generally, but meet the housing growth of 706pa as demonstrated in my comments about objectively assessing housing needs. Such a reduction would be fully in line with NPPF paragraph 14.	Richard Frost
SID360/Mod/DP1/1			We welcome the commitment set out in Policy SS1, in particular that 'Development within the City of York area will not lead to environmental problems... And transport congestion for adjacent local authority areas.'	North Yorkshire Country Council - Tricia Richards

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP1 York Sub Area

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/Mod/DP1/1			Change point iii of DP1 to read: "The housing needs of City of York's current and future population including that arising from economic and institutional growth is met within the York local authority area. Housing needs will, in part, be met through the creation of a new garden village (ST15) in the south east of York."	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID850/Mod/DP1/1			The Plan lacks a recognition that the scale of traffic growth on the A64 trunk road and its junctions with local primary roads will require physical mitigation in the form of investment in highway infrastructure in addition to extensive sustainable travel proposals. Policy DP1 York Sub Area does not refer to York's position on the SRN and the importance of improving connectivity in the York Sub Area, exemplified by the recent announcement of West Yorkshire Transport Funding for junction improvements along the A1237.	Highways England

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP2 Sustainable Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID42/S/DP2/1		Sound	A city such as York with all its historic buildings and heritage must have a proper, workable Local Plan in place. It is imperative to provide for all the requirements of the next generations.	Brian McClure
SID61/S/DP2/1		Not Sound	Sustainable Development. Needs clear articulation that every effort will be made to reduce likelihood of homes flooding by ensuring a proper survey is conducted on evidence over the past 10 years with increased climate change. Fundamental shift in travel to work - how will proposal be implemented (all buses free/electric?)	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID94/S/DP2/1		Not Sound	Plan does not prioritise brownfield land. Council is too quick to bend to developers wishes and build on the green belt. Transport network is particularly poor to the north of the city on the A1237. Schools are full to bursting.	Steven Davenport
SID119/S/DP2/1		Sound	pleased to see that you have incorporated our suggestion to add text to this policy to ensure the remediation of polluted land/groundwater and the protection of groundwater	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID153/S/DP2/1		Not Sound	policy fails in its stated aims of encouraging the development of renewable energy by not identifying sites that are suitable for renewable energy. The plan is not consistent with national policy, as it does not reflect the strong support for renewable energy contained in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF). Paragraph 94 of the NPPF states that local planning authorities should adopt proactive strategies to mitigate climate change.	York Community Energy - Kit Bennett
SID181/S/DP2/1			Objection is made to policies DP1 and DP2, not as a matter of principle but because of the failure of the Plan to meet the current and future needs of the population for the reasons explained.	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments
SID231/S/DP2/1		Not Sound	FPC considers that the Local Plan should be based on an OAHN of 706 dwellings per annum for the plan period to reduce harm to city. Provides no evidence that the plan is assessing the impact of meeting housing needs in accordance with the NPPF.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP2 Sustainable Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID339/S/DP2/1		Not Sound	Part ii of this policy states that the Council will ensure that development will help provide good quality homes and opportunities through “addressing the housing and community needs of York’s current and future population”. Our Client objects to this part of the policy as it is not positively prepared and is therefore unsound, as the Council are not planning for the full OAN, a point which we have made throughout our previous representations and which is backed up by the Council’s own evidence base, the DCLG standardised housing methodology, as well as Barton Willmore’s critique of the Council’s OAN. As such the Council are not addressing the housing needs of York’s current and future population.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID351/S/DP2/1			Policy DP2 seeks to safeguard and enhance “the established retail hierarchy, the city centre, district, local and neighbourhood centres, while ensuring out of centre retailing is controlled”. The supporting text should clarify that this measure of control is not intended to prevent appropriate expansion at the YDO (para 4.39).	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID355/S/DP2/1		Sound	With regard to the tourist, culture and leisure policies referred to in our previous representations (Policies DP2, EC4 and D3), we are pleased to see that our proposed alterations to the policies have been incorporated into the Publication Draft Local Plan. On this basis, we support these Local Plan policies, consider the Plan sound insofar as it relates to the these policies and request that these policies are adopted in their proposed form.	National Railway Museum - Judith McNicol
SID357/S/DP2/1		Not Sound	We support this part of Policy DP2 and agree that development should only be supported in acceptable locations	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID372/S/DP2/1		Sound	Gladman support Policy DP2 of the CYLP and in particular the recognition that the Plan will address the housing and community needs of York’s current and future population.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID419/S/DP2/1		Not Sound	Each of the Strategic Housing Sites identifies the need to provide appropriate connectivity and access in and around the site, however we feel that the appropriate hierarchy of needs is not effectively clear or present in this identification. Each Strategic Housing Site includes a paragraph as a variation of ‘Optimise integration, connectivity and access through the provision of new pedestrian, cycle, public transport and vehicular routes to ensure sustainable movement into, out of and through the site’, however this gives equal weighting to all transport modes. This goes against paragraph 35 of the NPPF on promoting sustainable transport and creating safe layouts.	York Cycle Campaign

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP2 Sustainable Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID609/S/DP2/1		Not Sound	The current plan fails to provide enough housing and particular affordable / social housing for the future, falling massively short of the minimum overall 1070 homes per year requirement the Government's draft 2017 proposals.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID61/S/DP2/1		Not Sound	Sustainable Development. Needs clear articulation that every effort will be made to reduce likelihood of homes flooding by ensuring a proper survey is conducted on evidence over the past 10 years with increased climate change. Fundamental shift in travel to work - how will proposal be implemented (all buses free/electric?)	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID119/MOD/DP2/1			Specific policy wording required to ensure developeprs have regrad to the Water Framework Directive. Potential text could be added into Policy DP2. Example wording provided.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID153/Mod/DP2/1			These sites should then be added to the policies map.The support for community-led initiatives for renewable and low-carbon energy should be made clear, even where itfalls outside areas being taken forward through neighbourhood planning.	York Community Energy - Kit Bennett
SID351/Mod/DP2/1			The supporting text should clarify that this measure of control is not intended to prevent appropriate expansion at the YDO (para 4.39).351	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID374/Mod/DP2/1			The hierarchy should provide the basis for the definition of sustainable development and sustainable communities in Policies DP2 and DP3. All transport policy measures should be selected and implemented following the hierarchy of users on which LTP3 is based, reflecting the principles of sustainable travel. This approach should determine the measures to be included under Policies T2, T4, T5 and T8, and the prioritisation in investment between these three transport policies.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID419/Mod/DP2/1			With respect to the Strategic Housing Sites, we suggest the aforementioned paragraphs are revised to highlight a priority should be given during the design and development of these sites to the access and movement needs of pedestrians, cyclists and public transport users, in alignment with the NPPF. We also suggest that the paragraphs sets out the a requirement to adhere to creating layouts which minimise conflict through proper design accounting for speed & volume of traffic, through the use of Home Zones allowing for appropriate segregation where speed/volume can not be managed.	York Cycle Campaign
SID423/Mod/DP2/1		Not Sound	Need work on A1237/ road infrastructure improvements.	NDM 6

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy DP2 Sustainable Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID850/Mod/DP2/1			The Plan lacks a recognition that the scale of traffic growth on the A64 trunk road and its junctions with local primary roads will require physical mitigation in the form of investment in highway infrastructure in addition to extensive sustainable travel proposals. Policy DP2 Sustainable Development refers to 'improving the strategic highway network capacity'. This applies equally to the city's primary roads and the A64.	Highways England



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP3 Sustainable Communities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/DP3/1		Not Sound	no mention of facilities, services or amenities which are vital to reducing travel need. Unsure how proposal to stop people using cars will be implemented. Suggest restricting number of drive ways and front gardens given to non porous surfaces be considered in policy.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID118/S/DP3/1		Sound	Policy DP3 is sound. Particularly endorse the requirements for new developments to consider the historic environment, design and creating high quality locally distinct places.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID182/S/DP3/1		Not Sound	There will be cost constraints to having to seek the very highest standards of embedded sustainability which may ultimately be weighed against delivering other benefits such as affordable housing.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID199/S/DP3/1			ST14 will appear as urban extension and not respect the character of evenly spaced villages outside the urban area. ST14 would not integrate well with surrounding area with only a single road in and out. ST14 of insufficient size to support level of services and facilities required resulting in further road congestion.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison
SID339/S/DP3/1		Not Sound	In order to ensure that sustainable communities are delivered within York, the Council set out a number of criteria that should be addressed through future developments. Part v of the policy states development should "contribute to a sustainable, balanced community through provision of an appropriate range of housing" Whilst it is accepted that the aims of the policy could be considered as a whole, it is not considered that some proposals within the Plan will achieve these goals. For example, the strategic housing allocation at York Central will only provide 1 and 2 bed dwellings, clearly failing to deliver an appropriate range for a development of that scale.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID61/S/DP3/1		Not Sound	no mention of facilities, services or amenities which are vital to reducing travel need. Unsure how proposal to stop people using cars will be implemented. Suggest restricting number of drive ways and front gardens given to non porous surfaces be considered in policy.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

### Proposed Modification

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP3 Sustainable Communities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID182/Mod/DP3/1		Not Sound	The wording in 'iv)' needs to be amended from 'highest standards' to 'high standards'.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID374/Mod/DP3/1			The hierarchy should provide the basis for the definition of sustainable development and sustainable communities in Policies DP2 and DP3. All transport policy measures should be selected and implemented following the hierarchy of users on which LTP3 is based, reflecting the principles of sustainable travel. This approach should determine the measures to be included under Policies T2, T4, T5 and T8, and the prioritisation in investment between these three transport policies.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID423/Mod/DP3/1		Not Sound	Picking up from schools is causing high congestion. Work should be done to minimise journeys and focus on walking and cycling. Houses should be provided in areas of exiting housing so buses are able to cope with additional demand. Provision must be made for affordable housing that is accessible to those that work in their sector.	NDM 6
SID582/Mod/DP3/1			While we have no overall objection to Policy DP3, the wording in 'iv)' needs to be amended from 'highest standards' to 'high standards'. There will be cost constraints to having to seek the very highest standards of embedded sustainability which may ultimately be weighed against delivering other benefits such as affordable housing.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/DP3/1			The term highest standards should be amended to high standards so that the costs of delivering this can be weighed against other factors such as delivering affordable housing.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/DP3/1			The term highest standards should be amended to high standards so that the costs of delivering this can be weighed against other factors such as delivering affordable housing.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

# CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

## Policy DP3 Sustainable Communities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
Sid 848/Mod/DP3/1			The term highest standards should be amended to high standards so that the costs of delivering this can be weighed against other factors such as delivering affordable housing.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DP4 Approach to Development Management

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID339/S/DP4/1		Not Sound	Our client objects to the following statement within policy DP4 – “where there are no policies relevant to the application or relevant policies are out of date at the time of making the decision then the Council will grant permission unless material considerations indicate otherwise (our emphasis)”. This does not accord with national planning policy and the introduction of the additional test as underlined above is unreasonable and unsound and should be deleted from the policy.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID372/S/DP4/1		Sound	Gladman support Policy DP4 as this accurately reflects the Government’s approach to sustainable development as set out in the Framework.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID12/LC/SS1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Councillors have ignored prescribed methodology for housing need assessment, have repeatedly ignored officers advice, the plan does not comply with the NPPF / planning law and will be found out as such. Councillors have repeatedly said in webcasts that not everyone should expect to be able to live in York and can move elsewhere, when neighbouring councils are meeting their requirements this then means that York is not and is expecting others to take its housing need.	Tracey Simpson-Laing
SID16/LC/SS1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant	Does not meet the identified housing need for York.	Ruth Potter
SID52/LC/SS1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant	Infrastructure already at capacity particularly for travel. Should use all brownfield sites before green field and maintain agricultural land.	Pauline Bramley
SID66/LC/ SS1/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Plan complies with Duty to Cooperate and supports a sustainable model of York.	David Hardcastle
SID117/LC/SS1/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support the plan which formally designates the land off Moor Lane as green belt.	Eunice Coates
SID174/LC/SS1/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Plan does not provide enough housing to meet projected need nor does it provide enough affordable housing.	Susan Turner
SID216/LC/SS1/1				Eversheds Sutherland (Roddy MacDonald) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID244/LC/SS1/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Jason Rose

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID267/LC/SS1/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	It is considered that the Plan has not been positively prepared as it does not seek to:- identify a correctly assessed housing need- allocate enough land to meet this need	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID274/LC/SS1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant		The Dransfield Family
SID838/LC/SS1/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited

### Soundness

SID1/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Plan does not propose the required number of houses in the area, noting reduced development at Derwenthorpe Village.	David Marsh
SID12/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Methodology for assessing housing need does not meet expected practice as such it is not effective.	Tracey Simpson-Laing
SID16/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Not positively prepared as the plan does not meet York's identified housing need, nor does it provide the affordable housing required.	Ruth Potter
SID18/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Assumptions about population growth are wrong. Using the more up to date 2017 estimates would require more houses, plan also fails to take account of housing shortfalls in the last decade.	John Nichol
SID40/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Housing numbers are not consistent with national guidelines.	Beatrice Wiseman
SID41/Mod/SS1/1		Sound	The green belt including Land at Moor Lane is not to be built on.	Jemma Goodrum



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID47/S/SS1/1		Sound	I agree with the report, for example Para 3.7:In addition the Council has defined Regional, District and Local Green Corridors,which are identified in the Green Corridors Technical Paper (2011) (shown in Figure3.2). It is important that any future development does not have a significant adverseeffect on green corridors. This would need to take account of their characteristicsand the reason behind their initial designation.	Kevin White
SID48/S/SS1/1		Sound	Current planned numbers of houses reflected in the Draft Local plan meets needs having followedguidelines and reflects consultants' feedback, including public.It preserves the greenbelt and avoids urban creep.	Nick Frieslaar
SID49/S/SS1/1		Sound	Current planned numbers of houses reflected in the Draft Local plan meets needs having followedguidelines and reflects consultants' feedback, including public.It preserves the greenbelt and avoids urban creep.	Nan Harding
SID51/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Add houses to existing villages to keep services open.	Richard Bramley
SID59/S/SS1/1		Sound	The Plan preserves green belt land and avoids urban sprawl but does not address need for revamp of infrastructure.	John Pace
SID61/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	City centre is different from centre of city, city centre is defined on this page as per the NPPF. Centre of the city of York however is defined nowhere yet calculation on distance for green belt are measured as 6 miles. This nebulous number means that areas within the draft green belt cannot clearly be seen which makes planning more difficult. Washed over green belt encourages builders to buy land they are not allowed to build on due to green belt restrictions.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID64/S/SS1/1		Sound	The green belt area between Geldof road and Jockey lane on New Lane is the last area of greenland in south Huntington following the development of Vanguard and stadium retail complex, andtherefore shouldn't be included for consideration for being built on.	Claire Bicknell
SID66/S/SS1/1			Brownfield sites need using first.	David Hardcastle
SID67/S/SS1/1			Brownfield sites need using first. Protect green belt areas.	James Holtt
SID68/S/SS1/1			#3 Northfield Lane (south of garden centre) -In addition to meeting housing land requirement during the plan period, the Council also have to exclude land from the Green Belt for development beyond the plan period to ensure green belt boundaries will endure for some time beyond the Plan Period.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID69/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	There are many brown field sites in York that should be developed and also areas inside the ring road that would not encroach on the countryside. York is a special place and to encroach on the greenbelt ruins this.	Barry Abraham
SID72/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Bias towards development in the North, but the roads infrastructure is available in the south (dual carriageway A64) and is already heavily congested to the North (single carriageway A1237 with congested roundabouts). Mismatch between resource availability and the location of developments. Plan has unsubstantiated hopes to upgrade infrastructure after developments to the north are in place. Plan also states that the costs of required infrastructure are too high for developers to bear. The tax payer is being asked to subsidise this over development of the north. Development of infrastructure after schemes are built is too late as the infrastructure is needed before construction begins. Before any further development in the north of York, A1237 needs to be duelled with grade separated major junctions. Drainage is also a major concern. Haxby sewers cannot take the increased load and therefore requires connection to the Strensall Treatment Works (but that is at capacity). Schools, health centres, shops, local parking are all significant infrastructure issues. All are at current at or beyond capacity in Haxby and cannot accommodate the sizeable building envisaged by the plan. Jobs are not available in Haxby/ Wigginton so people will be travelling to York, Leeds and beyond for work. A plan which seeks to build thousands of homes in a location with overloaded infrastructure without first demonstrating a funded plan to upgrade the infrastructure before the building is in place cannot be considered a sound and is irresponsible.	Andrew Montgomery
SID77/S/SS1/1		Sound	Pleased to note that all references to land identified as 'safeguarded' have been removed from the Plan. It is imperative that CYC is proactive in encouraging Brownfield first with proposed development.	Derek Jones
SID85/S/SS1/1		Sound	Believe the plan to be sound, adequate in meeting all of York's future needs, prevents urban creep and protects the greenbelt. 867 should be maximum number of homes built. Only concern is that a rail station for Haxby is not scheduled until late in the plan period, this should be brought forward as it would relieve congestion on the A1237.	Robert Ridley
SID86/S/SS1/1		Sound	Believe the plan to be sound, adequate in meeting all of York's future needs, prevents urban creep and protects the greenbelt. 867 should be maximum number of homes built. Only concern is that a rail station for Haxby is not scheduled until late in the plan period, this should be brought forward as it would relieve congestion on the A1237.	Jacqueline Ridley

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID91/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	867 is too few homes, H37 Land adjacent to Greystones Court Haxby should be re-instated. Rep goes into great detail about the history of H37 at various consultation stages in the past. Says 867 figure ignores the evidence base and officer recommendations, does not take account of under-delivery or affordability, and also ignores representations from previous consultations in support of site H37. Goes into detail on how this violates NPPF and NPPG. The approach taken has been to minimise the number of homes built and protect the draft green belt rather than producing a sound plan and properly considering green belt boundary issues. As the result the plan now relies very heavily on a small number of strategic sites for the majority of the housing, these sites require large upfront funding for infrastructure and are inherently riskier. The reinstatement of a number of smaller, available sites rather than intensifying development on large strategic sites is the most appropriate strategy. H37 is available for development having previously undertaken detailed pre-application officer advice and having used a specialist consultancy to deal with issues raised in earlier consultations.	Strathmore Estates (Debbie Hume) OBO Westfield Lodge and Valdara Ltd (H37)
SID99/S/SS1/1		Sound	Strensall with Towthorpe Parish Council is pleased to see almost all recommendations from previous consultations have been listened and policies have been altered accordingly. Supports figure of 867 homes per annum, DCLG 1,070 figure an over estimate that does not take into account Brexit or likelihood of building industry delivering such numbers. Supports removal of H27, H30, site 892 and site 902. Supports development of E18, H59 and ST35. Supports removal of safeguarded land especially SF1 and SF14. Supports policy H10 on affordable housing. Supports inclusion of H59 for residential use and supports early development. Welcomes proposal for a rail station at Haxby but would suggest a park and ride in open countryside on Towthorpe Road between Strensall and Haxby would serve both communities better.	Strensall with Towthorpe PC - Fiona Hill
SID100/S/SS1/1		Sound	Supports 867 homes p/a as the maximum York can accommodate. Developments near the A1237 should be avoided, supports protecting the green belt and preventing creeping development in York's outlying villages.	T J Bright
SID101/S/SS1/1		Sound	Supports 867 homes p/a as the maximum York can accommodate. Developments near the A1237 should be avoided, supports protecting the green belt and preventing creeping development in York's outlying villages.	Sheila Bright
SID107/S/SS1/1		Sound	Supports the plan and its green belt boundary in the current format. Particularly the field at Avon Drive's inclusion in the green belt (presumably referring to North Lane Meadow SE65-05YK) as a developer has repeatedly submitted it for development only to be rejected.	Keith Hartley
SID118/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Whilst accepting there is considerable merit in the spatial approach with the potential offered by the proposed new settlements, Section 3/SS1 doesnt clearly articulate the rationale for the spatial strategy and location of development. This rationale should therefore should be added into the document.	Historic England - Ian Smith

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Whilst accepting there is merit in the spatial approach with the potential offered by the proposed new settlements, Section 3/SS1 doesn't clearly articulate the rationale for the spatial strategy and location of development. This rationale should therefore be added into the document.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	In order to achieve sustainable growth in terms of York's environmental assets, it is important that not only the locations of growth safeguard these assets, but also the scale of growth proposed in each area.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	In order to achieve sustainable growth in terms of York's environmental assets, it is important that not only the locations of growth safeguard these assets, but also the scale of growth proposed in each area.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	SSI explanatory text - Whilst Historic England broadly concurs that the areas identified on Figure 3.1 are the main ones which help to safeguard elements which contribute to the special character and setting of the historic city, one of the aspects which it fails to adequately depict is the contribution made by the wider rural landscape.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	SSI explanatory text - Whilst Historic England broadly concurs that the areas identified on Figure 3.1 are the main ones which help to safeguard elements which contribute to the special character and setting of the historic city, one of the aspects which it fails to adequately depict is the contribution made by the wider rural landscape.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID123/S/SS1/1		Sound	Supports the plan. Pleased that no safeguarded land is allocated, particularly SF14, and that green belt boundaries will not have to be reviewed at the end of the plan period. Restates that no green belt development within the parish boundary of Earswick, even beyond 2032. Pleased with protection of environment (both ecological and historical). Residents want to protect as much green belt as possible, retain agricultural land with open views of the countryside, maintain character and individuality of historic villages, mitigate oversubscription of public services and infrastructure, prevent congestion and subsequent pollution.	Earswick Parish Council - Joanne Fisher
SID125/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	867 figure is too low, does not accord with NPPF / NPPG guidance, council has chosen to reject its own consultants and officers' advice on this matter. Current figure of 867 is contrary to NPPF guidance, GL Hearn, council officers, representation from Lichfields and representation from the development industry. No evidence has been put forward to support 867 and such a figure undermines the council's ambitions for economic growth. Current figure will further delay York having an adopted Local Plan and raise costs for York residents both in terms of council expenses and exacerbated affordability of housing in the city.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID125/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	York does not have a vast amount of previously undeveloped land waiting to be developed nor does it have time available to monitor the uptake of previously developed land and then choose when to release it. In view of the long lead it time for development to come forward the Council is not in a position to debate exactly when sufficient previously developed land has come forward in its first Phase to allow other sites to be developed. The Council needs to understand new houses are needed right now and the long lead in timescales for delivering new houses does not allow it the luxury of dividing release of sites into phases.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID129/S/SS1/1		Sound	867 homes (as maximum) in the right place can be supported by lack infrastructure, any more and it will be unsustainable. 'Safeguarding' of land for future development is rejected so as to preserve the environment, the green belt and the integrity of the historic outlying villages.	Joan Fatheazam
SID133/S/SS1/1		Sound	Protects the greenbelt, provides enough houses, will improve affordability, reflects sustainable development.	M E Ramsay
SID141/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The ELR Update and Officers 10th July 2017 report to the Local Plan Working Group consider that there is a clear qualitative justification for additional B1a office sites to be allocated to provide greater flexibility and reduce reliance upon one site (York Central) with its recognised delivery constraints (infrastructure challenges/ ownership fragmented/heritage constraints). However, the Plan addresses the undersupply of some 40,000 sqm by increasing the allocation of Office floorspace at York Central, retaining its role as the key office location. It does not explain how this can be achieved or why this increase has been made. The proposed quantum has not been justified. Timescales for delivery are uncertain, but likely to be in the long-term. The lack of commitment to early delivery of office accommodation is considered unsound, particularly given losses to ORCs. While York Central is likely to be a highly desirable location, the Plan does not provide for sufficient choice in the employment market.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Oakgate Caddick Groups
SID144/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Plan does not meet assessed development and infrastructure needs for city. York has a housing crisis with prices rising at five times the average rate of the rest of Yorkshire. Street homelessness has risen. Councillors have rejected advice to raise the 867 housing figure. Feels the green belt is average farmland or untidy, and protecting it is ignoring the needs of the people.	Christopher Arundel
SID147/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Plan does not ensure that brown field sites are used before green belt land.	Ann & Paul McLean
SID154/S/SS1/1		Sound	Brownfield sites should be the focus, local infrastructure may be unable to cope (i.e. Strensall to the ring road cannot cope already at peak times with traffic volume.	Steve Clipston

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID158/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The plan lack analysis of how different groups in the community are effected by the proposals and how the plan can heal these unequal conditions. The plan references sustainability but fails to consider community or environmental sustainability, with regard to transport strategy. The city is failing to attract good quality jobs and we have a large amount of workers on minimum wage. The plan fails to address these issues and our economic situation. Supports the governments figure of 1070 as a minimum. Need more affordable housing. It is vital that the property mix is what the city needs and not what is most profitable for developers.	Dan Taylor
SID160/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	CPRENY have concerns regarding the achievability of delivering a minimum annual provision of 867 new dwellings per annum over the plan period.	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE
SID165/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Estimate of OAHN is too high, derived from 2014-sub national population and household projections which do not account for unusual period of university expansion from 2008-14 that has since slowed, or Brexit and its likely impact on reducing inward migration. Agree with council that there is no basis to provide any uplift to take into account market signals or affordable housing need. Even if the figure of 867 is accepted for the plan period it should not be used as a proxy for housing need in the post plan period.	Richard Frost
SID174/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Plan does not provide enough housing to meet projected need nor does it provide enough affordable housing. OAHN should be closer to either DCLG white paper from November 2017 figure of 1,070 or draft NPPF figure of 1,135.	Susan Turner
SID181/S/SS1/1			It is flawed and fails to meet national policy, fails all tests of soundness. Under provides land for housing and employment. The 20% buffer should be applied across the entire Plan period, not just the first five years of it. The windfall allowance should therefore be removed and added in full to the requirement to identify sites meaning that at least another 169 sites should be added to the requirement	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments
SID181/S/SS1/2			Policy SSTs target of 867 units is significantly understated and the figure should be increased by in excess of 500 units per annum: Given the tightness of the green belt in York there will be a need to review the green belt boundary in order to ensure that sufficient suitable, viable, available and deliverable sites are brought forward.	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID182/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	It is unclear as to which forecast has been used for employment figures and how these relate to the Leeds City Region work and Northern Powerhouse. It is also unclear as to which methodology has been used to calculate the housing requirement.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID182/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Support the reference to the 'notable affordable housing need' and increasing affordability concerns in the City in para 1.46, it is clear this recognition has not been taken forward into the housing requirement number that will be used to help resolve these problems.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID182/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	Para 2.5 informs that 'By the end of the plan period sufficient sites will have been identified for viable and deliverable house sites ...':	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID182/S/SS1/4		Not Sound	In reviewing the various OAN options, it is clear there is no sound evidential approach to adopting the 867 dpa figure. The figures of the 2017 SHMA (adjusted for early years shortfall) and the DCLG Methodology are broadly similar and would suggest the net annual requirement for York is least 1,000 dwellings per annum based upon York's own evidence and more likely 1,150 dpa in the DCLG and NLP work once economic growth is factored in.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID182/S/SS1/4		Not Sound	It is known and accepted by the Council that it is unable to currently demonstrate a 5 year supply of housing and that matters will only worsen should the adoption of a new Local Plan be delayed.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID199/S/SS1/1			York already has poor historic delivery rate of new homes. ST14 is an unacceptable risk if the site fails to come forward. Preferable for a number of smaller sites instead which would ensure annual provision of 867 new dwellings. ST14 issues with congestion, pollution and flood risk.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID203/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Draft Plan is vastly insufficient in the housing numbers proposed and will require new sites to meet additional housing needs. Not sound because the strategy is not based on DCLG "Planning for the right homes in the right places:consultation proposals" which sets out a minimum annual requirement for York of 1070 dwellings per annum and the plan fails to increase housing targets to identify this need. The Draft Plan leaves a shortfall of over 4000 additional dwellings that will be required to cover the period to 2032, with the Draft Plan stating 17,340 dwellings and the DCLG publication stating 21,400 dwellings. Revisions to Policy SS1 to address the housing shortfall and a adopt a robust annual housing requirement in line with the published DCLG Consultation Document "Planning for the right homes in the right places: consultation proposals" which sets out an annual requirement of 1070 dwellings as a minimum per annum for York.	Savills (M Boyce ) OBO Mr Allen and Mrs Dorothea Park
SID205/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Draft Plan is vastly insufficient in the housing numbers proposed and will require new sites to meet additional housing needs. Not sound because the strategy is not based on DCLG "Planning for the right homes in the right places:consultation proposals" which sets out a minimum annual requirement for York of 1070 dwellings per annum and the plan fails to increase housing targets to identify this need. The Draft Plan leaves a shortfall of over 4000 additional dwellings that will be required to cover the period to 2032, with the Draft Plan stating 17,340 dwellings and the DCLG publication stating 21,400 dwellings. Revisions to Policy SS1 to address the housing shortfall and a adopt a robust annual housing requirement in line with the published DCLG Consultation Document "Planning for the right homes in the right places: consultation proposals" which sets out an annual requirement of 1070 dwellings as a minimum per annum for York.	Savills (R Housam) OBO Private landowner
SID210/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	In order to address the conflicts identified and ensure that Policy SS1 is sound, it is considered that City of York Council should amend the Policy as follows: 1 The calculation of OAHN should be based on the normal 'policy-off' methodology. 2 Given the significantly worsening market signals identified in City of York, Lichfields consider that a 20% uplift would be appropriate in this instance and should be applied to the OAHN, plus a further 10% uplift to help address affordable housing needs. 3 There should be a focus on growth on extensions to the York urban area and the expansion of existing settlements to make best use of existing infrastructure and resources, as well as ensuring that the needs of the local community are met. 4 The Council should identify additional land for housing (including the appropriate definition of the Green Belt boundary) to meet the housing needs of the community. This is the only approach that will deliver a 'sound' plan and enable the much needed investment in new housing to meet the community's needs.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID214/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	the Council will have to demonstrate to a Local Plan Inspector that the Green Belt boundaries will not have to be altered at the end of the plan period. It can do this by including in areas of safeguarded to meet development need beyond the plan period.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID214/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Paragraph 85 of the NPPF advises that when defining Green Belt boundaries for the first time, local planning authorities should identify areas of 'safeguarded land' between the urban area and the Green Belt, to meet longer-term development needs beyond the plan period and make clear that the safeguarded land is not allocated for development at the present time;	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID216/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Council has failed to give proper consideration to market signals when assessing housing need for York.	Eversheds Sutherland (Roddy MacDonald) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID216/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Without proper justification, the Council has chosen to disregard advice from its consultants, G L Hearn, recommendations from its officers and representations made previously by developers, which is contrary to NPPF para. 158.	Eversheds Sutherland (Roddy MacDonald) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID216/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	There is no proper evidence base for the housing need identified in the Plan. The Plan proceed to examination in its current form it is very likely that the Inspector would find the Plan unsound.	Eversheds Sutherland (Roddy MacDonald) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID216/S/SS1/4		Not Sound	In the absence of proper consideration of proper market signals the plan fails to satisfy a number of test of soundness in accordance with NPPF para. 182:- it fails to meet the requirement to be positively prepared by addressing objectively assessed development and infrastructure requirements.- it fails to adopt the most appropriate strategy for addressing housing need and does not provide an adequate justification- it fails to satisfy a number of areas of national policy.	Eversheds Sutherland (Roddy MacDonald) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID216/S/SS1/5		Not Sound	A Technical Report prepared by Lichfields on behalf of a number of developers concludes that:- the democratic baseline should be set at 871 dpa rather than 867 dpa- a market signals adjustment of 20% rather than 10% is appropriate- an increased proportion of affordable housing should be set- evidence supports an annual housing need figure of 1,150 dwellings	Eversheds Sutherland (Roddy MacDonald) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID220/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Council's overall assessment of its housing requirement is significantly flawed, and shows that there must be considerable doubt over whether the housing allocations that are proposed could deliver the number of dwellings identified. It is considered that a substantial amount of additional housing land should be allocated if the Council is to meet the housing requirements of the City and to confirm a permanent Green Belt for York. Otherwise, the Plan should be found unsound. Include reference to students and windfalls and over reliance of several strategic sites.	O'Neill Associates (Philip Holmes)OBO Mr M Ibbotson
SID231/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	FPC considers that the Local Plan should be based on an OAHN of 706 dwellings per annum for the plan period to reduce harm to city. Provides no evidence that the plan is assessing the impact of meeting housing needs in accordance with the NPPF.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID231/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	The Green Belt proposed by the PD is the residual of the open land not required to accommodate development needs in the plan period 2012-2033 and beyond to 2038. FPC considers this is not the correct approach for preparing detailed Green Belt boundaries for a historic city like York of international and national importance where its open land setting is a very important part of its special character. Should be based on NPPF framework.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID232/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The number of houses proposed in the latest draft Local Plan (867/annum) is insufficient. There has been a historic under-delivery against targets which has resulted in a markedly constrained supply and caused significant increases in housing costs (in both purchase and rental markets) which the adopted proposals will do nothing to correct.	Stephen Lornie
SID244/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	York needs more housing than 867 per year.	Jason Rose
SID247/S/SS1/1			The Trustees are concerned that the emerging Local Plan identifies a net housing requirement of 867 dwellings per annum. This figure is significantly below that within earlier consultations, which were seeking to deliver 1,090 dwellings per annum and below the CLG Standard Housing Methodology of 1,070 dwellings per annum.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge
SID247/S/SS1/2			The Trustees are concerned that this Paper provides insufficient evidence on the derivation and analysis of windfalls to justify a level of windfalls equivalent to 19% of the annual requirement from Year 4 onwards. This is a significant level of housing provision to come from unknown sources.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge
SID255/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Advice from GL Hearn within the SHMA Addendum is that the York Local Plan should include a 10% market signals adjustment to the 867 baseline figure. This would increase the figure to 953 dwellings per annum. GL Hearn state that the market signals adjustment is based on an assessment of both market signals and affordable housing need. Without this adjustment neither of these elements have been taken into consideration within the housing requirement. It is therefore considered that the Local Plan is not compliant with the NPPF as it has not taken into account market signals and housing affordability.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID255/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Neither the 2016 SHMA, nor its addendum have considered the implications of the LEP ambitions for growth. This should be factored into the housing need assessment (whether using the Council's methodology or the DCLG standard methodology) to ensure that there is an appropriate balance between employment growth aspirations and homes.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID255/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	It is therefore recommended that the policy text be amended to refer to sustainable sites, or if reference to previously developed land is to be retained that 'will be phased first' is replaced with 'be encouraged'.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID256/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	We maintain the view that the housing target within the Plan is too low and does not take into account the objectively assessed needs for the market and affordable housing, which fails the test of para 182 of the NPPF	Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes - Liam Tate
SID257/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Policy SS1 fails to adopt the minimum OAN figure of 1,070 dpa for York City provided in 'Planning for the Right Homes in the Right Places' instead adopting a much lower figure of 867dpa covering both the plan period to 2032/33 and for the subsequent five years to 2037/38. The lower figure proposed by the City Council is inadequate and will not meet the needs of the City over the plan period.	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	In addition we would regard the 1,070 dpa figure as representing a minimum level of supply and consider the Plan should adopt a higher figure incorporating a 10% uplift for Market Signals, to start to address the issue of lack of affordability in the City and ongoing economic growth. A minimum housing requirement figure of 1,180dpa is therefore required to make the plan 'sound'.	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID267/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Seeking to adopt a plan with only 867 dpa over the plan period when there is evidence that there is a requirement for 1070 as set out in proposed DCLG for calculating housing need it is considered that the Plan has not been positively prepared.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID268/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Brownfield sites in York need to be filled with accommodation before encroaching onto virgin land.	J Nicholson
SID303/S/SS1/1		Sound	I believe the draft local plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs whilst also protecting the Green Belt preserving the unique character and setting of York and maintaining the amenity sustainability and resilience of Copmanthorpe the community in which I live.	Ian Moir

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID306/S/SS1/1		Sound	Considering the population figures the Plan provides enough housing for the people of York. Delivering up to 1000 new homes pa I believe through this delivery affordability will be improved in York.	Y Boynton
SID307/S/SS1/1		Sound	Considering the population figures the Plan provides enough housing for the people of York. Delivering up to 1000 new homes pa I believe through this delivery affordability will be improved in York.	G Greetham
SID308/S/SS1/1		Sound	Considering the population figures the Plan provides enough housing for the people of York. Delivering up to 1000 new homes pa I believe through this delivery affordability will be improved in York.	NDM 3
SID309/S/SS1/1		Sound	Considering the population figures the Plan provides enough housing for the people of York. Delivering up to 1000 new homes pa I believe through this delivery affordability will be improved in York.	Brian L Bell
SID310/S/SS1/1		Sound	Considering the population figures the Plan provides enough housing for the people of York. Delivering up to 1000 new homes pa I believe through this delivery affordability will be improved in York.	Richard Rafton
SID311/S/SS1/1		Sound	Considering the population figures the Plan provides enough housing for the people of York. Delivering up to 1000 new homes pa I believe through this delivery affordability will be improved in York.	M Ellis
SID318/S/SS1/1			Supports SS1 minimal provision of 867 dwellings per annum. Supports detail shown in figures 3.1, 3.2 and identified flood risk in 3.3. Supports traffic increase concerns in paragraph 3.12.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID324/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Housing numbers on York Central (ST5) have increased from 1500 to 1700-2500 there is no reasoning provided for this increase and no explanation that the extra homes will be built after the Plan period. Also the site size has remained the same. I have added all housing starts together and have reached a total of 929 dpa over the Plan period. This figure does not comply with the Governments figure of 1070. However, when adding windfalls this equates to 1140 pa.	Howard Perry
SID335i/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Plan is not sound because it is not properly prepared or justified because it is not an objective assessment of where new housing areas generally in the City of York because it is not sound in the infrastructure works required for highways and the A1237 in particular, generated by ST1, ST2 and ST14, and these are not deliverable over the Plan period by developers, even working with statutory bodies.	Lionel Lennox



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID339/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Our Client strongly objects to the proposing housing target that is being proposed by the Council as set out in Policy SS1 of the CYCLP. The annual housing target of 867 dwellings is less than is recommended in the Council's own evidence base, as the 10% uplift for market signals has been ignored. As such this does not represent the Council's full objectively assessed housing need and the requirements of the Framework and the PPG have not been met. In addition to the above, Barton Willmore have previously prepared a Technical Paper to assess the findings in the Council's SHMA and it concluded that a housing target of between 920 and 1,070 dwellings would represent the Council's full OAN. Had the Council included the 10% uplift as stated in their own evidence base, this would have derived a housing target of 953 dwellings per annum, which would have aligned with Barton Willmore's findings. Furthermore, the proposed standardised methodology which is currently being consulted on, includes an uplift for market signals, and suggest that the OAN for York would be 1,070 dwellings per annum. There is clear and robust evidence which demonstrates that the Council's full OAN is higher than being proposed within the CYCLP	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID345/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	DIO contend that the policy fails to reflect the higher 953dph figure set out in the SHMA to reflect market signals and has not properly justified the reasons for this deficiency. 953dph is a more realistic and appropriate OAHN. The plan should determine suitable and deliverable sites to meet 953dph and give consideration to government's 1070dph proposed housing figure.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Support delivery of previously developed land first in policy SS1. Also support the sentence "land or buildings identified for economic growth must be attractive to the market" is fully supported by DIO (Policy SS1 final paragraph).	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID346/S/SS1/1			The Local Plan is not justified as the level of additional homes planned are way too many for expected future needs. I do not see masses of homeless people roaming the streets and even if these homes are built who is going to be able to afford them? All through the previous stages of consultation concerns have repeatedly been raised regarding the impact of such development on existing drainage, congestion, pollution, schools, property values, existing residents quality of life, safety and loss of green belt. This latest revised Plan still does not address these concerns. It is as if the developers just want to get on and build and they will try to address some issues but will only pay lip service to the loose reference to the important concerns that have been repeatedly raised.	Chris Slade

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID347/S/SS1/1			The Submission Plan seek to make provision for some 867 dwellings per annum for the plan period. It is essential that the new Plan provides for an appropriate level of housing. Government policy requires a step change in the delivery of new housing. The National Planning Policy Framework states in respect of housing that “The Government’s key housing objective is to increase significantly the delivery of new homes. Everyone should have the opportunity to live in high quality, well designed homes, which they can afford, in a community where they want to live. This means: • increasing the supply of housing • delivering a wide choice of high quality homes that people want and need • widening opportunities for home ownership; and • creating sustainable, inclusive and mixed communities, including through the regeneration and renewal of areas of poor housing”. Paragraph 47 of the Framework requires Local Planning Authorities to use their evidence base to ensure that their Local Plan meets the full, objectively assessed needs (OAN) for market and affordable housing in the housing market area. There are significant negative impacts which would result from adopting low levels of housing growth and these must be recognised, not least the significant impact on housing affordability and increased house prices by a lack of supply. Equally, a low level of housing growth would not meet housing needs, would not support the economic growth aspirations of the vision and could lead to unsustainable patterns of travel with people having to travel further distances between home and work. As currently proposed the Plan does not meet the full OAN in accordance with the evidence in the SHMA. An additional provision should be made to support market signals in line with the SHMA recommendations. Policy considerations have been applied to suppress the full OAN set out in the SHMA without justification, whilst appropriate land is available within and adjoining the City to meet needs.	Planning Prospects (Jason Tait) OBO Miller Homes
SID350/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The housing requirement and the predicted housing supply is not justified, effective or consistent with national planning policy or even the council’s own evidence base. The minimum annual provision of 867 new dwellings per annum is not based upon any robust objective assessment of need – even the council’s own evidence base gives an OAN of 953dpa. As a result, the draft plan will not deliver sufficient new housing or the much needed boost to the level of supply indicated by the available evidence.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Picton Capital
SID350/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Even founded on a figure of 867dpa the plan proposes insufficient housing land to meet its proposed requirement. The spatial strategy relies too heavily on a number of key large and/or complex sites and over-optimistic and unsupported assumptions over both timing and number of dwellings to be delivered.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Picton Capital
SID354/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The SHMA concludes that, based on the latest official projections, there is a need for 867 dwellings per annum over the 15 year plan period. However, the SHMA also recommends that taking into account market signals and affordable housing need, there is justification of a response to affordable housing need and market signal challenges.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID354/Mod/SS1/2			Safeguarded Land is required in the Plan to provide a degree of permanence to the Green Belt boundary and avoid the need for future review.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID354/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	The findings of the SHMA are considered to be in line with the PPG, supported by a range of Inspectors' decisions and the requirement of an uplift justified by market trends and affordable needs in York. The Draft Local Plan has therefore not been positively prepared and is not justified as it does not reflect the evidence base produced.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID354/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	The SHMA notes the Council's past failure to meet its housing targets. With the exception of the 2016/17 year, York has missed their target each year since 2007, therefore missing its target by 20% (equating to 2,051 units below the target level). The PPG states: "If the historic rate of development shows that actual supply falls below planned supply, future supply should be increased to reflect the likelihood of under-delivery of a plan"3.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID354/S/SS1/4		Not Sound	The standard methodology in the DCLG 'Planning for the right homes in the right places' paper calculates a baseline housing need figure for York of 1,070 dwellings per annum. It is clear the housing number for York in that document (even without employment growth) informs of an annual housing requirement significantly above that within this Publication Draft Local Plan.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID354/S/SS1/5		Not Sound	Safeguarded Land is required in the Plan to provide a degree of permanence to the Green Belt boundary and avoid the need for future review.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID357/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Policy SS1 identifies that the Council will seek to deliver 867 new dwellings per annum over the plan period. Whilst this figure is based on the Council's own evidence, as part of the Government's commitment to delivering housing, a new standardised methodology for calculating housing need has been consulted on. As part of the consultation, an indicative assessment of housing need for each Local Authority has been set out using the proposed methodology. For York, the indicative assessment suggests a housing need figure of 1,070 dwellings per annum.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID357/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	It is clear from the Council's own evidence the housing requirement should at the very least be 953 dpa, although a case can be made for the higher 1,070 dpa figure derived from the proposed Government standardised methodology. We therefore object to proposed housing requirement figure of 867 dpa. This figure is not justified and would result in the plan not being positively prepared and is not consistent with national policy.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID359/S/SS1/1			LP Housing Requirement is unsound. Updated SHMA figures rejected by CYC. PDLP provides 3,248 homes less than minimum calculated using government's standardised methodology. PDLP approach to dealing with housing shortfall is incorrect and unsound. Table 5.1 of PDLPP - no detail beyond 5 year time frame which makes reasonability of proposed phasing of sites and delivery rates impossible to comment on.	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO NHS Property Services

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID364/S/SS1/1			Plan fails to deliver prosperity for all, heal unequal conditions of residents, follow up implications of sustainability, solve housing crisis, accomodate needed workforce and address transport and pollution issues. Plan incorrectly addresses the economic state of York, office availability and socio-economic divide. Plan incorrectly analyses and addresses employment issues, allocation of office space, city centre congestion and employment.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/S/SS1/2			To provide enough land for at least 867 dwellings per annum over the plan period: Plan not prepared to meet housing crisis. Plan makes no provision for alternative strategy or acknowledges third party housing figures. Issues with allocated sites.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/S/SS1/3			Delivering 20% of brownfield and 30% of greenfield sites as affordable homes: Plan shows no concern for crisis of housing affordability. Issue with Social/Affordable housing figures.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/S/SS1/4			Ensuring an efficient transport system to underpin the plan: Plans transport policies are not grounded in comprehensive analysis. Policies based on an out of date plan, no up to date traffic analysis,	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/S/SS1/5			Concerned that the plan fails to address the major challenges facing the city over the plan period. Believes the plan will exacerbate many of the problems York faces, particularly thehousing / affordable housing crisis.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/SS1/1			Plan fails to deliver prosperity for all, heal unequal conditions of residents, follow up implications of sustainability, solve housing crisis, accomodate needed workforce and address transport and pollution issues. Plan incorrectly addresses the economic state of York, office availability and socio-economic divide. Plan incorrectly analyses and addresses employment issues, allocation of office space, city centre congestion and employment.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/S/SS1/2			To provide enough land for at least 867 dwellings per annum over the plan period: Plan not prepared to meet housing crisis. Plan makes no provision for alternative strategy or acknowledges third party housing figures. Issues with allocated sites.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/S/SS1/3			Delivering 20% of brownfield and 30% of greenfield sites as affordable homes: Plan shows no concern for crisis of housing affordability. Issue with Social/Affordable housing figures.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/S/SS1/4			Ensuring an efficient transport system to underpin the plan: Plans transport policies are not grounded in comprehensive analysis. Policies based on an out of date plan, no up to date traffic analysis,	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/S/SS1/5			Concerned that the plan fails to address the major challenges facing the city over the plan period. Believes the plan will exacerbate many of the problems York faces, particularly thehousing / affordable housing crisis.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID366/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	York's emerging Local Plan seeks to provide 867 new dwellings pa. This figure directly correlates to the OAN which was calculated by CYCs 2016 SHMA. It is important to note that the Government published their standard methodology to housing need in September 2017 - using this methodology the requirement rises to 1070 dwellings pa. if it is considered that additional housing sites are required to ensure an adequate supply we submit representations to put forward three sites for consideration as windfall sites.	Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services
SID367/S/SS1/1			From delivering roughly 500 houses per annum, to nearly 1000 houses per annum, I believe that through the housing delivered under the plan, affordability will be improved in York.	Keith Massheder
SID367/S/SS1/2			From delivering roughly 500 houses per annum, to nearly 1000 houses per annum, I believe that through the housing delivered under the plan, affordability will be improved in York.	Keith Massheder
SID367/S/SS1/3			From delivering roughly 500 houses per annum, to nearly 1000 houses per annum, I believe that through the housing delivered under the plan, affordability will be improved in York.	Keith Massheder
SID369/S/SS1/1		Sound	The current housing allocation of 867 per annum is a far more sustainable number.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID369/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	The York Outer Ring Road is already over capacity and I have made my views very clear over a number of years about the need for upgrades. Proposals in the Local Plan, particularly the land west of Wigginton Road, north of Monks Cross and north of Haxby will naturally place greater strain on the A1237, so I remain concerned about the level of development north of the city and support efforts to upgrade this road.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID370/S/SS1/1		Sound	It is important that the city has a robust plan to guide commercial and residential development in support of economic growth over the coming years. Moving towards an approved Local Plan is vitally important to the city's long term future development and we are wholly supportive of CYCs efforts to move it forward. We believe the plan to be sound and our submission is intended to be a helpful contribution to ensure the Plan supports the city's economic strategy and delivers the land allocations required to support the future economic growth in the short, medium and long term. The overall increase in employment land allocation throughout the Plan's development has been welcomed, especially where it relates to B1a office space. It is important that the employment land allocation is flexible to ensure sufficient quantum can be brought forward in a timely manner. The flexible approach to sites such as University of York, Northminster and Elvington will help deliver the right mix of uses and provide flexibility. We are however concerned that recommendations for additional allocations of land at ST26 Elvington Airfield and ST27 University have been rejected. We also believe that further potential remains to add flexibility within areas of the city located close to the A64.	Make it York - Andrew Sharp

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID372/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	<p>Policy SS1 outlines that the Plan will deliver a minimum annual provision of 867 new dwellings over the plan period to 2032/33 (see the SHMA Update 2017). The report also recommends a 10% uplift to the demographic start point in order to address Market Signals. Gladman has concerns that the housing requirement that is included in the York Local Plan as it does not fully reflect the latest evidence as set out in the Strategic Housing Market Assessment Update (2017) and does not fully reflect the guidance set out in the Framework and Planning Practice Guidance on defining housing needs. Gladman are concerned that in an area such as York, where housing affordability is a priority issue, the lower quartile ratio of house price to earnings is increasing (8.92 in 2015) and there is a key Government agenda attached to addressing the affordability of housing, the Council has chosen not to address clear worsening Market Signals evidence in setting their housing requirement in the CYLP. Gladman consider that as a minimum, the Council's housing requirement in the CYLP should be 953 dpa as set out in the Council's own evidence. Gladman reiterate concerns regarding the phasing of development suggested by Policy H1. Phasing should not be included unless it is fully justified by the need to deliver significant infrastructure before development is commenced. The Framework is clear that development which is in accordance with the development plan should go ahead without delay in order to significantly boost the supply of housing. Introducing phasing into Policy H1 is contrary to national policy. Gladman also remain concerned with the level of windfall sites that the Council are including within the housing supply going forwards. In order to include the windfall allowance of 169 dwellings per annum in the CYLP, the Council will need to have credible evidence to justify this.</p>	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID376/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	<p>Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd strongly object to Policy SS1, as the approach being undertaken by the Council is unsound It is not justified, consistent with national planning policy, effective nor is it positively prepared. TW have grave concerns related to the 867 housing requirement that does not include an uplift for market signals. It does not align with Paragraph 17 of the NPPF and questions the demographic baseline, market signals adjustment and affordable housing needs requirement. Two go on to state that in the absence of proper consideration of market signals, the Local Plan fails to satisfy the 'soundness test' under NPPF, at para. 182. The consequences of this are that the Local Plan is very likely to be found unsound by an Inspector and is likely to require substantive amendments and further rounds of consultation with all the delays that this will bring.</p>	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID377/S/SS1/1		Sound	<p>I support an annual house building target of 867 new homes. I especially support the policy of building homes on brownfield sites and the decision not to safeguard land for future development. I am particularly encouraged by the fact that those who are responsible for preparing the various drafts of the Local Plan have clearly listened to the feedback that has been provided by community groups, Parish Councils, evidence based research from experienced consultants and individuals by dropping the earlier requirement for land to be safeguarded for future development. This will undoubtedly limit the prospect of urban creep and coalescence of rural villages. It will also help to protect the essential rural characteristics and heritage of the ancient villages on the outskirts of the City. I believe that the special protection that is afforded to the Greenbelt by the NPPF is properly and fully given effect to in the current version of the draft Local Plan and I fully support its adoption.</p>	John Williams

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The integral relationship between housing growth and development needs, a further review of the economic growth aspects (first bullet) of Policy SS1 will need to be reviewed.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Given that it is recognised that in order to meet the housing needs of the City in the south east quadrant through a new settlement, specific reference to this is required.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID392/S/SS1/1		Sound	The City of York Local Plan Publication Draft identifies a significant number of housing, employment and retail opportunities to deliver growth up to 2032. The quantum and nature of the proposed development will be of great strategic benefit to this LEP area and it is important that the Local Plan is advanced to adoption quickly to allow delivery of these sites. Past issues with under delivery of housing, together with recent market signals for York, mean that it will be essential to achieve at least the proposed minimum annual provision of 867 new dwellings over the plan period, together with any additional homes needed to reflect any under delivery of this annual target during the Plan period. This LEP will work with the Council, Homes England and developers towards achieving this. Identification of appropriate reserve sites for housing and employment may assist in meeting the planned housing and economic growth in the advent that any of the proposed allocations do not come forward or are delayed. This would also provide flexibility to meet any future unforeseen economic or housing needs and / or address changes in national policy that may come forward.	Rydale District Council - Julian Rudd
SID393/S/SS1/1		Sound	Much discussion in York in recent years has centred on the objectively assessed housing need for the city. The Regional Spatial Strategy prior to its abolition in 2013 set an annual housing target for York between 2008 and 2026 at 850 houses per annum. Given all the evidence from the old RSS figures, through to the most up to date population projections, it is clear that the current starting position of 867 homes per annum is a robust and realistic target. The current housing supply proposed in the local plan equates to 1008 homes per annum. Including a 10% allowance for non delivery, this relates to an annual housing delivery of circa 923 homes per annum. Delivery of 923 homes per annum would be a step change in housing delivery in the city, but one that is achievable. There has been much talk about the figure of 1070 which was included in the recent DCLG consultation, but this figure is irrelevant for York and would never be applied. The methodology is still out to consultation and the DCLG has been clear that this will not be applied to the current local plan if the timetable is met. Secondly, given the DCLG figures are based on outdated population projections, this figure would never be in place for any local authority.	Cllr N Ayre

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID394/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The document should identify further housing sites, especially for older persons' housing, within the city area. Such a strategy would help ensure that the City's full housing needs are met over the plan period and provide a greater choice and competition in the market for land in accordance with the core principles of the NPPF. The scale of additional land releases required is such that land is required to be excluded from the Green Belt to meet development requirements in the plan period. As part of these releases, our client's land to the west of Common Road, Dunnington should be identified for allocation within the Local Plan. Our client welcomes that the Local Plan is seeking to meet the housing needs of the current and future population linked to the city's economic growth ambitions (paragraph 2.5). However, it is considered that the housing requirement of 867 dwellings per annum would not meet this objective and therefore the Local Plan is not positively prepared or justified in this respect. The housing target would not meet the City area's(OAHN) and does not accord with the tests set out in the NPPF. Paragraph 14 of the NPPF is explicit that the Local Plan should meet its OAHN with sufficient flexibility to adapt to rapid changes. The 867 figure is based on the demographic starting point from the ONS 2014- based sub-national household projections. The Council has decided to not include the 10% uplift to take account of market signals advocated within the GL Hearn SHMA. The failure to include an appropriate uplift is clearly contrary to national guidance. The draft Local Plan states that median house and rental prices are significantly higher than the regional and national averages. Therefore, the evidence clearly indicates that an uplift should be applied to the baseline demographic figure. The Housing White Paper (September 2017) outlines a potential standard method for calculating local authorities' housing need. York being increased to 1,070 dwellings per annum. In order for the Local Plan to be found 'sound', the housing requirement should be revised upwards to take into account of market signals and affordable housing need as advocated in paragraph 019 of the PPG.	The Planning Bureau (Stephen Courcier) OBO McCarthy & Stone Retirement Lifestyles Ltd
SID396/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	object to Policy SS1 on the grounds that the minimum annual provision of 867 new dwellings has not been objectively assessed by decision makers and this therefore unsound	Roger Pierce
SID401/S/SS1/1			Objection to annual employment and housing targets as they will constrain the amount of growth required to meet identified need. Plan is not in conformity with paragraphs 47, 156 and 157 of the NPPF as it fails to deliver homes for identified need. Not enough outside areas of green infrastructure and flood risk to accomodate development. No justified reason to have ignored requirements of NPPF. Plan will not deliver necessary levels of development. Additional land must be allocated for development. Intention to extend plan period not in accordance with NPPF and NPPG. Housing figures don't relate to Sustainability Statement. Unsound due to lack of policy context for development. No consideration for Government White Paper.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID417/S/SS1/1		Sound	Despite my remarks about the proposals for Haxby and Wigginton, across our City, I am confident that, with the publication draft of the Local Plan, York will be able to provide sustainable development across the City and deliver a balance between providing new homes and delivering more employment, whilst protecting the City's special character.	Cllr Ian Cuthbertson



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID581/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Council's approach to identifying its Full Objectively Assessed Need (FOAN) is unsound	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP
SID581/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	The Council has not provided an annualised trajectory in order to understand in detail the phasing of delivery rates proposed for each site and how the Council will maintain a rolling five year housing land supply in accordance with the NPPF Paragraph 47 requirement. Therefore, it has not been justified that the trajectory can be delivered on a site specific basis.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP
SID582/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Our major concerns are The Publication Draft does not adequately present the correct Objective Assessment of Housing Need (OAHN) and The Council delivery of sites fails to deliver the right housing in the right location across the plan period to 2038.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID582/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	Concerns relating to the 5 year supply; It is known and accepted by the Council that it is unable to currently demonstrate a 5 year supply of housing and that matters will only worsen should the adoption of a new Local Plan be delayed. When an OAN higher than that sought in the Local Plan is applied with longer lead in times from these larger more remotes sites is applied, the current Local Plan falls well short of an early years 5 years supply. Student accommodation should be excluded from the completion figures.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID582/S/SS1/4		Not Sound	We question the validity of the use of historic windfalls going forward when such windfalls have come forward at a time of no adopted plan being in place. It is not certain that the average windfall rate will continue at this rate going forward	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/S/SS1/1			Our major concerns are The Publication Draft does not adequately present the correct Objective Assessment of Housing Need (OAHN) and The Council delivery of sites fails to deliver the right housing in the right location across the plan period to 2038. Under the sub-heading 'About the Plan' para i) informs the Local Plan Period runs from 2017 to 2032/33 with the exception of Green Belt boundaries which will endure to 2037/38. The text requires clarification. Points to note are:- . The Plan Period should be April 2017 to 31st March 2038. The housing allocations only partly extend beyond 2033, the Plan fails to justify the 2038 end date with the allocations as presented in Trajectory (Figure 5.1) demonstrating those shortcomings.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID583/S/SS1/2			As drafted, Policy SS1 wrongly references the housing number for the Plan Period and seeks a housing number that is not supported by the evidence base or the Sustainability Appraisal (SA). Furthermore, the policy seems to suggest that brownfield/PDL will be phased ahead of greenfield sites in reality given the allocations in this York Local Plan are all released in a single phase. Paragraph 3.3 needs to align with Table 5.2 in the Plan and recognise the fact that the shortfall since 2012 has been rolled into the new Plan Period commencing 2017. In relation to the Objectively Assessed Housing Need we are concerned the Council has taken a political route in selecting the lowest possible housing number available. The Council's own Sustainability Appraisal (February 2018) of the OAN Options at SA Appendix N informs a higher level of housing than that proposed in the current Plan would be more sustainable overall. We are aware of the work on OAHN undertaken by others including the modelling work of Lichfields. We acknowledge the approach taken by Lichfields which concludes an OAHN of at least 1,150 pa from the base date of 2012.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID583/S/SS1/3			Concerns relating to the 5 year supply; It is known and accepted by the Council that it is unable to currently demonstrate a 5 year supply of housing and that matters will only worsen should the adoption of a new Local Plan be delayed. When an OAN higher than that sought in the Local Plan is applied with longer lead in times from these larger more remote sites is applied, the current Local Plan falls well short of an early years 5 years supply. Student accommodation should be excluded from the completion figures.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID583/S/SS1/4			We question the validity of the use of historic windfalls going forward when such windfalls have come forward at a time of no adopted plan being in place. It is not certain that the average windfall rate will continue at this rate going forward	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/SS1/1			The Plan period should be 1st April 2017 to 31st March 2038. This would remove any confusion and ensure that upon adoption that plan period will be more than 15 years, as preferred by the NPPF.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/S/SS1/2			As drafted, Policy SS1 wrongly references the housing number for the Plan Period and seeks a housing number that is not supported by the evidence base or the Sustainability Appraisal (SA). SS1 contains a lower than required housing number and is therefore unsound for the following reasons:-Housing requirement is too low, ignores the advice of the Council's own consultants, the Governments OAHN methodology, conclusions of the SA and its own Officers' advice. Further, market signals suggest a 20% uplift is warranted;the 867 dpa will act as a brake on economic growth and harm the delivery of affordable housing;Housing fails to deliver the full requirement and fails to align with the Plan Period for the Green Belt boundaries up to 2038.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID584/S/SS1/3			Having reviewed the portfolio of sites set out in Local Plan, it appears that the Council's strategy is a combination of urban expansion, the provision of isolated new settlements and restricted growth in existing settlements. The document contains no narrative as to how, or why, the Council has arrived at this approach, nor does it set out the implications of this pattern of spatial distribution or discuss the alternative options considered.In sustainability terms, we still consider it more appropriate to focus growth in the York urban area and expand existing settlements. This approach would make best use of existing infrastructure and resources, as well as ensuring that the needs of the local community are met. In particular, the failure to allocate land in existing settlements will increase affordability pressures in the City.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID584/S/SS1/5			The plan is reliant on several large strategic sites making an early delivery start with high levels of delivery and it is our opinion that this approach is unrealistic, given the well researched lead in times for large strategic sites such as ST14, ST15 and ST35. This could cause problems for the 5 year supply which would be further exacerbated should a higher OAN be found appropriate.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Plan period should be 1st April 2017 to 31st March 2038.This would remove any confusion and ensure that upon adoption that plan period will be more than 15 years, as preferred by the NPPF.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID585/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	As drafted, Policy SS1 wrongly references the housing number for the Plan Period and seeks a housing number that is not supported by the evidence base or the Sustainability Appraisal(SA). SS1 contains a lower than required housing number and is therefore unsound for the following reasons:-*Housing requirement is too low, ignores the advice of the Council's own consultants, the Governments OAHN methodology, conclusions of the SA and its own Officers' advice. Further, market signals suggest a 20% uplift is warranted;*the 867 dpa will act as a brake on economic growth and harm the delivery of affordable housing;*Housing fails to deliver the full requirement and fails to align with the Plan Period for the Green Belt boundaries up to 2038.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	Having reviewed the portfolio of sites set out in Local Plan, it appears that the Council's strategy is a combination of urban expansion, the provision of isolated new settlements and restricted growth in existing settlements. The document contains no narrative as to how, or why, the Council has arrived at this approach, nor does it set out the implications of this pattern of spatial distribution or discuss the alternative options considered. In sustainability terms, we still consider it more appropriate to focus growth in the York urban area and expand existing settlements. This approach would make best use of existing infrastructure and resources, as well as ensuring that the needs of the local community are met. In particular, the failure to allocate land in existing settlements will increase affordability pressures in the City.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID585/S/SS1/5		Not Sound	We question the validity of the use of historic windfalls going forward when such windfalls have come forward at a time of no adopted plan being in place. It is not certain that the average windfall rate will continue at this rate going forward	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID586/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Publication Draft Local Plan is vastly insufficient in its housing numbers proposed and will require new sites to meet the additional housing need identified within the area. The approach taken does not meet with any of the test of soundness for the following reasons: The plan is not based upon a strategy that seeks to meet the objectively assessed need; The DCLG Consultation Document "Planning for the right homes in the right places: consultation proposals" sets out an annual requirement of 1070 dwellings as a minimum per annum for York and the Plan fails to increase its housing targets to meet this identified need. Without taking any identified shortfall that currently exists in the period 2012-2017 and taking into account the proposed housing target within the Pre-Publication Draft Local Plan, this leaves a shortfall of over 4000 additional dwellings that will be required to cover the period to 2032. This approach is neither positive, justified, effective, nor consistent with National Policy.	Savills (M Boyce) OBO Mr Thomas & Mr Allen Park
SID587/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Rep goes into much greater detail but to summarise - objects to current housing policy as OAHN figure is too low, backlog since 2012 has been under-estimated, outstanding commitments include student housing that should be excluded and the assumptions on windfalls are questionable and should not be treated as a component of the Plan. The plan relies too heavily on too few large sites to deliver the housing needed. Meeting the OAHN figure seems to be predicated on a large number of high density flats / apartments whilst the SHMA indicated greatest demand was for good quality family homes. It is unlikely that the densities in the plan will be delivered and the council has little power to enforce them.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh)OBO Shepherd Homes Land at Cherry Lane
SID590/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Housing figure too low. Concerned about the backlog. Failure to meet housing need has direct and negative impact on the economy.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID590/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	The Local Plan identifies a requirement for only 34 hectares of employment land over the 15-year plan period plus the additional 5 years for the period 2033 to 2038. Against this the plan allocates 57 hectares of strategic employment land. However, of this, 10hectares is already allocated for Autohorn at Whitehall Grange and 21 hectares is allocated for the knowledge based activities at the York University but is only expected to accommodate 21,500 sq m of floorspace. The majority of the 21 hectares allocation is for landscaping.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID590/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	In summary, the Chamber concludes that the identified employment land supply will not cater for York's future needs and this will constrain economic growth. In light of The Chamber feels that further land should be identified to broaden the portfolio of sites available to cater for York's diverse high value-added businesses and new inward investment to the City. Such sites should be located in areas accessible by public transport and the major road network and be deliverable in the short term.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID592/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Rep goes into much greater detail but essentially OAHN figure is too low, the plan relies too heavily on high densities at a few major sites, demand in York is for family homes not the high density flats and apartments that make up most of the housing in the plan. The plan should be allocating safeguarded land to ensure that when York does eventually have a defined green belt boundary that it is permanent. In short, the plan as it is will not meet the city's housing need.	ONEill Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Yorvik Homes
SID595/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	At present the Council have maintained their decision to progress with a housing target which is based solely on the baseline figure which is derived from the ONS 2014-based sub-national household projections and does not include the 10% uplift for market signals which is advised within the Council's latest SHMA. By omitting the 10% uplift, and not progressing with a housing requirement of 954 dwellings per annum, the Council are failing to meet their full OAN, as required by the Framework and the Planning Practice Guidance (PPG). There are considered to be no overarching constraints within the District that justify the Council not delivering their full OAN. Such an approach therefore fails to meet any of the tests of soundness set out in paragraph 182 of the NPPF as the Local Plan is not positively prepared; justified; effective and consistent with national policy.	Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID598/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Consider that the lack of a safeguarded land policy and the lack of identified safeguarded land sites to be unsound and unjustified and as such the Local Plan will not be effective. We consider that the lack of a safeguarded land policy and safeguarded sites is contrary to national policy. Also, it is considered that the Council are not providing sufficient land to ensure that the Green Belt, when adopted for the first time, will be permanent. The Local Plan has therefore not been positively prepared. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and all seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy SS1 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID598/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Council have not properly assessed the OAHN or set out a justified and effective housing requirement nor have the Council demonstrated an adequate supply of land as required by national guidance. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy SS1 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Consider that the lack of a safeguarded land policy and the lack of identified safeguarded land sites to be unsound and unjustified and as such the Local Plan will not be effective. We consider that the lack of a safeguarded land policy and safeguarded sites is contrary to national policy. Also, it is considered that the Council are not providing sufficient land to ensure that the Green Belt, when adopted for the first time, will be permanent. The Local Plan has therefore not been positively prepared. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and all seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy SS1 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID600/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Council have not properly assessed the OAHN or set out a justified and effective housing requirement nor have the Council demonstrated an adequate supply of land as required by national guidance. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy SS1 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Consider that the lack of a safeguarded land policy and the lack of identified safeguarded land sites to be unsound and unjustified and as such the Local Plan will not be effective. We consider that the lack of a safeguarded land policy and safeguarded sites is contrary to national policy. Also, it is considered that the Council are not providing sufficient land to ensure that the Green Belt, when adopted for the first time, will be permanent. The Local Plan has therefore not been positively prepared. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and all seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy SS1 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID601/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Council have not properly assessed the OAHN or set out a justified and effective housing requirement nor have the Council demonstrated an adequate supply of land as required by national guidance. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy SS1 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Consider that the lack of a safeguarded land policy and the lack of identified safeguarded land sites to be unsound and unjustified and as such the Local Plan will not be effective. We consider that the lack of a safeguarded land policy and safeguarded sites is contrary to national policy. Also, it is considered that the Council are not providing sufficient land to ensure that the Green Belt, when adopted for the first time, will be permanent. The Local Plan has therefore not been positively prepared. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and all seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy SS1 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID602/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Council have not properly assessed the OAHN or set out a justified and effective housing requirement nor have the Council demonstrated an adequate supply of land as required by national guidance. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy SS1 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID603/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Objects to housing requirement number as too low for the housing affordability issues in city. Does not comply with planning practise guidance.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited
SID604/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The housing requirement and the predicted housing supply is not justified, effective or consistent with national planning policy or even the council's own evidence base. In particular, the minimum annual provision of 867 new dwellings per annum is not based upon any robust objective assessment of need – even the council's own evidence base gives an OAN of 953dpa. The plan should provide for a minimum of 1,070 new dwellings per annum.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID605/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	SS1 is not considered to be sound as it is not positively prepared, effective or consistent with national policy as a result of the housing requirement being set at 867 dwellings per annum. The GL Hearn Strategic Housing Market Assessment May 2017 clearly recommends that, based on their assessment of market signals evidence and some recent Inspectors decisions, the council should include a 10% market signals adjustment to the 867 figure, resulting in a requirement of 953 dwellings per annum. We are aware that other respondents are indicating figures of 1,070 in line with the emerging new national housing land requirement methodology or even higher.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Mr D Lancaster & Oakwood Business Park
SID606/S/SS1/1			867 dwellings per annum is unsound. Needs to be higher based on evidence.	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO KeyLand Developments Ltd
SID606/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Plan is over-reliant on the delivery of large strategic sites to provide the vast majority of the city's housing requirement. These sites are likely to have complex masterplanning and delivery issues which will affect their lead-in times, and push their delivery into the latter part of the plan period and beyond.	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO KeyLand Developments Ltd
SID607/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Plan maintains the minimum annual housing requirement of 867 dwellings which was set in the pre publication draft plan. Consider this housing requirement to be unsound	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO Taylor Wimpey

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID609/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The current plan fails to provide enough housing and particular affordable / social housing for the future, falling massively short of the minimum overall 1070 homes per year requirement the Government's draft 2017 proposals.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID609/S/SS1/2			A projected 30% increase in travel time across the network and a 55% increase in peak hour congestion and the associated air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays for people and businesses is simply unacceptable. No analysis of what improvements should be made.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID611/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Plan's strategy fails to ensure housing needs are met. The Council has ignored the Government's standardised methodology for identifying housing need and advice from its own consultants. The Plan does not evidence its inability to accommodate the full OAHN. On this basis the Plan can only be found to be unsound as it has not been positively prepared to promote growth (both in housing and employment terms) and it will not be effective in addressing housing need.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID611/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Plan period - the Plan has not been prepared in conformity with NPPF, given that it allocates land for development beyond the Plan period. Land is being brought forward without a policy framework.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID613/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Plan's strategy fails to ensure housing needs are met. The Council has ignored the Government's standardised methodology for identifying housing need and advice from its own consultants. The Plan does not evidence its inability to accommodate the full OAHN. On this basis the Plan can only be found to be unsound as it has not been positively prepared to promote growth (both in housing and employment terms) and it will not be effective in addressing housing need.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Askham Bryan College
SID613/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Plan period - the Plan has not been prepared in conformity with NPPF, given that it allocates land for development beyond the Plan period. Land is being brought forward without a policy framework.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Askham Bryan College
SID614/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Plan's strategy fails to ensure housing needs are met. The Council has ignored the Government's standardised methodology for identifying housing need and advice from its own consultants. The Plan does not evidence its inability to accommodate the full OAHN. On this basis the Plan can only be found to be unsound as it has not been positively prepared to promote growth (both in housing and employment terms) and it will not be effective in addressing housing need.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID614/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	Plan period - the Plan has not been prepared in conformity with NPPF, given that it allocates land for development beyond the Plan period. Land is being brought forward without a policy framework.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID620/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The assessment of the housing requirement and the housing allocations set out in the Draft Plan to be inadequate for the following reasons: (i) The housing requirement is too low; (ii) The calculation of completions since 2012 is too high (i.e. the Councils estimate of backlog is too low) (iii) Outstanding commitments include student housing that should be excluded (iv) The assumptions on windfalls are questionable and should not be treated as a component of the Plan. Representation provides detailed alternative requirement.	Eamonn Keogh ONEILL Associates OBO Galtres Village Development Company
SID620/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	No evidence to demonstrate how market housing supply has been increased by students transferring from traditional private sector shared housing. Indeed, the available evidence presented in the City of York Council Strategic Housing Market Assessment June 2016 is that new purpose-built student accommodation has not displaced students from market or family housing. In addition, not demonstrated that students form part of the objectively assessed housing need nor demonstrated that new student housing accommodation would contribute towards meeting the housing requirement.	Eamonn Keogh ONEILL Associates OBO Galtres Village Development Company
SID620/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	It is envisaged that a high proportion of the total number of dwellings to be delivered over the plan period will be derived from the 19 strategic sites . However, there is no real certainty over the rate of delivery that can be achieved on some of these sites.	Eamonn Keogh ONEILL Associates OBO Galtres Village Development Company

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID825/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	In the absence of an Environmental Capacity Study, the Plan is not 'positively prepared'. It does not meet the need for new housing, other development infrastructure and business development, it exceeds greatly the natural growth of the City by adhering to Government imposed growth targets, largely driven by International Inward Migration, which cannot be accommodated in York. The Plan should have included an Environmental Capacity Study, as previously requested by English Heritage (A Sustainability Appraisal is not a suitable replacement). This approach has led to an unsound plan, which is demonstrated by the English Heritage's submission to the 2006 Derwenthorpe & Germany Beck Inquiry (quote attached in submission). The (largely Govt imposed) growth levels in the Plan (large urban extensions / garden villages) will erode the special character of the City. NPPF Green Belt purpose ("To preserve the setting and special character of historic towns") is especially relevant - this was accepted historically in previous Local Plans. Will this purpose survive the development pressures being created by population growth, rather than natural change? If not, the special character of York (small historic City with a surrounding hinterland of small villages) will be lost forever . Views of the Minster looking westwards from the A64 with the Green Belt in the hinterland is essential to the character of York (and the proposed development of ST7 will destroy this character). The growth levels proposed will lead to a worsening of the traffic situation and gridlock. No indication of a financed plan to dual the A1237. Recent PINS decisions submitted to demonstrate the issue. Failure to address traffic implications renders the Plan unsound. Similar concerns re: infrastructure (eg. York District Hospital).	Osbalwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID825/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	With all the developments, fail to see how the A64 / Grimston Bar roundabout & A1079 will cope with the extra traffic.	Osbalwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID827/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The plan is not positively prepared in that it is inadequate for the number of dwellings required per annum and throughout the plan period. It does not account for market signals or comply with the national method for calculating OAHN. More info submitted by Pilcher homes and a Regeneris consulting FOAN report.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID827/s/SS1/1		Not Sound	The plan is not effective as the large sites limit the number of local SME developers which puts the deliverability of the plan in the hands of too few housebuilders.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID827/s/SS1/1		Not Sound	The plan is not effective because it does not allocate safeguarded land which means that no land between the built up edge and the inner greenbelt boundary ( where evidence base shows that there are areas which do not need to be kept permanently open) can come forward without a revision of the plan. The plan instead focuses on unsustainable dormitory settlements accessed by car.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID827/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Plan is not effective because it is dependent on a few very large new settlements with long timeframes for delivery or complex infrastructure needs (such as ST5, ST14 and ST15) as well as the uncertainty of the MOD land within the plan period.	Pilcher Homes Ltd

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID827/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The plan is not positively prepared as it makes no effort to provide for the neighbouring authorities and seeks for them to provide housing. The lack of an adopted plan since 1954 has had a negative impact on neighbouring authorities.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID827/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	The plan is not justified because the most appropriate spatial strategy has not been used, a better approach would be to allocate available land within thr ring road.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID827/S/SS1/3		Not Sound	The Plan is not effective because it cannot be delivered over the plan period as it does not address the long term undersupply	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID838/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	Seeking to adopt a plan with only 867 dpa over the plan period when there is evidence that there is a requirement for 1070 as set out in proposed DCLG for calculating housing need it is considered that the Plan has not been positively prepared.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID841/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The Plan does not provide an evidence-based spatial strategy for the City but a plan which is an amalgamation of sites and policies which offer the least resistance to the Council. The Plan in its current form was endorsed by the Council's Executive and the Local Plan Working Group not to accept the Council's own consultants' estimate of the city's housing requirement for the Plan period the consultants' estimate itself being significantly below the housing requirement of the Government's draft Standard methodology for calculation for OAN. The housing requirement varied from 840 dpa, to 1,070 dpa (applying the standard methodology) with the figure endorsed by the Executive and now incorporated into the draft plan set at 867 dpa . The Council has not produced any evidence to substantiate this figure. Representations from the promoters of two of the largest proposed housing allocations (Sites ST14 and ST15) and representative of the Chamber of Trade each of whom warned that a Plan based on the reduced housing figures would be found to be unsound: also, in respect of the two proposed housing allocations, Sites ST14 and 15, the development would be unviable and hence undeliverable if the areas and/or the capacities of the sites were reduced. The unsoundness is compounded by concentrating provision in a small number of large sites	Jennifer Hubbard Planning
SID848/S/SS1/1			The Plan period should be 1st April 2017 to 31st March 2038. This would remove any confusion and ensure that upon adoption that plan period will be more than 15 years, as preferred by the NPPF.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID848/S/SS1/5			The plan is reliant on several large strategic sites making an early delivery start with high levels of delivery and it is our opinion that this approach is unrealistic, given the well researched lead in times for large stratigic sites such as ST14, ST15 and ST35.This could cause problems for the 5 year supply which would be furhter exacerbated should a higher OAN be found appropriate.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/S/SS1/2			As drafted, Policy SS1 wrongly references the housing number for the Plan Period and seeks a housing number that is not supported by the evidence base or the Sustainability Appraisal (SA). SS1 contains a lower than required housing number and is therefore unsound for the following reasons:-Housing requirement is too low, ignores the advice of the Council's own consultants, the Governments OAHN methodology, conclusions of the SA and its own Officers' advice. Further, market signals suggest a 20% uplift is warranted;the 867 dpa will act as a brake on economic growth and harm the delivery of affordable housing;Housing fails to deliver the full requirement and fails to align with the Plan Period for the Green Belt boundaries up to 2038.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID848/S/SS1/3			Having reviewed the portfolio of sites set out in Local Plan, it appears that the Council's strategy is a combination of urban expansion, the provision of isolated new settlements and restricted growth in existing settlements. The document contains no narrative as to how, or why, the Council has arrived at this approach, nor does it set out the implications of this pattern of spatial distribution or discuss the alternative options considered.In sustainability terms, we still consider it more appropriate to focus growth in the York urban area and expand existing settlements. This approach would make best use of existing infrastructure and resources, as well as ensuring that the needs of the local community are met. In particular, the failure to allocate land in existing settlements will increase affordability pressures in the City.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID851/S/SS1/1		Sound	Plan should protect the greenbelt, provide enough houses and make sure affordability is improved in York.	NDM 14
SID61/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	City centre is different from centre of city, city centre is defined on this page as per the NPPF. Centre of the city of York however is defined nowhere yet calculation on distance for green belt are measured as 6 miles. This nebulous number means that areas within the draft green belt cannot clearly be seen which makes planning more difficult. Washed over green belt encourages builders to buy land they are not allowed to build on due to green belt restrictions.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID1/Mod/SS1/1			* Plan for more homes to be built	David Marsh
SID12/Mod/SS1/1			Housing numbers for each year and total life of the plan are calculated using the accepted methodology. Councillors should listen to officers advice on housing figures, not use insufficient figures motivated by local elections in 2019.	Tracey Simpson- Laing
SID18/Mod/SS1/1			Increase the overall housing number by around 4,000 and include the Galtres Garden Village development in the plan.	John Nichol

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID72/MOD/SS1/1			Reconsider the plan to relocate developments to the South of the city, where the roads infrastructure is better able to cope. Lower taxpayer subsidies should be achievable by moving the bias to the south of the city. Demonstrate an acceptance that infrastructure investment is a required precondition to development proceeding and identifying funding sources or make suitable communities to planning constraints that will be added to any planning approvals (ie. before the scheme proceeds stated infrastructure developments will have taken place or the developer will provide funding to the council to enable the infrastructure developments to take place).	Andrew Montgomery
SID118/MOD/SS1/1			Section 3/ SS1 - Add a section which explains the reasons why the Plan is proposing to develop the two new settlements and the justification for their form and size.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/SS1/1			Section 3/ SS1 - Add a section which explains the reasons why the Plan is proposing to develop the two new settlements and the justification for their form and size.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/SS1/2			Policy SS1 should reference scale of development. Policy SS1, second Paragraph amend to read:- "The location and scale of development through the plan .... etc"	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/SS1/2			Policy SS1 should reference scale of development. Policy SS1, second Paragraph amend to read:- "The location and scale of development through the plan .... etc"	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/SS1/3			To recognise the contribution of the wider rural landscape, amend Paragraph 3.5 line 11 amend to read:- "... are illustrated in Figure 3.1. However, many areas of the open countryside beyond the ring road also makes an important contribution to the wider rural setting of the historic city"	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/SS1/3			To recognise the contribution of the wider rural landscape, amend Paragraph 3.5 line 11 amend to read:- "... are illustrated in Figure 3.1. However, many areas of the open countryside beyond the ring road also makes an important contribution to the wider rural setting of the historic city"	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID125/Mod/SS1/1			Persimmon together with other developers appointed Lichfields to provide a recommendation on dwelling requirement figure in 2017 and has done so again for 2018, Persimmon supports the figure of 1,150 dwellings per annum as proposed by Lichfields.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID144/Mod/SS1/1			The number of proposed new homes should be increased to the numbers recommended by experts to meet expected demand.	Christopher Arundel

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID158/Mod/SS1/1			The plan should commit to more affordable and family homes, and restrict student accommodation to spare land on the University of York campus. It should restrict luxury flats and investment properties. The targets should be legally binding and not optional. Larger brownfield sites need a much higher mix of homes for families, young couples and single working professional adults. A scheme should be in place so people who have lived and worked in York for 4+ years have the first chance to buy some of the proposed new homes. If people live in the City, it will ease up pressure on the roads as less people will commute in to the City from Ryedale, Doncaster etc.	Dan Taylor
SID165/Mod/SS1/1			Local Plan should be based on OAHN of 706 dwellings per annum for the plan period.	Richard Frost
SID182/Mod/SS1/1		Not Sound	Para 2.5 needs rewording to inform these sites are to be identified now, at the start of the plan period. This para also needs to be clear over the plan period, that being up to 31 March 2038.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID210/Mod/SS1/1			In order to address the conflicts identified and ensure that Policy SS1 is sound, it is considered that City of York Council should amend the Policy as follows: 1 The calculation of OAHN should be based on the normal 'policy-off' methodology. 2 Given the significantly worsening market signals identified in City of York, Lichfields consider that a 20% uplift would be appropriate in this instance and should be applied to the OAHN, plus a further 10% uplift to help address affordable housing needs. 3 There should be a focus on growth on extensions to the York urban area and the expansion of existing settlements to make best use of existing infrastructure and resources, as well as ensuring that the needs of the local community are met. 4 The Council should identify additional land for housing (including the appropriate definition of the Green Belt boundary) to meet the housing needs of the community. This is the only approach that will deliver a 'sound' plan and enable the much needed investment in new housing to meet the community's needs.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID214/Mod/SS1/1			Safeguarded land should be identified to meet housing requirements beyond the end of the plan period	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID216/Mod/SS1/1			In view of the fundamental flaw in relation to assessment of housing need should not be submitted to the SoS in its current form. The Council should carry out a full reassessment of housing need paying full regard to housing signals.	Eversheds Sutherland (Roddy MacDonald) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID231/Mod/SS1/1			FPC considers that the Local Plan should be based on an OAHN of 706 dwellings per annum for the plan period to reduce harm to city.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID244/Mod/SS1/1			Take all objective housing assessments over the last 10 years and average the assessment figures to come to a more realistic number of houses suitable for York's needs.	Jason Rose
SID255/Mod/SS1/1			HBF propose that the policy is modified as follows: 'Deliver a minimum annual provision of 1,070 867 new dwellings over the plan period to 2032/33 and post plan period to 2037/38. This will enable the building of strong, sustainable communities through addressing the housing and community needs of York's current and future population'. 'Where viable and deliverable, the use of sustainable sites reuse of previously developed land will be phased first.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID257/Mod/SS1/1			A minimum housing requirement figure of 1,180dpa is required to make the plan 'sound'.	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID267/Mod/SS1/1			Council should delete more land from the Green belt and allocate more land for housing.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID267/Mod/SS1/2			Housing requirement should be increased.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID267/Mod/SS1/3			Land south of Foxwood Lane, Acomb should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID274/Mod/SS1/1			The housing quota of 1348 homes at ST14 should be added to ST15 which already has a dualled access road with grade separated junctions: the A64. There are also plans to further dual the A64 towards Scarborough which would alleviate any potential congestion on this stretch.	The Dransfield Family
SID335/MOD/SS1/1			Land should be identified for a new settlement / garden village to the east of York with access to the A64.	Lionel Lennox
SID345/MOD/SS1/1			Would be helpful to acknowledge the Governments proposed standard housing methodology in the plan	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS1/2			The plan should allow suitable and deliverable sites to meet the 953dpa SHMA OAHN and government proposed figure (Jan 17) of 1070dpa. Starting point for writing Policy SS1 relating to housing need in York, should be whether the minimum figure of 953dpa can be met within York, given the existence of available, suitable and deliverable sites.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID347/Mod/SS1/1			The level of housing proposed in Policy SS1 should be increased in line with the SHMA to reflect market signals increasing the OAN to 953 dwellings per annum with additional flexibility added above this to support delivery	Planning Prospects (Jason Tait) OBO Miller Homes
SID350/Mod/SS1/1			The plan should provide for a minimum of 1,000 new dwellings per annum.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Picton Capital
SID354/Mod/SS1/1			it is strongly recommended that the housing need in the Local Plan is increased to a minimum of 1,070 dwellings per annum at this stage, in alignment with the methodology, which will require the identification of additional land, to ensure that the inevitable changes to the Green Belt in York are made now, and secured for the long term	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID357/Mod/SS1/1			Given the conclusions of the Sustainability Appraisal it would be expected that at the very least the SHMA Update 2017 953 dpa figure should be identified as the proposed housing need figure for York.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID360/Mod/SS1/1			Whilst we do not wish to question the overall annual provision, we do note that the plan whilst delivering higher housing numbers than has been achieved over the last 10 years, does not make any additional uplift to the OAN for market signals.	North Yorkshire Country Council - Tricia Richards
SID364/Mod/SS1/1			Expansion to SS1 wording regarding accessibility to sustainable modes of transport.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/SS1/1			Immediate release of readily deliverable land to achieve housing target. Increase scale of sites where constrained to ensure full range of facilities and services are provided. Major sites developed on "garden city" principles or if not sufficient then allocate Greenfield sites that were identified in early drafts. ST1 should be used for new public park. H56 threats potential community use of university playing fields.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/Mod/SS1/1			Expansion to SS1 wording regarding accessibility to sustainable modes of transport.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/Mod/SS1/2			Affordable housing ratios to be raised to 25% on brownfield sites and 35% on greenfield sites. Reduce reliance on brownfield sites to reduce pressure on housing in York central. Provision for social housing on larger housing sites should be incorporated. Establish a York living rent. Introduce article 4 determination across all HMOs. Require new properties to be offered to York Residents before going on open market.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID376/Mod/SS1/1			TW Uk propose the following changes to the policy to make it sound: • 'Deliver a minimum annual provision of 1,150 new dwellings over the plan period to 2032/33 and post plan period to 2037/38. This will enable the building of strong, sustainable communities through addressing the housing and community needs of York's current and future population.' • Delete: 'Where viable and deliverable, the re-use of previously developed land will be phased first'.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID378/Mod/SS1/1			Policy SS1 bullet point 1 reference to 650 jobs needs to be reviewed due to requirement for additional housing.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/Mod/SS1/2			Bullet point 2 - change 867 to 953 dwellings.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/Mod/SS1/3			Add new bullet point after second: "In order to deliver the required new dwellings, a new garden village will be developed in the south east of the City (site allocation ST15)."	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID418/Mod/SS1/1			Allocation sites must be selected in accordance with site selection methodology. Green belt land must be assessed against all five functions of greenbelt in NPPF 80. Greenbelt boundary must be fully defined to the same level of precision for both outer and inner boundary. The defensibility of land on the border of the greenbelt should be assessed and used to justify a boundary which could endure beyond the plan period.	Save Windmill Lane Playing Fields - Chris Wedgwood
SID581/Mod/SS1/1			All available approaches to housing need, both current and emerging, point to an OAN of at least 1,070 dpa for York. This is the figure that should be used by York in its emerging Local Plan.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP
SID582/Mod/SS1/1			Para 2.5 informs that 'By the end of the plan period sufficient sites will have been identified for viable and deliverable house sites ...'. This needs rewording to inform these sites are to be identified now, at the start of the plan period. This para also needs to be clear over the plan period, that being up to 31 March 2038.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID582/Mod/SS1/2			Provide a buffer of sites to provide choice and flexibility in the market, and not place an over reliance on windfall delivery. . Remove reference to phasing. Remove text on 5 year supply assuming there is no release mechanism, thus no need for 5 year supply text.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID582/Mod/SS1/3		Not Sound	Under the sub-heading 'About the Plan' para i) informs the Local Plan Period runs from 2017 to 2032/33 with the exception of Green Belt boundaries which will endure to 2037/38. The text require clarification. Points to note are:- . The Plan Period should be April 2017 to 31st March 2038. The housing allocations only partly extend beyond 2033, the Plan fails to justify the 2038 end date with the allocations as presented in Trajectory (Figure 5.1) demonstrating those shortcomings.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/Mod/SS1/2			Provide a buffer of sites to provide choice and flexibility in the market, and not place an over reliance on windfall delivery. . Remove reference to phasing. Remove text on 5 year supply assuming there is no release mechanism, thus no need for 5 year supply text.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/SS1/1			The Plan period should be 1st April 2017 to 31st March 2038.This would remove any confusion and ensure that upon adoption that plan period will be more than 15 years, as preferred by the NPPF	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID584/Mod/SS1/2			Amend para 3.3 to align with Table 5.2 in the Plan and recognise the fact that the shortfall since 2012 has been rolled into the new Plan Period commencing 2017. The introduction text in the Plan states the Plan Period commences 2017. If that is the case the housing requirement is 867+56 = 923 as per the trajectory table.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID584/Mod/SS1/3			The figures of the 2017 SHMA (adjusted for early years shortfall) and the DCLG Methodology are broadly similar and would suggest the net annual requirement for York is at least 1,000 dwellings per annum based upon the Council's own material and more likely 1,150 dpa based upon the DCLG and Lichfield's work once economic growth is factored into both.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID584/Mod/SS1/4			The proposed spatial strategy for the City, and how this will be achieved over the lifetime of the Plan (up to 2038), should be set out clearly in the Plan. Without this context it is not possible to consider the suitability of the portfolio of sites. The absence of an overarching spatial strategy is apparent as the Plan identifies two strategic housing allocations in isolated locations, significantly separated from the main urban area. Such an approach does not promote sustainable patterns of development as required by the Framework, and therefore conflicts with national guidance.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/SS1/1			The Plan period should be 1st April 2017 to 31st March 2038.This would remove any confusion and ensure that upon adoption that plan period will be more than 15 years, as preferred by the NPPF.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/Mod/SS1/2			Amend para 3.3 to align with Table 5.2 in the Plan and recognise the fact that the shortfall since 2012 has been rolled into the new Plan Period commencing 2017. The introduction text in the Plan states the Plan Period commences 2017. If that is the case the housing requirement is 867+56 = 923 as per the trajectory table.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID585/Mod/SS1/3			The figures of the 2017 SHMA (adjusted for early years shortfall) and the DCLG Methodology are broadly similar and would suggest the net annual requirement for York is at least 1,000 dwellings per annum based upon the Council's own material and more likely 1,150 dpa based upon the DCLG and Lichfield's work once economic growth is factored into both.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID585/Mod/SS1/4			The proposed spatial strategy for the City, and how this will be achieved over the lifetime of the Plan (up to 2038), should be set out clearly in the Plan. Without this context it is not possible to consider the suitability of the portfolio of sites. The absence of an overarching spatial strategy is apparent as the Plan identifies two strategic housing allocations in isolated locations, significantly separated from the main urban area. Such an approach does not promote sustainable patterns of development as required by the Framework, and therefore conflicts with national guidance.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID585/Mod/SS1/5			Provide a buffer of sites to provide choice and flexibility in the market, and not place an over reliance on windfall delivery. . Remove reference to phasing. Remove text on 5 year supply assuming there is no release mechanism, thus no need for 5 year supply text.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID586/Mod/SS1/1			Revisions to Policy SS1 to address the housing shortfall and a adopt a robust annual housing requirement in line with the published DCLG Consultation Document "Planning for the right homes in the right places: consultation proposals" which sets out an annual requirement of 1070 dwellings as a minimum per annum for York.	Savills (M Boyce) OBO Mr Thomas & Mr Allen Park
SID587/Mod/SS1/1			The housing requirement figure for the Plan Period should be increased to at least 1,100 dwellings per annum.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh)OBO Shepherd Homes Land at Cherry Lane

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID590/Mod/SS1/1		Not Sound	The calculation for York was a housing requirement of 1,070 dwellings per annum. The consultation paper explains that this should be treated as the starting point for assessing the housing requirement. the Council should be incorporating a considerable element of flexibility into the housing figures in the plan, particularly when the latest evidence is indicating yet further upward pressure on the requirement for housing. The housing requirement should therefore be increased and additional land allocations made to meet the housing need of the city.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID592/Mod/SS1/1			The OAHN figure should be raised to at least over 1,000, suggests figure of 1,070.	ONEill Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Yorvik Homes
SID598/Mod/SS1/1			The plan should include a safeguarded land policy and an appropriate quantum of safeguarded land sites. This will help ensure that when the green belt is adopted for the first time it will be permanent. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/Mod/SS1/2			The Council should allocate additional land to meet the housing needs of the community and these sites should be able to deliver early in the plan period. This is the only approach that will deliver a 'sound' plan and enable the much-needed investment in new housing to meet the community's needs.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/Mod/SS1/1			The plan should include a safeguarded land policy and an appropriate quantum of safeguarded land sites. This will help ensure that when the green belt is adopted for the first time it will be permanent. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID600/Mod/SS1/2			The Council should allocate additional land to meet the housing needs of the community and these sites should be able to deliver early in the plan period. This is the only approach that will deliver a 'sound' plan and enable the much-needed investment in new housing to meet the community's needs.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/Mod/SS1/1			The plan should include a safeguarded land policy and an appropriate quantum of safeguarded land sites. This will help ensure that when the green belt is adopted for the first time it will be permanent. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID601/Mod/SS1/2			The Council should allocate additional land to meet the housing needs of the community and these sites should be able to deliver early in the plan period. This is the only approach that will deliver a 'sound' plan and enable the much-needed investment in new housing to meet the community's needs.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/Mod/SS1/1			The plan should include a safeguarded land policy and an appropriate quantum of safeguarded land sites. This will help ensure that when the green belt is adopted for the first time it will be permanent. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID602/Mod/SS1/2			The Council should allocate additional land to meet the housing needs of the community and these sites should be able to deliver early in the plan period. This is the only approach that will deliver a 'sound' plan and enable the much-needed investment in new housing to meet the community's needs.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID603/Mod/SS1/1			Should increase to 1070dpa suggested by government.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited
SID607/Mod/SS1/1		Not Sound	When market signals are properly taken into consideration a more appropriate figure is 1,150 dwellings per annum	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO Taylor Wimpey
SID609/Mod/SS1/1			We feel the plan should be amended to deliver at least the Government's estimated minimum 1070 houses a year. There is a need for the Council to introduce a local plan policy to protect the residual offices in the city centre.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID611/Mod/SS1/1			If the Plan is to be found sound then the annual housing target would need to increase to at least 867 plus 10% as recommended by GL Hearn, and to accord with para 47 of NPPF, should instead use the Government's objectively assessed housing need figure as the basis for the housing target.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID611/Mod/SS1/2			The Council plans to allocate land for development beyond the period to which the strategy is intended to apply. There is not a legitimate justification for deferring from a sound approach. The Plan period simply needs to be extended along with the identification of land for other types of development by a further 5 years. Or else, the allocations identified for delivery beyond the Plan period need to be deleted.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID613/Mod/SS1/1			If the Plan is to be found sound then the annual housing target would need to increase to at least 867 plus 10% as recommended by GL Hearn, and to accord with para 47 of NPPF, should instead use the Government's objectively assessed housing need figure as the basis for the housing target.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Askham Bryan College
SID614/Mod/SS1/1			If the Plan is to be found sound then the annual housing target would need to increase to at least 867 plus 10% as recommended by GL Hearn, and to accord with para 47 of NPPF, should instead use the Government's objectively assessed housing need figure as the basis for the housing target.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID614/Mod/SS1/2			The Council plans to allocate land for development beyond the period to which the strategy is intended to apply. There is not a legitimate justification for deferring from a sound approach. The Plan period simply needs to be extended along with the identification of land for other types of development by a further 5 years. Or else, the allocations identified for delivery beyond the Plan period need to be deleted.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID825/MOD/SS1/1			City of York Council to undertake an Environmental Capacity Study	Osbalwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID827/Mod/SS1/1			Increase the OAN to at least 1070 dpa	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID827/Mod/SS1/2		Not Sound	A more sound approach to creating a justified plan would be an alternative spatial approach of allocating land inside the ring road close to existing amenities (Such as site 191) for the correct number of homes.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID827/Mod/SS1/3			A greater variety of sites should be added with a focus on sustainability and deliverability including the allocation of more small and medium sized sites (such as site 191) which could address the long term under supply and the lack of a 5 year housing supply.	Pilcher Homes Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID838/Mod/SS1/1			Council should delete more land from the Green belt and allocate more land for housing.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID838/Mod/SS1/2			Housing requirement should be increased.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID839/Mod/SS1/1			From delivering roughly 500 houses per annum, to nearly 1000 houses per annum, I believe that through the housing delivered under the plan, affordability will be improved in York.	Della Johnson
SID845/Mod/SS1/1			From delivering roughly 500 houses per annum, to nearly 1000 houses per annum, I believe that through the housing delivered under the plan, affordability will be improved in York.	J M Agnew
SID846/Mod/SS1/1			From delivering roughly 500 houses per annum, to nearly 1000 houses per annum, I believe that through the housing delivered under the plan, affordability will be improved in York.	NDM 13
SID848/Mod/SS1/1			The Plan period should be 1st April 2017 to 31st March 2038.This would remove any confusion and ensure that upon adoption that plan period will be more than 15 years, as preferred by the NPPF	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID848/Mod/SS1/3			The figures of the 2017 SHMA (adjusted for early years shortfall) and the DCLG Methodology are broadly similar and would suggest the net annual requirement for York is at least 1,000 dwellings per annum based upon the Council's own material and more likely 1,150 dpa based upon the DCLG and Lichfield's work once economic growth is factored into both.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID848/Mod/SS1/2			Amend para 3.3 to align with Table 5.2 in the Plan and recognise the fact that the shortfall since 2012 has been rolled into the new Plan Period commencing 2017. The introduction text in the Plan states the Plan Period commences 2017. If that is the case the housing requirement is 867+56 = 923 as per the trajectory table.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/Mod/SS1/4			The proposed spatial strategy for the City, and how this will be achieved over the lifetime of the Plan (up to 2038), should be set out clearly in the Plan. Without this context it is not possible to consider the suitability of the portfolio of sites. The absence of an overarching spatial strategy is apparent as the Plan identifies two strategic housing allocations in isolated locations, significantly separated from the main urban area. Such an approach does not promote sustainable patterns of development as required by the Framework, and therefore conflicts with national guidance.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID60/LC/SS2/1		Not Legally Compliant	On the basis that the proposed Green Belt boundary does not allow for any of the development needs of Gypsies & Travellers, it is difficult to see how a decision to adopt the York Local Plan on the basis of the current draft would be compatible with the Public Sector EqualityDuty under s.149 of the Act.	Michael Hargreaves Planning OBO York Travellers Trust
SID68/LC/SS2/1				SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID75/LC/SS2/1		Not Legally Compliant	The NPPF states that protecting the Green Belt remains sacrosanct, only in exceptional circumstances should there be releases. Brown Field before Green Belt. It is not clear the Council has provided the proof of "exceptional" circumstances.	Heslington Parish Council
SID214/LC/SS2/1	Does not comply with DtC		With regard to the duty to co-operate it may be the case the Council has consulted with neighbouring authorities, but some of those authorities have expressed concerns that have not been fully resolved.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID257/LC/SS2/1				ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID267/S/SS2/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID320/LC/SS2/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Believes the plan should keep the current designated areas of green belt land.	Jane Hopley
SID321/LC/SS2/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Believes the plan should keep the current designated areas of green belt land.	Kristen Everett

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/LC/SS2/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID589/LC/SS2/1	Does not comply with DtC		With regard to the duty to co-operate it may be the case the Council has consulted with neighbouring authorities, but some of those authorities have expressed concerns that have not been fully resolved.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Malton Road Developments Ltd
SID590/LC/SS2/1	Does not comply with DtC			ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID833/LC/SS2/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Sound	The process should demonstrate a cross-border cooperation to appropriately resolve the outer boundary of the green belt at 6-miles or thereabouts as this is a strategic issue.	George E Wright Combined
SID838/S/SS2/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited

### Soundness

SID60/S/SS2/1			We question the tightness of the proposed inner green belt boundary, and the decision not to identify any safeguarded land.	Michael Hargreaves Planning OBO York Travellers Trust
---------------	--	--	---	---

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID61/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Key role of green belt is to prevent coalescence between urban and rural areas. This is missing from policy. Notion of 6 miles does not follow logic as the outer ring road is sometimes 4 miles from the city centre yet the area is rural agricultural land. Needs to be permanence to green belt beyond length of plan. Development should preserve character and setting of city. The rural nature of the green belt should also preserve the land patterns and hedgerows. There is a failure to identify exceptional circumstances as obstruction to development of transport links is missing. The city planners have removed references to upgrading the outer ring road specifically between the A19 and the Hopgrove Roundabout which currently any time of the working day is at a speed of 5mph.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	3.15 clear boundaries on the ground. What happens when the clear foundations (Green) are removed, which causes controversy.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID68/S/SS2/2			#1 entire site - Northfield Lane (Triangle) - The site does not perform any of the five roles of the Green Belt. Technically, the site serves no obvious Green Belt function in relation to the historic setting of the City and need not be kept permanently open.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID68/S/SS2/3			#1 entire site - Northfield Lane (Triangle)- Paragraph 79 of the NPPF defines the essential characteristics of Green Belts as their openness and permanence. The NPPF is clear that land which is unnecessary to keep permanently open should not be included in the Green Belt (Para 85). This site is not open and therefore cannot contribute to the openness of the Green Belt. The proposed employment allocations within the around the site indicate that it will be even less open in the future. It is therefore argued that the concepts of permanence and openness are not relevant to this site and that it does not meet the criteria for inclusion in Green Belt as set out in Paragraph 85. Therefore following the guidance in paragraph 85 of the NPPF, it is not necessary to keep this land permanently open and it should therefore not be included in the Green Belt.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID68/S/SS2/4			#1 entire site - Northfield Lane (Triangle) - Paragraph 85 states that Green Belt boundaries should be defined clearly using physical features that are readily recognisable and likely to be permanent. The woodland on the site's eastern boundary effectively disconnects the site from the proposed Green Belt to the east, a severance which is emphasised by the Ring Road. The Ring Road, the A59 and Northfield Lane would represent a recognisable and permanent boundary for the Green Belt.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID77/S/SS2/1		Sound	Pleased to note and fully support the removal of SF14 from the draft Plan and the suggestion of development within the Green Belt within the parish of Earswick.	Derek Jones
SID118/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Policy SS2, first para - needs to more closely reflect the requirements set out in SI2013 No. 117, i.e. that the purpose of the York Green Belt is to safeguard the special character and setting of the historic city. At present there is no reference to the historic element. Also reference to primary purpose of Greenbelt to deliver the local plan should be deleted.	Historic England - Ian Smith

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	SS2, 3rd para - A Green Belt which might need to be amended only five years after the end-date of this Local Plan does not appear to have the degree of "permanence" expected by national planning guidance. The end-date by which the Green Belt boundaries may need to be reviewed needs to be amended in order to give the York Green Belt the degree of permanence envisaged by Paragraph 79 of the NPPF.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID125/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	SS2 states it allocates sufficient land for development to meet the needs identified in the plan and for a further minimum period of five years to 2038, the dwelling requirement in SS1 is too low. York's Green Belt boundary has artificially limited development of the City for many years and has been a major contribution to the housing problem. The Local Plan provides an opportunity to introduce some flexibility in setting the Green Belt boundary, there need to be areas of safeguarded land. If they are not needed in the future then they remain safeguarded. If they are needed then they can be released for development without requiring full scale review of Green Belt boundaries.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID141/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Questions the soundness of evidence supporting the proposed green belt boundary, including that the original 2003 'Approach to the Green Belt Appraisal' was not made available in full, and incremental updates have not been conducted within the framework of guidance. Further, the 2003 study continues to be referenced and is considered out of date. Considers that exceptional circumstances exist which justify a general review of Green Belt boundaries around York, particularly since the Plan proposes allocations which would fall within the green belt's general extent.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Oakgate Caddick Groups
SID154/S/SS2/1		Sound	Imperative that green belt is protected and preserved against future development.	Steve Clipston
SID160/S/SS2/1		Sound	Welcomes inclusion of policy.	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID165/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	<p>The Green Belt proposed by the PD is the residual of the open land not required to accommodate development needs in the plan period 2012-2033 and beyond to 2038. I consider this is not the correct approach for preparing detailed Green Belt boundaries for a historic city like York of international and national importance where its open land setting is a very important part of its special character. Instead, Green Belt boundaries should be based upon an assessment of what land is important for the five purposes of the Green Belt as set in paragraph 80 of the Framework and in particular whether land needs to be kept open to preserve the setting and special character of the City. Only land which is not important for these purposes should be excluded from the Green Belt and considered further for potential development. The NPPF (paragraph 79) makes clear that the essential characteristics of Green Belts are their openness and their permanence. In the case of the York Green Belt, the Secretary of State has made clear on many occasions that its primary purpose is to safeguard the setting and special character of the historic city. This purpose must mean that there are long-term physical limits to the growth of the City and that the urban area cannot be expanded indefinitely to meet identified needs. I consider that in the case of the York Green Belt the main test to establish whether land does or does not fulfil the primary Green Belt purpose should be a visual one. It is necessary to ask whether a site is open and if so whether it is essential for that or any other Green Belt purpose that it should remain so.</p>	Richard Frost
SID165/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	<p>York's special character is not just related to the walled city or its conservation areas (such as Heslington) or even the green wedges extending into the City. It relates as much to the general size, scale and character of York, especially as a compact historic city set in the open countryside. Views from the Outer Ring Road are of especial significance, particularly when they include views of the Minster which defines the location of the city centre and indicates the general scale and character of York. Serious harm would be caused to the special character of the City if development is allowed to intrude significantly into this green buffer around the City, and especially if it should come close to the Ring Road or even leap-frog it. This has already happened in the Clifton area where the harm to the special character is self-evident. We must emphasise that our view on this matter is very similar to that expressed by the Inspector who held the Inquiry into the York Green Belt Local Plan. Although this Inquiry took place in 1994, the primary purpose of the York Green Belt has not changed since then nor has the thrust of national Green Belt policy.</p>	Richard Frost

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID165/S/SS2/3		Not Sound	I consider that the PPD development proposals would cause serious harm to the setting and special character of the City as:• Development would be brought much closer to the Outer Ring Road, intruding significantly into the sensitive buffer of open land between the main urban area and the road. At some points, the buffer would be reduced to a very narrow gap, sometimes little more than a landscaped strip. Such development would significantly damage the current perception of York as a compact historic town set into the open countryside. Instead it would appear as a sprawling large urban area expanding out and beyond the Ring Road. The mistake of Clifton Moor would have been repeated. • The two large new settlements proposed would have major urbanising effects on the wider countryside setting of York beyond the Ring Road. These urbanising effects would not be confined to the sites themselves but would extend over much larger areas because of the need for major new transport and other infrastructure to service them. This infrastructure would include major new junctions onto the Outer Ring Road with very substantial land-takes in vulnerable parts of the Green Belt. The combined result would be a substantial deterioration in the landscape and other rural qualities of the open countryside which forms a belt around York and which the Green Belt is meant to preserve. However, moving ST15 further way from the ring road in the current version of the plan has ameliorated this impact to a certain extent	Richard Frost
SID165/S/SS2/4		Not Sound	The faults in CoYC's appraisal of Green Belt are exemplified by Fig 3.1 of the PD which seeks to identify the areas of open land which contribute to the "historic character and setting of York." Figure 3.1 does not show most of the open land beyond the Outer Ring Road as contributing to this special character or setting. This is incomprehensible as the Green Belt around York has always been described by the Secretary of State and CoYC as "a belt" of open countryside encircling the City "whose outer edge is about 6 miles from York City Centre". This belt of open countryside establishes the important rural character of York's setting and defines its size and scale as a compact historic city serving a large rural hinterland. The functions of a belt are not fulfilled by the narrow corridors of open land which Figure 3.1 identifies as "extensions to green wedges". In reality these narrow corridors have a character not dissimilar to the rest of the belt of open countryside around York. A more appropriate way of considering the relationship between the green wedges and the surrounding open countryside is that the wedges provide a continuation of the encircling belt of open countryside into the urban area. If this so, all the open countryside around York beyond the Outer Ring Road is of similar value to the setting and special character of the City.	Richard Frost
SID165/S/SS2/5		Not Sound	A further major deficiency of Fig 3.1 is that it does not identify the value of the entirety of the green buffer of open land which encircles the City between the Outer Ring Road and the existing urban edge (except in the vicinity of Clifton). As I have said, this buffer of open land plays a major role in establishing the setting and special character of York. Significant areas of open land have been excluded from designation only because the Council wishes to promote development on them. Most of these undesignated areas have similar characteristics and fulfil the same open land functions as areas which are designated.	Richard Frost

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID181/S/SS2/1			Policy SS2 defining the general extent of the green belt on the key diagram will therefore need to be addressed by amendments to the green belt boundary: Policy H1 dealing with housing allocations needs to provide for a significant number of additional allocations including the four sites identified above: Allocation SS20 should be excluded in its entirety from the Plan as it is not a site being brought forward within the Plan period.	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments
SID182/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Local Plan fails to provide sufficient land for housing and again contains no Safeguarded Land. This is a shortcoming of the Plan.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID182/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	The Plan lacks flexibility by having no Safeguarded Land to give a new Green Belt any degree of permanence.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID199/S/SS2/1			Main Representations Report shows inadequate assessment of Green Belt. Green Belt should prevent neighbouring towns from merging and preserve setting and character of historic towns. SS2 flawed due to incomplete evidence base and full Green Belt review is needed.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison
SID210/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	In order to address the conflicts identified and ensure that Policy SS2 is sound, it is considered that City of York Council should amend the Policy as follows:1 The boundary of the Green Belt should be defined to allow additional land to be allocated to meet the housing needs of the community.2 The Local Plan should identify a reserve of safeguarded land to ensure that this section of the document is effective and consistent with national policy. 3 The boundary of the Green Belt should be defined such that land at Brecks Lane, Southfields Road and Princess Road, Strensall are excluded from it and allocated for residential development on the Local Plan Proposals Map. 4 The sites should be identified as Safeguarded Land on the Local Plan Proposals Map if they are not allocated for development.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID214/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	In the absence of an adopted Local Plan, confusion surrounds the status of the Green Belt around York. Much commentary relating to the Green Belt assumes the Green Belt boundaries are fixed in an adopted plan and that any suggestion that sites should be allocated for development will result in land being taken out of the Green Belt (in which case the second sentence of paragraph 83 of the NPPF would apply i.e. Green Belt boundaries should only be altered in exceptional circumstances). This is erroneous because the Green Belt boundaries around York are being defined (or established) for the first time. They are not being altered. Paragraph 85 of the NPPF: In defining/ establishing boundaries the Council must meet the identified requirement for sustainable development i.e. it must allocate land to meet identified needs for housing, employment, leisure etc... and other needs.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID215/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The inclusion of land at the rear of the Hospice within York's Green Belt is not consistent with the advice in the NPPF regarding the definition of Green Belt boundaries. Paragraph 85 of the NPPF states that when defining boundaries, local planning authorities should define boundaries clearly, using physical features that are readily recognisable and likely to be permanent. Whereas we would accept that the southern, western and eastern boundaries of housing allocation H6 are clearly defined, there are no existing physical features that are readily recognisable in defining the northern boundary of the allocation i.e. the current boundary of the Green Belt	ONEILL Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Wilberforce Trust
SID215/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	The current stepped boundary is not defined by any physical features and is considered to be somewhat irregular. It is clear that the mature tree belt to the north of this line provides a more recognisable edge to the allocated area.	ONEILL Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Wilberforce Trust
SID231/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The Green Belt proposed by the PD is the residual of the open land not required to accommodate development needs in the plan period 2012-2033 and beyond to 2038. FPC considers this is not the correct approach for preparing detailed Green Belt boundaries for a historic city like York of international and national importance where its open land setting is a very important part of its special character. Should be based on NPPF framework.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID231/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	Objects to the proposal to exclude the York Designer Outlet from the Green Belt. Instead, the site should be shown as overwashed and treated as a previously developed site in the Green Belt.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID232/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The local plan should ensure the permanence of the Green Belt for longer than five years after the plan. Additionally, there needs to be a realistic Green Belt instead of just a broad brushing of everywhere that isn't urban land.	Stephen Lornie

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID255/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Policy SS2 states that the sufficient land will be allocated for development to meet the needs identified in the plan and for a further minimum period of 5 years to 2038.The HBF recommends that the Plan period is extended until 2038, and that an additional 20% buffer is provided in relation to allocations to allow for flexibility. Therefore there is likely to be a need for further land to be identified.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID255/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	It is also considered appropriate to identify Safeguarded Land to meet longer term development needs stretching well beyond the plan period, and to ensure the Council is satisfied that the Green Belt boundaries will not need to be altered at the end of the development plan period.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID257/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Given the need to increase the housing requirement for the City identified in representation in relation to Policy SS1 ( increase from 867dpa to 1180dpa) we take the view that there will be a need to release further land from the Green Belt to accommodate the additional housing identified as being required over the plan period and the additional five years beyond – 21 Years . In this context we support the proposed 'removal' of the former Terry's Car Park site ( Policies ST16 & SS14 Site Phase 2) from the Green Belt and its allocation for housing development	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID267/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	It is considered that the Plan has not been positively prepared as it does not seek to:- identify a correctly assessed housing need- allocate enough land to meet this need	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID268/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Green Belt is there to give us all a better life (recreation not a car in sight) - green belt is for future generations.	J Nicholson
SID306/S/SS2/1		Sound	The Plan gives good protection to York's Green Belt protecting our unique City	Y Boynton
SID307/S/SS2/1		Sound	The Plan gives good protection to York's Green Belt protecting our unique City	G Greetham
SID308/S/SS2/1		Sound	The Plan gives good protection to York's Green Belt protecting our unique City	NDM 3
SID309/S/SS2/1		Sound	The Plan gives good protection to York's Green Belt protecting our unique City	Brian L Bell
SID310/S/SS2/1		Sound	The Plan gives good protection to York's Green Belt protecting our unique City	Richard Rafton
SID311/S/SS2/1		Sound	The Plan gives good protection to York's Green Belt protecting our unique City	M Ellis

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID318/S/SS2/1			Supports SS2 and importance of Green Belt.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID329/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	We are therefore disappointed to find that the NPPF Section 207 is not developed in the Local Plan. It avoids giving 'a local enforcement plan to manage enforcement proactively, in a way that is appropriate to their area'. This is, for us and many other parish councils, of grave concern.	Alistair McFarlane
SID339/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The Policy states that the "primary purpose of the Green Belt is to safeguard the setting and the special character of York and delivering the Local Plan Spatial Strategy" . This is not correct as the Green Belt serves five purposes, which should be treated equally. The Council's annual housing requirement of 867 dwellings, when multiplied over 5 years would total 4,335 units. The following sites are identified in table 5.1 as delivering housing outside of the plan period: ST5 – York Central – 200 units; ST14 – Land West of Wigginton Road – 148 units; ST15 – Land West of Elvington Lane – 1,139 units; and ST36 – Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road – 769 units. This equates to 2,256 units, which leaves a residual figure of 2,079 units. This equates to 2.4 years supply which is not being delivered. This is unacceptable and further demonstrates that additional sites need to be allocated, and that as currently drafted the Plan is unsound and fails to meet the tests outline in paragraph 182.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID342/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The Key Diagram (page v of the main document) was taken from the revoked Yorkshire and Humberside RSS with the sole purpose of outlining the "General Extent of the Green Belt". As the diagram has been updated with Housing developments that are only proposals at this stage it detracts from the original purpose of this diagram. The inclusion of only the proposed Housing developments within the single coloured settlements is misleading as it implies sites are "Residential Infilling" which is not always the case.	Andy Bell

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID342/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	This Green Belt section does not have enough detail paragraph 1.50 Implies that there are already detailed sections of the Outer Boundary that are out of scope for this Local Plan period, this implication is further supported by York's neighbouring Harrogate and Selby Councils(Additional Info: Green Belt) with the latter adding more weight as a number of York's Villages that lie to the South used to be under the control of Selby Council when these detailed boundaries were created, but, of more significance is CYC's own Draft Local Plan 2005(Additional Info: Green Belt) which although never came to fruition, was approved and adopted by CYC for the purposes of Development Control. Within the Green Belt section of the CYC Draft Local Plan 2005 that was approved and formerly adopted for the purposes of Development control is the following paragraph:- "5.10 Whilst remaining broadly consistent with the draft York Green Belt Local Plan, the Local Plan has taken the Inspector's Report to the York Green Belt Public Inquiry as its starting point for the consideration of detailed boundaries and has updated existing policies to take into account the revised guidance contained in the latest version of PPG2 (1995) and the approved Structure Plan." Given that the purpose of the Green Belt is to preserve the special and historical character and setting of York, the omission of the historical work and polices makes the plan unsound.	Andy Bell
SID345/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Whilst DIO is supportive of the proposed Green Belt policy, it is noted that not all of the previously developed land at Queen Elizabeth Barracks (ST35)and Imphal Barracks (ST36) is proposed for exclusion from the Green Belt designation, on this basis DIO objects to the proposed detailed inner boundaries of the Green Belt around these sites because they do not consider that it follows demarcated boundaries. Alternative proposed boundaries presented in Appendix 4 and 5. Larger boundaries may be required in context of higher OAHN linked with policy SS1.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID351/S/SS2/1			We support the removal of the YDO from the green belt. As expressed above, we consider that the green belt boundary should be further amended to remove the 20 acre site to the south to accommodate relocated and enhanced Park & Ride facilities.	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID354/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The paragraph 182 of the NPPF is quite clear in relation to the creation of new Green Belt. 'The general extent to Green Belt across the country is already established. New Green Belt should only be established in exceptional circumstances, for example, when planning for larger scale developments such as new settlements or major urban extensions .In essence, the Council must now demonstrate the very exceptional circumstances for re designating this site as Green Belt, particularly in the light of the pre-existing local development management policy and the quite considerable objectively assessed housing need.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID357/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	We object to this policy on the basis that we maintain the housing requirement figure is too low when considered against the Council's own evidence base	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID367/S/SS2/1			In particular, the plan gives good protection of York's Greenbelt.	Keith Massheder
SID367/S/SS2/2			In particular, the plan gives good protection of York's Greenbelt.	Keith Massheder
SID367/S/SS2/3			In particular, the plan gives good protection of York's Greenbelt.	Keith Massheder
SID369/S/SS2/1		Sound	A major criticism of previous Local Plan documents was the scale of development on greenbelt land. The Council's work bringing this number down has been very welcome as it shows they are listening to the concerns which have been raised over several consultation periods.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID372/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The emerging Local Plan will set York's detailed Green Belt boundaries for the first time it must be recognised that this should be done with the view that the full needs for housing and employment growth need to be delivered both within this plan period and for some length of time beyond. Policy SS2 outlines that to ensure permanence beyond the plan period sufficient land is allocated for development to meet the needs identified in the Plan and for a further 5 years to 2038. Gladman recommend that further land should be identified to be removed from the Green Belt as the current flexibility could be considered to be insufficient. Gladman reiterate the suggestion that it may be preferable to release some pressure on the York Green Belt by allowing small adjustments to Green Belt boundaries around local service centres in locations such as Copmanthorpe, where it can be demonstrated that the land is not currently fulfilling the five purposes of Green Belt. The site at Tadcaster Road, Copmanthorpe (Site SS16) fulfils this role and therefore it is considered to be a suitable release from the Green Belt. This site fulfils a local need, is supported by the local community through their Neighbourhood Plan and is available, achievable and deliverable. The release of this site from the Green Belt would provide logical and clear defensible GreenBelt boundaries to further growth.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID376/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd (TW) object to Policy SS2 as in view of their response to Policy SS1 the Local Plan fails to allocate sufficient land to meet its correctly calculated housing requirement, and to achieve this release further land from the Green Belt. The trajectory at Table 5.2 only runs to 2032/33. In line with the Home Builders Federation (HBF) representations, TW suggest that the Plan period be extended to 2038 and in addition to that the Council must identify safeguarded land to meet longer-term development needs stretching well beyond the Plan period and to ensure that the Green Belt boundaries do not need to be altered at the end the development plan period. Policy SS2 is therefore not sound as the proposed Green Belt boundaries are not justified and are not consistent with the requirements of NPPF.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID378/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The Green Belt boundary should be changed in respect of the site allocation ST15 and that the boundaries proposed (for the Langwith allocation) are readily defined, logical and appropriate to protect the remainder of the City's Green Belt.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID393/S/SS2/1		Sound	York is in a unique position of having to set its Greenbelt boundaries for the first time. In order to preserve and formalise these Greenbelt boundaries, we must ensure Brownfield sites are developed at the first opportunity to avoid the scars of un-developed urban land seen within the city constraints. Due to the need to ensure permanence of the Greenbelt, York is also required to allocate land for 21 years rather than 15 years required in planning policy. As such, the city has identified significantly more land for development and significantly more dwellings than would be required in a normal plan making process. The effect of this will help deliverability and affordability in a way that precludes the need for market forces adjustment.	Cllr N Ayre
SID401/S/SS2/1			Approach is of concern as Green Belt Boundaries have little prospect of being 'permanent' and the expectation that they will be reviewed 5 years after the plan. Approach is unorthodox as is contrary to NPPF Para. 85. No justification for allocating land beyond the plan period.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID418/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Green belt policy put forward in the plan is not consistent with national policy and is not supported by a robust evidence base. Land should not be removed from the Green Belt where that land continues to serve Green Belt function under NPPF s80, unless there is an evidenced need to remove land from the Green Belt to meet proven local need. In such circumstances land must be brought forward in a managed way with regard to the value of keeping the land open. This can only be fairly achieved through a complete evaluation of all reasonable alternatives against all 5 functions of Green Belt in NPPF 80. The proposed alteration of the Green Belt boundaries in the Publication Draft LP will result in the removal of some land from the Green Belt (such as Site H56) which can be evidenced to fulfil Green Belt function without, consideration of the need to keep that land open. There are no special circumstances which could render this removal of land from the Green belt acceptable. The evidence base put forward to support the Green Belt Policies in the Publication Draft Local Plan does not assess all 5 functions of Green Belt in NPPF 80. It has previously been considered by the SOS in called in planning applications as unable to be used to justify the removal of any piece of land from the Green Belt previously identified in a NYCSP. It is certainly not a sound evidence base to use to justify a revision of the entire Local Plan Green Belt boundary.	Save Windmill Lane Playing Fields - Chris Wedgwood
SID581/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The omission of safeguarded land further serves to fatally undermine the plans approach	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP
SID581/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	The only Green Belt Appraisal document produced by the City is dated 2003 and is just 16 pages long. Clearly this document was formulated in the context of development requirements that bear no relation at all to present and forecast needs. Moreover, there have been significant changes in policy/guidance upon assessments of landscape and heritage issues which were key parts of the work done in the early 1990s.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	We Support the Councils acknowledgement that the current 'Draft' Green Belt boundary will need to be altered to meet the development needs of the area. The identification of Safeguarded Land is considered particularly important as the Plan will set detailed Green Belt boundaries for the first time and an appropriate and sound strategy is therefore required to enable flexibility up to and beyond the plan period. The current approach adopted in the Plan conflicts with national guidance and advice sought by the Council from John Hobson QC (Landmark Chambers) in relation to Safeguarded Land. The Council has also been advised by Counsel that it would be appropriate for the Green Belt to endure for a ten year period beyond the life of the Plan. We therefore request that the Plan is amended accordingly to ensure that it is effective and consistent with national policy.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/SS2/1			We Support the Councils acknowledgement that the current 'Draft' Green Belt boundary will need to be altered to meet the development needs of the area. The identification of Safeguarded Land is considered particularly important as the Plan will set detailed Green Belt boundaries for the first time and an appropriate and sound strategy is therefore required to enable flexibility up to and beyond the plan period. The current approach adopted in the Plan conflicts with national guidance and advice sought by the Council from John Hobson QC (Landmark Chambers) in relation to Safeguarded Land. The Council has also been advised by Counsel that it would be appropriate for the Green Belt to endure for a ten year period beyond the life of the Plan. We therefore request that the Plan is amended accordingly to ensure that it is effective and consistent with national policy.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/SS2/1			Support the plan period being extended to 2038 to enable setting greenbelt boundaries but the Publication Draft fails to provide sufficient land for housing from 2033 to 2038 and contains no safeguarded land. The flexibility offered by safeguarded land is particularly important when considering the complexity of certain sites such as ST5 and ST15, heritage issues across the city and the use of a minimum housing target figure. The lack of safeguarded land is a shortcoming in the plan as it reduces flexibility and permanence of the boundaries which will be set for the first time and conflicts with both national guidance and advice from counsel which recommended the greenbelt should be set to endure for 10 years period beyond the plan.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID590/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Need to exclude enough land from the Green Belt in the form of both allocations and safeguarded land to provide the necessary flexibility to meet the development needs of the City, particularly for housing and employment land.	ONEll Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID598/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The Local Plan does not provide sufficient housing land to meet needs of the housing market area and those sites allocated will not deliver the units identified and as the sites identified (site 908 H38 extension, sites 859, 872, 814, 55, 882 and 926) do not serve full Green Belt purposes they should not be included in the Green Belt. (Further detail provided in reps, all of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy SS2 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID600/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The Local Plan does not provide sufficient housing land to meet needs of the housing market area and those sites allocated will not deliver the units identified and as the site 131 ST13 Moor Lane Copmanthorpe does not perform a Green Belt purpose it should not be designated as Green Belt. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The Local Plan does not provide sufficient housing land to meet needs of the housing market area and those sites allocated will not deliver the units identified and as the site 903 (formerly H34 Land north of Church Lane, Skelton) does not perform a Green Belt purpose it should not be designated as Green Belt. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The Local Plan does not provide sufficient housing land to meet needs of the housing market area and those sites allocated will not deliver the units identified and as the Site 187 (formerly ST30) and The Wider Site - Land North of Stockton Lane does not perform a Green Belt purpose it should not be designated as Green Belt. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID603/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Housing numbers policy is based on a flawed approach and is therefore unsound. In summary, the proposed inner and outer Green Belt boundaries should be relaxed as appropriate to enable additional housing land to be allocated to meet a significantly increased OAN. Safeguarded land should be also allocated for development needs well beyond 2038. Suggested alterations.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited
SID603/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	Object to the inclusion of the retreat in the green belt. Buildings are urban in character and evidence for green belt boundaries are out of date. Concerned that the inclusion of retreat in green belt is based on assumption that the land already is - it is not. The site would neither perform any of the five NPPF purposes of Green Belt, nor would it contribute to the key characteristic of openness. Provides appendix and assessment of site.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited
SID604/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The concept of sustainable urban extensions should be re-introduced to make up the projected shortfall in supply and improve future range and choice. The draft plan is unsound and in conflict with the NPPF as no safeguarded land is proposed to help meet "longer term needs stretching well beyond the plan period". The proposed Green Belt is unsound as it is drawn to unreasonably restrict development opportunities for the necessary growth of York.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID604/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	proposed Green Belt boundaries within the plan have clearly been drawn up with maximum development restraint in mind. Given the proposed Green Belt boundaries are in no small part based upon a highly flawed approach under SS1, it stands to reason that Policy SS2 as written cannot be considered sound as it is not effective and justified.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID604/S/SS2/3		Not Sound	Given the absence of any full review of the General Extent of Green Belt since its introduction and in view of NPPF advice at paragraph 85, it is also considered necessary to formally identify Safeguarded Land to meet longer-term development needs stretching well beyond the plan period, and to ensure the Council is satisfied that the adopted Green Belt boundaries will not need to be altered at the end of the development plan period.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID605/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The Green Belt boundaries proposed within the plan have clearly been drawn up with maximum development restraint in mind. Given the proposed boundaries are in no small part based upon a highly flawed approach under Policy SS1 noted above, it stands to reason that Policy SS2 as written cannot be considered sound as it is not effective and justified.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Mr D Lancaster & Oakwood Business Park
SID611/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Policy SS2 is intended to form the basis for a detailed green belt boundary, as well as to make clear the intention to protect the open character of the countryside. The Plan is unsound as: green belt boundaries would need to be reviewed only 5 years after the end of the Plan period, and could not be considered 'permanent' in accordance with para 79 of NPPF; 'permanence' has been established through case law as 30yrs (not the 25 years advocated by the Plan); the Council could have used more orthodox measures such as safeguarding land (NPPF para 89) beyond the plan period; projecting development needs beyond the plan period gives an increasingly unreliable picture.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID614/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Policy SS2 is intended to form the basis for a detailed green belt boundary, as well as to make clear the intention to protect the open character of the countryside. The Plan is unsound as: green belt boundaries would need to be reviewed only 5 years after the end of the Plan period, and could not be considered 'permanent' in accordance with para 79 of NPPF; 'permanence' has been established through case law as 30yrs (not the 25 years advocated by the Plan); the Council could have used more orthodox measures such as safeguarding land (NPPF para 89) beyond the plan period; projecting development needs beyond the plan period gives an increasingly unreliable picture.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID620/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	There is a lack of evidence confirming that Green Belt boundaries will endure beyond the Plan period. Questions about the permanence of the Green Belt boundary beyond the plan period have also been raised by adjacent authorities. The omission of this key component of the Local Plan spatial strategy is a serious weakness and may well result in the Plan being found unsound, particularly as the Plan period is only up to 2033 and from the point of anticipated adoption in 2019 will only be a 14-year plan	Eamonn Keogh ONeill Associates OBO Galtres Village Development Company
SID827/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The proposed greenbelt is not capable of enduring beyond the lifetime of the plan as it continues to constrain York's housing and economic growth, more land should be removed to enable allocation of enough land to fulfill a revised OAN figure which includes market signals or the revised DCLG standard methodology figure	Pilcher Homes Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID827/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	The plan cannot endure well beyond the plan period, as the plan period is 5 years shorter than the proposed greenbelt period.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID833/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Broad ranging objection to the Green Belt designations and policies proposed. The overall conclusion of this response, taken as a whole, is that the Plan is fundamentally unsound and unfit for purpose. Over 1,000 pages of supporting evidence supplied with representation.	George E Wright Combined
SID833/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	Plan fails to address the needs for Secondary Policy for the YGB to conform with the Primary Policy set out in the RSS Revocation Order and to be consistent with the National Policy set out in the NPPF	George E Wright Combined
SID833/S/SS2/3		Not Sound	The approach to green belt designation has serious implications for the whole Plan and in particular to the allocation of land for development and the opportunity to provide safeguardedland to ensure the permanence of the York green belt.	George E Wright Combined
SID833/S/SS2/4		Not Sound	Policy refers to primary purpose not a single purpose of the green belt. This is not inline with the purpose set out in the Revocation Order of the RSS.	George E Wright Combined
SID833/S/SS2/8		Not Sound	The LPA have misconceived or incorrectly applied the purpose of the York green belt to their process and that is of fundamental relevance to the outcomes. The Plan uses the 1991 and/or 1998 Proposals as a template for establishing the boundaries and those proposals were fundamentally flawed and unsound.	George E Wright Combined
SID836/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Plan is neother justified nor consistent with national policy in respect of Green Belt proposals affecting Wheldrake. Object to current proposals not to safeguard land. Land at Wheldrake should be safeguarded (Site 752 Land at Eastfield Lane).	Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO REV Sir T Forbes Adams Combined
SID838/S/SS2/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	It is considered that the Plan has not been positively prepared as it does not seek to:- identify a correctly assessed housing need- allocate enough land to meet this need	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID841/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Reference is made to submissions prepared by George Wright MA MRTPI dealing with the history of York Green Belt. Mr Wright concludes that the green belt boundaries as proposed in the PDLP cannot be justified. His conclusions are adopted, rather than repeated in these submissions. Mr Wright concludes there is sufficient land suitable and available for development in such locations to meet York's development needs for several generations without harming the character or setting of York.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/S/SS2/1			Support the plan period being extended to 2038 to enable setting greenbelt boundaries but the Publication Draft fails to provide sufficient land for housing from 2033 to 2038 and contains no safeguarded land. The flexibility offered by safeguarded land is particularly important when considering the complexity of certain sites such as ST5 and ST15, heritage issues across the city and the use of a minimum housing target figure. The lack of safeguarded land is a shortcoming in the plan as it reduces flexibility and permanence of the boundaries which will be set for the first time and conflicts with both national guidance and advice from counsel which recommended the greenbelt should be set to endure for 10 years period beyond the plan.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID849/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	The Plan will be unable to secure a permanent green belt boundary unless adequate space is identified to meet the University's needs. Green Belt boundaries cannot be confirmed until the Plan meets the identified needs for sustainable development (NPPF para 85).	Oneill Associates (Janet O'Neill)OBO University of York
SID849/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	The University supports in principle the removal of campus west from green belt. It also supports the removal of the allocated area for development at campus east from green belt. The plans in appendix 5 illustrate areas of contention and the alternative boundaries proposed by these representations, which comply with the approved campus east master plan and/or guidance on setting green belt boundaries.	Oneill Associates (Janet O'Neill)OBO University of York
SID852/S/SS1/1		Sound	Plan should protect the greenbelt, provide enough houses and make sure affordability is improved in York.	NDM 15
SID61/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Key role of green belt is to prevent coalescence between urban and rural areas. This is missing from policy. Notion of 6 miles does not follow logic as the outer ring road is sometimes 4 miles from the city centre yet the area is rural agricultural land. Needs to be permanence to green belt beyond length of plan. Development should preserve character and setting of city. The rural nature of the green belt should also preserve the land patterns and hedgerows. There is a failure to identify exceptional circumstances as obstruction to development of transport links is missing. The city planners have removed references to upgrading the outer ring road specifically between the A19 and the Hopgrove Roundabout which currently any time of the working day is at a speed of 5mph.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/SS2/2		Not Sound	3.15 clear boundaries on the ground. What happens when the clear foundations (Green) are removed, which causes controversy.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID60/MOD/SS2/1			Need to include safeguarded land and allocate traveller sites. The plan must be based on an assessment of longer term Gypsy and Traveller needs going beyond the plan period - of a similar length to the period for which safeguarded land is being provided.	Michael Hargreaves Planning OBO York Travellers Trust

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID68/Mod/SS2/1			#1 entire site - Northfield Lane (Triangle) - The landowner requests that the council does not include the land within the proposed Green Belt.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID118/MOD/SS2/1			Clarity of GB reference required. Policy SS2, first Paragraph amend to read:- "The primary purpose of the Green Belt is to safeguard the special character and setting of the historic city of York. New building in the Green Belt ... etc	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/SS2/2			SS2, 3rd para - The end-date by which the Green Belt boundaries may need to be reviewed needs to be amended in order to give the York Green Belt the degree of permanence envisaged by Paragraph 79 of the NPPF.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID165/Mod/SS2/1			Exclude development close to the outer ring road in order to protect York's green belt and special character. York's Special character comes from being a small, compact city set in the open countryside. I agree that the open land between the A64 and Fulford and Heslington makes a particular contribution to special character, not least because it fulfils the role of an attractive rural buffer to the Ring Road in this part of the City. After saying this, I consider that this designation should be extended to include all the open land to the south of Hull Road currently without planning permission for development as it too fulfils an important buffer function. Should it be necessary to implement the site ST15 to meet the housing requirements of 706pa stated above, it is imperative that the open land proposed in the current plan is in no way reduced.	Richard Frost
SID182/MOD/SS2/1			It is clear that the draft Green Belt Boundaries of York will need to be altered and it is considered that the site at Chapelfields would be a suitable site to allocate for housing. The development of this site would provide a logical urban extension to the existing settlement of Chapelfields.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID210/Mod/SS2/1			In order to address the conflicts identified and ensure that Policy SS2 is sound, it is considered that City of York Council should amend the Policy as follows:1 The boundary of the Green Belt should be defined to allow additional land to be allocated to meet the housing needs of the community.2 The Local Plan should identify a reserve of safeguarded land to ensure that this section of the document is effective and consistent with national policy. 3 The boundary of the Green Belt should be defined such that land at Brecks Lane, Southfields Road and Princess Road, Strensall are excluded from it and allocated for residential development on the Local Plan Proposals Map. 4 The sites should be identified as Safeguarded Land on the Local Plan Proposals Map if they are not allocated for development.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID214/Mod/SS2/1			The site at Landing Lane should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID215/Mod/SS2/1			Housing allocation H6 should be extended to include the land at the rear of the Hospice with the Green Belt running along the eastern boundary of site.	ONEill Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Wilberforce Trust
SID220/Mod/SS2/1		Not Sound	Plan should identify safeguarded land to ensure the permanence of the green belt.	O'Neill Associates (Philip Holmes)OBO Mr M Ibbotson
SID232/Mod/SS2/1			The Green Belt needs to be redrawn to a more appropriate scope which meets the Green Belt purposes, protects the long-term sustainability and permanence of the established Green Belt boundaries, while still allowing for the future needs of the city.	Stephen Lornie
SID247/Mod/ss2/1			Undertake a thorough Green Belt Review, which includes provision of safeguarded land; review approach of small isolated new settlements within the Green Belt; consider identifying a policy to seek to meet longer term housing requirements within a new settlement beyond the York Green Belt.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge
SID255/Mod/SS2/1			HBF propose that the policy is modified as follows:• 'To ensure that there is a degree of permanence beyond the plan period sufficient land is allocated for development to meet the needs identified in the plan and for a further minimum period of five years to 2038, with additional land safeguarded for development beyond the plan period,'	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID257/Mod/SS2/1			We would however also seek the removal of additional land immediately to the south of the car park as shown edged red on attached plan.	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID267/Mod/SS2/1			Council should delete more land from the Green belt and allocate more land for housing.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID267/Mod/SS2/2			Housing requirement should be increased.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID267/Mod/SS2/3			Land south of Foxwood Lane, Acomb should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID329/Mod/SS2/1			Develop NPPF Section 207.	Alistair McFarlane
SID342/Mod/SS2/1			Include a Key Diagram unaltered so that the current "General Extent of the Green Belt" can be fully appreciated. It might still be worth including the diagram with the proposed developments in addition to an unaltered one, with the current Residential and Employment sites highlighted in different colours so that misleading "residential infill areas" are not created.	Andy Bell
SID342/Mod/SS2/2			The plan needs to reference and include as part of its evidence base the CYC Draft Local Plan 2005 that was approved and formerly adopted for Development Control purposes along with the draft York Green Belt Local Plan and the Inspector's report from the York Green Belt Public Inquiry. Once this has been included, all sites that conflict with the already detailed sections of the Outer Green Belt boundaries should be removed from the Local Plan.	Andy Bell
SID351/Mod/SS2/1			We consider that the green belt boundary should be further amended to remove the 20 acre site to the south to accommodate relocated and enhanced Park & Ride facilities.	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID354/Mod/SS2/1			Land north of Northminster Business Park, Poppleton - is required for housing and should be allocated as a housing allocation.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID357/Mod/SS2/1			This policy and the amount of Green Belt land required to meet the identified need therefore needs to be reviewed for this policy to be sound.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID357Mod/SS2/2			It is our case that the strategic allocation should comprise a natural extension to Huntington and incorporate land to the north of North Lane as part of alternative option Site 914.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID360/Mod/SS2/1			We note that if the Green Belt boundary is drawn too tightly it could reduce flexibility and result in pressure for growth being exerted on adjacent areas in North Yorkshire. We are keen to ensure that the Plan avoids any adverse effects on North Yorkshire infrastructure and services.	North Yorkshire Country Council - Tricia Richards
SID360/Mod/SS2/2			It is important to ensure that the York plan makes sufficient provision to safeguard land needed to meet the City's growth needs well beyond the current plan period.	North Yorkshire Country Council - Tricia Richards
SID376/Mod/SS2/1			Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd propose the following changes to the policy to make it sound:• Extend the Plan period to 2038;• Release further land from the Green Belt and make additional housing allocations to meet the correctly calculated housing requirement (1,150 dpa) with an appropriate flexibility buffer (at least 20%); and• Identify additional safeguarded land for development beyond the Plan period.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID378/Mod/SS2/1			The proposed Green Belt Boundary is not sound, and should be modified in relation to ST15 as shown on the Plan at Appendix 14.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID401/Mod/SS2/1			Green Belt Boundaries should endure for 30 years.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID423/Mod/SS2/1		Not Sound	(York Pullman) Struggling with planning permission for sites at Strensall, Rufforth and Bilborough. Using these locations would reduce emissions.	NDM 6
SID583/Mod/SS2/1			The plan should be amended to ensure that greenbelt boundaries can endure for 10 years beyond the end of the plan which includes allocating further sites and safeguarded land to ensure flexibility and permanence given the low housing target figure, complexity of delivery of major site allocations and heritage issues across the city.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/Mod/SS2/1			The plan should be amended to ensure that greenbelt boundaries can endure for 10 years beyond the end of the plan which includes allocating further sites and safeguarded land to ensure flexibility and permanence given the low housing target figure, complexity of delivery of major site allocations and heritage issues across the city.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID589/Mod/SS2/1			Should the Inspector conclude the site is not required at the present time to meet the employment land requirement, the undeveloped 10.66 hectares to the north of the business park should be designated as safeguarded land in the Local Plan	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Malton Road Developments Ltd
SID598/Mod/SS2/1			Site 908 (H38 Extension - Land to the rear of Rufforth Primary School), site 859 (formerly SF15 Land north of Escrick), site 872 (formerly ST12 Manor Heath, Copmanthorpe), site 814 (formerly SF4 Land north of Haxby), site 55 (formerly H26 Land At Dauby Lane), site 882 (Askham Lane and Land south of Foxwood Lane, Acomb) and site 926 (formerly H28 Land to the north of North Lane, Wheldrake) should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing development or as safeguarded land.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/Mod/SS2/1			Site 131 / ST13 should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing development or as safeguarded land.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/Mod/SS2/1			Site 903 / H34 should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing development or as safeguarded land.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/Mod/SS2/1			Site 187 (formerly ST30) and The Wider Site - Land North of Stockton Lane should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing development or as safeguarded land.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID603/Mod/SS2/1			Remove Retreat from green belt. The southern boundaries of Low Moor Allotments and The Retreat would form a logical, permanent and strong Green Belt boundary and a well-defined edge to the built-part of the city at this point.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID605/Mod/SS2/1		Not Sound	The proposed inner, outer and inset allocation site Green Belt boundaries should be reviewed and relaxed as appropriate to enable additional development land to be allocated to meet a significantly increased OAN and the potential need for more employment land. Safeguarded land should also be allocated for development needs well beyond 2038. Revised text provided.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Mr D Lancaster & Oakwood Business Park
SID611/Mod/SS2/1			In earlier versions of the Plan the Council had identified parcels of land which did not serve green belt purposes and which were unnecessary to keep open. Land previously identified as 'safeguarded' should be identified as such again, especially as to do so would be a sound approach to establishing green belt permanence, unlike the Council's current approach.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID614/Mod/SS2/1			In earlier versions of the Plan the Council had identified parcels of land which did not serve green belt purposes and which were unnecessary to keep open. Land previously identified as 'safeguarded' should be identified as such again, especially as to do so would be a sound approach to establishing green belt permanence, unlike the Council's current approach.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID827/Mod/SS2/1			Greenbelt boundaries should be set using physical features that are readily recognisable and likely to be permanent such as the ring road.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID827/Mod/SS2/2			The plan should allow for safeguarded land so that development land can be brought forward during the plan period without a full Local Plan review. Pilcher homes supports the HBF proposed change to SS2.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID833/Mod/SS2/1		Not Sound	Policy wording should be amended by deleting 'primary' and inserting sole. This should be followed by the wording as set out at Y1.C.2 of the RSS Revocation Order	George E Wright Combined
SID836/Mod/SS2/1			1. The Green Belt should be reduced to omit Wheldrake in its entirety. 2. The site identified as Site 752 on the plan attached to the previous representations dated 30th October 2017 and 1st September 2016 should be identified as a housing site or as safeguarded land in the Local Plan.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO REV Sir T Forbes Adams Combined
SID838/Mod/SS2/1			Council should delete more land from the Green belt and allocate more land for housing.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID838/Mod/SS2/2			Housing requirement should be increased.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID838/Mod/SS2/3			Land south of Foxwood Lane, Acomb should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID839/Mod/SS2/1			In particular, the plan gives good protection of York's Greenbelt.	Della Johnson
SID845/Mod/SS2/1			In particular, the plan gives good protection of York's Greenbelt.	J M Agnew
SID846/Mod/SS2/1			In particular, the plan gives good protection of York's Greenbelt.	NDM 13
SID848/Mod/SS2/1			The plan should be amended to ensure that greenbelt boundaries can endure for 10 years beyond the end of the plan which includes allocating further sites and safeguarded land to ensure flexibility and permanence given the low housing target figure, complexity of delivery of major site allocations and heritage issues across the city.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID849/Mod/SS2/1			Amend green belt boundary to reflect submitted rep (noting Plan in appendix 5)	Oneill Associates (Janet O'Neill)OBO University of York

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS3 York City Centre

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/SS3/1		Sound	Policy SS3 is considered sound..	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS3/1		Sound	Policy SS3 is considered sound..	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID186/S/SS3/1		Sound	The Trust welcomes the promotion and protection of theatres along with other cultural and social facilities within the plan. In particular, that the plan seeks to resist the loss of facilities. We support the explicit reference made to theatres being acceptable in principle within the City Centre as defined, as well as within the University as ancillary uses to the academic function. We consider the plan to accord with the need to plan positively for cultural wellbeing as set out in the NPPF.	Theatres Trust
SID186/S/SS3Policy/1			We support the explicit reference made to theatres being acceptable in principle within the City Centre as defined, as well as within the University as ancillary uses to the academic function. We consider the plan to accord with the need to plan positively for cultural wellbeing as set out in the NPPF.	Theatres Trust
SID206/S/SS3/1		Sound	Do not challenge the soundness of the Plan. The policy has been positively prepared but requires minor modification to reinforce its support of York Minster. It is fully justified. To be effective we consider that a minor modification is given to SS3 to strengthen the support that CYC has clearly intended to give and will ensure absolute clarity on CYCs commitment to future care of the Minster addressed through its support of a master plan possibly adopted as an SPD or Neighbourhood Plan. Policy SS3 is consistent with NPPF however further explanation within the policy or explanatory text on how support could be given to the Minster should be explicitly stated.	York Minster Alexander McCallion
SID364/S/SS3/1			Policy fails to adequately reflect third party evidence. Needs to be commitment of extending footstreets and upgrading public realm. Further improvements to York City Centre need to be made. Transportation and Congestion Issues.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/SS3/1			Policy fails to adequately reflect third party evidence. Needs to be commitment of extending footstreets and upgrading public realm. Further improvements to York City Centre need to be made. Transportation and Congestion Issues.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/S/SS3/1		Not Sound	While the emphasis on the needs of pedestrians is to be welcomed, there needs to be a commitment to extending the area covered by foot streets, extending their operating hours and removing traffic from them, and substantially upgrading and then maintaining the quality of the public realm.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS3 York City Centre

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID380/S/SS3/1			There should be an emphasis on the scope of the city centre to deliver more new homes. For example, the ST32: Hungate allocation to deliver 328 dwellings should not be taken as a definitive figure and the policy wording should be amended to allow flexibility to deliver more homes on this site where appropriate.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/S/SS3/2			The current wording of Policy SS3 implies that the total capacity of the ST32: Hungate allocation is 328 dwellings. However, this actually reflects the approximate number of dwellings to be delivered in Phases 5 + as set out in Policy SS17. It is also unclear which elements of the Hungate scheme the 328 dwellings / phase 5+ relate to or how this figure has been calculated.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID406/S/SS3/1		Not Sound	Generally supportive of SS3. Issue with 5th Paragraph, last sentence; should say 'use class A1' rather than 'use class A'. Aim should be to protect city centre retail diversity, so Class A1 not whole of Class A.	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)

### Proposed Modification

SID206/Mod/SS3/1			To be effective we consider that a minor modification is given to SS3 to strengthen the support that CYC has clearly intended to give and will ensure absolute clarity on CYCs commitment to future care of the Minster addressed through its support of a master plan possibly adopted as an SPD or Neighbourhood Plan. Policy SS3 is consistent with NPPF however further explanation within the policy or explanatory text on how support could be given to the Minster should be explicitly stated.	York Minster Alexander McCallion
SID206/Mod/SS3/2			We suggest the re-wording of SS3 to read: ... York Minster Cathedral Precinct is approximately 8 Ha in size. The Minster is still the preeminent structure in the City of York today and it continues to play a significant role in the religious, social and cultural life of the city. The Council will work with the Chapter of York as appropriate to develop a York Minster master plan to plan for its development to better reveal the significances of its special character and appearance... within the subsequent text we suggest a minor amendment to add the following paragraph; .. The York Minster Precinct forms an important part of the City Centre. The City Council will work with the Chapter of York and other key stakeholders to develop a master plan for the future care of the Minster. It is important that this document provides certainty in development management terms which could be addressed through either a SPD or Neighbourhood Plan.	York Minster Alexander McCallion
SID364/Mod/SS3/1			Redraft to reflect points made in SID364.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/SS3/1			Redraft to reflect points made in SID365.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS3 York City Centre

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/Mod/SS3/1			Policy SS3 needs to be redrafted	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID380/Mod/SS3/1			Update Policy SS3 to clarify that 328 dwellings is not a definitive capacity figure for the Hungate site and to provide flexibility to increase unit numbers where appropriate.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/Mod/SS3/2			Provide clarification as to which elements of the Hungate scheme the 328 dwellings / phase 5+ relates to and how this figure has been calculated.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID406/Mod/SS3/1			Amend 5th paragraph, last sentence; change 'A' to 'A1'. Add a further principle xi) Ensure better overall access and facilities for people with disabilities.	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID26/LC/SS4/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	No assessment has been made of the impact proposed developments will have on the already heavily congested road network. ST5 for example will add a significant amount of traffic to the A19, Water Lane, Clifton Bridge and various tributary roads. The road safety implications of this have not been considered.	Andrew Dickinson
SID39/LC/SS4/1			Not sufficiently qualified to answer. However does feels there was insufficient consultation on the figures used for housing and employment at ST5 York Central in this version of the plan.	Valerie Richards
SID388/LC/SS4(ST5)/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	York Central Partnership considers that Policy SS4 is legally compliant and has been prepared in accordance with the Duty to Co-operate.	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell)OBO York Central Partnership
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID39/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	The increase in number of dwellings and employment floor space from 1,500 and 60,000 sq m in January 2018 to now 1700-2500 and 100,000sqm was made without proper local consultation. This increase in numbers will have severe negative impacts on the local community, including the environmental impact from the increase in trips / congestion arising from a greater concentration of buildings.	Valerie Richards
SID61/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	Logical place for development but consideration has not been given for a transport hub where a reasonable bus/train station interchange might be possible and would reduce congestion. If offices are being considered here other out of town sites should be reduced.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID118/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	Whilst supporting the principle of the redevelopment of this large brownfield site Historic England are extremely concerned about the potential impact which the quantum of development being proposed might have upon the city's heritage. There has been nothing provided as part of the Evidence Base to demonstrate that this site is capable of accommodating 2,500 dwellings and 100,000sq m of office floorspace in a manner which would not result in a form of development whose scale, massing, design and impact upon the city's infrastructure (particularly the road network in and around the historic core) would not have a considerable adverse impact upon the centre of the City, including traffic. The Evidence Base needs to demonstrate that the volume of development being suggested (and the resultant heights and massing of the buildings) will not harm the setting of the heritage assets in its vicinity or those elements identified in the Heritage Topic Paper	Historic England - Ian Smith

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	Whilst supporting the principle of the redevelopment of this large brownfield site Historic England are extremely concerned about the potential impact which the quantum of development being proposed might have upon the city's heritage. There has been nothing provided as part of the Evidence Base to demonstrate that this site is capable of accommodating 2,500 dwellings and 100,000sq m of office floorspace in a manner which would not result in a form of development whose scale, massing, design and impact upon the city's infrastructure (particularly the road network in and around the historic core) would not have a considerable adverse impact upon the centre of the City, including traffic. The Evidence Base needs to demonstrate that the volume of development being suggested (and the resultant heights and massing of the buildings) will not harm the setting of the heritage assets in its vicinity or those elements identified in the Heritage Topic Paper	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS4/2		Sound	Welcome and support criterion iii, v, vi, vii. However, whilst supporting the development principles for this area, we have significant concerns whether or not the amount of development is achievable in a manner consistent with conservation of those elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS4/2		Sound	Welcome and support criterion iii, v, vi, vii. However, whilst supporting the development principles for this area, we have significant concerns whether or not the amount of development is achievable in a manner consistent with conservation of those elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID182/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	Over-reliance of delivery from the York Central site. YorkCentral has a long history of non-delivery. Envisage some residential development on the York Central site, but not be at the amount envisaged in this Plan.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID186/S/SS4/1		Sound	The Trust welcomes the promotion and protection of theatres along with other cultural and social facilities within the plan. In particular, that the plan seeks to resist the loss of facilities. We support the explicit reference made to theatres being acceptable in principle within the City Centre as defined, as well as within the University as ancillary uses to the academic function. We consider the plan to accord with the need to plan positively for cultural wellbeing as set out in the NPPF.	Theatres Trust
SID186/S/SS4/2		Sound	We support the explicit reference made to theatres being acceptable in principle within the City Centre as defined, as well as within the University as ancillary uses to the academic function. We consider the plan to accord with the need to plan positively for cultural wellbeing as set out in the NPPF.	Theatres Trust
SID330/S/SS4/1			Level of housing proposed for this site is at a very high risk of causing environmental damage through the increase of road traffic leading to air pollution.	Anthony Gregory

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID332/S/SS4/1			Overestimation of amount of land available for development due to site constraints and existing users' requirements.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe
SID339/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	Our Client supports the redevelopment of the York Central site however has significant concerns regarding the deliverability of the quantum of development anticipated by the Council across the site and during the Plan Period. Specifically, our Client objects to the number of homes allocated at York Central within Policy SS4, and the number of homes identified to be delivered within the Plan Period. With regards to the residential component of the site, the Policy stipulates that land is allocated for 1,700 – 2,500 dwellings, of which a minimum of 1,500 will be delivered in the Plan Period. It also stipulates that the site will deliver inter alia 100,000sq.m of Office (B1a). Our Client therefore objects to Policy SS4 as currently drafted as they consider that the number of dwellings proposed to be allocated to be unsound on the basis that it is not justified. Policy H2 sets out that housing developments will be expected to achieve a specific density, depending on its location. The allocation of such a high number of residential unit on the site contradicts the requirement within Policy SS4 (above) and within Policy H2 given the density which would be required. Specifically, the development of buildings up to 14 storeys is likely to have adverse impacts on the historic urban fabric of the city would seek to maximise development rather than being informed by the local character of the area. Our Client is also concerned that Policy SS4 contradicts itself and will be unable to achieve the amount of development anticipated. To achieve 2,500 homes, this would clearly be at the expense of the creation of jobs and would create an extremely dense, residential heavy area with very little mixed -use commercial and leisure elements. Policy SS4 as draft therefore clearly contradicts itself in what it is seeking to achieve and is unsound.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID339/S/SS4/2		Not Sound	Policy H3 seeks to try to balance the housing market across the plan period and work towards a mix of housing identified in the SHMA. As demonstrated in the submitted table, to deliver 2,500 dwellings at York Central this would require the delivery of all 1 and 2-bedroom apartments at a very high density. Even the delivery of just 1,210 units on the site would equate to only approximately 10% of 3 and 4-bedroom townhouses, with the remaining 90% being 1 and 2-bedroom apartments. This level of 1 and 2-bedroom apartments equates to 8% of the overall housing requirement just being delivered on one site. This is clearly contrary to what Policy H3 is seeking to achieve and will hamper the delivery of family houses. Reference has also been made to the affect SS4 would have on affordable housing and deliverability issues. In conclusion our Client supports the principle of redevelopment of the York Central site, however objects to Policy SS4 as drafted on the basis that it is not justified and so is unsound. Following an assessment of the site, we consider that York Central could be capable of accommodating maximum of a total of 1,210 units made up of 250 townhouses and 960 apartments. This is a shortfall of 1,280 units. To achieve 2500 units the scheme would need to be all apartment blocks of 6 storeys in height across the whole site. This would fail to deliver a suitable mix of types or sizes of houses but also be at the expense of commercial development.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	While the transport proposals here are necessary, they are not sufficient, or reflective of the emerging Master plan for the site.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID380/S/SS4/1			We support the increase in dwelling numbers on the York Central site as it is in a highly sustainable location. On this basis, the expected capacity of the Hungate site should also be increased to reflect existing and future permissions.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID382/S/SS4/1		Sound	Homes England considers the aforementioned policies sound and supports their inclusion within the Local Plan. In particular, Homes England strongly supports the allocation of York Central for housing and employment uses through Policies H1, EC1 and SS4.	GVA (Christopher Jones) OBO Homes England
SID388/S/SS4(ST5)/1		Sound	YCP considers SS4 is sound. YCP supports the allocation and identification of York Central as a strategic site and the range & scale of uses proposed by SS4. The Partnership of public sector bodies are taking a joint approach to progressing the development and providing the necessary infrastructure to ensure the site can be developed to its full potential - and comprises Homes England, City of York Council, Network Rail and the National Railway Museum, who together, represent the majority of the site. The Partnership confirms it anticipates delivering over 1700 homes (at least 1500 in the Plan period) and a total of approx 100,000sqm of commercial uses. The Partnership is undertaking further work & intends to submit an outline application in 2018, accompanied by a detailed application for a western access road - funding has been secured from West Yorkshire Combined Authority Transport Fund. YCP is also likely to be in a position to agree and provide a delivery Plan for the site including an updated trajectory with the LPA in advance of Examination hearings and will be able to respond to the Inspectors questions on York's land supply. *Submission includes trajectory and delivery rates for York Central*	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell) OBO York Central Partnership
SID388/S/SS4/1		Sound	York Central Partnership considers Policy is sound. Table 5.1 in Policy H1 estimates the site can yield over 1700 dwellings inc at least 1500 in the Plan period. YCP concur this is possible for the following reasons: Masterplanning, viability and other assessments have confirmed that it can deliver 1700 homes (1500 in the Plan period).	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell) OBO York Central Partnership

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID388/S/SS4/2			Work to date suggests YC is capable of accommodating 1700-2500 units based on indicative master planning work; YC is a Home Zone and therefore there is an immediate drive to ensure that dwellings are delivered as soon as possible, subject to planning permission; There is capacity within the existing highway network and access routes into the site to enable a first phase of development of circa 400 homes to be delivered as soon as possible, and can be constructed concurrently with new access route which also allows further phases to be delivered. The Partnership is undertaking further work & intends to submit an outline application in 2018, accompanied by a detailed application for a western access road - funding has been secured from West Yorkshire Combined Authority Transport Fund. YCP is also likely to be in a position to agree and provide a delivery Plan for the site including an updated trajectory with the LPA in advance of Examination hearings and will be able to respond to the Inspectors questions on York's land supply.	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell)OBO York Central Partnership
SID390/S/SS4(ST5)/1		Not Sound	There is particular concern about the York Central site. Although it has the potential to be well penetrated by existing bus services (eg. the 2, 10 and 15), and achieve a high mode share to bus, its location relatively close to York City Centre means that, if its traffic impact is mismanaged, there is a risk that the development could place significant additional traffic onto York's Inner Ring Road (Lendal Bridge - Gillygate and Queen Street sections) and the links through Leeman Road, Lendal Arch Gyratory, Rougier Street, George Hudson Street, Ouse Bridge and Clifford Street / Tower Street. Many of these links are already at or near saturation capacity for hours every day, leading to slow and unreliable bus journey times through central York, which then impacts on reliability across the network. The QBP's view is that the road access to central York through the Leeman Road Underpass should be bus only to mitigate this.	Confederation of Passenger Transport UK (Andrew McGuinness) OBO York Quality Bus Partnership
SID392/S/SS4/1		Sound	The increase in the planned target to 100,000 sq m of B1a office space at York Central is strongly welcomed given the submitted EZ proposal and the pivotal role of this development for the economy of York and the LEP area. York Central is increasingly important; the site has been approved to move to final co-development stage for a potential c£57m Homes England funding and, with the York, North Yorkshire & East Riding LEP Enterprise Zone status providing an estimated £100m in retained business rates, significant investment is available to address some of York's infrastructure challenges and ensure early delivery.	Rydale District Council - Julian Rudd
SID401/S/SS4/1			Reducing housing numbers for ST5 in the post-plan period whilst increasing overall site capacity seems make an expectation that delivery of this site will be compressed into a shorter time frame. Question as to whether this is achievable due to known constraints.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID401/S/SS4/2			How additional development is to be achieved is questionable as site is landlocked and limited in scale. Question ability to deliver site in shorter time frame. Financial issues.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID408/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	The Permitted Uses and Principles of Development do not appear to agree with each other. For example permitted uses does not include a primary school or nursery, or health facilities, whereas this is included under principles of development. Strongly disagrees with the inclusion of Hotels for York Central. The area surrounding York Central already has an abundant supply of hotels. The planned target of 2,500 dwellings is a huge increase on the earlier plan of 1,500 dwellings. I believe this would involve too high a density of housing on this site.	Sue Cooke
SID582/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	We have expressed concern over the over-reliance of delivery from the York Central site. York Central has a long history of non-delivery. While we envisage some residential development on the York Central site, it will not be at the amount envisaged in this Plan.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/SS4 (ST5)/1			We have expressed concern over the over-reliance of delivery from the York Central site. York Central has a long history of non-delivery. While we envisage some residential development on the York Central site, it will not be at the amount envisaged in this Plan.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/SS4(ST5)/1			York Central has a long history of non-delivery. While there will be some development at the site it will not be to the amount envisaged in the Plan.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/SS4(ST5)/1		Not Sound	York Central has a long history of non-delivery. While there will be some development at the site it will not be to the amount envisaged in the Plan.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID590/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	Over-reliance of this site. Should be treated as windfall. Believes that developable area is less than 35ha.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID598/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	There is currently no developer interest and insufficient evidence to demonstrate that site ST5 is suitable for the type and scale of development proposed or when the site will be genuinely available for development and that the proposed development is achievable in the timescales and quantum set out. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and five of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST5 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	There is currently no developer interest and insufficient evidence to demonstrate that site ST5 is suitable for the type and scale of development proposed or when the site will be genuinely available for development and that the proposed development is achievable in the timescales and quantum set out. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and five of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST5 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	There is currently no developer interest and insufficient evidence to demonstrate that site ST5 is suitable for the type and scale of development proposed or when the site will be genuinely available for development and that the proposed development is achievable in the timescales and quantum set out. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and five of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST5 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	There is currently no developer interest and insufficient evidence to demonstrate that site ST5 is suitable for the type and scale of development proposed or when the site will be genuinely available for development and that the proposed development is achievable in the timescales and quantum set out. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and five of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST5 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID603/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	Note that the suggested yield includes a significant degree of optimism on the one hand and an unreasonably broad range spanning a potential 850 dwellings on the other. In particular, the suggested “1,700 – 2,500 dwellings, of which a minimum of 1,500 dwellings will be delivered in the plan period” represents a lack of clear understanding of true site potential.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID604/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	Suggested yield includes a significant degree of optimism in terms of programme and delivery rates on the one hand and an unreasonably broad range of potential housing yield. It is worth noting that the suggested range of 1,700 – 2,500 dwellings doesn't correlate with the council's own York Central webpage which states 1,000 to 2,500 homes.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID611/S/SS4 (ST5)/1		Not Sound	It is questionable how the additional development is to be achieved on the site (1,700 to 2,500 housing units and 100,000sqm employment floorspace) given the site is landlocked and limited in scale - the site has only 35ha of developable land.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID614/S/SS4 (ST5)/1		Not Sound	It is questionable how the additional development is to be achieved on the site (1,700 to 2,500 housing units and 100,000sqm employment floor space) given the site is landlocked and limited in scale - the site has only 35ha of developable land.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID848/S/SS4(ST5)/1			York Central has a long history of non-delivery. While there will be some development at the site it will not be to the amount envisaged in the Plan.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/SS4/1		Not Sound	Logical place for development but consideration has not been given for a transport hub where a reasonable bus/train station interchange might be possible and would reduce congestion. If offices are being considered here other out of town sites should be reduced.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID2/Mod/SS4/1			Opposes the Railway Institute at Queen Street by the station being designated as mixed use, this means it will be knocked down and an excellent, regionally important sporting facility will be lost. There is no comparable facility in York, demolition will damage local sport and public health. If it must be demolished then another facility at least as good, if not better should be built to replace it.	Rachel Hallam
SID39/Mod/SS4/1			Restore the original allocation of 1,500 dwellings and 60,00 sqm of office floor space. Any greater number will make the plan unsound and cannot be considered sustainable development.	Valerie Richards

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/MOD/SS4/1			The Evidence Base needs to demonstrate that the volume of development being suggested (and the resultant heights and massing of the buildings) will not harm the setting of the heritage assets in its vicinity or those elements identified in the Heritage Topic Paper as contributing to the special character and setting of York. It will also be necessary to show how the amount of traffic generated by this scale of development (in conjunction with the other proposed developments in and around this sector of the City) will not result in increased congestion and worsening air quality - particularly given the fact that the light rail link originally proposed for this development is no longer a requirement.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/SS4/1			The Evidence Base needs to demonstrate that the volume of development being suggested (and the resultant heights and massing of the buildings) will not harm the setting of the heritage assets in its vicinity or those elements identified in the Heritage Topic Paper as contributing to the special character and setting of York. It will also be necessary to show how the amount of traffic generated by this scale of development (in conjunction with the other proposed developments in and around this sector of the City) will not result in increased congestion and worsening air quality - particularly given the fact that the light rail link originally proposed for this development is no longer a requirement.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID330/Mod/SS4/1			I consider it necessary to drastically reduce the number of houses proposed to be built on this site.	Anthony Gregory
SID364/Mod/SS4/1			Redraft to reflect points made in SID364.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/SS4/1			Redraft to reflect points made in SID365.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/Mod/SS4/1			Policy SS4 needs to be redrafted	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID409/Mod/SS4/1		Not Sound	Would be helpful if land was safeguarded for the provision of schools. Also including additional detail around when new schools will be needed to support the delivery of major housing allocations.	Education and Skills Funding Agency - John Pilgrim

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID598/Mod/SS4/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST5 should be 410 units as set out in the Publication Draft (2014). This level of development is more realistic and achievable.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/Mod/SS4/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST5 should be 410 units as set out in the Publication Draft (2014). This level of development is more realistic and achievable.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/Mod/SS4/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST5 should be 410 units as set out in the Publication Draft (2014). This level of development is more realistic and achievable.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/Mod/SS4/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST5 should be 410 units as set out in the Publication Draft (2014). This level of development is more realistic and achievable.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS5 Castle Gateway

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID198/LC/SS5/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Area in which Dep of Environment proposes to build visitor centre was designated as open space. Council by law not permitted to appropriate such land without following correct process.	Jonathan Brockbank
SID258/LC/SS5/1				Annie Medcalf
SID266/LC/SS5/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The area where the proposed new visitor centre at Clifford's Tower was designated as an Open Space and the Council are not allowed to appropriate this land without following due process and advertisement.	Christopher Cook
SID352/LC/SS5/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	There should be further public consultation before the Council sells off the open land at the foot of Clifford's Tower enabling English Heritage to build a visitor centre into the motte.	Louise Williams
SID387/LC/SS5/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	I am of the opinion that the decision to build a visitors centre on part of the Clifford's Tower site was made by CYC with inadequate public consultation.	John Iredale
SID406/LC/SS5/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		York Green Party (Clr Denise Craghill)
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/SS5(ST20)/1		Not Sound	The proposed removal of the car park is supported. A pedestrian precinct on green park land to provide extra way of reducing air pollution. Area is prone to floods. Parking should be encouraged in park and ride areas and not in centre. Tourism features in area should be protected from CO2 erosion.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/SS5(ST20)/2		Not Sound	Contradiction - one paragraph talks about sustainable transport but where a valuable open space could be for city there is another car park planned.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS5 Castle Gateway

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	With minor amendments Historic England broadly support this Policy which will assist in realising the potential of this important part of the City. Amendments suggested to criterion - ix and xvii - delete proposed car park and identify castle mills as residential opportunity.- xi / xvi- improve clarity.- Reference required to state opportunity of Castle and the Eye of York to improve access to the musuems	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	With minor amendments Historic England broadly support this Policy which will assist in realising the potential of this important part of the City. Amendments suggested to criterion - ix and xvii - delete proposed car park and identify castle mills as residential opportunity.- xi / xvi- improve clarity.- Reference required to state opportunity of Castle and the Eye of York to improve access to the musuems	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS5/2		Sound	Conisder that sections for Kings staith/coppergate and Castel and eye of York are sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS5/2		Sound	Conisder that sections for Kings staith/coppergate and Castel and eye of York are sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID119/S/SS5/1		Sound	We have no objections in principle to the concept of developing a multi-storey car park on the existing St Georges field car park and therefore have no objection to the proposed allocation with respect to this. It is important, however, that any applications are in line with Policy ENV 4 and clearly demonstrate that there would be no loss of flood storage and also that flood flow routes would not be altered or displaced onto others. We would not expect to see, nor would we support, any development that results in an increase in flood risk vulnerability classification at this location.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID119/S/SS5/2		Not Sound	Don not consider that the Foss Basin to be an appropriatelocation for new development, such as is indicated in the latest version of the Local Plan. The Foss Basin is critical for the operation of both the Foss Barrier and Castle Mills Sluice. The flood storage within the Foss Basin must be available for the proper operation of flood defence infrastructure and any impact on that infrastructure and associated increases in flood risk are not considered acceptable. We would not supportany development in this location, with the possible exception of water compatible uses, subject to detail. As such we do not consider it appropriate to include the Foss Basin within the ST20 site allocation and that the Local Plan should not be adopted with this allocation included.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID198/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	Open space is recognised nationally and the same procedures are required to change its usage.	Jonathan Brockbank

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS5 Castle Gateway

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID258/S/SS5/1			I strongly object to this plan. One reason is the fact the Local Plan has already appropriated the piece of land where the Clifford's Tower Visitor Centre is due to be built. It was designated as Open Space and the Council by law are not allowed to appropriate such land without following due process and advertising that they are disposing of this land. "Local Government Act 1972 Section 123 (2A)." This should not be done until after the appeal and after the period of advertising to allow people to object.	Annie Medcalf
SID266/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	The area where the proposed new visitor centre at Clifford's Tower was designated as an Open Space and the Council are not allowed to appropriate this land without following due process and advertisement.	Christopher Cook
SID331/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	The provision of a multi-storey carpark at St George's Field is totally unacceptable and is a complete change of policy since the previous draft Plan was available for comment.	Philip Crowe
SID331/S/SS5/2			The Castle and Eye of York proposal would radically affect the concept of open space as a setting for Clifford's Tower. Any such development was called into question by the Inspector when he gave his judgement in the Public Inquiry into proposals to develop the site as part of a shopping centre some years ago. It is clear that this proposal is included as a means of realising a financial gain to the Council, and does not contribute to the desirable development of the whole of the Castle Precinct, which is now under review.	Philip Crowe
SID352/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	The Council should not allow English Heritage to deface Clifford's Tower with a visitor centre built into the motte.	Louise Williams
SID374/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	While the transport proposals here are necessary, they are not sufficient, or reflective of the emerging Master plan for the site. There needs in addition to be reference to closing Coppergate eastbound, linking Piccadilly to the foot streets network amongst other references.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID387/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	I believe errors have been made in regard to the Clifford's tower proposals and that public consultation was inadequate.	John Iredale
SID406/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	Local Plan Evidence Base document : Open Space and Green Infrastructure update Sept.2017, pages 30 –32, Guildhall Ward: map shows 426 the motte and green space around Cliffords Tower with small dent. Incorrect - the whole area is amenity greenspace and there is no legal justification for its removal.	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)
SID406/S/SS5(ST20)/1		Not Sound	Second paragraph, final bullet point. Non-ancillary retail been added to permitted uses for site. Non-ancillary use would damage city centre. Clauses relating to transport not sufficiently robust.	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS5 Castle Gateway

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID604/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID61/S/SS5(ST20)/1		Not Sound	The proposed removal of the car park is supported. A pedestrian precinct on green park land to provide extra way of reducing air pollution. Area is prone to floods. Parking should be encouraged in park and ride areas and not in centre. Tourism features in area should be protected from CO2 erosion.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/SS5(ST20)/2		Not Sound	Contradiction - one paragraph talks about sustainable transport but where a valuable open space could be for city there is another car park planned.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID22/Mod/SS5/1			Considers the Castle Gateway project SS5 to be extremely important. Opening up of the frontage (including behind the Debtor's Prison) with cycle and pedestrian access should be a priority. There should also be a new footbridge over the Foss linking Castle car park with Piccadilly. The new footpath should be extended from Castle Mill Lock to cross the busy main road via a traffic lights controlled pedestrian crossing.	River Foss Society - John Millett
SID118/MOD/SS5/1			With minor amendments Historic England broadly support this Policy which will assist in realising the potential of this important part of the City. Amendments suggested to criterion - ix and xvii - delete proposed car park and identify castle mills as residential opportunity.- Criterion xi amend to read:- "... historic assets and their setting"- Criterion xvii amend to read:- "... sightlines to, from and across the Castle Gateway"- Reference required to state opportunity of Castle and the Eye of York to improve access to the musuems	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/SS5/1			With minor amendments Historic England broadly support this Policy which will assist in realising the potential of this important part of the City. Amendments suggested to criterion - ix and xvii - delete proposed car park and identify castle mills as residential opportunity.- Criterion xi amend to read:- "... historic assets and their setting"- Criterion xvii amend to read:- "... sightlines to, from and across the Castle Gateway"- Reference required to state opportunity of Castle and the Eye of York to improve access to the musuems	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID119/Mod/SS5/1			EA do not support any development in the Foss Basin, with the possible exception of water compatible uses, subject to detail. As such we do not consider it appropriate to include the Foss Basin within the ST20 site allocation and that the Local Plan should not be adopted with this allocation included.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS5 Castle Gateway

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID198/Mod/SS5/1			Public consultation before approval of the Visitor Centre plan is approved.	Jonathan Brockbank
SID258/Mod/SS5/1			I strongly object to this plan. One reason is the fact the Local Plan has already appropriated the piece of land where the Clifford's Tower Visitor Centre is due to be built. It was designated as Open Space and the Council by law are not allowed to appropriate such land without following due process and advertising that they are disposing of this land. "Local Government Act 1972 Section 123 (2A)." This should not be done until after the appeal and after the period of advertising to allow people to object.	Annie Medcalf
SID266/Mod/SS5/1			The piece of land now proposed as the new Visitor Centre should remain designated as Open Space	Christopher Cook
SID331/Mod/SS5/1			Delete Policy SS5 references to St George's ield and Piccadilly.	Philip Crowe
SID352/Mod/SS5/1			Withdraw the planning permission given to English Heritage to build on 'open land' at the foot of Clifford's Tower, as it was not legally given.	Louise Williams
SID361/Mod/SS5/1			Cllr D'Agorne wishes to add his name to the list of councillors supporting the point about open space surrounding Clifford's Tower (link in rep to York Press article).	Cllr Andy D'Agorne
SID363/Mod/SS5/1			Cllr Dave Taylor wishes to add his name to the list of councillors supporting the point about open space surrounding Clifford's Tower (link in rep to York Press article).	Dave Taylor
SID364/Mod/SS5/1			Redraft to reflect points made in SID364.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/SS5/1			Redraft to reflect points made in SID365.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/Mod/SS5/1			Policy SS5 needs to be redrafted	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID387/Mod/SS5/1			That in the light of the concerns or residents the Clifford's tower development is withdrawn.	John Iredale

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS5 Castle Gateway

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID406/Mod/SS5/1			Amend SS5 map to include all of the green space around Clifford's Tower as amenity greenspace.	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)
SID406/Mod/SS5(ST 20)/1			Second para, delete final bullet point. Development principles – add a new xiv) ‘A transport plan for the site must demonstrate how a maximum of 10%of journeys to, from, through or within the site by private car will be achieved.’	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)
SID423/Mod/SS5/1			Loss of site would produce great strain on the other coach park and make it difficult fo other coaches to drop off near the centre.	NDM 6

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS6 British Sugar/Manor School

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/SS6/1		Not Sound	Need to preserve green landscape should be written in policy. No mention of preservation of mature trees. Support for development to take place with the provision that the loss of playing fields should be replaced. Green infrastructure is to be preserved. There are a number of water ponds which support aquatic life. With the increased housing in this area there is a suggestion of primary and nursery school facilities but no mention of increasing the size of the provision for secondary and tertiary education. The lack of provision will increase need for transport and car journeys adding to the congestion.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/SS6/2		Not Sound	Supports this. Total impact of two strategic sites should be seen in concert as this number of houses within such a relative close area over 20 years will totally change the ambience of the area. 500 houses should be completed on site before opening ST2. Configuration of access from the site should be as York Business Park with a dual carriage split entrance onto the site through onto the Borough bridge road. Due to the proximity of the 14th most dangerous unmanned level crossing in the country on millfield lane it is concerning that this should be considered as an entrance or an exit from the site. Additional traffic is noticeable since CYC did not repair the bollard. Consider using bridge across Harrogate railway for exit. Trees and hedgerow should be preserved. Provide playing fields. Consider proximity of power lines and railway (noise). Impact to rural setting. Parking all along Millfield lane despite yellow lines - hazardous. Provision for elderly and young people starter homes.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID199/S/SS6/1			Positive Appraisal of ST1.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison
SID208/S/SS6/1		Not Sound	Comments re: CIL in particular must be directly related to the development itself and in this respect reference to serving the needs of the surrounding communities is not justified or consistent with national policy and should be deleted. Reference to local retail and healthcare infrastructure is specifically made in reference to the future development of the former manor School part of ST1 allocation - this should be clarified.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/2		Not Sound	As part of the master planning exercise British Sugar has ensure that a suitable buffer to the sidings SINC is included within the parameter plans that form part of the outline application to ensure suitable protection. There has been no reference by CYC to the need to phase development around the life cycle of the bees and wasps as it is unjustified and unnecessary. The wording should therefore be deleted from Para 3.41	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/3		Not Sound	Following discussions with CYC it has not been at any point proposed or required that provision be made within the British Sugar site redevelopment for a proportion of plots for sale to self builders or custom house builders. Therefore no provision of this nature is made within the outline application. This requirement is not justified	Rapleys OBO British Sugar

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS6 British Sugar/Manor School

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID208/S/SS6/4		Not Sound	Following discussions with CYC it has not been at any point proposed or required that provision be made within the British Sugar site redevelopment for gypsies and travellers and there is no inclusion in the outline application. This requirement is not justified	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/5		Not Sound	Following detailed discussions with CYC officers the British Sugar site will provide a range of predominantly family housing. These unit types will therefore provide suitable accommodation for older persons. Therefore it is not appropriate that for this site Policy H9 stipulates that specific older persons specialist housing should be provided as this would be contrary to the predominantly family housing provision agreed with officers as part of the planning application.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/6		Not Sound	British Sugar support CYCs aspirations to secure 20% affordable housing on Brownfield sites of 15 or more dwellings. Discussions between CYC and British Sugar since its closure in 2007 have been directed by CYC to assume a tenure split of 70:30 for social rent and discount sale dwellings. It should therefore be made clear that this requirement does not relate to redevelopment of ST1. British Sugar also support the concept of pepper potting affordable housing throughout the development but find the current proposal of no more than two affordable homes placed next to each other too prescriptive and ultimately to lower affordable housing provision.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/7		Not Sound	As part of the planning application process British Sugar has assessed in detail with CYC officers the need for the provision of new community facilities as part of the redevelopment of the site. However, the provision of such facilities must accord with the CIL Regulation Regulations 22, in particular therefore it must be directly related to the development itself. In this respect reference in this policy to meeting the needs of existing occupiers is not justified or in line with national policy and should be deleted.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/8		Not Sound	The planning applications which are currently with CYC for the redevelopment of the British Sugar Site were scoped in detail as part of the pre-application consultation exercise and a cultural wellbeing plan (Policy D3: Cultural Provision) was not requested or required as part of the scoping exercise or as part of the formal EIA scoping exercise.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/9		Not Sound	As part of the planning application process British Sugar site the application seeks to ensure the retention of all mature trees worthy of retention. In the context of the need to remediate the site and provide level development platforms for future housing development. In order to be justified this policy (GI4: Trees and Hedgerows) should therefore recognise that such landscaping should be retained wherever possible in the context of the necessary infrastructure provisions for future development.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/10		Not Sound	As part of the planning application process British Sugar site, British Sugar are committed to providing a combination of on site sports pitches, open space and playing pitch provision and contributions toward off site facilities in agreement with Officers informed by an assessment of need in the locality. There is no definition in policy GI5: Protection of Open Space and playing Fields as the precise meaning of the words area of benefit - this needs to be clarified	Rapleys OBO British Sugar

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS6 British Sugar/Manor School

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID208/S/SS6/11		Not Sound	As part of the planning application process British Sugar has assessed in detail with CYC officers the need for the provision of new open space provision as part of the redevelopment of the site. However, the provision of such facilities must accord with the CIL Regulation Regulations 22, in particular therefore it must be directly related to the development itself. In this respect reference in this policy to meeting the needs of existing occupiers is not justified or in line with national policy and should be deleted.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/12		Not Sound	In reference to Policy ENV2: Managing Environmental Quality when relating to ST1 - the policy should be consistent in its tests for the level of impact that is acceptable in accordance with NPPF and the opening paragraph of the policy itself which refers to development not giving rise to 'significant adverse environmental impacts'. The second paragraph of the policy should therefore be re-worded accordingly.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/13		Not Sound	With reference to Policy ENV4: Flood Risk in relation to ST1 the policy wording should be clarified to ensure that it makes clear that only increases in flood risk arising as a direct result of the development in question will need to be mitigated for.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/S/SS6/14		Not Sound	With reference to Policy DM1: Infrastructure and Developer Contributions in relation to ST1 CYC must ensure in accordance with NPPF that the requirement for funding strategic infrastructure on developers does not hamper the viability and deliverability of the key strategic sites. Any infrastructure requirements associated with new development must be directly related to the impact of that particular development in accordance with CIL Regulation 122. The commercial viability of a development should not be compromised by the requirements of large scale infrastructure. The policy should therefore include specific reference to contributions being in accordance with the requirements of CIL Regulation 122. (also same for Ref: Para 15.12 )	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID269/S/SS6/1		Not Sound	If ST2 and ST1 are developed at the same time it is difficult to see how the necessary infrastructure for both will be provided. ST2 should be retained to provide recreational /sports facilities required for ST1 for the acknowledged shortfall within that part of York. It would also allow for secondary education expansion required for the British Sugar site (ST1) and possibly for primary education. If ST2 is developed along with ST1 where will sports and education facilities be provided? Even with the proposed highway improvements for the A59 and A1237 will they be sufficient to prevent future congestion. ST 2 is a valuable area of Green Belt and helps separate York from the Poppletons and adds to the setting of York.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID315/S/SS6/1		Not Sound	ST1 only allows for 3% affordable housing, contrary to policy SS6.	Robert Leslie Towner
SID330/S/SS6/1		Not Sound	Level of housing proposed for this site is at a very high risk of causing environmental damage through the increase of road traffic leading to air pollution.	Anthony Gregory



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS6 British Sugar/Manor School

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID332/S/SS6/1			Scheme has no affordable housing on the basis of high remediation costs. No cost to justify this and the scheme could have a higher density.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe
SID603/S/SS6/1		Not Sound	we consider the suggested 1,200 dwelling yield includes a significant degree of over-optimism. Reports (2017) refer to “up to 1,100 dwellings” and also 2018 Design and Access Statement suggests as 675 units up to maximum of 1,076 units.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited
SID604/S/SS6/1		Not Sound	Consider the suggested 1,200 dwelling yield includes a significant degree of over-optimism.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID61/S/SS6/1		Not Sound	Need to preserve green landscape should be written in policy. No mention of preservation of mature trees. Support for development to take place with the provision that the loss of playing fields should be replaced. Green infrastructure is to be preserved. There are a number of water ponds which support aquatic life. With the increased housing in this area there is a suggestion of primary and nursery school facilities but no mention of increasing the size of the provision for secondary and tertiary education. The lack of provision will increase need for transport and car journeys adding to the congestion.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/SS6/2		Not Sound	Supports this. Total impact of two strategic sites should be seen in concert as this number of houses within such a relative close area over 20 years will totally change the ambience of the area. 500 houses should be completed on site before opening ST2. Configuration of access from the site should be as York Business Park with a dual carriage split entrance onto the site through onto the Borough bridge road. Due to the proximity of the 14th most dangerous unmanned level crossing in the country on millfield lane it is concerning that this should be considered as an entrance or an exit from the site. Additional traffic is noticeable since CYC did not repair the bollard. Consider using bridge across Harrogate railway for exit. Trees and hedgerow should be preserved. Provide playing fields. Consider proximity of power lines and railway (noise). Impact to rural setting. Parking all along Millfield lane despite yellow lines - hazardous. Provision for elderly and young people starter homes.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID132/Mod/SS6/1			ST1 and ST2 sites proximity to the Millfield Lane level crossing and the need to minimise new pedestrian, cycle and vehicular traffic because of the crossing's high risk rating	Network Rail - Diane Cragg

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS6 British Sugar/Manor School

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID208/Mod/SS6/1			British Sugar/manor School (ST1) will deliver approximately 1200 dwellings at this urban development site. In addition to complying with the policy within this local plan the site should be master planned and be deliverable in accordance with the following key principles; (inter alia) (ii) provide new social infrastructure to serve the needs of the new community including local retail and health (on the former manor School Site), community space, educational facilities and sports provision.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/2			Delete from Para 3.41 'this may include phasing development around the site to correspond to the life cycle of the species'	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/3			Suggest new wording of Policy H4: On strategic sites (other than ST1), (Site 5 hectares and above) developers will be required to supply at least 5% of dwelling plots for sale to self builders or to small/custom house builders subject to appropriate demand being identified.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/4			Suggest new wording of Policy H5 Gypsies and Travellers: within strategic allocations (other than ST1) applications for larger development sites of 5 hectares or more will be required to (i) provide a number of pitches within the site; or (ii) provide alternative land that meets the criteria set out in Part D (of this policy) to accommodate the required number of pitches; or (iii) provide commuted sum payments to contribute to development of pitches elsewhere.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/5			Suggest new wording of Policy H9 Older Persons specialist housing - 'Strategic sites (other than ST1) (over 5 hectares) should incorporate the appropriate provision of accommodation types for older persons within their site master plan.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/6			Suggest new wording of Policy H10: fully integrate the affordable housing by pepper potting throughout the development with no more than four affordable dwellings placed next to each other . The size and type of homes should be pro rata mix of the total homes provided on site taking into account current assessment of local needs where on site provision is required. The affordable housing should be visually indistinguishable from open market dwellings.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/7			Suggest new wording to Policy HW2 - 'development that places additional demands on existing services will be required to provide proportionate new or expanded community facilities to meet the needs of future occupiers.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/8			Suggest new wording to Policy G14 - 'development will be supported where it *provides protection for overall tree cover as well as for existing trees worthy of retention wherever possible in the immediate and longer term, and with conditions that would sustain the trees in good health and maturity.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/9			Rewording of Policy G15 in relation to ST1 suggested that allow appropriate timescales for the provision of off-site facilities agreed via S106 agreement.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS6 British Sugar/Manor School

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID208/Mod/SS6/10			Delete wording in Policy G16: New Open Space Provision - 'where there are deficiencies in certain types of open space provision in the area surrounding a proposed development the Council will seek variations in the component elements to be provided by the developer in order to overcome them.'	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/11			With reference to Policy ENV2 when related to ST1 development proposals for uses that are likely to have an environmental impact on the amenity of the surrounding area including residential amenity, open countryside, local character and distinctiveness, and open spaces must be accompanied by evidence that the impacts have been evaluated and the proposal will not result in significant adverse environmental impacts, giving rise to loss of character, amenity or damage to human health, to either existing or new communities.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/12			With reference to Policy ENV4: Flood risk in relation to ST1 where proposed development is shown to be at risk of flooding or is shown to increase flooding elsewhere in the catchment, development will only be permitted when the local planning authority is satisfied that increases in flood risk as a result of the proposed development (either to the development itself or elsewhere within the catchment), will be successfully managed (through a management and maintenance plan for the lifetime of the development) and there are details of proposed necessary mitigation measures.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID208/Mod/SS6/13			With reference to Policy DM1: Infrastructure and Developer Contributions in relation to ST1 (together with Paragraph 15.12) new development will not be permitted unless the infrastructure required to service the development is available and the necessary infrastructure to meet the local and wider strategic demand generated by the development can be provided and co-ordinated. ....All contributions must accord with the test for planning obligations as defined in CIL Regulations 122.	Rapleys OBO British Sugar
SID269/Mod/SS6/1			ST2 should be retained to provide recreational /sports facilities required for ST1 for the acknowledged shortfall within that part of York. It would also allow for secondary education expansion required for the British Sugar site (ST1) and possibly for primary education.ST 2 is a valuable area of Green Belt and helps separate York from the Poppletons and adds to the setting of York.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID330/Mod/SS6/1			I consider it necessary to drastically reduce the number of houses proposed to be built on this site.	Anthony Gregory

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS7 Civil Service Sports Ground

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/SS7/1		Not Sound	;	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/SS7/2		Not Sound	The paradox of the statement 'perception of openness is a clear indication of green belt and that if development is considered the green belt would be sacrificed. This is the last open space between the villages of upper Poppleton and the urban sprawl of York. The views of the minster are clear from the site and could be lost with development. It is an important urban are and should be reinstated as sports and leisure areas for the local schools and community. There will be significant competition on the Borough bridge Road if this development goes ahead as there will be in the region of 1500 homes. No mention of this in the transport strategy.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/SS7/3		Not Sound	noted that the presence of grade 2 agricultural land is missing from policy. Only includes mixed housing however in SS18 it is stated there is a need for affordable housing. GB1 references building in green belt, Np policy says land needs to be allocated in green belt. key to the amalgamation of the two sections of land is the loss of green belt and high quality agricultural land. it is the last significant break in the landscape between the urban area of York and the city limits and the boundary of poppleton. Plan promoted healthy living but will not reinstate playing fields. Should consider expansion of these facilities for Manor academy. Valuable trees and shrubs surrounding site which should be retained.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID118/S/SS7/1		Sound	Consider the policy is sound. The frontage alongside the A59 is undeveloped. This open area contributes to the setting and approach to the City from the north-west. Particularlry welcome therefore the requirement in this Criterion that development should be set back from the A59 frontage and retain the mature trees in order to preserve the perception of openness.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID166/S/SS7/1		Not Sound	Loss of green belt land is not in York's greater interest, there are other sites that are more appropriate and should be developed first. Local infrastructure cannot support a development of this size.	David Gale
SID199/S/SS7/1			Positive Appraisal of ST2.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS7 Civil Service Sports Ground

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID269/S/SS7/1		Not Sound	If ST2 and ST1 are developed at the same time it is difficult to see how the necessary infrastructure for both will be provided. ST2 should be retained to provide recreational /sports facilities required for ST1 for the acknowledged shortfall within that part of York. It would also allow for secondary education expansion required for the British Sugar site (ST1) and possibly for primary education. If ST2 is developed along with ST1 where will sports and education facilities be provided? Even with the proposed highway improvements for the A59 and A1237 will they be sufficient to prevent future congestion. ST 2 is a valuable area of Green Belt and helps separate York from the Poppletons and adds to the setting of York.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID335i/S/SS7(ST2)/1		Not Sound	Not sound, not properly prepared or justified as not an objective assessment of where housing should be located so far as ST2 is concerned as it is not sound in the infrastructure required for highways & A1237 in particular, generated by ST1, ST2 and ST14, & not deliverable over Plan period, even working with statutory bodies. Not consistent with NPPF Green Belt & is in conflict with the Local Plan primary and other purposes for Green Belt land. Disagree the relocated Manor School redefines urban edge & that ST2 is well contained. Buildings on ST2 only covered a small part of the site & most of it were pitches & agric land. Sports pitches acceptable in Green Belt - pitches at new Manor School is no justification for removing ST2. Other areas within A1237 are Green Belt. Also important in maintaining gap between York & Poppleton (one of the purposes of Green Belt). Poppleton P&R and Poppleton Junior FC are both in Green Belt - do not justify taking ST2 out of Green Belt. ST2 provided a large area of open space, & was an attractive approach to York across open fields.Site provided for sport & recreation (NPPF para 81). Removing land from Green Belt would reduce quality of farmland locally. Playing fields have been lost locally, yet demand gone up as more housing sites coming forward. ST2 should be retained to meet this demand. Para 3.43 acknowledges that ST2 will be likely to exacerbate congestion in the area, esp at peak times, when combined with ST1. The Highway Authority has acknowledged that the volume of traffic on the A1237 near ST2 and Boroughbridge Road as now almost at full capacity.	Lionel Lennox
SID347/S/SS7/1		Not Sound	The site should be referred to as “the former” Civil Service Sports Ground but it should be noted that it also includes adjoining land fronting to Millfield Lane and adjacent Manor School. The description of the site should be amended on the Key Diagram (page 19), in the title of Policy SS7 and in the Table 5.1 of the Plan. It can also be noted that the site was also allocated for development in the Submission Poppleton Neighbourhood Plan with the support of the Neighbourhood Plan Group and Parish Council. Although not included in the final plan following comments from the Examiner that allocations and the definition of the Green Belt should be a strategic matter for the Local Plan, the development of the site was and continues to be supported locally with few concerns.	Planning Prospects (Jason Tait) OBO Miller Homes
SID604/S/SS7/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS7 Civil Service Sports Ground

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID61/S/SS7/1		Not Sound	The definition that follows was given to the upper and nether Poppleton neighbourhood plan when the made plan was agreed and supported by CYC but in the policy stated in the current local plan it has been ignored. The site ST2 was removed by the inspector of the upper and nether Poppleton neighbourhood plan based on the city of York information that this was a green belt site from the reserved regional spatial strategy RSS. The Green Belt designation of the Land by the reserved RSS YH9C. The detailed inner boundaries of the Green Belt around York should be defined in order to establish long term development limits that safeguard the special character and setting of the historic cityPolicy Y1 York Sub area policy plan strategies, investment decisions and programmes for York sub area should: C Environment1 The City of York LDF, defines the detailed boundaries of the outstanding sections of the outer boundary of the York Green Belt about 6 miles from York City Centre and the inner boundary in line with policy YH9.2 Protect and enhance the nationally significant historical and environmental character of York including its historic setting., views of the Minster and important open area'	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/SS7/2		Not Sound	The paradox of the statement 'perception of openness is a clear indication of green belt and that if development is considered the green belt would be sacrificed. This is the last open space between the villages of upper Poppleton and the urban sprawl of York. The views of the minster are clear from the site and could be lost with development. It is an important urban are and should be reinstated as sports and leisure areas for the local schools and community. There will be significant competition on the Borough bridge Road if this development goes ahead as there will be in the region of 1500 homes. No mention of this in the transport strategy.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/SS7/3		Not Sound	noted that the presence of grade 2 agricultural land is missing from policy. Only includes mixed housing however in SS18 it is stated there is a need for affordable housing. GB1 references building in green belt, Np policy says land needs to be allocated in green belt. key to the amalgamation of the two sections of land is the loss of green belt and high quality agricultural land. it is the last significant break in the landscape between the urban area of York and the city limits and the boundary of poppleton. Plan promoted healthy living but will not reinstate playing fields. Should consider expansion of these facilities for Manor academy. Valuable trees and shrubs surrounding site which should be retained.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID132/Mod/SS7/1			ST1 and ST2 sites proximity to the Millfield Lane level crossingand the need to minimise new pedestrian, cycle and vehicular traffic because of the crossing's high risk rating	Network Rail - Diane Cragg
SID166/Mod/SS7/1			ST2 should remain greenbelt, remove allocation from the plan.	David Gale

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS7 Civil Service Sports Ground

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID269/Mod/SS7/1			ST2 should be retained to provide recreational /sports facilities required for ST1 for the acknowledged shortfall within that part of York. It would also allow for secondary education expansion required for the British Sugar site (ST1) and possibly for primary education.ST 2 is a valuable area of Green Belt and helps separate York from the Poppletons and adds to the setting of York.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID335i/MOD/SS7(S			Remove ST2 from the Local Plan and keep it in the Green Belt.	Lionel Lennox
SID347/Mod/SS7/1			In response to a number of points set out in Policy SS7 and the Explanation section of the site's assessment at paragraphs 3.42, 3.43 and 3.44 we would highlight and request corresponding amendments to the Policy that; - The site should be referred to as the former Civil Service Sports Ground and Adjoining Land - New open space provision can be made within the scheme however off site contributions towards formal sports provision is proposed in order to make effective use of the site and efficiently support other sports sites nearby. Indeed, discussions have progressed with Manor School about this development supporting their proposals for additional sports pitches and recreation facilities on land to the north west of the school through an off site financial contribution. - Mention is made of the need to cater for additional school capacity as a result of the development and this can be adjudged relative to capacity within existing schools at the time of the determination of a planning application. - The capacity of the site is suggested as approximately 266 and this is reflective of the current planning application. - Access is possible to both Millfield Lane and Boroughbridge Road however there is a strong desire not to create a through route for motor vehicles. - The estimated Phasing for this site should see its immediate delivery and contribute to the first 5 years of the plan. This delivery within the short term should be reflected also in Table 5.1 of the Plan	Planning Prospects (Jason Tait) OBO Miller Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS8 Land Adjacent to Hull Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/SS8/1		Not Sound	Whilst there is no objection to the principle of allocating this site for development, the future of this site needs to be considered in the context of the likely future needs of the University and the impact which development on Site ST27 might have upon the elements which contribute to York's special character and setting. preferable, therefore, if Site ST4 was allocated, instead, to help meet the future needs of the University and the southern extent of the Campus moved further back from the A64.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS8/1		Not Sound	Whilst there is no objection to the principle of allocating this site for development, the future of this site needs to be considered in the context of the likely future needs of the University and the impact which development on Site ST27 might have upon the elements which contribute to York's special character and setting. preferable, therefore, if Site ST4 was allocated, instead, to help meet the future needs of the University and the southern extent of the Campus moved further back from the A64.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS8/2		Not Sound	we welcome the inclusion of the development principle relating to the need to protect important views and that the site is designed appropriately in relation to its gradient (iv)	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS8/2		Not Sound	we welcome the inclusion of the development principle relating to the need to protect important views and that the site is designed appropriately in relation to its gradient (iv)	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID125/S/SS8/1			Persimmon supports the allocation of this site for residential development. It is noted the policy states the site's dwelling capacity as approximately 211 units. Persimmon considers the site has a capacity of about 240 houses. As requested, Persimmon has completed the Council's standard site viability pro-form based on the site providing 211 units in accordance with policy, and one with the preferred unit numbers, attached. The site has not been subject of a detailed technical review therefore all costs are estimates.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID231/S/SS8/2		Not Sound	FPC considers this proposal should be deleted. It would result in further incremental urbanisation of the south-eastern quadrant of the City which is damaging its character. This site was once part of a much larger area of open land and Green Belt which extended from Hull Road to the A64 and beyond. The University East Campus was allowed to be developed in this area as an exception to Green Belt policy because of its national and regional importance. Despite this, the presence of the University is now being used to justify further development of open land	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID604/S/SS8/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS8 Land Adjacent to Hull Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID825/S/SS8(ST4)/1		Not Sound	The site is an important 'green' route between the Green Belt fringe and urban area, its elevated position making it even more important, functioning as open space and wildlife value (Jubilee Wood) - which will be compromised by cutting an access through it for housing, and erode the buffer zone. The land drains into Osbaldwick Beck, which is at capacity, so drainage concerns. The traffic implications of this site on the A1079 Field Lane, together with the implications of Germany beck when completed and other sites, would make the development unsound. Consequently ST4 fails all 4 tests of soundness. Not Positively prepared / Effective - in terms of no credible transport solutions. Not justified - given buffer zone / green corridor role. Not Consistent with National Policy - important views compromised & loss of biodiversity / woodland.	Osbaldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association

### Proposed Modification

SID118/MOD/SS8/1			Consideration should be given to the use of this site as an allocation to meet the future needs of the University and thereby enable a reduction in Site ST27 to a scale less likely to harm the special character and setting of the City.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/SS8/1			Consideration should be given to the use of this site as an allocation to meet the future needs of the University and thereby enable a reduction in Site ST27 to a scale less likely to harm the special character and setting of the City.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID825/MOD/SS8(ST4)/1			Removal of ST4 from the Plan	Osbaldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS9 Land East of Metcalfe Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID36/S/SS9(ST7)/1		Sound	The document is clear and contains relevant information,	Kay Stead
SID114/S/SS9(ST7)/1		Not Sound	Development of this size with only one access northwards and one access southwards cannot be justified. Both Stockton Lane and Osbaldwick are very busy as it is. Roads and drains cannot accommodate this.	Ian Anderson
SID118/S/SS9/1		Not Sound	Whilst there may well be potential to accommodate some of York's development needs on the eastern side of the City, as currently proposed, this allocation will harm a number of key elements identified in the Heritage Topic Paper as contributing to the special character and setting of York including prominent views and reducing the gap between the A64 and the edge of the built-up. A new settlement in this location is out of keeping with the current pattern of development. Development needs to be pulled away from the ring road. The most appropriate approach might be for some limited development on the eastern edge of the main built-up area of the City but this must be of a scale which does not harm the scale or compact nature of the City	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID125/S/SS9(ST7)/1		Not Sound	Supports proposed allocation of housing in the area which includes ST7, but objects to the site boundaries. Potential development of ST7 was proposed by York Council in its draft Core Strategy. Although indicative, it was clear the development was seen as an urban extension to the built up area of York but without suitable vehicular access. This omission was thoroughly investigated at design and technical workshops and subsequently the site was extended to abut Stockton Lane. The September 2016 Draft Local Plan showed ST7 standing isolated from the main urban area as a satellite development and this continues in the CYLPS. Persimmon considers this approach: • is counter to the wider objectives of the Local Plan • does not create good urban form • is not a sustainable form of development • is an inefficient use of land In brief, Persimmon proposes the CYLPS reverts to the development boundaries put forward by the Council in its Publication Draft Proposals Plan Consultation Draft October 2014 Local Plan for the northern part of ST7. The impact on site size and estimated yield is provided at the end. Rep then goes into detail about site boundaries and proposes expansion.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID256/S/SS9/1		Not Sound	We continue to support the principle of allocation of ST7 but have concerns about the boundary of the allocation.	Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes - Liam Tate
SID256/S/SS9/1		Not Sound	We strongly question whether ST7 meets the test of soundness in that it has not been positively prepared and is not fully justified.	Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes - Liam Tate

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS9 Land East of Metcalfe Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID256/S/SS9/3			We have no specific comment on the wording of the document but the Council clearly has aspirations for a new 'garden' village support by a whole host of services and facilities which will reduce the developable area of the site, therefore the site should be increased.	Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes - Liam Tate
SID297/S/SS9(ST7)/1		Not Sound	The map does not show all occupied housing development in Osbaldwick. Specifically, the JRHT development marked on the attached photocopied sheet.	Cllr Roger Bedford
SID329/S/SS9/1		Not Sound	ST7 will have a negative environmental impact on the city.	Alistair McFarlane
SID329/S/SS9/2			The present boundaries of ST7 are too close to the village of Murton and would negatively impact the village.	Alistair McFarlane
SID329/S/SS9/3			The proposed development has planned dwellings of around 8 times the number in the village. This would cause a severe strain on the infrastructure in the village of Murton.	Alistair McFarlane
SID332/S/SS9/1			Issues with access to services that would require major infrastructure investment. Site not large enough to support adequate social provision for resident's needs. Adverse Transport impacts.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe
SID338/S/SS9(ST7)/1		Not Sound	Comment made to road access to this site to the south and this new access will be essential for the viability of the proposed development. This has not been confirmed or positively prepared. With reference to paragraphs vi. And x., in Policy SS9 the texts for the 2 principles are confusing and misleading. The access to the south as shown on the proposals map is from Outgang Lane not Murton Way and there will be no impact or loss to nature conservation (Osbalwick Meadows) as the site access is as shown on the proposals map from Outgang Lane not Murton Way.	Alan Cook
SID339/S/SS9/1		Not Sound	Although our Client welcomes the principle of site ST7 as a proposed housing allocation, these representations demonstrate that the Council are not delivering their full OAN and additional housing should be provided. We have previously demonstrated that this site can accommodate additional units and it is noted that the Council put forward the possibility of increasing the capacity of the site to 975 units in the Local Plan Working Group report of January 2018. We have previously objected to this amendment to the site boundary and the reduction in capacity and we continue to maintain our position on this as the reduction of the site is not justified, effective or positively planned, and as such Policy SS9 is unsound. A copy of our site-specific representations regarding site ST7 are attached at Appendix 2, which were submitted as part of the Preferred Sites consultation and the Pre-Publication consultation.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS9 Land East of Metcalfe Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/S/SS9(ST7)/1		Not Sound	While supporting the principle of development at SS9, the rep raises the following issues: * the target of 845 dwgs is significantly below what is achievable and what would support sustaining local services, increase housing mix and reduce access/infrastructure costs; * land between the site and the urban edge should form part of the site and be allocated for housing;* housing need should be led by a localised housing needs assessment;* outstanding questions re traffic impacts, infrastructure and CI;* public transport/cycle connectivity could be improved by connecting the site to the urban edge;* questions why footpath requires a 50m buffer;	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID594/S/SS9 (ST7)/1		Not Sound	Support for the proposed allocation of Land to the East of Metcalfe Lane (ST7) proposed by CYC within the emerging CYC Local Plan of 845dwellings on 35.4Ha,70% net site area at 35dph. Whilst the principles of the allocation of the site is supported, it is indicated that amendments are also required to the site's proposed boundaries in order to ensure that CYC's Garden Village philosophy for the site can be delivered. Three options are considered: Option A: 845 houses in an area of 43.53ha, 60% net developable area 26.4Ha at 32dph. Option 2. 945 houses on an area of 43.53Ha, 70% net developable area - 30.47 Ha net site area at 32dph. Option 3: 1,225 Homes on an area of 57.27 Ha, 70% net developable area – 40.1 Ha net site area at 32dph. The proposals will deliver a Sub-Urban Garden Village with the provision of a primary school, village centre and public open space, allotments and recreational facilities. The proposed development options have been formulated following the undertaking of ecology, landscape, Green Belt, flood risk, archaeology and highways, deliverability assessments which are included within the full response. Indicative Masterplan are included in the full response for Options 1 and 2. Socio-Economic information given for each option proposed. There is a legal process which the response indicates that CYC can undertake. Case given for the release of additional land as housing allocations within the emerging CYC Local Plan in order to meet the City's fullobjectively assessed housing needs.	Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7
SID604/S/SS9/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS9 Land East of Metcalfe Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID825/S/SS9(ST7)/1		Not Sound	Development of this prominent site would completely spoil the setting of the Minster with the rural landscape in the foreground. Previously planning agreed principles have been disregarded., making it unsound. Goes against officers assurances at the 2006 Inquiry, where it was assured that Metcalfe Lane would form an enduring Green Belt boundary . CYC/JRHT resisted construction traffic across ST7 due to Green Belt concerns, but these concerns no longer exist. Developers have publically admitted that the current site would be financially unviable, so must be unsound in that context. Current boundary would compromise surrounding buffer zones (to protect Osbaldwick Cons Area & Meadlands). Inclusion would compromise one of the primary purposes of the Green Belt, to the setting and views of the Minster & create development pressure in other areas. Access to the site from Outgang Lane would be past the gypsy site. Access via Link Rd would increase pressure on Hull Rd, other accesses to built up area unacceptable (info annexed). No effective transport solution, so ST7 is unsound on Transport grounds. Risk of destroying a candidate SINC if accessed off Murton Way (also part of floodplain). Development would be very car dependent, creating parking issues. How will the number of ecological constraints identified within ST7 be addressed. Land is poorly drained clay so how will the drainage be provided - any access off Murton Way will be across an exceptionally poorly drained field. ST7 fails all 4 tests of soundness. Not positively prepared (fails to take into account green belt setting / access); Not effective (transport issues & not viable according to developers); Not justified (based on previous Inspectors decisions on the same land); Not consistent (with NPPF Green Belt policy).	Osbaldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID833/S/SS9/1		Not Sound	Intermediate and isolated growth areas such as at ST14 and ST 7 appears to be entirely inappropriate, without precedent, and without justification. They are contrary to NPPF policy.	George E Wright Combined
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID118/MOD/SS9/1			The eastern edge of Site ST7 needs to be pulled away from the ring road. The most appropriate approach might be for some limited development on the eastern edge of the main built-up area of the City but this must be of a scale which does not harm the scale or compact nature of the City	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID/Mod/SS9(ST7)/1			Persimmon proposes that the Local Plan reverts to the development boundaries proposed by the Council in the October 2014 version of the Local Plan Publication Draft for the northern part of ST7.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID256/Mod/SS9/1			The allocation boundary is too small and should be increased to utilise available land.	Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes - Liam Tate
SID329/Mod/SS9/1			The environmental problems identified by English Heritage/Historic England need to be addressed. So too, do the criticisms from the Ward and Parish Council to earlier drafts.	Alistair McFarlane

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS9 Land East of Metcalfe Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID338/Mod/SS9/1			Changes to the text are required to make both principles as written correspond with each other and give correct information, to make the plan sound. I suggest revised wording to key principle vi. :- 'Provide vehicular access from Stockton Lane to the north of the site and/or Outgang Lane to the south of the site (as shown on the proposals map) with a small proportion of public transport served off Bad Bargain Lane. Access between Stockton Lane and Outgang Lane will be limited to public transport and walking/cycling links only'. Modification required to correct text to correspond with proposals map. I suggest removing the key principle x. completely or alternatively revised wording (considering there is an existing public footpath crossing the SINC which continues to the boundary of ST7). 'Minimise impacts of access by limiting to walking/cycling links only from Murton Way to the south on 'Osboldwick Meadows' Site of Importance to Nature Conservation and provide compensatory provision for any loss	Alan Cook
SID339/Mod/SS9/1			Whilst our Client supports the principle of a strategic housing allocation within proximity of Osboldwick, it is considered that the boundary of the allocation should be increased to include additional land to the south and west so that it relates to the existing more suitably to the existing built form of Osboldwick.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID409/Mod/SS9(ST 7)/1		Not Sound	Would be helpful if land was safeguarded for the provision of schools. Also including additional detail around when new schools will be needed to support the delivery of major housing allocations.	Education and Skills Funding Agency - John Pilgrim
SID585/Mod/SS9/1			Taylor Wimpey would support a boundary change to the north of ST7, connecting the site with Stockton Lane to improve the connectivity of the site.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID825/MOD/SS9(ST 7)/1			Removal of ST7 from the Plan and the land determined to be left permanently open Green Belt, given the contribution it makes to the character and setting of historic York, when viewed from the A64.	Osboldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID850/Mod/SS9(ST 7)/1			Highways England have commented on the proposed development sites in our letter of 23rd October 2017 and note the proposed increase in housing and employment at York Central, and the reduction in housing at the Queen Elizabeth Barracks site. We welcome reference to the need for individual and cumulative traffic impact assessments for these sites. However, some of the strategic sites refer to the cumulative impact with other sites but not all the sites have a reciprocal reference about the individual and cumulative impact, for example ST7 should include reference to Sites ST35 and ST15.	Highways England

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS10 Land North of Monks Cross

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID241/LC/SS10/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Peter Aspin
SID595/LC/SS10/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID114/S/SS10/1		Not Sound	Cannot justify 968 houses at this site. Monks Cross link road is already very busy, with the coming addition of the community stadium, cinema, cafes etc the roads will not have capacity. At the very least the Monks Cross link road from Jockey Lane to the A1237 should be dualled.	Ian Anderson
SID118/S/SS10/1		Not Sound	Whilst there may well be potential to accommodate some of York's development needs on the eastern side of Huntington, as currently depicted, this allocation seems likely to harm several elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York including reducing the gap between the edge of the built-up area and the Ring Road. It would start to enclose the western edge of the green wedge that is centred on Monk Stray. The open areas either side of Monk's Cross Link Road have the remnants of its historic field patterns contribute to the character of this area. Strategic Greenspace has been created alongside the western boundary of this site; which has pushed the development towards the ringroad so looks likely to create a development poorly linked to and integrated with the neighbouring residential areas.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID241/S/SS10/1		Not Sound	"Minor delays" in traffic flow estimates as a result of new housing proposals are unrealistic.	Peter Aspin
SID270/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The Local Plan is introduced as a plan to set out where land should be provided for new homes and jobs needed in the City - need is an opinion. Have Huntington residents been asked. Stop: people before profit! In 2016 the British people said no to uncontrolled population increase and damage to our special countryside. The policy of new homes/jobs is self defeating and will create problems.	Peter Carney
SID332/S/SS10/1			Higher density would be possible. Provision of public open space is unacceptable.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS10 Land North of Monks Cross

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID357/S/SS10/1		Not Sound	Policy SS10 seeks to allocate the Land North of Monks Cross (ST8) as an urban extension site which it is stated will deliver 968 dwellings. Whilst we support the general principle of allocating land for development in this part of York given it is free from the development constraints identified at paragraphs 3.4 to 3.12 of the Plan, we do not support the proposed boundary of site ST8 as it does not adjoin the existing settlement limits of Huntington and therefore cannot rightly be considered to be an urban extension.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID357/S/SS10/1		Not Sound	The Huntington site would comprise an extension to the settlement and adjoins sites which have been considered as reasonable alternatives to strategic housing site (ST8 – Land to the North of Monks Cross). It is considered that the allocation of this site along with adjoining sites which have been assessed by the Council would comprise a more reasonable alternative to proposed strategic housing site ST8, which is separated from the settlement and does not form a natural extension.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID357/S/SS1/2		Not Sound	It is unclear why a gap has been left between Huntington and the proposed allocation, with the site only comprising an urban extension northwards from Monks Cross. The allocation as proposed leaves an un-natural gap between the site and land to the west	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID374/S/SS10/1		Not Sound	These developments between them risk adding significantly to vehicular traffic and congestion on York's road network. None of them adheres fully even to the design principles for new developments specified in Policy T1; Policies SS11, 19 and 21 make no reference at all to public transport provision. The others propose a target of 15% of journeys by public transport; no evidence is offered to justify that target; nor is any target offered for walking and cycling. As we have noted elsewhere, the design principles in Policy T1 are necessary but not sufficient. Three of the sites, under Policies SS12, 13 and 22, propose direct links to the outer ring road. There is ample evidence that such provision promotes the development of dormitory villages for commuters to remote employment areas,	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID582/S/SS10/1		Not Sound	Land to the immediate south of North Lane, to the east of the existing Huntington urban edge, and to the immediate west of the western boundary of proposed strategic site ST8 should be included / part re-instated to form part of site ST8. We object to the removal of land from strategic site ST8. In terms of ST8 we consider the target 968 dwellings is achievable but could be significantly increased to circa 1,400 should the ST8 2014 boundary be reinstated. This increase would assist in provision of local services green corridors and local affordable homes.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/SS10(ST8)/ 1			Broadly supportive of the allocation of ST8, The allocation is deliverable with redrow owning the majority of the site and committed to its delivery. Land to the immediate south of North Lane, to the east of the existing Huntington urban edge, and to the immediate west of the western boundary of proposed strategic site ST8 should be excluded from the greenbelt and included as a green wedge incorporating openspace provision to form part of site ST8.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS10 Land North of Monks Cross

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/S/SS10(ST8)/1			We consider that it is unjustified to exclude the triangular piece of land to the immediate north of North Lane which formed part of ST8 within the Publication Draft of the York Local Plan (October 2014). We consider that the A1237 would provide for a more appropriate defensible long term Green Belt boundary further north than that proposed, and this would allow for appropriate landscape buffers to be built and that this would not threaten the coalescence between Huntington and Earswick Village any further than the existing development in this area. Access to this land could be from North Lane with no direct access to A1237 in line with existing planning principles - Masterplan included.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID584/S/SS10(ST8)/2			We find the reasoning given for reducing the capacity of ST8 (that a green corridor between the western boundary of the site and the existing built edge of Huntington Village was needed to maintain the identity of Huntington and create a 'new contained neighbourhood within the main York urban area') separates urban extensions from the existing urban area and is not considered to be an appropriate plan-led approach.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID595/S/SS10/1		Sound	Our client supports the retention of the site Land North of Monks Cross (Site Ref. ST8) as a proposed strategic site allocation within the Publication Draft Local Plan. However, they are concerned that the site may not be brought forward in a comprehensive manner unless collaborative discussions between all parties take place as early as possible. On the basis of the information provided within this letter our client supports the principle of the proposed allocation of Site ST8 by CYC within the Publication Draft Local Plan. BDW would like to work alongside CYC and the other developers of the site to finalise the site specific strategic development policy to be included within future versions of the Local Plan. As explained above, working together we can ensure that CYC's and the local community's planning parameters for the site are deliverable	Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID604/S/SS10/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID118/MOD/SS10/1			In order to reduce the impact upon the setting of the City from the A1237 and to retain the pattern of historic fields, development should be pulled away from the northern Ring Road and Monk's Cross Link Road.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID241/Mod/SS10/1			Housing developments, in particular the 960 houses near Monk's Cross, should only be granted if the dualling of the ring road is approved.	Peter Aspin

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS10 Land North of Monks Cross

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID357/Mod/SS10/1			We do not support the proposed boundary of siteSS10 (ST8) as it does not adjoin the existing settlement limits of Huntington and therefore cannot rightly be considered to be an urban extension.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID364/Mod/SS10/1			Should consider extending park and ride services to site.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/SS10/1			Should consider extending park and ride services to site.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/MOD/SS10/1			The policy must be based on the full set of design principles for promoting sustainable travel, and include a much more challenging target for the proportion of journeys by sustainable modes. Policy SS10 should consider extending park and ride services to the site	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID582/Mod/SS10/1			Johnson Mowat have prepared this response to the City of York Local Plan Publication Draft Consultation on behalf of landowners (Curry, Hudson and GM Ward Trust) to the immediate south of North Lane, to the east of the existing Huntington urban edge, and to the immediate west of the western boundary of proposed strategic site ST8 - we consider should be included / part re-instated to form part of site ST8. We object to the removal of land from strategic site ST8. In terms of ST8 we consider the target 968 dwellings is achievable but could be significantly increased to circa 1,400 should the ST8 2014 boundary be reinstated. This increase would assist in provision of local services green corridors and local affordable homes.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/SS10(S T8)/1			Concerns remain with the reduced scale of the allocation and references to 'strategic greenspace' and the provision of a 'new green wedge' when considering the land to the immediate west of site ST8. Disagree that this land should be given Green Belt status. The target 968 dwellings is achievable subject to the Primary School being located in the western green wedge, community facilities being associated with the school such that they do not take land that could be used for residential and that public openspace allocation on the site is reflective of community use of school playing fields and informal use of nature reserve created to the East.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS10 Land North of Monks Cross

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/Mod/SS10(S T8)/1			Both Redrow Homes and Linden Homes have an interest in the land immediately north of North Lane Huntington. This land was previously identified as part of ST8 in 2014 and feel the boundary of the site should be amended to include this once more as they consider it appropriate and more logical to reinstate this. This land is circa 8.55 ha, which could deliver circa 250 on this area and increase capacity on the allocated ST8 site through intensification of uses. It would also enable an additional development sales outlet on ST8, increasing sustainability and increasing the delivery rates to circa 100/120 dpa. The greenbelt boundary should also be amended to follow the line of the A1237 as a more robust and defensible boundary.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID850/Mod/SS10/1			Highways England have commented on the proposed development sites in our letter of 23rd October 2017 and note the proposed increase in housing and employment at York Central, and the reduction in housing at the Queen Elizabeth Barracks site. We welcome reference to the need for individual and cumulative traffic impact assessments for these sites. However, some of the strategic sites refer to the cumulative impact with other sites but not all the sites have a reciprocal reference about the individual and cumulative impact, for example ST8 should include reference to Sites ST35 and ST15.	Highways England

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID87/LC/SS11/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant	Has reviewed the DtC document and feels the traffic implications of ST9 have not been fully considered. Believes DtC has purposefully focused on the east and west of the city. CYC need to consider adding a rail link from Haxby to York station (via the Scarborough line) and explore expanding the existing road layout to include a bus lane (Wigginton End) to ease traffic congestion by encouraging people onto public transport. Only once this has been considered should proposals for further development be put forward.	Craig Norris
SID93/LC/SS11/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant	Unable to judge the legality, does not appear to be. Unsure whether the environmental impacts of ST9 are allowed.	Allan Harris
SID139/LC/SS11/1	Does not comply with DtC		An extra 135 houses in Haxby is unsustainable.	David Stuart
SID168/SS11/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Alan Terence James
SID188/LC/SS11/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Elaine Mephram
SID234/LC/SS11/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Mary Crawford
SID237/LC/SS11/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Janet White
SID275/LC/SS11/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The Plan is not legally compliant as it offers no consideration to existing residents lifestyles or the negative impacts of this development will have on them. There has been no co-operation with the residents.	Paul Tutill

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID277/LC/SS11/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		William Grainger
SID279/LC/SS11/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	ST9 built on flooded marshland, already overcrowded and there will not be enough area space for infrastructure.	Christine Daker
SID281/LC/SS11/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Information not supplied.	Daniel Grainger
SID369/LC/SS11 (ST9)/1		Not Sound	Disappointment that ST9 has not been reduced further. lack of acknowledgement for potential air quality concerns as a result of the ST9 proposal. Strain on parking and local infrastructure but also flooding and surface water drainage.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID843/LC/SS11/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Jayne Grainger

### Soundness

SID19/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Haxby and Wigginton infrastructure cannot cope , especially the roads, cannot cope with additional strain that will come from development of ST9. Goes into detail about road safety / junctions around Ralph Butterfield School and congestion on the outer ring road.	Graham and Pat Wilford
SID20/S/SS11/1		Sound	Believes the plan to be sound and well thought out so long as proposed measures in the policy SS11 are delivered i.e. A new school.	Roy Gibson
SID21/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Haxby infrastructure cannot cope with additional pressure. Specifically mentions congestion and road safety around local schools, lack of parking spaces, congestion on the outer ring road. Lack of facilities for young people. Strensall Barracks site is the only logical place for expansion,	Ray McDonogh

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID61/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	New primary school in policy but not included in ST1 or ST2	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID70/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	The road network combined with the railway crossings in the village already lead to unacceptable congestion around peak times. 735 new houses with 1-2 cars will continue to make that worse. Building on greenbelt is unacceptable it changes the feel of the village. The local amenities such as road surface and schools cannot cope with the increase. We have already seen Haxby and Wigginton merge into one village, this is going to now join up to strensall. There are many brown field sites in York that should be developed and also areas inside the ring road that would not encroach on the countryside. York is a special place and to encroach on the greenbelt ruins this.	Clare Abraham
SID71/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	I want to ride my bike round Haxby. The roads are already busy and this makes it worse. Getting to school is difficult as there is lots of traffic, more houses and more cars will make it worse.	Joseph Abraham
SID74/S/SS11(ST9)/1		Not Sound	The requirement and to some extent the scale of the proposal for housing is not a problem, it is the lack of any coherent information about infrastructure to support the new housing and the existing village both through the period of construction and once the population has increased that is worrying. Without clear indications of infrastructure intentions I do not believe this to be well or positively prepared	Andy Mulholland
SID80/S/SS11 (ST9)/1		Not Sound	The proposed allocation of land north of Haxby (ST9) for housing development ( up to 735 dwellings) does not take account of the wider infrastructure needs required to support increasing the housing numbers to this extent. In particular the capacity of the local road network is not sufficient to accommodate the large increase in the number of motor vehicles that will result if this land is developed on this scale and capacity. The links and queues from both Haxby andWigginton, both on to and from the York bypass, currently at peak periods are already beyond the capacity for the roads. The development of this land on this scale will make this situation intolerable and have a severely negative impact lives of both existing and new residents in Haxby and the surrounding areas. If this land is to be developed further consideration needs to be give to transport policies - including the need to upgrade and dual the York By pass.	Robert Gibson
SID82/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Yes houses need to be built but the currently plan has not been thought out properly. Haxby's infrastructure cannot cope with 700+ new homes. Roads and drainage infrastructure are inadequate now. Need to improve public transport, outer ring road and build rail station for Haxby.	Grant Cockburn

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID87/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Traffic implications of ST9 have not been fully considered. CYC need to consider adding a rail link from Haxby to York station (via the Scarborough line) and explore expanding the existing road layout to include a bus lane (Wigginton End) to ease traffic congestion by encouraging people onto public transport. Only once this has been considered should proposals for further development be put forward.	Craig Norris
SID93/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Many concerns about the sustainability of developing site ST9. Education - a new primary school would be essential. Accessibility - Moor Lane is already very busy, even during construction site traffic would be unsuited for what is a narrow 18th century road. Road safety implications for the pedestrians, agricultural traffic, horses and cyclists that use the lane at present. Transport - private car use will increase, current bus services to Haxby are good but a new bus route and dedicated cycle lanes will be required. Climate change - the site is frequently water-logged and acts as a flood sink for the north of Haxby. Biodiversity - the trees, mainly oak near Moor Lane, and hedges are mature and rich in species. Land Use - this is productive agricultural land, despite its wetness, loss to built environment is regrettable. Drainage - will be problematic as the water table in winter months is already high in Haxby and this land currently drains eventually through the back to the Foss.	Allan Harris
SID99/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Strensall with Towthorpe Parish Council has serious concerns about the allocation of ST9 as the sewage from this site is likely to be treated at Walbutts Sewage Treatment Plant which is unlikely to be able to accommodate this additional flow along with all sewage that will be generated by sites ST35, E18 and H59. Traffic generated by new residents will also exacerbate existing congestion problems in Strensall village. The site should either be removed from the plan or significantly reduced in size.	Strensall with Towthorpe PC - Fiona Hill
SID124/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Para. 8.75 of the NPPF states: 'Planning policies should protect and enhance public rights of way and access. Local authorities should seek opportunities to provide better facilities for users, for example by adding links to existing rights of way networks including National Trails'. Crooklands Lane, an unspoilt bridleway, is unique in Haxby and is a valued amenity for residents. It passes through the centre of the development at Land North of Haxby (ST9). When responding during the local plan consultations, residents have expressed their wish that this bridleway be conserved. Despite this and the government policy above, there is no mention of preserving Crooklands Lane in the key principles for ST9 in the 'City of York Local Plan – Publication Draft (February 2018)' - page 50.	Haxby And Wigginton Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Paul Firth
SID134/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Objects to housing as the existing infrastructure in Haxby is already not fit for purpose. Issues with drainage, roads (parking on usher land and A1237 regularly blocked), and lack of amenities.	Robert Perkin
SID135/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Issues with Traffic congestion, air quality and road safety, parking issues in village, flooding and drainage problems and lack of facilities.	S Perkin

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID139/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Need significant infrastructure improvements before development in Haxby. No development for other local areas with better access to major roads. Poppleton has a railway station and a park and ride system.	David Stuart
SID147/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Plan suggests that secondary access for ST9 to Usher Lane should be used, but this is a bad idea as the route is used for recreation by dog walkers, runners and cyclists. The infrastructure is strained to the limit.	Ann & Paul McLean
SID148/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	The roads in the area around Haxby and Wiggington already suffer greatly from congestion. It is not difficult to accurately model additional traffic burden from their developments, and come up with mitigation strategies. The A1237, the village of Haxby and all junctions with the A1237 are already atrocious throughout the day. The Plan could better deal with the specifics of these issues, rather than stating "all transport issues have been addressed". Feels reopening a "new station" in Haxby would be a way to avoid developers responsibilities in dealing with the road infrastructure and it should not be done.	Daniel Dickinson
SID157/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	AIR QUALITY. There is no mention of an Air Quality Impact Assessment in regards to Haxby. Many people and organisations have commented on it. Haxby already has problems with congestion. There will be an estimated 20% more cars on village roads. Section 12 of the plan states 'A detailed emissions assessment and/or a full air quality impact assessment are likely to be required for major planning applications that: generate or increase traffic congestion'. Consideration of air quality should be included in the principles and delivery of developments at Haxby. Haxby is already at capacity.	Janet White
SID174/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Most of the housing developments will not hit the triggers that require the developers to build new schools, doctors, transport links etc. This will negatively impact on all areas damaging quality of life.	Susan Turner
SID188/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Public transport is not given proper consideration neither is parking. The centre of Haxby is very congested.	Elaine Mephram
SID219/S/SS11 (ST9)/1		Not Sound	ST9 is within the Green Belt and the building of 735 houses is not "limited" affordable housing and will detract from the openness of the Green Belt.	Ian Colquhoun
SID234/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Settlement developed to the north of Haxby cannot be effective because of the lack of sustainable connectivity.	Mary Crawford
SID234/S/SS11/2		Not Sound	The development of this site compromises the historical characteristics of the landscape	Mary Crawford
SID237/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	The draft for ST9 has not recognised the significance of ST9 as a heritage asset. Additionally construction would spoil the Crooklands Lane bridleway.	Janet White



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID237/S/SS11/2		Not Sound	Construction at the ST9 site would create congestion on local roads (Moor Lane, Usher Lane and trouble for residents getting onto the A1237). This "rat race" is a danger to the safety of children.	Janet White
SID239/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Surface water draining on the site and in the surrounding area is already very poor. Sewers are overflowing and further construction is likely to worsen the situation	Terence John (Terry) Crawford
SID239/S/SS11/2		Not Sound	The site has valuable landscape that would likely be destroyed during the construction process	Terence John (Terry) Crawford
SID243/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	A sustainable transport infrastructure to support these developments would, at a minimum, involve grade separated junctions on the overloaded A1237, and without significant government or regional funding this will never be economically viable. In addition, most of the traffic associated with Site ST9 will travel into and out of Haxby and Wigginton along already overloaded and unsuitable roads, i.e. Usher Lane, Moor Lane, York Road and Mill Lane.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID243/S/SS11/2		Not Sound	The 2016 Strategic Housing Market Assessment identifies an appropriate level of affordable housing as 522 houses p.a. from total of 841 houses being built p.a. The Local Plan (table 5.4) sets out targets only that do not exceed 30% in any areas. This falls significantly short of the identified need.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID243/S/SS11/3		Not Sound	Current residents' experience shows that the sewerage arrangements are not fit for purpose. Newly built houses built to the highest council specification still have sewage lapping at their door following heavy rain. It has been acknowledged the system is overloaded: Yorkshire Water is aware of this problem and referred to the problems in the Haxby system at a meeting of Haxby Town Council in November 2013.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID243/S/SS11/4		Not Sound	The recognition of the importance of the preservation of medieval strips/ridge and furrow and ancient hedges, as well as the presence of older archaeological remains is identified in the Appraisal Stage Document. However, a serious omission is Crooklands Lane, a Green Lane unique in this area, which runs through the centre of the development. How can medieval field systems be preserved in the face of development/use of open space for recreation? How can the character, identity and biodiversity of Crooklands Lane and the established medieval hedgerows be preserved once the developers' heavy plant moves in?	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID243/S/SS11/5		Not Sound	735 houses will generate a substantial number of children. Assurances are given that school places will be provided. As all schools locally are full and with the current pressure for school places as the bulge in the population moves on to secondary school, should school provision not be provided on site when the houses are first built, this will necessitate unsustainable travel for the new residents.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID243/S/SS11/6		Not Sound	The plan does not demonstrate consultation with Humber, Vale & Coast Clinical Commissioning Group. Current primary care medical provision in Haxby and Wigginton is at breaking point because of the increasing demands from an ageing population.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID250/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Transport - In relation to the proposed housing development on Site ST9 and the other proposed developments along the A1237 ring road corridor, the plan is unsound because it is based on the delivery of a sustainable transport infrastructure. A sustainable transport infrastructure to support these developments would, at a minimum, involve grade separated junctions on the overloaded A1237, and without significant government or regional funding this will never be economically viable.	Michael Harrison
SID264/S/SS11/1		Sound	It is considered that policy H1, insofar as it includes the housing allocation known as ST9, is sound as the allocation will boost the supply of housing consistent with national policy. The Developers have suggested a couple minor amendments to the text of the policy which would improve the interpretation of the policy and reflect good practice	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land, Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID264/S/SS11/2			The development density for Haxby and Wigginton is identified as 40 dwellings per hectare. Given the character and form of Haxby and Wigginton it is considered that such a density of development could be harmful. A development density of 40 dwellings per hectare is more characteristic of high density urban living rather than an extension to sustainable villages	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land, Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID265/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	The site fails because of the totally inadequate connectivity of the road network.	Honary Alderman Richard Watson
SID275/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	The Plan fails to offer the guarantees that the infrastructure will be in place before the development starts. The Council Plan offers the guarantee of a 'green' buffer zone. As I understand the developers wish to remove this. Also HV Power lines run through this site - the National Grid forbids any development adjacent or below these lines.	Paul Tutill
SID276/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	The development ST9 cannot be justified as the resulting traffic would have a detrimental effect on the lives of residents in Haxby/Wigginton - causing gridlock and access to services issues. The existing road system cannot be upgraded to cope with additional traffic.	Catherine Bowes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID277/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Haxby has seen massive growth with original ponds ditches and marshland now built over causing the water table to be very high. There are problems with flooding and sewage, there is a shortage of open space, schools and medical services with huge traffic problems. More houses = more problems, more pollution.	William Grainger
SID279/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	ST9 built on flooded marshland, already overcrowded and there will not be enough area space for infrastructure.	Christine Daker
SID281/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Housing would be built on marshes and therefore there is a risk of worse flooding in the area.	Daniel Grainger
SID281/S/SS11/2			Haxby doesn't have enough green spaces.	Daniel Grainger
SID281/S/SS11/3			No parking spaces available locally.	Daniel Grainger
SID281/S/SS11/4			The town centre is full to capacity inc. The schools.	Daniel Grainger
SID300/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Little planning has taken place on the impact of 750 extra cars on the immediate local area.	Peter Bainbridge
SID318/S/SS11/1			Considers SS11 clauses vi and vii to be UNSOUND in respect of disposal of foul waste. Concerns about effect of additional traffic.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID327/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	No access to the ring road. This will have a significant impact of the infrastructure in the local village.	Lt Col Gyle Jones MBE
SID327/S/SS11/2			Haxby is already over-developed with schools working to capacity and a health centre which presently struggles to provide a satisfactory service to the existing residents of both Haxby and Wigginton.	Lt Col Gyle Jones MBE
SID327/S/SS11/3			Added to these problems, the existing Sewage System is totally inadequate in Haxby.	Lt Col Gyle Jones MBE
SID328/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	The infrastructure of the village is already stretched to breaking point and the increased housing will only increase the strain.	Diana Jones

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID328/S/SS11/2			The new buildings will bring more cars which will add to the congestion.	Diana Jones
SID328/S/SS11/3			Drainage is already poor and there is frequent flooding of residents' gardens.	Diana Jones
SID332/S/SS11/1			Extension to Haxby is unacceptable as settlement is already over developed with inadequate infrastructure and access to services.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe
SID336/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Local Plan for development of 735 new homes North of Haxby ignores all (1-15) points of Sustainability Objectives.	Christine McKenna
SID336/S/SS11/2			This the aim being to develop Brownfield sites the need to build on Greenbelt land is unjustified.	Christine McKenna
SID346/S/SS11/1			The Local Plan is not justified as the level of additional homes planned are way too many for expected future needs. I do not see masses of homeless people roaming the streets and even if these homes are built who is going to be able to afford them? All through the previous stages of consultation concerns have repeatedly been raised regarding the impact of such development on existing drainage, congestion, pollution, schools, property values, existing residents quality of life, safety and loss of green belt. This latest revised Plan still does not address these concerns. It is as if the developers just want to get on and build and they will try to address some issues but will only pay lip service to the loose reference to the important concerns that have been repeatedly raised.	Chris Slade
SID374/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	These developments between them risk adding significantly to vehicular traffic and congestion on York's road network. None of them adheres fully even to the design principles for new developments specified in Policy T1; Policies SS11, 19 and 21 make no reference at all to public transport provision. The others propose a target of 15% of journeys by public transport; no evidence is offered to justify that target; nor is any target offered for walking and cycling. As we have noted elsewhere, the design principles in Policy T1 are necessary but not sufficient. Three of the sites, under Policies SS12, 13 and 22, propose direct links to the outer ring road. There is ample evidence that such provision promotes the development of dormitory villages for commuters to remote employment areas,	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID386/S/SS11(ST9)/1		Not Sound	The area has already suffered massive development and can take no more. Any new development of this scale should be away from existing suburbs and from York itself, with its own new roads, sewers, shops, schools and medical centre. Object on the grounds of impact of traffic on local roads and the B1363 & A1237, road safety, parking, impact of construction traffic, overloaded sewage system, high water table in the area, lack of doctor facilities, school facilities, lack of green spaces. Additionally, even a new station at Haxby wouldn't reduce congestion significantly.	Alison Scott

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID401/S/SS11/1			Sustainability Statement shows site being delivered beyond plan period. Draft Pub. LP show site being delivered within plan period. Unclear why alteration has been made.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID417/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	It appears that the proposal to construct an additional 735 dwellings for Haxby & Wigginton Ward at site ST9 (see policy SS11, pp 49-51) is likely to create more problems in terms of providing new/upgraded infrastructure of all kinds, addressing traffic access problems at two key junctions, and the birth of a secondary 'small' new village at some distance from the existing main thoroughfare in Haxby (Station Road/The Village/Mill Lane)Perversely, the intuitively 'obvious' solution of siting this development to the north of Haxby and away from York's urban core seems likely to lead to more problems with traffic and air quality because of the need to dissipate trips originating in/ending at ST9 either through Haxby or through Wigginton. I hope, therefore, that the proposal for development at this site will be examined both carefully and thoroughly	Cllr Ian Cuthbertson
SID604/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID833/S/SS11/1			The concept of extending Haxby outwards rather than inwards in accordance with NPPF policy is unsound as it varies the quantum of the York green belt it should also have been promoted on the basis of exceptional circumstances. In the case of proposed allocations ST9 this could be avoided by a more relaxed inner boundary andthat would be a more sustainable pattern of development.	George E Wright Combined
SID840/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Air quality has frequently been rased as an issue by individual residents and organisations yet the need for an Air Quality Impact Assessment is still missing from the Local Plan.	Wendy Stewart
SID840/S/SS11/2			If/when development goes ahead it will be over a period of time which will gradually stretch resources, which are at present working to full capacity.	Wendy Stewart
SID843/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Existing houses in Haxby have been built over existing ponds, ditches and marshland. Therefore the water table s high and any new builds will only exaggerate the existing problems.	Jayne Grainger
SID843/S/SS11/2			Haxby and Wigginton haven't got enough green spaces or schools and the medical centre is at full capacity.	Jayne Grainger

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID843/S/SS11/3			Traffic congestion is already bad and the building of ST9 will only increase congestion and pollution for existing residents.	Jayne Grainger
SID61/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	New primary school in policy but not included in ST1 or ST2	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID19/Mod/SS11/1			ST9 should be removed from the plan.	Graham and Pat Wilford
SID69/S/SS11/1			Remove ST9 from the plan.	Barry Abraham
SID70/MOD/SS11/1			Do not build on ST9	Clare Abraham
SID71/MOD/SS11/1			Don't build ST9	Joseph Abraham
SID74/MOD/SS11(ST9)/1			By showing residents where access road will go, predicted traffic flows in the new and older parts of Haxby and Wigginton and the effects on the ring road. By guaranteeing levels of services needed in the future with a higher population before this becomes a problem, including drainage, schools, doctor and dentist availability, library, bus or train connections, elderly care and many others.	Andy Mulholland
SID80/Mod/SS11 (ST9)/1			Modifications should be based on the implications of the following issues: The proposed allocation of land north of Haxby (ST9) for housing development ( up to 735 dwellings) does not take account of the wider infrastructure needs required to support increasing the housing numbers to this extent. In particular the capacity of the local road network is not sufficient to accommodate the large increase in the number of motor vehicles that will result if this land is developed on this scale and capacity. The links and queues from both Haxby andWigginton, both on to and from the York bypass, currently at peak periods are already beyond the capacity for the roads. The development of this land on this scale will make this situation intolerable and have a severely negative impact lives of both existing and new residents in Haxby and the surrounding areas. If this land is to be developed further consideration needs to be give to transport policies - including the need to upgrade and dual the York By pass.	Robert Gibson
SID82/Mod/SS11/1			Do not overwhelm Haxby with the scale of development currently proposed, roads and drains cannot cope.	Grant Cockburn
SID89/Mod/SS11/1			Review transport and infrastructure arrangements for the proposed ST9 development to include sustainable and effective solutions to the current and proposed traffic volumes to the north of the city.	Craig Norris

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID93/Mod/SS11/1			Further work required on the following. Traffic - Moor Lane needs a dedicated assessment. Infrastructure - especially drainage, loss of environmentally important trees, hedges and agricultural land needs to be considered. Site access - this will be through an already busy village that struggles for parking as it is, access will be through residential areas and narrow country lanes.	Allan Harris
SID124/Mod/SS11/1			We suggest that within Policy SS11, sub paragraph xi that an addition line(s) are added to include a reference to the special status of Crooklands Lane and the immediate area. That where possible it is protected from development.	Haxby And Wigginton Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Paul Firth
SID134/Mod/SS11/1			Objects to housing as the existing infrastructure in Haxby is already not fit for purpose. Issues with drainage, roads (parking on usher land and A1237 regularly blocked), and lack of amenities.	Robert Perkin
SID135/Mod/SS11/1			Objects to development as Issues with Traffic congestion, air quality and road safety, parking issues in village, flooding and drainage problems and lack of facilities.	S Perkin
SID139/Mod/SS11/1			Haxby rail station should be reopened. The A237 should be duelled. Drainage infrastructure in Haxby should be improved. Another pedestrian crossing should be installed in the village. Additional schools be put in place.	David Stuart
SID147/Mod/SS11(S T9)/1			Plan suggests that secondary access for ST9 to Usher Lane should be used, but this is a bad idea as the route is used for recreation by dog walkers, runners and cyclists. The infrastructure is strained to the limit. Plan does not ensure that brown field sites are used before green belt land. A1237 is overloaded and a bottleneck, the changes to roundabouts have not improved the situation much. Road needs to be duelled first.	Ann & Paul McLean
SID169/Mod/SS11/1			ST9 is inappropriate for development and should be removed from the plan for the following reasons - insufficient drainage facilities, lack of school places, road infrastructure is at capacity and often congested, doctors surgery is at capacity.	Ellen Walton
SID174/Mod/SS11/1			Developments must meet guidelines both for annual build of houses and affordable homes. As no extra employment is planned for Haxby and Wigginton people living in these houses will need to travel for employment. Rep goes into detail on congestion issues around Haxby and on outer ring road, concludes by saying infrastructure must be built BEFORE any further housing is built. Currently drainage and sewage infrastructure is inadequate. Waste from new developments MUST NOT just feed into the existing network of drains as it will exacerbate the problem. Housing developments must trigger the requirement for new schools, medical centres and transport links. Homes must be made as carbon neutral as possible.	Susan Turner

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID188/Mod/SS11/1			Rethinking of exits on to local road. The size of the proposal should be reduced as the local infrastructure cannot cope with what has been built already.I feel strongly that previous submissions SHOULD have had their responses taken into consideration.	Elaine Mepham
SID214/Mod/SS11(S T9)/1			The site at Landing Lane could also provide car parking for the proposed rail station at Haxby.	ONeill Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID219/Mod/SS11 (ST9)/1			Relocate the 735 houses among the proposed brand new garden villages and provide local employment opportunities and transport for the garden villages instead of bolting the extra housing onto an existing overstretched community.	Ian Colquhoun
SID234/Mod/SS11/1			Build roads either to the west or east of the new settlement: ensure alternative access as suggested in Policy SS11 Paragraph ix.	Mary Crawford
SID234/Mod/SS11/2			Consider building elsewhere where the environment is not so sensitive and of such a historic nature.	Mary Crawford
SID237/Mod/SS11/1			Investigate the medieval and Roman archeology of ST9 to ascertain if it is a significant heritage asset and retain Crooklands Lane as an unspoilt bridleway	Janet White
SID237/Mod/SS11/2			Further assessment of ST9 as a suitable site with careful consideration on the danger of increased car pollution and traffic to the safety of children from local schools	Janet White
SID239/Mod/SS11/1			All required modifications to current surface water drainage and sewerage, and any enhanced or new sewage treatment facilities, should be completed before ANY development starts at ST9.	Terence John (Terry) Crawford
SID239/Mod/SS11/2			Do not proceed with development of ST9 and develop other sites that do not have such important and valuable historical and archaeological features.	Terence John (Terry) Crawford
SID243/Mod/SS11/1			To make the plan sound, the development of Site ST9 should be deferred until the improvements to the A1237 have been completed.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID243/Mod/SS11/1			To make the plan sound, these housing developments should be deferred until the improvements to the A1237 have been completed. Alternatively, the additional housing should be located on sites with access to the dual carriageway A64 bypass, which has the capacity to cope with increased traffic volumes.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID243/Mod/SS11/2			Firm commitment to require developers to include in excess of 30% affordable housing in all areas.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID243/Mod/SS11/3			To make the plan sound, development should not take place before the current problems with sewerage and drainage have been resolved by Yorkshire Water.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID243/Mod/SS11/4			Consider building elsewhere where the environment is not so sensitive and of such a historic nature.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID243/Mod/SS11/5			Government backed support for school provision when this is beyond the powers of York City Council must be guaranteed at the time development commences.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID243/Mod/SS11/6			Government backed support for premises/staffing when this is beyond the power of York City Council must be guaranteed at the time development commences.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID250/Mod/SS11/1			To make the plan sound, these housing developments should be deferred until the improvements to the A1237 have been completed. Alternatively, the additional housing should be located on sites with access to the dual carriageway A64 bypass, which has the capacity to cope with increased traffic volumes.	Michael Harrison
SID265/Mod/SS11/1			Remove site ST9 and allocate the houses to site ST14.	Honary Alderman Richard Watson
SID275/Mod/SS11/1			Cast iron guarantees must be written into any development which must include updating of existing road systems and services, with a guarantee of a green buffer zone. No illegal development beneath the pylons on health grounds	Paul Tutill
SID276/Mod/SS11/1			Site ST9 should be removed from the Plan.	Catherine Bowes
SID277/Mod/SS11/1			To ease congestion in Haxby/Wigginton the A1237 needs to be dual carriageway with flyovers.	William Grainger
SID279/Mod/SS11/1			Ease the congestion via new flyovers/dual carriageway.	Christine Daker
SID281/Mod/SS11/1			To ease congestion the A1237 needs to be upgraded to a dual carriageway with flyovers.	Daniel Grainger

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID327/Mod/SS11/2			Development to the north of the City will have massive implications to traffic congestion. Some of these developments should be replaced to the south of the city.	Lt Col Gyle Jones MBE
SID327/Mod/SS11/1			ST9 should be remoded from the plan and another area with direct access to the ring road established.	Lt Col Gyle Jones MBE
SID328/Mod/SS11/1			Another area closer to the ringroad, with direct access, should be considered and the ST9 area should be removed from development plans.	Diana Jones
SID336/Mod/SS11/1			There needs to be a large reduction in the number of dwellings proposed in order to comply with both Brindtland Commission 1987 and European Directive 2001/42/EC. The Plan at present risks serious detrimental environmental effects of Local Communities. Development of Brownfield sites FIRST.	Christine McKenna
SID346/Mod/SS11/1			Previously raised concerns regarding the effect of the development (SS11) on drainage, congestion, pollution, schools, property values, existing residents quality of life, safety and loss of green belt land must be robustly responded to. Policy SS11 ref: item vii states 'connect the site to the public sewer network which will incur additional costs. Developers will need to work with Yorkshire Water in developing a suitable scheme' - A clear and detailed explanation of how this will actually be achieved must be provided. Item iv. states 'provide highway access to the site from Moor Lane on the West side with secondary access from Usher lane on the East Side....Alternative access should also be explored in relation to this site'Again a clear and detailed explanation of how this will actually be achieved must be provided.	Chris Slade
SID364/Mod/SS11/1			Extended current Haxby bus service.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/SS11/1			Extended current Haxby bus service.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/MOD/SS11/1			The policy must be based on the full set of design principles for promoting sustainable travel, and include a much more challenging target for the proportion of journeys by sustainable modes. Policy SS11 should commit to extending the current bus service to the site, the construction of Haxby station and the provision of a high frequency service there, and minimise the need for additional vehicular traffic through Haxby village.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID386/MOD/SS11(S			Delete allocation.	Alison Scott

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID843/Mod/SS11/1			To ease the heavily congested area of Haxby and Wigginton the A1237 needs to be a dual carriageway and flyovers at Haxby level crossing and Wigginton Road so traffic flow is improved.	Jayne Grainger

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID199/LC/SS12/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	CYC has failed to apply its own site selection methodology correctly.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison
SID621/LC/SS12/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support allocation of site.	Paul Butler OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes and TW Fields

#### Soundness

SID8/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Unsound as the plan does not address traffic congestion to the north of York and on the northern section of the outer ring-road. Notes that Hambleton District Council has plans for significant developments north of York that will add to congestion above and beyond that planned for in York's Local Plan. Development of ST14 assumes significant improvements to the A1237 will be made, traffic flow needs to improve massively between the A59 and Monks Cross. Needs to be a dual-carriageway with grade-separation. All of this additional congestion will do significant damage to businesses in and around York.	Joseph Watt
SID19/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Instead of further development around Haxby and Wigginton the number of dwellings at ST14 should be increased to form a proper garden village.	Graham and Pat Wilford
SID51/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Consider increasing the size of SS12 (ST14) This site is close to existing infrastructure and not close to wildlife sites. A rail link could be possible. Close to retail park.	Richard Bramley
SID61/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Traffic issues considered in policy but not in sugar beet/ civil service grounds.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID81/S/SS12 (ST14)/1		Not Sound	Skelton Village Action Group support the inclusion of all brownfield sites and brownfield first. Disappointed that Green Belt sites are allocated. Strongly object to ST14 and the use of 55 hectares of prime agricultural land. It is completely unacceptable for the Council to adopt the ambitious landowner pushed sites and the developer led solution to favour Green Belt development simply because it is easier, cheaper and quicker to achieve than brownfield development. High risks of total gridlock on the A1237, the damage caused to business by congested transport links and the improbability of effective road infrastructure being funded, it is considered that strategic Green Belt sites, ST14 in particular, should be removed from the North of the A1237, in the Local Plan.	Skelton Village Action Group
SID103/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	YCT does not wish to comment in detail on the nature and extent of the spatial allocations, since we believe that the overall policy advantages of achieving an adopted plan are so very great for the common good. We therefore support the spatial strategy components of the Local Plan. Although we support the document and urge that it be approved in its entirety, we have a reservation to bring to the attention of the Council (which is elaborated in our observations elsewhere of Transport and Communications). In their current form two sites, ST14 and ST15, may not comply with paragraph 17 of the NPPF which establishes the ambitions for 'sustainable development' as anywhere that 'makes fullest possible use of public transport, walking and cycling and focus significant development in locations which are or can be sustainable'. ST14 ) is only sound if it is subject to sustainable transport links being provided to shopping and employment services and bus service terminus. York Civic Trust is concerned that the A1237 Outer Ring Road will separate this site from such services and that infrastructure requirements connecting the two are not sufficiently positively prepared.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID118/S/SS12/1		Sound	Sound with exception of criterion vi. Subject to the change in relation to transport, we support the principle of accommodating a proportion of the City's development needs in a new settlement of this size in this location. There is considerable merit in the potential offered by this new settlement. Historic England would oppose any increase in the size of this settlement over and above that currently proposed because of the harm that this would cause to numerous elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS12/1		Sound	Sound with exception of criterion vi. Subject to the change in relation to transport, we support the principle of accommodating a proportion of the City's development needs in a new settlement of this size in this location. There is considerable merit in the potential offered by this new settlement. Historic England would oppose any increase in the size of this settlement over and above that currently proposed because of the harm that this would cause to numerous elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS12/2		Not Sound	It is essential that the infrastructure necessary to deliver this scale of development in this location can be achieved in a manner which does not harm other elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York. This needs to be better reflected within this Criterion	Historic England - Ian Smith

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/S/SS12/2		Not Sound	It is essential that the infrastructure necessary to deliver this scale of development in this location can be achieved in a manner which does not harm other elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York. This needs to be better reflected within this Criterion	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID139/S/SS12/2		Not Sound	This proposal will have an adverse effect on residents of Haxby and Wigginton by extending travel times to and from Clifton moor centre, Poppleton, Harrogate, the Dales and Leeds due to all the extra traffic which will be generated by this large development onto the B1363.	David Stuart
SID148/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	The Plan does not include sufficiently strict criteria on the infrastructure requirements, in particular on schooling and road infrastructure. A development of nearly 800 new builds, even in stages, will add hundreds of new primary agechildren to the area. However the Plan then includes deliberate vagueness as to what developers can do to deal with that obvious issue. There is a naïve certainty in the sentence “expansion would be possible with the required financial contributions”. The vagueness here in the Plan clearly allows developers to move a long way down their plans before even considering funding an additional primary school as part of the development. Existinglocal schools will become over-crowded before a new school is started.	Daniel Dickinson
SID174/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Most of the housing developments will not hit the triggers that require the developers to build new schools, doctors, transport links etc. This will negatively impact on all areas damaging quality of life.	Susan Turner
SID199/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	ST14: failure of council to undertake proper assesment of sustainability of sites. Issues with sustainability of ST14. Inconsistencies in the Publication Local Plan and accompanying Sustainability Appraisal. Green Belt Issues, Transport matters. landscape and visual impact. Heritage. Ecology. Viability. Drainage and flood risk.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison
SID199/S/SS12/3			The Main Representations Report, which provides a full assessment of matters and issues, relates specifically to the allocation of ST14 and associated Policy SS12.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison
SID210/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	In order to address the conflicts identified and ensure that the Local Plan is sound, it is considered that City of York Council should: 1 Allocate additional land to meet the housing needs of the community and these sites should be able to deliver early in the plan period. This is the only approach that will deliver a ‘sound’ plan and enable the much needed investment in new housing to meet the community's needs. The identification of a portfolio of small site allocations (e.g. up to 250 dwellings) around existing settlements and the main urban area would assist in meetingany shortfall created by the delay in large sites delivering dwellings early in the plan period.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID265/S/SS12/1			The site is far too small and should be created with 'garden' principles in mind. To enlarge the site it should accomodate ST9.	Honary Alderman Richard Watson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID274/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	The Plan is not sound, is not fit for purpose, is not consistent with achieving sustainable development and does not show good judgement. ST14 is infill development and rural urbanisation. It is not a Garden Village, it is overflow. The Plan must pursue brownfield sites as a priority. It is extremely concerning that recent in-depth traffic modelling STILL appears to be unavailable. With no definite plans for dualling the northern ring road the proposed developments to the north cannot be included in the Plan. The Plan admits in Policy SS12 that the location of ST14 is the most congested part of the northern ring road Although Policy T4 proposes improvements to the A1237 over three timescales this will be too little too late if the development of ST14 is given the go ahead. Local roads will also be impacted.	The Dransfield Family
SID325/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	The proposed residential site is a significant intrusion into the green space and prime agricultural land separating Skelton and Wigginton.	Skelton Village Trust - Phillip Butler
SID332/S/SS12/1			No sense a sustainable settlement due to employment, transport and social provision issues.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe
SID335/S/SS12(ST14)/1		Not Sound	Plan is not sound because it is not properly prepared or justified because it is not an objective assessment of where new housing areas should be located in so far as ST14 is concerned. Also, the infrastructure works required for highways, A1237 in particular for ST14 and other sites are not deliverable over the Plan period. It is not consistent with NPPF - re: Green Belt, and is in conflict with the draft Local Plan primarily and other purposes of the Green Belt. ST14 contributes to several purposes of the Green Belt. To remove ST14 from the Green Belt undermines those purposes , in particular its necessary connectivity with the A1237, together with the infrastructure works and enhancement of the capacity of the A1237. In the vicinity of ST14, the A1237 will require substantial infrastructure, inc cycleways and public transport to meet the demands required. A new garden village at ST14 will cause congestion in both directions on the A1237 and well beyond the A19 and B1363 roundabouts. ST14 is not a good location for a new garden village.	Lionel Lennox
SID374/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	These developments between them risk adding significantly to vehicular traffic and congestion on York's road network. None of them adheres fully even to the design principles for new developments specified in Policy T1; Policies SS11, 19 and 21 make no reference at all to public transport provision. The others propose a target of 15% of journeys by public transport; no evidence is offered to justify that target; nor is any target offered for walking and cycling. As we have noted elsewhere, the design principles in Policy T1 are necessary but not sufficient. Three of the sites, under Policies SS12, 13 and 22, propose direct links to the outer ring road. There is ample evidence that such provision promotes the development of dormitory villages for commuters to remote employment areas,	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID386/S/SS12(ST14)/1		Not Sound	The area has already suffered massive development and can take no more. Any new development of this scale should be away from existing suburbs and from York itself, with its own new roads, sewers, shops, schools and medical centre. Object on the grounds of impact of traffic on local roads and the B1363 & A1237, road safety, parking, impact of construction traffic, overloaded sewage system, high water table in the area, lack of doctor facilities, school facilities, lack of green spaces. Additionally, even a new station at Haxby wouldn't reduce congestion significantly.	Alison Scott
SID390/S/SS12(ST14)/1		Not Sound	Most young people from Wigginton attend Joseph Rowntree School and use the local bus services that are supplemented by duplicate buses. The addition of significant amounts of new housing will mean that additional resources will need to be provided support the home to school journeys in this area, either by separate provision or even more duplicate buses on the local bus network. This would be the case whichever school these young people attend. ST14 is probably not big enough to support new commercial bus services and would need to be linked to current routes - part of services linking the greater Wigginton area to York, or extending services from Clifton Moor.	Confederation of Passenger Transport UK (Andrew McGuinness) OBO York Quality Bus Partnership
SID406/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Sustainable transport provision for this site are inadequate and plan fails to meet environmental policy objectives. A1237 already one of most congested parts of outer ring road. 1,200 dwellings on site will increase congestion without sustainable transport. Plan fails to provide specific targets for non-car journeys. SS12 measures to promote public transport has been watered down since previous version of the plan and needs to be stronger.	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)
SID598/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Not objecting to the principle of the allocation but we do consider the estimated yield from ST14 to be overly ambitious so as to call into question the ability of the Local Plan to deliver houses to meet the housing requirement. As such we consider the yield assumed for ST14 to be unsound in that ST14 will not deliver the housing units identified in the plan period. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST14 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Not objecting to the principle of the allocation but we do consider the estimated yield from ST14 to be overly ambitious so as to call into question the ability of the Local Plan to deliver houses to meet the housing requirement. As such we consider the yield assumed for ST14 to be unsound in that ST14 will not deliver the housing units identified in the plan period. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST14 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Not objecting to the principle of the allocation but we do consider the estimated yield from ST14 to be overly ambitious so as to call into question the ability of the Local Plan to deliver houses to meet the housing requirement. As such we consider the yield assumed for ST14 to be unsound in that ST14 will not deliver the housing units identified in the plan period. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST14 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID602/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Not objecting to the principle of the allocation but we do consider the estimated yield from ST14 to be overly ambitious so as to call into question the ability of the Local Plan to deliver houses to meet the housing requirement. As such we consider the yield assumed for ST14 to be unsound in that ST14 will not deliver the housing units identified in the plan period. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST14 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID604/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Whilst the Sustainability Appraisal considers the selected sites against each other it fails to reassess them against alternatives such as the dismissed urban extensions. This renders the plan unsound and that urban extensions in sustainable locations, such as the Land at North Field, should be reintroduced to help make up the expected delivery shortfalls against OAN noted throughout these representations and to increase flexibility and broaden choice.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID609/S/SS12/1			The arbitrary reduction in the size of the north of Clifton Moor site (ST14) should also be rejected and the larger previously proposed site reinstated to ensure it is sufficient to fund a full range of community facilities	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID621/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Whilst the site can deliver 1,348 homes within the plan period within CYC's current site red line site allocation boundary, it is our view that the current boundary should be expanded in order to enhance the community and green infrastructure that the site can deliver in respect of the policy aspirations required by Policy SS12 of the Publication Draft Local Plan.	Paul Butler OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes and TW Fields
SID621/S/SS12/2		Not Sound	Whilst support the allocation in principle, allocation boundary needs to be expanded in order to deliver a minimum of 1,350 homes at the site	Paul Butler OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes and TW Fields
SID833/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Intermediate and isolated growth areas such as at ST14 and ST 7 appears to be entirely inappropriate, without precedent, and without justification. They are contrary to NPPF policy.	George E Wright Combined
SID61/S/SS12/1		Not Sound	Traffic issues considered in policy but not in sugar beet/ civil service grounds.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

**Proposed Modification**

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID8/Mod/SS12/1			Remove ST14 from the plan and any other sites to the north of York until upgrading of the outer ring road to a dual carriageway with grade separation is guaranteed.	Joseph Watt
SID81/Mod/SS12 (ST14) /1			To make the Plan 'Sound', ST14 must be removed from the Local Plan and the housing numbers on the other sites feeding the Northern Ring Road must be reduced. The reduction in new houses to the north of York should be offset by increasing the housing numbers on the sites that will be served by the A64 southern ring road - site ST15 in particular. The A64 is already a dual carriageway with grade-separation junctions. Therefore it can accommodate the increased vehicle movements caused by the increased housing it would serve. Moreover, plans to 'Dual' the A64 beyond York, towards Scarborough, are well advanced and have political support.	Skelton Village Action Group
SID103/Mod/SS12/1			York Civic Trust believes that all of York's proposed residential developments in the green belt should have access to a range of services and be well connected by transport. The local plan should account for such connections. For the (Land West of) Wigginton Road site (SS12 / ST14), this might be resolved through the provision of an overbridge for a direct footpath and cycleway to Clifton Moor and a busway constructed between the new housing and the Clifton moor junction on the A1237 Outer Ring Road.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID118/MOD/SS12/1			It is essential that the infrastructure necessary to deliver this scale of development in this location can be achieved in a manner which does not harm other elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York. This needs to be better reflected within this Criterion. Policy SS12 – Site ST14 (Land West of Wigginton Road), Criterion vi amend to read:- "".. proposals map). The design and layout of the road should minimise the impact upon the openness of the Green Belt and demonstrate how it would safeguard those elements which contribute to the special character and setting of the historic City”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/SS12/1			It is essential that the infrastructure necessary to deliver this scale of development in this location can be achieved in a manner which does not harm other elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York. This needs to be better reflected within this Criterion. Policy SS12 – Site ST14 (Land West of Wigginton Road), Criterion vi amend to read:- "".. proposals map). The design and layout of the road should minimise the impact upon the openness of the Green Belt and demonstrate how it would safeguard those elements which contribute to the special character and setting of the historic City”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID174/Mod/SS12/1			Developments must meet guidelines both for annual build of houses and affordable homes. As no extra employment is planned for Haxby and Wigginton people living in these houses will need to travel for employment. Rep goes into detail on congestion issues around Haxby and on outer ring road, concludes by saying infrastructure must be built BEFORE any further housing is built. Currently drainage and sewage infrastructure is inadequate. Waste from new developments MUST NOT just feed into the existing network of drains as it will exacerbate the problem. Housing developments must trigger the requirement for new schools, medical centres and transport links. Homes must be made as carbon neutral as possible.	Susan Turner

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID210/Mod/SS12/1			In order to address the conflicts identified and ensure that the Local Plan is sound, it is considered that City of York Council should: 1 Allocate additional land to meet the housing needs of the community and these sites should be able to deliver early in the plan period. This is the only approach that will deliver a 'sound' plan and enable the much needed investment in new housing to meet the community's needs. The identification of a portfolio of small site allocations (e.g. up to 250 dwellings) around existing settlements and the main urban area would assist in meeting any shortfall created by the delay in large sites delivering dwellings early in the plan period.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID265/Mod/SS12/1			Increase the size of ST14 to make it a viable 'garden' village with adequate connectivity to the A1237 and a park and ride to the south of the A1237.	Honary Alderman Richard Watson
SID274/Mod/SS12/1			ST14 must be removed from the Plan	The Dransfield Family
SID335/MOD/SS12(S			Remove ST14 from the Local Plan and keep it in the Green Belt.	Lionel Lennox
SID364/Mod/SS12/1			New access routes directly to the regional road network should not be provided. Omit link to A1237 and focus on new Clifton Moor Park and Ride Site.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/SS12/1			New access routes directly to the regional road network should not be provided. Omit link to A1237 and focus on new Clifton Moor Park and Ride Site.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID369/Mod/SS12 (ST14)/1		Not Sound	Significant fall in housing numbers from previous consultations is welcomed however the impact of this proposal on the A1237 is of concern as this site will still significantly impact our already pressured transport network.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID374/MOD/SS12/1			The policy must be based on the full set of design principles for promoting sustainable travel, and include a much more challenging target for the proportion of journeys by sustainable modes. Policy SS12 should omit the reference to provision of a direct link to the A1237 and instead focus on providing a new Clifton Moor park and ride site adjacent to the development, with high quality frequent bus services through Clifton Moor to the site using a grade separated crossing of the A1237	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID386/MOD/SS12(S			Delete allocation	Alison Scott
SID406/Mod/SS12/1			Insert new point 'vi' (new transport plan). Amend point 'viii' (upgrades to outer ring road) . Insert new point 'x' (use of light rail).	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID598/Mod/SS12/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST14 should be reduced to 900 units. We consider that this number of units is more realistic and achievable. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/Mod/SS12/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST14 should be reduced to 900 units. We consider that this number of units is more realistic and achievable. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/Mod/SS12/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST14 should be reduced to 900 units. We consider that this number of units is more realistic and achievable. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/Mod/SS12/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST14 should be reduced to 900 units. We consider that this number of units is more realistic and achievable. (Further detail provided in rep.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID604/Mod/SS12/1			Whilst the Sustainability Appraisal considers the selected sites against each other it fails to reassess them against alternatives such as the dismissed urban extensions. This renders the plan unsound and that urban extensions in sustainable locations, such as the Land at North Field, should be reintroduced to help make up the expected delivery shortfalls against OAN noted throughout these representations and to increase flexibility and broaden choice.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID621/Mod/SS12/1		Not Sound	Presented three potential development options to the Council to provide a new Garden Village of either 1,350 homes; 1,725 homes; or 2,200 homes alongside the delivery of significant community infrastructure in the form of a new primary school, a village centre, public open space and recreational facilities. Extensive supporting information provided. Alternative boundary to ST14.	Paul Butler OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes and TW Fields
SID621/Mod/SS12/1		Not Sound	Presented three potential development options to the Council to provide a new Garden Village of either 1,350 homes; 1,725 homes; or 2,200 homes alongside the delivery of significant community infrastructure in the form of a new primary school, a village centre, public open space and recreational facilities. Extensive supporting information provided.	Paul Butler OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes and TW Fields

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID83/LC/SS13/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	ST15 is proposed without sufficient analysis detailing alternatives, the infrastructure implications and impacts. Location proposed seems arbitrary, local people cannot understand the implications and there is insufficient information available for them to respond constructively. Little or no discussion with local people, the plan does not demonstrate a duty to cooperate. Also, the area is currently greenbelt and insufficient information has been given as to why this should change.	Rosemary Tozer
SID163/LC/SS13/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Catherine Rose Hilton
SID207/LC/SS13/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant		Keep Elvington Rural Action Group - Martin Moorhouse
SID221/LC/SS13/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	This information is not supplied.	Sally Firth
SID222/LC/SS13/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Joanne Wedgwood
SID223/LC/SS13/1			This information is not supplied.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID227/LC/SS13/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Matthew Wedgwood
SID283/LC/SS13/1			Legal direction required.	Marshall P Curtis
SID319/LC/SS13/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Raymond Barnes OBO F R & K Handley
SID333/LC/SS13/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	This document is not legally compliant with Sustainability Appraisal and for development in relation to national rulings on Green belt land.	Alison Stead

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID356/LC/SS13/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The only local views the council have listened to are those of the residents of Heslington	Jonathan Laverack
SID362/LC/SS13/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Proposals to develop the area of land in ST15 have been rejected in the past	Dominic Stevens
SID378/LC/SS13/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID381/LC/SS13/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Development of the suggested allocation would be contrary to local policy G12 and the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2017.	Yorkshire Wildlife Trust - Sara Robin
SID383/LC/SS13/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID400/LC/SS13/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	ST15 has been labelled as a brownfield site. It isn't as much of the housing will be in greenfield and the infrastructure required is going to take out huge areas of greenfield land.	Claire Broadbent
SID412/LC/SS13/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	As a layperson it is difficult to understand and assess whether the document is legally compliant. The council hasn't taken in the views of the Parish Council regarding the development of H26 rather than H39.	Louisa Stevens
SID413/LC/SS13/2/1		Not Legally Compliant	ST15 is incorrectly labelled as a Brownfield Site. This is incorrect because part of ST15 is Greenbelt land and the infrastructure required to support ST15 would lead to further incursions into Greenbelt land.	Richard Schofield
SID414/LC/SS13/1			EMAIL -- This information is not supplied.	Peter Newman
SID416/LC/SS13/1			EMAIL -- This information is not supplied.	Linda Newman

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID581/LC/SS13/1		Not Legally Compliant		How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP

### Soundness

SID15/S/SS13/1		Sound	Thinks the plan is sound, only concern is about the impact ST15 may have on nearby villages - access roads etc.	Mick Wojkiw
SID43/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Members of the NFU would appreciate seeing the reasoning behind rejecting alternative sites and selecting ST15, for which the land for their members is compensatory habitat. The land is productive and provides other benefits to biodiversity / the environment as a result of their actions. The site is also close to Heslington Tillmire SSSI, whilst the new proposed open space (OS10) will offset the development at ST15 the biodiversity losses at Tillmire SSSI should be accounted for.	National Farmers Union North East - Andy Stephenson
SID51/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Garden village is too far from infrastructure and too close to wildlife sites, and would demand a huge infrastructure cost and mitigation area.	Richard Bramley
SID52/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Goes against the NPPF. Road linkages will become blocked and are already at capacity. In close proximity to Tillmire SSSI. Due to where it is cited, the proposal will need an additional area for mitigation, OS10, an area larger than the proposed new town, covering 500 acres of green belt agricultural land. This is against para 112 of the NPPF. OS10 already has views of the Minster. No proof mitigation will compensate for pollution damage. Common Lane should be made suitable for existing traffic, pedestrians and cyclists by widening. To ensure protection of the Tilmire should remain as is protected by rural farmland. Fear that farming community will be wiped out with use of the agricultural land at ST15.	Pauline Bramley
SID56/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Objects to houses as it will impact Elvington hugely with an increase in traffic on the already busy B1228. There is also no clear provision of infrastructure for the new town. Prefers original location for new town on land to the north. It is a shorter distance to the A64, will reduce traffic on the B1228 and will be outside the Green Corridor. It will also affect York's tourism with the runway and Airfield. It is also a greenfield and not brownfield site.	Judith Hodgson
SID75/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Brown field site or green belt land? In developing this site, a considerable amount of productive agricultural land within the Green Belt will be lost for infrastructure provision. This is in addition to approx 139 hectares taken out of arable production for OS10 which will be required for mitigation due to the very close proximity of both SSSI and SINC sites. There is no proof that mitigation can compensate for pollution damage: water, air, soil, noise, light, increased footfall and pet predation, to these two highly sensitive areas and irreplaceable habitats.	Heslington Parish Council

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID75/S/SS13/2		Not Sound	Building the right homes in the right place With regards to „soundness., HPC would appreciate seeing the reasoning behind rejecting alternative sites and selecting site ST15. The farmed land is productive, best and most versatile arable land, with the economic and other benefits. This is a “stand alone” site that requires extensive mitigation measures and infrastructure. Infrastructure that will join already highly congested roads..The site is remote, with no access.It is listed correctly as primarily a Brown field site, but a tremendous amount of infrastructure (amenities, roads, traffic) would be across green belt.The site is good agricultural land, which would be lost.The SSSI would be at serious risk from dog walker disturbing ground nesting birds.The area is of high environmental value SINC site especially regarding skylarks	Heslington Parish Council
SID83/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	ST15 is too close to Elvington and will engulf the village. Negatively impacts historical setting, green belt and the environment. ST15 has no natural boundaries and is unlikely to be contained in the medium-long term. Little information on traffic impacts and no consultation. No guarantees about the quality of such a settlement, could end up an unattractive development with high dependency on private cars. Such as settlement should have direct railway access.	Rosemary Tozer
SID84/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Plan does not adequately consider the impact ST15 will have on Elvington.	Tim Tozer
SID92/S/SS13/1			Previous location of this site, closer to the A64, when it was known as Winthorpe was much preferred. Previous location allowed the airfield to be retained, would not require such extensive access roads and created a greater gap to the adjoining villages of Elvington and Wheldrake allowing them to retain individual village character. There has been no information on provision of transport links to the A64, drainage, school, shops, healthcare etc. Development of this site will have a huge negative impact on nearby villages and their residents quality of life. Destroying the airfield will do damage to York both financially and in terms of the history / recreation value that will be lost. ST15 being situated further north, adjacent to the A64 as originally proposed, would also help reduce damage to the areas ecology.	Jonathan Shaw
SID96/S/SS13/1		Sound	The satisfactory provision of vehicle access from the development ST15 to and from the A64, rather than from Elvington Lane, is a key condition for the approval of the scheme to go ahead. Developers must ensure this condition is fulfilled, including making adequate financial contributions to achieve this condition.	David Mayston
SID102/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Previous site closer to the A64 was much preferred, this would have meant less access roads need to be built and allows Elvington Airfield to remain. Current location is too close to Elvington / Wheldrake and will overwhelm the villages. Parish Council unhappy with lack of information on access roads to and from the proposed site, particularly links to A64 and B1228. Cannot support the site in current location, Parish Council would support development if it was on the originally proposed site alongside the A64 and adjacent to the proposed new junction.	Elvington Parish Council - David Headlam



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID103/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	YCT does not wish to comment in detail on the nature and extent of the spatial allocations, since we believe that the overall policy advantages of achieving an adopted plan are so very great for the common good. We therefore support the spatial strategy components of the Local Plan. Although we support the document and urge that it be approved in its entirety, we have a reservation to bring to the attention of the Council (which is elaborated in our observations elsewhere of Transport and Communications). In their current form two sites, ST14 and ST15, may not comply with paragraph 17 of the NPPF which establishes the ambitions for 'sustainable development' as anywhere that 'makes fullest possible use of public transport, walking and cycling and focus significant development in locations which are or can be sustainable'. ST15 is independent from the city centre (7 miles away); a mile from the village of Elvington (pop. 1,700), and three miles from the nearest high frequency public transport corridor, as shown in Figure 5.3 of the Local Plan. The principle transport link is a recommended to be a new access road to the A64, but the proposed settlement allocation is too low to fund this link and the necessary sustainable transport infrastructure and essential services other than a primary school.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID108/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Disappointed to see that section SS13 of the plan makes no specific reference to any measures to protect the amenity value (light and noise pollution particularly) of existing residents or of Wheldrake Woods, this is in clear contrast to Policy SS21 for site ST26 where paragraph iii promises to 'Provide appropriate landscaping / screening to assist in mitigation against the erosion of the existing semi-rural setting of the airfield'. Requests a similar provision is added to SS13 preferably in the form of a bund five to ten metres high which could be planted and made attractive with hedges / trees. This would go some way to mitigating the noise and light pollution and protecting the landscape during construction which is likely to last for several decades. This would be in accordance with policy GB1 paragraph 10.4 which reads 'When granting permission for residential developments in the Green Belt, conditions will normally be attached... to ensure that the visual openness of the countryside is protected from obtrusive domestic development.'	Tim Vicary
SID108/S/SS13/2		Not Sound	Map showing the 'garden village' shows no details of the necessary transport link to the A64 which would have to be constructed before construction work begins nor does the map or draft plan make any reference to the much more detailed map produced by the developers Oakgate Partnership.	Tim Vicary
SID108/S/SS13/3		Not Sound	Current plan to build hundred of houses at the western end of Elvington Airfield will likely undo the considerable cost and effort the council has gone to in the past to retain the amenity value of this quiet rural location (2009 legal case that restricted motor racing on the airfield to minimise noise pollution). Building so many new houses will have a significant impact on the local road network, the A64 is often congested as it is. It is vital that even in the earliest stages of development access to the site is designated in a way that protects the villages of Heslington, Wheldrake and Elvington. Believes a recent development plan drawn up by the developers Oakgate Partnership mitigates some of the issues raised and has the approval of planning officers but was ultimately rejected by councillors. The recent Oakgate plan which indicates housing starting at The Old Fire station and continuing to the eastern end of Elvington Airfield avoids the environmental problem of building at the western end of the airfield. It would protect the quiet area's amenity value and much of the rare birds / wildlife that currently inhabit the site.	Tim Vicary

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/S/SS13/1		Sound	Sound with exception of criterion xii. Subject to the change in relation to transport, we support the principle of accommodating a proportion of the City's development needs in a new settlement of this size in this location. There is considerable merit in the potential offered by this new settlement. Historic England would oppose any increase in the size of this settlement over and above that currently proposed because of the harm that this would cause to numerous elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS13/2		Not Sound	It is essential that the infrastructure necessary to deliver this scale of development in this location can be achieved in a manner which does not harm other elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York. This needs to be better reflected within this Criterion	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID145/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Development would have an enormous effect on the surrounding countryside. Proposed site encroaches on historically significant runway, with commercial impacts from loss of tourism. Site is in green belt and would impact on Heslington Tilmire SSSI.	Ken Guest
SID156/S/SS13/1			The proposals do not have supporting infrastructure proposals for road, public transport, schools, doctor's surgery and public amenities all of which are now at over capacity with major issues such as long waiting lists for doctor's appointments, major traffic congestion on Elvington Lane. Further dwellings will result in widespread disruption and a significant reduction of quality of life for the existing residents of Elvington. Notwithstanding the negative impact the loss of local wildlife habitat including barn owls and a variety of hawks and decimation of The Green Belt previously referred in section 1 of this correspondence.	Steve Izzard
SID163/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The selection of ST15, a remote site with no usable existing infrastructure close to a SSSI and adjacent to a SINC site, for the largest of all the housing developments in the draft York Local Plan has not been justified and is contrary to national policy on greenbelt development.</li> <li>• According to the National Planning Policy Framework the 'garden village' should be developed only "with the support of their communities". The bulk of ST15 falls within Heslington Parish Council which opposes the new settlement.</li> <li>• Protection of the SINC site during the years of development so as not to disturb associated wildlife particularly birdlife including skylarks, and barn owls, as well as brown hares, from noise and physical and air pollution has not been clearly addressed. In the long term, there would be a net loss of biodiversity contrary to the NPPF.</li> <li>• The implications of OS10 as a nature conservation site rather than as managed conservation farmland providing arable land close to a major city has not been explored.</li> </ul>	Catherine Rose Hilton

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID163/S/SS13/2		Not Sound	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Usage of existing, largely single track, lanes in the draft plan as a quality cycle and pedestrian route (SS13 point xiii) is contrary to continued access for existing residents, businesses and landowners. In particular, the need for existing residents, commercial and agricultural vehicles to retain access throughout the parish in the context of proposed cycle/pedestrian routes is ineffective and unsound and indeed unsafe without major further incursion into adjacent verges/farmland. SS13 (xiii) will actively encourage increased pedestrian access to the SSSI at Tillmire including dog walkers disturbing breeding birds.</li> <li>• Creation of dedicated secure access (SS13 point xv) is unsound because it is ineffective as a means of providing the residents and businesses currently using these routes to continue their rights to freely allow access to their properties/places of work for visitors, trades and customers.</li> <li>• The combination of SS13 xiii and xv is ineffective in protecting the SSSI, ensuring safe cycle/pedestrian access towards York and enabling existing residents and businesses to function normally.</li> </ul>	Catherine Rose Hilton
SID182/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Land to the West of Elvington Lane [ST15] would not create and support, sustainable patterns of development. Is situated in the open countryside in an isolated location, with no existing infrastructure capable of accommodating the proposed levels of development. This would result in a long lead in time as the provision of infrastructure is a long, complex and costly process. ST15 could therefore only provide new homes towards the end of the plan period and there is no certainty over the potential supply due to the complexities of delivery. It is also important to highlight that there is no known developer interest in this site at this time.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID184/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	The first version of the Local Plan included ST15 as 'Whinthorpe'. This was significantly better sited than the current proposals, being much closer to the A64 – its principal access point. As it is proposed, ST15 is too close to the villages of Elvington and Wheldrake as well as being disproportionate in size to them. It would dominate the area. Elvington Airfield is an important part of York's history and the full-length runway should be retained for historical reasons. The airfield is Green Belt and a site of importance to nature.	Philip Rees
SID185/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	The first version of the Local Plan included ST15 as 'Whinthorpe'. This was significantly better sited than the current proposals, being much closer to the A64 – its principal access point. As it is proposed, ST15 is too close to the villages of Elvington and Wheldrake as well as being disproportionate in size to them. It would dominate the area. Elvington Airfield is an important part of York's history and the full-length runway should be retained for historical reasons. The airfield is Green Belt and a site of importance to nature.	Helen Rees
SID193/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Absurd and economically ill-advised to destroy Elvington Airfield runway. The Airfield is an important part of York's history, attracts over 200,000 visitors a year and is internationally respected as an Air Museum and Allied Air Forces Memorial. The Airfield should be retained for historical reasons, future strategic need and recreational activities that take place. Its removal could damage tourism, which is a stated economic strategy for York. It is also in the Green Belt and the ecological impact would be less adverse if ST15 was sited further north.	Peter Murray

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID194/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Absurd and economically ill-advised to destroy Elvington Airfield runway. The Airfield is an important part of York's history, attracts over 200,000 visitors a year and is internationally respected as an Air Museum and Allied Air Forces Memorial. The Airfield should be retained for historical reasons, future strategic need and recreational activities that take place. Its removal could damage tourism, which is a stated economic strategy for York. It is also in the Green Belt and the ecological impact would be less adverse if ST15 was sited further north.	Jessica Murray
SID195/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Absurd and economically ill-advised to destroy Elvington Airfield runway. The Airfield is an important part of York's history, attracts over 200,000 visitors a year and is internationally respected as an Air Museum and Allied Air Forces Memorial. The Airfield should be retained for historical reasons, future strategic need and recreational activities that take place. Its removal could damage tourism, which is a stated economic strategy for York. It is also in the Green Belt and the ecological impact would be less adverse if ST15 was sited further north.	Natasha Murray
SID196/LC/SS13/1		Not Sound	Absurd and economically ill-advised to destroy Elvington Airfield runway. The Airfield is an important part of York's history, attracts over 200,000 visitors a year and is internationally respected as an Air Museum and Allied Air Forces Memorial. The Airfield should be retained for historical reasons, future strategic need and recreational activities that take place. Its removal could damage tourism, which is a stated economic strategy for York. It is also in the Green Belt and the ecological impact would be less adverse if ST15 was sited further north.	Anneliese Murray
SID197/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Absurd and economically ill-advised to destroy Elvington Airfield runway. The Airfield is an important part of York's history, attracts over 200,000 visitors a year and is internationally respected as an Air Museum and Allied Air Forces Memorial. The Airfield should be retained for historical reasons, future strategic need and recreational activities that take place. Its removal could damage tourism, which is a stated economic strategy for York. It is also in the Green Belt and the ecological impact would be less adverse if ST15 was sited further north.	Mary Julie Murray
SID199/S/SS13/1			Positive Appraisal of ST15.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID207/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Original proposals for Winthorpe held the site closer to the A64 which is acceptable and would minimise the damage to the Green belt, nature conservation and local communities. The airfield is not brownfield but greenfield and furthermore a site of importance to nature. With less new roads the original location offers less destruction of Green Belt for the same size town. The airfield is as much a part of York's history as the walls, Clifford's Tower or Minster and should be provided the same level of protection and should be considered an asset of community value as well as a tourist attraction. Building on the open space of the airfield would seriously damage the site and location of the internationally renowned Allied Forces. Destroying the runway is contradictory to York's stated policies of preserving history, the character, protecting wildlife and encouraging tourism. Significant additional traffic will result. Access to the A64 are considerably shortened in previous version and would have damaged less countryside. many of the points for moving from original location are invalid. Infrastructure and transport fall well short of what is required.	Keep Elvington Rural Action Group - Martin Moorhouse
SID221/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	This site is not Brownfield but is actually Greenbelt.	Sally Firth
SID221/S/SS13/2			The airfield is of community value and significant historical/tourism value.	Sally Firth
SID221/S/SS13/3			The proposed plan would cause significant additional traffic.	Sally Firth
SID221/S/SS13/4			The rumoured reasons for moving the proposals onto the airfield are individually personal and should be investigated.	Sally Firth
SID222/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	This site is not Brownfield but is actually Greenbelt.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID222/S/SS13/2			The airfield is of community value and significant historical/tourism value.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID222/S/SS13/3			The proposed plan would cause significant additional traffic.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID222/S/SS13/4			The rumoured reasons for moving the proposals onto the airfield are individually personal and should be investigated.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID223/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	This site is not Brownfield but is actually Greenbelt.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID223/S/SS13/2			The airfield is of community value and significant historical/tourism value.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID223/S/SS13/3			The proposed plan would cause significant additional traffic.	Jonathan Hailstone

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID223/S/SS13/4			The rumoured reasons for moving the proposals onto the airfield are individually personal and should be investigated.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID227/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	ST15 site is in the greenbelt and the airfield is an important part of York's history and destroying the runway would contradict CYC's aim of preserving the history and character of York.	Matthew Wedgwood
SID231/S/SS13/2		Not Sound	FPC considers that Proposal ST15 should be deleted. This proposed new settlement of some 3339 dwellings occupies an area of attractive open land which fulfils important Green Belt functions, including the separation of Elvington from the main urban area. The gap has already been substantially reduced by the development of the Heslington East university campus. Its further reduction would be highly damaging.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID240/S/SS13/1			Increased traffic and the risk of pollution/accidents/congestion.	David Boddy
SID240/S/SS13/2			Incursion onto Greenbelt and damage to wildlife/habitats.	David Boddy
SID240/S/SS13/3			Airfield is an important tourism hotspot	David Boddy
SID242/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Unclear whether (Land West of Elvington Lane) would be sufficient to deliver the necessary supporting infrastructure outlined in Policy SS13. Does not consider policy unsound but needs further clarification within the plan to outline how this strategic allocation will be delivered. Including provision of services. Requirements for these services have been laid out in other policies, however the costs of the services are not clarified. Suggests it may be helpful to include viability of essential infrastructure and the costs and mechanisms for securing funding.	East Riding of Yorkshire Council Jon Palmer
SID261/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	The proposed siting of this 'new village' has been moved from adjacent to the A64 to being closer to Elvington. The new site would result in more traffic on the B1228 and is out of kilter with the village aesthetic of Elvington and Wheldrake. Additionally, the area is Greenbelt.	Amanda Moore
SID/262/S/SS13/1			The proposed siting of this 'new village' has been moved from adjacent to the A64 to being closer to Elvington. The new site would result in more traffic on the B1228, is out of kilter with the village aesthetic of Elvington and Wheldrake, and would destroy the airfield. Additionally, the area is Greenbelt.	Ian Dickens
SID265/S/SS13/1			The site is too small to be commercially viable and cannot support a community on 'garden' principles.	Honary Alderman Richard Watson

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID280/S/SS13/1			As residents interested in nature conservation, we are pleased that site ST15 has now moved further away from the SSS1. However, we are concerned that ST15 is not large enough to guarantee sustainable infrastructure, inc. Public transport.	John & Dorothy Lawton
SID283/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	The choice to build this site in prime countryside, far away from A64, B1228, A1019 and A1237, will only lead to increased traffic and the need for further infrastructure in prime countryside.	Marshall P Curtis
SID283/S/SS13/2			If development were to go on there would be a significant disturbing of wildlife. In addition, farmland would be destroyed inc. Significant walks such as the renowned 'Minster Trek'.	Marshall P Curtis
SID283/S/SS13/3			The airstrip should be protected as a national asset.	Marshall P Curtis
SID289/S/SS13/1			This site is too close to existing village developments with no transport links other than the B1228. The effect on the village of Elvington would be vast.	Terence Wilson
SID289/S/SS13/2			The Air Museum and Airfield are of major importance both historically and to York's tourism industry.	Terence Wilson
SID290/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Objects as proposed site is greenbelt, economy of village would be affected, there would be a loss of wildlife and nature conservation, a loss of the historical significance of the airfield.	Graham Keighley
SID319/S/SS13/1			Support the inclusion of the site in allocation of a garden village. Land is available and deliverable. In appraisal of strategic sites, ST15 scored highly in satisfying objectives.	Raymond Barnes OBO F R & K Handley
SID332/S/SS13/1			Same criticism as per SID332/S/SS12/1. Not a sustainable settlement as it is not large enough.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID333/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	NOT positively prepared as the current siting of this development is not directly linked to the main traffic route of the A64. It is not addressing infrastructure requirements. Any significant increase of traffic on the B1228 will have adverse effect on movement of traffic in the area. The B1228 is a road heavily used by sat nav guided HGVs to the M62. It is not clear how an effective link to A64 will be created without destroying areas of countryside. NOT justified -The runway is to be split. Is this an appropriate action on this unique facility for historic and current amenity reasons? It is very close in proximity to the villages of Wheldrake and Elvington and its size is disproportionate to them. Some controlled residential development in the village should be allowed but within proportion to the existing size of the village. There are a number of significant wildlife areas including an SSSI in the vicinity and it is not clear how these will be safeguarded and how the wildlife corridors set up in the biodiversity plan would continue to operate.	Alison Stead
SID356/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	The location of the currently proposed ST15 is not sound in that it effectively creates a small town near some villages with poor infrastructure links. The site previously known as Whinthorpe (ST15 also) was located adjacent to the A64 which forms the eastern York outer ring road. I appreciate York needs a large scale development somewhere and to me the ideal location is adjacent to the main arterial road thus not encroaching into the Green belt and open countryside too much. The current site lies over 1mile away from the A64, whereas the original site lay next to the A64, there was still a considerable distance between this and the settlement of Heslington including the A64 to effectively mask the settlement.	Jonathan Laverack
SID356/S/SS13/2		Not Sound	Of perhaps a greater concern is the fact that approx. half of Elvington Airfield Runway will be dug up to create the planned settlement. Especially since one of York's main drivers is tourism. With the internationally renowned Yorkshire Air Museum being located adjacent to the existing runway.	Jonathan Laverack
SID362/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	The Airfield is an important part of the village's history, and is a major attraction for tourists to the area with events centred around the airfield runway, as well as events at the museum	Dominic Stevens
SID362/S/SS13/2			ST15 is far too close to the villages of Elvington and Wheldrake, as well as being completely disproportionate in size comparison with them. It would utterly dominate the area. It should be proposed much farther away from the current location.	Dominic Stevens
SID362/S/SS13/3			Development of this area will put a further strain on the A64 traffic, which is already poor at the moment.	Dominic Stevens
SID362/S/SS13/4			This site at present is totally waterlogged. It is clearly a high flood risk area.	Dominic Stevens
SID362/S/SS13/5			The airfield is Green Belt land and a site of importance to the nature surrounding it.	Dominic Stevens



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID369/S/SS13 (ST15)/1		Not Sound	Welcomed the inclusion of brownfield land at Elvington Airfield in conjunction with the site that was then called Whinthorpe during the previous consultation in 2016. Heard representations from residents regarding the impact this development would have on the existing transport and local infrastructure. Particular concern about such a large development on school places and the increased pressure on our already congested roads; particularly the A64, A19 and A1079. When this site was moved further away from the A64 it raised questions about the financial viability of delivering access onto the A64 and this question remains.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID373/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Policy SS13 - ST15 site, key principles vii. ecological mitigation and compensation measures to be delivered 5 years prior to commencement of development. But elsewhere in document section 3.62 - development to commence 2022 i.e. less than 5 years away?xiii. states that It is essential that there is no vehicular transport access to Heslington village along current lanes (Common, Long, Langwith). But xv. provide dedicated secure access for local residents and landowners ( and should also say businesses). These two statements are contradictory and require re-wording. xiii needs the phrase "from the new village settlement added after "Heslington Village so It is essential that there is no vehicular transport access to Heslington village from the new village settlement along current lanes etc	Cllr Keith Aspden OBO Rose Hilton
SID374/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	These developments between them risk adding significantly to vehicular traffic and congestion on York's road network. None of them adheres fully even to the design principles for new developments specified in Policy T1; Policies SS11, 19 and 21 make no reference at all to public transport provision. The others propose a target of 15% of journeys by public transport; no evidence is offered to justify that target; nor is any target offered for walking and cycling. As we have noted elsewhere, the design principles in Policy T1 are necessary but not sufficient. Three of the sites, under Policies SS12, 13 and 22, propose direct links to the outer ring road. There is ample evidence that such provision promotes the development of dormitory villages for commuters to remote employment areas,	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID375/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	The residents do not feel they have been properly consulted regarding their needs. The Local Plan therefore is unsound as it does not reflect local public need or opinion as not taken account of previous consultation exercises.	Cllr Suzie Mercer
SID378/S/SS13/1			The strategic road link linking the garden village with the A64, and providing its primary access, is indicated on the Policies Map on an alignment that is technically undeliverable. The Policies Map should be updated to show the appropriate alignment	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Policy SS13 supports the allocation of the proposed new garden village in the south eastern part of the City (i.e., objection have been made to ST15 and these are not re-presented here). The Policy, however, sets a number of criteria requiring the allocation to be developed in a sustainable and master planned manner, and delivered in accordance with a range of criteria. Whilst many of the criteria are not objectionable (if applied to an appropriate site allocation), objections are made to the following which are either unnecessary or unduly burdensome.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/S/SS13/2		Not Sound	There is no justification for secondary education provision on site. In discussions with Officers at CYC, LDP have been informed that current forecasts and projections, suggest extra capacity can be achieved at existing schools in the City, albeit no evidence is available at present.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/SS13/3		Not Sound	The scale of open spaces proposed as part of SS13 (and Policy OS10) is not justified, not supported by any sound evidence, and falls in the control of various third parties, rendering it potentially unavailable and therefore not deliverable.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/SS13/4		Not Sound	The strategic road link linking the garden village with the A64, and providing its primary access, is indicated on the Policies Map on an alignment that is technically undeliverable. The Policies Map should be updated to show the appropriate alignment (see Plan at Appendix 14).	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID381/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Development of a central part of the airfield will divide up the habitat of wildlife with an area of development in the centre of the airfield with a small undeveloped western compartment that will be very disturbed by the development and an undeveloped eastern section which will be close to the industrial and museum area and Elvington Lane and hence also disturbed.	Yorkshire Wildlife Trust - Sara Robin
SID383/S/SS13/1			In the context of the conclusions of the Sustainability Appraisal concerning the preferred spatial strategy and site ST15 we welcome policy SS13 which we consider to set out the necessary compensation and mitigation measures necessary in relation to the threats identified. In particular we welcome the identification of the biodiversity mitigation/ compensation area on the proposals map, the ambition for no net loss and to maximise further benefits for biodiversity in criterion v., the avoidance, mitigation and compensation requirements of criterion vi. (including a 400m buffer). We consider the requirement for the provision of compensation five years prior development in criterion vii of great importance considering the sensitivity of the location in relation to internationally, nationally and locally designated sites. In addition the requirement for the site to be retained and monitored in perpetuity is very welcome in this context.	Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID383/S/SS13/2			Natural England notes that ST15 has been through a number of iterations with different boundaries and footprints and that a great deal of evidence has been gathered for different site boundaries but has not been made available publically. We would encourage you to consider making the wider evidence base for this site available and clarify what evidence accords to which variation of the site.	Natural England - Merlin Ash

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID383/S/SS13/3			Natural England notes and welcomes the assessment against objective 8 in the Sustainability Appraisal which we consider to be detailed and accurate. We agree with the scoring given and the weighting applied alongside other sustainability concerns. We note para 7.1.9 states that no appropriate alternatives could be found and the reasons for this and that the spatial strategy and allocation are determined to be the most sustainable option despite the potential impacts identified in relation to the biodiversity objective. Natural England defers to City of York council on these matters but would welcome further elucidation regarding how competing sustainability concerns were weighed against each other.	Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID389/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	As it is proposed, ST15 being the size of Pocklington is far too close to the villages of Elvington and Wheldrake as well as being disproportionate in size to them. It would dominate the area, when it could and should be sited further away.	Sandra Atkinson
SID389/S/SS13/2			There has been no provision regarding information of infrastructure, in particular the transport links to the A64 and B1228 but also the ability of drainage to cope with not only the extra housing but the loss of a natural soakaway. No mention has been made of extra schools, churches, shops etc to cope with all the extra residents.	Sandra Atkinson
SID389/S/SS13/3			Elvington Airfield is an important part of York's history and the full-length runway should be retained for historical reasons and future strategic need, along with the existing recreational activities that currently take place.	Sandra Atkinson
SID389/S/SS13/4			Notwithstanding this, the airfield is Green Belt and a site of importance to nature. The adverse ecological impact of ST15 would be less if it were sited north as originally proposed.	Sandra Atkinson
SID390/S/SS13(ST15)/1		Not Sound	With regards to ST15, this will need additional school buses to which every school is deemed suitable (currently Fulford School). In addition, the facilities at these schools to cope with additional school buses needs to be taken into consideration as both are currently at capacity. This is particularly important when looking to maintain the current school journey times below the current 60 minute maximum. ST15 is not big enough to support new commercial services, so needs to be linked to current routes. Using a bridge link, ST15 is on the corridor linking Elvington, the University of York and York City Centre and will therefore potentially enable this service to have better frequencies and attract more passengers.	Confederation of Passenger Transport UK (Andrew McGuinness) OBO York Quality Bus Partnership

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID391/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	We are shocked that City of York Council are proposing to build on part of Elvington Air Museum one of the biggest tourism assets in York with over 100,000 visitors a year. York Councils policies are to promote business to the area through tourism. The runway is of historical significance and can be used again in the future. Is it wise to build thousands of homes next to a runway? Noise and pollution need to be taken into account for the residents of the proposed properties. Infrastructure will be put under significant strain. Elvington Lane is too small to take the additional traffic of over 3000 houses, combined with 2000 homes that have been built in Pocklington, additional homes in Wilberfoss and Market Weighton. There is not enough detail in the plan to provide us with how the transport links to the A64 and B1228 will work. The location of the site does not make much sense when there are alternatives available – for example where the Whinthorpe development was planned in the last York Plan- this would be closer to the York ring road enabling residents to make use of existing transport links. Elvington has a small primary school and doctor's surgery which are already fully subscribed. The airfield is Greenfield not brownfield site – it should not be built on where there are already a number of brownfield sites available in York.	Katherine and James Marsh
SID402/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Safeguarded land is land that should be safeguarded from development. The proposed site is Green belt which should be preserved and not affect nature. A development of this scale will affect nature and ecology. The size and scale of the proposed development is inappropriate especially considering the close proximity of the site to Elvington and Wheldrake. Will lose character of village and loss of historical significance with runway. There will be an impact on traffic, infrastructure and the countryside.	Joanne Owen
SID412/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	The Yorkshire Air Museum and the events that take place on the runway are integral parts of tourism in the city. The runway itself is historically important.	Louisa Stevens
SID412/S/SS13/2			ST15 is far too close to the villages of Elvington and Wheldrake, as well as being completely disproportionate in size comparison with them. It would utterly dominate the area. It should be proposed much farther away from the current location.	Louisa Stevens
SID412/S/SS13/3			Development of this area will put a further strain on the B1228 and A64 traffic, which is already poor at the moment. In addition, the area is in the green belt and floods frequently.	Louisa Stevens
SID413/S/SS13/2/1		Not Sound	Wildlife and natural habitats would not be protected.	Richard Schofield
SID413/S/SS13/2/2			Usage of existing, largely single track, lanes in the draft plan as a quality cycle and pedestrian route (SS13 point xiii) is contrary to continued access for existing residents, businesses and landowners.	Richard Schofield

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID413/S/SS13/2/3			Creation of dedicated secure access (SS13 point xv) is unsound because it is ineffective as a means of providing the residents and businesses currently using these routes to continue their rights to freely allow access to their properties/places of work for visitors, trades and customers.	Richard Schofield
SID414/S/SS13/1			EMAIL -- This information is not supplied.	Peter Newman
SID416/S/SS13/1			EMAIL -- This information is not supplied.	Linda Newman
SID424/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	The proposals for the development of Airfield Business Park and the additional do not have 3339 dwellings any supporting infrastructure proposals for road, public transport, schools, doctor's surgery and public amenities all of which are now over capacity.	Val Izzard
SID581/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Given the lack of robust evidence and, in relation to the legal certainty required by the Habitats Regulations with respect to European designated sites, it is considered that the Policy SS13(ST15 Land to the West of Elvington) is unsound and the Council should invoke the precautionary principle due to the lack of scientific evidence to inform the likelihood of significant effects.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP
SID582/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	We are concerned that the proposed allocation of land to the West of Elvington Lane [Allocation ref. ST15] would not create and support, sustainable patterns of development for the following reasons: ST15 is situated in the open countryside in an isolated location, with no existing infrastructure capable of accommodating the proposed levels of development. The necessity to create and maintain an appropriate landscape setting and substantial buffers would result in the loss of developable area and not make the best use of the land. The vision for ST15 is to create a 'garden' village the Council has failed to recognise that new settlements need to be of a sufficient size to support the required range of social and physical infrastructure. ST15 has been subjected to a Sustainability Appraisal but appears to score differently to other Strategic Sites in terms of accessing all local services. Given its remoteness, this would suggest there is a flaw in the scoring system.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/SS13 (ST15)/1			We are concerned that the proposed allocation of land to the West of Elvington Lane [Allocation ref. ST15] would not create and support, sustainable patterns of development for the following reasons: ST15 is situated in the open countryside in an isolated location, with no existing infrastructure capable of accommodating the proposed levels of development. The necessity to create and maintain an appropriate landscape setting and substantial buffers would result in the loss of developable area and not make the best use of the land. The vision for ST15 is to create a 'garden' village the Council has failed to recognise that new settlements need to be of a sufficient size to support the required range of social and physical infrastructure. ST15 has been subjected to a Sustainability Appraisal but appears to score differently to other Strategic Sites in terms of accessing all local services. Given its remoteness, this would suggest there is a flaw in the scoring system.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/S/SS13(ST15)/1			Support the need to develop greenbelt sites but have concerns regarding ST15 such as the isolated nature of development making it costly and complex to provide necessary infrastructure. The Lack of developer interest in the current boundary. The need to create and maintain an appropriate landscape buffer significantly reducing developable area. To be truly sustainable the site would need to provide a secondary school and provide 5000-6000 should allow for higher housing numbers.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/SS13(ST15)/1		Not Sound	Concerns raised re ST15, as follows:*costly and complex lead in to provide necessary infrastructure;*the need to create and maintain an appropriate landscape buffer would significantly reduce developable area;*to be truly self sustaining the site should allow for higher housing numbers.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID598/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Not objecting to the principle of the allocation but we do consider the estimated yield from ST15 to be unrealistic and to call into question the ability of the Local Plan to deliver houses to meet the housing requirement. As such we consider the yield assumed for ST15 to be unsound in that ST15 will not deliver the housing units identified in the plan period. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST15 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Not objecting to the principle of the allocation but we do consider the estimated yield from ST15 to be unrealistic and to call into question the ability of the Local Plan to deliver houses to meet the housing requirement. As such we consider the yield assumed for ST15 to be unsound in that ST15 will not deliver the housing units identified in the plan period. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST15 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Not objecting to the principle of the allocation but we do consider the estimated yield from ST15 to be unrealistic and to call into question the ability of the Local Plan to deliver houses to meet the housing requirement. As such we consider the yield assumed for ST15 to be unsound in that ST15 will not deliver the housing units identified in the plan period. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST15 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Not objecting to the principle of the allocation but we do consider the estimated yield from ST15 to be unrealistic and to call into question the ability of the Local Plan to deliver houses to meet the housing requirement. As such we consider the yield assumed for ST15 to be unsound in that ST15 will not deliver the housing units identified in the plan period. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to site ST15 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID604/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Whilst the Sustainability Appraisal considers the selected sites against each other it fails to reassess them against alternatives such as the dismissed urban extensions. This renders the plan unsound and that urban extensions in sustainable locations, such as the Land at North Field, should be reintroduced to help make up the expected delivery shortfalls against OAN noted throughout these representations and to increase flexibility and broaden choice.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID609/S/SS13/1			Proposed Elvington airfield (ST15) related development is not big enough to fund a full range of community facilities to make it a self sufficient community, and that it should be larger	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID614/S/SS13(ST15)/1		Not Sound	We have previously objected to this allocation due to the impact on existing businesses at Elvington Airfield. Many of the businesses omit noise . SS13 has moved closed to the business park and proposed SS21. We suggest developers undertake noise and light assessments. Criterion (xi) refers to need to address all transport issues and cumulative impact f allocations. The list fails to include SS21 it should be added to this list. Also requirements are not consistent with other allocations such as surface water, drainage and archaeology? A review of each of the policies associated with this allocation should be carried out. Given the NPPF sets out how under para 17 how planning should seek a good standard of amenity for all existing and future occupants of land and buildings.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID825/S/SS13(ST15)/1		Not Sound	Site ought to be referred to as a 'new town' or 'new settlement', and not a 'Garden Village' - the sheer size precludes it from being a village. The scale of the proposal offers the chance to create a meaningful new stand alone community with all usual accepted facilities on site, whilst this should minimise traffic generation as far as possible, the cumulative impact has to be carefully managed with the other proposals in the Plan, should they reach fruition.	Osbalwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID833/S/SS13/1			It is entirely unsound to propose a new settlement within the YGB and allocation ST15 should be declared an unsound proposal. As it varies the quantum of the York green belt it should also have been promoted on the basis of exceptional circumstances	George E Wright Combined
SID848/S/SS13(ST15)/1			Support the need to develop greenbelt sites but have concerns regarding ST15 such as the isolated nature of development making it costly and complex to provide necessary infrastructure. The Lack of developer interest in the current boundary. The need to create and maintain an appropriate landscape buffer significantly reducing developable area. To be truly sustainable the site would need to provide a secondary school and provide 5000-6000 should allow for higher housing numbers.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID15/Mod/SS13/1			Believes most concerns about ST15 have been addressed.	Mick Wojkiw

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID34/Mod/SS13/1			Wheldrake could support a small number of additional homes but not at the scale currently proposed for ST33. It would make more sense, doing less damage to historic villages and supporting infrastructure investment elsewhere, to concentrate the new housing in the garden village ST15.	David Randon
SID43/Mod/SS13/1			Would welcome full and well-justified reasons as to why ST15 has been put forwards as opposed to any alternatives. When planning generally discourage development in the Green Belt it is difficult to understand why a stand-alone development requiring extensive infrastructure such as this has been allowed.	National Farmers Union North East - Andy Stephenson
SID52/Mod/SS13/1			Discourages these developments.	Pauline Bramley
SID75/MOD/SS13/1			Heslington Parish Council (HPC) would welcome full and well-justified reasons as to why the development (ST15) has been put-forward in the proposed location as opposed to other sites. When planning policy discourages development in the green belt, it is difficult to understand why a stand alone development would be permitted on this scale with the need for extensive infrastructure to connect to the existing network. HPC would like to see the cumulative traffic flow impacts from local proposed developments - ST15, ST27, H56 and the ST4 analysed by CYC/Developers to evidence that there will be no adverse traffic congestion for Hull Road, Field Lane, University Road and Heslington Lane.	Heslington Parish Council
SID81/Mod/SS13 (ST15)/1			Suggested that a reduction in new houses to the north of York should be offset by increasing the housing numbers on the sites that will be served by the A64 southern ring road - site ST15 in particular. The A64 is already a dual carriageway with grade-separation junctions. Therefore it can accommodate the increased vehicle movements caused by the increased housing it would serve. Moreover, plans to 'Dual' the A64 beyond York, towards Scarborough, are well advanced and have political support.	Skelton Village Action Group
SID83/Mod/SS13/1			Move the site further from Elvington and closer to the A64. More analysis and consultation should be undertaken on location, size and nature of proposed settlement. Particularly regarding impact on nearby villages and traffic. Consultation should meaningfully engage with residents and Parish Councils, not just simple questionnaires	Rosemary Tozer
SID102/Mod/SS13/1		Not Sound	Previous site closer to the A64 was much preferred, this would have meant less access roads need to be built and allows Elvington Airfield to remain.	Elvington Parish Council - David Headlam
SID103/Mod/SS13/1			York Civic Trust believes that all of York's proposed residential developments in the green belt should have access to a range of services and be well connected by transport. A genuinely sustainable settlement at the Elvington airfield site (SS13 / ST15) will need to be in the order of 12,000 or more houses. This will enable the sustainable provision of key infrastructure, such as a secondary school and public transport links to be provided. The allocation for this site should be increased accordingly.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID108/Mod/SS13/1			Policy SS21 for site ST26 paragraph iii promises to 'Provide appropriate landscaping / screening to assist in mitigation against the erosion of the existing semi-rural setting of the airfield'. Requests a similar provision is added to SS13 preferably in the form of a bund five to ten metres high which could be planted and made attractive with hedges / trees. This would go some way to mitigating the noise and light pollution and protecting the landscape during construction which is likely to last for several decades. This would be in accordance with policy GB1 paragraph 10.4 which reads 'When granting permission for residential developments in the Green Belt, conditions will normally be attached... to ensure that the visual openness of the countryside is protected from obtrusive domestic development.'	Tim Vicary
SID118/MOD/SS13/1			It is essential that the infrastructure necessary to deliver this scale of development in this location can be achieved in a manner which does not harm other elements which contribute to the special character and setting of York. This needs to be better reflected within this Criterion. Policy SS13 – Site ST15 (Land to the west of Elvington Lane), Criterion xii amend to read:-“”.. is limited. The design and layout of these roads should minimise the impact upon the openness of the Green Belt and demonstrate how they safeguard those elements which contribute to the special character and setting of the historic City”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID163/Mod/SS13/1			In general, the revised local plan is an improvement on earlier unacceptable plans, but there are caveats. Mitigation measure need to be started 5 years before development as stated in SS13 (vii) not less than 4 years before as implied in 3.62 p 56. .	Catherine Rose Hilton
SID163/Mod/SS13/2			The council should clearly identify and justify the number of hectares of green belt arable land which will be lost to infrastructure for ST15 in addition to 139 Hectares in OS10 based on current realistic population forecasts for York.	Catherine Rose Hilton
SID163/Mod/SS13/3			The access for pedestrians and cyclists to ST15 should be alongside the proposed new vehicle access to the A64 at Heslington East Campus, with no access at all from ST15 onto Langwith Stray, Langwith Lane or Long Lane. This would enable the existing single track lanes used by residents, farm machinery and existing businesses to continue unobstructed, better protect the SSSI, minimize the number of different greenbelt sites that are disrupted by infrastructure, and ensure that important habitats for barn owls and bats are retained with minimal disturbance	Catherine Rose Hilton
SID163/Mod/SS13/4			A full ecological survey of ST15, OS10 and the proposed infrastructure routes should be undertaken maximum 3 years prior to development commencing	Catherine Rose Hilton

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID165/Mod/SS13/1			In the event that this proposal is adopted, the policy should be clarified and strengthened so that it achieves the requirements of the NPPF, including to provide safeguards for the local communities which would be worst affected, including Heslington. In particular:1. That all transport issues have been resolved and not just “addressed”. The NPPF paragraph 32 test should be used so that the residual cumulative impacts on the surrounding highway network are not severe.2. In line with paragraphs 29, 30 and 32 of the NPPF, there should be a stronger policy commitment to public transport and more sustainable transport modes. In particular, the policy should require the developer to prepare a Travel Plan which discourages the use of the private car. I suggest criterion xvi) should be rewritten as follows: The developer will need to include a series of measures designed to discourage the use of the private car by residents and encourage the use of more sustainable modes of travel, including cycling and walking. The objective should be to ensure that upwards of 50% of trips to and from the settlement are by public transport and other sustainable modes of transport. Monitoring and contingency arrangements will be required in a Section 106 Undertaking to ensure that this policy objective is secured in practice.	Richard Frost
SID165/Mod/SS13/2			3. To encourage alternatives to the car, the proposed link road should provide a cycle track and footpath. It should be completely isolated from the existing local roads so that traffic cannot access them. It is vital that the link road does not impede use of local roads by local residents and businesses. This is to protect the Green Belt through which this access road will run and to ensure that the local roads and Heslington village (which has a conservation area and 21 listed buildings) is not used as a short cut or rat run.	Richard Frost
SID193/Mod/SS13/1			First version of Local Plan included ST15 as 'Whinthorpe'. Original siting was significantly better sited than the current proposals, being much closer to the A64 - its principle access point. This allowed for retention of Airfield runway and a lessened adverse impact on Elvington and Wheldrake. The A64 clearly separates the site from Heslington and therefore the visual and auditory impact would be minimal. As proposed, ST15 too close to Elvington and Wheldrake and disproportionately sized. It would dominate the area when it could be sited away.	Peter Murray
SID194/Mod/SS13/1			First version of Local Plan included ST15 as 'Whinthorpe'. Original siting was significantly better sited than the current proposals, being much closer to the A64 - its principle access point. This allowed for retention of Airfield runway and a lessened adverse impact on Elvington and Wheldrake. The A64 clearly separates the site from Heslington and therefore the visual and auditory impact would be minimal. As proposed, ST15 too close to Elvington and Wheldrake and disproportionately sized. It would dominate the area when it could be sited away.	Jessica Murray
SID195/Mod/SS13/1			First version of Local Plan included ST15 as 'Whinthorpe'. Original siting was significantly better sited than the current proposals, being much closer to the A64 - its principle access point. This allowed for retention of Airfield runway and a lessened adverse impact on Elvington and Wheldrake. The A64 clearly separates the site from Heslington and therefore the visual and auditory impact would be minimal. As proposed, ST15 too close to Elvington and Wheldrake and disproportionately sized. It would dominate the area when it could be sited away.	Natasha Murray

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID196/Mod/SS13/1			First version of Local Plan included ST15 as 'Whinthorpe'. Original siting was significantly better sited than the current proposals, being much closer to the A64 - its principle access point. This allowed for retention of Airfield runway and a lessened adverse impact on Elvington and Wheldrake. The A64 clearly separates the site from Heslington and therefore the visual and auditory impact would be minimal. As proposed, ST15 too close to Elvington and Wheldrake and disproportionately sized. It would dominate the area when it could be sited away.	Anneliese Murray
SID197/Mod/SS13/1			First version of Local Plan included ST15 as 'Whinthorpe'. Original siting was significantly better sited than the current proposals, being much closer to the A64 - its principle access point. This allowed for retention of Airfield runway and a lessened adverse impact on Elvington and Wheldrake. The A64 clearly separates the site from Heslington and therefore the visual and auditory impact would be minimal. As proposed, ST15 too close to Elvington and Wheldrake and disproportionately sized. It would dominate the area when it could be sited away.	Mary Julie Murray
SID207/Mod/SS13/1			The original proposals for Winthorpe held the site much closer to the A64 - this site is acceptable and would minimise the damage to Tourism, Reputation, Greenbelt, nature conservation and local communities.	Keep Elvington Rural Action Group - Martin Moorhouse
SID222/Mod/SS13/1			Take notice of what local residents said in previous rounds of consultation.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID222/Mod/SS13/2			Revert to the first version of the Local Plan, which included ST15 as 'Whinthorpe'.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID223/Mod/SS13/1			The CYC Local Plan should be rejected in its current form and reworked to become a proper analysis that actually deals with the long term interests of the residents who live, and the businesses that exist in the area.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID227/Mod/SS13/1			Revert to original location proposed in previous version of the draft local plan.	Matthew Wedgwood
SID231/Mod/SS13/1			FPC considers that Proposal ST15 should be deleted. This proposed new settlement of some 3339 dwellings occupies an area of attractive open land which fulfils important Green Belt functions, including the separation of Elvington from the main urban area. The gap has already been substantially reduced by the development of the Heslington East university campus. Its further reduction would be highly damaging.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID261/Mod/SS13/1			I suggest moving ST15 back to its original location adjacent to the A64.	Amanda Moore
SID262/Mod/SS13/1			I suggest moving ST15 back to its original location adjacent to the A64.	Ian Dickens

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID265/Mod/SS13/1			Increase the size of ST15 to be a significantly self-sufficient 'garden' village and provide road connectivity to Grimston Bar roundabout.	Honary Alderman Richard Watson
SID283/Mod/SS13/1			Select sites within ringroad boundary and model them on the New Earswick 'Model Village'.	Marshall P Curtis
SID283/Mod/SS13/2			Withdraw the ST15 proposal.	Marshall P Curtis
SID289/Mod/SS13/1			The impact of ST15 would be less if the originally proposed site along the A64 and nearer to the propose new A64 Juntion.	Terence Wilson
SID290/Mod/SS13/1			Suggests building houses further north so as to reduce impact on Elvington village and reduce traffic on B1228.	Graham Keighley
SID333/Mod/SS13/1			Reconsideration of the proposed siting of this significant development to the siting of the previously proposed Whinthorpe site which was nearer to major road infrastructure i.e. the A64 so that it is more clearly linked into existing infrastructure including the A64 and facilities and with its own environs without impinging on smaller neighbouring villages	Alison Stead
SID339/Mod/SS13/1			It is noted that the Council continue to omit our Clients sites – In addition, none of our Clients land interests have been included within the allocation at land to the west of Elvington Lane (ref: ST15).	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID356/Mod/SS13/1			Move site ST15 to the site originally classed as Whinthorpe which would alleviate the issues raised by the localparish councils and residents.	Jonathan Laverack
SID362/Mod/SS13/1			ST15 could be built much further north (as it was originally proposed). This has better access to the A64, and is far enough away from Elvington and Wheldrake to allow them to remain smaller rural villages.	Dominic Stevens
SID364/Mod/SS13/1			New access routes directly to the regional road network should not be provided. Omit link to A1237 which would stimulate its use as a dormitory village for areas other than York.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/Mod/SS13/5			New Garden Village settlements should be supported.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID365/Mod/SS13/1			New access routes directly to the regional road network should not be provided. Omit link to A1237 which would stimulate its use as a dormitory village for areas other than York.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/Mod/SS13/2			New Garden Village settlements should be supported.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID373/Mod/SS13/1			Policy SS13 - ST15 site, key principles vii. ecological mitigation and compensation measures to be delivered 5 years prior to commencement of development. But elsewhere in document section 3.62 - development to commence 2022 i.e. less than 5 years away? xiii. states that It is essential that there is no vehicular transport access to Heslington village along current lanes (Common, Long, Langwith). But xv. provide dedicated secure access for local residents and landowners ( and should also say businesses). These two statements are contradictory and require re-wording. xiii needs the phrase "from the new village settlement added after "Heslington Village so It is essential that there is no vehicular transport access to Heslington village from the new village settlement along current lanes etc	Cllr Keith Aspden OBO Rose Hilton
SID374/MOD/SS13/1			The policy must be based on the full set of design principles for promoting sustainable travel, and include a much more challenging target for the proportion of journeys by sustainable modes.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/MOD/SS13/2			Policy SS13 should omit the reference to a new junction on the A64 (and be rejected if it is dependent on such a junction) and instead provide a high quality frequent bus services through the University to the site using a grade separated crossing of the A64, and a dedicated link to, or extension of, the Grimston Bar park and ride service	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID375/Mod/SS13/1			The proposed development ST15 is currently undeliverable unviable unsustainable and unacceptable ecologically. The developers have put forward a revised size and shape for the site which is deliverable viable sustainable and is ecologically friendly. With an increased size the developer would install a new junction on the A64 to service the site which would give less traffic on existing roads making less intrusion on existing properties.	Cllr Suzie Mercer
SID378/MOD/SS13/11			Table 5.1 ST15 - change site size to 204 ha and estimated yield to 4018	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/Mod/SS13/1			Main part of policy SS13 should be changed: "The development of Land West of Elvington Lane (ST15) supports the Local Plan vision in delivering a new sustainable garden village for York. It will delivery approximately 4,000 dwellings, around 2,400 units of which will be delivered within the plan period. In addition to complying with the policies within this Local Plan, the site must be delivered in accordance with the following key principles."	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/SS13/1			In order to make the Plan sound, it is necessary to increase the provision of suitable and deliverable sites, and of particular interest to LDP is the need to modify site allocation ST15.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/Mod/SS13/2			Change to iii "Be of a high design standard, and to reflect the existing settlement form of villages around the main urban area of York in-keeping with the existing urban form. The south eastern and south western boundaries of the site are less well contained than the north so it will be important for the site to establish its own landscape setting."	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/Mod/SS13/3			Point v: Impacts on biodiversity within the site and on land at OS10 zone of influence will be addressed by following the mitigation hierarchy with the overall aim being to prevent harm to existing biodiversity assets in the area, delivering no net loss for biodiversity and maximise further benefits for biodiversity through a net gain approach. Where required Loss compensatory measures such as habitat creation, enhancement and long-term management should take full account of the extent and quality of the asset being lost or damaged and equivalent or enhanced habitats should be provided.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/Mod/SS13/4			Point vi bullet 1: Incorporation of additional habitat within a new nature conservation area created principally to compensate for biodiversity impacts from the development (as shown on the policiesmap) including a buffer of wetland habitats, a barrier to the movement of people and domestic pets on to the SSSI and deliver further benefits for biodiversity. A buffer of at least 400m from the SSSI will be required in order to adequately mitigate impacts unless evidence demonstrates otherwise; and	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/Mod/SS13/5			Point vii: Deliver ecological mitigation and compensation measures both on and off-site prior to, or alongside, the commencement of any development. Prior to occupation of any development the compensatory measures must be available and suitable for use by wildlife as appropriate. They must be supported by a long term management plan, and be retained and monitored in perpetuity.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/Mod/SS13/6			Point x: Deliver new on-site education provision to meet nursery and , primary to be assessed based on generated need. New nursery and , primary and provision will be required to serve the earliest phases of development.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/Mod/SS13/7			Point xi: In consultation with the Council and Highways England as necessary, to ensure sustainable transport provision at the site is achievable. The impacts of the site individually and cumulatively with site's ST7, S78, ST9, ST14, ST27, ST35 and ST36 should be addressed.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/Mod/SS13/8			Point xii: Ensure provision of necessary transport infrastructure to access the site with primary access via the A64 (as shown on the proposals map) and a potential access via Elvington Lane. The capacity of the local highway network including Elvington Lane and junctions is limited.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/Mod/SS13/9			Point xv: Provide dedicated secure vehicular, cycle and pedestrian access for existing local residents and landowners to be agreed with the community of Heslington. Appropriate solutions would need to ensure access is preserved for existing residents and landowners developed in consultation with the community of Heslington.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/Mod/SS13/10			Point xviii: Exploit synergies with the proposed university expansion in terms of site servicing including transport (public and private), energy and waste.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID379/Mod/SS13/1			Steps should be taken to make B1228 (Elvington Lane) safer by prohibiting heavy vehicles from travelling through the village and by creating a roundabout at the Airfield junction.	Colin Packer
SID379/Mod/SS13/1			All efforts should be made to ensure Elvington and the ST15 site do not meet in order to maintain their separate historic identities.	Colin Packer
SID379/Mod/SS13/2			Elvington is dangerous for cyclists and therefore a cycling lane should be created from Elvington to York.	Colin Packer

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID381/Mod/SS13/1			In order to make the Plan sound the authority would need to either show conclusively that Elvington Airfield is not important for SPA birds or move the allocation to the east which would have the advantage of using an area of the airfield which is already hard standing so will have very little wildlife interest. Alternatively avoiding the airfield entirely and moving the allocation to the north with a large area of compensation habitat adjacent to the Tilmire SSSI. A full HRA should be provided for the York Plan.	Yorkshire Wildlife Trust - Sara Robin
SID383/Mod/SS13/1			Natural England notes that ST15 has been through a number of iterations with different boundaries and footprints and that a great deal of evidence has been gathered for different site boundaries but has not been made available publicly. We would encourage you to consider making the wider evidence base for this site available and clarify what evidence accords to which variation of the site. For instance we are unclear whether any assessment has been undertaken for the central segment of the allocation which is in a third party ownership and has not been involved in the earlier iterations of this allocation.	Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID385/MOD/SS13/1		Not Legally Compliant	ST15 - Land to the West of Elvington Lane/ Airfield - 3,300 dwellings. If a new garden village is required, this should be constructed in a location which preserves significant Green Belt to all 4 sides, in keeping with the character of other villages surrounding York. The current proposed development would merely become an extension to Elvington, spoiling the character of this historic village. The full length of Elvington Airfield should be retained for historical and economic / recreational uses. If ST15 is to be built, it should be further north, away from Elvington Airfield and closer to the A64, its primary access point, which separates it from Heslington. Agree that such proposals should include strategic plans for road transport to include a dedicated A64 junction and to ensure Elvington Lane and Grimston do not become further congested. Work on a new A64 junction should be completed before any development is allowed. A wider transport policy should also be included to improve public transport and cycling in the vicinity including surrounding villages (Elvington & Wheldrake). The development should also include suitable infrastructure (doctors, schools, public transport, shops) as the existing are already at capacity.	Giles Carter
SID389/Mod/SS13/1			In conclusion, ST15 as it was originally proposed alongside the A64 and adjacent to the proposed new junction would not cause any of the above issues.	Sandra Atkinson
SID390/Mod/SS13/1			With regards to ST15, this will need additional school buses to which every school is deemed suitable (currently Fulford School). In addition, the facilities at these schools to cope with additional school buses needs to be taken into consideration as both are currently at capacity. This is particularly important when looking to maintain the current school journey times below the current 60 minute maximum. ST15 is not big enough to support new commercial services, so needs to be linked to current routes.	Confederation of Passenger Transport UK (Andrew McGuinness) OBO York Quality Bus Partnership
SID409/Mod/SS13/1		Not Sound	Would be helpful if land was safeguarded for the provision of schools. Also including additional detail around when new schools will be needed to support the delivery of major housing allocations.	Education and Skills Funding Agency - John Pilgrim



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID412/Mod/SS13/1			ST15, if it is to be built at all, should be built far away from existing villages of Elvington and Wheldrake and away from the Airfield, runway, industrial estate and Yorkshire Air Musuem, where it was originally proposed.	Louisa Stevens
SID413/Mod/SS13/2 /1			The council should clearly identify and justify the number of hectares of green belt arable land which will be lost to infrastructure for ST15 in addition to 139 Hectares in OS10.	Richard Schofield
SID413/Mod/SS13/2 /2			The access for pedestrians and cyclists to ST15 should be alongside the proposed new vehicle access to the A64 with no access at all from ST15 onto Langwith Stray, Langwith Lane or Long Lane.	Richard Schofield
SID414/Mod/SS13/1			I wish to strongly oppose the local development plan for 3000 plus houses at the Elvington Lane area of the Elvington Airfield. This airfield is regularly used by sporting activities, air displays, the caravan club meetings, and various functions. The present situation in Elvington is becoming unsustainable.	Peter Newman
SID414/Mod/SS13/2			The infrastructure does not allow for further development. The main road through Elvington is narrow and has been severely damaged by HGV's, not to mention the danger it is putting on local residents.	Peter Newman
SID416/Mod/SS13/1			I wish to strongly oppose the local development plan for 3000 plus houses at the Elvington Lane area of the Elvington Airfield. This airfield is regularly used by sporting activities, air displays, the caravan club meetings, and various functions. The present situation in Elvington is becoming unsustainable.	Linda Newman
SID416/Mod/SS13/2			The infrastructure does not allow for further development. The main road through Elvington is narrow and has been severely damaged by HGV's, not to mention the danger it is putting on local residents.	Linda Newman
SID598/Mod/SS13/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST15 should be reduced to 900 units. We consider that this number of units is more realistic and achievable.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/Mod/SS13/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST15 should be reduced to 900 units. We consider that this number of units is more realistic and achievable.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID601/Mod/SS13/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST15 should be reduced to 900 units. We consider that this number of units is more realistic and achievable.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/Mod/SS13/1			We would suggest that the level of housing delivery in the plan period for ST15 should be reduced to 900 units. We consider that this number of units is more realistic and achievable.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID604/Mod/SS13/1			Whilst the Sustainability Appraisal considers the selected sites against each other it fails to reassess them against alternatives such as the dismissed urban extensions. This renders the plan unsound and that urban extensions in sustainable locations, such as the Land at North Field, should be reintroduced to help make up the expected delivery shortfalls against OAN noted throughout these representations and to increase flexibility and broaden choice.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID609/Mod/SS13/1			ST15 should made larger in order to fund a full range of community facilities to make it a self sufficient community.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID614/Mod/SS13(S T15)/1			We have previously objected to this allocation due to the impact on existing businesses at Elvington Airfield. Many of the businesses omit noise . SS13 has moved closed to the business park and proposed SS21. We suggest developers undertake noise and light assessments. Criterion (xi) refers to need to address all transport issues and cumulative impact f allocations. The list fails to include SS21 it should be added to this list. Also requirements are not consistent with other allocations such as surface water, drainage and archaeology? A review of each of the policies associated with this allocation should be carried out. Given the NPPF sets out how under para 17 how planning should seek a good standard of amenity for all existing and future occupants of land and buildings.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID825/Mod/SS13(S T15)/1			Site ought to be referred to as a 'new town' or 'new settlement', and not a 'Garden Village' - the sheer size precludes it from being a village. The scale of the proposal offers the chance to create a meaningful new stand alone community with all usual accepted facilities on site, whilst this should minimise traffic generation as far as possible, the cumulative impact has to be carefully managed with the other proposals in the Plan, should they reach fruition.	Osbalwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID848/Mod/SS13(S T15)/1			Support the need to develop greenbelt sites but have concerns regarding ST15 such as the isolated nature of development making it costly and complex to provide necessary infrastructure. To be truly sustainable the site would need to provide a secondary school and provide 5000-6000 should allow for higher housing numbers.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID850/Mod/SS13/1			Highways England have commented on the proposed development sites in our letter of 23rd October 2017 and note the proposed increase in housing and employment at York Central, and the reduction in housing at the Queen Elizabeth Barracks site. We welcome reference to the need for individual and cumulative traffic impact assessments for these sites. However, some of the strategic sites refer to the cumulative impact with other sites but not all the sites have a reciprocal reference about the individual and cumulative impact, for example ST15 should include reference to Sites ST7, ST8 and ST35.	Highways England
SID850/Mod/SS13/2			We welcome the inclusion of a dedicated public transport / cycle route linking the new settlement (ST15) to a suitable access on York's highway network in the urban centre of York (subject to confirmation of the developer's access proposals). The proposed Garden Village will have a primary access via the A64 with a secondary access via Elvington Lane. For this 'out of town' development to deliver an 'exemplar sustainable community' (Section 2, 2.5) including sustainable transport, we would like to see more clarity around proposed parking standards and plans for a suitably direct and attractive public transport link towards the University and York City Centre. This is supported by other statements in ED3, policy T1 14.5 and policy T2.	Highways England

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS14 Terry's Extension Sites

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID257/LC/SS14/1				ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/LC/SS14/1				ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/LC/SS14/2				ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd

#### Soundness

SID118/S/SS14/1	Sound	The Policy is sound overall with specified support for the following key principles: Terry's Extension Site (Phase1,2 and 3)		Historic England - Ian Smith
SID257/S/SS14(ST16 )/1	Not Sound	Fully support the proposed allocation of the former Terry's Car Park site (SS14/ST 16 – Site2) for housing but consideration should be given to extending this allocation to include the additional land to the south and east. This would require realignment of the GreenBelt boundary in this area to accommodate this additional site		ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/S/SS14/1	Not Sound	Fully support the proposed allocation of the former Terry's Car Park site (SS14/ST 16 – Site2) for housing but consideration should be given to extending this allocation to include the additional land to the south and east. This would require realignment of the GreenBelt boundary in this area to accommodate this additional site		ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS14 Terry's Extension Sites

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID257/S/SS14/2		Sound	Phase 2 - It is appreciated that the 'Site Capacity' of '33 dwellings' specified in the Site Assessment is a purely indicative figure and based on a standard methodology/density. Notwithstanding the indicative nature of this figure HBD take the view that the development of single or two storey houses at any density in this location, would look diminutive and out of place in the context of both the more 'massive' and imposing buildings on the main Terry's site and the more recently consented residential developments to the north of the site	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/S/SS14(ST16)/2		Not Sound	As such a Green Belt designation is not required on this land to check the unrestricted sprawl of large built-up areas; to prevent neighbouring towns merging into one another; nor to assist in safeguarding the countryside from encroachment.	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/S/SS14/3		Sound	Henry Boot Developments Ltd (HBD) would fully support the proposed allocation of the former Terry's Car Park site (ST 14 - Phase 3) for housing as part of the emerging York Local Plan	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/S/SS14/4		Sound	Phase 3 - HBD consider that the Indicative Site Capacity of 56 dwellings, identified in the Site Assessment is likely to underestimate the number of dwellings that could potentially be delivered on this site.	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/S/SS14/5		Not Sound	Henry Boot Developments would support the allocation of the three ST 16 Terry's Extension Sites (Phases 1, 2 & 3) as housing allocation under Policy H1 – and as listed in Table 5.1. As detailed in separate representations in relation to SS14 HBD would however seek a variation to the Estimated Yield (Dwellings) figures for both Phases 2 and 3 which they consider too low at 33 and 56 respectively.	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/S/SS14/6		Sound	Henry Boot Developments Ltd (HBD) would fully support the proposed allocation of the former Terry's Car Park site (ST 14 – Phase 2) for housing as part of the emerging York Local Plan.	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID604/S/SS14/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS14 Terry's Extension Sites

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID257/Mod/SS14(S T16)/1			Fully support the proposed allocation of the former Terry's Car Park site (SS14/ST 16 – Site2) for housing but consideration should be given to extending this allocation to include the additional land to the south and east. This would require realignment of the GreenBelt boundary in this area to accommodate this additional site	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/Mod/SS14/1			In relation to the Phase 2 Terry's Car Park Site the figure of 33 dwellings is predicated on the Council's expressed desire to secure a low profile development on this site. It is considered that, subject to detailed design proposals, development of a greater scale can be achieved on the car park site without compromising views of the Multi Storey Factory and Clock Tower from nearby public rights of way, nor resulting in a form of development that is prominent from the countryside to the south or the river to the east.	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID257/Mod/SS14/1			Phase 2 - HBD consider that development of three or perhaps even higher development would be appropriate and even necessary on the former car park site.	ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS15 Nestle South

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/SS15/1	Sound	Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID332/S/SS15/1			A previously developed site which should include a cross road link between Wigginton Road and Haxby Road.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe
SID406/S/SS15/1	Not Sound		Development principle iii) no mention of affordable housing provision. Inconsistent with other sites. More robust approach to sustainable transport should be adopted.	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)
SID591/S/SS15/1	Sound		In September 2017, Newby Developments obtained planning permission to convert the former factory buildings at Nestle South into 258 apartments. They have now obtained the remaining land to the west and are currently progressing a scheme to redevelop it for around 595 dwellings. This is consistent with proposed allocation (ST17) in the Local Plan. It is expected that the outline application will be submitted in May 2018, with the construction period running between 2020 and 2025. i.e. the first 1-10 years of the plan period. The estimated phasing is the only change that we would propose to the housing allocation	ONEILL Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Newby Developments
SID604/S/SS15/1	Not Sound		No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates

#### Proposed Modification

SID406/Mod/SS15/1			Development principle iii) as in reference provision of affordable housing. Add two development principles: ix) sustainable transport plan x) Site layout and walking and cycling routes should be designed to be more attractive than vehicular routes.	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)
-------------------	--	--	--	---

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS16 Land at Tadcaster Road, Copmanthorpe

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID53/LC/SS16/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	While being very supportive of the Local Plan's policy to define and defend the Green Belt to the west of Copmanthorpe I take issue with the number of dwellings per hectare proposed for both the development sites in Copmanthorpe (Tadcaster Road and Moor Lane). These densities are far above the current average density for the village and will mean the addition of many more new residents than the infrastructure can cope with. Doctors, school, roads and sewage systems are already at maximum.	Peter Whitfield
SID200/LC/SS16/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Kaite Betts
SID202/LC/SS16/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Darren Magson
SID291/LC/SS16/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Supports plan apart from housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe~ which are greater than the average density for the village, which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services~.	Derek Brown
SID293/LC/SS16/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Supports plan apart from housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe~ which are greater than the average density for the village, which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services~.	Graham Auton
SID294/LC/SS16/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Supports plan apart from housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe~ which are greater than the average density for the village, which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services~.	Jean Auton
SID299/LC/SS16/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Margaret Miller

#### Soundness

SID10/S/SS16/1		Not Sound	Copmanthorpe's infrastructure cannot accommodate another 100 homes, schools, roads and amenities are at capacity. The proposed site regularly floods and is a habitat for wildlife including deer, owls and birds. Oak trees on site are protected and believe the site to be in the greenbelt.	Laura Simpson
SID53/S/SS16/1		Not Sound	Too many new houses proposed for Copmanthorpe. Proposed housing density is too high and inconsistent with the current average density of the village. I would also take issue with the factthat the neighbouring village of Bishopthorpe has no new housing development proposed despite having many more suitable locations and as good, if not better, infrastructure.	Peter Whitfield



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS16 Land at Tadcaster Road, Copmanthorpe

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID88/S/SS16/1		Sound	Believes the plan to be sound. Only complaint is that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming over already over-stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Brian Bell
SID89/S/SS16/1		Sound	Believes the plan to be sound Only complaint is that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming over already over-stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Maxine Bell
SID118/S/SS16/1		Not Sound	The development of this site could harm a number of elements which contribute to the special character of the historic City. Firstly, this site is perceived as being very much a part of the swathe of open countryside to the south of the ring road.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS16/2			Secondly, the relationship of the historic City of York to the surrounding villages is one of the elements identified as contributing to the special character of York. This relationship relates to not simply the distance between the settlements but also the size of the villages themselves, and the fact that they are free-standing, clearly definable settlements.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID143/S/SS16/1		Not Sound	Site ST31 is green belt land. The field in questions one of the 3 remaining medieval sites in Copmanthorpe - York Field - and is listed as a site of special interest by the Copmanthorpe Parish Council. The Council made delivering a Local Plan that protects our green belt a priority. This field is adjacent to the Askham Bog site, which is nationally important, and development threatens this. The RSPB and Historic England have recommended the removal of this site to protect the bog from harm. There is a lot of wildlife in this area which will be impacted. This field should not be removed as it performs green belt functions.	Sarah Wickham
SID171/S/SS16/1		Sound	Believes the plan to be sound. Only complaint is that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming over already over-stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Megan Taylor
SID200/S/SS16/1			Satisfied that the documents are legally compliant. Would prefer that housing densities for two development sites in Copmanthorpe reduced to densities given in Policy CNP2 of Draft Neighbourhood Plan, due to them being greater than current average density for the village and would result in overwhelming of infrastructure and services	Kaite Betts

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS16 Land at Tadcaster Road, Copmanthorpe

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID202/S/SS16/1		Sound	In respect of Section 3, support and agreement with City of York Council's processes, procedures and justifications and satisfied it is legally compliant. Would prefer that housing densities for two development sites in Copmanthorpe reduced to densities given in Policy CNP2 of Draft Neighbourhood Plan, due to them being greater than current average density for the village and would result in overwhelming of infrastructure and services.	Darren Magson
SID273/S/SS16/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site ST31 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Margaret Thomas
SID278/S/SS16/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site ST31 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Gillian Hinton
SID291/S/SS16/1		Sound	Supports plan apart from housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe~ which are greater than the average density for the village, which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services~. Densities should be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Derek Brown
SID293/S/SS16/1		Sound	Supports plan apart from housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe~ which are greater than the average density for the village, which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services~. Densities should be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Graham Auton
SID294/S/SS16/1		Sound	Supports plan apart from housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe~ which are greater than the average density for the village, which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services~. Densities should be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Jean Auton
SID299/S/SS16/1			would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services be reduced to the CNP2 densities detailed in Policy of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Margaret Miller
SID301/S/SS16/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site ST31 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Copmanthorpe Parish Council - Diane Stones
SID302/S/SS16/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site ST31 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Jeffrey Clarke

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS16 Land at Tadcaster Road, Copmanthorpe

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID320/S/SS16/1		Not Sound	Feels the need to keep Moor Lane designated green belt land. It is near Askham Bog and any interference would cause damage to the ecosystem. Would add traffic to already congested area.	Jane Hopley
SID321/S/SS16/1		Not Sound	Feels the need to keep Moor Lane designated green belt land. It is near Askham Bog and any interference would cause damage to the ecosystem. Would add traffic to already congested area.	Kristen Everett
SID372/S/SS16/1		Sound	Gladman strongly support the identification of land at Tadcaster Road, Copmanthorpe for residential development It is available, achievable and deliverable and is capable of delivering up to 160 units, including a significant proportion of affordable dwellings. The site will contribute to the Council's 5-year housing land supply in the early part of the plan period. Copmanthorpe is a sustainable location for growth and has been identified as an area requiring new housing in both the emerging Local Plan and emerging Neighbourhood Plan. Included as Appendix 2 to this submission is an indicative landscape plan for this site. Gladman therefore welcome the opportunity to work alongside the City Council and the Neighbourhood Plan group to ensure the delivery of the site in line with the aspirations of the local community.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID598/S/SS16/1		Not Sound	Objects to the allocation of ST31. Reps for site 872 / ST12 and site 131 / ST13 both submitted under SID598 go into further detail on the history of the site but to summarise - ST31 serves an important green belt that prevents coalescence, a point the council has agreed with for a long time as demonstrated by the evidence base. Goes into further detail on nearby ecology, transport access etc. arguing ST12 / ST13 are better alternatives and ST31 should not have been allocated.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID604/S/SS16/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID10/Mod/SS16/1			Remove ST31 from plan, do not build houses in Copmanthorpe.	Laura Simpson
SID53/Mod/SS16/1			Reduce proposed housing density on the two development sites in Copmanthorpe (Tadcaster Road and Moor Lane) to a maximum of 25 per hectare.	Peter Whitfield
SID143/Mod/SS16/1			Proposed site ST31 should be removed from the plan.	Sarah Wickham

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS16 Land at Tadcaster Road, Copmanthorpe

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID299/Mod/SS16/1			would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services be reduced to the CNP2 densities detailed in Policy of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Margaret Miller
SID320/Mod/SS16/1			Keep green field land around moor lane as green belt.	Jane Hopley
SID321/Mod/SS16/1			Keep green field land around moor lane as green belt.	Kristen Everett
SID372/Mod/SS16/1			Notwithstanding the support for this site, Gladman object to the identification of the site to deliver 158 dwellings. Following detailed due diligence work, Gladman consider this site is capable of deliver up to 160 dwellings and recommend that Policy SS16 is amended to reflect this. With regards to clause i) Gladman recommend that instead of delivering a mix in accordance with the Council's most up to date SHMA this should be amended to state "a mix to be agreed with the Council prior to determination to reflect local needs and circumstances." Whilst Gladman note that the wording of clause ii) has been amended through this iteration of the CYLP Gladman recommend that further amendments should be made. Gladman recommend that this clause should be amended to state "...which should be delivered prior to occupation of the first phase of development..."	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID598/Mod/SS16/1			There is no exceptional circumstance to justify this development in the greenbelt and there are alternatives that will be less harmful (i.e. site 872 ST12 Manor Heath Copmanthorpe or site 131 ST13 Moor Lane Copmanthorpe - see SID600), ST31 should be deleted from the plan.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID844/Mod/SS16/1			I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Copmanthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Group - Diane Stones OBO

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS17 Hungate

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID380/S/SS17/1			The Hungate allocation of 328 dwellings should not be taken as a definitive figure and the policy wording should be amended to allow flexibility to deliver more homes on this site where appropriate.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/S/SS17/2			The current wording of Policy SS3 implies that the total capacity of ST32 is 328 dwellings. However, this actually reflects the approximate number of dwellings to be delivered in Phases 5 + as set out in Policy SS17. It is also unclear which elements of the Hungate scheme the 328 dwellings / phase 5+ relate to or how this figure has been calculated.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/S/SS17/3			The Plan, by its nature, should be forward thinking and should incorporate flexibility to allow potential scope for change in the future to respond to changes in policy and circumstance.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID604/S/SS17/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates

#### Proposed Modification

SID380/Mod/SS17/1			Update Policy SS17 to make clear that 328 dwellings is a minimum number.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/Mod/SS17/2			Provide clarification as to which elements of the Hungate scheme the 328 dwellings / phase 5+ relates to and how this figure has been calculated.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS17 Hungate

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID380/Mod/SS17/3			The wording 'must be delivered in accordance with the agreed site masterplan through existing outline and full planning consents' is omitted. The Plan should be forward thinking and should incorporate flexibility to allow potential scope for change in the future to respond to changes in policy and circumstance.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS18 Station Yard, Wheldrake

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID251/LC/SS18/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The inclusion of site ST33 is outside of the range of reasonable decisions by the authority. The plan is therefore not legally compliant and the authority has not complied with its duty to cooperate.	Samuel Greatorex
SID295/LC/SS18/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Robert Arnold
SID342/LC/SS18/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	We find the Plan fails to be legally compliant or sound with the inclusion of Policy SS18 as it conflicts with other polices such as the Housing and Employment ones and isn't consistent with NPPF Green Belt Policies and Test.	Andy Bell
SID354/LC/SS18/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Peter Vernon Vernon & Co

#### Soundness

SID34/S/SS18/1		Not Sound	Scale of development proposed here is inappropriate - infrastructure cannot cope, proximity to industrial estate is unlikely to comply with planning guidance, part of the site is on greenbelt land, previous proposals were rejected, proposed development would not enhance the special character / appearance of Wheldrake. The area of the proposed site to the south-west of the industrial estate and previously identified for expansion should be retained for that purpose.	David Randon
SID118/S/SS18/1		Sound	A small portion of this site adjoins the boundary of the Wheldrake Conservation Area. Therefore we welcome the requirement for development to conserve and enhance the special character and/ or appearance of the Conservation Area.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID176/S/SS18/1		Not Sound	1. It involves unjustified use of good quality agricultural land. 2. The village has insufficient services and infrastructure to accommodate such a significant population increase. 3. The choice of site does not promote sustainable transport. 4. It will limit potential expansion of Wheldrake Industrial Estate, hindering local economic growth and development.	Household of Blackberry Station House Dr Damian Mawer

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS18 Station Yard, Wheldrake

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID251/S/SS18/1		Not Sound	In summary, the proposal at ST33 will never be delivered to the size proposed. The cost of resolving issues identified and the additional costs of dealing with local objections will make a development of this size uneconomic. As a result it is not justified or effective to include a site which is already acknowledged as having significant issues which will inevitably result in it never being built to this size.	Samuel Greatorex
SID295/S/SS18/1		Not Sound	ST33 originally consisted of H49 which was mixed greenbelt and brownfield land, which was rejected as it failed to meet the requirements of the NPPF. The dwelling for ST33 fall within the green belt area. Wheldrake is already over subscribed.	Robert Arnold
SID342/S/SS18/1		Not Sound	We feel that this policy is inaccurate and deliberately omits relevant information to disguise the inappropriateness of the site and the failure to comply with the NPPF. The site has previously been known as H49. This too has always been rejected as it failed to meet the required criteria for access to services of the Sustainability Appraisal It was resubmitted in 2016 with a much smaller/clearer development site boundary (3.8ha) It would have still failed the same Sustainability Appraisal tests but would have drawn further attention to the inappropriateness as the density is way above the recognised 35dph over 70% of the development area for rural/village locations as per Policy H2. We assume the failures above resulted in a different approach needing to be taken and so the site was increased to 6ha by removing land that was earmarked for employment (E7) and including part of the Industrial Estate. Wheldrake is one of furthest lying villages from the centre of York, it is therefore unlikely that any cycle integration with York from this site would occur. The site would impact on the Conservation area From the references to historical evidence and the other comments we have made so far, along with the applicants own documentation siting this as within the Green Belt, it should be evident that this site is Grade 2 Agricultural Land situated within the Green Belt and therefore as supported by the previous Planning Inspectors report does provide Green Belt purpose as it:- checks the unrestricted sprawl of a large built-up area, assists in safeguarding the countryside from encroachment, preserves the setting and special character of historic towns. The special character of York also stems from its relationship with the surrounding countryside which contains a number of attractive villages. We also conclude that the site cannot demonstrate any exceptions to be developed and as a result does not demonstrate any 'Very Special Circumstances.	Andy Bell
SID354/S/SS18/1		Not Sound	The plan does not correctly identify the actual site boundary of the proposed allocation at ST33(specifically at the area adjacent to the site entrance) and needs amending. We attach a copy of the relevant title plan of this part of the site.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID369/S/SS18 (ST33)/1		Not Sound	Concerns about oversubscription in school places. Heard representations from residents who generally support the development but not at the current level of housing. Congestion on the A19 at rush hour is already a significant issue for villagers and 147 extra properties will only exacerbate this problem.	Julian Sturdy MP



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS18 Station Yard, Wheldrake

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID375/S/SS18/1		Not Sound	Following a consultation with villagers there is an overwhelming objection to the size and scale of the proposed development at ST33. that would place an unacceptable and unjustifiable pressure on the current infrastructure and services including the local school. The proximity to the development to the industrial estate is also an issue. A planning application for part of ST 33 nearest the industrial estate has been rejected in the past for reasons of potential noise and other impacts to adjacent properties. A significant proportion of ST33 is located on good quality agricultural land and also on green belt. During the draft green belt boundary review proposals to remove the green field, part of the area, was rejected.	Cllr Suzie Mercer
SID598/S/SS18/1		Not Sound	Objects to allocation of ST33 for housing. Rep for site 926 (formerly H28) North Lane Wheldrake submitted under SID598 goes into more detail but to summarise - takes issue with site selection methodology, lack of HRA and pollution from nearby Industrial Estate. The site has no defensible green belt boundary to the south-west, should not have been allocated.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID604/S/SS18/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates

### Proposed Modification

SID176/Mod/SS18/1			Rather than develop site SS18 we propose incorporating the additional dwellings in to site SS13 (Land West of Elvington Lane). Located just two miles from Wheldrake this 'garden' village site is already projected to deliver more than 3,300 homes. Is already going to include infrastructure so would avoid negative impact and stop development on greenfield land. If the City of York Council can provide clear justification for a site in Wheldrake, we would propose limiting development to the original Station Yard part of SS18. This is brownfield land, the northern edge of which already has new houses on	Household of Blackberry Station House Dr Damian Mawer
SID251/Mod/SS18/1			*Reduce scale of site ST33 to 25-30 dwellings and move remaining to the garden village.*25-30 could be built at marginal increase in facilities, beyond this the cost of resolving amenities Q21issues will cause the development economics to be undermined.	Samuel Greatorex
SID295/Mod/SS18/1			Extend the scope and size of garden village st15 to the west of the adjacent village of elvington to eliminate need for increasing dwellings in elvington and wheldrake.	Robert Arnold

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS18 Station Yard, Wheldrake

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID342/Mod/SS18/1			Remove the entire SS18 policy from the plan, re-instate the Employment site E7 (also see our part B with regard to E8) which also supports the E7 being re-instated. We acknowledge that development is required across York but feel there are 2 other reasonable options that should be considered first. Increase the number of dwellings on the SS13/ST15 which the comments from the ST15 developer made makes that site more viable and supports the absorption of SS18/ST33. In addition to this we believe it could open opportunities for the people of Wheldrake to access new facilities at this site such as the proposed bus terminal and make York, in particular the University, York Sport and Fulford Secondary School accessible by cycle. If this is not an option and development must take place in Wheldrake, then we reluctantly request H28 be re-instated in place of SS18/ST33, although many of the points we have raised are relevant to this site, the lower number of dwellings means the impacts would be lessened and the Planning Inspector found this site to have no Green Belt purpose given it has existing residential properties on 3 of the 4 sides of the site. Historically, H28 has always been allocated in previous York Local Plan's, it was only removed from this one after suddenly developing a technical issue which has since been resolved and was resubmitted and endorsed by the York Planning officers but CYC were not prepared to reconsider due to the threat of having Central Government intervening.	Andy Bell
SID354/Mod/SS18/1			The site boundary of proposed allocation ST33 needs changing. We attach a copy of the relevant title plan of this part of the site.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID375/Mod/SS18/1			The current Plan should reference and include as part of its evidence base the CYC Draft Local Plan 2005 that was approved and formerly adopted for DC purposes along with the Draft Green Belt Local Plan and the inspectors report from the York Green Belt Public Inquiry. Once this has been included all sites that conflict with the already detailed sections of the Outer Green belt boundaries should be removed from the Plan.	Cllr Suzie Mercer
SID598/Mod/SS18/1			ST33 should be removed from the plan and replaced by Site 926 - (formerly H28) North Lane, Wheldrake.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID381/LC/SS19/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Allocation ST35 Queen Elizabeth Barracks at Strensall does not yet have sufficient background information available to ensure that there will not be an impact on the Strensall Common SAC.	Yorkshire Wildlife Trust - Sara Robin
SID383/LC/SS19/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID383/LC/SS19/2	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID581/LC/SS19/1		Not Legally Compliant		How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP

#### Soundness

SID16/S/SS19/1		Not Sound	Plan will not be effective as meeting the housing target relies too heavily on windfall sites and over-development at York Central.	Ruth Potter
SID21/S/SS19/1		Not Sound	Does support development on this site and on the neighbouring land, in contrast to ST9 it is a logical choice with good access to the A1237 and A64.	Ray McDonogh
SID25/S/SS19/1		Sound	Would like to see Strensall Barracks developed for housing.	Roger Dickinson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID99/S/SS19/1		Sound	Strensall with Towthorpe Parish Council supports the reduction in number of dwellings from 578 to 500 but is concerned this reduction may also reduce the money that is available for necessary infrastructure improvements. Policy SS19 and the explanations 3.77 and 3.83 are supported now that consideration to the use of Towthorpe Moor Lane as a principal exit route has been identified and the need to improve the Strensall Rd/Towthorpe Moor Lane junction. There is also some concern that clause ix) does not fully address the issues concerning foul sewage and the obsolescence of the existing Severn Trent facility. The Council is concerned that clause xiv) does not specifically address the need to address potential issues at the A64/Towthorpe Moor Lane junction, though these may be addressed by the proposed dualling of the A64 should it proceed. Welcomes open space on site, protection of trees and preservation of military identity. Supports full ecological assessment in relation to Strensall Common, new school with some retail and the suggestion that an entirely new drainage system is installed.	Strensall with Towthorpe PC - Fiona Hill
SID99/S/SS19/2		Sound	Strensall with Towthorpe Parish Council agrees existing cycle routes are unsafe and that a dedicated off road cycle route is required. Considers that a major junction improvement at the A64/Towthorpe Moor Lane junction is absolutely essential to the success of this development. Considers that a major upgrading of the Towthorpe Moor Lane/Strensall Rd/Towthorpe Rd junction will be needed. Agrees that no access to the site should be by the northern section of Scott Moncrieff Rd. An access will be required to The Army Cadets Building at the east of the site, which is in separate ownership. The Council strongly opposes this access being taken off the northern part of Scott Moncrieff Rd. The Council considers that the Southern part of Scott Moncrieff Rd, should be developed as one of the major accesses to the site and suggest that any minor harm to this least sensitive area of Strensall Common will be offset by a major reduction of traffic on Strensall Rd. However, a weight /access only restriction may be required to prevent commercial vehicular use. Before any development of this site is approved, it will be necessary for Parliament to amend or repeal the Strensall Common Act 1884. It may also be necessary to carry out a detailed survey of the site to ensure that the development limit of 250 acres set in that Act is not exceeded, unless the Act is amended to alter this. The future of the ranges is currently uncertain. If they are retained, it is highly likely that the Army will need to retain some accommodation on the site. This would reduce the developable area and the number of dwellings. There would also be security considerations to be addressed if munitions are to be stored on the site.	Strensall with Towthorpe PC - Fiona Hill
SID99/S/SS19/3		Sound	Sites 917 -921 inclusive/H59 These sites lie within the broader area of the Queen Elizabeth 2 Barracks site, but outside the secure area. The Council considers that these could be developed before the final closure of the Barracks. The Council is pleased to see allocation of site H59 in years 1-5 of the plan. Reason: to provide much needed low cost/social housing in Strensall at the earliest possible date.	Strensall with Towthorpe PC - Fiona Hill
SID118/S/SS19/1		Sound	Support for this Policy.	Historic England - Ian Smith

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID123/S/SS19/1		Sound	The proposed development of the army barracks at Strensall would inevitably lead to a considerable increase in the volume of traffic passing through Earswick village. The Parish Council is prepared to work closely with the City of York Council and potential developers to identify measures to mitigate against any such increase in traffic flows.	Earswick Parish Council - Joanne Fisher
SID135/S/SS19/1		Sound	Approves use of brownfield site. Suggest improving access to common and making it a public amenity. As there will be an increase in traffic suggests changing the crossroads on the Strensall to York road at Towthorpe to a roundabout.	S Perkin
SID182/S/SS19/1		Not Sound	The text to ST35 in Policy SS19 informs the site is to be disposed of in 2021 but is not without challenges. The site lies adjacent to a SSSI and requires a sensitive approach to development. The text informs the site is remote from existing services such that the 578 dwellings will need to deliver a retail shop and a primary school. Both of these will impact upon the sites' viability.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID318/S/SS19/1			Supports SS19 use of ST35. Concerns over future management of Strensall Common as identified in clauses i, ii and iii. Supports clauses iv,v, vi, vii and viii. Concern with clause ix that it does not reflect current foul drainage system. Clause x : insufficient sports facilities. Supports Clauses xi, xii, xiv, xv and xvi.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/SS19/1		Not Sound	MOD support the allocation of site ST35 and confirm their commitment to dispose of and deliver the site post 2021 in the timescales of the Local Plan. Consider that these sites are important for Local Plan housing delivery in context of the current housing target. Masterplanning work submitted to support 650 dwellings. Concept plan in Appendix 2. Object to current capacity in the plan at 500 homes as this would not make most of effective use of previously developed land. Site would include 605 dwellings plus 45 at H59. Object to errata addendum to amend housing figure to 500 dwelling. Can incorporate existing facilities. Masterplan aims to retain existing openspace.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/2		Not Sound	The MOD raise serious concerns in relation to proposed reduction of dwellings in ST35 which they consider is not evidence based and will affect viability of site delivery. This is particularly related to the increase in openspace to be delivered on site.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/S/SS19/3		Not Sound	Concern over inner Green Belt boundary affecting ST35	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/4		Not Sound	DIO query the policy requirement for “repeatable surveys”, this requirement is open ended and needs to be amended to clarify the quantity and extent of surveys required. Also, In relation to “ensuring no access throughout the life of the development to adjoining land on the north, south and eastern site boundary.” The extent of these restrictions will depend on the outcomes emerging from the VIMS, and is therefore, at this stage, considered too restrictive and premature. There is no safeguard proposed for how this will be enforced. Should take into consideration the outcomes of the DIO's HRA.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/4		Not Sound	HRA supplied post Reg 18 consultation satisfies concerns in relation to habitats and ecology at ST35 as a result of air quality, recreational pressure and hydrology. This includes information for recreational strategy and mitigation alleviate concerns relating these issues. It is considered that this accords with mitigating effects on healthland sites. Habitat management confirmed to remain as MOD and Yorkshire Wildlife Trust so opportunities to contribute to the conservation objectives through provision of enhanced / alternative access points. Concept masterplan sets out greenspace suitable for range of users. Support for explanatory text in para 3.84 regarding biodiversity.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/5		Not Sound	Linking implementation of measures to ‘commencement’ of development is not appropriate; linking this to ‘occupation’ i.e. When people move in is a more reasonable approach (point iii in policy SS19)	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/6		Not Sound	Point v. Of the policy should be amended because otherwise would prioritise the retention of buildings of limited heritage significance and could give rise to a situation where otherwise appropriate development would be precluded or the development potential of the site not fully realised. It is therefore suggested that the policy wording be amended (SID345/MOD/SS19/7). Policy should acknowledge the potential for mitigation at the loss of buildings of limited significance through agreed programme of recording. Acknowledge that this site contributes to importance of military history of York. See also masterplanning proposals which are considered to take this into account. Viability could be considered in the policy and therefore needs some flexibility. Support accompany explanatory para 3.83. Also notified that Heritage statement produced wherein concluded that buildings are medium to low significance.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/S/SS19/7		Sound	Point Vii is considered sound. A tree survey and constraints report has informed the masterplan.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/8		Sound	Point viii is considered sound. DIO acknowledge requirement for archaeological evidence. Support explanatory para 3.85.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/9		Sound	Point ix is considered sound. DIO have produced a flood risk report. To support concept masterplan for 605 dwellings. Through appropriate mitigation any constraints are considered to be able to be overcome.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/10		Not Sound	Point X. DIO objects to the proposed "50:50 ratio" of open space and residential development area. This appears to be an ad hoc requirement, not justified. There needs to be a proven link supported by an appropriate evidence base between the amount/quality of open space provided within the site and the perceived reduction in recreational pressure on Strensall Common. The proposed concept masterplan has been informed by ecological advice, and areas of the Strensall Common SAC have been omitted from the masterplan, and open space provision has been included within the site, including some on the eastern boundary of the site in order to be policy compliant. As such DIO opposes any further increase in open space provision and reduction of site capacity for development unless evidence is produced which demonstrates the provision of additional open space is necessary and likely to be effective in order to mitigate impacts on Strensall Common as a result of the redevelopment of the site.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/11		Sound	Point xi is sound. DIO committed to provision of ancillary retail in masterplan. Clarity required on types.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/12		Sound	Point xii is sound. DIO committed to provision of primary school in masterplan. Support explanatory text in para 3.87. community facilities subject to viability and demand.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/S/SS19/13		Sound	Transport points (xiii-xv) in policy SS19 are sound . Transport appraisal produced ; See Appendix 6 for more information. Support for explanatory para 3.88 subject to viability and demand considerations of bus route.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/14		Sound	Support flood risk expanaotry paragpah 3.86. DIO has produced an accopnaying flood risk appraisal to support development which identifies that surface wate rand rainage issues can be overcome with appropriate mitigation and design	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID369/S/SS19 (ST35)/1		Sound	Pleased the proposed housing number on this site has been reduced from 578 to 500. Welcome the proposal of a new primary school to support residents of the development. Concern about the increased traffic on Strensall Road at the Towthorpe junction must be considered when deciding on access to the development, particularly whether access to the site from Towthorpe Moor Lane may reduce extra pressure on the junction and thus move traffic away from the village. This development must be able to foster a genuine and distinct community whilst also reflecting the deep military history at the site. Local amenities and open space should be supported so the development reflects the community in surrounding villages. Local amenity must be protected, particularly the mature trees from the Strensall Road and Towthorpe junction into the village. Local amenity must be protected, particularly the mature trees from the Strensall Road and Towthorpe junction into the village. Pleased a Flood Risk Assessment and full drainage strategy has been pledged.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID374/S/SS19/1		Not Sound	These developments between them risk adding significantly to vehicular traffic and congestion on York's road network. None of them adheres fully even to the design principles for new developments specified in Policy T1; Policies SS11, 19 and 21 make no reference at all to public transport provision. The others propose a target of 15% of journeys by public transport; no evidence is offered to justify that target; nor is any target offered for walking and cycling. As we have noted elsewhere, the design principles in Policy T1 are necessary but not sufficient. Three of the sites, under Policies SS12, 13 and 22, propose direct links to the outer ring road. There is ample evidence that such provision promotes the development of dormitory villages for commuters to remote employment areas,	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID381/S/SS19/1		Not Sound	The allocation of this site without sufficient information on the potential impacts of increased disturbance and on the hydrology of the site would be contrary to the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2017.	Yorkshire Wildlife Trust - Sara Robin
SID581/S/SS19/1		Not Sound	Given the lack of robust evidence and, in relation to the legal certainty required by the Habitats Regulations with respect to European designated sites, it is considered that the Policy SS19 (ST35 Queen Elizabeth Barracks) is unsound and the Council should invoke the precautionary principle due to the lack of scientific evidence to inform the likelihood of significant effects.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/SS19/1		Not Sound	ST35 lies adjacent to a SSSI and requires a sensitive approach. The text informs the site is remote from existing services such that the 578 dwellings will need to deliver a retail shop and a primary school. Both of these will impact upon the sites' viability.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/SS19 (ST35)/1			ST35 lies adjacent to a SSSI and requires a sensitive approach. The text informs the site is remote from existing services such that the 578 dwellings will need to deliver a retail shop and a primary school. Both of these will impact upon the sites' viability.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/SS19(ST35)/1			This site is listed as available in the medium term and disposal is programmed for 2021 however delivery is not immediate or certain, t Redrow and Linden homes believe that the proximity of the SSSI and the need to provide retail and school provision for this remote site will cause viability issues.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/SS19(ST35)/1		Not Sound	Site is operational, and proposals to dispose are not immediate or certain. Site is to be disposed of in 2021, but is not without challenges. Site lies in a sensitive location adjacent to an SSSI. The need to deliver a retail shop and primary school will impact on the site's viability.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID604/S/SS19/1		Not Sound	DIO sites remain operational until Queen Elizabeth Barracks (QEB) and Imphal Barracks (IB) are vacated by existing users	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID848/S/SS19(ST35)/1			This site is listed as available in the medium term and disposal is programmed for 2021 however delivery is not immediate or certain, t Redrow and Linden homes believe that the proximity of the SSSI and the need to provide retail and school provision for this remote site will cause viability issues.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

**Proposed Modification**

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID135/Mod/SS19/1			Approves use of brownfield site. Suggest improving access to common and making it a public amenity. As there will be an increase in traffic suggests changing the crossroads on the Strensall to York road at Towthorpe to a roundabout.	S Perkin
SID154/Mod/SS19/1			IT ISESENTIAL that either a separate road would need to be built to join the A64 North of the HopgroveRoundabout or that the road from Towthorpe to the A64 be utilised.	Steve Clipston
SID174/Mod/SS19/1			With INEOS planning to start seismic testing in a couple of months in Strensall with a view to drilling and fracking for shale gas in this area and the future of the Barracks not confirmed ST35 andH59 are not sound and legally compliant. The land may not be available or may be within the proposed 500m buffer zone expected to be authorised in the JWMP. I therefore think that this housing should not be included in the plan.	Susan Turner
SID318/Mod/SS19/1			Clause xiii should be amended so that the existing MOD road is retained and enhanced.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/MOD/SS19/1			Amend boundary to reflect submitted boundary in Figure 1 in Appendix 4. Should also omit OS12 (in policy GI6).	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS19/2			Amend opening para:Following the Defence Infrastructure Organisation’s disposal of the site by 2021, Queen Elizabeth Barracks (ST35) will deliver 500 up to605 dwellings at this rural previously developed development site.Development is anticipated to commence in from 2023 2021.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS19/3			Amend for clarity:i. “The mitigation hierarchy should be followed to ensure no net lossof biodiversity; where possible development should deliverbiodiversity gain. Development will only be allowed where it canbe demonstrated that it will not have a n significant adverseimpact, alone or in combination, upon the integrity of StrensallCommon SAC and SSSI.”	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/MOD/SS19/4			DIO proposes amending 'on Strensall Common "encourage" behaviour' as it will not be in DIO's gift to "ensure" certain types of behaviour by the public are adopted, albeit specific measures such as limiting access points can modify behaviours of potential visitors. Specifically:ii.....To help deliver this, a detailed Visitor Impact Mitigation Strategy must be prepared, which will be informed by comprehensive and repeatable visitor surveys (to be repeated as to inform a planning application).On Strensall Common ensure encourage suitable behaviourby visitors by:	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS19/5			DIO recommend that any further work on the development of theVIMS, and subsequent determination of open space requirements,should not be restricted to a specific area or ratio, as the proposedmasterplan of 650 dwellings shows how an alternative approach of65/35 development/open space ratio can be positively applied tothe site (this is over the combined ST35 and H59 allocations withinSS19), rather than reducing the capacity to the 545 dwellings on a50/50 ratio, as suggested in the revised policy requirement,	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS19/6			Text changes proposed by DIO as follows:iii. "Ensure all ecological avoidance, mitigation and compensation measures are fully operational and functioning prior to commencement occupation of any development.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS19/7			Policy should acknowlegde the potential for mitigation at the loss of buildings of limited signficance through agreed programme of recording and for viability reasons. Text changes proposed by DIO as follows:v. "The development of this area must be informed by an assessment of architectural interest of the site and its buildings.Those buildings which are considered to be of particular historicinterest should be retained and reused where appropriate and viable reuse within the context of a coherent residential development scheme can be achieved supported by aprogramme of recording of the buildings reused or demolisheddepending on the degree of historic significance."See also concept masterplan (appendix 2).	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS19/8			Other factors such as development viability and effective use of the site need to be taken into account, hence the insertion of the words 'as far as practicable' to facilitate flexibility and ensure that there is no unreasonable restriction on development.Text changes proposed by DIO as follows:vi. Be of a high design standard, ensuring the development has adistinct identity from Strensall village and not be just acontinuation of the existing development. The site should have its own identity and character that in its layout and spaces, reflects as far as practicable the site's long use as a barracks, itslandscape context, and the natural site assets.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS19/9			DIO objects to the proposed "50:50 ratio" of open space and residential development area. This appears to be anad hoc requirement, not justified. There needs to be a proven link supported by an appropriate evidence base between the amount/quality of open space provided within the site and the perceived reduction in recreational pressure on Strensall Common.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/MOD/SS19/10			DIO seeks clarification in relation to the reference that an assessment is required in relation to the military training area, and requests clarity to confirm that a 'noise assessment' only is sought in this context. Text changes proposed by DIO as follows: xvi. Undertake detailed noise and contamination assessments, including detailed assessment of the current and future use of the military training area, in relation to noise, adjacent to the site.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID364/Mod/SS19/1			Should extend current bus service and construct new station at Strensall.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/SS19/1			Should extend current bus service and construct new station at Strensall.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/MOD/SS19/1			The policy must be based on the full set of design principles for promoting sustainable travel, and include a much more challenging target for the proportion of journeys by sustainable modes. Policy SS19 should commit to extending the current bus service to the site and to a new station at Strensall, and the provision of a high frequency service there	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID381/Mod/SS19/1			More baseline data on visitors and disturbance to the SAC and ecological data. More information on potential hydrology impacts. This will mean there is sufficient information for an Appropriate Assessment of the site. A full HRA report for the York allocations would also give confidence that the plan was sound.	Yorkshire Wildlife Trust - Sara Robin
SID850/Mod/SS19/1			Highways England have commented on the proposed development sites in our letter of 23rd October 2017 and note the proposed increase in housing and employment at York Central, and the reduction in housing at the Queen Elizabeth Barracks site. We welcome reference to the need for individual and cumulative traffic impact assessments for these sites. However, some of the strategic sites refer to the cumulative impact with other sites but not all the sites have a reciprocal reference about the individual and cumulative impact, for example ST35 should include reference to Sites ST7, ST8 and ST15.	Highways England

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS20 Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID233/LC/SS20/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Green Party
SID397/LC/SS1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Naomi Smith
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/SS20/1		Not Sound	The starting point for any development of this site must be a better understanding of significance of this site and its buildings. Although many of the buildings have been altered in the hundred or so years since their construction, nevertheless, it may well be the case that several of the buildings are of national importance.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS20/2			Support for Paragraph 3.90. We welcome the intention to should undertake a review of Imphal Barracks to ascertain whether it is of sufficient architectural or historic interest that it should be included within the Fulford Road Conservation Area.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID182/S/SS20/1			Site ST36 in Policy SS20 is uncertain given it will not be released until 2031 and development unlikely to commence until 2033, the end of the Council's housing delivery period. The text in Policy SS20 and supporting paragraphs references a raft of heritage concerns which may impact on the quantum of delivery from the site; this will be the case should many of the existing buildings need to be retained.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID231/S/SS20/2		Not Sound	notes that development is unlikely to start before the end of the plan period. In these circumstances and in line with paragraph 47 of the NPPF, the site should not be allocated in this Plan, but should be considered at the next review in potentially about five years time. This would still allow adequate opportunity for appropriate policies to be put in place to ensure its timely redevelopment.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID233/S/SS20/1		Not Sound	Prior to allocating this site for housing, no assessment was made on the viability of the site for re-use as employment land. The council simply used the land for housing as an opportunity to reduce the amount of Green Belt land taken for housing. In addition, Route 5, A19 inbound (the arterial road serving the site), is forecast to show the largest increase in morning traffic delay and there are no additional bus priority measures planned.	York Green Party

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS20 Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/S/SS20/1		Not Sound	MOD support the allocation of site ST36 and confirm their commitment to dispose of and deliver the site post 2031 in the timescales of the Local Plan. Consider that these sites are important for Local Plan housing delivery in context of the current housing target. Masterplanning work submitted to support up to 769 dwellings. Concept plan in Appendix 2. Can also incorporate any existing facilities. Masterplan incorporates existing open space.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/2		Not Sound	The MOD are concerned that changes to the extent of Fulford Road Conservation area will affect the capacity of ST36. In considering the military barracks, need a balance of historic interest against viability and suitability of conversion	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/3		Not Sound	Concern over inner Green Belt boundary affecting ST36	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/4		Not Sound	DIO notes that 2031 is DIO/MOD's current disposal date, with potential for commencement of development in this year or possibly earlier. Commencement of development is therefore likely to take place before the end of the plan period.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/5		Sound	Point i - DIO produced a Transport Appraisal for IB in December 2017 and the report concluded that "in principle, there are no overriding reasons, from a transportation perspective, that could prevent this site from being redeveloped and thus being allocated for residential development within the emerging City of York Local Plan	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/6		Sound	Point ii - DIO consider this point sound.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS20 Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/S/SS20/4		Not Sound	Point iii and iv - DIO acknowledges the need for an assessment on the historic interest of the buildings on the site to inform redevelopment of the site. DIO seeks however additional wording to emphasise that a balanced planning consideration needs to be made when considering whether to retain or demolish existing buildings on the site as not all of the buildings are of architectural or 'historic interest' and may not be reasonably capable of retention and re-use due to poor condition, difficulties in conversion, due to poor functionality and abnormally high conversion costs which will adversely impact on development viability. masterplanning has tried to take account of heritage significance.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/8		Not Sound	The proposed addition of subsection v) appears to be superfluous, as this is a direct restatement of the existing statutory provisions regarding development within conservation areas and it is proposed that this should be deleted.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/9		Sound	vi- considered sound.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/10			DIO consider point viii- xiv sound. Evidence produced for water quality and flood risk detailed impacts can be avoided (see appendix 7). Acknowledge need for archaeological assessment. Would like: xiv -further clarification in relation to primary school provision xii - clarification as to facilities as this should be based on demand and viability.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/11		Not Sound	Para 3.90 - Whilst DIO fully supports working with Historic England in developing a masterplan for the site, the recommendation to use Historic England's enhanced advice service is seen as premature and is not necessarily appropriate as Non Departmental Public Bodies (NDPB) procedures are prone to change and the Local Plan is not the appropriate vehicle to recommend this type of paid-for service from another public body. DIO comments on the potential to extend Fulford Road Conservation Area and the caveats required have been articulated in the response to Policy SS20 criterion v.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/12		Sound	DIO support supporting explanatory text paras 391-3.92, 3.94. Masterplan informed by tree survey.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS20 Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/S/SS20/13		Not Sound	Walmgate Stray is neither a SAC/SPA or SSSI and hence assessment of effects would not require a HRA. The CYC HRA of the Plan does not indicate HRA is required in respect of the Imphal site, therefore DIO invites CYC to delete reference to the need for a HRA.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID397/S/SS1/1		Not Sound	The document is not positively prepared, justified or effective because glaring errors, causing massive issues in Fulford are being over looked constantly by the City of York Council and Permission. Planning applications are constantly changing to suit the building company and lack of local consultation is continuous. Tress and open spaces are being destroyed and aren't in compliance with the agreed planning applications. The promises of flood free areas and reduced traffic are already, clearly lies. Neither will discuss the issues with the local people.	Naomi Smith
SID582/S/SS20/1		Not Sound	The text in Policy SS20 and supporting paragraphs reference a raft of heritage concerns which may impact on the quantum of delivery from the site. ST36 lacks certainty such that it should not be an allocated site.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/SS20 (ST36)/1			The text in Policy SS20 and supporting paragraphs reference a raft of heritage concerns which may impact on the quantum of delivery from the site. ST36 lacks certainty such that it should not be an allocated site.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/SS20(ST36)/1			Site is operational, and proposals to dispose are not immediate or certain. Site is to be disposed of in 2021, but is not without challenges. Site lies in a sensitive location adjacent to an SSSI. The need to deliver a retail shop and primary school will impact on the site's viability.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/SS20(ST36)/1		Not Sound	Site is operational, and proposals to dispose are not immediate or certain. Site is to be disposed of by 2031, with development unlikely before 2033. Policy notes heritage concerns which may impact on deliverability.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS20 Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID604/S/SS20/1		Not Sound	No comment	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID848/S/SS20(ST36)/1			Site is operational, and proposals to dispose are not immediate or certain. Site is to be disposed of in 2021, but is not without challenges. Site lies in a sensitive location adjacent to an SSSI. The need to deliver a retail shop and primary school will impact on the site's viability.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

### Proposed Modification

SID233/Mod/SS20/1			SS20 Must be reviewed to consider whether it is viable for conversion to housing and whether the allocated number of dwellings is appropriate for the site. Provision for 'home working' and smallbusiness start up should be incorporated within the design.	York Green Party
SID345/MOD/SS20/1			Amend boundary to reflect submitted boundary in Figure 1 in Appendix 5.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS20/2			Text changes proposed by DIO to Policy SS20 as follows:Development is not anticipated to commence until the end of the plan period2031, 2 years prior to the end of the plan period.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS20/3			Text change suggested by DIO for policy SS20:iii. The development of this area must be informed by an assessment of architectural and historic interest of the site and its buildings. Those buildings which are considered to be of particular historic interest should be retained and reused, subject to considerations of building condition, potential for functional conversion and financial viability.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS20/4			DIO request to delete point v. The proposed addition of subsection v) appears to be superfluous, as this is a direct restatement of the existing statutory provisions regarding development within conservation areas and it is proposedthat this should be deleted.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS20 Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/MOD/SS20/5			this is a fairly nebulous policy and further clarification is sought from CYC over the exact meaning and practical implementation of this policy.: DIO suggest following text change:vii. Be of a high design standard, ensuring the development reflects the history of the site and its previous military use, as far as practicable	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS20/6			Walmgate Stray is neither a SAC/SPA or SSSI and hence assessment of effects would not require a HRA. The CYC HRA of the Plan does not indicate HRA is required in respect of the Imphal site, therefore DIO invites CYC to delete reference to the need for a HRA. Text changes proposed by DIO for para 3.93 as follows:3.93 This site has limited biodiversity interestThe area and adjacent surrounds are also incredibly wet which contributes to the value of the UK priority habitat grassland on Walmgate stray and any changes to hydrology need to consider the impact on this. A Habitat Regulations Assessment will be required to accompany any proposals for this site.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID584/Mod/SS20(S T36)/1			Site is operational, and proposals to dispose are not immediate or certain. Site is to be disposed of by 2031, with development unlikely before 2033. Policy notes heritage concerns which may impact on deliverability.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/SS20(S T36)/1			It is our opinion that site ST36 lacks certainty such that it should not be an allocated site. In making this suggestion to remove this site there is a recognition the site could be developed in time but that could be for a later review of the Plan.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/SS20(S T36)/1			Site is operational, and proposals to dispose are not immediate or certain. Site is to be disposed of by 2031, with development unlikely before 2033. Policy notes heritage concerns which may impact on deliverability.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID850/Mod/SS36/1			Whilst the site is not expected to be developed until the end of the Local Plan period, the section of Fulford Road between the proposed development and the A64 is already within an Air Quality Management Area. Highways England therefore wishes to be consulted as part of the Transport Assessment and Air Quality impact assessment for this site.	Highways England

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS21 Land South of Airfield Business Park, Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID183/LC/SS21/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Elvington should remain in the green belt as it always has. Feels the housing is unnecessary as it will disturb the character of the village and there are 3339 houses being built nearby.	Emma Yates
SID191/LC/SS21/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Martin Moorhouse
SID/221/LC/SS21/1			This information is not supplied.	Sally Firth
SID222/LC/SS21/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Joanne Wedgwood
SID223/LC/SS21/1			This information is not supplied.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID378/LC/SS21/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID56/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	Objects as it will have an impact on village of Elvington if more HGVs are allowed to pass through the village.	Judith Hodgson
SID156/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	The proposals do not have supporting infrastructure proposals for road, public transport, schools, doctor's surgery and public amenities all of which are now at over capacity with major issues such as long waiting lists for doctor's appointments, major traffic congestion on Elvington Lane. Further dwellings will result in widespread disruption and a significant reduction of quality of life for the existing residents of Elvington. Notwithstanding the negative impact the loss of local wildlife habitat including barn owls and a variety of hawks and decimation of The Green Belt previously referred in section 1 of this correspondence.	Steve Izzard
SID183/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	Reasons for removing site from green belt haven't changed since previous submissions. There will be disruption to the beckside estate and village, with additional pressures on infrastructure. It will also impact local wildlife habitats.	Emma Yates

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS21 Land South of Airfield Business Park, Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID184/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	There is a large and growing number of HGV movements through the village. ST26 would generate further unacceptable levels of HGV traffic, creating danger to pedestrians and cyclists and damaging air quality.	Philip Rees
SID185/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	There is a large and growing number of HGV movements through the village. ST26 would generate further unacceptable levels of HGV traffic, creating danger to pedestrians and cyclists and damaging air quality.	Helen Rees
SID191/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	This site [ST26], while perfectly reasonable, fails the test of Soundness (positively prepared) as it fails to deal with the resulting, increased, HGV transport issues through the narrow mainstreet of Elvington Village. If the proposals included a HGV ban through the village it would pass this test.	Martin Moorhouse
SID221/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	This site is not positively prepared as it fails to deal with the increased HGV transport issues through the narrow mainstreet of Elvington Village. If the proposals included an HGV ban through the village it would pass this test.	Sally Firth
SID222/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	The site fails to deal with the resulting, increased, HGV transport issues through the narrow mainstreet of Elvington Village. If the proposals included an HGV ban through the village it would pass this test.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID223/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	The site fails to deal with the resulting, increased, HGV transport issues through the narrow mainstreet of Elvington Village.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID240/S/SS21/1			Increased amount of HGVs leading to an increased risk of accidents and pollution.	David Boddy
SID369/S/ SS21 (ST26)/1		Sound	Community representatives generally support the proposed extension, but believe an archaeological assessment should take place before development. The existing traffic and congestion through the village, particularly on Main Street, indicates this expansion should also include consideration of a weight limit in the village. Due to the potential impact of HGVs and possible disturbance to residents, I welcome the proposal of using B1 and B8 units, which will provide light industry, reflecting the rural nature of nearby villages.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID374/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	These developments between them risk adding significantly to vehicular traffic and congestion on York's road network. None of them adheres fully even to the design principles for new developments specified in Policy T1; Policies SS11, 19 and 21 make no reference at all to public transport provision. The others propose a target of 15% of journeys by public transport; no evidence is offered to justify that target; nor is any target offered for walking and cycling. As we have noted elsewhere, the design principles in Policy T1 are necessary but not sufficient. Three of the sites, under Policies SS12, 13 and 22, propose direct links to the outer ring road. There is ample evidence that such provision promotes the development of dormitory villages for commuters to remote employment areas,	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS21 Land South of Airfield Business Park, Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	LDP do not object to the extension to the Airfield Business Park but request that the Policy has specific recognition of the Business Park's ability to link with Langwith, given the close relationship of both allocations.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID424/S/SS21/1		Not Sound	Elvington sits within the Green Belt. This has protected us against excessive development in the past and this should remain.	Val Izzard
SID609/S/SS21/1			good quality bus service that can also run on to the Airfield employment site (ST26)	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID614/S/SS21(ST26 )/1		Not Sound	Support in principle the allocation of this land. However, concerned that insufficient land has been allocated to meet demand over Plan period. Enclosed is a report prepared by Briggs Burley indicating local market forces. Concern is indicated to criteria of Policy SS21 and believe the policy is unsound as it will not provide the framework necessary to determine a planning application. Criterion (ii) references retention of historic field boundaries - none exist. This criterion should be deleted. Criterion (v) references air quality but no commentary.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons

### Proposed Modification

SID102/Mod/SS21/1			Elvington Parish Council supports the extension proposed but emphasises the need for detailed archaeological and ecological assessments before development. A gap should be made between the existing and the new estates which would allow for a 'wildlife corridor'. Units should be small, high value businesses consistent with a restriction to B1 and B8 use, as at present, and in line with CYC's economic strategy. However the Parish Council's support is conditional on the imposition of a 7.5 tonne weight limit on Main Street (i.e. the road through the village centre). There are a disproportionately large number of HGV movements currently through the village impacting on the safety of pedestrians and cyclists - particularly our children walking and cycling to/from school. The extra traffic generated by ST26 (and E9) would bring further unacceptable HGV traffic passing through the village.	Elvington Parish Council - David Headlam
SID191/Mod/SS21/1			This site [ST26], while perfectly reasonable, fails the test of Soundness (positively prepared) as it fails to deal with the resulting, increased, HGV transport issues through the narrow mainstreet of Elvington Village. If the proposals included a HGV ban through the village it would pass this test.	Martin Moorhouse

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS21 Land South of Airfield Business Park, Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID222/Mod/SS21/1			There needs to be a detailed archaeological and ecological assessments before development and a gap should be made between the existing and the new estates which would allow for a 'wildlife corridor'.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID222/Mod/SS21/2			There should be a 7.5 tonne weight limit imposed on Main Street (i.e. the road through the village centre).	Joanne Wedgwood
SID223/Mod/SS21/1			If the proposals included an HGV ban through the village it would pass this test.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID240/Mod/SS21/1			There should be a weight / size restriction placed on HGV's through the centre of the village and using the bridge.	David Boddy
SID364/Mod/SS21/1			Should adopt modifications listed in SID364/Mod/SS13/1.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/SS21/1			Should adopt modifications listed in SID365/Mod/SS13/1.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/MOD/SS21/1			The policy must be based on the full set of design principles for promoting sustainable travel, and include a much more challenging target for the proportion of journeys by sustainable modes. Policy SS21, which currently makes no provision for transport, should adopt the modifications listed above for Policy SS13	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID378/Mod/SS21/1			LDP do not object to the extension to the Airfield Business Park but request that the Policy has specific recognition of the Business Park's ability to link with Langwith, given the close relationship of both allocations.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID614/Mod/SS21(S T26)/1			Support in principle the allocation of this land. However, concerned that insufficient land has been allocated to meet demand over Plan period. Enclosed is a report prepared by Briggs Burley indicating local market forces. Concern is indicated to criteria of Policy SS21 and believe the policy is unsound as it will not provide the framework necessary to determine a planning application. Criterion (ii) references retention of historic field boundaries - none exist. This criterion should be deleted. Criterion (v) references air quality but no commentary.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS22 University of York Expansion

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID587/LC/SS22(ST27)/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh)OBO Shepherd Homes Land at Cherry Lane
------------------------	--------------------------	-----------------------	--	--

#### Soundness

SID75/S/SS22/1		Not Sound	York University East Campus has the potential to provide all identified further university uses. The NPPF supports more optimum and intensive use of developed land. The Secretary of State, from the Public Inquiry, particularly commented that the lake and wetland area will provide a positive limit to built development to the south of the Heslington East site and help Heslington still preserves its unique rural village character.	Heslington Parish Council
SID118/S/SS22/1		Not Sound	This proposal could harm two elements which contribute to the special character of the historic City. Firstly, this area is prominent in views from the A64. The expansion of the University to the extent of the area identified would bring development very close to the Ring Road. This will fundamentally change the relationship which the southern edge of York has with the countryside to its south. Secondly, the expansion of the university towards the ring road could also harm the relationship which the historic city of York has to the surrounding villages.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/SS22(ST27)/1		Not Sound	Notwithstanding the caveats within the Planning Principles regarding P68 the limits on the development footprint of any new development and for an "appropriately landscaped buffer between the site and the A64", this proposal could harm two elements which contribute to the special character of the historic City. Firstly, this area is prominent in views from the A64. It is by no means certain that the requirement for an "appropriately landscaped buffer" between the site and the A64, will not, itself, further harm the openness of the Green Belt in this location. Secondly, the expansion of the university towards the ring road could also harm the relationship which the historic city of York has to the surrounding villages. The expansion of the University would effectively reduce the gap between the edge of the built-up area of the City and the proposed new settlement at Elvington Lane (Site ST15) to 1.6km.	Historic England - Ian Smith

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS22 University of York Expansion

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID165/S/SS22(ST27)/1			The site of this proposed allocation is part of the green buffer along the A64 which contributes significantly to the setting and special character of York. Bringing large-scale development almost completely up to the A64, replicating the type of harm already seen at Clifton Moor. Its development would conflict with at least three of the purposes of the Green Belt as set out in NPPF paragraph 80. It should be retained in the Green Belt. The HIA sets out the potential impact of the proposal on the setting and special character of the city - principal characteristic 6. ST27 was not intended to be developed by the university when planning permission was sought for Heslington East, it is unclear why this has changed over such a short period of time. The proposed allocation is actually for "B1b knowledge businesses" rather than to meet any need identified for further university uses which cannot be accommodated on the existing two campuses. To my knowledge, no substantial case has been made which demonstrates a need for further land for knowledge-based businesses linked to the university beyond that allowed by the 2006 Secretary of State permission. Even if there is such a need, I consider that sites would not have to be immediately adjacent to the University. With appropriate communications, such sites could be some distance away, for example at York Central. The linkage is organisational and not necessarily physical. Policies SS22, ED1, ED2 and ED3 do not achieve the objectives or the clarity required by the NPPF. Framework paragraph 154 states: "Local Plans should set out the opportunities for development and clear policies on what will or will not be permitted and where. Only policies that provide a clear indication of how a decision-maker should react to a development proposal should be included in the plan."	Richard Frost
SID165/S/SS22/1			Impacts of university expansion have fallen disproportionately on nearby communities including Fulford, Heslington and Badger Hill. This is in terms of family houses being converted to HMOs resulting in insensitive extensions, poorly maintained exteriors with unkempt gardens and bins close to the street. Parking by staff, students and visitors on local roads as well as general increase in traffic congestion. Policies related to the university SS22, ED1, ED2 and ED3 duplicate each other in part and set out similar requirements in slightly different ways so should be rationalised.	Richard Frost
SID231/S/SS22(ST27)/2		Not Sound	the costs of the university's rapid expansion in recent years have fallen disproportionately on local communities nearby, including Fulford, Heslington and Badger Hill. Issues such as pressures on local housing stock, levels of parking, and traffic congestion have arisen. Contains various amendments.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID280/S/SS22/1			Heslington East site contains sufficient as yet undeveloped land for a great deal of expansion. The site also has the potential to impact on Heslington Village unless severe mitigation is imposed.	John & Dorothy Lawton



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS22 University of York Expansion

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/S/SS22/1		Not Sound	These developments between them risk adding significantly to vehicular traffic and congestion on York's road network. None of them adheres fully even to the design principles for new developments specified in Policy T1; Policies SS11, 19 and 21 make no reference at all to public transport provision. The others propose a target of 15% of journeys by public transport; no evidence is offered to justify that target; nor is any target offered for walking and cycling. As we have noted elsewhere, the design principles in Policy T1 are necessary but not sufficient. Three of the sites, under Policies SS12, 13 and 22, propose direct links to the outer ring road. There is ample evidence that such provision promotes the development of dormitory villages for commuters to remote employment areas,	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID825/S/SS22(ST27)/1		Not Sound	Given the hugely detrimental impact of the University expansion in recent years on the surrounding Badger Hill, Hull Road and increasingly, Osbaldwick, will regard to the loss of family housing to the student HMO market, para iv of SS22 is not prescriptive enough. The increase in student numbers must be accompanied on site and in full to avoid disripting the local housing market any further.	Osbaldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID849/S/SS22(ST27)/1		Not Sound	The University is again making representations to the consultation process to secure an expansion allocation which meets its growth needs in the period to 2038. Note references to preceeding stages in the Plan's production and in reporting Officer recommendations, principally that the boundary should reflect the University's technical evidence which supports a site of some 26ha. This has been the Officer position since 2014, and reflects the University's assumed growth rate. The case for an extension is accepted by Council Members and Officers. Alternative growth options have been considered, including consideration given to the Plan's alternative ST allocations. The proposed 26ha site is considered to offer significant benefits, particularly in terms of opportunities for accessibility (delvering a new junction on A64 to be shared with ST15); connectivity with existing communities to deliver shared services; 26ha could accommodate all but the most ambitious growth scenarios - ST27 could not satisfy predicted demand during the Plan period; being set back from the ring road, the 26ha site provides more scope for development, with reduced buffering required; broadly similar landscape effects with ST27, none of which are thought to be significant; potential loss to the york economy through limiting expansion of research and associated business activities.	Oneill Associates (Janet O'Neill)OBO University of York
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID75/MOD/SS22/1			Heslington Parish Council would welcome full and well-justified reasons as to why the development (ST27) has been put-forward as being necessary in the proposed location for further university uses that cannot be incorporated into the two existing campuses. When planning policy discourages development in the green belt, it is difficult to understand why this would be permitted beyond development boundaries. HPC would like to see the cumulative traffic flow impacts from local proposed developments - ST15, ST27, H56 and the ST4 analysed by CYC/Developers to evidence that there will be no adverse traffic congestion for Hull Road, Field Lane, University Road and Heslington Lane.	Heslington Parish Council

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy SS22 University of York Expansion

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/Mod/SS22/1			The future expansion of the University should be restricted to within the Campus East and consideration should be given to the expansion of the university in a northerly direction onto Site ST4 instead.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/Mod/SS22(S T27)/1			The future expansion of the University should be restricted to within the Campus East and consideration should be given to the expansion of the university in a northerly direction onto Site ST4 instead.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID165/Mod/SS22/1			If Proposal ST27 is retained, Policy SS22 should be amended as follows:• Criterion iv) should be altered to omit “which is clearly evidence in terms of demand” as it is ambiguous in meaning. • Criterion v) should be strengthened so that the transport objectives of the NPPF are achieved. High quality sustainable transport is vital to reduce congestion on the local road network and impacts on nearby communities, including Heslington. To ensure this, I consider the criterion should be reworded as follows:Deliver high quality frequent and accessible public transport to York City Centre and elsewhere including Campus West. Any proposal must demonstrate that such measures will enable upwards of 15% of trips to be undertaken using public transport. Monitoring and delivery arrangements will be required in a Section 106 Undertaking to ensure that this policy objective is secured in practice.	Richard Frost
SID165/Mod/SS22/2			If Proposal ST27 is retained, Policy SS22 should be amended as follows: • Criterion vii) should be revised so that it applies the stronger NPPF paragraph 32 test as follows:Demonstrate that all transport issues have been resolved, in consultation with the Council and Highways England as necessary, so that the residual cumulative impacts on the surrounding highway network are not severe. The cumulative impact of the proposal with other proposals to the south-east of York, including ST4 and ST15, should be addressed. • A new criterion should be added so that only businesses linked to the university should be allowed on the site. Otherwise there is a danger that the site is rapidly developed for businesses not genuinely requiring a location adjacent to the university, thereby prompting a demand for the release of even more land from the Green Belt. I suggest the following: Demonstrate that only knowledge-based businesses genuinely requiring a location on or immediately adjacent to the University campus are allowed to occupy premises on the site.	Richard Frost
SID364/Mod/SS22/1			New access routes directly to the regional road network should not be provided. Omit new junction on A64 and extend Grimston Bar Park and Ride and introduce new bus service serving ST15 and ST26.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/SS22/1			New access routes directly to the regional road network should not be provided. Omit new junction on A64 and extend Grimston Bar Park and Ride and introduce new bus service serving ST15 and ST26.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS22 University of York Expansion

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/MOD/SS22/1			The policy must be based on the full set of design principles for promoting sustainable travel, and include a much more challenging target for the proportion of journeys by sustainable modes. Policy SS22 should omit the reference to a new junction on the A64 and commit to the provision of a high quality frequent bus service through the University servicing sites ST15 and 26 (Policies SS13 and 21).	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID849/Mod/SS22(S T27)/1			The University is again making representations to the consultation process to secure an expansion allocation which meets its growth needs in the period to 2038. Note references to preceding stages in the Plan's production and in reporting Officer recommendations, principally that the boundary should reflect the University's technical evidence which supports a site of some 26ha.	Oneill Associates (Janet O'Neill)OBO University of York

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS23 Land at Northminster Business Park

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID395/LC/SS23/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	I have no views on this, but that is not an option given, so I have ticked no. My comments on this document refer specifically to the proposed expansion of Northminster Business Park which I object to.	Nigel Thompson
------------------	--------------------------	-----------------------	---	----------------

#### Soundness

SID61/S/SS23/1		Not Sound	Largest business park outside York central. Provides 60,000sqm of B1a B1b and B8 development. Development with 1500 houses is not sustainable on the same access road. Does not consider traffic. The B1224 with the current roundabout improvement would provide better access to site. The site is in lock down from 7pm to 7am so no night deliveries are available. Anticipate night deliveries to become the norm and it will disrupt those who currently live down the rural road. Office space at business park is still under occupied after 20 years of development in area. Offices are being converted into flats in York and Clifton Moor. Could become another housing estate if under utilised. reference to park and ride is a red herring as area only operates till 7pm. The railway station at Poppleton would require a 1.5mile walk to development and doesn't have enough parking. Needs a full habitat, land quality, historic and character setting appraisal. Should not proceed without significant improvement to A1237. Has 6 empty warehouses and 3 office sites at present. Road system cannot cope.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/SS23/2		Not Sound	Business park is well run with limited car access due to country lane. Increasing business park size when other areas within the city are being converted into flats (previously employment use) indicates no need for business premises. Neighbourhood plan does not support business park expansion into green belt. Expansion too big. Northfield land inadequate for level of traffic. Expansion in green belt. No specific number of jobs. Park and ride may be solution to traffic. May not bring businesses into area and traffic problems may put them off.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID269/S/SS23/1		Not Sound	I fully support the comprehensive response by Upper and Nether Poppleton PCs that gives all the reasons against the allocation of this inappropriate site. There has been little consideration of existing residents of Northfield lane.	Mrs Janet Hopton

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS23 Land at Northminster Business Park

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID395/S/SS23/1		Not Sound	I object very strongly to policy proposal SS23. It is directly at odds with the Upper and Nether Poppleton Neighbourhood Plans. Currently there are three business parks within the designated area of Nether and Upper Poppleton and one small farm diversification business unit. Much of the success has to do with ease of access to the sites, security of tenure and sufficient parking for employees and clients. A good example is cited as Northminster Business Park where the site is screened by trees and blends with the rural environment. Expansion within the curtilage of this site would be acceptable. Further expansion would compromise the green belt. This site is not suitable for expansion beyond its existing boundary. Loss of Residential Amenity - Northfield Lane is a residential road where 6 private residences adjoin the Business Park. The lane is already subject to a large number of heavy (12- heeler) lorry, and other traffic, movements because of the existence of Northminster Park's entrance. Noise increasingly affects our quality of life. Policy SS23 states:vii. Ensure that the residential amenity of neighbouring residential properties is maintained." The only way to do this is to bar any increase, or better to reduce, the number of HGVs and delivery lorries on Northfield Lane. It conflicts with Green Belt Policy and harms the Green Belt. It conflicts with Policy GI3 and puts a far larger part of the Green Belt at risk. Expansion of Northminster Business Park (or Poppleton Park and Ride facility) closes a crucial green corridor even further. Northfield Lane is completely unsuitable to support traffic for such a major expansion. No Requirement. As there appear to be empty business properties at many of the businessparks sited at this side of the city, and similar premises in other areas of the city are beingconverted into flats and apartments or demolished. Development would create a Loss of Grade 1 and 2 Agricultural Land.	Nigel Thompson
SID605/S/SS23/1		Not Sound	The removal of SS23 from the General Extend of Green Belt is justified and supported. However, in other parts of the city the proposed Green Belt is unsound as the proposed boundaries are too tightly drawn and would unreasonably restrict development opportunities for the necessary growth of York.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Mr D Lancaster & Oakwood Business Park
SID611/S/SS23/1		Not Sound	While supporting the allocation, the policy is not explicit in what will be required from development. Criteria (i) and (ii) are open to interpretation and not effective in providing an appropriate framework in determining future planning applications. Space for growth needs to be planned in (safeguarded land). Criterion (iv) is superfluous and unnecessary, and is repeated by criterion (v). Criteria (v) and (vi) are unclear.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS23 Land at Northminster Business Park

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID61/S/SS23/1		Not Sound	Largest business park outside York central. Provides 60,000sqm of B1a B1b and B8 development. Development with 1500 houses is not sustainable on the same access road. Does not consider traffic. The B1224 with the current roundabout improvement would provide better access to site. The site is in lock down from 7pm to 7am so no night deliveries are available. Anticipate night deliveries to become the norm and it will disrupt those who currently live down the rural road. Office space at business park is still under occupied after 20 years of development in area. Offices are being converted into flats in York and Clifton Moor. Could become another housing estate if under utilised. reference to park and ride is a red herring as area only operates till 7pm. The railway station at Poppleton would require a 1.5mile walk to development and doesn't have enough parking. Needs a full habitat, land quality, historic and character setting appraisal. Should not proceed without significant improvement to A1237. Has 6 empty warehouses and 3 office sites at present. Road system cannot cope.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/SS23/2		Not Sound	Business park is well run with limited car access due to country lane. Increasing business park size when other areas within the city are being converted into flats (previously employment use) indicates no need for business premises. Neighbourhood plan does not support business park expansion into green belt. Expansion too big. Northfield land inadequate for level of traffic. Expansion in green belt. No specific number of jobs. Park and ride may be solution to traffic. May not bring businesses into area and traffic problems may put them off.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID118/Mod/SS23/1			In order to retain the separation between the Business Park and nearby villages, the southern extent of this area should not extend any further south than the existing car park to the south of Redwood House. We suggest that the extent of Site ST19 be amended so that the southern extent of this area extends no further south than the existing car park to the south of Redwood House.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID269/Mod/SS23/1			The response by Upper and Nether Poppleton PCs gives all the reasons against the allocation of this inappropriate site.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID395/Mod/SS23/1			Remove all reference to Northminster Business Park expansion. It should not take place.	Nigel Thompson
SID611/Mod/SS23(S T19)/1			Criteria (i) and (ii) are ineffective as currently drafted. Criterion (i) should be rewritten to make clear what is actually meant or deleted. Criterion (ii) should be deleted. Criterion (iv) should be deleted. Criteria (v) and (vi) should be rewritten to provide clarity.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy SS24 Whitehall Grange, Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/SS24/1	Not Sound		This site forms part of the green wedge that extends into the north of City which is centred on Bootham Stray. Although there are a handful of buildings on this particular site, it is clearly perceived as a part of this open area. The loss of this site and its subsequent development would result in the considerable narrowing of this wedge and harm one of the key elements identified in the Heritage Topic Paper and on Figure 3.1 of the Local Plan as contributing to the special character and setting of York	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID593/S/SS24 (ST37)/1	Not Sound		Support for the principle of ST37 and the retention of the site as a proposed strategic employment allocation within the Publication Draft Local Plan. However amendments to the proposed wording of Draft Policy SS24 should be amended in order to provide further flexibility in respect of the future development of the site. Since the approval of the outline planning application in June 2016, Autohorn are concerned over the costs. As a result, they are unable to achieve the investment needed to deliver the approved scheme. Accordingly, Autohorn need to commence discussions with CYC at the earliest opportunity in order to seek to revise the approved development proposals at the Whitehall Grange site. Whilst the approved outline planning approval is still very much the long-term vision for the site, Autohorn have sought to develop an immediate development option for the site which is viable, can be delivered by the end of 2019 and which seeks to retain the “openness” of the Green Belt in this location of the City, this is set out in full in response.	Paul Butler Planning OBO Autohorn Fleet Services Ltd (Autohorn)

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/SS24/1			Delete Site 37.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID593/Mod/SS24 (ST37)/1			Proposed revised wording for Policy SS24 (ST37) is as follows: Whitehall Grange, Wigginton Road (ST37) will provide up to 33,330sqm for B1 office and B8 storage use. In addition to complying with the policies within this Local Plan, the site must be delivered in accordance with the agreed Masterplan through the existing outline consent. Given the location of this site, development should be as unobtrusive within the existing landscape as possible, retaining and enhancing (where possible) aiming to increase the clarity and openness of the green wedge between Clifton Moor to the west and New Earswick to the east. Landscaping is integral to the development of ST37.	Paul Butler Planning OBO Autohorn Fleet Services Ltd (Autohorn)

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy EC1 Provision of Employment Land

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID358/LC/EC1/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Methodology and forecasting parameters used in arriving at employment land requirement are not an exact science and the rate of take up of sites (particularly large complex ones) can not be assumed, therefore a greater flexibility of small employment sites is needed.	Doug Jennings Planning OBO Mark Miller
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Reference to land uses (e.g. B1a) is not explained anywhere in document. Regarding H16 Poppleton Garden Centre, the Parish councils confirm that only the proposal to use the existing footprint of the building is supported. The garden centre adds to the historic character of the city. Any other development in this area would lead to coalescence with the urban area of York and green belt. In the past CYC have opposed development adjacent to the site as it is seen as being an important element of the green belt.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/EC1/2		Not Sound	Poppleton garden centre should remain as a valuable attribute to area.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID68/S/EC1/3			#2 Northfield Lane (south of garden centre) - The decision not to allocate the site (land east of Northfield Lane) for employment purposes seems based solely on the comment that the site would be a buffer between future development at Northminster Business Park and the ring road. However, the site is large enough to accommodate employment development and still maintain a buffer with the ring road. The decision to allocate the Poppleton Garden centre which directly adjoins the A59 for residential use and no further from the ring road than the subject site demonstrates this issue is not a barrier to the allocation of the subject site.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID118/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	We do not consider that the following allocations as currently identified are sound: · ST5 (York Central)· ST19 (Northminster Business Park)· ST27 (University of York)· ST37 (Whitehall Grange, Wiggington Road)- E16 (Poppleton Garden centre)	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID141/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	The ELR Update and Officers 10th July 2017 report to the Local Plan Working Group consider that there is a clear qualitative justification for additional B1a office sites to be allocated to provide greater flexibility and reduce reliance upon one site (York Central) with its recognised delivery constraints (infrastructure challenges/ ownership fragmented/heritage constraints). However, the Plan addresses the undersupply of some 40,000 sqm by increasing the allocation of Office floorspace at York Central, retaining its role as the key office location. It does not explain how this can be achieved or why this increase has been made. The proposed quantum has not been justified. Timescales for delivery are uncertain, but likely to be in the long-term. The lack of commitment to early delivery of office accommodation is considered unsound, particularly given losses to ORCs. While York Central is likely to be a highly desirable location, the Plan does not provide for sufficient choice in the employment market.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Oakgate Caddick Groups



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy EC1 Provision of Employment Land

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID141/S/EC1/2		Not Sound	Questions the soundness of the Employment Land Review, suggesting flaws with scoring framework and relative weighting of sites.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Oakgate Caddick Groups
SID181/S/EC1/1			The Plan itself identifies that there has been a significant increase in the amount of B1a floorspace required. There is a need to ensure that employment sites are suitable, viable, available and deliverable now. An additional supply of B1 a land needs to be provided in order to provide sufficient flexibility within the delivery programme.	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments
SID232/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	There is an undersupply for the amount of land allocated in the plan for B1a employment use (64k sqm) and projected demand for B1a employment use across the plan period ( 107k sqm).	Stephen Lornie
SID246/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Land north of Elvington Industrial Estate should be allocated to make the Plan sound	LHL Group (Richard Hampshire) OBO Mr J Nicholson
SID269/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Reference: E16 Poppleton Garden Centre - any future part or total redevelopment of this site should consider its location on an important approach road to York (A59) so the site should not be over developed and should remain a rural business use - preferably its present use as a Garden Centre.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID318/S/EC1/1			Supports EC1	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy EC1 Provision of Employment Land

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID339/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	The Policy sets out the strategic employment sites which the Council are proposing to allocate within the Plan. These will deliver a variety of different employment and commercial uses and our Client welcomes the Council's aspirations for economic growth. However, our Client is concerned that the aspiration level of economic growth should be matched by an equally pro-growth level of housing. It is not considered that the Council's OAN is sufficient to adequately plan for the level of economic growth being proposed. The work into the Council's OAN, which was undertaken by Barton Willmore and submitted as part of previous representations concluded that based on the Council's future job growth projections, the OAN should be a minimum of 920 dwellings per annum to ensure that sufficient labour would be available to address future economic growth.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID345/S/EC1/1		Not Sound		GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID354/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Land north of Northminster Business Park, Poppleton - The site could be considered for employment or mixed use purposes, but given the proposed employment allocation to the south of the Northminster Business Park, and proximity to the Poppleton Bar Park and Ride, its most appropriate predominant use is residential.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID421/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Support proposed range of employment uses including B1a, B1c, B2 and B8 but object to omission of B1b uses. There are no justifications for not including B1b uses on site E11.	DPP Planning (Oliver Corbett) OBO Portakabin
SID583/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Unclear which employment forecast has been used and how these relate to Leeds City Region work and Northern Powerhouse and which methodology has been used to calculate housing requirement.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/EC1/1			Unclear which employment forecast has been used and how these relate to Leeds City Region work and Northern Powerhouse and which methodology has been used to calculate housing requirement.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy EC1 Provision of Employment Land

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID589/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	The Draft Local Plan is unsound because it fails to allocate enough land to meet the existing and future employment land requirements of the City.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Malton Road Developments Ltd
SID598/S/EC1/2		Not Sound	The Draft Plan takes an overly cautious and unjustified approach to employment land allocation. As Green Belt Boundaries are being defined for the first time the Plan should exclude enough land from the Green Belt to cater for anticipated and unexpected development needs for at least 10 years beyond the Plan period, not 5 years as proposed.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Malton Road Developments Ltd
SID589/S/EC1/3		Not Sound	Market evidence indicates there is strong and unfulfilled demand for employment floor space in the District. There is a need for employment land to meet the requirements of small indigenous businesses for reasonably cheap premises that are priced out of the urban area by demand for residential land. There is a need to have land available to meet potential major inward investment requirements. The cautious approach of the Draft Plan fails to meet this objective.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Malton Road Developments Ltd
SID599/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Supports the allocation of E11 for employment use but objects to the allocation for E11 not including B1b uses. Rep goes into further detail but to summarise - Given that nature of the surrounding land and the allocation history the omission of this land use is plainly not justified and will not be as effective in encouraging economic growth and therefore the plan has not been positively prepared.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Portakabin
SID608/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Land at Park Farm, Skelton should be allocated as mixed use (housing and employment)	Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Messrs N Blacker & Son
SID609/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	The current plan fails to provide enough housing and particular affordable / social housing for the future, falling massively short of the minimum overall 1070 homes per year requirement the Government's draft 2017 proposals.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID611/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Policy is inconsistent with the Government's agenda for growth. To reflect comments made in relation to the need for increased housing growth, the amount of land allocated for employment growth will have to increase; references 46ha proposed in previous version of the Plan as an appropriate target.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy EC1 Provision of Employment Land

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID614/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Policy is inconsistent with the Government's agenda for growth. To reflect comments made in relation to the need for increased housing growth, the amount of land allocated for employment growth will have to increase; references 46ha proposed in previous version of the Plan as an appropriate target.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID848/S/EC1/1			Unclear which employment forecast has been used and how these relate to Leeds City Region work and Northern Powerhouse and which methodology has been used to calculate housing requirement.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/EC1/1		Not Sound	Reference to land uses (e.g. B1a) is not explained anywhere in document. Regarding H16 Poppleton Garden Centre, the Parish councils confirm that only the proposal to use the existing footprint of the building is supported. The garden centre adds to the historic character of the city. Any other development in this area would lead to coalescence with the urban area of York and green belt. In the past CYC have opposed development adjacent to the site as it is seen as being an important element of the green belt.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/EC1/2		Not Sound	Poppleton garden centre should remain as a valuable attribute to area.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID118/Mod/EC1/1			Amend ST5, ST19, ST27 and ST37 as per application Spatial Policies suggestions.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/Mod/EC1/2			Reduce the extent of Site E16 to exclude the Poppleton Garden Centre Car Park and the currently undeveloped area to the south of the existing buildings.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID141/Mod/EC1/1			Naburn Business Park - identified as 'reserved land' in 2005 draft Local Plan. Note supporting evidence which seeks to address issues of impact on the openness of green belt and Historic Character and Setting of the City. There is a strong economic case for a new business park at Naburn, providing easy access to the ring road and university, choice in the market and noting its proximity to ST15. Transport constraints could be addressed and traffic impacts mitigated. The site is in single ownership and capable of development in the short term	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Oakgate Caddick Groups
SID269/Mod/EC1/1			Reference: E16 Poppleton Garden Centre - any future part or total redevelopment of this site should consider its location on an important approach road to York (A59) so the site should not be over developed and should remain a rural business use - preferably its present use as a Garden Centre.	Mrs Janet Hopton

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy EC1 Provision of Employment Land

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/Mod/EC1/1			DIO proposes that E18 – Towthorpe Lines Strensall proposed uses of “B1(c), B2 and B8 uses” should be expanded to include potential for B1(a) and B1(b) uses in addition to B1(c), B2 and B8 uses to diversify market attractiveness and demand and hence enhance the viability and deliverability of the proposed development.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID354/Mod/EC1/1			Land north of Northminster Business Park, Poppleton - The site could be considered for employment or mixed use purposes, but given the proposed employment allocation to the south of the Northminster Business Park, and proximity to the Poppleton Bar Park and Ride, its most appropriate predominant use is residential.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID358/Mod/EC1/1			The site 795 Greenacres should be allocated for employment on the Policies Map.	Doug Jennings Planning OBO Mark Miller
SID364/Mod/EC1/1			Increase provision of land for Grade A office space, commercial sites and sites for start up and grow on enterprises. Address need for more affordable space for start up businesses. Remove permitted rights for sites changing from office use to housing. ST36 and ST35 need to be removed. Needs to give greater support for addressing skills gap.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/EC1/1			Increase provision of land for Grade A office space, commercial sites and sites for start up and grow on enterprises. Address need for more affordable space for start up businesses. Remove permitted rights for sites changing from office use to housing. ST36 and ST35 need to be removed. Needs to give greater support for addressing skills gap.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID421/Mod//EC1/1			Policy should include B1b uses on site E11.	DPP Planning (Oliver Corbett) OBO Portakabin
SID589/Mod/EC1/1			As Green Belt Boundaries are being defined for the first time the Plan should exclude enough land from the Green Belt to cater for anticipated and unexpected development needs for at least 10 years beyond the Plan period, not 5 years as proposed.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Malton Road Developments Ltd
SID589/Mod/EC1/2			The 14.66 hectares at the Malton Road Business Park should be included as an employment allocation in Policy EC1 of the Plan;	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Malton Road Developments Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy EC1 Provision of Employment Land

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID589/Mod/EC1/3			Malton Road Business Park and land to north east - The site outlined red on the Plan at Appendix A should be identified on the Local Plan Proposals Map as an employment allocation;	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Malton Road Developments Ltd
SID599/Mod/EC1/1			B1b use should added to the allowed use classes for site E11.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Portakabin
SID608/Mod/EC1/1		Not Sound	Land at Park Farm, Skelton should be allocated as mixed use (housing and employment)	Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Messrs N Blacker & Son
SID609/Mod/EC1/1			Object to the Council allocating the use of the Army Barracks in the Local Plan for housing needs instead of employment to protect jobs within the city.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID611/Mod/EC1/1			EC1 is inconsistent with the Government's agenda for growth as insufficient land is to be allocated to meet market demand; the supply of employment land should be increased.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID614/Mod/EC1/1			EC1 is inconsistent with the Government's agenda for growth as insufficient land is to be allocated to meet market demand; the supply of employment land should be increased.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### E8 Wheldrake Industrial Estate

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID34/S/E8/1			Proposed site E8 is unsuitable for the expansion of Wheldrake industrial estate. It is green space that should be retained. It is also close to the village conservation area.	David Randon
SID35/S/E8/1			This area of open grassland greatly enhances the approach to the village and makes the industrial estate less intrusive. Building here on the approach to Wheldrake Conservation area would degrade the village. Unlike most other villages Wheldrake does not have a village green so this grassland is of greater importance to the public.	David Dick
SID342/S/E8/1		Not Sound	E8 is an inappropriate allocation as it is on land at the entrance to the village at the very start of the Conservation Area and would have a detrimental effect on the setting and character of the Village. This area of land also provides a community space that hosts the villages Christmas Lights display which is supported by the existing local business adjoining this site who provide the electricity for it.	Andy Bell
SID375/S/E8/1		Not Sound	Site E8 is not appropriate for inclusion as it would be situated on land at the entrance to the village of Wheldrake which also coincides with the commencement of the Conservation Area and it would therefore have a detrimental effect on the setting and character of the village. The area of land also provides a green space entrance way and community space for the village.	Cllr Suzie Mercer

#### Proposed Modification

SID34/Mod/E8/1			Should be re-considered whether an expansion of this estate (E8) is necessary.	David Randon
SID342/Mod/E8/1			Remove E8 from the plan and/or designate it as Green Space within the Village and re-instate E7 which was previously allocated and would help preserve the character and setting of the village.	Andy Bell
SID375/Mod/E8/1			Remove E8 from the plan and/or designate it as Green Space within the Village and re-instate E7 which was previously allocated and would help preserve the character and setting of the village.	Cllr Suzie Mercer

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### E9 Elvington Industrial Estate

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID240/S/E9/1			Increased amount of HGVs leading to an increased risk of accidents and pollution.	David Boddy
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID102/Mod/E9/1			Elvington Parish Council supports inclusion of this site in the plan but would like to point out it is not a brownfield site as currently described, it is a grassy paddock.	Elvington Parish Council - David Headlam
SID240/Mod/E9/1			There should be a weight / size restriction placed on HGV's through the centre of the village and using the bridge.	David Boddy



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

E11 Annamine Nurseries. Jockey Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID421/LC/E11/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		DPP Planning (Oliver Corbett) OBO Portakabin
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID421/S/E11/1		Not Sound	It is considered that Policy EC1 insofar as it relates to allocation E11 is unsound it that it omits B1b land uses from the range of suitable employment uses identified.	DPP Planning (Oliver Corbett) OBO Portakabin

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### E16 Poppleton Garden Centre

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID55/S/E16/1	Sound		Support the allocation of land at E16 for 'B' uses, including B1a to help meet the area's employment needs.	Indigo Planning (Andrew Astin) OBO Wyevale Garden Centres
---------------	-------	--	---	--

#### Proposed Modification

SID55/Mod/E16/1			It is requested that the words 'an element' are removed from policy wording to allow an unrestricted amount of B1a to be brought forward. The draft Local Plan identifies at Table 4.1 that there is a requirement for up to 13.8ha of land for B1a floorspace up to 2038 within the City of York. However, there are limited available and suitable sites within the city centre to accommodate this, with the Council's Employment Land Review (2017) also highlighting that a large amount of office space within the city centre has been lost to residential.	Indigo Planning (Andrew Astin) OBO Wyevale Garden Centres
-----------------	--	--	--	--

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### E18 Towthorpe Lines, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID345/S/E18/1	Not Sound		Support the development of E18 for up 13,000 sqm of employment floospace. Concept plan in Appendix 2. Also suggest chnage linked to policy EC1 to expand applicable used to B1a and B1b	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/E18/2	Not Sound		HRA supplied post Reg 18 consultation satisfies concerns in relation to habitats and ecology at ST35 as a result of air quality, recreational pressure and hydrology. This includes information for recreational strategy and mitigation alleviate concerns relating these issues. It is considered that this accords with mitigating effects on healthland sites. Habitat management confirmed to remain as MOD and Yorkshire Wildlife Trust so opportunities to contribute to the conservation objectives through provision of enhanced / alternative access points. Concept masterplan sets out greenspace suitable for range of users.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID369/S/ E18/1	Sound		Given the character of the surrounding area, pleased the proposals indicate light industry. While this is welcome, consideration should be made for the additional HGV lorriescoming to and from the site and how this may affect Strensall village.	Julian Sturdy MP

#### Proposed Modification

SID369/Mod/E18/1			Proposed that an entry access road to the site could also provide, avoiding the SSSI land, an effective access route to the proposed Towthorpe Lines Barracks site (E18).	Julian Sturdy MP
------------------	--	--	---	------------------

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy EC2 Loss of Employment Land

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID61/S/EC2/1		Not Sound	No recognition of changes of trends in shopping. The increasing use of online shopping, Tesco decision not to develop at York Business Park. Not been recognised in policy.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID374/S/EC2/1		Not Sound	City centre offices facilitate the provision for and use of sustainable travel. Yet York has experienced one of the highest rates of decline in such office space following the introduction of freedom to convert to residential use. A policy to arrest and reverse this decline would contribute significantly to the achievement of sustainable travel goals.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID61/S/EC2/1		Not Sound	No recognition of changes of trends in shopping. The increasing use of online shopping, Tesco decision not to develop at York Business Park. Not been recognised in policy.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

#### Proposed Modification

SID345/Mod/EC2/1			More clarity is required on “compelling evidence todemonstrate that the site is no longer needed” and what is meant by “significant changes in the economic circumstances of the district”. These need to be defined so changes in economic circumstances can be monitored.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID374/Mod/EC2/1			Policy EC2 needs to be redrafted	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy EC3 Business and Industrial Uses within Residential Areas

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/EC3/1		Not Sound	The soundness of the policy is questioned as it does not recognise type of business that are incompatible with residential area. York Business Park has car sale businesses with high security next to a elderly care home which causes disruption. More vehicles on roads due to nature of work.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/EC3/1		Not Sound	The soundness of the policy is questioned as it does not recognise type of business that are incompatible with residential area. York Business Park has car sale businesses with high security next to a elderly care home which causes disruption. More vehicles on roads due to nature of work.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy EC4 Tourism

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID850/LC/EC4/1	Does not comply with DtC		Highways England needs to understand the scale of growth in tourism which is expected. York is a year-round tourism destination which attracts over 7 million visitors, many of whom arrive by car using the SRN.	Highways England
-----------------	--------------------------	--	---	------------------

#### Soundness

SID122/S/EC4/1	Not Sound		We wish to reiterate that there is a widely acknowledged need and requirement for hotels to be provided in York and we do support 'Policy EC4: Tourism'. potential expansion of services at the Racecourse would greatly assist the Racecourse to diversify its revenue model over a much broader timeframe beyond the primary racing season. The Racecourse must continue to find alternative ways to generate revenue so that it can sustainably fund and deliver required upgrades across the entire Estate. This diversification of the racecourse's activities would therefore deliver additional significant economic benefits to the local area and to the Council through increased revenue via our mutually beneficial revenue sharing model. According to paragraph 156 of the NPPF, Local Plans should set out strategic priorities for the area in the Local Plan, including for the delivery of 'retail, leisure and other commercial development'. Policy EC4 does not set out such priorities. We would suggest, therefore, the wording on Policy EC4 be revised to provide more flexibility for new visitor accommodation at York Racecourse and ensure it is consistent with national policy. The policy should refer to York Racecourse as a preferred site so as to protect the long-term viability of the Racecourse and its tourism related functions.	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse
SID122/S/EC4/2	Not Sound		York Racecourse has long term aspirations for the development of a hotel within the main racecourse area. This would meet the aspirations of Policy EC4 for 'maintaining and improving the choice and quality of visitor accommodation to encourage overnight stays, particularly by higher spending visitors. However, the supportive text at paragraph 4.13, states that hotels are defined as a town centre use and that the town centre is to be viewed as the primary location for hotels. Section 4.12 also states that: 'where suitable sites are not available in the city centre, sites in edge-of-centre locations will be considered and, if no suitable sites are available in any of the preferred locations, out-of-centre sites will be considered'. York Racecourse approximately 1 mile from the City Centre, and a sustainable venue for a hotel, given that many visitors to York are already likely to be visiting the Racecourse during the day, and so the provision of overnight accommodation could help to reduce the number of journeys made by visitors around York.	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse
SID181/S/EC4/1			Policy EC4 recognises the contribution that tourism makes to the economy of York and notes the need to maintain and improve the choice and quality of visitor accommodation to encourage overnights stays "particularly by higher spending visitors". Given the very constrained character of the city centre in York there is a need to allocate land for a high quality hotel set within grounds on the outskirts of the city centre but accessible to it. The site at Sim Balk Lane represents an ideal opportunity to provide an allocation for a modern spa-style hotel accessible to the city centre due to the proximity to the park and ride.	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy EC4 Tourism

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID355/S/EC4/1		Sound	With regard to the tourist, culture and leisure policies referred to in our previous representations (Policies DP2, EC4 and D3), we are pleased to see that our proposed alterations to the policies have been incorporated into the Publication Draft Local Plan. On this basis, we support these Local Plan policies, consider the Plan sound insofar as it relates to the these policies and request that these policies are adopted in their proposed form.	National Railway Museum - Judith McNicol

### Proposed Modification

SID122/Mod/EC4/1			In order for York Racecourse to expand and remain viable, the Racecourse must be able to adapt, particularly outside the primary racing season. In regard to York Racecourse specifically, the language of Policy EC4 and how it seeks to promote the tourism sector, runs counter to the designation of York Racecourse being placed in the Green Belt and therefore being restricted by its limits on development. It would be helpful for the Local Plan to specifically refer to sites that the Council supports for growth within Policy EC4. The inclusion of such sites would provide greater clarity for York Racecourse, and other visitor focused attractions, to be acknowledged and supported if and when any applications were to come forward for consideration. Our suggested wording for such a policy to add to Policy EC4 is as follows: Uses of international and/or national importance and the buildings and sites that accommodate them will be protected and supported throughout the City of York. Sustainable growth for the benefit of the local area will be encouraged by the enhancement of existing visitor attractions, particularly York Racecourse, (and other significant sites as appropriate).	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse
SID122/Mod/EC4/2			The Local Plan should be more explicit in its support for the development of hotels at existing tourism venues, such as the Racecourse. We suggest that the draft Local Plan include York Racecourse as a preferred site for hotel development within the policy to allow for the development of additional visitor facilities in the future if appropriate. Our suggested re-wording for such a policy to add to Policy EC4 is as follows: the provision of quality visitor attractions including temporary structures throughout the year especially ones with a national/international profile, in locations which are easily accessible by a variety of transport modes and complement York's existing cultural heritage, such as York Racecourse.	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse
SID423/Mod/EC4/1			Loss of site would produce great strain on the other coach park and make it difficult fo other coaches to drop off near the centre.	NDM 6

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy EC5 Rural Economy

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID841/LC/EC5/1	Does not comply with DtC			Jennifer Hubbard Planning
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/EC5/1		Not Sound	policy needs great clarification.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID160/S/EC5/1		Sound	CPRENorthYorkshire does not believe that the minor change to this policy renders it unsound and thus remains supportive of the policy in principle.	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE
SID318/S/EC5/1			Supports EC5	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID841/S/EC5/1		Not Sound	Policy EC5 purports to support the rural economy. However, since most of the rural areas of York lie within the general extent of the green belt set by saved Regional Spatial Strategy policy, there is little or no opportunity under Policy GB1 as currently drafted for rural businesses which are not allied to agriculture or forestry to establish or expand The outcome of these policies taken together is that, other than agricultural or forestry development, development which is permitted development or which can show very special circumstances, all potential rural developments will need to seek locations beyond the outer edge of the green belt - that is, in neighbouring authorities. Policy GB1 should recognise the constraints which the green belt places on the aspirations and objectives of Policy EC5.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning
SID61/S/EC5/1		Not Sound	policy needs great clarification.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman



# CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

## Policy EC5 Rural Economy

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

### Proposed Modification

SID383/Mod/EC5/1

Natural England notes the consideration of soils and agricultural land in policies CC1 and SS21 and the Sustainability Appraisal. However, considering the findings of the Sustainability Appraisal, we advise that you consider including a specific reference to the protection of best and most versatile (BMV) agricultural land, for instance in policy EC5. In addition we would welcome reference to the importance of the protecting wider soils resources including in relation to ecosystem services such as carbon storage and their role in flood prevention. NPPF para 112 states that Local Planning Authorities should take into account the economic and other benefits of the best and most versatile agricultural land while para 109 is clear that planning system should contribute to and enhance the natural and local environment by protecting and enhancing soils.

Natural England -  
Merlin Ash

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy R1 Retail Hierarchy and Sequential Approach

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/R1/1		Not Sound	No provision in ST1 or ST2 for retail space.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID118/S/R1/1		Sound	Support for this Policy.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID128/S/R1/1		Not Sound	Policy R1 includes within the retail hierarchy "neighbourhood parades". By including such centres within the hierarchy, policy R2 accepts development in such centres in principle and policy R4 requires neighbourhood parades to be included in any future sequential assessment and impact assessment. The NPPF makes clear that neighbourhood parades are not included in the definition of town centres - there is no justification put forward in the Plan as to why that should be any different in York.	Eric Hall TDH Estates OBO Trustees Of Monks Cross Shopping Park
SID351/S/R1/1			We support the recognition in paragraph 1.38 that the YDO fulfils a specialist retail role, and that it helps York to meet its role as a regional centre (para 1.39). Paragraph 1.40 seeks to "restrict further developments in out of centre locations" - whilst YDO makes no comment on the merits or otherwise about this relating to new retail destinations, it should not be seen to inappropriately restrict appropriate expansion at the YDO – such expansion is envisaged in other parts of the local plan (e.g. para 4.39).	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID351/S/R1/2			Whilst encouraging further investment at the YDO, recognition should be given to the parking issues identified at the YDO which are restricting its ability to reach its potential economic contribution to York and the City's growth aspirations. The existing unsatisfactory position will be further exacerbated by extension plans at the YDO and the increase in Park & Ride spaces from 541 to 1,000, as agreed with the City Council.	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID351/S/R1/3			The site is identified as being an Existing Park & Ride location with the potential for relocation. We support that principle (consistent with the objective of Policy T2) onto land to the south of the YDO (as previously advocated) retaining its operation closely associated with the YDO's role and function as a wider retail and tourist attraction.	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID61/S/R1/1		Not Sound	No provision in ST1 or ST2 for retail space.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

### Proposed Modification

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy R1 Retail Hierarchy and Sequential Approach

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID128/Mod/R1/1			All references to neighbourhood parades in policy R1 and R2 should be deleted. Paragraph 4.29 should be deleted.	Eric Hall TDH Estates OBO Trustees Of Monks Cross Shopping Park
SID351/Mod/R1/1			Retail Hierarchy and Sequential Approach, the threshold for requirement for a Retail Impact assessment should be 2,500 sqm, consistent with paragraph 26 of The Framework, rather than 1,500 sqm.	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy R4 Out of Centre Retailing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID128/S/R4/1		Not Sound	Policy R4 states that restrictions on floorspace or goods that may be sold will be secured by condition to prevent out of centre proposals having a negative impact on the vitality and viability of the City centre. However a policy which presents a blanket application of conditions would likely fail the tests on the use of conditions, in particular necessity.	Eric Hall TDH Estates OBO Trustees Of Monks Cross Shopping Park
SID128/S/R4/2		Not Sound	Para 4.37 states that sui generis and uses such as bulky goods (non food), car showrooms and trade counters may be appropriate in out of centre locations but will still be subject to impact and sequential testing. The examples (the text says "such as" so presumably this not expected to be an exclusive list) are poorly judged. Sui generis uses are not main town centre uses, nor are car showrooms or trade counters; insofar as trade counters may contain a retail element this should by definition be ancillary. Moreover it is not clear how an impact assessment can be done for such uses. Finally if bulky goods are going to be subject to impact and sequential tests anyway. it is not clear what purpose the second part of para 4.37 serves.	Eric Hall TDH Estates OBO Trustees Of Monks Cross Shopping Park
SID128/S/R4/3		Not Sound	The plan notes the economic benefits of Monks Cross, Clifton Moor and the York Designer centre. Para 4.39 states that proposals for development within these out of centre retailing destinations that consolidate their existing function as specialist locations for the sale of bulky comparison goods or other restricted comparison goods will be supported subject to the application of policy R4. MCSP is indeed an important facility and a key economic driver for York. Further investment is being directed to the Centre off the back of a number of consents issued by CYC in recent years. Nevertheless retailing in general remains prone to rapid changes in customer behaviour. It should be noted that in general MCSP has a relatively open consent, including for the sale of food and there are major foodstores within the Monks Cross area. The references in para 4.39 to bulky non food and restricted comparison goods do not match reality.	Eric Hall TDH Estates OBO Trustees Of Monks Cross Shopping Park
SID231/S/R4/1		Not Sound	Objects to the proposal to exclude the York Designer Outlet from the Green Belt. Instead, the site should be shown as overwashed and treated as a previously developed site in the Green Belt.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID374/S/R4/1		Not Sound	Out of centre retailing has been designed to be car-based and in doing so has added significantly to traffic levels and congestion, as well as attracting retailers and shoppers to leave the city centre. The criteria for accepting further out of centre retailing make no reference to these impacts. The set of criteria for provision for sustainable travel in Policy T1, as strengthened by our recommendations for this policy, need to be applied to out of centre retailing as well.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

### Proposed Modification

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy R4 Out of Centre Retailing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID128/Mod/R4/1			It is suggested that the final paragraph of policy R4 be amended to read "Restrictions on floorspace or goods sold may be secured by condition where necessary to prevent out of centre proposals..." Para 4.38 should be similarly reworded.	Eric Hall TDH Estates OBO Trustees Of Monks Cross Shopping Park
SID128/Mod/R4/2			Para 4.38 from "sui generis" onwards should be deleted.	Eric Hall TDH Estates OBO Trustees Of Monks Cross Shopping Park
SID128/Mod/R4/3			The words "for the sale of bulky comparison goods or other restricted comparison goods" should be deleted.	Eric Hall TDH Estates OBO Trustees Of Monks Cross Shopping Park
SID374/Mod/R4/1			Policy R4 needs to be redrafted	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID116/LC/H1policy /1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Plan complies with laws related to sites of special scientific interest i.e. Askham bog. As 'Land to the south of Moor Lane' is not being put forward for development. Satisfied with all consultations.	Linda Eaves
SID209/LC/H1Policy /1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		ELG Town Planning (Kim Eastwood) OBO Askham Bryan College
SID210/LC/H1Policy /1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID214/LC/H1/1	Does not comply with DtC		With regard to the duty to co-operate it may be the case the Council has consulted with neighbouring authorities, but some of those authorities have expressed concerns that have not been fully resolved.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID252/LC/H1/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Arcus Consulting (Clare Walters) OBO Cobalt Housing York Limited
SID257/LC/H1/1				ELG Town Planning (Ian Lyle ) OBO Henry Boot Developments Ltd
SID259/LC/H1/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO David Wilson Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID267/LC/H1Policy /1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID350/LC/H1/1				Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Picton Capital
SID354/LC/H1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID378/LC/H1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID388/LC/H1(Policy)/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	York Central Partnership considers that Policy H1 is legally compliant and has been prepared in accordance with the Duty to Co-operate.	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell)OBO York Central Partnership
SID590/LC/H1(Policy)/1	Does not comply with DtC			ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID837/LC/H1Policy /1	Does not comply with DtC			Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO Escrick Park Estates Combined

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID838/LC/H1Policy/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited

### Soundness

SID27/S/H1(Policy)/1		Sound	Believes the plan meets the practical and realistic housing need whilst safeguarding the green belt and sites of importance for nature conservation.	Richard Wilson
SID68/S/H1policy/1			#3 Northfield Lane (south of garden centre) - The site performs none of the roles of the Green Belt as defined in the NPPF and there has been no proper justification in planning terms of including the site in the Green Belt.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID68/S/H1policy/2			#3 Northfield Lane (south of garden centre) - The housing allocations proposed in the Pre-Publication Draft document are wholly inadequate to meet the housing needs of the district. Without considerably more housing land the objectively assessed housing needs of the City will not be met and the Local Plan will be found unsound.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID68/S/H1policy/3			#3 Northfield Lane (south of garden centre) - In addition to ensure what the Draft Plan considers to be enduring Green Belt Boundaries, additional land is allocated to meet the annual base requirement of 867 dwellings per annum for the 5-year period 2033 to 2038. For reasons we explain below, we consider this assessment of the Requirement remaining and the housing allocations set out in the Draft Plan to be inadequate for the following reasons:(i) The housing requirement is too low;(ii)The calculation of completions since 2012 is too high (i.e. the Councils estimate of backlog is too low)(iii) Outstanding commitments includes student housing that should be excluded(iv) The assumptions on windfalls are questionable and should not be treated as a component of the Plan	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID68/S/H1policy/4			#3 Northfield Lane (south of garden centre) - The Council cannot demonstrate that Green Belt boundaries will endure beyond the Plan period thus failing one of the fundamental objectives of Green Belt Policy in the NPPF. Without additional housing land allocations, the Green Belt boundaries cannot be confirmed.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID68/S/H1policy/6			#4 Northfield Lane (Minster Vets) - The site is neither open nor in the countryside, given the current level of development on the site and in the surrounding area. The site performs none of the roles of the Green Belt as defined in the NPPF and there is no justification in planning terms of including the site in the Green Belt.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID68/S/H1policy/7			#4 Northfield Lane (Minster Vets) - The housing allocations proposed in the Further Sites consultation document are wholly inadequate to meet the housing needs of the district. Without considerably more housing land the objectively assessed housing needs of the City will not be met and the Local Plan will be found unsound.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID91/S/H1(Policy)/1		Not Sound	867 is too few homes, H37 Land adjacent to Greystones Court Haxby should be re-instated. Rep goes into great detail about the history of H37 at various consultation stages in the past. Says 867 figure ignores the evidence base and officer recommendations, does not take account of under-delivery or affordability, and also ignores representations from previous consultations in support of site H37. Goes into detail on how this violates NPPF and NPPG. The approach taken has been to minimise the number of homes built and protect the draft green belt rather than producing a sound plan and properly considering green belt boundary issues. As the result the plan now relies very heavily on a small number of strategic sites for the majority of the housing, these sites require large upfront funding for infrastructure and are inherently riskier. The reinstatement of a number of smaller, available sites rather than intensifying development on large strategic sites is the most appropriate strategy. H37 is available for development having previously undertaken detailed pre-application officer advice and having used a specialist consultancy to deal with issues raised in earlier consultations.	Strathmore Estates (Debbie Hume) OBO Westfield Lodge and Yaldara Ltd (H37)
SID116/S/H1policy/1		Sound	Glad that the proposal to build at the site 'Land south of Moor Lane' has not been included in the plan. The site is green belt and is consistent with national policy on protection of SSSIs.	Linda Eaves
SID118/S/H1/1		Not Sound	The development of several of the sites identified in this Policy could, potentially, result in harm to elements which contribute to the historic environment of York. It also possible that a number of them would also affect other elements which contribute towards other aspects of York's environmental quality (such as the natural environment). Includes: H1, H10, H46, H52 and H58	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID125/S/H1policy/1		Not Sound	Whiteland Field, Usher Park Road, Haxby - rep goes into detail on green belt criteria in relation to the site, argues for its inclusion. Concludes with - Whiteland Field does not meet any the Green Belt criteria and should be allocated for residential development. Persimmon Homes previously has put forward a number of reports in support of its allocation including transport, services, archaeology and masterplan. Persimmon owns the land and is keen to progress development of the site once a satisfactory planning position has been obtained. The site should be allocated for residential development to make a rational Green Belt boundary and provide a deliverable site and to contribute to meeting the City's widespread housing needs. 1.3 hectares, 49 dwellings, Short term.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID125/S/H1policy/1		Not Sound	NPPF requires a Local Plan to be positively prepared and flexible. It has been established previously the Local Plan is under-providing dwellings therefore the schedule of housing allocations in Table 5.1 is insufficient to allow the true housing requirement to be met.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID125/S/H1policy/2		Not Sound	New Lane, Huntington - rep goes into detail on green belt criteria in relation to the site, argues for its inclusion. Concludes with - The site should be allocated for residential development in accordance with the boundaries of ST11 in the halted 2014 Local Plan to make a deliverable site and thus contribute to meeting the City's widespread housing needs. 13.7 hectares, 336 dwellings, Short to Medium Term.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID125/S/H1policy/3		Not Sound	Pond Field, Field Lane - rep goes into detail on green belt criteria in relation to the site, argues for its inclusion. Concludes with - Pond Field does not meet any of the criteria for Green Belt. The reality is that Pond Field is now a field surrounded by development. It has to be inappropriate to seek to retain a field in agricultural use when it is surrounded by development. The Green Belt designation should be removed and Field Lane used to define this part of the inner Green Belt boundary with a rational boundary. The site should be allocated for residential development to provide a deliverable site and thus contribute to meeting the City's widespread housing needs. 5.7 hectares, 140 dwellings, Short term.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID125/S/H1(Policy)/4			Lime Tree Farm, Common Lane, Heslington - rep goes into detail on green belt criteria in relation to the site, argues for its inclusion. Concludes with - Lime Tree Farm does not meet any of the criteria for Green Belt designation. Lime Tree Farm has development on three sides with limited views into it from the southern boundary. The Green Belt designation should be removed and Common Lane used to define this part of the inner Green Belt boundary with a rational boundary. The site should be allocated for residential development to provide a deliverable site and thus contribute to meeting the City's widespread housing needs. 2.7 hectares, 90 dwellings, Short term.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID160/S/H1Policy/1		Sound	Policy is sound. Paragraph 5.16 says CYC has worked with neighbouring authorities under the DtC to establish whether the Council needs to provide additional land to address any shortfall of land, stating that they do not. CPRE North Yorkshire would seek further clarification on this matter as they have concerns that proposed developments in Pocklington and Stamford Bridge (East Riding of Yorkshire) and Green Hammerton (Harrogate Borough Council) and with in Selby District may impact detrimentally upon the setting and infrastructure provisions of the City of York.	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE
SID182/S/H1/1		Not Sound	Land West of Chapelfields should be allocated for housing for 89 dwellings.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID199/S/H1/1			Paragraph 5.9 shows LPAs should demonstrate 5-year land supply, which in York's case should have 20% buffer. Methodology is of 5 year supply is not adequately detailed in LP.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID203/S/H1/1		Not Sound	Land to the East of Wheldrake Lane, Wheldrake, York, YO19 6NA: The site could be fully developed to intergate into the existing urban edge, akin to allocated site SS18, and contribute towards meeting housing requirements.	Savills (M Boyce ) OBO Mr Allen and Mrs Dorothea Park
SID210/S/H1Policy/ 3		Not Sound	In order to address the conflicts identified and ensure that Policy H1 is sound, it is considered that City of York Council should amend the Policy as follows: 1 The Local Plan should allocate this additional land to meet the housing needs of the community. These sites should be able to deliver early in the plan period. This is the only approach that will deliver a 'sound' plan and enable the much needed investment in new housing to meet the community's needs. 2 The identification of a portfolio of small site allocations (e.g. up to 250 dwellings) around existing settlements and the main urban area would assist in meeting any shortfall created by the delay in large sites delivering dwellings early in the plan period. 3 The boundary of the Green Belt should be defined such that land at Brecks Lane, Southfields Road and Princess Road, Strensall are excluded from it and allocated for residential development on the Local Plan Proposals Map. It should be noted that the above assessment is reliant upon the information provided in the LPP and associated evidence base documents. Lichfields therefore reserves the right to update the above evidence as and when further information becomes available.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID212/S/H1Policy/ 1		Not Sound	Having considered the contents of the Plan and accompanying proposals map for the south area a number of revisions should be made and the land to east of Mitchells Lane/West of Fulford Golf Course should be removed from the green belt. Given that the Plan proposes to create Green Belt Boundaries that endure up to 2037/38 it is important that the plan allocates more than enough housing sites to ensure delivery of the full requirement over this period.	IB Planning (Iain Bath ) OBO Client
SID214/S/H1/1		Not Sound	The land use proposals are acceptable and can be delivered from a transport perspective and, as a result, there is no reason in terms of transport and access why the site should not continue to be promoted for residential use.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID214/S/H1/2		Not Sound	We consider this assessment of the Requirement remaining to be inadequate for the following reasons:(i) The housing requirement is too low;(ii) The calculation of completions since 2012 is too high (i.e. The Councils estimate of backlog is too low)iii Outstanding commitments include student housing that should be excluded(iv) The assumptions on windfalls are questionable and should not be treated as a component of the Plan	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID214/S/H1/3		Not Sound	Not enough land had been allocated for development beyond the Plan period and consequently the Council cannot demonstrate that Green Belt boundaries will endure beyond the Plan period thus failing one of the fundamental objectives of Green Belt Policy in the NPPF. Without additional housing land allocations, the Green Belt boundaries cannot be confirmed.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID214/S/H1/4		Not Sound	The calculation in table 6 in the rep demonstrates the high level of latent and unmet demand in York and the precarious nature of the housing supply in the City. In order to achieve a balance between the housing requirement and housing supply the requirement would have to fall significantly. On the basis of the background evidence prepared for the Local Plan, this scenario is highly unlikely.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID220/S/H1(Policy) /1		Not Sound	Not enough sites allocated to meet housing need.	O'Neill Associates (Philip Holmes)OBO Mr M Ibbotson
SID247/S/H1(Policy) /1			Housing developments need to be located in the most appropriate and sustainable locations, which are accessible to jobs, key services and infrastructure. The Trustees are concerned that the Local Plan shows a preference towards few larger sites.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge
SID252/S/H1/1		Not Sound	It is evident that the local plan in its current form should be deemed unsound as it fails to meet the housing requirements of the city. The inclusion of the Site would ensure that local and national housing targets are met and would have minimal impact on the historic city of York, indeed it would demonstrate that new housing can be accommodated within the city. There are no significant environmental and amenity restraints that would impede the development of the Site and it is deliverable in the short to medium term.	Arcus Consulting (Clare Walters) OBO Cobalt Housing York Limited
SID252/S/H1/3		Not Sound	Prior versions of the local plan emphasised the need for significant additional housing to be provided in York, but this is absent from the present iteration of the local plan. Long term trends in York show that there has consistently been an under-provision of housing, and so to fail to account for future needs and demand at this juncture would be an error. The housing requirements which do exist can only be met by further allocations of land for housing, and this would include the Site.	Arcus Consulting (Clare Walters) OBO Cobalt Housing York Limited
SID252/S/H1/4		Not Sound	The Consultation NPPF emphasises the importance of affordable housing provision and significant weight should therefore be given to the availability of the Site for this particular purpose. We would be happy for the Site to become a larger exception site for Affordable Housing, in line with the current Government Planning agenda, as this is a particular area that the City of York Council has failed in - the delivery of affordable homes for the people of York.	Arcus Consulting (Clare Walters) OBO Cobalt Housing York Limited
SID254/S/H1/2		Not Sound	The guidance within national planning policy has been carried forward into the CYCLP, at paragraphs 1.10 - 1.11. It states that "neighbourhood plans are a key element of neighbourhood planning and the Council is committed to supporting communities in preparing Neighbourhood Plans" . By failing to allocate our Clients land, against the wishes of the Rufforth and Knapton Neighbourhood Planning Group, the Council have failed to adhere to their own commitment.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Equibase Ltd (Nick Squire)

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID254/S/H1/3		Not Sound	Plan is unsound in its current form as it fails to meet the tests outlined in paragraph 182 of the NPPF. The Council's approach is not effective, positively planned or in accordance with national planning policy.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Equibase Ltd (Nick Squire)
SID255/S/H1Policy/ 1		Not Sound	The HBF also strongly recommends that the plan allocates more sites than required to meet the housing requirement as a buffer. This buffer should be sufficient to deal with any under-delivery which is likely to occur from some sites. The HBF recommends as large a contingency as possible (circa at least 20%) to the overall housing land supply	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID255/S/H1Policy/ 2		Not Sound	In principle, the use of gross to net ratios for sites is considered appropriate. However the use of 70% for large strategic sites may be an over-estimated given the significant infrastructure contributions that are likely to be required.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID255/S/H1Policy/ 3		Not Sound	The housing supply makes an allowance for windfall sites of 169 dwellings per annum from year 4. This is evidenced by the Windfall Technical Paper. However, it is noted that the use of historic windfall in an area where there has been no adopted Plan may not provide the most appropriate basis for windfall development going forward	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID259/S/H1/1		Not Sound	Land at Manor Heath Copmanthorpe (Owned by Askham Bryan should be removed from the green belt and allocated for housing.	Paul Butler Planning OBO David Wilson Homes
SID264/S/H1Policy/ 1		Not Sound	It is considered that policy H1, insofar as it includes the housing allocation known as ST9, is sound in that the allocation is justified, it has been positively prepared and it will be effective in delivering housing and as such the allocation will boost the supply of housing consistent with national policy.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land, Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID267/S/H1Policy/ 1		Not Sound	Seeking to adopt a plan with only 867 dpa over the plan period when there is evidence that there is a requirement for 1070 as set out in proposed DCLG for calculating housing need it is considered that the Plan has not been positively prepared.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID267/S/H1Policy/2		Not Sound	Plan proposes 169 dpa as windfalls. Due to restrictive nature of York, Green Belt boundary and diminishing infill sites it is questioned whether this is achievable.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID269/S/H1policy/1		Not Sound	All strategic sites are stated that they must be of a high standard. This is welcomed as is the requirement for all of them to be master planned (policies SS6-SS17) This requirement appears to have been omitted for Policies SS18, SS19 SS20 but should be included. It would be beneficial to York if the ST Sites should be expected to consult with the Yorkshire & Humber design Review Panel (or Local Review panel) as it will ensure the best design possible is achieved. The listed ST sites tend to be in Green Belt - how they are developed is critical to ensure the setting and character of York is not harmed.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID304/S/H1Policy/1		Sound	The Huntington & New Earswick Ward Cllrs having taken account of residents views agree to the non-allocation of previously considered sites such as; H48, ST11, ST18, Galtres Farm Proposal, and Site 191 (Avon Drive). By not allocating these sites the Cllrs view the Plan to be sound.	Cllr K Orrell
SID316/S/H1Policy/3			Site 72, the Water Tower Land. Inclusion of land for development would compromise Greenbelt boundaries. Surface water drainage issues.	Stuart Kay
SID316/S/H1Policy/4			Site 72, the Water Tower Land. Inclusion of land for development would compromise Greenbelt boundaries. Surface water drainage issues.	Stuart Kay
SID316/S/H1Policy/			Site 737 Stockhill Field. Agricultural use and not suitable for development.	Stuart Kay
SID316/S/H1Policy/			Site 748 Adjacent Stamford Bridge Road. Agricultural use and not suitable for development. Development in Greenbelt.	Stuart Kay
SID316/S/H1Policy/			Site 899 York Road. Greenbelt Land. Development adversely impact on the Village.	Stuart Kay
SID316/S/H1Policy/			Site 738 Land to South Side of Intake Lane. Agricultural use and not suitable for development. Development in Greenbelt.	Stuart Kay

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID339/S/H1 (Policy)/1		Not Sound	<p>The policy also explains that the allocations will be phased, albeit table 5.1 only provides estimated phasing. The Council have had a persistent record of under delivery due to not having an adopted plan and due to the extent of Green Belt land which surrounds the district. It is noted that the Council continue to omit our Clients sites – Manor Heath, Copmanthope (ref: ST12); Riverside Gardens, Elvington (ref: SF10) and New Lane, Huntington (ref: ST11). In addition, none of our Clients land interests have been included within the allocation at land to the west of Elvington Lane (ref: ST15). In terms of windfall allowance, we have previously raised objections to the Council’s approach to the provision of a windfall allowance. Our Client continues to object to this proposal as it will lead to uncertainty over delivery and will potentially lead to under delivery of housing. In total, the Council are relying on circa 20% of their housing requirement through the plan period to come forward from windfall - considered to be high. Past records of windfall can be linked back to the lack of an adopted plan, which in turn places an overreliance of windfall sites. This approach is not positively planned or effective and is unsound, having failed to meet the tests outlined in paragraph 182 of the Framework.</p>	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID345/S/H1Policy/1		Not Sound	<p>Welcome reference to PDL but need amendments to ensure the trajectory is justified and effective.</p>	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/H1Policy/2		Not Sound	<p>The proposed policy also states “Where sites contain existing open space, this will be an important consideration in the development of the site and the open space needs of the area will need to be fully assessed”. The policy fails to explain why/how this will be an important consideration. Presumably this aims to retain existing identified open space provision, unless suitable alternative open space of similar or better quality can be provided.</p>	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID347/S/H1Policy/1		Not Sound	<p>Policy H1 is linked to the delivery of housing and seeks to provide for housing through the plan period. The policy seeks to restrain housing delivery to a specific phasing. The approach set out in Policy H1 is objected to particularly in circumstances where in the City housing delivery has not met needs and there has over a sustained period been persistent under delivery of housing. Objections are as follows;- No sites should be held back whilst there is any evidence of under delivery or persistent under delivery where a 20% buffer is in play - Five year supply is a minimum requirement and therefore should not be used to hold back housing delivery of otherwise acceptable and sustainable housing proposals - In order to fully understand the extent of additional housing needed to be allocated, there needs to be a full and detailed assessment of commitments to ensure they remain deliverable - Prioritizing brown filed sites over greenfield sites sequentially is not in line with national policy - The approach to windfall is fails to respond to a plan led planning system and create a significant over reliance from such sites in circumstances where government policy requires evidence not only that such windfall has provided a reliable source of supply but also WILL CONTINUE to be such a source. This cannot be confirmed in the circumstances of the City where past windfall has had to form a significant component of supply in the absence of a Plan – with an adopted Plan there is no evidence to support continued high levels of windfall - The evidence of past delivery against need shows persistent under delivery, a 20 % buffer applies and this is recognised by the City - The Plan must show a 5 year supply upon adoption and no such calculation is set out - The trajectory needs to respond to past under delivery by boosting supply as soon as possible - There is no evidence to suggest that a significant boost to supply could not take place over the next 5 years - The shortfall in delivery to date should be made up in the next 5 years (Sedgefield approach) rather than the extended (Liverpool) residual method adopted by the Council - The Councils approach only serves to continue under delivery for longer than necessary</p>	Planning Prospects (Jason Tait) OBO Miller Homes
SID350/S/H1Policy/1		Not Sound	The draft plan also includes over-optimistic assumptions over the predicted levelof windfall.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Picton Capital
SID354/S/H1/1		Not Sound	Land north of Northminster Business Park, Poppleton - Given that the land to the south of Poppleton Park & Ride is now allocated as 'White Land' (without any designation) in the Neighbourhood Plan, the land should properly be considered as a housing allocation given the overriding objectively assessed need which will, in all certainty, require deletions of Green Belt in other locations. As a matter of principle therefore, the allocation of this site for housing must be preferred.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID354/S/H1/1		Not Sound	The plan is generally unsound because it seeks to identify too few sites to meet its housing requirement, but caution should be applied to allocating further sites in Wheldrake, unless there is a clear strategy for further sites coming forwards later in the plan period. Generally there are better located potential additional sites in other market areas.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID357/S/H1/1		Not Sound	The Fulford site along with land to the north extending towards Heslington Lane would comprise a sustainable urban extension to this part of York with land to the west comprising white land within the settlement limits and therefore the sites would comprise a natural extension to the settlement.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID366/S/H1Policy/1		Sound	The consultation Plan identifies that CYC have five spatial principles - the redevelopment of land at Peppermint Court can be considered to be in line with these strategies.	Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services
SID366/S/H1Policy/2		Sound	The consultation Plan identifies that CYC have five spatial principles - the redevelopment of land at Cherry Tree House can be considered to be in line with these strategies.	Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services
SID366/S/H1Policy/3		Sound	The consultation Plan identifies that CYC have five spatial principles - the redevelopment of land at the Limetrees site can be considered to be in line with these strategies.	Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services
SID369/S/H1 (policy)/1		Sound	Previously raised concern about the viability of the Whiteland Field site in Haxby, particularly with regard to the large electricity pylons and power lines within the proposed site. I was therefore pleased to note this site has been removed from proposals.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID376/S/H1Policy/1		Not Sound	Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd object to Policy H1 as it is not consistent with two key requirements of the NPPF; to provide sufficient housing allocations to significantly boost the supply of housing and to meet the objectively assessed needs of the City over the plan period. As set out in relation to Policy SS1, TW have significant objections to the Council's suggested housing requirement Housing Land Supply The representations prepared by Lichfields (appended to these representations) on behalf of a number of house builders including (Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd) provides a detailed assessment of the Council's suggested supply and raised a number of significant issues as summarised below: The Council has not produced a detailed trajectory or a detailed assessment of the 5-year • housing land position nor has it provided a detailed trajectory for the plan period; The Lichfields assessment confirms that the Council is unable to demonstrate a 5 year housing • land supply based on its own suggested housing requirement (867 dwellings per annum). The plan is therefore unsound as the Council cannot demonstrate a 5 year housing land supply on adoption; and The 5 year supply position is significantly worse when using the SHMA OAHN and Lichfields' • position. Highlighted also were under delivery, boosting supply /early plan review and additional sites (Land at Glatres Farm)	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID378/S/H1/1		Not Sound	LDP object to Policy H1, as the housing allocations are insufficient to meet the housing needs.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID380/S/H1Policy/1			We request clarification as to which elements of the Hungate scheme Phases 5+ and 328 dwellings refers to, to ensure that this is consistent with the consented and future proposals for this site.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID393/S/H1Policy/1		Sound	I remain of the belief that the allocation of housing on Greenbelt land in the Heworth Without and Osbaldwick wards is unnecessary and inappropriate. Current government policy has resulted in a situation that has required the allocation of such land in the current plan. Under such circumstances, I endorse the work that has been undertaken by officers to try and mitigate the harmful effects of this. This includes: The prevention of coalescence between the newly proposed development and existing housing. This maintains the inherently semi-rural nature of Heworth Without and allows the Greenbelt to maintain its function as enshrined in the NPPF. The protection of the millennium way – an important piece of public open space which is lacking in the area. The separation between the proposed new settlement and main entry routes into the city, ensuring the historic character of the city is not compromised. The restriction on housing numbers accessing from Stockton Lane due to the inability of the road network to cope with any further traffic.	Cllr N Ayre
SID393/S/H1 Policy/2		Sound	I have also been made aware of a proposal from land owners between Stockton Lane and Malton Road for a further substantial housing development. The sites proposed have already been assessed by the council and found to be wholly unsuitable for development, as they involve substantial loss of some of the most valuable greenbelt land in the city and have no provisions for necessary infrastructure. The current proposals appear to involve some annexing of and potentially a new access road through Monk Stray.	Cllr N Ayre
SID394/S/H1Policy/1		Not Sound	We consider that the Local Plan needs to bring forward additional sites to meet the City of York's Objectively Assessed Housing Need. It is considered that our client's land to the 'west of Common Road, Dunnington' should be allocated for older persons housing to help meet the OAN within the city area.	The Planning Bureau (Stephen Courcier) OBO McCarthy & Stone Retirement Lifestyles Ltd
SID401/S/H1/1			Previous concerns not taken into account. Way in which the plan notes housing delivery beyond the Plan period of 2033 is not in conformity with the NPPF. Unsound because it intends to allocate land for development beyond the scope of the time frame in which planning policy is intended to apply.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/H1Policy/2		Not Sound	Policy H1 as drafted refers to phasing but lacks timescales. Table 5.1 informs of no phased release mechanism with only the MoD Sites having a delivery delay due to disposal dates. Insufficient range of sites are identified given concerns with housing requirement, and lack of identification of safeguarded sites.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/H2 (Policy)/1			Policy H1 as drafted refers to phasing but lacks timescales. Table 5.1 informs of no phased release mechanism with only the MoD Sites having a delivery delay due to disposal dates. Insufficient range of sites are identified given concerns with housing requirement, and lack of identification of safeguarded sites.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/H1(Policy)/1			Policy H1 refers to phasing but lacks timescales. Table 5.1 informs of no phased release mechanism Insufficient range of sites are identified given concerns with housing requirement, and lack of identification of safeguarded sites. Question the validity of including windfalls given the average trend used is based on a time with no adopted plan.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/H1Policy/2		Not Sound	Policy H1 as drafted refers to phasing but lacks timescales. Table 5.1 informs of no phased release mechanism with only the MoD Sites having a delivery delay due to disposal dates. Insufficient range of sites are identified given concerns with housing requirement, and lack of identification of safeguarded sites.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID590/S/H1(Policy)/1		Not Sound		ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID592/S/H1policy/1		Not Sound	Objects to the removal of H33 Land to the south of the water tower, Dunnington - rep goes into further detail but to summarise - OAHN figure is incorrectly low, it is only because of this that H33 has been removed.	ONEILL Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Yorvik Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID595/S/H1Policy/ 1		Not Sound	We object to the site (Former SF10: Riverside Gardens Elvington) being rejected as a potential housing option within CYC's Publication Draft Local Plan. The development proposals are situated in a suitable and highly sustainable location there are no technical or environmental (built and natural) constraints that would preclude the development of the site. Additional housing allocations to those currently proposed by CYC will need to be identified in order to meet the City's housing needs over the proposed plan period. Which is why we fully support CYC's Officer's recent recommendation to allocate the site for residential development. Though we would suggest that a quantum of 110 homes be applied to the site. See also supporting evidence provided by Barton Wilmore for this site together with previous reps on this site. .	Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID595/S/H1Policy/ 2		Not Sound	Object to former ST11 being rejected as a potential housing option within CYC's Publication Draft Local Plan. The site represents one of the most sustainable locations for new residential development in the City. The site benefits from strong defensible boundaries, and there are no technical or environmental (built and natural) constraints that would preclude the development of the site. We believe that there is a compelling case for the release of additional land as housing allocations within the CYC Local Plan in order to meet the City's full objectively assessed housing needs. Consequently, the New Lane, Huntington proposals have the potential to provide up to 250 new homes, public open space, green wedges and associated infrastructure.	Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID597/S/H1policy/ 1		Not Sound	Objecting to the exclusion of their site SF1 Land North of Flaxton Road, Strensall. Say it could be brought forward for housing. Rep goes into greater detail but to summarise - argues plan is unsound regarding paragraph 182 of the NPPF (housing provision too low), that previous evidence on deliverability submitted by letter on 30th October 2017 has been ignored, the site is needed for the plan to meet OAHN of the city.	Paul Butler Planning OBO Mr K Chan
SID597/S/H1policy/ 2		Not Sound	The September 2017 SHLAA and Officer report to LPWG July 2017 reassessed the potential to restore the allocation of an area that included the majority of Site Ref. SF1 but officer report says it failed criteria 4 – access to facilities and transport. Stresses that their client's site is the only area of the previously proposed allocation that was not re-assessed by CYC's Officers in July 2017. Their client's site relates to the south-western corner of previous site Ref. SF1, which is located within walking and cycling distance from a number of services and facilities of the Village. Goes on to detail proposal for 30 homes at density of 30dph.	Paul Butler Planning OBO Mr K Chan
SID598/S/H1policy/ 3		Not Sound	Objects to deletion of site 55 / formerly H26 Dauby Lane, it should be included in the plan to help reach the housing target. The plan does not offer a diverse choice of housing, the sites identified will not yield the numbers quoted, overall it will fail to meet the housing needs of the city. (rep goes into further detail)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/S/H1policy/ 4		Not Sound	Objects to deletion of site 814 / formerly SF4 Land north of Haxby, it should be included in the plan as safeguarded land. The plan does not offer a diverse choice of housing, the sites identified will not yield the numbers quoted, overall it will fail to meet the housing needs of the city. The site does not fulfil the five greenbelt purposes and the NPPF advises land that does not need to be kept permanently open should not be included in the green belt. Rep goes into further detail on history of the site.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID598/S/H1policy/5		Not Sound	Objects to deletion of site 859 / formerly SF15 Land north of Escrick, it should be included in the plan as safeguarded land. The plan does not offer a diverse choice of housing, the sites identified will not yield the numbers quoted, overall it will fail to meet the housing needs of the city. The site does not fulfil the five greenbelt purposes and the NPPF advises land that does not need to be kept permanently open should not be included in the green belt. (Rep goes into further detail about history of the site)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/S/H1policy/6		Not Sound	Objects to deletion of site 872 / formerly ST12 Manor Heath, Copmanthorpe, it should be included in the plan as a housing allocation. ST12 scores higher on the 2016 Preferred Sites Sustainability Appraisal than other sites such as ST14, ST15 and ST31 that are included in the plan. The site should not be included in the green belt. The plan does not offer a diverse choice of housing, the sites identified will not yield the numbers quoted, overall it will fail to meet the housing needs of the city. (Rep goes into further detail about history of the site)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/S/H1policy/7		Not Sound	Objects to the exclusion of site 882 - Askham Lane, Acomb and Land south of Foxwood Lane, Askham. The plan does not offer a diverse choice of housing, the sites identified will not yield the numbers quoted, overall it will fail to meet the housing needs of the city. Site 882 is suitable for sustainable development. (Rep goes into further detail about history of the site)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/S/H1policy/8		Not Sound	Objects to the deletion of site 926 - (formerly H28) North Lane, Wheldrake. The plan does not offer a diverse choice of housing, the sites identified will not yield the numbers quoted, overall it will fail to meet the housing needs of the city. Site 926 is completely suitable for development as detailed by the council's evidence base, it has never been argued otherwise, the only reason this site has been excluded is because the incorrectly low OAHN has made it surplus to requirements. (Rep goes into further detail about history of the site)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/S/H1policy/1		Not Sound	Objects to deletion of site 131 (formerly ST13 Moor Lane Copmanthorpe). The plan does not offer a diverse choice of housing, the sites identified will not yield the numbers quoted, overall it will fail to meet the housing needs of the city. Site 131 is suitable for development as detailed by the council's evidence base, it has never been argued otherwise, the only reason this site has been excluded is because the incorrectly low OAHN has made it surplus to requirements. (Rep goes into further detail about history and suitability of the site)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/S/H1policy/1		Not Sound	Objects to deletion of site 903 (formerly H34 Land north of Church Lane). The plan does not offer a diverse choice of housing, the sites identified will not yield the numbers quoted, overall it will fail to meet the housing needs of the city. Site 903 is suitable for development, the only reason this site has been deleted from the plan is because the incorrectly low OAHN has deemed it surplus to requirements. (Rep goes into further detail about history and suitability of the site)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID602/S/H1policy/ 1		Not Sound	Object to deletion of site 187 (formerly ST30) and The Wider Site - Land North of Stockton Lane. The plan does not offer a diverse choice of housing, the sites identified will not yield the numbers quoted, overall it will fail to meet the housing needs of the city. Site 187 is suitable for development, it does not serve greenbelt purposes and the only reason this site has been deleted from the plan is because the incorrectly low OAHN has deemed it surplus to requirements. Rep also takes issue with the site's scoring in Sustainability Appraisal, arguing it scored better than other sites that have been included. Developers also wish to extend the site boundary to the north and north-east in collaboration with sports clubs that currently use most of this additional land - this is the Wider Site that is referred to. (Rep goes into further detail about history and suitability of the site.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID603/S/H1Policy/ 1		Not Sound	Maintain for the reasons given and as set out in extensive representations to date, the proposed housing allocations will not meet the appropriate level of OAN for the City over the plan period. Need a buffer to deal with under delivery. Plan underestimates delivery times and overestimates amount of housing availability on sites. Object to inclusion of over 2000 units of windfall.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited
SID604/S/H1(Policy) /1		Not Sound	The proposed housing allocations will not meet the appropriate level of OAN for the City over the plan period. In this respect the plan is not sound, justified, effective or in accordance with national policy. Concerns re the methodology for selecting sites.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID607/S/H1(Policy) /1		Not Sound	Should include site at Malton Road (previous ref H50) as housing allocation. Could provide up to 150 dwellings if fully developed, alongside strategic open space. The site is on the urban fringe and relates closely to the existing residential areas to the north-west and west, as well as employment and retail uses at MonksCross, to facilitate a sustainable extension to the existing urban area. Extensive supporting information provided.	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO Taylor Wimpey
SID608/S/H1(Policy) /1		Not Sound	Land at Park Farm, Skelton should be allocated as mixed use (housing and employment)	Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Messrs N Blacker & Son
SID609/S/H1Policy/ 1		Not Sound	The current plan fails to provide enough housing and particular affordable / social housing for the future, falling massively short of the minimum overall 1070 homes per year requirement the Government's draft 2017 proposals.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID611/S/H1 (Policy)/1		Not Sound	The plan is over-reliant on delivery from York Central site to achieve its development targets, which has challenging access and infrastructure issues to overcome.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID613/S/H1(Policy)/1		Not Sound	The Plan does not allocate enough land to meet identified need, in light of associated comments regarding the need to increase the annual housing target to reflect the Government's standardised methodology.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Askham Bryan College
SID614/S/H1 (Policy)/1		Not Sound	The plan is over-reliant on delivery from York Central site to achieve its development targets, which has challenging access and infrastructure issues to overcome.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID615/S/H1Policy/1		Not Sound	Criticism due to housing requirement too low, calculations of completions since 2012 too high, commitments to include student housing should be excluded, and the assumptions on windfalls are questionable. The 16 strategic allocated sites make up around 90% of the total housing yield. The proposed changes to the allocation are made in context of considerable doubt over the Council's overall assessment of its housing requirement. The changes to the allocation as proposed would have a significantly positive contribution both to meeting the housing need, and crucially in allowing for delivery within the early years of the plan.	ONEILL Associates (Philip Holmes) OBO Heworth Green Gasworks Ltd
SID620/S/H1(Policy)/1		Not Sound	Land north east of Huntington (Galtres Garden Village - ref 964) should be allocated as a new settlement. The site will accommodate 1,753 residential units which includes a 64-person care home on 77.37 hectares of land with an additional 15.6ha provided as a country park. The representation contains extensive supporting information relating to: Green Belt, Highway Impact and Access, Landscape, Ecology, Archaeology, Heritage, Flood Risk and Drainage as well as Sustainability Appraisal, Viability and Deliverability.	Eamonn Keogh ONEILL Associates OBO Galtres Village Development Company
SID826/S/H1(policy)/1		Not Sound	The plan does not provide a sufficient range of sites to provide enough sales outlets to enable delivery to be maintained at the required levels throughout the plan period. The sites included are too large and would have long lead in times, followed by a slow build out period, due to the sales at a single location. Persistent undersupply has left a backlog, this needs to be addressed. The plan does not provide 5 years worth of housing with an additional buffer of 20% to ensure choice and competition in the market for land. The focus should be on small and medium sized deliverable sites. The 20% requirement of smaller sites has been ignored.	Thomas Pilcher Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID837/S/H1Policy/1		Not Sound	These representations relate to the green belt boundary and to the non-allocation of land for residential development north of Escrick. CYC officers have repeatedly confirmed that the site passes its site selection criteria. Selby DC supported the allocation for housing that was ultimately undermined and we doubt the duty to co-operate has been discharged properly in relation to this site. At the last consultation stage the site was proposed as safeguarded land - it is not known what submissions the developer will make at this stage. A series of technical reports previously submitted to demonstrate the develop ability of the site have been included in the rep.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO Escrick Park Estates Combined
SID838/S/H1Policy/1		Not Sound	Seeking to adopt a plan with only 867 dpa over the plan period when there is evidence that there is a requirement for 1070 as set out in proposed DCLG for calculating housing need it is considered that the Plan has not been positively prepared.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID838/S/H1Policy/2		Not Sound	Plan proposes 169 dpa as windfalls. Due to restrictive nature of York, Green Belt boundary and diminishing infill sites it is questioned whether this is achievable.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID842/S/H1Policy/1		Not Sound	The plan is not justified because the most appropriate strategy has not been considered against alternatives such as "new towns" between Green Hammerton and York.	Peter Eaves
SID848/S/H1Policy/1			Avant homes object to land North of the A59 and west of the A1237, East of Station Road Poppleton not being included within the local plan as a housing site as previously proposed. The site is partly brownfield and we object to its retention within the greenbelt. The site would be sustainable with direct links to rail, cycle and park and ride bus facilities which already have permission for expansion.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID848/S/H1(Policy)/1			Policy H1 refers to phasing but lacks timescales. Table 5.1 informs of no phased release mechanism Insufficient range of sites are identified given concerns with housing requirement, and lack of identification of safeguarded sites. Question the validity of including windfalls given the average trend used is based on a time with no adopted plan.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID42/Mod/H1polic y/1			Sees early adoption of the Local Plan as essential to promote the development of strategic sites ST1, ST2 and particularly ST5. Indecision has disrupted development of these three sites.	Brian McClure



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/Mod/H1(site )/1			(a) Add an Appendix at the end of the Plan which sets out the detailed considerations which would need to be taken into account in the development of each of the proposed allocations. (b) Add the following to the end of the first Paragraph of Policy H1:- "Proposals for the development of the allocated sites will be required to accord with the development principles set out in Appendix 1"	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID210/Mod/H1Policy/3			In order to address the conflicts identified and ensure that Policy H1 is sound, it is considered that City of York Council should amend the Policy as follows: 1 The Local Plan should allocate this additional land to meet the housing needs of the community. These sites should be able to deliver early in the plan period. This is the only approach that will deliver a 'sound' plan and enable the much needed investment in new housing to meet the community's needs. 2 The identification of a portfolio of small site allocations (e.g. up to 250 dwellings) around existing settlements and the main urban area would assist in meeting any shortfall created by the delay in large sites delivering dwellings early in the plan period. 3 The boundary of the Green Belt should be defined such that land at Brecks Lane, Southfields Road and Princess Road, Strensall are excluded from it and allocated for residential development on the Local Plan Proposals Map. It should be noted that the above assessment is reliant upon the information provided in the LPP and associated evidence base documents. Lichfields therefore reserves the right to update the above evidence as and when further information becomes available.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID214/Mod/H1/2			Alternatively, or in combination with a housing scheme, the site west of Landing Lane could also accommodate a care home and retirement village complex to meet the immediate and pressing need for elderly person accommodation in the city.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID214/Mod/H1/3			The housing requirement figure for the Plan Period should be increased to at least 1,100 dwellings per annum	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID231/Mod/H1Policy/1			Agrees that the open land between the A64 and Fulford and Heslington makes a particular contribution to special character. Considers that this designation should be extended to include all the open land to the south and east of Low Lane, currently without planning permission for development , as it too fulfils an important buffer function.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID255/Mod/H1Policy/1			HBF propose that the policy is modified as follows:• That sites are allocated to provide for at least the CLG methodology housing requirement, with an additional buffer of at least 20% to support delivery and provide choice and flexibility. • That the Council engages with the relevant landowner, promoter or developer to ensure that the potential capacities identified are appropriate and to ensure that the proposed allocations are delivery within the plan period. That further sites are allocated to meet the needs identified, rather than relying on windfall development.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID256/Mod/H1/1			The overall housing requirement should be increased in line with recommendations	Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes - Liam Tate
SID267/Mod/H1Policy/1			Council should delete more land from the Green belt and allocate more land for housing.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID267/Mod/H1Policy/2			Housing requirement should be increased.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID269/Mod/H1policy/1			All strategic sites are stated that they must be of a high standard. This is welcomed as is the requirement for all of them to be master planned (policies SS6-SS17) This requirement appears to have been omitted for Policies SS18, SS19 SS20 but should be included. It would be beneficial to York if the ST Sites should be expected to consult with the Yorkshire & Humber design Review Panel (or Local Review panel) as it will ensure the best design possible is achieved.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID345/MOD/H1Policy/1			Policy H1 - trajectory of sites should be amended to reflect previously developed land first. In particular, H59 to years 1-10, ST35 to years 1-10 and ST36 to 2031 not year 2033 start.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID347/Mod/H1Policy/1			The plan should set out a 5 year supply requirement using realistic assumptions on commitments, applying a 20% buffer and a Sedgefield approach to meeting the shortfall in delivery to date. References to windfall should be omitted, Phasing should promote early delivery and the sequential prioritization of brownfield sites should be deleted.	Planning Prospects (Jason Tait) OBO Miller Homes
SID357/Mod/H1/1			It remains our case these sites should duly be assessed proposed allocations to assist in meeting the identified housing need for York, which we maintain is higher than the figure being proposed in the Publication Draft:- •Land to the east of Cotswold Way and north of North Lane, Huntington • Land off Mitchel's Lane, Fulford	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID359/Mod/H1Policy/1			Clifton Park Hospital Site could accommodate a mixed used scheme across two phases that could meet the identified need for additional housing sites in York. Various Development Options Available within 3.6ha site.	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO NHS Property Services
SID364/Mod/H1Policy/2			Immediate release of readily deliverable land to achieve housing target. Increase scale of sites where constrained to ensure full range of facilities and services are provided. Major sites developed on "garden city" principles or if not sufficient then allocate Greenfield sites that were identified in early drafts. ST1 should be used for new public park. H56 threats potential community use of university playing fields.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID380/Mod/H1Policy/1			The reference to the estimated yield for the Hungate site is updated to make clear that this is a minimum figure.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID581/Mod/H1/1		Not Sound	Land at Moor Lane, Woodthorpe (previously ST10) should be allocated for housing. Representation includes extensive supporting evidence.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP
SID582/Mod/H1Policy/2			Insert Plan Period Dates . Identify additional sites to meet the increased recommended housing requirement,	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID584/Mod/H1(Policy)/1			Student accommodation figures (such as those for privately managed off campus accommodation) should be excluded from completion figures as CLGs household projections upon which Yorks OAHN is based do not include them.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/Mod/H1(Policy)/2			Insert plan period datesIdentify additional sites to meet increased OANProvide a buffer of sites to provide choice and flexibility and not place an over reliance on windfall delivery. Remove reference to phasing. Remove text on 5 year supply assuming there is no release mechanism, thus no need for 5 year supply text.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/H1Policy/2			Insert Plan Period Dates . Identify additional sites to meet the increased recommended housing requirement.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID587/Mod/H1(Policy)/1			Land south of Cherry Lane, Dringhouses is suitable for development and should be included as a housing allocation to help meet the city's housing need (Rep goes into further detail on site suitability, provides evidence.)	Oneill Associates (Eamonn Keogh)OBO Shepherd Homes Land at Cherry Lane
SID594/Mod/H1(policy)/1			Site ST7: Alternative Site Size proposed: Option A: 845 houses in an area of 43.53ha, 60% net developable area 26.4Ha at 32dph.	Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7
SID594/Mod/H1(policy)/4			Option 2. 945 houses on an area of 43.53Ha, 70% net developable area - 30.47 Ha net site area at 32dph.	Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7
SID594/Mod/H1(policy)/7			Option 3: 1,225 Homes on an area of 57.27 Ha, 70% net developable area – 40.1 Ha net site area at 32dph.	Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7
SID615/Mod/H1Policy/1			Commitments to include student housing the housing requirement should be excluded.	Oneill Associates (Philip Holmes) OBO Heworth Green Gasworks Ltd
SID826/Mod/H1(policy)/1			The site selection process should be re-run with a focus on sustainable, deliverable and viable sites. There should be a greater number of sites and there should be more smaller and medium sized sites. These deliverable sites can meet the 20% buffer for the 5 year supply.	Thomas Pilcher Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID827/Mod/H1 (Policy)/1			The Site selection work from 2014 should be reviewed by the inspector to assess which sites were removed on political rather than technical ground	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID827/Mod/H1 (Po			Change the sites selected to the most sustainable, deliverable and viable.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID838/Mod/H1Policy/1			Council should delete more land from the Green belt and allocate more land for housing.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID838/Mod/H1Policy/2			Housing requirement should be increased.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID848/Mod/H1(Policy)/2			Insert plan period datesIdentify additional sites to meet increased OANProvide a buffer of sites to provide choice and flexibility and not place an over reliance on windfall delivery. Remove reference to phasing. Remove text on 5 year supply assuming there is no release mechanism, thus no need for 5 year supply text.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID848/Mod/H1(Policy)/1			Student accommodation figures (such as those for privately managed off campus accommodation) should be excluded from completion figures as CLGs household projections upon which Yorks OAHN is based do not include them.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H1 Former Gas Works, 24 Heworth Green (Phase 1)

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/Mod/H1(site)/1	Not Sound		H1 - This site lies opposite the boundary of the Heworth Green/East Parade/Huntington Road Conservation Area. 26 Heworth Green, on the northern side of this site, is a Grade II Listed Building. If this site is allocated, the Plan should make it clear that development proposals for this area would need to ensure that those elements which contribute to the significance of the Heworth Green/East Parade/Huntington Road Conservation Area and the adjacent Listed Building are not harmed.	Historic England - Ian Smith
-----------------------	-----------	--	---	------------------------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID615/Mod/H1(site)/1			Representation on behalf of brownfield Heworth Green Gasworks Ltd in respect of its land comprising the former gas works at Heworth Green. Representation seeks to make comments in respect of the housing yield and redevelopment phasing for the site. Site is now under sole control of a group of York investors and is capable of being viably delivered in the short term. It is considered the site should be reassessed in terms of both the quantum and estimated phasing of the of development to reflect their intentions to bring the site forward for development in the short term.	ONEill Associates (Philip Holmes) OBO Heworth Green Gasworks Ltd
-----------------------	--	--	---	--

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H5 Lowfield School

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID29/LC/H5site/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Comments here refer to the process used to determine the future of Lowfields Playing Fields. The council owns the playing field and failed in its duty to consult impartially. It submitted a planning application to develop the site at the same time as it was consulting on the site's Local Plan designation (autumn 2017).	Save Lowfields Playing Field Action Group - Phil Young
SID29/LC/H5site/2	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Should be noted that development site 5 (Lowfields) is incorrectly represented on the map, part of the site is currently open space.	Save Lowfields Playing Field Action Group - Phil Young

#### Soundness

SID29/S/H5site/1		Not Sound	Development of H5 is in conflict with many of the Local Plan's other policies specifically: para 2.17 of policy DP2 Sustainable Development, para 2.19 of Policy DP3 Sustainable Communities, para 9.14-9.18 policy GI5 Protection of Open Space and Play Fields and policy GI6 New Open Space Provision. Also, there is a shortage of open space in the Westfield Ward generally and in the Lowfields area specifically, this will be exacerbated by development. No local compensatory open space is offered for the losses at Lowfields (see page 172 of DPLP).	Save Lowfields Playing Field Action Group - Phil Young
------------------	--	-----------	--	--

#### Proposed Modification

SID29/Mod/H5site/1			The number of homes allocated to the Lowfields development in section 5, site H5, page 92 should be reduced from 162 to a maximum of 120 homes (plus the 80 bed care home). Development would be restricted to the former built footprint of the 5.4 ha site (as was promised by the Council when the Lowfields school closure was announced in 2008, and which was subsequently respected, in every iteration of the emerging Local Plan, until 2016). We have already evidenced to the York Council how development could be achieved while retaining the present, well used, sports pitches. The playing fields would continue as public open space and would incorporate the existing sports pitches. The open space (2.7 ha) would be further managed to conserve natural flora and fauna while improving play facilities.	Save Lowfields Playing Field Action Group - Phil Young
--------------------	--	--	---	--

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H6 Land R/O The Square Tadcaster Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID215/LC/H6(Site)/1			Housing allocation H6 should be extended to include the land at the rear of the Hospice with the Green Belt running along the eastern boundary of site. Remove the reference to use class C3(b) within the proposed allocation, instead referring to it as 'specialist housing and headquarters building for the Wilberforce Trust'	ONEill Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Wilberforce Trust
----------------------	--	--	---	---

#### Soundness

SID215/S/H6(Site)/1	Not Sound		The purpose of these representations is to set out a series of amendments to housing allocation H6 in order to make it consistent with the Trust's proposals for the site. The changes include:- Re-designate the housing allocation H6 from a C3(b) use class to C3(a)- Extend the allocation to include a further 0.5 hectares of land to the north, which lies to the east of St Leonards Hospice so that the Green Belt boundary is more clearly defined.	ONEill Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Wilberforce Trust
SID215/S/H6(Site)/2	Not Sound		In responding to the allocation of part of the site within the Local Plan Consultation Draft, the first step is to clarify the use class of the proposed accommodation. The allocation was originally referred to as 'Residential Extra Care C2 facilities in association with the Wilberforce Trust' although the use class has subsequently been amended to C3(b) i.e. not more than six residents living together as a single household where care is provided. In our view, the proposed development does not fall into either of these categories and the most appropriate use class is C3(a)	ONEill Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Wilberforce Trust
SID215/S/H6(Site)/3	Not Sound		The Trust supports the allocation of land to the rear of the Square for housing development. However, in line with the representations that we submitted prior to the publication of the Draft Local Plan, it is considered that the allocated area should be extended to include the land at the rear of St Leonards Hospice.	ONEill Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Wilberforce Trust
SID215/S/H6(Site)/4	Not Sound		The inclusion of land at the rear of the Hospice within York's Green Belt is not consistent with the advice in the NPPF regarding the definition of Green Belt boundaries. Paragraph 85 of the NPPF states that when defining boundaries, local planning authorities should define boundaries clearly, using physical features that are readily recognisable and likely to be permanent. Whereas we would accept that the southern, western and eastern boundaries of housing allocation H6 are clearly defined, there are no existing physical features that are readily recognisable in defining the northern boundary of the allocation i.e. the current boundary of the Green Belt	ONEill Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Wilberforce Trust

#### Proposed Modification



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H6 Land R/O The Square Tadcaster Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID215/Mod/H6(Site)/1			Remove the reference to use class C3(b) within the proposed allocation, instead referring to it as 'specialist housing and headquarters building for the Wilberforce Trust'	ONEILL Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Wilberforce Trust
SID215/Mod/H6(Site)/2			Housing allocation H6 should be extended to include the land at the rear of the Hospice with the Green Belt running along the eastern boundary of site. Alternative boundary.	ONEILL Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Wilberforce Trust

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

Site H7 Bootham Crescent

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

### Soundness

SID125/S/H7site/1

Persimmon supports the allocation of this site for residential development. The company has a legal agreement with the owners of the site which allows the site to be redeveloped. There is an extant planning application which will be superseded by a new residential planning application. It is intended that once the football club moves to its replacement ground, for which contracts have now been let, the residential redevelopment will be able to commence.

Persimmon Homes -  
Robin McGinn

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H10 The Barbican

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID318/S/H10/3			Supports H10	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
----------------	--	--	--------------	--

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/H10site/1			H10 - This site lies opposite the City Walls (a Scheduled Monument) and the Central Historic Core Conservation Area. If this site is allocated, the Plan should make it clear that development proposals for this area would need to ensure that those elements which contribute to the significance of the City Walls and Central Historic Core Conservation Area are not harmed and also set out specific parameters for the design of any buildings in this sensitive location...	Historic England - Ian Smith
----------------------	--	--	--	------------------------------

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H29 Land at Moor Lane Copmanthorpe

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID200/S/H29/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Kaite Betts
SID202/LC/H29/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Darren Magson
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID88/S/H29/1		Sound	Believes the plan to be sound Only complaint is that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming over already over-stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Brian Bell
SID89/S/H29/1		Sound	Believes the plan to be sound Only complaint is that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming over already over-stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Maxine Bell
SID171/S/H29/1		Sound	Believes the plan to be sound Only complaint is that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming over already over-stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Megan Taylor
SID200/S/H29/2			Satisfied that the documents are legally compliant. Would prefer that housing densities for two development sites in Copmanthorpe reduced to densities given in Policy CNP2 of Draft Neighbourhood Plan, due to them being greater than current average density for the village and would result in overwhelming of infrastructure and services	Kaite Betts
SID202/S/H29/1			In respect of Section 3, support and agreement with City of York Council's processes, procedures and justifications and satisfied it is legally compliant. Would prefer that housing densities for two development sites in Copmanthorpe reduced to densities given in Policy CNP2 of Draft Neighbourhood Plan, due to them being greater than current average density for the village and would result in overwhelming of infrastructure and services.	Darren Magson

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H29 Land at Moor Lane Copmanthorpe

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID202/S/H29/1		Sound	In respect of Section 3, support and agreement with City of York Council's processes, procedures and justifications and satisfied it is legally compliant. Would prefer that housing densities for two development sites in Copmanthorpe reduced to densities given in Policy CNP2 of Draft Neighbourhood Plan, due to them being greater than current average density for the village and would result in overwhelming of infrastructure and services.	Darren Magson
SID273/S/H29/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site H29 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Margaret Thomas
SID278/S/H29/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site H29 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Gillian Hinton
SID301/S/H29/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site H29 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Copmanthorpe Parish Council - Diane Stones
SID302/S/H29/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site H29 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Jeffrey Clarke
SID596/S/H29/1		Sound	Fully support the proposed allocation for development of site H29 - Land at Moor Lane Copmanthorpe. Attaches documents from previous representation in October 2017 to re-iterate evidence and deliverability of the site, previous documents are mainly focused on the two SA criteria for which the site scored negatively SAO9 Land use and SAO15 natural and built landscape. Following the representation from 27th October 2017, Barratt Homes (BH) have submitted a pre-application request that was validated on the 20th December 2017 with a reference 17/02990/PREAPP. It is BH's intention to submit a full planning application to CYC in relation to the development of the site within the next 6 months and deliver 88 homes in the first five years of the plan. (Site-specific representations should be read in conjunction with BH's overarching representations prepared by Barton Willmore, which make comments upon the overall soundness of the emerging CYC Local Plan.)	Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes
SID844/S/H29/1			I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Copmanthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Group - Diane Stones OBO

**Proposed Modification**

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H29 Land at Moor Lane Copmanthorpe

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID88/Mod/H29/1			Believes the plan to be sound Only complaint is that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming over already over-stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Brian Bell
SID171/Mod/H29/1			Only complaint is that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming over already over-stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Maxine Bell
SID171/Mod/H29/1			Believes the plan to be sound Only complaint is that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming over already over-stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.	Megan Taylor
SID200/S/H29/1			Satisfied that the documents are legally compliant. Would prefer that housing densities for two development sites in Copmanthorpe reduced to densities given in Policy CNP2 of Draft Neighbourhood Plan, due to them being greater than current average density for the village and would result in overwhelming of infrastructure and services	Kaite Betts
SID202/Mod/H29/1			Would prefer that housing densities for two development sites in Copmanthorpe reduced to densities given in Policy CNP2 of Draft Neighbourhood Plan, due to them being greater than current average density for the village and would result in overwhelming of infrastructure and services.	Darren Magson
SID273/Mod/H29/1			I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site H29 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Margaret Thomas
SID278/Mod/H29/1			I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site H29 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Gillian Hinton
SID301/Mod/H29/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site H29 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Copmanthorpe Parish Council - Diane Stones
SID302/Mod/H29/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for site H29 in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Jeffrey Clarke

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H29 Land at Moor Lane Copmanthorpe

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID596/Mod/H29/1			<p>Fully support the proposed allocation for development of site H29 - Land at Moor Lane Copmanthorpe. Attaches documents from previous representation in October 2017 to re-iterate evidence and deliverability of the site, previous documents are mainly focused on the two SA criteria for which the site scored negatively SAO9 Land use and SAO15 natural and built landscape. Following the representation from 27th October 2017, Barratt Homes (BH) have submitted a pre-application request that was validated on the 20th December 2017 with a reference 17/02990/PREAPP. It is BH's intention to submit a full planning application to CYC in relation to the development of the site within the next 6 months and deliver 88 homes in the first five years of the plan. (Site-specific representations should be read in conjunction with BH's overarching representations prepared by Barton Willmore, which make comments upon the overall soundness of the emerging CYC Local Plan.)</p>	Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes
SID844/Mod/H29/1			<p>I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan.</p>	Copmanthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Group - Diane Stones OBO

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H31 Eastfield Lane Dunnington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID217/LC/H31/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Peter Moorhouse
SID238/LC/H31/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Gill Shaw
SID259/LC/H31/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO David Wilson Homes
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID31/S/H31/1		Not Sound	Concerned about increase in traffic that will come from development, congestion an issue but particularly road safety. If the site goes ahead then council should install some measures to deter people from using Dunnington as a short cut. Also concerned about road safety at the Eastfield Lane / Church Balk junction. Adding further properties to an already congested village without addressing the issues raised above will have a negative impact on the well-being and safety of residents.	Gareth Thompson
SID96/S/H31/1			A condition similar to the one requiring access to and from ST15 is from the A64 and not Elvington Lane, is an essential part of the proposal for 76 dwellings in H31: Eastfield Lane, Dunnington, where there is at present a single track road on to the site and dangerous junctions of Eastfield Lane with Church Balk in one direction and with the A166 Stamford Bridge road in the other direction. The junction between Church Balk and the A166 is also a difficult one which will become more difficult with the additional traffic that will be generated by the new housing development. Again it is essential that adequate infrastructural improvements are made as part of the conditions for the development to proceed, with a need for developers to make adequate financial contributions to enable this to be achieved. In order for the developments to be sustainable it is essential that their developers fulfil the conditions which are needed for adequate supporting infrastructure, as a key part of the proposals.	David Mayston
SID217/S/H31/1		Not Sound	More appropriate sites should have been considered other than H31 as criteria has been incosistently applied to sites H744(?) and H737(?). Examples for this include H31 having poor transport links compared to two proposed sites and H31 being less ideally located.	Peter Moorhouse
SID238/S/H31/1		Not Sound	H31 is in the Greenbelt and has narrow access, which would mean further Greenbelt land would have to be utilised to make the site accessible.	Gill Shaw



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H31 Eastfield Lane Dunnington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID259/S/H31/1		Sound	Our client supports the retention of the site as a proposed housing allocation within the Publication Draft Local Plan. However, they object to the current proposed red line site allocation boundary of the site.	Paul Butler Planning OBO David Wilson Homes
SID316/S/H31/2			H31 Eastfield Lane: H31 not welcome. Cannot cope with vehicular traffic, will remove attractive features. Drainage issues, water pressure issues. Development will reduce quality of housing and overcrowd the site. Loss of greenspace, loss of opportunity for mixture of housing and issues with overburdened services.	Stuart Kay
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID31/Mod/H31/1			Give no consideration to development that increases traffic through Dunnington / Church Balk.	Gareth Thompson
SID96/Mod/H31/1			A condition similar to the one requiring access to and from ST15 is from the A64 and not Elvington Lane, is an essential part of the proposal for 76 dwellings in H31: Eastfield Lane, Dunnington, where there is at present a single track road on to the site and dangerous junctions of Eastfield Lane with Church Balk in one direction and with the A166 Stamford Bridge road in the other direction. The junction between Church Balk and the A166 is also a difficult one which will become more difficult with the additional traffic that will be generated by the new housing development. Again it is essential that adequate infrastructural improvements are made as part of the conditions for the development to proceed, with a need for developers to make adequate financial contributions to enable this to be achieved. In order for the developments to be sustainable it is essential that their developers fulfil the conditions which are needed for adequate supporting infrastructure, as a key part of the proposals.	David Mayston
SID238/Mod/H31/1			Withdraw H31 from the plan.	Gill Shaw
SID259/Mod/H31/1			We request that the red line site allocation boundary be re-instated to that consulted on as part of the Preferred Sites Consultation (June 2016) to include the landowner's existing property which would provide a more comprehensive and appropriate development of the site.	Paul Butler Planning OBO David Wilson Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H38 Land RO Rufforth Primary School Rufforth

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID598/S/H38/1		Not Sound	Rep supports allocation of H38 but objects to rejection of proposed extension - Land to the rear of Rufforth Primary School. Two reps related to the site but are in the same PDF, first is supporting the proposed allocation and the second is regarding a proposed extension to the current allocation. To summarise the second - objects to non-allocation of the proposed extension to H38, proposed extension was approved by LPWG but rejected by council's executive.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/S/H38/1		Sound	Rep supports allocation of H38 - Land to the rear of Rufforth Primary School. Two reps related to the site but are in the same PDF, first is regarding the proposed allocation and the second is regarding a proposed extension to the current allocation and argues the plan is unsound. To summarise the first - details the history of the site to demonstrate that H38 is available, suitable and that development is achievable and therefore the allocation is sound, it has been justified and will be effective and it is in accordance national guidance. First rep runs from 8 to 107 of PDF, the last 83 pages of which is the Lichfields March 2018 Technical report on housing issues attached as an appendix.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/S/H38/2		Not Sound	Argues this was a mistake as the extension does not serve greenbelt purposes nor does the land need to be permanently kept open, policy H1 fails to provide a robust choice of housing, the plan as a whole is unsound because housing provision for the plan period is too low and relies on unrealistic delivery at key sites (ST14 and ST15), extension to H38 should be approved in order to meet OAHN and contribute to a sound plan. Second rep runs from 168 to 296 of PDF.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land

#### Proposed Modification

SID598/Mod/H38/1			H38 extension should be allocated for housing or included as safeguarded land.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
------------------	--	--	--	--

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID32/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Significant road infrastructure investments needed for H39, existing traffic problems will be exacerbated. Dauby Lane site preferable as it unites the two halves of village. Local people opposed to current site.	Jennifer Woodford
SID84/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Residents views in opposition to the development at H39 have been consistently heard in the various consultations. Failure to meaningfully consult residents on an appropriate development is not legally compliant. Site has been rejected for development by inspectors in the past, sees no reason why it should be different now. Residents universally prefer H26 for development, cannot understand why H39 is being persisted with and Parish Councils ignored. Elvington needs 4 and 5 bedroom houses and affordable housing, has plenty of 3 bedroom houses.	Tim Tozer
SID95/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Not legally compliant as H39 is included for development when an inspector previously found it serves green belt purposes, plan does not take into account the overwhelming views of residents.	Eileen Roberts
SID180/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant		Andrew Simpson
SID191/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant		Martin Moorhouse
SID207/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Keep Elvington Rural Action Group - Martin Moorhouse
SID221/LC/H39/1				Sally Firth
SID222/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	CYC Officers have failed to consult the residents of Elvington and specifically ignored village proposals for an alternative site.	Joanne Wedgwood

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID223/LC/H39/1			This information is not supplied.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID227/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant	CYC Officers failed to consult the residents of Elvington and ignored village proposals during previous consultations for an alternative.	Matthew Wedgwood
SID333/LC/H39/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The land at H39 has previously been stated as serving Green belt purposes by the Planning Inspector.	Alison Stead
SID334/LC/H39/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The land at H39 has been previously stated as serving green belt purposes by the Planning Inspector.	David Stead
SID349/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Laura Good
SID353/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The proposed size of the plot of at least 30 new homes directly behind my house is disproportionate for the current village.	Matthew Colven
SID356/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The local planning authority have not listened to the wishes of the local residents which goes against the whole purpose of the Localism Act 2011.	Jonathan Laverack
SID362/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Plans to develop the H39 are have been rejected numerous times before for very good reason and these reasons still stand.	Dominic Stevens
SID391/LC/H39/1		Not Legally Compliant		Katherine and James Marsh
SID412/LC/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	As a layperson it is difficult to understand and assess whether the document is legally compliant. The council hasn't taken in the views of the Parish Council regarding the development of H26 rather than H39.	Louisa Stevens

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID617/LC/H39/1			EMAIL -- This information is not supplied.	Johnathan Wharton
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID32/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Development will exacerbate existing traffic issues - congestion and road safety. Development of land at Dauby Lane is preferable.	Jennifer Woodford
SID56/S/H39/1		Not Sound	(ST39) The area is greenbelt and reverses the previous decision by the Planning Inspectorate. Better alternative site at Dauby lane. Extra traffic would cause problems on B1228 at peak times and Church Lane would be an impossible alternative access route due to being narrow and with a sharp bend. The houses suggested to be built at Beckside are not what the village needs, more large and small houses are needed rather than medium.	Judith Hodgson
SID84/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Justification for why this site is being removed from greenbelt has never been provided. Development here would harm rural village feel / character and setting of Elvington in general, proximity to the conservation area means development would likely harm this as well. H39 may appear to be a natural rounding off of the village but in reality represents an encroachment on the countryside, would harm rural feel. H39 has no natural boundary to the west, the fence was hastily constructed on the morning the site was due to be considered during the 1992/3 public inquiry. Church Lane is unsuited for an increase in traffic flow so the increased congestion will go through Beckside and negatively existing residents quality of life / road safety. Residents and Parish Council are not opposed to development, Elvington has absorbed more than its fair share of housing in past decades and is prepared to again if absolutely necessary, this should be at Dauby Lane, approximately the proposed H26 site. The site of H39 is regularly waterlogged and does not drain properly.	Tim Tozer
SID95/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Poor judgement to include site H39, previously found to serve green belt purposes and overwhelmingly opposed by local residents. H26 Dauby Lane is a much better alternative, is preferred by majority of residents and parish council.	Eileen Roberts
SID102/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Has previously been determined H39 serves green belt purposes, the extra traffic generated would adversely impact current Beckside residents, density of any new development should have been commensurate with the existing Beckside development in order to minimise and 'difference' to the phases.	Elvington Parish Council - David Headlam
SID145/S/H39/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Sound	The site is not supported by local residents (who favour H26). It would create additional congestion, permit fewer homes and fails to address the issue of bridging the 2 halves of the village.	Ken Guest

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID150/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Objects as: Elvington sits in the green belt, nothing has changed from pervious inspectors reports, reasons for removing site from green belt haven't changed, lack of democracy, 3339 houses less than 2 miles away on a brown field site.	Simon Lock
SID151/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Objects as: Elvington sits in the green belt, nothing has changed from pervious inspectors reports, reasons for removing site from green belt haven't changed, lack of democracy, 3339 houses less than 2 miles away on a brown field site.	Ann Lock
SID156/S/H39/1			Elvington is in the green belt and should remain so without development. Feels there isn't need for 32 houses when there are 3339 houses being built 1.5 miles away. Feels nothing has changed since the last rejected proposal at Elvington. There will be disruption in the Beckside estate and Elvington village and strains on local infrastructures. All past objections which stopped the previous development remain valid so questions what has changed.	Steve Izzard
SID180/S/H39/1		Not Sound	There has been severe flooding on Church lane this winter making it very difficult for traffic to pass, any additional building will add to this problem.	Andrew Simpson
SID184/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Objects as it serves green belt purposes.	Philip Rees
SID185/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Objects as it serves green belt purposes.	Helen Rees
SID191/S/H39/1		Not Sound	The H39 Site is neither positively prepared nor justified. CYC Officers have failed to consult residents of Elvington and specifically ignored the village proposals for an alternative site. The vast majority of villagers believe that H26, land at Daulby Lane, is a better site offering the capacity for housing in the village. The land at H26 would unite the two halves of the village, provide better access and importantly provide a mix of housing, including affordable housing, much better suited to the needs of the village. The site would cause significant transport and safety issues for the existing residents of Beckside. The site will not meet future needs of the village, as it will contain the wrong mix of housing. The Local Plan fails the test of being local when residents are overridden by planning officers who have never visited the sites yet believe they know them better than residents.	Martin Moorhouse
SID193/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Planning Inspector previously determined that H39 serves Green Belt purposes. Church Lane (adjoining the site) contributes to the character of Elvington, and is frequently used by local residents for recreational purposes and should be protected from development. The extra traffic generated from the 32 houses would adversely impact of residents of Beckside. Beckside is too narrow to accomodate extra traffic, posing a risk to pedestrians. Elvington residents have never been properly consulted and their views ignored. Nearly all residents at local consultations wanted to link two residential areas of the village. Site H26 is a way of satisfying that need aswell as increasing housing stock. CYC ignored the community by imposing H39 instead of H26.	Peter Murray

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID194/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Planning Inspector previously determined that H39 serves Green Belt purposes. Church Lane (adjoining the site) contributes to the character of Elvington, and is frequently used by local residents for recreational purposes and should be protected from development. The extra traffic generated from the 32 houses would adversely impact of residents of Becksides. Becksides is too narrow to accommodate extra traffic, posing a risk to pedestrians. Elvington residents have never been properly consulted and their views ignored. Nearly all residents at local consultations wanted to link two residential areas of the village. Site H26 is a way of satisfying that need aswell as increasing housing stock. CYC ignored the community by imposing H39 instead of H26.	Jessica Murray
SID195/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Planning Inspector previously determined that H39 serves Green Belt purposes. Church Lane (adjoining the site) contributes to the character of Elvington, and is frequently used by local residents for recreational purposes and should be protected from development. The extra traffic generated from the 32 houses would adversely impact of residents of Becksides. Becksides is too narrow to accommodate extra traffic, posing a risk to pedestrians. Elvington residents have never been properly consulted and their views ignored. Nearly all residents at local consultations wanted to link two residential areas of the village. Site H26 is a way of satisfying that need aswell as increasing housing stock. CYC ignored the community by imposing H39 instead of H26.	Natasha Murray
SID196/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Planning Inspector previously determined that H39 serves Green Belt purposes. Church Lane (adjoining the site) contributes to the character of Elvington, and is frequently used by local residents for recreational purposes and should be protected from development. The extra traffic generated from the 32 houses would adversely impact of residents of Becksides. Becksides is too narrow to accommodate extra traffic, posing a risk to pedestrians. Elvington residents have never been properly consulted and their views ignored. Nearly all residents at local consultations wanted to link two residential areas of the village. Site H26 is a way of satisfying that need aswell as increasing housing stock. CYC ignored the community by imposing H39 instead of H26.	Anneliese Murray
SID197/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Planning Inspector previously determined that H39 serves Green Belt purposes. Church Lane (adjoining the site) contributes to the character of Elvington, and is frequently used by local residents for recreational purposes and should be protected from development. The extra traffic generated from the 32 houses would adversely impact of residents of Becksides. Becksides is too narrow to accommodate extra traffic, posing a risk to pedestrians. Elvington residents have never been properly consulted and their views ignored. Nearly all residents at local consultations wanted to link two residential areas of the village. Site H26 is a way of satisfying that need aswell as increasing housing stock. CYC ignored the community by imposing H39 instead of H26.	Mary Julie Murray
SID207/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Keep Elvington Rural (KER) fully support the Parish Council (i) the Planning Inspectorate previously determined that H39 serves GB purposes (ii) the extra traffic that would be generated from 32 houses would adversely impact on existing residents (iii) density should have been commensurate with the existing Becksides development to minimise any 'difference ' to the phases KER agree that H39 should be withdrawn from the Plan and replaced by H26. Dauby Lane. KER members want to link the two residential areas of the village. Approximately 1/3 of homes are currently to the west of the school. H26 is a way of satisfying that need as well as increasing the housing stock. Furthermore H26 should contain a better mix of housing type especially larger houses to meet another clearly identified local need. KER agree a total of around 60 residences are suitable for this site.	Keep Elvington Rural Action Group - Martin Moorhouse

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID211/S/H39/1		Not Sound	The suggested area to build in, at the top of Beckside in elvington, is an area that is already out of proportion with the rest of the village, and the field itself regularly suffers flooding which crosses fully into the road beyond. It doesn't seem a sound decision to build on such an area. It will make the Beckside part of the estate a rat run and not safe for children to play.	Sophie Moore
SID221/S/H39/2			Site H39 would cause many significant transport and safety issues for the people already living in Beckside.	Sally Firth
SID221/S/H39/3			Site H39 will not meet the future needs of the village as it will not contain the correct mix of housing.	Sally Firth
SID222/S/H39/1		Not Sound	There is a better site available (H26) that has the support of the community.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID222/S/H39/2			Site H39 would cause significant transport and safety issues for the existing residents of Beckside.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID222/S/H39/3			Site H39 will not meet the future needs of the village as it will contain the wrong mix of housing.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID223/S/H39/1		Not Sound	There is a better site available (H26) that has the support of the community and it would join the two halves of the village.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID223/S/H39/2			Site H39 would cause significant transport and safety issues for the existing residents of Beckside.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID223/S/H39/3			Site H39 will not meet the future needs of the village as it will contain the wrong mix of housing.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID223/S/H39/4			CYC have ignored the views of residents and fail to understand that local residents know and understand the area much better than they do.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID227/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Not the most appropriate site as construction would cause significant transport and safety issues for existing residents and will not meet the future needs of the village.	Matthew Wedgwood
SID240/S/H39/1			Increased traffic will lead to a "rat race" and the may risk injury.	David Boddy
SID261/S/H39/1		Not Sound	This area is in the Greenbelt and the additional traffic and comotion caused by the construction would change the image of the cul-de-sac and pose a potential threat to children playing. Additionally, this area is unsuitable for more housing as it constantly floods.	Amanda Moore



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID262/S/H39/1		Not Sound	This area is in the Greenbelt and the additional traffic and comotion caused by the construction would change the image of the cul-de-sac. Additionally, this area is unsuitable for more housing as it constantly floods.	Ian Dickens
SID289/S/H39/1		Not Sound	All traffic from 32 houses would have to exite through the existing residential area of Beckside and exisit on to the main street in the centre of the village.	Terence Wilson
SID333/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Not positively prepared - (i) it fails to provide the housing needs of the village for affordable housing and larger housing. (ii) fails to provide due consideration of traffic flow out of a single exit from Beckside. Not justified - (i) not the most appropriate development for the village (Former H26), the southern hedgerow of the site is of SINC quality and forms an important wildlife link between the nationally important Wheldrake lngs and the statutory nature conservation site (River Derwent), the strategy to address the SINC hedgerow and TO trees falls short of appropriate safeguarding, the plan is not the most appropriate strategy in relation to flood risk and drainage. Not consistent - with national policy concerning green belt. (a previous Inspector determined the site served green belt purposes.)	Alison Stead
SID334/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Not positively prepared as it fails to provide for the village's housing needs, in particular their need for smaller more affordable houses.	David Stead
SID334/S/H39/2			This proposed development would be close to the hedgerow and could impact on the biodiversity and amenity importance of this hedgerow and its links.	David Stead
SID334/S/H39/3			Not justified because the plan does not have the appropriate strategy for flood and drainage issues.	David Stead
SID334/S/H39/4			The proposal is not consistent with national policy for Green belt land.	David Stead
SID349/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Elvington sits within the Green Belt - What has changed from the previous objections and Inspector's Report? NOTHING - I do not believe that the Councils reasons for proposing the removal of the original sites from the Green Belt in 1991 or 2013 stood up to detailed scrutiny, and nor do I believe the removal of the Beckside/Church Lane site does now. - Democracy in action? - There never appears to be any direct response to the objections raised - The constant requirements from CYC to resubmit new submissions with the previous submissions being ignored feels a lot like censorship? - I suggest: )CYS will have all of the names of those who provided a submission on a database. Instead of relying on public announcements in papers. Allow the objections submitted previously to be reused in the original format if requested. If the CYC knows that subsequent submission to government are going to be in different formats, why not require us to submit in that format to begin with?.The views of local people, local councils are ignored.	Laura Good

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID353/S/H39/1		Not Sound	I object to the building of houses on the Green Field site H39. Elvington sits within the Green Belt. This has protected us against excessive development in the past and this should remain.	Matthew Colven
SID353/S/H39/2		Not Sound	The views of local people, local councils are ignored. We are not adverse to new houses being built in the village. So why, are suggestions such as the replacement of H39 (Church Lane) with a larger build site of H26 (Dauby Lane) not being accepted. Comments such as 'H26 would constitute a significant change to the shape and form of the current village' clearly show a lack of knowledge about the village, ignore precedents set by past planning decisions (Elvington Park etc) and totally ignore the wishes and considerations of local villagers and the local village council	Matthew Colven
SID356/S/H39/1		Not Sound	None of the local's and this includes Elvington Parish Council and the majority of responses to the previous consultation want to see houses on this site. Without repeating myself the site is accessed off an already over developed housing estate with a long standing issue with on street parking due to the lack of parking provision previously provided.	Jonathan Laverack
SID356/S/H39/2			A far more reasonable site is H26, known at Dauby Lane, but also accessed from the main road through the village. It would provide more housing could be designed to provide both affordable and larger homes both of which are in short supply in the village. Families generally have to leave Elvington if they wish for a larger house as there is a distinct lack so the village will suffer from a transient population where families have to leave to find the right housing stock.	Jonathan Laverack
SID362/S/H39/1		Not Sound	It would be inappropriate to remove this site from the Green Belt due to difficulties in relation to access that would cause harm to the character of the village or the amenities of existing residents.	Dominic Stevens
SID362/S/H39/2			The extra traffic generated by 32 new houses would have a tremendously adverse impact on the current residents of Becksides.	Dominic Stevens
SID362/S/H39/3			This area is well-known to have poor drainage and has always been prone to flooding. In fact, the entire village has a history of flood issues, but this area has standing water all over the fields and road that passes by it.	Dominic Stevens
SID369/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Concerns that the extra traffic generated from the proposed 39 properties at H39 would adversely impact the residents on Becksides. The contribution from Elvington Parish Council and residents indicate preference for the previously consulted expansion on Dauby Lane.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID389/S/H39/1		Not Sound	H39 was previously deemed by the Planning Inspector to serve as Green Belt purposes.	Sandra Atkinson
SID389/S/H39/2			Furthermore, the extra traffic that would be generated from the 32 houses would adversely impact on the existing residents of Becksides.	Sandra Atkinson

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID391/S/H39/1		Not Sound	The drains already struggle to cope with excess rainfall and there is a lot of surface water on the fields. Building on this land will add to the increased risk of flooding in the area The number of cars far exceeds the amount of available off road parking in this area resulting in congestion and disagreements between neighbours over parking. Adding further homes which will no doubt have minimal space for more vehicles is only going to add to the problem. The proposed type of housing is not suitable for local families. Elvington is primarily a family area because it lacks the infrastructure and facilities of York inner ring road. Larger properties with decent sized rooms suitable for families and gardens for children to play in are required. The planned development for Beckside is not sympathetic to Elvington in that it would lead to a clear split between the wealthier side of Elvington and the cheaper homes in Beckside. It would be more sensible to put any new development further towards the doctor's surgery and other amenities to improve the social mix of housing and integration into the area.	Katherine and James Marsh
SID401/S/H39/1			Fully support inclusion of site H39 in draft policy H1. Plan however does not allocate enough land to meet the need over the plan period.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID402/S/H39/1		Not Sound	The Planning Inspector has previously determined that the land in which H39 would be built on sits within the Green Belt. This decision should remain. The houses would create additional traffic in an area where the majority have young children who will play in the street	Joanne Owen
SID407/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Development would have too great an impact on village life and environment. Flooding issues may be exacerbated. More congestion would cause increased threat to pedestrians.	Rob Littlewood
SID410/S/H39/1		Not Sound	The proposed 32 home development that is intended to be accessed through the southern end of Beckside would have a large environmental impact on what is already designated Green Belt (greenfield) land. A Statutory Nature Conservation Site – River Derwent SAC/SPA/RASMSAR being only a short distance away. Also Church Lane regularly floods which may be exacerbated by housing. Additional traffic will add to the morning traffic.	Helene Littlewood
SID412/S/H39/1		Not Sound	Better alternative site (H26) supported by villagers and Parish Council – H39 is not the most appropriate site	Louisa Stevens
SID412/S/H39/2			Site H39 is in the Green belt and development of this land would be detrimental to wildlife.	Louisa Stevens
SID412/S/H39/3			H39 is not a natural extension to the village.	Louisa Stevens

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID412/S/H39/4			Plans to develop this area before have been rejected numerous times before (1991, 1998, and 2005).	Louisa Stevens
SID412/S/H39/5			Site H39 does not take into account flood risks. Developing H39 will increase the flood risk as surface run-off enters this subsidiary beck.	Louisa Stevens
SID412/S/H39/6			Beckside and Church Lane are both narrow roads that are at capacity in terms of cars parked on the road and vehicular usage. Any further vehicles from H39 will only exacerbate the situation.	Louisa Stevens
SID412/S/H39/7			H39 development will significantly increase traffic at Beckside and Churchlane junctions, which will lead to dangerous raods. The junctions on H26 would be much safer than H39 as there are no other obstructions or adjoining roads.	Louisa Stevens
SID412/S/H39/8			One of the aims of the aims of York City Council in its Local Plan is 'to make sure that new development is close to high quality public transport'. This is simply not the case for Site H39, which is serviced only by the most sporadic of rural village bus services.	Louisa Stevens
SID424/S/H39/1		Not Sound	How have your reasons for removing this site from the Green Belt changed from previous submissions?	Val Izzard
SID598/S/H39/1		Not Sound	H39 is a greenfield site with no defensible boundary to the west, by contrast H26 is well contained by identifiable physical features and partially brownfield. Allocation of H39 before H26 is therefore unsound - not justified, effective or consistent with national policy.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID617/S/H39/1			Elvington is within the Green Belt.	Johnathan Wharton
SID617/S/H39/2			Nothing has changed since the previous objections and the Inspector's Report.	Johnathan Wharton
SID617/S/H39/3			CYC are ignoring the views of residents.	Johnathan Wharton
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID32/Mod/H39/1			Development will exacerbate existing traffic issues - congestion and road safety. Development of land at Dauby Lane is preferable.	Jennifer Woodford

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID84/Mod/H39/1			Remove H39 from the plan, in line with residents and the parish council's views. If appropriate, H26 should be put forward for development.	Tim Tozer
SID102/Mod/H39/1			Has previously been determined H39 serves green belt purposes, the extra traffic generated would adversely impact current Beckside residents, density of any new development should have been commensurate with the existing Beckside development in order to minimise and 'difference' to the phases.	Elvington Parish Council - David Headlam
SID150/Mod/H39/1			Objects as: Elvington sits in the green belt, nothing has changed from pervious inspectors reports, reasons for removing site from green belt haven't changed, lack of democracy, 3339 houses less than 2 miles away on a brown field site.	Simon Lock
SID151/Mod/H39/1			Objects as: Elvington sits in the green belt, nothing has changed from pervious inspectors reports, reasons for removing site from green belt haven't changed, lack of democracy, 3339 houses less than 2 miles away on a brown field site.	Ann Lock
SID156/Mod/H39/1			Elvington is in the green belt and should remain so without development. Feels there isn't need for 32 houses when there are 3339 houses being built 1.5 miles away. Feels nothing has changed since the last rejected proposal at Elvington. There will be disruption in the Beckside estate and Elvington village and strains on local infrastructures. All past objections which stopped the previous development remain valid so questions what has changed.	Steve Izzard
SID180/Mod/H39/1			Before building takes place the flooding and poor drainage on Church Lane needs to be resolved first.	Andrew Simpson
SID211/Mod/H39/1			To consider another area.	Sophie Moore
SID261/Mod/H39/1			I suggest removing site H39 from the plan and replacing with H26 for consideration. H26 is supported by the residents and Parish council and will provide a greater number of houses.	Amanda Moore
SID287/Mod/H39/1			I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe, which are substantially greater than the current average density for the village and which would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services, be reduced to the densities detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan	Katherine Pickard
SID369/Mod/H39/1			Concerns that the extra traffic generated from the proposed 39 properties at H39 would adversely impact the residents on Beckside. The contribution from Elvington Parish Council and residents indicate preference for the previously consulted expansion on Dauby Lane.	Julian Sturdy MP

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID391/Mod/H39/1			The drains already struggle to cope with excess rainfall and there is a lot of surface water on the fields. Building on this land will add to the increased risk of flooding in the area The number of cars far exceeds the amount of available off road parking in this area resulting in congestion and disagreements between neighbours over parking. Adding further homes which will no doubt have minimal space for more vehicles is only going to add to the problem. The proposed type of housing is not suitable for local families. Elvington is primarily a family area because it lacks the infrastructure and facilities of York inner ring road. Larger properties with decent sized rooms suitable for families and gardens for children to play in are required. The planned development for Beckside is not sympathetic to Elvington in that it would lead to a clear split between the wealthier side of Elvington and the cheaper homes in Beckside. It would be more sensible to put any new development further towards the doctor's surgery and other amenities to improve the social mix of housing and integration into the area.	Katherine and James Marsh
SID401/Mod/H39/1			Fully support inclusion of site H39 in draft policy H1. Plan however does not allocate enough land to meet the need over the plan period.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID402/Mod/H39/1		Not Sound	The Planning Inspector has previously determined that the land in which H39 would be built on sits within the Green Belt. This decision should remain. The houses would create additional traffic in an area where the majority have young children who will play in the street	Joanne Owen
SID410/Mod/H39/1			If further Elvington development is necessary then the previous proposed site in Dauby Lane would be a preferred option in that it offers significantly more housing opportunity, and of the more appropriate type. It would also provide a link between the two ends of the village and give better access to the main B1228 and A1079 routes.	Helene Littlewood
SID412/Mod/H39/1			The proposed site H39 should be withdrawn and excluded, and H26 should be considered instead as most inhabitants of the village support this area for development, despite the village services already being at almost full capacity. If a site must be considered in Elvington, H26 should be the only site considered.	Louisa Stevens
SID598/Mod/H39/1			H39 is a greenfield site with no defensible boundary to the west, by contrast H26 is well contained by identifiable physical features and partially brownfield. Allocation of H39 before H26 is therefore unsound - not justified, effective or consistent with national policy.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H46 Land to North of Willow Bank and East of Haxby Road, New Earswick

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID298/Mod/H46/1			Identified as a internationally recognised village of historic importance. Infrastructure requirement cannot be met. If developed would lose last remaining area of green space. Approved development which would assist overstretched facilities are 151 additional dwellings as part of the red lodge development, huntington stadium, and a new health care facilities off Haxby road.	Sally Bruckshaw
------------------	--	--	---	-----------------

#### Soundness

SID5/S/H46/1	Not Sound		Opposes development of H46, it used to be a well-tended sports field (previous Josh Rowntree School Sports Field) but the Joseph Rowntree Trust stopped maintenance and fenced the field off and for the last 25 years has only been used for dog walking. Development will worsen congestion, increase run-off and flood risk.	Peter Tuffs
SID298/S/H46/1	Not Sound		Identified as a internationally recognised village of historic importance. Infrastructure requirement cannot be met. If developed would lose last remaining area of green space. Approved development which would assist overstretched facilities are 151 additional dwellings as part of the red lodge development, huntington stadium, and a new health care facilities off Haxby road.	Sally Bruckshaw
SID835/S/H46/1	Not Sound		Planning document does not show rationale behind the proposal. No accepted that an open space deficiency exists, sites is part of local green infrastructure, site has rich species of grassland, sites is popular with dogwalkers. Not possible to produce housing scheme of 104 dwellings.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO Joseph Rowntree Housing Trust

#### Proposed Modification

SID5/Mod/H46/1			H46 should be properly maintained for recreational use beyond just dog-walking, not used for housing.	Peter Tuffs
SID118/Mod/H46/1			H46 - This area that is proposed for development lies close to the northern edge of the New Earswick Conservation Area. If this site is allocated, the Plan should make it clear that development proposals for this area would need to ensure that those elements which contribute to the significance of the New Earswick Conservation Area are not harmed.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID298/Mod/H46/1			Need to address issues raised such as flood plain, historic character adn setting, conservation, green infrastructure, traffic and facilities.	Sally Bruckshaw

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

Site H46 Land to North of Willow Bank and East of Haxby Road, New Earswick

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID835/Mod/H46/1			Planning document does not show rationale behind the proposal. No accpted that an open space deficiency exists, sites is part of local green infrastructure, site has rich species of grassland, sites is popular with dogwalkers. Not possible to produce housing scheme of 104 dwellings.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO Joseph Rowntree Housing Trust



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

Site H52 Willow House EPH, Long Close Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/H52/1			H52 - It is essential that the Plan alerts potential developers to the need to ensure that any scheme would be required to demonstrate that they would safeguard those elements which contribute to the significance of the City Walls and the Conservation Area.	Historic England - Ian Smith
------------------	--	--	---	------------------------------

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H53 Land at Knaption Village

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID3/S/H53/1		Not Sound	Opposes H53 as extending the village boundary will provide little additional housing and do damage to a historic village. Only benefits developers who have held land banks for years. A poor use of resources so therefore unjustified.	John Flynn
SID126/S/H53/1		Not Sound	Object to inclusion of this site as it has been previously rejected as an inappropriate encroachment onto the green belt, as well as on the openness and character of Knaption village. This proposals has not addressed the issues raised, public should be made aware of any proposals to change the draft green belt so they are able to object.	Andrew Moorcroft
SID189/S/H53/1		Not Sound	Objects to development. This site has previously been rejected for housing, most recently in 2016 due to inappropriate encroachment onto the green belt, as well as on the openness and character of Knaption village.	Christine Moorcroft
SID190/S/H53/1			Objection to the inclusion of Knaption site H53 within the Local Plan. The recent refusal was based on the following : Erection of four dwellings with car parking, garaging and landscape treatment on an elevated site would cause harm to the character and appearance of the area. This would be contrary to NPPF core planning principle of recognising the intrinsic character and beauty of the countryside and GP1 of the 2005 Development Control Local Plan.	Rebecca, David & Christopher Moorcroft
SID368/S/H53/1		Sound	Novus support the continued proposed allocation of site H53 for residential use, the estimated phasing for delivery of short term (years 1 to 5), and the proposed estimated yield of four dwellings. Novus agree with the Council's assessment of the site and conclusions that it is suitable for housing. The Local Plan is sound on the basis of the proposed allocation of the site for housing, and the proposed allocation (Allocation Ref: H53) is justified in the context of paragraph 182 of the NPPF.	Indigo Planning (Matthew Stocks) OBO Novus Investment Ltd
SID369/S/H53/1		Not Sound	Site H53 has previously been rejected for housing, most recently in 2016 due to inappropriate encroachment onto the green belt, as well as on the openness and character of Knaption village. Not convinced this proposal has addressed the issues raised and therefore do not believe this development should be included in the Local Plan.	Julian Sturdy MP

#### Proposed Modification

SID3/Mod/H53/1			Again raises opposition to H53 and additional development around historic villages, raises the issue of land banking.	John Flynn
SID126/Mod/H53/1		Not Sound	Object to inclusion of this site as it has been previously rejected as an inappropriate encroachment onto the green belt, as well as on the openness and character of Knaption village. This proposals has not addressed the issues raised, public should be made aware of any proposals to change the draft green belt so they are able to object.	Andrew Moorcroft

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site H53 Land at Knapton Village

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID189/Mod/H53/1			Do not include development in local plan due to encroachment on green belt.	Christine Moorcroft
SID190/Mod/H53/1			Objection to the inclusion of Knapton site H53 within the Local Plan. The recent refusal was based on the following : Erection of four dwellings with car parking, garaging and landscape treatment on an elevated site would cause harm to the character and appearance of the area. This would be contrary to NPPF core planning principle of recognising the intrinsic character and beauty of the countryside and GP1 of the 2005 Development Control Local Plan.	Rebecca, David & Christopher Moorcroft
SID369/Mod/H53/1		Not Sound	Site H53 has previously been rejected for housing, most recently in 2016 due to inappropriate encroachment onto the green belt, as well as on the openness and character of Knapton village. Not convinced this proposal has addressed the issues raised and therefore do not believe this development should be included in the Local Plan.	Julian Sturdy MP

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H56 Land at Hull Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID418/S/H56/1		Not Sound	Objecting to allocation of H56 for housing. Rep goes into great detail about the history of the site, relation to NPPF, sport facility / open provision in the city, inadequacy of proposed replacements, double counting of open space, conflicts with policies on density, contamination, drainage etc. H56 is the result of an illegal subdivision of a larger playing field site and H56 represents only part of the appropriate planning unit.	Save Windmill Lane Playing Fields - Chris Wedgwood
SID418/S/H56/2		Not Sound	Also attached to rep is objection to planning application 16/02358/OUTM, goes into great detail, in summary argues the site does not comply with site selection methodology and was erroneously included in preferred sites, does not comply with open space selection criteria, approval of planning application would conflict with council policies on provision of open space / playing fields, evidences demand for the playing fields from various local clubs etc.	Save Windmill Lane Playing Fields - Chris Wedgwood

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

Site H58 Clifton Without Primary School

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/H58/1			H58 - If this site is allocated, the Plan should make it clear that development proposals for this area would need to ensure that those elements which contribute to the significance of the Clifton (Malton Way and Shipton Road) Conservation Area are not harmed.	Historic England - Ian Smith
------------------	--	--	--	------------------------------

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site H59 Queen Elizabeth Barracks – Howard Road, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID318/S/H59/1			Supports policy and inclusion of site H59.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/H59/1		Not Sound	DIO support principle of H59 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Howard Road (up to 45 Dwellings) but seeks more flexibility on phasing, the 2021 release date gives scope for development in the short to medium term 1-10 years rather than Years 6-15 (medium to long term).	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

#### Proposed Modification

SID174/Mod/H59/1			With INEOS planning to start seismic testing in a couple of months in Strensall with a view to drilling and fracking for shale gas in this area and the future of the Barracks not confirmed ST35 and H59 are not sound and legally compliant. The land may not be available or may be within the proposed 500m buffer zone expected to be authorised in the JWMP. I therefore think that this housing should not be included in the plan.	Susan Turner
SID345/MOD/H59/1		Sound	DIO support principle of H59 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Howard Road (up to 45 Dwellings) but seeks more flexibility on phasing, the 2021 release date gives scope for development in the short to medium term 1-10 years rather than Years 6-15 (medium to long term).	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H2 Density of Residential Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID53/LC/H2Policy/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	While being very supportive of the Local Plan's policy to define and defend the Green Belt to the west of Copmanthorpe I take issue with the number of dwellings per hectare proposed for both the development sites in Copmanthorpe (Tadcaster Road and Moor Lane). These densities are far above the current average density for the village and will mean the addition of many more new residents than the infrastructure can cope with. Doctors, school, roads and sewage systems are already at maximum.	Peter Whitfield
SID415/LC/H2Policy			The allocated density of spacing per dwelling (yield) on developments within the Plan may contradict best practice.	Anthony Dennis
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID53/S/H2Policy/1		Not Sound	Too many new houses proposed for Copmanthorpe. Proposed housing density is too high and inconsistent with the current average density of the village. I would also take issue with the fact that the neighbouring village of Bishopthorpe has no new housing development proposed despite having many more suitable locations and as good, if not better, infrastructure.	Peter Whitfield
SID118/S/H2Policy/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID125/S/H2policy/1		Not Sound	NPPF, paragraph 47, puts forward five actions local authorities can take to boost significantly the supply of housing. One of these says they should set their own approach to housing density to reflect local circumstances. The context therefore is one of boosting housing supply. Paragraph 5.17 in the Local Plan appears to consider density solely as a function of creating walk able communities. Whilst this is an important consideration it cannot be the only one. House buyers look for accessibility to services but of more importance to them is the nature of the house, the space around it, privacy and space to park one or more cars. The Local Plan does not take into account the other considerations. NPPF refers to local circumstances. It is not doubted that densities of 100 units/ha in the city centre and 50 units/ha in the urban area are being achieved but it is doubted if these are universally applicable. It is reasonable where proposed housing schemes adjoin areas of terraced housing to have a density of c.50 units/ha but adjacent inter- and post-war housing areas new housing at densities between 35 to 40 units/ha would seem more challenging to the existing circumstances.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID220/S/H2(Policy)/1		Not Sound	The Plan's focus on high-density development will inevitably lead to an increase in the number of flatted schemes, despite the SHMA for York identifying that the main area of need is in the provision of 2- and 3-bed family homes	O'Neill Associates (Philip Holmes)OBO Mr M Ibbotson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H2 Density of Residential Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID255/S/H2Policy/1		Not Sound	As has been set out in our previous comments, the HBF considers that development densities of 100 dwellings per hectare within the city centre combined with 50dwellings per hectares within the York urban area is optimistically high.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID264/S/H2Policy/1		Not Sound	We consider that Policy H2 will not ensure effective delivery of the housing requirement and is therefore inconsistent with national policy. Concerns about policy H2 on the density of residential developments and object to the policies but in doing so suggest that additional evidence needs to be provided to justify the policies or propose minor amendments which would make the policies sound. Have changed approach to calculating densities and is now harmful density for villages.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land, Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID273/S/H2Policy/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Margaret Thomas
SID278/S/H1Policy/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Gillian Hinton
SID296/S/H2Policy/1		Not Sound	Overall content with housing plans and protection of green belt. Observe that for the period of concern (2012 to 2032) 12 of the 21 years have housing targets above the 923 per annum. Population figures are estimated to be lower than previously estimated so future housing could be reduced for these years.	Peter & Barbara Bentley
SID301/S/H2Policy/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Copmanthorpe Parish Council - Diane Stones
SID302/S/H2Policy/1		Sound	I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Jeffrey Clarke



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H2 Density of Residential Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID318/S/H2Policy/ 1			Supports housing density identified in H59. Highlights reduction in public transport services.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID332/S/H2Policy/ 1			Issues with housing densities.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe
SID345/S/H2Policy/ 1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID350/S/H2Policy/ 1		Not Sound	The high housing densities within Policy H2 represent part of the council's case to minimise housing land allocations and thus the need to remove land from the General Extent of Green Belt. Development densities of 100 dwellings per hectare within the city centre and 50 dwellings per hectare within the wider urban area are unrealistically high and would lead to lack of choice and poor standards.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Picton Capital
SID350/S/H2Policy/ 1			Indicative densities are too high, giving unrealistic yield per hectare assumptions and potentially resulting in poor quality development and lack of new housing choice.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Picton Capital
SID380/S/H2Policy/ 1			We agree that the densities set out within the policy should only be used as a general guide and that they should be considered on a 'site-by-site' basis. However, it should be recognised that higher densities would be appropriate in principle on brownfield city centre sites such as Hungate, in order to make efficient use of land and deliver much needed housing.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H2 Density of Residential Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/H2Policy/1		Sound	Reference to 'net' density is welcomed Further clarification is required in supporting text. We welcome the reference that on strategic sites specific master planning agreements that provide density targets for that site may override the density policy. That said, it is not clear where the net density requirements in Policy H2 are derived, which are considered to be too high, too prescriptive and unachievable.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/H2 (Policy)/1			Reference to 'net' density is welcomed Further clarification is required in supporting text. We welcome the reference that on strategic sites specific master planning agreements that provide density targets for that site may override the density policy. That said, it is not clear where the net density requirements in Policy H2 are derived, which are considered to be too high, too prescriptive and unachievable.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/H2(Policy)/1			While supportive of use of "net" density and the use of the policy as a general guide allowing it to be overridden in the case of some specific strategic sites, still believe the densities prescribed are too high, too prescriptive and unachievable. There is no evidence to justify the density ranges. The ranges need to be tested on some recently approved schemes and checks to ensure no heritage impacts from these densities.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/H2Policy/1		Not Sound	Reference to 'net' density is welcomed Further clarification is required in supporting text. We welcome the reference that on strategic sites specific master planning agreements that provide density targets for that site may override the density policy. That said, it is not clear where the net density requirements in Policy H2 are derived, which are considered to be too high, too prescriptive and unachievable.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID598/S/H2policy/1		Not Sound	Policy H2 and the associated assumed yields applied to various allocations are unsound and not justified and will not ensure effective delivery of the housing requirement and is therefore inconsistent with national policy. (Further detail provided in reps, six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy H2 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/S/H2policy/1		Not Sound	Policy H2 and the associated assumed yields applied to various allocations are unsound and not justified and will not ensure effective delivery of the housing requirement and is therefore inconsistent with national policy. (Further detail provided in reps, SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy H2 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H2 Density of Residential Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID601/S/H2policy/1		Not Sound	Policy H2 and the associated assumed yields applied to various allocations are unsound and not justified and will not ensure effective delivery of the housing requirement and is therefore inconsistent with national policy. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy H2 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/S/H2policy/1		Not Sound	Policy H2 and the associated assumed yields applied to various allocations are unsound and not justified and will not ensure effective delivery of the housing requirement and is therefore inconsistent with national policy. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy H2 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID604/S/H2 (Policy)/1		Not Sound	Indicative densities are too high, giving unrealistic yield per hectare assumptions and potentially resulting in poor quality development and lack of new housing choice. Concerns are raised in relation to the reliance on such sites to deliver the plan's housing requirements as this strategy represents a significant risk insofar as there is also a prospect of current operators deciding to retain control.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID615/S/H2Policy/1		Not Sound	It is considered that this would represent a suitable and appropriate level of development for the site, which will provide a high level of residential amenity without harm to surrounding development or the adjacent Conservation Area. As such, the draft masterplan indicates that the site is capable of delivering a significantly higher quantum of development than is proposed in the Draft Local Plan.	ONEILL Associates (Philip Holmes) OBO Heworth Green Gasworks Ltd
SID848/S/H2(Policy)/1			While supportive of use of "net" density and the use of the policy as a general guide allowing it to be overridden in the case of some specific strategic sites, still believe the densities prescribed are too high, too prescriptive and unachievable. There is no evidence to justify the density ranges. The ranges need to be tested on some recently approved schemes and checks to ensure no heritage impacts from these densities.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID125/Mod/H2policy/1			The CYLPS needs to take a more relaxed stance on housing density and reduce each band by 5 units per hectare.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID255/Mod/H2Policy/1			HBF propose that the policy is modified as follows:• That the expected net densities are reduced. • That further flexibility is included within the policy in relation to the mix of housing and the density of development.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H2 Density of Residential Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID264/Mod/H2Policy/1			We suggest that that net development density is reduced and that greater flexibility is included in the policy to allow for balanced developments to be created	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land, Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID273/Mod/H2Policy/1			I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Margaret Thomas
SID296/Mod/H2Policy/1			Overall content with housing plans and protection of green belt. Observe that for the period of concern (2012 to 2032) 12 of the 21 years have housing targets above the 923 per annum. Population figures are estimated to be lower than previously estimated so future housing could be reduced for these years.	Peter & Barbara Bentley
SID301/Mod/H2Policy/1			I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Copmanthorpe Parish Council - Diane Stones
SID302/Mod/H2Policy/1			I would prefer that the housing densities identified for the two development sites in Copmanthorpe be reduced as per those detailed in Policy CNP2 of the draft Neighbourhood Plan as they would result in the overwhelming of already stretched infrastructure and services.	Jeffrey Clarke
SID332/Mod/H2Policy/1			Review housing densities on appropriate sites. Delete sites; ST7, ST9, ST14 and ST15 (Total: 6267 units) and allocated a site for a standalone settlement of 7500 which would see clear economic and social benefits and would justify high infrastructure costs.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe
SID350/S/H2Policy/1			The high housing densities within Policy H2 represent part of the council's case to minimise housing land allocations and thus the need to remove land from the General Extent of Green Belt. Development densities of 100 dwellings per hectare within the city centre and 50 dwellings per hectare within the wider urban area are unrealistically high and would lead to lack of choice and poor standards.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Picton Capital
SID364/Mod/H2Policy/1			H2 should be reviewed to accommodate principles set out in SID364/Mod/SS1/1.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H2 Density of Residential Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID365/Mod/H2Policy/1			H2 should be reviewed to accommodate principles set out in SID364/Mod/SS1/1.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID372/Mod/H2Policy/1			Gladman accept that efficient use should be made of land, especially in areas which are constrained by the Green Belt for example. However, we would suggest that an element of flexibility should be added to Policy H2 as there may be circumstances where 35 dwellings per hectare in rural areas and villages is out of keeping with the setting and scale of development in the rural area and a slightly lower density may be preferred. An element of flexibility added to this policy would allow the design of sites to be more adaptable to the scale and character of the existing area.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID380/Mod/H2Policy/1			Policy H2 should be more explicit in recognising that higher densities would be appropriate in principle on brownfield city centre sites such as Hungate, in order to make efficient use of land and deliver much needed housing.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/Mod/H2Policy/1			Supporting text needs to reference those elements that relate to gross and net. Needs to have regard to garden size requirements in any design guide. Given that the Council refer to the Policy as a 'general guide' we recommend further flexibility in the policy with density ranges	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/H2 (Policy)/1			Supporting text needs to reference those elements that relate to gross and net. needs to have regard to garden size requirements in any design guide. Given that the Council refer to the Policy as a 'general guide' we recommend further flexibility in the policy with density ranges	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/H2(Policy)/1			Supporting text needs to be specific about what is included within gross or net areas eg Open space, water attenuation etc. Suggest greater flexibility eg: 80-100 city centre; 40-50 Urban Area; 30-40 suburban and haxby; 20-30 rural	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H2 Density of Residential Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/Mod/H2Policy/1			Supporting text needs to reference those elements that relate to gross and net. Needs to have regard to garden size requirements in any design guide. Given that the Council refer to the Policy as a 'general guide' we recommend further flexibility in the policy with density ranges	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID598/Mod/H2policy/1			Suggest that that net development density is reduced and that greater flexibility is included in the policy to allow for balanced developments to be created.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/Mod/H2policy/1			Suggest that that net development density is reduced and that greater flexibility is included in the policy to allow for balanced developments to be created.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/Mod/H2policy/1			Suggest that that net development density is reduced and that greater flexibility is included in the policy to allow for balanced developments to be created.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/Mod/H2policy/1			Suggest that that net development density is reduced and that greater flexibility is included in the policy to allow for balanced developments to be created.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID604/Mod/H2(Policy)/1			Indicative densities are too high, giving unrealistic yield per hectare assumptions and potentially resulting in poor quality development and lack of new housing choice. Concerns are raised in relation to the reliance on such sites to deliver the plan's housing requirements as this strategy represents a significant risk insofar as there is also a prospect of current operators deciding to retain control.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID848/Mod/H2(Policy)/1			Supporting text needs to be specific about what is included within gross or net areas eg Open space, water attenuation etc.Suggest greater flexibility eg: 80-100 city centre; 40-50 Urban Area; 30-40 suburban and haxby; 20-30 rural	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID253/LC/H3/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID378/LC/H3Policy /1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID415/LC/H3Policy /4			Typically, the City of York Council is planning to include an allocation of 20% of the dwellings to affordable homes but developers are required to provide 35-50% depending on the local authority. There needs to be clarity on this issue.	Anthony Dennis
SID415/LC/H3Policy				Anthony Dennis

#### Soundness

SID7/S/H3policy/1		Not Sound	Insufficient provision, protection and availability of social housing.	David Casswell
SID61/S/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	policy should stipulate that outside urban areas houses that are more than 2 storeys high should be discourages as they overlook other properties and reduce privacy. Bungalows should feature in properties developed. Sheltered housing and assisted living included. Space standards for car parking.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID125/S/H3policy/ 1		Not Sound	NPPF paragraph 50 encourages local planning authorities to deliver a wide choice of homes. Policy H3 says the Council will seek to balance the housing market across the plan period and work towards a mix of housing identified in the Strategic Housing Market Assessment (published June 2016). The SHMA housing mix is a theoretical exercise across the District. It cannot hope to be applied at a site level to set a requirement for each new housing proposal. In practical terms, a housing applicant could not be reasonably expected to know what other housing applications have just been approved across the city or are being considered by the Council at any one time. The policy is also too ambitious in setting a requirement for residential proposals to balance thehousing market to reflect the diverse mix of need across the city. Each year's supply of new housing (at Council requirement level) will add about 1% to the City's housing stock. It is evident that the practical application of this policy has not been thought through.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID253/S/H3Policy/ 1		Not Sound	Approach to Identifying OAHN - In practice, applying the Framework and Practice Guidance to arrive at a robust and evidenced OAHN is a staged and logical process. An OAHN must be a level of housing delivery which meets the needs associated with population, employment and household growth, addresses the need for all types of housing including affordable and caters for housing demand.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/ 2		Not Sound	Housing Need - The Council's approach to identifying an assessed need of 867 dpa in the introductory section of the SHMA Assessment Update is fundamentally flawed. This is a 'policy-on' intervention by the Council which should not be applied to the OAHN. It has been confirmed in the Courts that FOAN is 'policy off' and does not take into account supply pressures. The Council's approach to identifying the FOAN, as set out in the SHMA Assessment Update, would therefore be susceptible to legal challenge. The calculation of OAHN should therefore be based on the normal 'policy-off' methodology.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/ 3		Not Sound	There are a number of significant deficiencies in the SHMA Assessment Update which means that even the higher 953 dpa OAHN figure identified in the Assessment Update is not soundly based. In particular: 1 - GL Hearn clearly accepts that an increase in household formation rates is necessary to respond to continued suppression of household formation rates within younger age groups within the official projections. However this demographic conclusion of 871 dpa does not appear to have been carried forward by GL Hearn in calculating the resultant housing need.2 - The Assessment Update fails to distinguish between the affordable housing needs of the City of York and the supply increase needed to address market signals to help address demand. Instead the SHMA blends the two elements within the same figure. 3 - Given the significant affordable housing need identified in City of York Lichfields consider that a 20% uplift would be appropriate in this instance and should be applied to the OAHN.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/ 4		Not Sound	The scale of objectively assessed need is a judgement and the different scenarios and outcomes set out within this report provide alternative levels of housing growth for the City of York. Lichfields considers these to be as follows: 1 - Demographic Baseline: The 2014-based household projections indicate a net household growth of 867dpa between 2014 and 2024 (including a suitable allowance for vacant/second homes. Once a suitable adjustment has been made to rebase the projections to the (slightly lower) 2015 MYE, and through the application of accelerated headship rates amongst younger age cohorts takes the demographic starting point to 871 dpa. 2 -Market Signals Adjustment: GL Hearn's uplift is 10%. Lichfields considers that a greater uplift of 20% would be more appropriate in this instance. When applied to the 871 dpa re-based demographic starting point, this would indicate a need for 1,045 dpa.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/ 5		Not Sound	It is emphasised again that CLG's household projections explicitly exclude the housing needs of students living in halls of residence. GL Hearn has used the latest CLG 2014-based household projections to underpin its housing OAN for York. The market signals adjustment it makes does not address the separate specialised housing needs of students, which would be additional to the target identified.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID253/S/H3Policy/6		Not Sound	There are inherent dangers in including student housing in the supply if there is no evidence that there has been a reduction in the number of general market dwellings occupied by students as a direct result of the provision of purpose-built student accommodation.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/7		Not Sound	The Council's housing land supply figures do not provide an annual housing delivery trajectory for each site over the plan period. The Council simply provides an assumed total delivery figure for each site without detailed reasoning on the methodology for deriving this figure.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/8		Not Sound	There is a distinct lack of evidence on lead-in times and delivery rate assumptions for the Council's unimplemented permissions and draft allocations.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/9		Not Sound	The Council includes several student sites in its future supply, which is inappropriate, as there is no justification regarding how these developments will result in the release of housing into the general housing market as required by the Practice Guidance. As a result, the Council's land supply figures risk being severely distorted.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/10		Not Sound	The SHMA Update sets out an OAHN for York of 953 dpa; however, the Council has ignored this figure and adopted 867dpa for the plan period. Lichfields considers that an OAHN of 1,150 dpa is more appropriate. Even this figure explicitly excludes the needs of students living in purpose built halls of residence.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/11		Not Sound	The appropriate plan period is for this assessment is 2012-2032. We have set out the Council's past completion data and consider that a 20% buffer is required due to the persistent under delivery of housing in the City over the past 10 years.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/12		Not Sound	When using the Council's OAHN and factoring in backlog and an appropriate buffer it is concluded that the annual housing requirement over the next 5-years is 6,286 (1,257 dpa), rising to 7,318 (1,464 dpa) using the SHMA's OAHN. Using Lichfields' OAHN figure would result in an annual requirement of 9,898 (1,980 dpa) over the next 5-years.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/S/H3Policy/14		Not Sound	The Council has not produced a trajectory or a detailed assessment of the 5-year supply position as required by the Framework. No evidence has therefore been produced to demonstrate the Council's housing supply position.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID253/S/H3Policy/15		Not Sound	The assessment of the balance between the housing requirement and supply demonstrates that there is a significant shortfall for 5-year period.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID255/S/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	It is acknowledged that this policy is based on the evidence set out in the SHMA. However, it should be noted that the SHMA will only ever identify current deficits and reflects a snap-shot in time. The HBF would like to ensure greater flexibility within this policy to acknowledge that the mix will vary both geographically and over the plan period.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID264/S/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	We consider that Policy H3 is unsound and concerned about H3 on balancing the housing market and object to the policies but in doing so suggest that additional evidence needs to be provided to justify the policies or propose minor amendments which would make the policies sound.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land, Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID324/S/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	Whilst I feel sure that City of York Council have applied to the rules and regulations as identified in the Strategic Housing Market Assessment I am a little nonplussed that there is no mention from the City Council as to when they intend to provide Council Houses and I would like the Planning Inspector to insist that this matter is considered. I say this due to the fact of the cost of houses in York and the average cost of a property in York. (Attached documents add to this)	Howard Perry
SID345/S/H3Policy/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID372/S/H3Policy/1		Sound	Gladman support the flexibility provided by Policy H3. This states that housing mix proposed should have reference to the SHMA and be informed by up to date evidence of need, including at the local level and the nature and character of site and surrounding area. This allows sites to provide a mix which suits the local circumstances and for this element of an application to be considered on a site by site basis rather than a strict policy requirement.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID376/S/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd object to the Policy H3 as it is not effective, justified nor consistent with national policy and is therefore not sound. TW support the representations made by the HBF on this policy and would reiterate that SHMAs only ever reflect a snap shot in time and the policy must include flexibility to reflect market demand and aspirations.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/S/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	As needs may change during the Plan period, it is necessary that the Policy is flexible enough to respond to changing circumstances, and has regard to the need prevailing at the time of any planning application. The draft Policy's flexibility in this respect is supported. However, it would aid the application of the Policy if it referred to the SHMA applying at the time of consideration of any planning application.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID380/S/H3Policy/1			In order to ensure that the Plan is justified and effective over the plan period, this needs to recognise the scope for flexibility on a site by site basis.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID394/S/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	Unless properly planned for, there is likely to be a serious shortfall in specialist accommodation for the older population in the area, which will have a knock-on effect in meeting the housing needs of the whole area and wider policy objectives. Specialist accommodation for the elderly will therefore have a vital role in meeting the areas housing needs. We would advocate that the Council continues in taking a positive approach in seeking to provide appropriate accommodation to meet the needs of its ageing population within the Local Plan. Specialist accommodation for the elderly also usually provides an element of care and communal facilities at an additional cost to the developer. This requires a critical mass of residents in order to be feasible and small-scale developments of specialist housing for the elderly could not be realistically asked to provide or maintain such facilities.	The Planning Bureau (Stephen Courcier) OBO McCarthy & Stone Retirement Lifestyles Ltd
SID582/S/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	We object to this policy. The policy needs maintain a degree of flexibility given the SHMA considers only need as opposed to 'demand' and the SHMA represents a certain snapshot in time.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/H3 (Policy)/1			We object to this policy. The policy needs maintain a degree of flexibility given the SHMA considers only need as opposed to 'demand' and the SHMA represents a certain snapshot in time.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/S/H3(Policy)/1			This policy needs to have a site size threshold indicating where mix and evidence of need should be considered. This policy also needs to be more flexible to ensure delivery is not stalled as a result of it being too prescriptive. Questionable how the current SHMA can estimate the size of housing market and affordable demand over the entire lifetime of the plan to 2038.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/H3(Policy)/1		Not Sound	We object to this policy. The policy needs maintain a degree of flexibility given the SHMA considers only need as opposed to 'demand' and the SHMA represents a certain snapshot in time. No 'threshold' in relation to mix.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID598/S/H3policy/1		Not Sound	Considers H3 unsound, It is unreasonable for an applicant to provide sufficient evidence to support their proposals particularly where a developer is providing a housing mix which is broadly in accordance with the identified need. This should be deleted. (Further detail provided in reps. Six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy H3 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/S/H3policy/1		Not Sound	Considers H3 unsound, It is unreasonable for an applicant to provide sufficient evidence to support their proposals particularly where a developer is providing a housing mix which is broadly in accordance with the identified need. This should be deleted. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy H3 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/S/H3policy/1		Not Sound	Considers H3 unsound, It is unreasonable for an applicant to provide sufficient evidence to support their proposals particularly where a developer is providing a housing mix which is broadly in accordance with the identified need. This should be deleted. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy H3 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/S/H3policy/1		Not Sound	Considers H3 unsound, It is unreasonable for an applicant to provide sufficient evidence to support their proposals particularly where a developer is providing a housing mix which is broadly in accordance with the identified need. This should be deleted. (Further detail provided in reps. SID600, SID601, SID602 and six of the seven site reps submitted under SID598 object to policy H3 in this way.)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID604/S/H3 (Policy)/1		Not Sound	The housing market and the appropriate mix of housing will vary both with time and within different parts of the housing market. Greater flexibility should be built into Policy H3 as the optimum mix for any proposed housing development to reflect market demand and aspirations alongside need over the plan period.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/S/H3(Policy)/1			This policy needs to have a site size threshold indicating where mix and evidence of need should be considered. This policy also needs to be more flexible to ensure delivery is not stalled as a result of it being too prescriptive. Questionable how the current SHMA can estimate the size of housing market and affordable demand over the entire lifetime of the plan to 2038.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	policy should stipulate that outside urban areas houses that are more than 2 storeys high should be discourages as they overlook other properties and reduce privacy. Bungalows should feature in properties developed. Sheltered housing and assisted living included. Space standards for car parking.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID7/Mod/H3policy			Plan needs to ensure proper provision of social housing, too often there are get out clauses and it is not provided.	David Casswell
SID61/Mod/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	policy should stipulate that outside urban areas houses that are more than 2 storeys high should be discourages as they overlook other properties and reduce privacy. Bungalows should feature in properties developed. Sheltered housing and assisted living included. Space standards for car parking.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID125/Mod/H3policy/1			HBf propose that the policy is modified as follows:• ‘Proposals for residential development should seek to will be required to balance the housing market by including a mix of types of housing which reflects the local market demand and the diverse mix of need across the city’.• ‘The housing mix proposed should have reference to the SHMA and be informed by:• Up to date evidence of need including at a local level;• Market demand and local aspirations; and• The nature of the development site and the character of the local surrounding area’.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID253/Mod/H3/1			As the Council has not demonstrated an adequate short and longer-term supply as required by national guidance. The Council should allocate additional land to meet the housing needs of the community and these sites should be able to deliver early in the plan period. This is the only approach that will deliver a ‘sound’ plan and enable the much needed investment in new housing to meet the community’s needs.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/2			Housing Need - The Council’s approach to identifying an assessed need of 867 dpa in the introductory section of the SHMA Assessment Update is fundamentally flawed. This is a ‘policy-on’ intervention by the Council which should not be applied to the OAHN. It has been confirmed in the Courts that FOAN is ‘policy off’ and does not take into account supply pressures. The Council’s approach to identifying the FOAN, as set out in the SHMA Assessment Update, would therefore be susceptible to legal challenge. The calculation of OAHN should therefore be based on the normal ‘policy-off’ methodology.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/3			There are a number of significant deficiencies in the SHMA Assessment Update which means that even the higher 953 dpa OAHN figure identified in the Assessment Update is not soundly based. In particular: 1 - GL Hearn clearly accepts that an increase in household formation rates is necessary to respond to continued suppression of household formation rates within younger age groups within the official projections. However this demographic conclusion of 871 dpa does not appear to have been carried forward by GL Hearn in calculating the resultant housing need.2 - The Assessment Update fails to distinguish between the affordable housing needs of the City of York and the supply increase needed to address market signals to help address demand. Instead the SHMA blends the two elements within the same figure. 3 - Given the significant affordable housing need identified in City of York Lichfields consider that a 20% uplift would be appropriate in this instance and should be applied to the OAHN.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/5			It is emphasised again that CLG's household projections explicitly exclude the housing needs of students living in halls of residence. GL Hearn has used the latest CLG 2014-based household projections to underpin its housing OAN for York. The market signals adjustment it makes does not address the separate specialised housing needs of students, which would be additional to the target identified.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/6			There are inherent dangers in including student housing in the supply if there is no evidence that there has been a reduction in the number of general market dwellings occupied by students as a direct result of the provision of purpose-built student accommodation.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/7			The Council's housing land supply figures do not provide an annual housing delivery trajectory for each site over the plan period. The Council simply provides an assumed total delivery figure for each site without detailed reasoning on the methodology for deriving this figure.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/8			There is a distinct lack of evidence on lead-in times and delivery rate assumptions for the Council's unimplemented permissions and draft allocations.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/9			The Council includes several student sites in its future supply, which is inappropriate, as there is no justification regarding how these developments will result in the release of housing into the general housing market as required by the Practice Guidance. As a result, the Council's land supply figures risk being severely distorted.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/10			The SHMA Update sets out an OAHN for York of 953 dpa; however, the Council has ignored this figure and adopted 867dpa for the plan period. Lichfields considers that an OAHN of 1,150 dpa is more appropriate. Even this figure explicitly excludes the needs of students living in purpose built halls of residence.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/11			The appropriate plan period is for this assessment is 2012-2032. We have set out the Council's past completion data and consider that a 20% buffer is required due to the persistent under delivery of housing in the City over the past 10 years.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/12			When using the Council's OAHN and factoring in backlog and an appropriate buffer it is concluded that the annual housing requirement over the next 5-years is 6,286 (1,257 dpa), rising to 7,318 (1,464 dpa) using the SHMA's OAHN. Using Lichfields' OAHN figure would result in an annual requirement of 9,898 (1,980 dpa) over the next 5-years.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/14			The Council has not produced a trajectory or a detailed assessment of the 5-year supply position as required by the Framework. No evidence has therefore been produced to demonstrate the Council's housing supply position.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID253/Mod/H3Policy/15		Not Sound	The assessment of the balance between the housing requirement and supply demonstrates that there is a significant shortfall for 5-year period.	Lichfields (Emma Brown) OBO Bellway Homes
SID255/Mod/H3Policy/1			HBF propose that the policy is modified as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 'Proposals for residential development should seek to will be required to balance the housing market by including a mix of types of housing which reflects the local market demand and the diverse mix of need across the city and area'.</li> <li>• 'The housing mix proposed should have reference to the SHMA and be informed by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Up to date evidence of need including at a local level;</li> <li>• Market demand and local aspirations;</li> <li>• The nature of the development site and the character of the localsurrounding area.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID264/Mod/H3Policy/1			Suggest the policy should be modified as referred to above to provide greater flexibility to allow for balanced developments to be created. In this regard we would suggest amending the policy to read "Proposals for residential development should assist in balancing the housing market, unless material considerations indicate otherwise, by including a mix of types of housing that respond to and reflects the diverse mix of need across the city and the character of the locality."	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land, Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID364/Mod/H3Policy/1			Affordable housing ratios to be raised to 25% on brownfield sites and 35% on greenfield sites. Reduce reliance on brownfield sites to reduce pressure on housing in York central. Provision for social housing on larger housing sites should be incorporated. Establish a York living rent. Introduce article 4 dtermination across all HMOs. Require new properties to be offered to York Residents before going on open market.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID376/Mod/H3Policy/1			TW fully support the HBFs suggested modifications (repeated below) to Policy H3 and consider that these changes will make the policy sound: 'Proposals for residential development should seek to will be required to balance the housing market by including a mix of types of housing which reflects the local market demand and the diverse mix of need across the city'. 'The housing mix proposed should have reference to the SHMA and be informed by: Up to date evidence of need including at a local level; Market demand and local aspirations; and The nature of the development site and the character of the local surrounding area'.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID378/Mod/H3Policy/1			As needs may change during the Plan period, it is necessary that the Policy is flexible enough to respond to changing circumstances, and has regard to the need prevailing at the time of any planning application. The draft Policy's flexibility in this respect is supported. However, it would aid the application of the Policy if it referred to the SHMA applying at the time of consideration of any planning application.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/Mod/H3/1			it would aid the application of the Policy if it referred to the SHMA applying at the time of consideration of any planning application.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID380/Mod/H3Policy/1			Policy H3 needs to recognise the scope for flexibility on a site by site basis.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID394/Mod/H3Policy/1			Unless properly planned for, there is likely to be a serious shortfall in specialist accommodation for the older population in the area, which will have a knock-on effect in meeting the housing needs of the whole area and wider policy objectives. Specialist accommodation for the elderly will therefore have a vital role in meeting the areas housing needs. We would advocate that the Council continues in taking a positive approach in seeking to provide appropriate accommodation to meet the needs of its ageing population within the Local Plan. Specialist accommodation for the elderly also usually provides an element of care and communal facilities at an additional cost to the developer. This requires a critical mass of residents in order to be feasible and small-scale developments of specialist housing for the elderly could not be realistically asked to provide or maintain such facilities.	The Planning Bureau (Stephen Courcier) OBO McCarthy & Stone Retirement Lifestyles Ltd



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/Mod/H3Policy/1			Insert additional wording allowing greater flexibility of the housing mix to reflect housing demand, and differences in demand across the City. Insert a site size threshold.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/H3 (Policy)/1			Insert additional wording allowing greater flexibility of the housing mix to reflect housing demand, and differences in demand across the City. Insert a site size threshold.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/H3(Policy)/1			Add a site size threshold to indicate at what point evidence of need and demand is assessed and offer further guidance as to the evidence required. Wording should be added to give greater flexibility of housing mix in response to demand and variations across the city as well as variations throughout the timeframe of the plan.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/H3Policy/1			Insert additional wording allowing greater flexibility of the housing mix to reflect housing demand, and differences in demand across the City. Insert a site size threshold. More explanation of 'evidence' required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID598/Mod/H3policy/1			We suggest the policy should be modified to provide greater flexibility to allow for balanced developments to be created. In this regard we would suggest amending the policy to read "Proposals for residential development should assist in balancing the housing market, unless material considerations indicate otherwise, by including a mix of types of housing that respond to and reflects the diverse mix of need across the city and the character of the locality."	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/Mod/H3policy/1			We suggest the policy should be modified to provide greater flexibility to allow for balanced developments to be created. In this regard we would suggest amending the policy to read "Proposals for residential development should assist in balancing the housing market, unless material considerations indicate otherwise, by including a mix of types of housing that respond to and reflects the diverse mix of need across the city and the character of the locality."	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H3 Balancing the Housing Market

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID601/Mod/H3policy/1			We suggest the policy should be modified to provide greater flexibility to allow for balanced developments to be created. In this regard we would suggest amending the policy to read "Proposals for residential development should assist in balancing the housing market, unless material considerations indicate otherwise, by including a mix of types of housing that respond to and reflects the diverse mix of need across the city and the character of the locality."	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/Mod/H3policy/1			We suggest the policy should be modified to provide greater flexibility to allow for balanced developments to be created. In this regard we would suggest amending the policy to read "Proposals for residential development should assist in balancing the housing market, unless material considerations indicate otherwise, by including a mix of types of housing that respond to and reflects the diverse mix of need across the city and the character of the locality."	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID604/Mod/H3 (Policy)/1			The housing market and the appropriate mix of housing will vary both with time and within different parts of the housing market. Greater flexibility should be built into Policy H3 as the optimum mix for any proposed housing development to reflect market demand and aspirations alongside need over the plan period.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID848/Mod/H3(Policy)/1			Add a site size threshold to indicate at what point evidence of need and demand is assessed and offer further guidance as to the evidence required. Wording should be added to give greater flexibility of housing mix in response to demand and variations across the city as well as variations throughout the timeframe of the plan.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/Mod/H3Policy/1		Not Sound	policy should stipulate that outside urban areas houses that are more than 2 storeys high should be discourages as they overlook other properties and reduce privacy. Bungalows should feature in properties developed. Sheltered housing and assisted living included. Space standards for car parking.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H4 Promoting Self and Custom House Building

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID415/LC/H4Policy/1			The Council appears to still be operating under outdated practices regarding its self and custom build housing policy (see policy H4 in the draft Local Plan).	Anthony Dennis
----------------------	--	--	--	----------------

#### Soundness

SID125/S/H4policy/1	Not Sound		The Council has not provided evidence that supports 5% of plots on sites of 5 ha and above is justified. It is not clear why the Local Plan expects the output of new dwellings to be increased by introducing a requirement for this kind of building. The large builders can build a house for sale far more quickly than a self build or custom house builder. Application of the policy will slow down house production for those houses provided by these means.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID255/S/H3Policy/1	Not Sound		The Council's approach is restrictive rather than permissive by requiring the inclusion of such housing on strategic sites of 5ha and above. This policy approach only changes the house building delivery mechanism from one form of house building company to another without any consequential additional contribution to boosting housing supply.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID372/S/H4Policy/1	Not Sound		The concept of self-build and custom build housing is supported as this is in line with Government aims and objectives. Notwithstanding this, Gladman raise some concern with the 5% requirement on all strategic sites. It is considered that the percentage requirement should be determined on detailed evidence of local need. Gladman support the reference to the Council having regard to viability considerations in relation to this requirement. Further, Gladman support the inclusion of the policy mechanism whereby if the self-build or custom build plots which are made available and marketed appropriately for 12 months do not get sold and brought forwards that these plots may revert back to the wider scheme and be built out as conventional plots for market housing by the developer. This provides flexibility for instances when these plots do not come forward for whatever reason and ensures that the full scale of provision on these sites is delivered.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID376/S/H4Policy/1	Not Sound		Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd object to Policy H4 as it is not justified and therefore not sound. TW do not consider that placing an arbitrary requirement on strategic sites for the provision of self-build plots will help people wishing to build their own home. There is no evidence to suggest that people wanting to build their own home would want to live within a larger housing development. Moreover, as the HBF point out in their representations the proposed approach only changes the type of house and does not contribute to boosting the supply of housing.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID380/S/H4Policy/1			Onsite provision of plots for self and custom builders would not be appropriate on some sites such as apartment block developments in the city centre (i.e the Hungate development) and the policy needs to be amended to contain sufficient flexibility to reflect this.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H4 Promoting Self and Custom House Building

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/H4Policy/1		Not Sound	We object to the need to insert Custom Build Housing on larger allocations. Sites of up to 10 dwellings with affordable housing commuted off site are the best vehicle for this approach.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/H4 (Policy)/1			We object to the need to insert Custom Build Housing on larger allocations. Sites of up to 10 dwellings with affordable housing commuted off site are the best vehicle for this approach.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/H4(Policy)/1			Those traditionally seeking to build their own home are not normally seeking to build on a housing estate. Custom housebuilding would therefore be more appropriate as a policy on Sites of up to 10 dwellings with affordable housing commuted off site	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/H4(Policy)/1		Not Sound	We object to the need to insert Custom Build Housing on larger allocations. Sites of up to 10 dwellings with affordable housing commuted off site are the best vehicle for this approach.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID604/S/H4 (Policy)/1		Not Sound	In view of the lack of market evidence over the willingness of self-builders and/or small/custom house-builders to build within larger sites of 5ha plus, object to Policy H4 in principle.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID848/S/H4(Policy)/1			Those traditionally seeking to build their own home are not normally seeking to build on a housing estate. Custom housebuilding would therefore be more appropriate as a policy on Sites of up to 10 dwellings with affordable housing commuted off site	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

### Proposed Modification

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H4 Promoting Self and Custom House Building

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID125/Mod/H4policy/1			Persimmon supports the proposed HBF policy modification as follows: 'On strategic sites (sites 5ha and above) developers will be required to supply at least 5% of dwelling plots for sale to self builders or to small/custom house builders subject to appropriate demand being identified. Developers will be able to provide dwelling plots for sale to self-builders or to small/custom house builders if demand is identified. Plots should be made available at competitive rates, to be agreed through Section 106 agreements, which are fairly related to the associated site/plot costs. In determining considering the nature and scale of provision the Council will have regard to viability considerations and site-specific circumstances'.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID255/Mod/H4Policy/1			HBF propose that the policy is modified as follows:'On strategic sites (sites 5ha and above) developers will be required to supply at least 5% of dwelling plots for sale to self builders or to small/custom house builders subject to appropriate demand being identified. Developers will be able to provide dwelling plots for sale to self-builders or to small/custom house builders if demand is identified. Plots should be made available at competitive rates, to be agreed through Section 106 agreements, which are fairly related to the associated site/plot costs. In determining considering the nature and scale of provision the Council will have regard to viability considerations and specific site circumstances.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID372/Mod/H4Policy/1			The concept of self-build and custom build housing is supported as this is in line with Government aims and objectives. Notwithstanding this, Gladman raise some concern with the 5% requirement on all strategic sites. It is considered that the percentage requirement should be determined on detailed evidence of local need. Gladman support the reference to the Council having regard to viability considerations in relation to this requirement. Further, Gladman support the inclusion of the policy mechanism whereby if the self-build or custom build plots which are made available and marketed appropriately for 12 months do not get sold and brought forwards that these plots may revert back to the wider scheme and be built out as conventional plots for market housing by the developer. This provides flexibility for instances when these plots do not come forward for whatever reason and ensures that the full scale of provision on these sites is delivered.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID376/Mod/H4Policy/1			A much more sensible approach would be to have a policy that allow the construction of self-built plots within or the edge of relevant settlements or specific small allocation for self-built plots in suitable locations.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID380/Mod/H4Policy/1			The wording of policy H4 is amended to contain sufficient flexibility to reflect the fact that onsite provision of plots for self and custom builders would not be appropriate on some sites such as apartment block developments in the city centre i.e the Hungate development.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID415/H4Policy/Gen/3			One way forward to address the anomaly, would be to formulate a new approach to Policy H4 with the support of the National Custom and Self Build Association's (NaCSBA) Right to Build Task Force.	Anthony Dennis

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H4 Promoting Self and Custom House Building

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/Mod/H4Policy/1			Remove text referring to Strategic Sites delivering Self Build.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/H4 (Policy)/1			Remove text referring to Strategic Sites delivering Self Build.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/H4(Policy)/1			Remove text referring to Strategic Sites delivering Self Build.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/(H4Policy)/1			Remove text referring to Strategic Sites delivering Self Build.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/H4(Policy)/1			Remove text referring to Strategic Sites delivering Self Build.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H5 Gypsies and Travellers

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID60/LC/H5(Policy)/1		Not Legally Compliant	Para 5.37-5.59. Local Plan underestimates need of Gypsies and Travellers and is not therefore legally compliant with 2010 Equality Act.	Michael Hargreaves Planning OBO York Travellers Trust
SID60/LC/H5(Policy)/2		Not Legally Compliant	Local Plan underestimates need of Gypsies and Travellers and is not therefore legally compliant with 2010 Equality Act.	Michael Hargreaves Planning OBO York Travellers Trust
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID60/S/H5(Policy)/1		Not Sound	Raises extensive concerns with the Gypsy and Traveller Accommodation Needs Assessment (2017) evidence base.	Michael Hargreaves Planning OBO York Travellers Trust
SID60/S/H5(Policy)/2		Not Sound	Raises extensive concerns with the Gypsy and Traveller Accommodation Needs Assessment (2017) evidence base.	Michael Hargreaves Planning OBO York Travellers Trust
SID118/S/H5/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID125/S/H5policy/1		Not Sound	The provision of pitches for travellers as part of strategic housing allocations appears to be an unusual approach to providing for this group of households who now fall outside the definition of Traveller. On this basis, it would be expected housing needs would be met within the overall housing provision. The explanation for the policy presents a number of specific requirements which will have an impact on how they are addressed on the smaller of the strategic sites. There are practical issues of how any protected spaces are managed and how the demand or not for them is dealt with. We are not aware of work undertaken by the Council to demonstrate what the physical impact will be on new development. In addition, it would be interesting to understand how demand for pitches within new housing developments has been assessed and how this may compare with opportunities for individual pitches in the existing urban areas.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H5 Gypsies and Travellers

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID231/S/H5Policy/1			However it is concerned that PD Policy H5 does not reflect national policy and also does not include sufficient safeguards to protect existing communities in York from potentially harmful development.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID249/S/H5Policy/1		Sound	We generally support the Plan and consider it to be sound in its approach to the provision of sites to meet the needs of Travellers.	National Federation of Gypsy Liaison Groups - A R Yarwood
SID255/S/H5Policy/1		Not Sound	The HBF has concerns in relation to this policy, particularly in relation to the need for Strategic Allocations to meet the needs of those Gypsy and Traveller households that do not meet the planning definition set out in Planning Policy for Traveller Sites. Further clarity is needed in relation to why provision is needed for those households no longer meeting the definition; whether a pitch on a strategic allocation is an appropriate location for these households particularly at the numbers proposed; what will happen to these pitches if no gypsy or traveller wishes to utilise them; and the management of these pitches.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID/369/S/H5 (Policy)/1		Sound	Welcome the direction of travel in the Council's approach to allocating traveller sites in the Local Plan. Grateful that the Council have listened and previously proposed sites in Dunnington, Huntington, Knaption, Rufforth and Naburn have been removed.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID372/S/H5Policy/1		Not Sound	Gladman raise concerns regarding Policy H5 which requires applications on strategic sites to provide gypsy and traveller accommodation. Where this is required on an allocated strategic site it can cause significant issues with deliverability of the site in question.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID380/S/H5Policy/1			no detail is given on how the commuted sum towards the development of land would be calculated.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/S/H5Policy/1		Not Sound	We object to Policy H5 as drafted. Gypsy and Traveller pitches are not suitable for large strategic housing sites, they have particular needs that traditionally require their own site. While we have no objection to the second part of the policy that seeks a contribution, this appears to lack any justification.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H5 Gypsies and Travellers

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/S/H5 (Policy)/1			We object to Policy H5 as drafted. Gypsy and Traveller pitches are not suitable for large strategic housing sites, they have particular needs that traditionally require their own site. While we have no objection to the second part of the policy that seeks a contribution, this appears to lack any justification.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/H5 (Policy)/1			Gypsy and Traveller sites have particular needs that traditionally require their own site and are therefore not suitable for large strategic housing sites. There is also a lack of justification in regards to funding these sites through contributions.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/H5Policy/1		Not Sound	We object to Policy H5 as drafted. Gypsy and Traveller pitches are not suitable for large strategic housing sites, they have particular needs that traditionally require their own site. While we have no objection to the second part of the policy that seeks a contribution, this appears to lack any justification.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID604/S/H5 (Policy)/1		Not Sound	Concerned that housing sites of 5ha or more will be expected to meet the need of “those 44 Gypsies and Traveller households that do not meet the planning definition”.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID611/S/H5(Policy)/1		Not Sound	Criterion (b) is unclear in its reference to large development sites over 5ha, and in terms of to which strategic allocations the stated requirement applies (comment notes potential undesirable conflicts with employment uses). As drafted the policy is unsound because it cannot be effective.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID614/S/H5(Policy)/1		Not Sound	Criterion (b) is unclear in its reference to large development sites over 5ha, and in terms of to which strategic allocations the stated requirement applies (comment notes potential undesirable conflicts with employment uses). As drafted the policy is unsound because it cannot be effective.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID848/S/H5 (Policy)/1			Gypsy and Traveller sites have particular needs that traditionally require their own site and are therefore not suitable for large strategic housing sites. There is also a lack of justification in regards to funding these sites through contributions.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

**Proposed Modification**

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H5 Gypsies and Travellers

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID60/Mod/H5(Policy)/1			Propose detailed changes to Table 5.3 and paras 5.37-5.39 to reflect higher need of Gypsies and Travellers.	Michael Hargreaves Planning OBO York Travellers Trust
SID60/Mod/H5(Policy)/2			Propose detailed changes to Policy H5 to reflect higher need of Gypsies and Travellers. The plan needs to identify a supply of specific, deliverable sites or broad locations for growth to meet the needs for accommodation for Gypsies and Travellers, both Travellers who meet and those who do not meet the August 2015 definition.	Michael Hargreaves Planning OBO York Travellers Trust
SID125/Mod/H5policy/1			Persimmon supports the HBF recommendation to amend the policy as follows: 'b) Within Strategic Allocations In order to meet the need of those 44 Gypsies and Traveller households that do not meet the planning definition: Applications for larger development sites of 5 ha or more will be required to:• provide a number of pitches within the site; or• provide alternative land that meets the criteria set out in part (c) of this policy to accommodate the required number of pitches; or• provide commuted sum payments to contribute towards to development of pitches elsewhere.The calculations for this policy will be based on the hierarchy below:• 100 - 499 dwellings - 2 pitches should be provided• 500 - 999 dwellings - 3 pitches should be provided• 1000 - 1499 dwellings - 4 pitches should be provided• 1500 - 1999 dwellings - 5 pitches should be provided• 2000 or more dwellings - 6 pitches should be provided'	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID249/Mod/H5Policy/1			The policy should specifically recognise that the requirement for pitches will be kept under regular review and ensure that sites remain available to travellers	National Federation of Gypsy Liaison Groups - A R Yarwood
SID255/Mod/H5Policy/1			Policy H5 should be deleted in its entirety.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID372/Mod/H5Policy/1			It is recognised that there is some flexibility built into Policy H5 to allow for off-site provision or a commuted sum towards the provision of gypsy and traveller accommodation. It is considered that this policy should extend its flexibility to set out that this provision will only be required where it is evidenced that there is a need for such plots in a specific location. This would avoid over provision of such accommodation and that the potential for inefficient use of land, should land be set aside which is not required.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H5 Gypsies and Travellers

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID380/Mod/H5Policy/1			Reword Policy H5 to provide clarity on the method for calculating the commuted sum to satisfy these requirements, as this is not evident from the current wording.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID401/Mod/H5/1			Larger, more strategic allocations capable of delivering over 1500 dwellings would be more suited to accomodating gypsy pitches.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID582/Mod/H5Policy/1			Remove part B of the policy with reference to on-site provision on large sites over 5ha. Provide clarity on the level of contribution being sought.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/H5 (Policy)/1			Remove part B of the policy with reference to on-site provision on large sites over 5ha. Provide clarity on the level of contribution being sought.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/H5 (Policy)/1			Remove part B of the policy with reference to on-site provision on large sites over 5ha. Provide clarity on the level of contribution being sought.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/H5Policy/1			Remove part B of the policy with reference to on-site provision on large sites over 5ha. Provide clarity on the level of contribution being sought.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H5 Gypsies and Travellers

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID604/Mod/H5 (Policy)/1				Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID611/Mod/H5Policy/1			As drafted, policy H5 is unsound as is cannot be effective. Criterion (b) should be reworded to provide clarity to which large strategic allocations the policy's requirements apply.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID614/Mod/H5Policy/1			As drafted, policy H5 is unsound as is cannot be effective. Criterion (b) should be reworded to provide clarity to which large strategic allocations the policy's requirements apply.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID848/Mod/H5 (Policy)/1			Remove part B of the policy with reference to on-site provision on large sites over 5ha. Provide clarity on the level of contribution being sought.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H6 Travelling Showpeople

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID90/LC/H6policy/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Plan has been through correct procedures and policy H6 is legally compliant.	Brimble Lea and Partners - Janet Montgomery
SID191/LC/H6(policy)/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Martin Moorhouse
SID201/LC/H6Policy/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Kerry Southby

#### Soundness

SID90/S/H6policy/1		Sound	Throughout the plan making process the needs of Travelling Showpeople have been considered. The need for 3 Travelling Showpeople sites is established through an updated GAA and the Plan has been prepared to deliver a site that meets this need, together with criteria for future sites. Policy H6 has been amended to account of previous representations made.	Brimble Lea and Partners - Janet Montgomery
SID118/S/H6/2		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID178/S/H6Policy/1		Not Sound	Site is unsound as previous refusals to site were based on National Planning Policy concluding that the proposed development would constitute 'inappropriate development in the Green Belt' with no prevailing very special circumstances. Site looks untidy. As defined under NPP .... such 'mixed use' TSP sites should only be permitted on Brown Field land.	Irene Guest
SID191/S/H6(policy)/1		Not Sound	This site [SP1] fails the test of Legally Compliant and Soundness. The site does not comply with: National Policy PPG2 -policies B,C,D,E & F. The proposals reverse a decision -Ref: 10/02082/FUL, made for a single site and now extends this abuse of National Planning Policy to 3 plots on the single site. CYC have failed to observe the requirements of the Planning Inspectors report and have made no effort to find an alternative site. The Local Plan process has resulted in CYC identifying significant areas of Brownfield Land and any of these could potentially be a suitable and legal alternative. CYC Officers have failed in their duty to consult the settled community as well as the applicants.If they (CYC) had spent more time and effort consulting local communities they would all have a better proposed Local Plan. The plan should be rejected and the responsibility taken over by national government.	Martin Moorhouse

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H6 Travelling Showpeople

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID201/S/H6Policy/		Sound	The plan has been through the correct procedures.	Kerry Southby
SID229/S/H6 (Policy)/1		Sound	Full consideration of the needs for Travelling Showpeople have been assessed and sites considered in the Preferred Options and Further Site Consultations.	Brian Woods
SID230/S/H6 (Policy)/1		Sound	Site SP1 on the Plan will deliver a site for Travelling Showpeople and thereby satisfy a long outstanding need for a Travelling Showperson's site.	Anne Kerr
SID231/S/H6Policy/1		Not Sound	However it is concerned that PD Policy H6 does not reflect national policy and also does not include sufficient safeguards to protect existing communities in York from potentially harmful development.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID305/S/H6Policy/1		Sound	Throughout the Local Plan process full consideration of the needs for travelling showpeople have been assessed and sites considered in earlier consultations. The need for 3 travelling showpersons sites is established through an updated GTAA and the Plan has been prepared to deliver a site to meet this need. Policy H6 has been amended to take into account representations made in Pre-Publication Draft and is positively prepared, effective, justified and consistent with national policy.	Mr & Mrs J Peel
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID178/Mod/H6Poli			As defined under NPP .... 'mixed use' TSP sites should only be permitted on Brown Field land.	Irene Guest
SID191/Mod/H6(policy)/1			Through the local plan process CYC have now identified significant areas of Brownfield Land - any of these could potentially be a suitable and legal alternative for a Travelling Showpersons site.	Martin Moorhouse
SID402/S/H6Policy/1			Upon seeking permission to reside on the land at the Stables this was permitted on a temporary basis by the Planning Inspector at which point the land would revert back to Green Belt. The Council should abide by this ruling. The entrance/exit to the Stables is situated on a bend onto the B1228. Although the speed limit has been reduced to 40mph, if large equipment is being transported to and from the land this can be a danger as they will be moving slowly and it could result in a road traffic accident.	Joanne Owen
SID402/S/H6Policy/1		Not Sound	Upon seeking permission to reside on the land at the Stables this was permitted on a temporary basis by the Planning Inspector at which point the land would revert back to Green Belt. The Council should abide by this ruling. The entrance/exit to the Stables is situated on a bend onto the B1228. Although the speed limit has been reduced to 40mph, if large equipment is being transported to and from the land this can be a danger as they will be moving slowly and it could result in a road traffic accident.	Joanne Owen

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Site SP1 The Stables Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID145/LC/SP1/1		Not Legally Compliant	Site has been refused planning permission 5 times for use as a permanent 'mixed use' Travelling Showpersons plot, twice by CYC Planning Dept, twice on Appeal and once by CYC in 2016 when they instead requested an extension of temporary consent. All refusals were soundly based on National Planning Policy. The proposers do not comply with legal definition of Traveller Showpersons. They have submitted miselading infromation. To approve the site in the context of the above would constitute extremely favourable treatment.	Ken Guest
SID221/LC/H6(SP1)/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The site does not comply with National Policy for Travellers sites (PPTS) or PPG2 for Greenbelt land and the local residents have not been consulted.	Sally Firth
SID222/LC/H6(SP1)/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The site does not comply with National Policy for Travellers sites (PPTS) or PPG2 for Greenbelt land and the local residents have not been consulted.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID223/LC/H6(SP1)/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	CYC have not engaged in consultation with the settled community	Jonathan Hailstone
SID227/LC/H6(SP1)/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The site (SP1) has been rejected by CYC and the planning inspector and it has become suitable since.	Matthew Wedgwood
SID333/LC/H6(SP1)/1		Not Legally Compliant	Site SP1 (The Stables Brinkworth Estate Elvington) was granted a 5 year temporary residence permit that expired on 14th June 2016. Hence the proposal for 3 permanent sites is contrary to the original court ruling	Alison Stead
SID356/LC/H6(SP1)/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The local planning authority have not listened to the wishes of the local residents which goes against the vwhole purpose of the Localism Act 2011.	Jonathan Laverack
SID420/LC/H6(SP1)/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The National Planning Policy (NPP) requires "fair and equal treatment for travellers" – not preferential treatment. No member of the settled community would be given planning permission/residency rights to occupy the green field site.	Jane Moorhouse

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site SP1 The Stables Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID73/S/H6(SP1)/1	Not Sound		It is not justified. To be justified, it should be the most appropriate strategy when considered against reasonable alternatives. The placing of travelling showpeople's (TSP) sites within the Green Belt is against NPP, yet despite CYC including a new brownfield site in the plan on the Elvington Airfield site, they persist in planning to allow TSP to settle in Green Belt rather than on the legally allowable brownfield site. The site at the Stables has long been regarded as Green Belt and was such when the site was transferred from Selby District to CYC. Any attempt to by CYC to alter the status of the Stables site must be regarded as inappropriate, self serving and furthermore unnecessary whilst brownfield sites are available within the local area. It is not consistent with National Policy. The inclusion of TSP sites within the Green Belt is against NPPF unless there are exceptional circumstances. The planning inspectorate have previously ruled against allowing permanent settling of the Stables site, allowing instead only a 5 year temporary residence whilst CYC found alternative sites. This indicates that the planning inspectorate have previously reviewed the case and found that there are no exceptional circumstances. As noted above, brownfield sites in the vicinity are available.	Peter Heptinstall
SID92/S/SP1/1	Not Sound		Previous Planning Inspector's report was that it granted for 5 years use only, which has now expired. CYC should abide by that Planning Inspector's analysis and decision.	Jonathan Shaw
SID102/S/SP1/1	Not Sound		Plan should uphold previous planning inspector's decision.	Elvington Parish Council - David Headlam
SID145/S/SP1/1	Not Sound		Site has been refused planning permission 5 times for use as a permanent 'mixed use' Travelling Showpersons plot, twice by CYC Planning Dept, twice on Appeal and once by CYC in 2016 when they instead requested an extension of temporary consent. All refusals were soundly based on National Planning Policy. Significant local objection.	Ken Guest
SID221/S/H6(SP1)/1	Not Sound		The proposals directly reverse a decision made by the Planning Inspectorate and the site has already been refused permanent permission (for one plot only) on 5 occasions.	Sally Firth
SID222/S/H6(SP1)/1			The proposals directly reverse a decision made by the Planning Inspectorate and the site has already been refused permanent permission (for one plot only) on 5 occasions.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID223/S/H6(SP1)/1	Not Sound		The site does not comply with National Policy for Travellers sites (PPTS) or PPG2 for Greenbelt land.	Jonathan Hailstone



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site SP1 The Stables Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID223/S/H6(SP1)/2			The proposals directly reverse a decision made by the Planning Inspectorate and the site has already been refused permanent permission (for one plot only) on 5 occasions.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID227/S/H6(SP1)/1		Not Sound	The site fails comply with various national policies regarding traveller's sites and contradicts previous decisions made by planning inspectors and the CYC.	Matthew Wedgwood
SID240/S/H6(SP1)/1			Loss of greenbelt paddock within the village and the site is not keeping with the rural aesthetic of the village.	David Boddy
SID240/S/H6(SP1)/2			Cars/vans and trailers from this site are a traffic risk as the entrance to the paddock is on a bend in the road. Furthermore, additional plots will lead to further increased traffic and risk.	David Boddy
SID261/S/H6(SP1)/1		Not Sound	Previous decision to have this site as temporary for one dwelling has been overturned. This destroys confidence in the council.	Amanda Moore
SID262/S/H6(SP1)/1			Previous decision to have this site as temporary for one dwelling has been overturned. This destroys confidence in the council.	Ian Dickens
SID285/S/H6(SP1)/1		Sound	Throughout the local plan process, full consideration of the needs for travelling showpeople have been assessed and sites considered in the preferred options and further site consultations.	E Peel
SID285/S/H6(SP1)/2			Site SP1 will deliver a site for travelling shwpeople and thereby satisfy a long outstanding need for a travelling showperson's site.	E Peel
SID333/S/H6(SP1)/1		Not Sound	The proposal is not consistent with national policy concerning land determined as green belt. Not positively prepared - the temporary permit for this travellers site expired on 14th June 2016. Not justified - CYC should be seen to be responding to the court ruling and addressing Policy E of the NPPftS i.e. that Travellers sites in the green belt are inappropriate development except in special circumstances.	Alison Stead
SID356/S/H6(SP1)/1		Not Sound	The site does not comply with National Policy PPG2 for GreenbeltThe site does not comply with National Policy for Travellers sites (PPTS) – policies B to F. The proposals directly reverse a decision made by the Planning Inspectorate 10/02082/FUL made for a single site and indeed now extend this abuse of National Planning Policy to 3 plots on the single site. No alternative sites have been put forward by York to justify whether this is the correct site or otherwise. York has plenty of Brownfield sites in the plan put forward for housing why cannot one of these be used?	Jonathan Laverack

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site SP1 The Stables Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID369/S/H6(SP1)/1		Not Sound	The proposed Elvington Showpeople additions have caused great concern amongst residents. A planning application for one permanent pitch on this site was refused by the Council on two occasions in 2010, on the grounds that the proposed development constitutes inappropriate development in the greenbelt. On appeal, the Planning Inspector agreed with the Council's decision making but allowed temporary permissions for one pitch until March 2016. This was then extended and the site is now included as a permanent site for additional plots. It is considered that the need for how people pitches does not constitute the exceptional circumstances required to permit development in the greenbelt. There are insufficient amenities in the village to cope with additional Showpeople families.	Julian Sturdy MP
SID389/S/H6(SP1)/1		Not Sound	I object to this proposal on the grounds of soundness as the previous Planning Inspector's report was that it granted for 5 years use only, which has now expired. CYC should abide by that Planning Inspector's analysis and decision.	Sandra Atkinson
SID420/S/H6(SP1)/1		Not Sound	Planning permission for use of this site as a Travelling Showpeople's (TSP) site was refused twice in 2010.	Jane Moorhouse
SID420/S/H6/(SP1)2			The Greenbelt is not being protected.	Jane Moorhouse

### Proposed Modification

SID73/MOD/H6(SP1)/1			To make the Local Plan legally compliant and sound with regard to TSP sites, the Plan should refuse planning permission for the development of the Stables site, insisting that it is returned to greenfield condition it was in prior to the TSP moving in. It should then make provision for their accommodation on the brownfield site at the Airfield (or elsewhere within the local area). This would be in keeping with the Planning Inspectorate's original decision regarding the site, which was that permanent settlement should not be allowed. Furthermore, that the site should be cleared within 5 years of that decision (2011) and returned to its original state.	Peter Heptinstall
SID145/Mod/SP1/1		Not Sound	Delete site SP1 and allocate an appropriate alternative brownfield site to accommodate Travelling Showpeople.	Ken Guest
SID221/Mod/H6(SP1)			The Plan should be rejected and responsibility taken over by National Government.	Sally Firth
SID222/Mod/H6(SP1)			The Plan should be rejected and responsibility taken over by National Government.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID222/Mod/H6(SP1)			Follow national policy, follow the planning inspector's previous decision. Take note of the opinion of the local community.	Joanne Wedgwood
SID223/Mod/H6(SP1)			The Plan should be rejected and responsibility taken over by National Government.	Jonathan Hailstone

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Site SP1 The Stables Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID227/Mod/H6(SP1)/1			Comply with national policies and listen to local residents.	Matthew Wedgwood
SID333/Mod/H6(SP1)/1			consider that CYC should follow through it's development plan process and come forward with potential TSP sites asap in order to provide a suitable site for the traveller family.	Alison Stead
SID385/MOD/H6(SP1)/1		Not Legally Compliant	SP1 - The Stables, Elvington. Objective comments on planning issues, and are no reflection on the personalities involved. Two previous applications submitted (March & September 2010) for change of use for a travelling showpeople's site for one family (previously refused). There were several reasons for refusal, which included: inappropriate development in the Green Belt, conflict with advice in PPG2, and Policy GB1 (Development in the Green Belt) in the 2005 City of York Local Plan; Proposal would erode the open, rural character of the site and would have a significant visual impact on the area, contrary to PPS1, PPS7, and Local Plan policies GP1 (Design) and H16 (Residential Sites for Gypsies & Travellers in the 2005 City of York Local Plan. Not aware of any circumstances which have changed. The site had a temporary permission for 5 years for a single occupancy, terminating in June 2016, after which it would need to be returned to Green Belt. Therefore, inclusion in the Plan with a temporary permission until 2020 is in clear conflict with the decision already made with the Planning Inspectorate. Significant traffic and road safety must be considered - the site is on a busy road, sight lines are poor making access difficult, especially when towing caravans or large trailers - turning would create a hazard to other road users. The existing buildings on the site are too small fore the storage of equipment required and the erection of new buildings would be inappropriate in the Green Belt. This allocation should be removed from the Local Plan.	Giles Carter

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H7 Student Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/H7Policy/1		Not Sound	Fails to reflect changes in government policy regarding tuition fees. Doesn't see why housing student numbers are related to the overall housing need. Students don't occupy accommodation all year and may decrease due to fees and Brexit discouraging foreign students. No estimated or accurate figure of student numbers occupying privately rented properties is in the domain. Not clear how increased student accommodation will affect premises for other families.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/H7Policy/2		Not Sound	no mention of increase potential student accommodation at askham bryan college.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID119/S/H7policy/ 1		Not Sound	Policy H7 (Sites SH1 / OS6) Reiterating previous comments on this site, this site has an area designated as functional floodplain (Flood Zone 3b (FZ3b)) in the current Strategic Flood Risk Assessment (SFRA). It should be noted that only essential infrastructure and water compatible development should be located in FZ3b.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID165/S/H7policy/ 1			In line with earlier comments about ED1-3, suggest either that the first part of Policy H7 is deleted as it simply duplicates other policies (ED1, ED2, ED3 and ED4) or it is replaced with the following: The University of York and York St John University must meet the need for any additional student housing which arises because of their future expansion of student numbers. In assessing need, account can be taken of firm proposals by independent providers for bespoke student housing in the City. To meet any projected shortfall, provision by the University of York can be made on either campus. Provision by York St John University....	Richard Frost
SID231/S/H7Policy/ 1		Not Sound	Suggests either that the first part of Policy H7 is deleted as it simply duplicates other policies (ED1, ED2, ED3and ED4) or it is replaced with suggested text.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID582/S/H7Policy/ 1		Not Sound	The Plan needs to make clear that Student Housing sits outside the OAN and Housing Supply.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H7 Student Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/S/H7 (Policy)/1			The Plan needs to make clear that Student Housing sits outside the OAN and Housing Supply.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/H7 (Policy)/1			The Plan needs to make clear that Student Housing sits outside the OAN and Housing Supply.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/H7Policy/1		Not Sound	The Plan needs to make clear that Student Housing sits outside the OAN and Housing Supply.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID825/S/H7(Policy)/1		Not Sound	The University of York, York St John University and Askham Bryan College should, to avoid further unbalance of the housing market in the areas of York close proximity to their campuses, be required to accommodate all increased numbers of students on campus. Policy H7 is worded too loosely (Not Positively Prepared, Not Justified, Not Effective) and is unsound to approve a development plan policy so lacking in clear direction as this will only lead to the continuing displacement of huge numbers of students into the HMO market with all the attendant problems for community cohesion and the operation of the housing market. Similarly, the continuing spread of purpose built off campus student accommodation blocks must be discouraged to redress the balance in providing residential units for York residents, in particular single peoples accommodation. Policy fails to take account of Askham Bryan College.	Osbalwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID848/S/H7 (Policy)/1			The Plan needs to make clear that Student Housing sits outside the OAN and Housing Supply.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/H7Policy/1		Not Sound	Fails to reflect changes in government policy regarding tuition fees. Doesn't see why housing student numbers are related to the overall housing need. Students don't occupy accommodation all year and may decrease due to fees and Brexit discouraging foreign students. No estimated or accurate figure of student numbers occupying privately rented properties is in the domain. Not clear how increased student accommodation will affect premises for other families.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H7 Student Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID61/S/H7Policy/2		Not Sound	no mention of increase potential student accommodation at askham bryan college.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

### Proposed Modification

SID119/MOD/H7policy/1			Recommend that you distinguish between the areas of allocation for Open Space and Student Housing, with open space only, allocated in FZ3b. Alternatively, you could provide a clear statement that the sequential approach site layout must be used on this site. You have suggested that you will cross reference Flood Risk Policy ENV4 to cover this issue. We recommend that this is referenced in Policy H7: Student Housing	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID119/Mod/H7policy/1			Policy H7 (Sites SH1 / OS6) We recommend that you distinguish between the areas of allocation for Open Space and Student Housing, with open space only, allocated in FZ3b. Alternatively, you could provide a clear statement that the sequential approach site layout must be used on this site. You have suggested that you will cross reference Flood Risk Policy ENV4 to cover this issue. We recommend that this is referenced in Policy H7: Student Housing.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID165/Mod/H7policy/1			In line with earlier comments about ED1-3, suggest either that the first part of Policy H7 is deleted as it simply duplicates other policies (ED1, ED2, ED3 and ED4) or it is replaced with the following: The University of York and York St John University must meet the need for any additional student housing which arises because of their future expansion of student numbers. In assessing need, account can be taken of firm proposals by independent providers for bespoke student housing in the City. To meet any projected shortfall, provision by the University of York can be made on either campus. Provision by York St John University....	Richard Frost
SID231/Mod/H7Policy/1			Suggests either that the first part of Policy H7 is deleted as it simply duplicates other policies (ED1, ED2, ED3 and ED4) or it is replaced with suggested text.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID364/Mod/H7Policy/1			Further Higher Education expansion must be matched by new purpose built 'on-campus' student accommodation. Strengthen H7 and ED1 to accomplish this.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/H7Policy/1			Further Higher Education expansion must be matched by new purpose built 'on-campus' student accommodation. Strengthen H7 and ED1 to accomplish this.	Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H7 Student Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/Mod/H7Policy/1			Clarification text required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/H7 (Policy)/1			Clarification text required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/H7 (Policy)/1			Clarification text required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/H7Policy/1			Clarification text required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID825/MOD/H7(Policy)/1			Should include requirement for York University, York St John University and Askham Bryan College to accommodate all future expansion numbers of students on campus.	Osbalwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID848/Mod/H7 (Policy)/1			Clarification text required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H8 Houses in Multiple Occupation

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID231/S/H8Policy/1	Not Sound		FPC considers that the thresholds for restrictions on new HMOs should be reduced from 20% to 10% for neighbourhood areas and from 10% to 5% for lengths of street.FPC considers the policy should contain a restriction on extensions to existing and proposed HMOs.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID825/S/H8(Policy)/1	Not Sound		The progression of policy H8 with the acceptability of thresholds first introduced in the 2012 Article 4 Direction have been the subject of much controversy, both with the far too high threshold percentages and the inability to maintain a database to enable planning applications to be determined means the policy is unsound. Continuing with the current thresholds is not in the interest of council tax paying residents, the local housing market or wider community adhesion. They should be reduced as far as possible (no more than 5% at street level and no more than 10% at neighbourhood level). The current thresholds spread blight further afield, especially in Osbaldwick. It is not justified to continue to identify Green Betlt land for housing in Osbaldwick area to address housing need whilst continuing to allow the steady loss of up to 20% of family homes in the rest of the area to HMOs.	Osbaldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association

#### Proposed Modification

SID165/Mod/165/H8policy/1			Policy needs significant strengthening. I consider that the thresholds for restrictions on new HMOs should be reduced from 20% to 10% for neighbourhood areas and from 10% to 5% for lengths of street. I consider the policy should contain a restriction on extensions to existing and proposed HMOs. Such extensions are often unsightly and out-of-scale with the original house, giving an institutional character to the property. To minimise the harm caused to existing residential communities such as Heslington, the following is suggested: Extensions to existing and proposed HMOs will only be permitted where it will improve living conditions for residents (such as larger bathrooms and kitchens) and not to provide additional living units. Such an alteration is required to be consistent with NPPF paragraph 17 which states that plans should always seek to secure a good standard of amenity for all existing and future occupants of land and buildings.	Richard Frost
SID231/Mod/H8Policy/1			FPC considers that the thresholds for restrictions on new HMOs should be reduced from 20% to 10% for neighbourhood areas and from 10% to 5% for lengths of street. FPC considers the policy should contain a restriction on extensions to existing and proposed HMOs.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID825/MOD/H8(Policy)/1			Reduction in the acceptability threshold percentages halved for both neighbourhood and street level thresholds.	Osbaldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H9 Older Persons Specialist Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/H9Policy/1		Not Sound	Overlook permitting residential homes for the elderly (too close to industrial parks)	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID125/S/H9policy/1		Not Sound	Persimmon Homes supports the HBF comment that the Council needs to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clarify the type of housing for older persons that the Council seeks to be provided</li> <li>• Demonstrate need and Consider:</li> <li>• The suitability of a site for this type of accommodation</li> </ul> Any impact on viability should be taken into account.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID255/S/H9Policy/1		Not Sound	It is not clear from the wording of Policy H9 whether the proposal for strategic sites (over 5ha) to incorporate appropriate provision of accommodation types for older persons refers to C2 or C3 provision.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID316/S/H9/5			H9 Land to west of Common Road, Dunnington. Important for setting of the village. Open and rural aspect lost through development. Flood, conservation and ecological issues. Greenbelt significance.	Stuart Kay
SID318/S/H9/1			Support policy H9 however of the opinion that it is UNSOUND as consideration needs to be made for the provision of housing for injured service personnel.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID372/S/H9Policy/1		Sound	Gladman support Policy H9 as the Council are seeking to enable the delivery of extra care accommodation specifically designed to meet the needs of older people. Specialist housing with care for older people is a type of housing which provides choice to adults with varying care needs and enables them to live as independently as possible in their own self-contained homes, where people are able to access high quality, flexible support and care services on site to suit their individual needs (including dementia care). Such schemes differ from traditional sheltered/retirement accommodation schemes and should provide internally accessible communal facilities including residents' lounge, library, dining room, guest suite, quiet lounge, IT suite, assisted bathroom, internal buggy store and changing facilities, reception and care managers office and staff facilities.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H9 Older Persons Specialist Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID380/S/H9Policy/1			We support the provision of an appropriate mix of housing including the potential provision for older persons accommodation where appropriate and particularly in accessible and central locations which are in close proximity to services and amenities. This must be applied flexibly, based on particular site characteristics.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID394/S/H9Policy/1		Not Sound	General support for Policy H9 'Older People's Specialist Housing'. Nevertheless, it is important that Policy H9 should clarify the position in respect of Extra Care Housing. The current draft suggests that it is only Care and Residential homes that fall within Use Class C2. Extra Care accommodation covers a wide spectrum and it is well recognised they can fall within either the C2 or C3 Use Class. It is therefore considered that policy should be drafted which explicitly encourages Extra Care Housing and includes guidance along the following lines: "All C3 Use Class homes will be required to provide affordable housing (including retirement properties but excluding Extra Care Accommodation where it falls within Use Class C2)"	The Planning Bureau (Stephen Courcier) OBO McCarthy & Stone Retirement Lifestyles Ltd
SID582/S/H9Policy/1		Not Sound	Policy H9 requires further clarification on what is required in terms of numbers and types. While house builders can provide elderly persons housing under C3, the provision of extra care housing as a C2 class is more complex.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/H9 (Policy)/1			Policy H9 requires further clarification on what is required in terms of numbers and types. While house builders can provide elderly persons housing under C3, the provision of extra care housing as a C2 class is more complex.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/H9 (Policy)/1			While house builders can provide elderly persons housing under C3, the provision of extra care housing as a C2 class is more complex and policy H9 requires further clarification on what is required in terms of numbers and types.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/H9Policy/1		Not Sound	Policy H9 requires further clarification on what is required in terms of numbers and types. While house builders can provide elderly persons housing under C3, the provision of extra care housing as a C2 class is more complex.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H9 Older Persons Specialist Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID604/S/H9 (Policy)/1		Not Sound	Maintain that strategic sites should only be required to “incorporate the appropriate provision of accommodation types for older persons within their site masterplanning” only if the need for older persons accommodation and the site suitability and location are appropriate.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID848/S/H9 (Policy)/1			While house builders can provide elderly persons housing under C3, the provision of extra care housing as a C2 class is more complex and policy H9 equires further clarification on what is required in terms of numbers and types.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/H9Policy/1		Not Sound	Overlook permitting residential homes for the elderly (too close to industrial parks)	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

#### Proposed Modification

SID125/Mod/H9policy/1			Persimmon proposes that the policy is modified as follows: • ‘Strategic sites (over 5ha) should incorporate the appropriate provision of accommodation types for older persons within their site masterplanning, where the need is demonstrated. The Council will give consideration to the viability of the development and to the suitability of the site to provide appropriate older persons housing. For sheltered/extra care accommodations a mix of tenures will be supported.’ If a particular type of older persons housing is expected to be provided further clarity should be provided.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID255/Mod/H9Policy/1			HBF propose that the policy is modified as follows: • ‘Strategic sites (over 5ha) should incorporate the appropriate provision of accommodation types for older persons within their site masterplanning where the need is demonstrated. The Council will give consideration to the viability of the development and to the suitability of the site to provide appropriate older persons housing. For sheltered/extra care accommodations a mix of tenures will be supported. • If a particular type of older persons housing is expected to be provided further clarity should be provided.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID318/Mod/H9/1			Consideration needs to be made for the provision of housing for injured service personel.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H9 Older Persons Specialist Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID380/Mod/H9Policy/1			Policy H3 needs to recognise the scope for flexibility on a site by site basis.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/Mod/H9Policy/1			The reference to Strategic Sites providing homes for the elderly needs to reference C3 uses only. The supporting text at para 5.58 needs to more clearly inform that C2 development will not count towards the housing supply in the OAN.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/H9 (Policy)/1			The reference to Strategic Sites providing homes for the elderly needs to reference C3 uses only. The supporting text at para 5.58 needs to more clearly inform that C2 development will not count towards the housing supply in the OAN.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/H9 (Policy)/1			The reference to Strategic Sites providing homes for the elderly should be amended to reference C3 uses only. The supporting text at para 5.58 needs to more clearly inform that C2 development will not count towards the housing supply in the OAN.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/H9Policy/1			The reference to Strategic Sites providing homes for the elderly needs to reference C3 uses only. The supporting text at para 5.58 needs to more clearly inform that C2 development will not count towards the housing supply in the OAN.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID604/Mod/H9 (Policy)/1		Not Sound	H9 should be amended to incorporate flexibility.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy H9 Older Persons Specialist Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/Mod/H9 (Policy)/1			The reference to Strategic Sites providing homes for the elderly should be amended to reference C3 uses only. The supporting text at para 5.58 needs to more clearly inform that C2 development will not count towards the housing supply in the OAN.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H10 Affordable Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID174/LC/H10policy/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Plan does not provide enough housing to meet projected need nor does it provide enough affordable housing.	Susan Turner
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID16/S/H10policy/1		Not Sound	Not positively prepared as the plan does not meet York's identified housing need, nor does it provide the affordable housing required.	Ruth Potter
SID24/S/H10policy/1		Not Sound	Plan is completely inadequate on air quality improvements, affordable housing and coordinated green spaces.	Daphne Taylor
SID26/S/H10policy/1		Not Sound	Document fails address the shortage of affordable housing which is a major issue for younger residents. If residents had been properly involved the final document would not be like this.	Andrew Dickinson
SID160/S/H10Policy/1		Sound	Support policy.	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE
SID174/S/H10policy/1		Not Sound	Plan does not provide enough housing to meet projected need nor does it provide enough affordable housing. At least 30% affordable housing on each development is needed.	Susan Turner
SID255/S/H10Policy/1		Not Sound	The first line of policy H10 acknowledges the need to improve affordability across the housing market. It is noted however, that this aspiration is not included within the overall housing requirement.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID269/S/H10Policy/1		Not Sound	In rural areas developments between 2 and 14 dwellings are to make an off-site contribution. How/where do we provide affordable housing in rural areas other than in exception sites (100% affordable) and this would not provide the mixed development sought. Where will off-site contributions from rural sites go?	Mrs Janet Hopton

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H10 Affordable Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID324/S/H10Policy /1		Not Sound	This is a very specialised area , I would imagine that the people who are professionals on this matter are the House Builders themselves (although they have a monetary interest in the matter) Planners and members of the Housing Department. Reference is made to the average house price and average wage in York and the issue this brings to the housing market in York. How many council houses will be built in York over the Plan period? How many York people will there be houses for in the allocations?	Howard Perry
SID339/S/H10Policy /1		Not Sound	Policy (H10) is not clear and implies that affordable housing is required on developments of 2 or more dwellings in line with the thresholds and targets set out in table 5.4. It is only stated in a footnote at the bottom of the table that for developments of less than 10 units, an off -site financial contribution can only be sought if the total combined floor space exceeds 1,000m <sup>2</sup> . This should be made clear. Paragraph 5.62 of the policy raises significant concerns and outlines a wholly unacceptable approach to considering the appropriate level of affordable housing. This should be deleted from the Plan as our Client strongly objects. Our Client objects to the requirement to have no more than two affordable dwellings placed next to each other. The NPPF makes no such requirement. Our Client’s vast experience shows people prefer the units to be in clusters of circa 10 -15 units. With regards to vacant building credit (VBC), the Council are misapplying national guidance set out within the PPG. Paragraph 5.72 of the CYCLP states that a viability appraisal will be required to accompany such applications. This requirement does not comply with national planning policy.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID345/S/H10Policy /1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID582/S/H10Policy /2		Not Sound	The Policy overlooks the Government’s intention to deliver ‘Starter Homes as part of the Affordable Housing Mix (as included in the emerging NPPF) The Policy should consider inserting an off-site contribution for Self Build Custom Sites as per the Rural Sites. The 30% affordable housing target is currently not objected to. We are currently reviewing 'developer contribution' and the cumulative effect those have on viability overall.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID582/S/H10Policy /1		Not Sound	While we support the reference to the ‘notable affordable housing need’ and increasing affordability concerns in the City in para 1.46, it is clear this recognition has not been taken forward into the housing requirement number that will be used to help resolve these problems.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H10 Affordable Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/S/H10 (Policy)/1			The Policy overlooks the Government’s intention to deliver ‘Starter Homes as part of the Affordable Housing Mix (as included in the emerging NPPF) The Policy should consider inserting an off-site contribution for Self Build Custom Sites as per the Rural Sites. The 30% affordable housing target is currently not objected to. We are currently reviewing 'developer contribution' and the cumulative effect those have on viability overall.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID583/S/H10 (Policy)/1			While we support the reference to the ‘notable affordable housing need’ and increasing affordability concerns in the City in para 1.46, it is clear this recognition has not been taken forward into the housing requirement number that will be used to help resolve these problems.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/H10 (Policy)/1			The Policy overlooks the Government’s intention to deliver ‘Starter Homes as part of the Affordable Housing Mix (as included in the emerging NPPF). The 30% affordable housing target is currently not objected to but We are currently reviewing 'developer contribution' and the cumulative effect those have on viability overall. Reducing the obligation on sites over 5ha to provide only 25% affordable housing should enable other infrastructure requirements to be funded.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/H10Policy /2		Not Sound	The Policy overlooks the Government’s intention to deliver ‘Starter Homes as part of the Affordable Housing Mix (as included in the emerging NPPF) The Policy should consider inserting an off-site contribution for Self Build Custom Sites as per the Rural Sites. The 30% affordable housing target is currently not objected to. We are currently reviewing 'developer contribution' and the cumulative effect those have on viability overall.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID604/S/H10 (Policy)/1		Not Sound	Generally support the provision of affordable housing and maintains that urban extensions provide the opportunity to help meet affordable housing requirements across the city. Reserve position on this aspect of the plan subject to more detail of how the draft NPPF amendments to the definition of affordable housing provision as set out in the current consultation on the draft NPPF will be incorporated as the plan proceeds.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID848/S/H10 (Policy)/1			The Policy overlooks the Government’s intention to deliver ‘Starter Homes as part of the Affordable Housing Mix (as included in the emerging NPPF). The 30% affordable housing target is currently not objected to but We are currently reviewing 'developer contribution' and the cumulative effect those have on viability overall. Reducing the obligation on sites over 5ha to provide only 25% affordable housing should enable other infrastructure requirements to be funded.	Johnson Mowat OBO Avant Homes

**Proposed Modification**



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H10 Affordable Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID16/Mod/H10poli			Increase the amount of affordable housing on all sites over dwellings to 50%.	Ruth Potter
SID26/Mod/H10poli			Increase number of affordable homes, involve community in production of the plan.	Andrew Dickinson
SID53/Mod/H2Policy/1			Bishopthorpe has no new housing development proposed despite having many more suitable locations and as good, if not better, infrastructure.	Peter Whitfield
SID174/S/H10Policy/1			Plan does not provide enough housing to meet projected need nor does it provide enough affordable housing. At least 30% affordable housing on each development is needed.	Susan Turner
SID372/Mod/H10Policy/1			Policy H10 provides the proposed approach to the delivery of affordable housing. The policy refers to Table 5.4 which sets out various site thresholds / site typologies and target affordable housing provisions. Gladman recommend that the Council revisit this policy and the proposed thresholds within Table 5.4 because as drafted this is not in line with the policy and guidance in the NPPF and PPG.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID582/Mod/H10Policy/1			Insert reference to Starter Homes. Change sites over 5Ha to a 25%requirement.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/H10 (Policy)/1			Insert reference to Starter Homes. Change sites over 5Ha to a 25%requirement.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/H10 (Policy)/1			The Policy should consider inserting an off-site contribution for Self Build Custom Sites as per the Rural Sites. Insert reference to Starter Homes. Change sites over 5Ha to a 25% requirement. The Policy should consider inserting an Off-site contribution for Self Build Custom Sites as per the Rural Sites	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy H10 Affordable Housing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/Mod/H10Policy/1			Insert reference to Starter Homes. Change sites over 5Ha to a 25%requirement.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/H10 (Policy)/1			The Policy should consider inserting an off-site contribution for Self Build Custom Sites as per the Rural Sites. Insert reference to Starter Homes. Change sites over 5Ha to a 25% requirement. The Policy should consider inserting an Off-site contribution for Self Build Custom Sites as per the Rural Sites	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW1 Protecting Existing Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/HW1/1		Not Sound	Needs to show commitment to developers to local opinion on facilities. Lack of provision makes policy unsound. The following provisions should be written into the policy:- Local communities must be informed of any changes that are proposed-Local communities should be given a minimum year to explore the opportunities for community raise.-Particularly applies to rural areas where the post office/pub/church may no longer be used for the purpose intended. -Communities could feel that the loss of the facility would reduce the residential quality of the village and to replace it with housing may not be an appropriate option.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID318/S/HW1/1			Supports Policy HW1. Re-using existing community assets should occur.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID366/S/HW1/1		Sound	This policy seeks to protect existing community facilities unless it can be demonstrated via a list of reasons that the use cannot be supported. Should certain sites become available the reasons will already have been established that the site(s) are no longer required.	Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services
SID398/S/HW1/1		Not Sound	Regarding pub protection policy this Local Plan is not “justified” in that it is not the most appropriate strategy to cope with current and future threats to York’s pubs. It is also not consistent with the documented wishes of the City of York Council Executive who passed a resolution on Thursday 29th October 2015 regarding Pubs and the Local Plan. York CAMRA submitted a document in response to the first consultation, based on best practice nationally, which was ignored in its entirety. Pubs are in need of more robust protection particularly in respect of issues of “viability” where owners claim a lack of viability. The wording in paragraph 6.10 around viability is not robust or comprehensive enough to offer sufficient protection to any community facilities and in particular public houses. The Local Plan is not consistent with the NPPF in that it doesn’t name public houses as Community Facilities	York Campaign for Real Ale - Nick Love
SID609/S/HW1/1			Council has failed to ensure balanced communities, and the plan has seen the evaporation of facilities. Playing fields should be protected by the local plan, as denuding the mainurban area of crucial green space is not acceptable as it will reinforce social exclusion.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW1 Protecting Existing Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID61/S/HW1/1		Not Sound	Needs to show commitment to developers to local opinion on facilities. Lack of provision makes policy unsound. The following provisions should be written into the policy:- Local communities must be informed of any changes that are proposed-Local communities should be given a minimum year to explore the opportunities for community raise.-Particularly applies to rural areas where the post office/pub/church may no longer be used for the purpose intended. -Communities could feel that the loss of the facility would reduce the residential quality of the village and to replace it with housing may not be an appropriate option.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

### Proposed Modification

SID398/Mod/HW1/1			We would suggest the definition in NPPF paragraph 70 be used instead of the current wording in point 6.5 on page 122. Paragraph 6.10 is not robust enough in defining viability. recommend re-wording of the paragraph and remove the last sentence of 6.10 and then amend to include; Clear evidence to prove non viability, use the CAMRA Public House Viability Test, provide documentary evidence of the range of measures used to explore more trade and diversity, provide evidence that no interest has been show in purchasing the lease or freehold, and evidence to show the community facility has been marketed rigorously.	York Campaign for Real Ale - Nick Love
------------------	--	--	---	--

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW2 New Community Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/HW2/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID318/S/HW2/1			Supports HW2.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/HW2/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID372/S/HW2/1		Not Sound	In terms of the provision of community benefits, such as those set out through policies HW2, HW3, HW4 and HW5, Gladman remind the Council that it is important for the evidence base for the Local Plan to properly assess the viability of all the policy requirements to ensure consistency with paragraphs 173 and 174 of the Framework. As the Council will be aware, plans need to be deliverable and sites should not be subject to such a scale of obligation and policy burdens that their ability to be developed viably is threatened. Therefore, the Council should assess the likely cumulative impacts on development in their area of all existing and proposed local standards and policies through a comprehensive and robust Viability Assessment to ensure that the cumulative impacts of these standards and policies do not put the implementation of the Plan at serious risk.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID378/S/HW2/1		Not Sound	This draft Policy requires applications for strategic residential developments to be supported by an audit of existing community facilities, their capacity, and identification, of the need for new more expanded community facilities required to meet the needs of "existing and future occupiers".	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW2 New Community Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/S/HW2/2		Not Sound	LDP object to the Policy's requirement that development should provide for the needs of existing residents. It is a well-established principle of planning that development should only mitigate the impacts of the development itself.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/HW2/3		Not Sound	It is not appropriate for the Plan to derogate the responsibility of assessing the community infrastructure of the City to individual applications. It is the responsibility of the Plan to assess the quality and capacity of infrastructure, and for it to plan for this infrastructure accordingly (paragraph 162 of the NPPF).	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/HW2/4		Not Sound	It is inappropriate to set policies in a Plan that are not supported by adequate, up to date and relevant evidence, and therefore not justified. There is presently no evidence base to support the infrastructure required by this Policy HW2, it is, therefore, not positively prepared and inconsistent with national policy.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID380/S/HW/1			We do not support Policy HW2 - also HW4, HW5 A and D3 - in their current form. It is the Council's responsibility to provide the appropriate evidence base to justify any requirement for contributions sought.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/S/HW/2			In order to provide certainty to applicants, the types of community facility to which the policy would apply should be identified within the policy. This would also help ensure that this Policy requirement does not cover the same facilities for which contributions are sought through other policies in the Publication Draft Local Plan.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/S/HW/3			The wording needs to be built into the policy to ensure that the provision of new community facilities is subject to viability testing where relevant.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW2 New Community Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/HW2/1		Not Sound	Whilst we welcome the policy wording change which deletes the 10 dwelling threshold for an audit of existing community facilities to be prepared, there remains little detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/HW2/1			Whilst we welcome the policy wording change which deletes the 10 dwelling threshold for an audit of existing community facilities to be prepared, there remains little detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/HW2/1			Support the deletion of 10 dwelling threshold for audit of existing community facilities to be carried out but require further information regarding the extent of developer contributions.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/HW2/1		Not Sound	Whilst we welcome the policy wording change which deletes the 10 dwelling threshold for an audit of existing community facilities to be prepared, there remains little detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/HW2/1			Council has failed to ensure balanced communities, and the plan has seen the evaporation of facilities. Playing fields should be protected by the local plan, as denuding the main urban area of crucial green space is not acceptable as it will reinforce social exclusion.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/HW2/1			Support the deletion of 10 dwelling threshold for audit of existing community facilities to be carried out but require further information regarding the extent of developer contributions.	Johnson Mowat OBO Avant Homes

**Proposed Modification**

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW2 New Community Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/Mod/HW2/ 1			Applications for strategic residential developments must be accompanied by an audit of existing community facilities and their current capacity, prepared by the applicant. Developments that place additional demands on existing services will be required to provide proportionate new or expanded community facilities, to meet the needs of existing and future occupiers. In the case of strategic sites (Section 3) provision should be made as required by the relevant policy. These should be provided on site or developer contributions will be sought to provide these additional facilities.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID380/Mod/HW2/ 1			Policy HW2, HW4, HW5, and D3, should be amended to reflect the fact that it is the Council's responsibility to provide the evidence to justify any requirements for contributions.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/Mod/HW2/ 2			In order to provide certainty to applicants, the types of community facility to which the policy would apply should be identified within the policy.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/Mod/HW2/ 3			The wording of policy HW2 is amended to allow flexibility for viability testing in appropriate circumstances.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/Mod/HW2/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required,	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/HW2/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required,	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW2 New Community Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/Mod/HW2/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/HW2/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required,	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/HW2/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW3 Built Sport Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/HW3/1		Not Sound	Policy is consistent with NPPF but contradicts development proposal ST2 which is the former civil service playing fields. No provision on site for playing facilities.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID318/S/HW3/1			Supports HW3.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/HW3/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID372/S/HW3/1		Not Sound	In terms of the provision of community benefits, such as those set out through policies HW2, HW3, HW4 and HW5, Gladman remind the Council that it is important for the evidence base for the Local Plan to properly assess the viability of all the policy requirements to ensure consistency with paragraphs 173 and 174 of the Framework. As the Council will be aware, plans need to be deliverable and sites should not be subject to such a scale of obligation and policy burdens that their ability to be developed viably is threatened. Therefore, the Council should assess the likely cumulative impacts on development in their area of all existing and proposed local standards and policies through a comprehensive and robust Viability Assessment to ensure that the cumulative impacts of these standards and policies do not put the implementation of the Plan at serious risk.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID380/S/HW3/1			With regards to Policy HW3, no detail is provided on how the calculation toward contributed to sports facilities would be calculated. In addition, the wording of this policy has been revised to specify that "For strategic sites facilities should be provided onsite, where possible."	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW3 Built Sport Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/HW3/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/HW3/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/HW3/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/HW3/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID602/S/HW3/1			Support for this policy. If site 187 (formerly ST30 Land north of Stockton Lane) was brought back into the plan with the suggested, expanded site boundary The Wider Site (land to the north and north-east) could be used to create an improved facility for the City of York Hockey Club and Heworth Cricket Club (more detail is provided in rep)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID609/S/HW3/1			Council has failed to ensure balanced communities, and the plan has seen the evaporation of facilities. Playing fields should be protected by the local plan, as denuding the mainurban area of crucial green space is not acceptable as it will reinforce social exclusion.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW3 Built Sport Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/S/HW3/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/HW3/1		Not Sound	Policy is consistent with NPPF but contradicts development proposal ST2 which is the former civil service playing fields. No provision on site for playing facilities.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

### Proposed Modification

SID2/Mod/HW3/1			Opposes the Railway Institute at Queen Street by the station being designated as mixed use, this means it will be knocked down and an excellent, regionally important sporting facility will be lost. There is no comparable facility in York, demolition will damage local sport and public health. If it must be demolished then another facility at least as good, if not better should be built to replace it.	Rachel Hallam
SID380/Mod/HW3/1			Policy HW3 should be reworded to provide clarity on the built sports facilities requirements that will be sought, as this is not evident from the current wording.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/Mod/HW3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required,	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/HW3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required,	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW3 Built Sport Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/Mod/HW3/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required,	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/HW3/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required,	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/HW3/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required,	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW4 Childcare Provision

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/HW4/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID318/S/HW4/1			Supports HW4.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/HW4/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID372/S/HW4/2		Not Sound	In terms of the provision of community benefits, such as those set out through policies HW2, HW3, HW4 and HW5, Gladman remind the Council that it is important for the evidence base for the Local Plan to properly assess the viability of all the policy requirements to ensure consistency with paragraphs 173 and 174 of the Framework. As the Council will be aware, plans need to be deliverable and sites should not be subject to such a scale of obligation and policy burdens that their ability to be developed viably is threatened. Therefore, the Council should assess the likely cumulative impacts on development in their area of all existing and proposed local standards and policies through a comprehensive and robust Viability Assessment to ensure that the cumulative impacts of these standards and policies do not put the implementation of the Plan at serious risk.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID378/S/HW4/1		Not Sound	It is not appropriate for the Plan to derogate the responsibility of assessing the community infrastructure of the City to individual applications. It is the responsibility of the Plan to assess the quality and capacity of infrastructure, and for it to Plan accordingly (paragraph 162 of the NPPF).	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW4 Childcare Provision

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/S/HW4/2		Not Sound	It is inappropriate to set policies in a Plan that are not supported by adequate, up to date and relevant evidence. There is presently no evidence base to support the infrastructure required by this Policy HW4, and it is, therefore, not justified.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID380/S/HW4/1			Similar wording also needs to be built into policies HW5 and HW6 to ensure that the provision of new healthcare and cultural facilities is subject to viability testing where relevant.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/S/HW4/1		Not Sound	We object to strategic sites being required to undertake an audit. This is work only the LEA can perform and onus should not be placed upon the developer. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/HW4/1			We object to strategic sites being required to undertake an audit. This is work only the LEA can perform and onus should not be placed upon the developer. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/HW4/1			We object to strategic sites being required to undertake an audit. This is work only the LEA can perform and onus should not be placed upon the developer. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/HW4/1		Not Sound	We object to strategic sites being required to undertake an audit. This is work only the LEA can perform and onus should not be placed upon the developer. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW4 Childcare Provision

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID609/S/HW4/1			Council has failed to ensure balanced communities, and the plan has seen the evaporation of facilities. Playing fields should be protected by the local plan, as denuding the mainurban area of crucial green space is not acceptable as it will reinforce social exclusion.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/HW4/1			We object to strategic sites being required to undertake an audit. This is work only the LEA can perform and onus should not be placed upon the developer. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID378/Mod/HW4/1			Any Nnew strategic sites will be expected to provide new or expanded conduct an audit of existing childcare facilities as identified in Strategic Sites policies (Section 3)and their current capacity. If increased demand from new residents would be expected to exceed the existing capacity of facilities in the vicinity, additional facilities must be incorporated into the masterplanning of the sites and supported by developer contributions unless it can be demonstrated that this is not viable or deliverable.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID380/Mod/HW4/1			The wording of policies HW5 and HW6 is amended to allow flexibility for viability testing in appropriate circumstances.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/Mod/HW4/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/HW4/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW4 Childcare Provision

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/Mod/HW4/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/HW4/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/HW4/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW5 Healthcare Services

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/HW5/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID372/S/HW5/1		Not Sound	In terms of the provision of community benefits, such as those set out through policies HW2, HW3, HW4 and HW5, Gladman remind the Council that it is important for the evidence base for the Local Plan to properly assess the viability of all the policy requirements to ensure consistency with paragraphs 173 and 174 of the Framework. As the Council will be aware, plans need to be deliverable and sites should not be subject to such a scale of obligation and policy burdens that their ability to be developed viably is threatened. Therefore, the Council should assess the likely cumulative impacts on development in their area of all existing and proposed local standards and policies through a comprehensive and robust Viability Assessment to ensure that the cumulative impacts of these standards and policies do not put the implementation of the Plan at serious risk.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID378/S/HW5/1		Not Sound	It is not appropriate for the Plan to derogate the responsibility of assessing the community infrastructure of the City to individual applications. It is the responsibility of the Plan to assess the quality and capacity of infrastructure, and for it to Plan accordingly (paragraph 162 of the NPPF).	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/HW5/2		Not Sound	It is inappropriate to set policies in a Plan that are not supported by adequate, up to date and relevant evidence. There is presently no evidence base to support the infrastructure required by this Policy HW4, and it is, therefore, not justified.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID582/S/HW5Policy/1		Not Sound	We object to the requirement that a developer is required to undertake an assessment of accessibility and capacity at the application stage. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW5 Healthcare Services

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/S/HW5 (Policy)/1			We object to the requirement that a developer is required to undertake an assessment of accessibility and capacity at the application stage. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/HW5 (Policy)/1			We object to the requirement that a developer is required to undertake an assessment of accessibility and capacity at the application stage. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/HW5Policy/1		Not Sound	We object to the requirement that a developer is required to undertake an assessment of accessibility and capacity at the application stage. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/HW5Policy/1			Council has failed to ensure balanced communities, and the plan has seen the evaporation of facilities. Playing fields should be protected by the local plan, as denuding the mainurban area of crucial green space is not acceptable as it will reinforce social exclusion.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/HW5 (Policy)/1			We object to the requirement that a developer is required to undertake an assessment of accessibility and capacity at the application stage. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID378/Mod/HW5/1			The Council will support the provision of new or enhanced primary care services when there is an identified need.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW5 Healthcare Services

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/Mod/HW5/2			Improved, enlarged or additional primary healthcare facilities will be required as identified in Strategic Sites policies (Section 3) to support residential developments that place additional demands on services beyond their current capacity, in line with the National Planning Policy Framework. If increased demand from other developments is proven to exceed, the capacity of facilities in the vicinity of the site, on-site provision or Developer contributions will be required to support the increase in provision. An assessment of the accessibility and capacity of existing primary care services will be required at the application stage.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID582/Mod/HW5Policy/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/HW5 (Policy)/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/HW5 (Policy)/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/HW5Policy/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/HW5 (Policy)/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW6 Emergency Services

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/HW6/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/HW6/1		Not Sound	St1 has been left out though there is no other alternative provision for emergency services west of the city.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID318/S/HW6/1			Supports HW6.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID318/S/HW6/1			Supports GI6.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID378/S/HW6/1		Not Sound	Notable contradiction in the Policy, where it is suggested that this infrastructure is still to be determined in further consultation. As with other policies referred above, it is inappropriate to set policies in a Plan which are not supported by adequate, up to date and relevant evidence, and it is, therefore, not justified. It is, therefore, not positively prepared and inconsistent with national policy.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW6 Emergency Services

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/S/HW6/2		Not Sound	It is notable, however, that there is a discrepancy in the Policy, which requires additional “spoke” facilities at “ST15: Land West of Wigginton Road”. It is understood that this site reference should be ST14, and consequently should be modified. If the Policy is referring to ST15, LDP object to it, on the lack of evidence presently available for the needfor a spoke facility.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID582/S/HW6/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required. Additional spoke facilities is not an absolute and should be subject to dialogue with the Ambulance Service	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/HW6/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required. Additional spoke facilities is not an absolute and should be subject to dialogue with the Ambulance Service	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/HW6/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required. Additional spoke facilities is not an absolute and should be subject to dialogue with the Ambulance Service	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/HW6/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required. Additional spoke facilities is not an absolute and should be subject to dialogue with the Ambulance Service	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/HW6/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required. Additional spoke facilities is not an absolute and should be subject to dialogue with the Ambulance Service	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/HW6/1		Not Sound	St1 has been left out though there is no other alternative provision for emergency services west of the city.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW6 Emergency Services

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID378/Mod/HW6/ 1			The Council will support the development of new emergency service facilities, in appropriate locations that enable emergency service providers to meet necessary response times.Bullet point 4 - ST14 : Land West of Wigginton Road	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID582/Mod/HW6/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/HW6/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/HW6/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/HW6/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/HW6/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW7 Healthy Places

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/HW7/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID113/S/HW7/1		Not Sound	Clean air has a fundamental impact on every resident's health and is largely overlooked. The HIA evidence talks about air quality but suitable policies and actions do not seem to have been embraced in the plan.	Susan Rippon
SID318/S/HW7/1			Supports HW7.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/HW7/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID378/S/HW7/1		Not Sound	This draft Policy is concerned with delivering “healthy places” in residential schemes. It is suggested in the Policy that a statement is required that explains a range of design principles, and it is respectfully suggested that these matters are properly addressed through a Design & Access Statement, and do not require a separate statement.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/HW7/2		Not Sound	The Policy requires all new strategic sites to be supported by a health impact assessment (“HIA”), and whilst it is suggested that these should be “completed prior to the submission of a planning application”, it would be more appropriate for the HIA to be submitted with planning applications, which demonstrate how the scheme has taken account of the impacts (both through mitigation and compensation).	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW7 Healthy Places

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID380/S/HW7/1			Hungate (York) Regeneration Limited still considers that requiring all new strategic sites to undertake a HIA is an overly onerous requirement.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/S/HW7/2			Additionally, the insertion of the word 'new' into the policy is also imprecise as it is unclear as to which strategic sites this relates to e.g. all strategic allocations made through the Local Plan or only those sites (or even phases of sites) upon which development has not commenced upon adoption.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/S/HW7/1		Not Sound	We object to this policy requirement sites are selected on the grounds of being sustainable, the need for such an assessment is negated by the allocation.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/HW7/1			We object to this policy requirement sites are selected on the grounds of being sustainable, the need for such an assessment is negated by the allocation.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/HW7/1			We object to this policy requirement sites are selected on the grounds of being sustainable, the need for such an assessment is negated by the allocation.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/HW7/1		Not Sound	We object to this policy requirement sites are selected on the grounds of being sustainable, the need for such an assessment is negated by the allocation.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW7 Healthy Places

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID609/S/HW7/1			Council has failed to ensure balanced communities, and the plan has seen the evaporation of facilities. Playing fields should be protected by the local plan, as denuding the mainurban area of crucial green space is not acceptable as it will reinforce social exclusion.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/HW7/1			We object to this policy requirement sites are selected on the grounds of being sustainable, the need for such an assessment is negated by the allocation.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

### Proposed Modification

SID380/Mod/HW7/ 1			The requirement to complete a Health Impact Assessment prior to submission of a planning application on all new strategic sites incorporates flexibility to assess whether this is necessary on a site by site basis.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID380/Mod/HW7/ 2			New strategic sites are defined.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/Mod/HW7/ 1			Delete the policy.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/HW7/ 1			Delete the policy.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy HW7 Healthy Places

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/Mod/HW7/ 1			Delete the policy.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/HW7/ 1			Delete the policy.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/HW7/ 1			Delete the policy.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED1 University of York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID186/S/ED1/1	Sound		The Trust welcomes the promotion and protection of theatres along with other cultural and social facilities within the plan. In particular, that the plan seeks to resist the loss of facilities. We support the explicit reference made to theatres being acceptable in principle within the City Centre as defined, as well as within the University as ancillary uses to the academic function. We consider the plan to accord with the need to plan positively for cultural wellbeing as set out in the NPPF.	Theatres Trust
SID231/S/ED1/1	Not Sound		the costs of the university's rapid expansion in recent years have fallen disproportionately on local communities nearby, including Fulford, Heslington and Badger Hill. Issues such as pressures on local housing stock, levels of parking, and traffic congestion have arisen. Contains various amendments.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID318/S/ED1/1			Supports ED1.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

#### Proposed Modification

SID165/Mod/ED1/1			I consider that Policies ED1, ED2 and ED3 should be consolidated into one policy and its requirements reworded to reflect the requirements of the NPPF. It should include the following:1. Policy ED1 currently facilitates the development of conference facilities unrelated to the University on the campus site. No case has been made why such facilities are needed or justified. Such facilities could significantly intensify usage of the University site to the detriment of surrounding communities. In line with paragraph 23 of the NPPF, conference facilities unrelated to the University should be directed towards the City Centre	Richard Frost
------------------	--	--	---	---------------

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED1 University of York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID165/Mod/ED1/2			2. The statement on student housing in Policy ED1 should be clarified and significantly strengthened in line with the NPPF. Instead of simply “addressing” the need (which in plain English only means looking at and understanding the issue) the University should ‘meet’ the need arising from any future expansion of student numbers. Also there should be no ‘let-out clause’ about “economic prudence” in the provision of student housing. The University should mitigate the impacts of its development in the same way as other forms of development do, such as housing. The cost should not fall on nearby local communities in terms of worse living conditions. I recommend the following rewording: The University of York must demonstrate how the need will be met for any additional student housing which arises because of any future significant expansion of student numbers. Provision will be expected to be made on campus in the first instance but account can be taken of firm proposals by independent providers of bespoke student housing elsewhere in the City. In line with NPPF paragraph 154, this change would ensure that the policy provides a clear indication of “what will or will not be permitted”. The current wording does not.	Richard Frost
SID165/Mod/ED1/3			3. It is important to ensure that any proposals for development at the University do not significantly increase traffic and parking in and around Heslington. Any development should provide a clear plan to ensure that this is achieved, similar to the parking and traffic plans developed for the expansion of the University at Heslington East. It should also include an enforceable Travel Plan which actively promotes the use of more sustainable modes of transport. I suggest the following addition to the ED1: As part of any new significant proposals, the University shall enter into a Travel Plan with enforceable monitoring and delivery arrangements which discourages the use of the private car by staff, students and visitors and achieves a significant modal shift towards more sustainable means of transport. It should also provide proposals to deal with student parking in local areas (similar to ones develop for the expansion at Heslington East).	Richard Frost
SID365/Mod/ED1/1			Further Higher Education expansion must be matched by new purpose built 'on-campus' student accomodation. Strengthen H7 and ED1 to accomplish this.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID364/Mod/ED1/1			Further Higher Education expansion must be matched by new purpose built 'on-campus' student accomodation. Strengthen H7 and ED1 to accomplish this.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED2 Campus West

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/ED2/1	Not Sound		The Policy would enable existing buildings on this campus to simply be demolished and replaced which will result in considerable harm to the overall design concept underpinning the original University and loss of key elements which contribute to understanding and appreciation of its architectural and historic interest.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID231/S/ED2/1	Not Sound		the costs of the university's rapid expansion in recent years have fallen disproportionately on local communities nearby, including Fulford, Heslington and Badger Hill. Issues such as pressures on local housing stock, levels of parking, and traffic congestion have arisen. Contains various amendments.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID318/S/ED2/1			Supports ED2.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/ED2/1			Policy ED2 insert the following additional Criterion:-“Proposals for the redevelopment of existing buildings must be informed by an assessment of their architectural and historic interest and their contribution to the original campus design. Those buildings which are considered to be of architectural or historic interest should be retained and reused”.	Historic England - Ian Smith
------------------	--	--	--	------------------------------

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED3 Campus East

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID378/LC/ED3/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
-----------------	--------------------------	-----------------------	--	---

#### Soundness

SID118/S/ED3/1		Not Sound	Notwithstanding the caveats within the Planning Principles regarding P68the limits on the development footprint of any new development and for an “appropriately landscaped buffer between the site and the A64”, this proposal could harm two elements which contribute to the special character of the historic City. Firstly, this area is prominent in views from the A64. it is by no means certain that the requirement for an “appropriately landscaped buffer” between the site and the A64, will not, itself, further harm the openness of the Green Belt in this location. Secondly, the expansion of the university towards the ring road could also harm the relationship which the historic city of York has to the surrounding villages The expansion of the University would effectively reduce the gapbetween the edge of the built-up area of the City and the proposed new settlement at Elvington Lane (Site ST15) to 1.6km.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID231/S/ED3/1		Not Sound	the costs of the university's rapid expansion in recent years have fallen disproportionately on local communities nearby, including Fulford, Heslington and Badger Hill. Issues such as pressures on local housing stock, levels of parking, and traffic congestion have arisen. Contains various amendments.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID318/S/ED3/1			Supports ED3.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID378/S/ED3/1		Not Sound	LDP do not object to this expansion, so long as it can be proven that it does not cause any undue impact on the existing environment and infrastructure, and where it does, that it can be adequately accommodated through mitigation. Most notably, LDP respectfully request that the Policy recognises the synergies that can be achieved in terms of access, public transport, waste and energies, to the Eastern Campus in the same way as allocation ST27 (see Appendix 13).	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

#### Proposed Modification

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED3 Campus East

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/Mod/ED3/1			The future expansion of the University should be restricted to within the Campus East and consideration should be given to the expansion of the university in a northerly direction onto Site ST4 instead.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID378/Mod/ED3/1			ST27 must create an appropriately landscaped buffer between development and the A64 in order to mitigate heritage impacts in terms of the historic character and setting of the city and to maintain key views. A development brief will be prepared for ST27, covering site considerations, including landscaping, design, local amenity, accessibility and transport requirements (including opportunities to exploit public and private transport synergies with ST15).	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED4 York St. John University Lord Mayor's Walk Campus

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/ED4/1	Sound		Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/ED4/1			Supports ED4.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy ED6 Preschool, Primary and Secondary Education

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID76/S/ED6/2		Not Sound	Not enough consideration is made to school provision, investment in the local schools must be made before this plan is justified	Richard Horner
SID148/S/ED6/1		Not Sound	The Plan does not include sufficiently strict criteria on the infrastructure requirements, in particular on schooling and road infrastructure. A development of nearly 800 new builds, even in stages, will add hundreds of new primary agechildren to the area. However the Plan then includes deliberate vagueness as to what developers can do to deal with that obvious issue. There is a naïve certainty in the sentence “expansion would be possible with the required financial contributions”. The vagueness here in the Plan clearly allows developers to move a long way down their plans before even considering funding an additional primary school as part of the development. Existinglocal schools will become over-crowded before a new school is started.	Daniel Dickinson
SID318/S/ED6/1			Supports ED6.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/ED6/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID582/S/ED6/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED6 Preschool, Primary and Secondary Education

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/S/ED6/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/ED6/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/ED6/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/ED6/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID148/Mod/ED6/1			There should be a clear requirement that developers have to model projected additional primary age school children in the area arising from the proposed phases of development. If the models show unacceptable additional numbers of school age children, then plans must be instigated to have new schooling funded by developers ready BEFORE existing local schools become over-crowded.	Daniel Dickinson
SID423/Mod/ED6/1			Picking up from schools is causing high congestion. Work should be done to minimise journeys and focus on walking and cycling. Houses should be provided in areas of exiting housing so buses are able to cope with additional demand.	NDM 6

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED6 Preschool, Primary and Secondary Education

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/Mod/ED6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/ED6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/ED6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/ED6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/ED6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED7 York College and Askham Bryan College

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID318/S/ED7/1			Supports ED7.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID582/S/ED7/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/ED7/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/ED7/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/ED7/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED7 York College and Askham Bryan College

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID613/S/ED7/1		Sound	Support for the wording of policy ED7; we welcome recognition within the Plan of contribution Askham Bryan College makes to economic growth, addressing imbalances in the demographics of the district, and creating a quality educational offer within York.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Askham Bryan College
SID848/S/ED7/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID582/Mod/ED7/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/ED7/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/ED7/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/ED7/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

Policy ED7 York College and Askham Bryan College

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/Mod/ED7/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED8 Community Access to Sports and Cultural Facilities on Education Sites

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID318/S/ED8/1			Supports ED8.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID582/S/ED8/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/ED8/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/ED8/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/ED8/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/ED8/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ED8 Community Access to Sports and Cultural Facilities on Education Sites

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID582/Mod/ED8/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/ED8/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/ED8/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/ED8/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/ED8/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D1 Placemaking

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID378/LC/D1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
----------------	--------------------------	-----------------------	--	---

#### Soundness

SID118/S/D1/1			Subject to a small modification to criterion iv, first bullet, , we support this Policy. Particularly welcome the requirement that development proposals that fail to take account of York's special qualities, fail to make a positive design contribution to the city, or cause damage to the character and quality of an area will be refused.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID339/S/D1/1		Not Sound	The Council seek to ensure through Policy D1 that developments “enhance York's special qualities and better reveal the significances of the historic environment ” however, those areas which fall outside of Conservation Areas should not be subject to such stringent policy. Notwithstanding this... our Client will endeavour to ensure that future proposals are built out to a high standard. The Council must acknowledge that the aspirations of the policy should be subject to deliverability and viability. Without the addition of this caveat, our Client objects to the policy as drafted, as it fails to meet the tests of soundness set out in paragraph 182 of the NPPF.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID345/S/D1/1		Sound	Approach sound but potential overlap with and linkage to policy H2 re: density and massing.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID378/S/D1/1		Not Sound	The Policy requires developments to be refused where they fail to take account of the City's special qualities or fail to make a positive design contribution to the City, or cause any damage to its character and quality. This aspect of the Policy is contrary to the general principles of planning that any adverse harm should be assessed against any wider benefits (see paragraph 14 of the NPPF). The Policy should be modified to recognise the appropriate planning balance where, harm is assessed against a proposal's benefits.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D1 Placemaking

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID825/S/D1/1		Not Sound	Para 8.8 makes reference to the CYC Streetscape Strategy and Guidance (approved 2014) and for development proposals to support the principles set out in the guidance. This document is worthy of praise in terms of format and intent and deserves stronger recognition in the Plan. Unfortunately, many of the aspects of the guidance are ignored by CYC - fail to see how it can be expected that private developers should be expected to adhere to it when CYC doesn't. Consequently, inclusion of the guidance would be regarded as unsound. The Plan has not been positively prepared to make the inclusion of this guidance effective.	Osbaldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association

### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/D1/1			Policy D1, Criterion iv, first bullet - It is unlikely that any development would “challenge ... the city centre roofscape”. Consequently, this bullet-point would benefit from a small amendment Policy D1, Criterion iv, first bullet-point amend to read:- “.. the Minster or harm the city centre roofscape”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID378/Mod/D1/1			Development proposals will be supported where they improve poor existing urban and natural environments, enhance York’s special qualities and better reveal the significances of the historic environment. Development proposals that fail to take account of York’s special qualities, fail to make positive design contribution to the city, or cause damage to the character and quality of an area will usually be refused.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID825/MOD/D1/1			Suggest the City of York Streetscape Strategy and Guidance is included in the Plan appropriately highlighted as: 'The document that guides the City of York Council along with utility companies, developers, Parish Councils and other interested parties as to the preferred methods of construction and maintenance of all aspects of the public realm in the City of York Council area. As such, the guide is intended to be followed closely and incorporated into any developments requiring new infrastructure or affecting existing infrastructure. The guide is intended to maintain standards across all areas of public realm in York and any deviation from the guide will be subject to rigorous justification and only permitted in exceptional circumstances.'	Osbaldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D2 Landscape and Setting

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/D2/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/D2/1			Supports D2.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/D2/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID582/S/D2/1		Not Sound	Policy D2 makes reference to the most up to date York Landscape Character Appraisal. We have been unable to locate this document.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/D2/1			Policy D2 makes reference to the most up to date York Landscape Character Appraisal. We have been unable to locate this document.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/D2/1			Policy D2 makes reference to the most up to date York Landscape Character Appraisal. We have been unable to locate this document.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D2 Landscape and Setting

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/S/D2/1		Not Sound	Policy D2 makes reference to the most up to date York Landscape Character Appraisal. We have been unable to locate this document.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/D2/1			Policy D2 makes reference to the most up to date York Landscape Character Appraisal. We have been unable to locate this document.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

### Proposed Modification

SID103/Mod/D1/1			The leading principles [8.1 – 8.5] should be rephrased to more explicitly stress a sound commitment to conserve and enhance the outstanding built heritage of the city. This could be better achieved by making reference to the value of the Central Historic Core Conservation Area to the culture and economy of the city, as well as Village Design Statements [in 8.3]; by noting the wealth of Designated Assets.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID372/Mod/D2/1			Gladman suggest that Policy D2 would benefit from some minor wording revisions to ensure that it is fully compliant with the Framework. Impact on the landscape is one factor that should be considered by the decision maker when determining any planning proposal and ultimately, it is a balance of the harm of development against the benefits. It is only where the harm significantly and demonstrably outweighs the benefits should planning permission be refused. Clause (ix) of Policy D2 sets out that proposals should “avoid any adverse impact on intrinsically dark skies and landscapes, townscapes and or habitats that are sensitive to light pollution...” Whilst this is accepted, it should be recognised that any adverse impacts that a proposal has on these issues should be factored into the planning balance when making a decision.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID582/Mod/D2/1			CYC to provide Landscape Character Appraisal Report into Evidence Base documents.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/D2/1			CYC to provide Landscape Character Appraisal Report into Evidence Base documents.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D2 Landscape and Setting

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/Mod/D2/1			CYC to provide Landscape Character Appraisal Report into Evidence Base documents.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/D2/1			CYC to provide Landscape Character Appraisal Report into Evidence Base documents.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/D2/1			CYC to provide Landscape Character Appraisal Report into Evidence Base documents.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D3 Cultural Provision

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/D3/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID186/S/D3/1		Sound	The Trust welcomes the promotion and protection of theatres along with other cultural and social facilities within the plan. In particular, that the plan seeks to resist the loss of facilities. We support the explicit reference made to theatres being acceptable in principle within the City Centre as defined, as well as within the University as ancillary uses to the academic function. We consider the plan to accord with the need to plan positively for cultural wellbeing as set out in the NPPF.	Theatres Trust
SID318/S/D3/1			Supports D3.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID355/S/D3/1		Sound	With regard to the tourist, culture and leisure policies referred to in our previous representations (Policies DP2, EC4 and D3), we are pleased to see that our proposed alterations to the policies have been incorporated into the Publication Draft Local Plan. On this basis, we support these Local Plan policies, consider the Plan sound insofar as it relates to the these policies and request that these policies are adopted in their proposed form.	National Railway Museum - Judith McNicol
SID378/S/D3/1		Not Sound	The Policy requires all assessments to be supported by a "Cultural Well-being Plan" ("CWP"). It is noteworthy that such plans are not defined in the Policy, and these are deferred to a definition to be outlined in a future SPD. As there is no planning definition of a CWP, it will be important for the SPD to be prepared and adopted alongside the Local Plan. LDP do not object to provision of a CWP so long as it is proportionate and commensurate with the implications of the development. We reserve the right to comment further should the SPD be drafted prior to the Examination.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D3 Cultural Provision

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/D3/1		Not Sound	We object to the request that strategic sites will need to demonstrate that future cultural provision has been considered and provide a Cultural Wellbeing Plan. This is a task only the Council can perform.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/D3/1			We object to the request that strategic sites will need to demonstrate that future cultural provision has been considered and provide a Cultural Wellbeing Plan. This is a task only the Council can perform.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/D3/1			We object to the request that strategic sites will need to demonstrate that future cultural provision has been considered and provide a Cultural Wellbeing Plan. This is a task only the Council can perform.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/D3/1		Not Sound	We object to the request that strategic sites will need to demonstrate that future cultural provision has been considered and provide a Cultural Wellbeing Plan. This is a task only the Council can perform.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/D3/1			We object to the request that strategic sites will need to demonstrate that future cultural provision has been considered and provide a Cultural Wellbeing Plan. This is a task only the Council can perform.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D4 Conservation Areas

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/D4/1		Sound	Subject to the changes suggested for criterion i, ii, iii, and Third para, Historic England support this Policy. In its City Centre Conservation Area York has one of the country's most distinctive Conservation Areas and which provides the setting for some very significant historic assets. It is essential that the plan sets out a robust Policy framework for the management of this area and the other Conservation Areas across the City.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID339/S/D4/1		Not Sound	Our Client objects to the contents of part i. of the policy, as it fails to accord with national planning policy, and as such is unsound. The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 only requires development within Conservation Areas to "preserve or enhance" the heritage asset. The policy is therefore unsound as current drafted and fails to meet the tests at paragraph 182 of the NPPF.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID345/S/D4/1		Sound	Approach sound.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID372/S/D4/1		Sound	Gladman note that changes have been made to these heritage policies since the previous iteration of the CYLP. Gladman are supportive of these changes as the new policy text included within the policies better aligns with the Framework. Specifically, Policies D4 and D5 now refer to the test to be applied for proposals impacting on designated heritage assets. The Framework (paragraphs 132-134) states that if the harm to a heritage asset is deemed to be substantial then the proposal would need to achieve substantial public benefits to outweigh that harm. If the harm is less than substantial then the harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball

### Proposed Modification

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D4 Conservation Areas

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID103/Mod/D5/1			Policies D4, D5 and D7 should be rephrased in order to be more prescriptive about not causing harm. The NPPF paragraphs 133 should act as suitable guidance on such rephrasing towards protection and opposing substantial (NPPF, para.133) and less than substantial harm (NPPF, para.134) of designated assets (NPPF, para. 133-34, 136, and non-designated assets (NPPF, para. 135-36). In the absence of a revised Local Heritage List Supplementary Planning Document (referred to in para 8.38) for the 2018 draft Local Plan, which would otherwise need to be published in advance of the Examination in Public for its implications on Policies D4, D5, D7 to be fully assessed, the use of the standards specified in the Consultation Draft Local Heritage List Supplementary Planning Document (June 2013; notably para 4.5) would offer a more positive strategy to protect non-heritage assets in Policy D7. In addition, for reasons of shoring up the soundness of the document, in Policy D5.ii, ‘...help secure a sustainable future for a building at risk...’ should be rephrased as: ‘...help secure a sustainable future for ALL LISTED BUILDINGS, ESPECIALLY ANY building at risk...’	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID118/MOD/D4/1			This Criterion needs amending to be consistent with primary legislation and to make its intentions more clear. Policy D4, firstParagraph, replace Criteria i with the following:-“i. are designed to preserve or enhance those elements which contribute to the character or appearance of the Conservation Area ii would enhance or better reveal its significance or would help secure a sustainable future for a building at risk“	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/D4/2			As the City Centre Conservation Area Appraisal notes, views across the City are one of the most important yet fragile components of the City’s historic townscape. Policy D4, firstParagraph, Criteria ii amend to read:-“safeguard the Key Views identified in the York Historic Core Conservation Area Appraisal and other local views“	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/D4/3			This Criterion is not about decisionmaking but, rather, the information that needs to be submitted in support of any application affecting a Conservation Area. As such it would be better taken out of this first part of the Policy and included later on. Policy D4, first Paragraph, delete Criterion iii and insert the following at the end of the Policy:-“Applications should be accompanied by an appropriate evidence-based assessment of the conservation area’s special qualities, proportionate to the size and impact of the development and sufficient to ensure that impacts of the proposals are clearly understood”.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/D4/4			As worded, this Criterion would allow a change of use even if it caused harm to the significance of a Conservation Area. Policy D4, third Paragraph amend to read:-“Changes of use will be supported where it has been demonstrated that the original use of the building is no longerviable or appropriate and where the proposed new use would not harm the significance of the area”.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID345/MOD/D4/1			More clarity should be provided to define the level of detail required at outline planning application (OPA) stage, for sites within or adjacent to conservation areas, in terms of “full design details” required.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D5 Listed Buildings

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

### Soundness

SID103/S/D5/1	Not Sound		<p>In its current draft form the Local Plan has inconsistencies and omissions with regard to its provision for the historic environment that make it unsound. Under the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2015, notice of applications for listed building consent and of the decisions taken by local planning authorities on those applications must be given to Historic England and the six National amenity Societies as part of their statutory role in the planning process. For legal purposes, and in order to be considered sound, the draft Local Plan needs to be accurate and consistent. Whereas advice is given [8.40] on the need for Historic England’s consultation on development affecting Historic Parks and Gardens, there is no inclusion of Historic England’s role in similar proposals affecting Listed Buildings [Policy D5]. Elsewhere, Historic England is either omitted or incorrectly associated as English Heritage in the ‘delivery’ sections of Policies D1, D4, D5, D8, D9, D10, and para.8.24, as is The Gardens Trust in Policy D8. Indeed, the soundness of the draft Local Plan is questioned by several confused mentions of English Heritage instead of Historic England [D1; 8.24; D8; D10]. Since 1 April 2015, Historic England and English Heritage have been separate bodies with very different cultural and statutory roles in the planning process and the protection of national heritage assets.</p>	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID345/S/D5/1	Sound		Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID372/S/D5/1	Sound		Gladman note that changes have been made to these heritage policies since the previous iteration of the CYLP. Gladman are supportive of these changes as the new policy text included within the policies better aligns with the Framework. Specifically, Policies D4 and D5 now refer to the test to be applied for proposals impacting on designated heritage assets. The Framework (paragraphs 132-134) states that if the harm to a heritage asset is deemed to be substantial then the proposal would need to achieve substantial public benefits to outweigh that harm. If the harm is less than substantial then the harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball

### Proposed Modification

SID103/Mod/D5/2			<p>Policy D5 should be redrafted to include reference to Historic England and The National Amenity Societies as statutory consultees for development proposals affecting the alteration or demolition of Listed Buildings of any grade. Furthermore, Paragraph 8.40 should be corrected to refer to The Gardens Trust rather than The Garden History Society which it is no longer called. The ‘Delivery’ parts of Policies D4; D5; D9 should be redrafted to include reference to Historic England as one of the key partners; likewise, The Gardens Trust to be included in the ‘Delivery’ part of Policy D8. Policies D1; D8; D10, and para 8.24 are to be corrected by making reference to Historic England rather than English Heritage.</p>	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
-----------------	--	--	---	---------------------------------

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy D5 Listed Buildings

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/Mod/D5/1		Sound	This Criterion is not about decisionmaking but, rather, the information that needs to be submitted in support of any application affecting a Conservation Area. As such it would be better taken out of this first part of the Policy and included later on. Policy D5, first Paragraph, delete Criterion iii and insert the following at the end of the Policy:-“Applications should be accompanied by an appropriate evidence-based heritage statement assessing the significance of the building”.	Historic England - Ian Smith

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D6 Archaeology

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/D6/1			Policy D6 does not differentiate sufficiently between the approach that will be taken to Scheduled Monuments and other nationally-important archaeological sites compared to archaeological remains of less than national importance. The 1990 York Development and Archaeology Study by Ove Arup P101Report was updated recently. This Paragraph may need reviewing and updating to better reflect that review. If necessary, this should also be reflected in Policy D6	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/D6/1			Supports D6.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/D6/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID372/S/D6/1		Sound	Gladman note that changes have been made to these heritage policies since the previous iteration of the CYLP. Gladman are supportive of these changes as the new policy text included within the policies better aligns with the Framework. Specifically, Policies D4 and D5 now refer to the test to be applied for proposals impacting on designated heritage assets. The Framework (paragraphs 132-134) states that if the harm to a heritage asset is deemed to be substantial then the proposal would need to achieve substantial public benefits to outweigh that harm. If the harm is less than substantial then the harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball

### Proposed Modification

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D6 Archaeology

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/Mod/D6/1			<p>The Policy does not differentiate sufficiently between the approach that will be taken to Scheduled Monuments and other nationally-important archaeological sites compared to archaeological remains of less than national importance. Delete Criterion vi and add the following additional Paragraphs to the end of the Policy:-“Harm to an element which contributes to the significance of a Scheduled Monument or other nationally important remains will be permitted only where this is outweighed by the public benefits of the proposal. Substantial harm or total loss of a Scheduled Monument or other nationally important remains will be permitted only where it can be demonstrated that the proposal would bring substantial public benefits. Harm to archaeological remains of less than national importance will only be permitted where the benefits of the development outweigh the harm having regard to the scale of the harm and the significance of the archaeology. In those cases where development affecting an archaeological site is acceptable in principle, detailed mitigation measures will need to be agreed with the City of York Council that include, where appropriate, provision for deposit monitoring, investigation, recording, analysis, archive deposition and community involvement”.</p>	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/Mod/D6/2			<p>The 1990 York Development and Archaeology Study by Ove Arup Report was updated recently. This Paragraph may need reviewing and updating to better reflect that review. If necessary, this should also be reflected in Policy D6. Amend accordingly,</p>	Historic England - Ian Smith

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D7 The Significance of Non-Designated Heritage Assets

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID103/S/D7/1		Not Sound	The draft Local Plan is unsound as it is insufficiently robust or positively prepared in the conservation of our historic environment. In key sections on Conservation Areas, Listed Buildings and the significance of non-designated heritage assets (Policies D4; D5; D7), too much weight is given in favour of development rather than protection of the city's historic environment, leading to a proclivity to harm. For example: • Policy D4.iii: 'Development proposals within or affecting the setting of a conservation area will be supported where they: ... iii.) are accompanied by an appropriate evidence based assessment of the conservation area's special qualities, proportionate to the size and impact of the development and sufficient to ensure that impacts of the proposals are clearly understood'; • Policy D5: 'Proposals affecting a Listed Building or its setting will be supported where they...'; • Policy D7: 'Development proposals will be encouraged and supported where they are designed to sustain and enhance, the significance of York's historic environment, including non-designated heritage assets'. This is an insufficiently positive strategy for the conservation of York's historic environment, questioning the soundness of the Local Plan. This is particularly problematic in D7, where there is a noted absence of commitment from City of York Council to protect the city's non-designated heritage assets.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID118/S/D7/1			Whilst we fully support much of the thrust of this Policy it is rather confusing since although it is headed 'non-designated heritage assets' it also deals with the historic environment more widely (in the opening Paragraph) and designated heritage assets (in the final Paragraph). The final Paragraph would be more appropriately included within Policy D9	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID345/S/D7/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID372/S/D7/1		Sound	Gladman note that similar to the policies in relation to designated heritage assets, this policy in relation to non-designated heritage assets has been amended since the previous iteration of the CYLP. Again Gladman are supportive of these changes which highlight the test to be applied to proposals affecting non-designated heritage assets. The policy now outlines that "developments which would remove, harm or undermine the significance of such assets, or their contribution to character of place, will only be permitted where the benefits of the development outweigh the harm having regard to the scale of harm and significance of the heritage asset." Gladman are supportive of this revised wording which now better aligns with paragraph 135 of the NPPF which highlights the need for a balanced judgment to be made.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball

### Proposed Modification

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D7 The Significance of Non-Designated Heritage Assets

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/Mod/D7/1			<p>The Policy is rather confusing since although it is headed ‘non-designated heritage assets’ it also deals with the historic environment more widely (in the opening Paragraph) and designated heritage assets (in the final Paragraph). The final Paragraph would be more appropriate included within Policy D9. (a) Delete the first Paragraph and replace with:-“Development proposals affecting a non-designated heritage asset or its setting will be supported where they conserve those elements which contribute to its significance.(b) Delete the final Paragraph and move to Policy D9</p>	Historic England - Ian Smith



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D8 Historic Parks and Gardens

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/D8/1	Sound		Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/D8/1			Supports D8.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D9 City of York Historic Environment Record

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/D9/1	Sound		Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D10 York City Walls and St. Mary's Abbey Walls ('York Walls')

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/D10/1	Sound		Subject to the change in third para Historic England whole-heartedly support the inclusion of a Policy to manage change in the vicinity of the City Walls.	Historic England - Ian Smith
----------------	-------	--	--	------------------------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/D10/1			In order to ensure that there is no misunderstanding, this Criterion would benefit from a slight amendment. Policy D10, third Paragraph amend to read:-“Other development proposals adjacent to ...”	Historic England - Ian Smith
------------------	--	--	--	------------------------------

SID118/Mod/D10/2			This Criterion would benefit from a slight amendment to improve its clarity. Policy D10, third Paragraph, Criterion i amend to read:-“ ... the elements which contribute to their significance and the six principal characteristics of the City as identified in the 'Heritage Topic Paper'”	Historic England - Ian Smith
------------------	--	--	---	------------------------------

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D11 Extensions and Alterations to Existing Buildings

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/D11/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/D11/1			Supports D11.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D12 Shopfronts

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/D12/1	Sound		Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/D12/1			Supports D12.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D13 Advertisements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID9/LC/D13/1		Not Legally Compliant		BGSA
---------------	--	-----------------------	--	------

#### Soundness

SID9/S/D13/1		Not Sound	D13 is unlawful and over prescriptive. Second part of policy D13 (ii) and paragraph 8.60 remain partly wrong as they effectively introduce an assessment of "need". Whether premises trade at night is not a criterion on which decisions may be based, Local Authorities may not concern themselves with the "need" for any particular sign or advertisement based on hours of trade. Paragraphs 8.59 and 8.60 of the supporting text are overly prescriptive, selective and ultimately unnecessary. If the sign is assessed using the criteria in the policy itself then it will be found acceptable or not without need for any reference to whether it is of a type 'not supported'.	BGSA
SID118/S/D13/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/D13/1			Policy is UNSOUND as it does not include reference to "temporary advertising" specially in conservation.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

#### Proposed Modification

SID9/Mod/D13/1			Specific changes to text have been suggested in prior responses. Paragraphs 8.59 and 8.60 of the supporting text are overly prescriptive, selective and ultimately unnecessary. If the sign is assessed using the criteria in the policy itself then it will be found acceptable or not without need for any reference to whether it is of a type 'not supported'. It is suggested that all references to trading as part of the evening economy are removed.	BGSA
----------------	--	--	---	------

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy D14 Security Shutters

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/D14/1	Sound		Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/D14/1			Supports D14.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI1 Green Infrastructure

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/GI1/1		Not Sound	By removing the wording on the 2017 consultation to point the removal of the designation of site of special scientific interest in nature conservation will allow York Business Park to develop on such areas leading to loss of habitat.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID118/S/GI1/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID160/S/GI1/1		Sound	Support policy.	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE
SID271/S/GI1/1		Not Sound	GI1 refers to the role of common land, village greens etc.. In protecting and enhancing historic character and improving recreational benefits. An area of common land covered by this policy has been omitted from the policies map and is part of Peasholme Green hatched green on map provided in the rep. The area is public common land. As common land its fairground rights were still exercised during the 1950s.	Angela Wheatcroft
SID318/S/GI1/1			Supports GI1.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/GI1/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI1 Green Infrastructure

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/GI1/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/GI1/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/GI1/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/GI1/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/GI1/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/GI1/1		Not Sound	By removing the wording on the 2017 consultation to point the removal of the designation of site of special scientific interest in nature conservation will allow York Business Park to develop on such areas leading to loss of habitat.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID22/Mod/GI1/1			Though the Foss corridor is not specifically mentioned, does agree with policies on maintaining river water quality, improvements to biodiversity and preventing loss of SINC sites. Also, policy ENV4 makes no mention of flood water retention in the Foss corridor.	River Foss Society - John Millett

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI1 Green Infrastructure

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/Mod/GI1/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/GI1/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/GI1/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/GI1/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/GI1/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI2 Biodiversity and Access to Nature

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/GI2/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID381/LC/GI2/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Yorkshire Wildlife Trust - Sara Robin
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/GI2/1		Not Sound	Strengthening of statement is supported. Potential developers in and around York should be made aware of their responsibilities to enhance Green Infrastructure. Some developers put correct wording in plans but later apply for an alteration so they do not need to comply. This loophole in planning needs attention.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID318/S/GI2/1			Supports GI2.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/GI2/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID378/S/GI2/1		Not Sound	It is inappropriate for the objectives to be applied only “where appropriate”, and all development should be required to meet the nine objectives set out in the Policy.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy G12 Biodiversity and Access to Nature

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID381/S/G12/1		Not Sound	Point i of Policy G12 would be improved by including Local Nature Reserves (LNR) as although these are designated and recorded nationally the NPPF does not have specific mention of protecting these sites and York has a number of LNRs	Yorkshire Wildlife Trust - Sara Robin
SID582/S/G12/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/G12/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/G12/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/G12/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/G12/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/G12/1		Not Sound	Strengthening of statement is supported. Potential developers in and around York should be made aware of their responsibilities to enhance Green Infrastructure. Some developers put correct wording in plans but later apply for an alteration so they do not need to comply. This loophole in planning needs attention.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI2 Biodiversity and Access to Nature

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID218/Mod/GI2/1		Not Sound	SE55-05YK 'Poppleton Glassworks site suggestion. The site is approximately 0.65 hectares and is rectangular in shape and situated on the south of Great North Way within York Business Park. The site is classified as 'previously developed land' having originally been part of a glassworks site. Although all previous buildings have been cleared the site currently comprises semi-improved grassland, with patches of scrub, bordered by a combination of fencing, mounds and a ditch. Within the Development Control Local Plan (DCLP) the site is allocated as an employment site. Since the DCLP was adopted, the site was designated as a SINC in 2011, following a suite of ecological surveys being undertaken between 2008 and 2010 as part of the 'City of York Biodiversity Audit 2010'. A survey in 2017 confirmed that the site mainly supports rank neutral grassland, with no badgers, bats or newts. Nesting birds can be mitigated by allowing no works near them. Objects to site as a SINC, and mentions that the plan should use up to date evidence. Includes evidence paper.	JLL (Naomi Kellett ) OBO Industrial Property Investment Fund
SID378/Mod/GI2/1			In order to conserve and enhance York's biodiversity, any development should where appropriate	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID381/Mod/GI2/1			Change point i of Policy G12 to: "avoid loss or significant harm to Local Nature Reserves, Sites of Importance for Nature Conservation (SINCs), whether directly or indirectly. Where it can be demonstrated that there is a need for the development in that location and the benefit outweighs the loss or harm the impacts must be adequately mitigated against, or compensated for as a last resort"	Yorkshire Wildlife Trust - Sara Robin
SID383/Mod/GI2/1			NE broadly welcomes this policy but recommends that you consider including references to the protection afforded to internationally and nationally designated sites in line with paras 113 and 117 of the NPPF. Ensuring to distinguish between the hierarchy of sites and their commensurate protection. We note that the protection of designated sites is embedded across the plan as well as this policy and that the hierarchy of designated sites is applied in the policies and assessments. However we advise that for clarity, particularly around the treatment of windfall sites that this policy is updated. In relation to this we also recommend that you consider making specific to protected species and priority species in policy GI2 and that the policies map is updated to clearly distinguish between nationally and internationally designated sites.	Natural England - Merlin Ash

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI2 Biodiversity and Access to Nature

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/Mod/GI2/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/GI2/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/GI2/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/GI2/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/GI2/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI3 Green Infrastructure Network

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID24/S/GI3/1				Daphne Taylor
SID61/S/GI3/1		Not Sound	Green corridors are supported through new proposed development on the former British sugar site. This would be useful if ties to cycle paths and pedestrian access to the city centre.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID118/S/GI3/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/GI3/1			Supports GI3.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/GI3/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID582/S/GI3/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI3 Green Infrastructure Network

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/S/GI3/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/GI3/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/GI3/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/GI3/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/GI3/1		Not Sound	Green corridors are supported through new proposed development on the former British sugar site. This would be useful if ties to cycle paths and pedestrian access to the city centre.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID345/MOD/GI2/1			Note typographical error in criterion 4 “improve links”.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI3 Green Infrastructure Network

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/Mod/GI3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/GI3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/GI3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/GI3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/GI3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI4 Trees and Hedgerows

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/GI4/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/GI4/1			Supports GI4.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/GI4/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID582/S/GI4/1		Not Sound	Why is a developer contribution required to protect existing trees and hedgerows as suggested in the 'Delivery' explanatory text to this policy?	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/GI4/1			Why is a developer contribution required to protect existing trees and hedgerows as suggested in the 'Delivery' explanatory text to this policy?	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/GI4/1			Why is a developer contribution required to protect existing trees and hedgerows as suggested in the 'Delivery' explanatory text to this policy?	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI4 Trees and Hedgerows

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/S/GI4/1		Not Sound	Why is a developer contribution required to protect existing trees and hedgerows as suggested in the 'Delivery' explanatory text to this policy?	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/GI4/1			Why is a developer contribution required to protect existing trees and hedgerows as suggested in the 'Delivery' explanatory text to this policy?	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

### Proposed Modification

SID383/Mod/GI4/1			Natural England advises that you consider including protection for ancient woodland and veteran trees in policy GI4 Trees and Hedgerows. We advise that para 118 of the NPPF is clear that planning permission should be refused for development resulting in the loss or deterioration of irreplaceable habitats, including ancient woodland and the loss of aged or veteran trees found outside ancient woodland, unless the need for, and benefits of, the development in that location clearly outweigh the loss.	Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID582/Mod/GI4/1			Fails the test.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/GI4/1			Fails the test.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/GI4/1			Fails the test.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI4 Trees and Hedgerows

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/Mod/GI4/1			Fails the test.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/GI4/1			Fails the test.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy G15 Protection of Open Space and Playing Fields

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID341/LC/GI5/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Susan Beckwith
SID825/LC/GI5/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Osboldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/GI5/1		Not Sound	Supported with reference to any development proposed on ST2. Support should be given to replacing the plan for housing development with playing field development due to loss of playing fields.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID68/S/GI5/1			#5 Northfield Lane (Wheatlands Woodlands) - This representation is for the removal of the designation of Wheatlands Woodland as a Site of Local Interest for Nature Conservation and as an objection to the designation of the site as existing open space under Policy G15. No policy in the Draft Local Plan deals with the designation of land as a SLINC.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID68/S/GI5/2			#5 Northfield Lane (Wheatlands Woodlands) - The designation of the site as an SLI is not based in scientific evidence nor justifiable from an ecological perspective. The site resembles a commercial tree plantation and does not have any ecological characteristics which are of notable nature conservation value or interest, as confirmed in the Ecological Report. The site is not part of a green corridor or stray and does not perform any of the functions of an SLI as outlined in the Biodiversity Action Plan.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID68/S/GI5/3			#5 Northfield Lane (Wheatlands Woodlands) - Wheatlands Woodland is private land. There is no public access to the site nor is there any prospect the site will serve an open space function. Its serves no recreational purpose. There is no functional or planning justification for the designation of the site as existing open space.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI5 Protection of Open Space and Playing Fields

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID318/S/GI5/1			Supports GI5.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID341/S/GI5/1		Not Sound	No consistent with national policy. I am concerned about Clifford's Tower York. The Local Plan has already appropriated the piece of land where the proposed new Visitors Centre is due to be built. This piece of land was designated as Open Space and the Council are not allowed by law to appropriate such land without following due process and advertising that they are disposing of this land for development. "Local Government Act 1972 Section 123 (2A)". This should not be done until after the appeal of the planning approval and after the period of advertising to allow people to object.	Susan Beckwith
SID345/S/GI5/1		Sound	Approach sound, particularly with reference to existing open space on ST35 and ST36	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID348/S/GI5/1		Not Sound	I strongly object to the citing of a visitor centre next to Clifford's Tower which will intrude onto the mound. This land belongs partly to the city and as such should not be sold or given away without people of the city being fully informed and being given a chance to voice their objections. I also oppose it on aesthetic grounds and because it will potentially disturb archaeological remains.	Felicity Iredale
SID418/S/GI5/1		Not Sound	Objecting to use of 2014 Open Space and Green Infrastructure Report in the evidence base. This document did not address true accessibility of sporting provision in the PPG compliant manner of the 2008 Open Space Study. It defined another measure of accessibility but excluded the situation where a facility is not available because the landowner refuses access. It does not matter how close or how good sports facilities are if you are not allowed to use them. The result of this change in assessment measure was that Heslington went from a deficit of open space to a large surplus as the University of York campus was then included. It is clearly the case that if the public are prevented from accessing a facility it is not accessible and this is how the PPG17 compliant study assessed it in 2008.	Save Windmill Lane Playing Fields - Chris Wedgwood

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI5 Protection of Open Space and Playing Fields

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID418/S/GI5/2		Not Sound	Objecting to use of 2017 Open Space Green Infrastructure Report Update in evidence base. This document seeks to claim that the sporting catchment areas has changed because of a electoral boundary change. This is not so. The 2014 Open Space and Green Infrastructure report made clear these were based on the geography of the area. Whilst there has been some attempt to display data in a form that tallies with the ward boundaries the catchment areas are not determined by the ward boundary. The result of this is that the large surplus of inaccessible land at the university has been pushed over into Hull Road ward and reported as a large surplus of open space. This is particularly perverse as the 2014 report pointed out that Hull Road ward had a particular shortage due to rapid development taking place in recent years.	Save Windmill Lane Playing Fields - Chris Wedgwood
SID418/S/GI5/3		Not Sound	Object to the wording "in the area of benefit" NPPF s74 uses the words "in a suitable location" Policy GP7 of the Development Control Plan shows that in the local area a "suitable location" means "the immediate vicinity". 'Area of benefit' is open to very wide interpretation, has replaced the objective standard (a 15 minute walk away) established in the 2014 Open Space and Green infrastructure Report but has not provided any evidence as to why it should do so. Replacing within the area of benefit assumes a level of homogeneity in the benefit of the facility being located anywhere inside the area of benefit, but this is not necessarily so. 'Immediate vicinity' would be the correct measure of assessment for all groups which would be affected. City wide shortage of playing fields is resulting in people needing to travel further to find a facility to play at. This taken in conjunction with the wording of "area of benefit" will result in facilities being closed and replaced miles away in completely unsuitable locations (as assessed by any other reasonable measure). Also object to the wording: "This could be rectified through re-designation of any current surplus facilities in the area of benefit." This is ambiguous and adds nothing to the meaning of the policy, so should be removed. The policy is not based on robust evidence and is not consistent with national policy.	Save Windmill Lane Playing Fields - Chris Wedgwood
SID582/S/GI5/1		Not Sound	Why is a developer contribution required to protect existing pitches from development?	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/GI5/1			Why is a developer contribution required to protect existing pitches from development?	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI5 Protection of Open Space and Playing Fields

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/S/GI5/1			Why is a developer contribution required to protect existing pitches from development?	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/GI5/1		Not Sound	Why is a developer contribution required to protect existing pitches from development?	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/GI5/1			Council has failed to ensure balanced communities, and the plan has seen the evaporation of facilities. Playing fields should be protected by the local plan, as denuding the mainurban area of crucial green space is not acceptable as it will reinforce social exclusion.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/GI5/1			Why is a developer contribution required to protect existing pitches from development?	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/GI5/1		Not Sound	Supported with reference to any development proposed on ST2. Support should be given to replacing the plan for housing development with playing field development due to loss of playing fields.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID68/Mod/GI5/1			#5 Northfield Lane (Wheatlands Woodlands) - Remove the designation of Wheatlands Woodlands as a site for Local Interest for Nature Conservation and remove the site as existing open space.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID341/Mod/GI5/1			The piece of land proposed for the new Visitors Centre at Clifford's Tower should remain designated as Open Space.	Susan Beckwith
SID348/Mod/GI5/1			I suggest siting the visitor centre away from the mound.	Felicity Iredale



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI5 Protection of Open Space and Playing Fields

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/Mod/GI5/1			Fails the test.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/GI5/1			Fails the test.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/GI5/1			Fails the test.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/GI5/1			Fails the test.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/GI5/1			Fails the test.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI6 New Open Space Provision

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/GI6/1		Not Sound	Approval for the change in wording to this policy. Provision for open space should not be left to the developer alone but in consultation with the local communities.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/GI6/2		Not Sound	Check code) New Open Space. Only supported at new manor academy site and site adjacent to Poppleton junior tigers soccer field.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID264/S/GI6Policy/1			It is considered that the development of 735 dwellings would justify the provision of an extensive area of open space and that this open space would not just benefit the residents on the allocationbut also the wider community. The Developers do not object to the provision of open space on ST9. However, the Developers request a meeting with the Council to discuss the implications of policyGI6 and the relationship of OS9 to the delivery of ST9 and the capacity assessment undertaken. The Developers therefore reserve the right to question the soundness of policy GI6.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land, Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID318/S/GI6/1			Supports HW5.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID339/S/GI6/1		Not Sound	We have previously raised objections to the Council's proposals to incorporate new significant areas of open space adjacent to strategic sites ST7, ST8 and ST9. It is noted these proposals have been retained in the Publication version of the Plan and our Client therefore maintains their previous objections.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID372/S/GI6/1		Sound	Gladman note that Policy GI6 suggests that significant new open space has been identified in connection with the strategic sites, including SS16/ST31, as shown on the proposals map. Gladman agree with the wording in this policy outlining that the precise delineation and extent of new open space should be set through detailed masterplanning. In this regard, with reference to OS11, Gladman refer to the Framework Plan included as Appendix 1 to this submission. This Gladman believe balances development and site constraints with Open Space provision.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI6 New Open Space Provision

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID380/S/GI6/1			It has been previously suggested that the policy should be reworded to provide clarity on the open space requirements that will be sought through the inclusion of open space standards within the policy wording, as this is not evident from the current use of statements such as “the precise type of onsite provision required will depend on the size and location of the proposal”.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/S/GI6/1		Not Sound	We object to point ‘iii’ that requires further land beyond the allocated boundaries of strategic sites. There is no justification for this request.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/GI6/1			We object to point ‘iii’ that requires further land beyond the allocated boundaries of strategic sites. There is no justification for this request.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/GI6/1			We object to point ‘iii’ that requires further land beyond the allocated boundaries of strategic sites. There is no justification for this request.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/GI6/1		Not Sound	We object to point ‘iii’ that requires further land beyond the allocated boundaries of strategic sites. There is no justification for this request.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/GI6/1			We object to point ‘iii’ that requires further land beyond the allocated boundaries of strategic sites. There is no justification for this request.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/GI6/1		Not Sound	Approval for the change in wording to this policy. Provision for open space should not be left to the developer alone but in consultation with the local communities.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI6 New Open Space Provision

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID61/S/GI6/2		Not Sound	Check code) New Open Space. Only supported at new manor academy site and site adjacent to Poppleton junior tigers soccer field.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID345/MOD/GI6/1			DIO suggests that it would be prudent to insert the current standard for calculating recommended open space in new developments in the supporting text.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID380/Mod/GI6/1			Policy GI6 is reworded to provide clarity on the open space requirements that will be sought through the inclusion of open space standards within the policy wording, as this is not evident from the current use of statements such as “the precise type of onsite provision required will depend on the size and location ofthe proposal”.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID582/Mod/GI6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/GI6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/GI6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI6 New Open Space Provision

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/Mod/GI6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/GI6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### GI6 (OS1) OS1: Land North of Manor Church of England Academy

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/GI6/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID378/S/GI6/1		Not Sound	There is no evidence supporting the scale, or location of OS10, and there are demonstrable constraints in its delivery (land ownership, highway infrastructure required to serve ST15 and consequently no justification for it.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID378/Mod/GI6/1			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>OS10: New Area for Nature Conservation on land to the South of A64 in association with ST15Two new significant areas of open space have been identified as part of ST15. The area falls outside the ST15 allocation, but is intrinsically linked to it, as part of a biodiversity enhancement area. This area will have restricted public access.</li> </ul>	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI6 (Site OS10) OS10: New Area for Nature Conservation on land to the South of A64 in association with ST15

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID43/LC/GI6(OS10)/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Members of the NFU have not received adequate information so therefore lack the ability to comment fully on the proposed designation of land they farm as Openspace. Have asked the council what the implications of this are, specifically for the purpose of 'nature and conservation' but was told this will be dealt with at a later date through consultation. Another concern is the low level of engagement between land owners, developers and the Local Authority with tenant farmers. Farmers would have expected to have been approached by this stage of the process.	National Farmers Union North East - Andy Stephenson
----------------------	-------------------	-----------------------	---	---

#### Soundness

SID51/S/GI6/1		Not Sound	Proposal opens to possible loss of a further 500 acres of land. This would be in contradiction to paragraph 12 of the NPPF. Grazing of the Tilmire SSSI is seen as a important conservation management tool. There is a danger that the link between the buildings and the land at Tilmire farm Heslington and the SSSI could be broken, which would make the grazing difficult.It would be impossible to guarantee effective mitigation as ST15 is close to the Tilmore SSSI which is C.R.O.W at 2000 open access land and very sensitive to recreational disturbance. The suggested pedestrian cycle route along the common lane would lead to increased disturbance to the conservation area and add to visitor pressure on the Tillmire SSSI.The suggested pedestrian/cycle route is a bendy single track road. This would lead to conflict over existing users of the route and the population of the new development. Farm traffic could be disrupted. Concern over village becoming rat run. Suggests cycle track along proposed A64.	Richard Bramley
SID52/S/GI6/1		Not Sound	Goes against the NPPF. Road linkages will become blocked and are already at capacity. In close proximity to Tillmire SSSI. Due to where it is cited, the proposal will need an additional area for mitigation, OS10, an area larger than the proposed new town, covering 500 acres of green belt agricultural land. This is against para 112 of the NPPF. OS10 already has views of the Minster. No proof mitigation will compensate for pollution damage.Common Lane should be made suitable for existing traffic, pedestrians and cyclists by widening. To ensure protection of the Tilmire should remain as is protected by rural farmland. Fear that farming community will be wiped out with use of the agricultural land at ST15.	Pauline Bramley

#### Proposed Modification

SID43/Mod/GI6(OS10)1			Member of the NFU who currently farms the land designated as OS10 should have been aware of the implications of this designation before consultation so they could comment from an informed position. The designation as Openspace for the purposes of nature and conservation may allow them to continue current practices or it might not. Either way, the local authority should be proactively engaging all people likely to be impacted at an early stage of the consultation.	National Farmers Union North East - Andy Stephenson
SID52/Mod/GI6/1			Discourages these developments.	Pauline Bramley

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

GI6 (OS12) OS12: Land to the East of ST35

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID345/S/GI6/1	Not Sound		DIO objects to the proposed new significant area of open space “Land to the East of ST35”. DIO object to this blanket approach to open space provision being adopted on the Proposals Map without a clear evidence base justifying this mechanism as likely to be effective in meeting its objectives. In DIO’s view, the current masterplan for ST35 addresses the justification provided in the Plan. Question on what evidence this policy is based. See also comments on ST35 criterion 10 [SID345/S/SS19/10].	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GI7 Burial and Memorial Grounds

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID61/S/GI7/1	Not Sound		Support given to expansion of current burial grounds.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID318/S/GI7/1			Supports GI7.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID825/S/GI7/1	Not Sound		The Plan appears to neglect to identify suitable sites for burial grounds & as such, fails 3 of the tests of soundness. It was recently suggested to CYC by Osbaldwick PC, St Thomas Church and a willing landowner that a Green Belt area is set aside for Osbaldwick and Murton residents within the Local Plan (plan / proposal attached to rep). Approving ST7 without addressing this need would render the Plan unsound.	Osbaldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID61/S/GI7/1	Not Sound		Support given to expansion of current burial grounds.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

#### Proposed Modification

SID825/MOD/GI7/1			Identify site in Osbaldwick as a green burial ground (in policy and on Proposals map)	Osbaldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
------------------	--	--	---	--

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GB1 Development in the Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID342/LC/GB1/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	We find the Plan fails to be legally compliant with the application of the Green Belt section of the NPPF which will be expanded upon in the remainder of our consultation response.	Andy Bell
SID841/LC/GB1/1	Does not comply with DtC			Jennifer Hubbard Planning

#### Soundness

SID61/S/GB1/1		Not Sound	Lack of consideration in wording to this policy is an invitation for unmanaged development. Additional statement added to this policy is ambiguous as to who decides 'what is an improvement to the openness of the green belt'. Settlement lines that have been agreed to in consultations have been left out of the policy.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID118/S/GB1/1		Sound	HE support first para criterion iii. This will help to ensure that any development in the Green Beltsafeguards those elements which contribute to the special character and setting of the historic City.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/GB1/2		Not Sound	NPPF Paragraph 90 makes it clear that local transport infrastructure is only appropriate in a Green Belt "where it can demonstrate a requirement for a Green Belt location". There is nothing in the NPPF which indicates that Park and Ride Sites as a matter of course are appropriate developments in the Green Belt	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID122/S/GB1/1		Not Sound	The Racecourse is generally supportive of the spatial vision of the draft Local Plan and agrees that the Green Belt should be protected whilst taking a proportionate amount of land out of the Green Belt, and thus allowing for appropriate levels of growth to be supported by suitable infrastructure. We consider that the Green Belt designation and section 10 'Managing appropriate development in the Green Belt' is not consistent with the policies set out by the NPPF. Draft Local Plan Proposals Map; draft Policy GB1 - In principle, York Racecourse considers that the Green Belt designation is unduly restrictive. As set out above, the Racecourse is an important local venue with influencing reaching up to an international scale. Therefore, it is important that the Racecourse is able to continue to adapt to meet local and visitor expectations. Rep then goes into detail about failings of the current policy relating to the race course and NPPF.	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GB1 Development in the Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID153/S/GB1/1		Not Sound	policy fails in its stated aims of encouraging the development of renewable energy by not identifying sites that are suitable for renewable energy. The plan is not consistent with national policy, as it does not reflect the strong support for renewable energy contained in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF). Paragraph 94 of the NPPF states that local planning authorities should adopt proactive strategies to mitigate climate change.	York Community Energy - Kit Bennett
SID160/S/GB1/1		Sound	Support policy.	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE
SID165/S/GB1/1		Not Sound	This policy deviates significantly from that set out in the NPPF for Green Belt. As Green Belt is intended to be a national policy, such deviation should be avoided. In line with other local plans, I consider that the policy should simply cross-refer to the NPPF for details of the types of development that can be permitted. If not, the policy should follow more closely the format of paragraph 89 of the NPPF. In particular, it should not make reference to renewable energy schemes being potentially appropriate forms of development. The NPPF is clear (paragraph 91) that most such projects would comprise inappropriate developments. There are no special circumstances in York to justify a different view. Indeed, large renewable energy projects in the Green Belt have the potential to cause major damage to the setting and special character of the historic city.	Richard Frost
SID231/S/GB1/1		Not Sound	This policy deviates significantly from that set out in the NPPF for Green Belt. As Green Belt is intended to be a national policy, such deviation should be avoided. In line with other local plans, FPC considers that the policy should simply cross-refer to the NPPF for details of the types of development that can be permitted. If not, the policy should follow more closely the format of paragraph 89 of the NPPF.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID318/S/GB1/1			Supports GB1.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID329/S/GB1/1		Not Sound	Murton Parish Council reaffirms its support for Policies GB1, GB2 and GB3 recognising that their adoption will create a Green Belt for York that 'will provide a lasting framework to shape the future development of the city ...'	Alistair McFarlane

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy GB1 Development in the Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID351/S/GB1/1			We further support the identification of Park & Ride facilities as being appropriate in the green belt	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID371/S/GB1/1		Not Sound	This policy does not allow flexibility for sites located adjacent to settlements to come forward for market housing schemes. The review of the Green Belt has not taken into full consideration the extent of amendments that would need to made to allow for appropriate development sites to come forward.	Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Mr & Mrs Beckett
SID608/S/GB1/1		Not Sound	This policy does not allow flexibility for sites located adjacent to settlements to come forward for market housing schemes. The review of the Green Belt has not taken into full consideration the extent of amendments that would need to made to allow for appropriate development sites to come forward.	Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Messrs N Blacker & Son
SID841/S/GB1/1		Not Sound	Policy EC5 purports to support the rural economy. However, since most of the rural areas of York lie within the general extent of the green belt set by saved Regional Spatial Strategy policy, there is little or no opportunity under Policy GB1 as currently drafted for rural businesses which are not allied to agriculture or forestry to establish or expand The outcome of these policies taken together is that, other than agricultural or forestry development, development which is permitted development or which can show very special circumstances, all potential rural developments will need to seek locations beyond the outer edge of the green belt - that is, in neighbouring authorities. Policy GB1 should recognise the constraints which the green belt places on the aspirations and objectives of Policy EC5.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning
SID61/S/GB1/1		Not Sound	Lack of consideration in wording to this policy is an invitation for unmanaged development. Additional statement added to this policy is ambiguous as to who decides 'what is an improvement to the openness of the green belt'. Settlement lines that have been agreed to in consultations have been left out of the policy.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/GB1/1			Policy GB1, second Paragraph, tenth bullet-point amend to read:-“ .. including highways work and Park and Ride facilities which can demonstrate a requirement for a Green Belt location”	Historic England - Ian Smith
------------------	--	--	--	------------------------------

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GB1 Development in the Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID122/Mod/GB1/1			City of York Council should prepare a Green Belt review in support of their proposed alterations to the Green Belt boundary, in order to provide a robust baseline strategy for development requirements. We strongly propose that the main developed area of the Racecourse (as marked on the plan in Appendix A of rep), should be removed from the Green Belt designation within the City of York's emerging Local Plan. The removal of the 'Major Developed Sites' designation restricts the overall flexibility of the Racecourse to continue to adapt and remain competitive. Alternatively, a policy which continues to recognise the developed nature of the Racecourse, and as such provides flexibility as with the former GB10, should be included within the emerging Local Plan. This should be worded to offer certainty to the operational ability, and long-term sustainable success of the Racecourse as a locally, nationally and internationally important asset.	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse
SID153/Mod/GB1/1			These sites should then be added to the policies map. The support for community-led initiatives for renewable and low-carbon energy should be made clear, even where it falls outside areas being taken forward through neighbourhood planning.	York Community Energy - Kit Bennett
SID160/Mod/GB1/1			Should add to the first bullet point for purposes of clarification under the following heading "AND it is for one of the following purposes: • Buildings associated with existing agricultural enterprises or forestry activities;"	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE
SID371/Mod/GB1/1			The extent of the Green Belt should be altered to allow other sites to come forward where they are sustainable, such as the site our client has put forward at Rufforth.	Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Mr & Mrs Beckett
SID423/Mod/GB1/1		Not Sound	(York Pullman) Struggling with planning permission for sites at Strensall, Rufforth and Bilborough. Using these locations would reduce emissions.	NDM 6
SID841/Mod/GB1/1			Policy GB1 should include "other development that requires a rural location" – or similar wording	Jennifer Hubbard Planning

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GB2 Development in Settlements within the Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/GB2/1		Not Sound	Villages where there are clear settlement lines that have been established should not have these lines altered. Hedgerows and mature trees which help as a visual aid to these boundaries should be protected. Desk research alone will not give evidence.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID318/S/GB2/1			Supports GB2.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID329/S/GB2/1			Murton Parish Council reaffirms its support for Policies GB1, GB2 and GB3 recognising that their adoption will create a Green Belt for York that 'will provide a lasting framework to shape the future development of the city ...'	Alistair McFarlane
SID61/S/GB2/1		Not Sound	Villages where there are clear settlement lines that have been established should not have these lines altered. Hedgerows and mature trees which help as a visual aid to these boundaries should be protected. Desk research alone will not give evidence.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GB3 Reuse of Buildings

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID61/S/GB3/1		Not Sound	Point vii of this policy is incorrect. The settlement limit should be the limit of extension. The wording should reflect the need for consultation and consent before the settlement limit is altered. This is the case for GB4 (iii), There should be a clear policy related to redundant farm buildings as within villages they can provide historic evidence of the development of a settlement.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID318/S/GB3/1			Supports GB3.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID329/S/GB3/1			Murton Parish Council reaffirms its support for Policies GB1, GB2 and GB3 recognising that their adoption will create a Green Belt for York that 'will provide a lasting framework to shape the future development of the city ...'	Alistair McFarlane
SID841/S/GB3/1		Not Sound	There is no justification for Criterion (vii) of Policy GB3 which is inconsistent with national (NPPF) policy and does not reflect Class Q permitted development regulations which permit the conversion of agricultural buildings to dwellings – subject, of course, to criteria, but the criteria do not include close proximity to a settlement.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning
SID61/S/GB3/1		Not Sound	Point vii of this policy is incorrect. The settlement limit should be the limit of extension. The wording should reflect the need for consultation and consent before the settlement limit is altered. This is the case for GB4 (iii), There should be a clear policy related to redundant farm buildings as within villages they can provide historic evidence of the development of a settlement.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

#### Proposed Modification

SID841/Mod/GB3/1			Criterion (vii) of Policy GB3 should be deleted.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning
------------------	--	--	--	---------------------------

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy GB4 'Exception' Sites for Affordable Housing in the Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/GB4/1		Not Sound	Affordable housing should also be related to proximity to employment and public transport works.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID318/S/GB4/1			Supports GB4.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID418/S/GB4/1		Not Sound	All new buildings are inappropriate in the Green Belt unless they can be shown to fulfil one of the exemptions in NPPF 89/90. [See R (Timmins) v Gedling Borough Council & Westerleigh Group [2015] EWCA Civ 10] S89 allows for "limited affordable housing for local community needs". It does not make any other type of development acceptable. Policy GB4 puts forward a case that Market housing would be acceptable in the Green Belt in conjunction with affordable housing. The NPPF exception relates specifically only to affordable housing not to the full extent of any development which includes some affordable housing and some not affordable housing. Housing which is not "affordable housing" does not satisfy any exception in NPPF 89/90 and so must remain inappropriate development in the Green Belt. Any development which includes some affordable housing and some housing which is not affordable housing must include some inappropriate development in the Green Belt. Such development would constitute substantial harm.	Save Windmill Lane Playing Fields - Chris Wedgwood
SID61/S/GB4/1		Not Sound	Affordable housing should also be related to proximity to employment and public transport works.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC1 Renewable and Low Carbon Energy Generation and Storage

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/CC1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/CC1/1			Whilst we would broadly support the thrust of this Policy, applicants are required to do no more than “consider” the impact of any scheme upon the various elements set out in the seven Criteria of the Policy. In order to provide a framework to enable the decision-maker to determine how they ought to react to a development proposal, the wording of the sentence before the Criteria needs to be more positive.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID125/S/CC1/1		Not Sound	The Deregulation Act 2015 put in place the changes of the Housing Standards Review. An amendment to the Energy Act 2008 removed the ability of local authorities to require higher than Building Regulations energy efficiency standards for new homes. Before that local planning authorities across the country were putting forward a wide variety of energy efficiency requirements. Seeking to comply with these on a District by District basis was inefficient and expensive and therefore less effective for the UK. Hence the recent Government Act of Parliament.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID153/S/CC1/1		Not Sound	policy fails in its stated aims of encouraging the development of renewable energy by not identifying sites that are suitable for renewable energy. The plan is not consistent with national policy, as it does not reflect the strong support for renewable energy contained in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF). Paragraph 94 of the NPPF states that local planning authorities should adopt proactive strategies to mitigate climate change. "New buildings must achieve a reasonable reduction in carbon emissions of at least 28%" gives no clear indication of what this should be measured against. This should be clarified in order for this policy to be meaningful.	York Community Energy - Kit Bennett
SID255/S/CC1/1		Not Sound	The HBF is generally supportive of the use of low carbon and renewable energy, however, it is queried whether this policy is in line with the Government's intentions as set out in Fixing the Foundations and the Housing Standards Review, which specifically identified energy requirements for new housing development to be a matter solely for Building Regulations with no optional standards. It is considered that the requirements of this policy could have the potential to add costs to the delivery of housing development, and could have implications for the viability of sites. There are concerns that requirements such as these could lead to the non-delivery of homes.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC1 Renewable and Low Carbon Energy Generation and Storage

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID318/S/CC1/1			Supports CC1.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID339/S/CC1/1		Not Sound	The Policy states that new buildings must achieve a reasonable reduction in carbon emissions of at least 28% unless it can be demonstrated that this is not viable - this is controlled through building regulations and should not be imposed through planning policy. As such, the policy should be removed from the plan as it is not effective or justified and is unsound as the tests of paragraph 182 are not met.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID376/S/CC1/1		Not Sound	Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd object to the current wording of Policy CC1, as issues relating to energy efficiency are now solely the remit of Building Regulations as clearly stated by the Ministerial Statement on 25th March 2015. As such, the requirement to reduce carbon emissions by 28% will place unnecessary financial burdens on new developments. This requirement is unjustified and does not accord with national planning policy and is therefore unsound.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID378/S/CC1/1		Not Sound	This draft Policy requires new buildings to achieve reduction in carbon emissions, with a minimum required reduction of 28%, unless this is not viable. There is no evidence to support the 28% threshold being applied locally, and without it the Policy is unjustified.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID582/S/CC1/1		Not Sound	While we welcome the addition of reference to viability in this Policy since the Pre-Publication Draft, we object to this policy being applied to strategic housing sites. The Policy and supporting text is unclear as to whether or not this applies to major residential schemes.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/CC1/1			While we welcome the addition of reference to viability in this Policy since the Pre-Publication Draft, we object to this policy being applied to strategic housing sites. The Policy and supporting text is unclear as to whether or not this applies to major residential schemes.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC1 Renewable and Low Carbon Energy Generation and Storage

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/S/CC1/1			While we welcome the addition of reference to viability in this Policy since the Pre-Publication Draft, we object to this policy being applied to strategic housing sites. The Policy and supporting text is unclear as to whether or not this applies to major residential schemes.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/CC1/1		Not Sound	While we welcome the addition of reference to viability in this Policy since the Pre-Publication Draft, we object to this policy being applied to strategic housing sites. The Policy and supporting text is unclear as to whether or not this applies to major residential schemes.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/CC1/1			Should be working towards zero carbon at the earliest opportunity - is essential for all new developments. We strongly support policies CC1-3 as far as they go. Local renewable energy supply, including wind and solar, should be strongly supported. Should have a shift from carbon fuelled transport.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/CC1/1			While we welcome the addition of reference to viability in this Policy since the Pre-Publication Draft, we object to this policy being applied to strategic housing sites. The Policy and supporting text is unclear as to whether or not this applies to major residential schemes.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID118/Mod/CC1/1			In order to provide a framework to enable the decision-maker to determine how they ought to react to a development proposal, the wording of the sentence before the Criteria needs to be more positive. Policy CC1, third Paragraph amend to read:-  "Applications will be supported where they can demonstrate that they would not have an adverse impact upon.."	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID125/Mod/CC1/1			Policy CC1 should be amended as follows: New buildings must achieve a reasonable reduction in carbon emissions of at least 28% unless it can be demonstrated that this is not viable. This should be achieved through the provision of renewable and low carbon technologies in the locality of the development or through energy efficiency measures. Proposals for how this will be achieved and any viability issues should be set out in an energy statement. And: Strategic sites will be required to produce energy masterplans to ensure that the most appropriate low carbon, renewable and energy efficient technologies are deployed at each site, taking into account local factors and the specifics of the masterplans.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC1 Renewable and Low Carbon Energy Generation and Storage

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID153/Mod/CC1/1			remove the sentence "These maps are to encourage consideration of renewableenergy generation only" from paragraph 11.5, potentially replacing it with "These maps indicate areas that wouldreceive support for future development, subject to the landscape sensitivity analysis and the full planning process."These sites should then be added to the policies map.The support for community-led initiatives for renewable and low-carbon energy should be made clear, even where itfalls outside areas being taken forward through neighbourhood planning.	York Community Energy - Kit Bennett
SID255/Mod/CC1/1			Policy CC1 should be deleted in its entirety	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID372/Mod/CC1/1			Gladman remain unclear in relation to the evidence the Council are relying upon to support the requirement for a 28% reduction in carbon emissions proposed through Policy CC2. Gladman recommend the Council revisit this proposed policy requirement and ensure they have the necessary evidence to justify its inclusion in the CYLP, otherwise this requirement should be removed.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID376/Mod/CC1/1			Remove the first paragraph from the policy and the corresponding supporting text.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID378/Mod/CC1/1			New buildings must achieve a reasonable reduction in carbon emissions of at least [28%] unless it can be demonstrated that this is not viable. This should be achieved through the provision of renewable and low carbon technologies in the locality of the development or through energy efficiency measures. Proposals for how this will be achieved and any viability issues should be set out in an energy statement.- It is more appropriate for this paragraph to be included in Policy CC2.- the figure of 28% should be justified in the evidence.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID582/Mod/CC1/1			Doubt exists over the application of this policy. See Peter Brett Report para 5.4.7. The Carbon Trust Report still does not appear to be an evidence base report – it needs to be if the Council are to rely upon it.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC1 Renewable and Low Carbon Energy Generation and Storage

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/Mod/CC1/1			Doubt exists over the application of this policy. See Peter Brett Report para 5.4.7. The Carbon Trust Report still does not appear to be an evidence base report – it needs to be if the Council are to rely upon it.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/CC1/1			Doubt exists over the application of this policy. See Peter Brett Report para 5.4.7. The Carbon Trust Report still does not appear to be an evidence base report – it needs to be if the Council are to rely upon it.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/CC1/1			Doubt exists over the application of this policy. See Peter Brett Report para 5.4.7. The Carbon Trust Report still does not appear to be an evidence base report – it needs to be if the Council are to rely upon it.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/CC1/1			Doubt exists over the application of this policy. See Peter Brett Report para 5.4.7. The Carbon Trust Report still does not appear to be an evidence base report – it needs to be if the Council are to rely upon it.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC2 Sustainable Design and Construction of New Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/CC2/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID55/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	Whilst supportive of the need for the Plan to promote sustainable design and construction, the requirement to achieve BREEAM 'excellent' or equivalent is unduly restrictive and does not take into account viability or feasibility, particularly in light of BREEAM's updated methodology.	Indigo Planning (Andrew Astin) OBO Wyevale Garden Centres
SID118/S/CC2/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID119/S/CC2/1		Legally Compliant	We are pleased to see that you have incorporated our suggestion to add text regarding water efficiency into Policy CC2 and section 11.16.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID125/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	This policy requires new dwellings to achieve a 19% reduction in the dwelling emission rate. The explanation states: "The:• Deregulation Act 2015,• Ministerial statement following the Housing Standards Review, and• HM Treasury report Fixing the Foundations: Creating a More Prosperous Nation (2015)all directly affect Policy CC2 for housing. Currently the above measures mean councils in England can no longer demand energy efficiency improvements beyond the requirements of Building Regulations, require new homes to achieve zero carbon standards, implement 'allowable solutions', or ask for new housing to meet any level of the Code for Sustainable Homes (CfSH)." YLP fails to justify why York City should be treated differently to the rest of the UK.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID125/S/CC2/2		Not Sound	Building Regulations set a water consumption rate of 125 litres/person/day). Local planning authorities can set out policies requiring new dwellings to meet the tighter optional requirement of 110 litres/person/day, where there is a clear local need. The explanation of policy CC2 refers to the Humber River Basin District River Basin Management Plan (HBMP) to justify introducing 110 litres/day/person. It is not considered the HBMP provides the justification. More than 10.8 million people live and work in towns and cities within the Humber Basin District; the main urban centres being Birmingham, Leeds, Bradford, Sheffield, Hull and Grimsby. There is no specific reference to York City; no clear local need.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC2 Sustainable Design and Construction of New Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID255/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	All new homes already have to meet the mandatory national standard set out in the Building Regulations (of 125 litres/person/day	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID269/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	All strategic sites are stated that they must be of a high standard. This is welcomed as is the requirement for all of them to be master planned (policies SS6-SS17) This requirement appears to have been omitted for Policies SS18, SS19 SS20 but should be included. It would be beneficial to York if the ST Sites should be expected to consult with the Yorkshire & Humber design Review Panel (or Local Review panel) as it will ensure the best design possible is achieved. The listed ST sites tend to be in Green Belt - how they are developed is critical to ensure the setting and character of York is not harmed.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID318/S/CC2/1			Supports CC2.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID339/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	The Policy seeks to ensure that new developments incorporate high standards of sustainable design and construction, such as energy and carbon dioxide savings. Our Client objects to the standards which the Council are seeking to impose for new residential developments, namely part ii. of the policy, which states they should achieve “water consumption rate of 110 litres per person per day CurrentBuilding Regulations require all new dwellings to be restricted to a water consumption of 125 l/p/d, and our Client ensures that all of their core house types achieve this restriction. As such, what the Council are seeking to impose within this policy is below the national standards and is not considered to be justified.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID372/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	Policy CC2 outlines that all new residential buildings should achieve: I. At least a 19% reduction in dwelling emission rate compared to the target emission rate; II. A water consumption rate of 110 litres per person per day. Gladman reiterate previous concerns regarding the 19% reduction in dwelling emission rate and recommend that this should be removed from policy. Gladman also raise concerns regarding the proposed water consumption rate. In this regard Gladman refer to the PPG (ID:56-014-20150327) which states “Where there is a clear local need, local planning authorities can set out Local Plan policies requiring new dwellings to meet the tighter Building Regulations optional requirement of 110 litres/person/day.” The Council in paragraph 11.17 outline that the Environment Agency consider York to be an area of moderate stress for water. Therefore, Gladman are unclear whether there is sufficient justification for the inclusion of this optional technical standard.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC2 Sustainable Design and Construction of New Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID376/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd object to Policy CC2 as it is not justified nor is it consistent with national policy. As with Policy CC1, these matters are solely the remit of Building Regulations as set out in the Ministerial 25th Statement on March 2015. The proposed requirements will place additional unnecessary financial burdens on development and in view of the fact the Government has amended Building Regulations to include the applicable energy standards, the Council should not be imposing more onerous requirements on developments	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID378/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	This draft Policy is concerned with sustainable design and construction of new development, but unlike CC1 (and CC3 – see below) does not recognise feasibility or viability as a genuine planning consideration. As such, the Policy may stymie necessary development. LDP object to this Policy on this basis,	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID582/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	Sustainable Design and Construction 19% reduction We object to this requirement as it goes beyond building regulations without justification to introduce the optional standards.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/CC2/1			Sustainable Design and Construction 19% reduction We object to this requirement as it goes beyond building regulations without justification to introduce the optional standards.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/CC2/1			Sustainable Design and Construction 19% reduction We object to this requirement as it goes beyond building regulations without justification to introduce the optional standards.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	Sustainable Design and Construction 19% reduction We object to this requirement as it goes beyond building regulations without justification to introduce the optional standards.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC2 Sustainable Design and Construction of New Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID609/S/CC2/1			Should be working towards zero carbon at the earliest opportunity - is essential for all new developments. We strongly support policies CC1-3 as far as they go. Local renewable energy supply, including wind and solar, should be strongly supported. Should have a shift from carbon fuelled transport.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID611/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	Policy will not be effective as the requirement for all non-residential buildings over 100sqm to achieve BREEAM 'Excellent' detrimentally affects the viability and deliverability of sites. There is no justification to achieve such a high rating.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID614/S/CC2/1		Not Sound	Policy will not be effective as the requirement for all non-residential buildings over 100sqm to achieve BREEAM 'Excellent' detrimentally affects the viability and deliverability of sites. There is no justification to achieve such a high rating.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID848/S/CC2/1			Sustainable Design and Construction 19% reduction We object to this requirement as it goes beyond building regulations without justification to introduce the optional standards.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID55/Mod/CC2/1			Draft Policy CC2 should be reworded to include a greater degree of flexibility, including that considerations should be given to individual sites circumstances, viability and the cost associated with a requirement to deliver sustainable development in accordance with paragraph 173 of the NPPF.	Indigo Planning (Andrew Astin) OBO Wyevale Garden Centres
SID125/Mod/CC2/1			Policy CC2 should be amended by the deletion of sub-section i as follows:i. at least a 19% reduction in Dwelling Emission Rate compared to the Target Emission Rate (calculated using Standard Assessment Procedure methodology as per Part L1A of the Building Regulations 2013	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID125/Mod/CC2/2			YLP falls far short of establishing a clear local need and policy CC2 should be amended by the deletion of sub-section ii as follows: ii. a water consumption rate of 110 litres per person per day (calculated as per Part G of the Building Regulations).	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID255/Mod/CC2/1			Policy CC2 should be deleted in its entirety	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC2 Sustainable Design and Construction of New Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID269/Mod/CC2/1			All strategic sites are stated that they must be of a high standard. This is welcomed as is the requirement for all of them to be master planned (policies SS6-SS17) This requirement appears to have been omitted for Policies SS18, SS19 SS20 but should be included. It would be beneficial to York if the ST Sites should be expected to consult with the Yorkshire & Humber design Review Panel (or Local Review panel) as it will ensure the best design possible is achieved.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID372/Mod/CC2/1			Gladman recommend the Council revisit this policy and ensure that it has the necessary justification for the proposed requirements.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID376/Mod/CC2/1			In line with HBF response, TW would suggest that the following modifications are required to make the policy sound. Remove: All new residential buildings should achieve: i. at least a 19% reduction in Dwelling Emission Rate compared to the Target Emission Rate (calculated using Standard Assessment Procedure methodology as per Part L1A of the Building Regulations 2013); and ii. a water consumption rate of 110 litres per person per day (calculated as per Part G of the Building Regulations).	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID378/Mod/CC2/1			Developments which demonstrate high standards of sustainable design and construction will be encouraged. Development proposals will be required to demonstrate energy and carbon dioxide savings in accordance with the energy hierarchy and water efficiency, unless it can be demonstrated this is not feasible or viable. Development proposals will be expected to consider good practice adaptation principles for climate resilience in their design, construction and operation.- All new residential buildings should achieve, where feasible and viable:- All new non-residential buildings with a total internal floor area of 100m2 or greater should achieve BREEAM 'Excellent' (or equivalent), where feasible or viable.- Application for conversion of existing residential buildings or change of use to residential should achieve BREEAM domestic refurbishment 'very good' and non-residential conversions or change of use will need to achieve BREEAM 'excellent', where feasible or viable.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID582/Mod/CC2/1			Delete parts i and ii in relation to all new residential buildings.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/CC2/1			Delete parts i and ii in relation to all new residential buildings.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC2 Sustainable Design and Construction of New Development

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/Mod/CC2/1			Delete parts i and ii in relation to all new residential buildings.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/CC2/1			Delete parts i and ii in relation to all new residential buildings.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID611/Mod/CC2/1			Policy CC2 detrimentally affects the viability and deliverability of sites. There is no justification to achieve such a high BREEAM rating. The requirements need to be revised to achieve the 'Very Good' rating of BREEAM.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID614/Mod/CC2/1			Policy CC2 detrimentally affects the viability and deliverability of sites. There is no justification to achieve such a high BREEAM rating. The requirements need to be revised to achieve the 'Very Good' rating of BREEAM.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID848/Mod/CC2/1			Delete parts i and ii in relation to all new residential buildings.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC3 District Heating and Combined Heat and Power Networks

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID233/LC/CC3/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Green Party
-----------------	-------------------	-------------------	--	------------------

#### Soundness

SID233/S/CC3/1		Not Sound	York Central (ST5) meets the criteria for a heat network scheme. The district heating network should be installed alongside other essential utility infrastructure.	York Green Party
SID318/S/CC3/1			Supports CC3.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID351/S/CC3/1			Heat Priority Areas indicates areas where new development should be compliant with Policy CC3. That Policy appears to indicate that the YDO is within such a location. Figure 11.1 should be amended to remove that reference to the YDO.	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID372/S/CC3/1		Not Sound	Gladman reiterate concerns regarding Policy CC3. The requirements within this policy would constitute a significant development cost and may well impact on the overall viability of a scheme such that development may not come forward. Paragraph 173 and 174 of the Framework set out that plans should be deliverable and sites should not be subject to the scale of obligations and policy burdens that their ability to be developed viably is threatened. Therefore, he Council should assess the likely cumulative impacts on development in their area of all existing and proposed local standards and policies through a comprehensive and robust Viability Assessment to ensure that the cumulative impact of these standards and policies do not put the implementation of the Plan at serious risk.	Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID376/S/CC3/1		Not Sound	Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd object to Policy CC3 as it is not justified and therefore not sound as the Council have not considered whether the delivery of decentralised energy network are feasible on the proposed strategic allocation nor have they considered the financial cost of providing them and implications of this on the delivery of housing.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC3 District Heating and Combined Heat and Power Networks

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/CC3/1		Not Sound	We object to this policy. The insertion within the Policy text since the Pre-Publication Draft now refers to all 'New Strategic Sites.' Paragraph 11.33 remains unchanged and informs this policy applies to residential schemes in excess of 300 dwellings. This would cover all proposed Strategic Housing sites. We object on the basis that energy efficiencies are already sought under Policy CC2 and as demonstrated in Table 5.12 of the viability report the cost of Policy CC3 would be an extra £3,396 to a typical 3 bed house.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/CC3/1			We object to this policy. The insertion within the Policy text since the Pre-Publication Draft now refers to all 'New Strategic Sites.' Paragraph 11.33 remains unchanged and informs this policy applies to residential schemes in excess of 300 dwellings. This would cover all proposed Strategic Housing sites. We object on the basis that energy efficiencies are already sought under Policy CC2 and as demonstrated in Table 5.12 of the viability report the cost of Policy CC3 would be an extra £3,396 to a typical 3 bed house.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/CC3/1			We object to this policy. The insertion within the Policy text since the Pre-Publication Draft now refers to all 'New Strategic Sites.' Paragraph 11.33 remains unchanged and informs this policy applies to residential schemes in excess of 300 dwellings. This would cover all proposed Strategic Housing sites. We object on the basis that energy efficiencies are already sought under Policy CC2 and as demonstrated in Table 5.12 of the viability report the cost of Policy CC3 would be an extra £3,396 to a typical 3 bed house.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/CC3/1		Not Sound	We object to this policy. The insertion within the Policy text since the Pre-Publication Draft now refers to all 'New Strategic Sites.' Paragraph 11.33 remains unchanged and informs this policy applies to residential schemes in excess of 300 dwellings. This would cover all proposed Strategic Housing sites. We object on the basis that energy efficiencies are already sought under Policy CC2 and as demonstrated in Table 5.12 of the viability report the cost of Policy CC3 would be an extra £3,396 to a typical 3 bed house.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/CC3/1			Should be working towards zero carbon at the earliest opportunity - is essential for all new developments. We strongly support policies CC1-3 as far as they go. Local renewable energy supply, including wind and solar, should be strongly supported. Should have a shift from carbon fuelled transport.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/CC3/1			We object to this policy. The insertion within the Policy text since the Pre-Publication Draft now refers to all 'New Strategic Sites.' Paragraph 11.33 remains unchanged and informs this policy applies to residential schemes in excess of 300 dwellings. This would cover all proposed Strategic Housing sites. We object on the basis that energy efficiencies are already sought under Policy CC2 and as demonstrated in Table 5.12 of the viability report the cost of Policy CC3 would be an extra £3,396 to a typical 3 bed house.	Johnson Mowat OBO Avant Homes

Proposed Modification

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC3 District Heating and Combined Heat and Power Networks

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID233/Mod/CC3/1			'Low-carbon' and 'compliant with policy CC3' need to be added to the principles of development at York Central within Policy SS4.	York Green Party
SID351/Mod/CC3/1			Heat Priority Areas indicates areas where new development should be compliant with Policy CC3. That Policy appears to indicate that the YDO is within such a location. Figure 11.1 should be amended to remove that reference to the YDO.	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID376/Mod/CC3/1			Delete Policy	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID582/Mod/CC3/1			Remove reference to all New Strategic Sites from this policy and supporting text.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/CC3/1			Remove reference to all New Strategic Sites from this policy and supporting text.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/CC3/1			Remove reference to all New Strategic Sites from this policy and supporting text.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy CC3 District Heating and Combined Heat and Power Networks

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/Mod/CC3/1			Remove reference to all New Strategic Sites from this policy and supporting text.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/CC3/1			Remove reference to all New Strategic Sites from this policy and supporting text.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ENV1 Air Quality

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID233/LC/ENV1/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		York Green Party
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID24/S/ENV1/1		Not Sound	Plan is completely inadequate on air quality improvements, affordable housing and coordinated green spaces.	Daphne Taylor
SID157/S/ENV1/1			AIR QUALITY. There is no mention of an Air Quality Impact Assessment in regards to Haxby. Many people and organisations have commented on it. Haxby already has problems with congestion. There will be an estimated 20% more cars on village roads. Section 12 of the plan states 'A detailed emissions assessment and/or a full air quality impact assessment are likely to be required for major planning applications that: generate or increase traffic congestion'. Consideration of air quality should be included in the principles and delivery of developments at Haxby. Haxby is already at capacity.	Janet White
SID231/S/ENV1/1		Not Sound	Feels policy could be strengthened and suggests rewording.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID233/S/ENV1/1		Not Sound	While the policy rightly requires an impact assessment for local air quality, traffic from new developments will result in more diffuse but wider impact on air quality which is not addressed. ENV1 should be more explicitly cross referenced to policy T2 and T5 with a full assessment of potentially viable public transport links and walking and cycling links as the first preference to eliminating additional vehicle pollution.	York Green Party
SID243/S/ENV1/1		Not Sound	The plan is not effective and is unsound because it does not take into account the deterioration in air quality that will be caused by the additional traffic generated by the development.	Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID268/S/ENV1/1		Not Sound	Clean air is not just for children but for all - houses mean transport - transport does not bring clean air.	J Nicholson



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ENV1 Air Quality

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID318/S/ENV1/1			Supports ENV1.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/ENV1/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID582/S/ENV1/1		Not Sound	We object to the requirement for strategic sites to undertake a detailed emissions strategy. Each strategic site is identified, allocated and master planned in accordance with the policy requirements of the plan. To request an emissions strategy later down the line at application stage merely inserts an unnecessary layer of paperwork on a site that has already been examined and found to be suitably located.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/ENV1/1			We object to the requirement for strategic sites to undertake a detailed emissions strategy. Each strategic site is identified, allocated and masterplanned in accordance with the policy requirements of the plan. To request an emissions strategy later down the line at application stage merely inserts an unnecessary layer of paperwork on a site that has already been examined and found to be suitably located.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/ENV1/1			We object to the requirement for strategic sites to undertake a detailed emissions strategy. Each strategic site is identified, allocated and masterplanned in accordance with the policy requirements of the plan. To request an emissions strategy later down the line at application stage merely inserts an unnecessary layer of paperwork on a site that has already been examined and found to be suitably located.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/ENV1/1		Not Sound	We object to the requirement for strategic sites to undertake a detailed emissions strategy. Each strategic site is identified, allocated and master planned in accordance with the policy requirements of the plan. To request an emissions strategy later down the line at application stage merely inserts an unnecessary layer of paperwork on a site that has already been examined and found to be suitably located.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ENV1 Air Quality

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/S/ENV1/1			We object to the requirement for strategic sites to undertake a detailed emissions strategy. Each strategic site is identified, allocated and masterplanned in accordance with the policy requirements of the plan. To request an emissions strategy later down the line at application stage merely inserts an unnecessary layer of paperwork on a site that has already been examined and found to be suitably located.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

### Proposed Modification

SID24/Mod/ENV1/1			Too complex to answer here but in short the plan has no vision for the city. Needs to adopt more of the vision set out in The York Economic Vision document published in 2010. Of particular importance is improving air quality and reducing traffic congestion, something this plan does not do.	Daphne Taylor
SID157/Mod/ENV1/1			An Air Quality Impact Assessment should be carried out, particularly at peak times where the roads are already congested. This should then be considered taking into account the increase in pollution that will result with a larger number of vehicles, once a further 735 houses are built. (a 20% increase for Haxby)	Janet White
SID165/Mod/ENV1/1			I support the principle of this policy but feel it should be strengthened. Air quality is a major issue in York. I consider that the first part of the policy should be reworded as follows: Development will only be permitted if the impact on air quality is acceptable and mechanisms are put in place to mitigate fully any adverse impacts and prevent further exposure to poor air quality. Proposals which would worsen air quality in and around Air Quality Management Areas after mitigation, either individually or cumulatively, will not be allowed. This is in order to protect human health. This proposed change would reflect the priority given to AQMAs by the NPPG on Air Quality. At present the policy makes no reference to AQMAs.	Richard Frost
SID233/Mod/ENV1/1			1) Layout to provide attractive segregated direct routes for walking and cycling to local services and facilities2) Public transport routes more direct and convenient than access for private cars3) Limit provision for private car ensuring only electric cars and cycles incentivized in new developments4) For major commercial and leisure developments covered parking for cycles to be located closer than car parking provision. Bus shelters with real time display must also be provided on nearest bus route, within 400m of the site5) Junction improvements to include better crossing facilities for pedestrians and cyclists6) Car sharing, taxi services or free shuttle bus promoted from commencement of occupation	York Green Party
SID423/Mod/ENV1/1			Asks for consideration into developing a system which will allow centres of employment to use park and coach facilities, and encouraging people not to use the ring road or cross the city by car.	NDM 6

# CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

## Policy ENV2 Managing Environmental Quality

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

### Soundness

SID318/S/ENV2/1

Supports ENV2.

Strensall with  
Towthorpe  
Neighbourhood Plan  
Steering Group -  
Anthony Keith  
Marquis

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ENV3 Land Contamination

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID119/S/ENV3/1		Legally Compliant	We are pleased to see that you have reworded this policy in line with our suggestion.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID318/S/ENV3/1			Supports ENV3.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/ENV3/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ENV4 Flood Risk

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID318/S/ENV4/1			Supports ENV4.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/ENV4/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID582/S/ENV4/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/ENV4/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/ENV4/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ENV4 Flood Risk

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/S/ENV4/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/ENV4/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Avant Homes

### Proposed Modification

SID582/Mod/ENV4/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/ENV4/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/ENV4/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/ENV4/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

# CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

## Policy ENV4 Flood Risk

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/Mod/ENV4/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ENV5 Sustainable Drainage

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID233/LC/ENV5/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Green Party
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID30/S/ENV5/1		Sound	As is practicable, surface water arising from a developed site should be managed in a sustainable manner to mimic the surface water flows arising from the site prior to the proposed development. This should be considered whether the surface water arrangements from the site are to connect to a public or private asset (watercourse or sewer) before out-falling into a watercourse or, to outfall directly into a watercourse in the Board area. The Board believes that, in an area where drainage problems could exist, development should not be allowed at any location until the Local Authority is satisfied that surface water drainage has been satisfactorily provided for. And any approved development should not adversely affect the surface water drainage of the area and amenity of adjacent properties. In addition the Board does not consider that development within Flood Zone 3 is desirable or sustainable in the longer term.	Internal Drainage Board - Julian Spaul
SID76/S/ENV5/3		Not Sound	Not enough consideration is made to adequate drainage provision, investment in better drainage systems must be made before this plan is justified	Richard Horner
SID233/S/ENV5/1		Not Sound	1) Brownfield sites: The opening paragraph has a qualifying element that renders the policy meaningless. All brownfield sites will include additional costs and in the context of York which regularly experiences flooding, attenuation of surface water flow from these sites is essential. 2) Greenfield sites: Again the policy is undermined by the qualifying statement that renders it meaningless. For a greenfield site in the York area, ground conditions are likely to be broadly comparable and exceptional costs limited. 3) No reference is made to an assessment of the capacity of existing sewer and stormwater drainage systems in the broad area of the development. Given that sewage contamination of stormwater regularly experienced with combined storm sewers this should be addressed through the principles within this policy.	York Green Party
SID318/S/ENV5/1			ENV5 is UNSOUND due to drainage and surface water issues.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ENV5 Sustainable Drainage

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/S/ENV5/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID582/S/ENV5/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/ENV5/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/ENV5/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/ENV5/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/ENV5/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

**Proposed Modification**

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy ENV5 Sustainable Drainage

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID233/Mod/ENV5/ 1			1) Delete second part of opening paragraph ‘.unless it can be demonstrated that it is not reasonably practicable to achieve this reduction in runoff’2) Second and third paragraphs should be moved to come after fourth paragraph reference to greenfield sites so that it clearly applies to both.3) Delete ‘unless it can be demonstrated that it is not reasonably practicable to achieve this’ from fourth paragraph.4) Add a statement outlining developer responsibility to comply with all reasonable requirements to secure separate disposal of storm and foul water from the site where such facilities exist and to minimize water usage (eg low flush, sprinkler taps etc)	York Green Party
SID582/Mod/ENV5/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/ENV5/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/ENV5/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/ENV5/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/ENV5/ 1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy WM1 Sustainable Waste Management

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID318/S/WM1/1			Supports WM1 & WM2.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
----------------	--	--	---------------------	--

#### Proposed Modification

SID360/Mod/WM1/1			Recognising that the York Local Plan defers detailed minerals and wastepolicies to the MWJP any policies in the York Local Plan must ensure that they are consistent with strategic polices in the MWJP. A minor factual update is required in paragraph 13.3 which states that AWRP will become commissioned in early 2018. However, the site became fully operational at the end of January 2018 therefore this paragraph requires updating to reflect the current status of the site.	North Yorkshire Country Council - Tricia Richards
------------------	--	--	--	---

# CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

## Policy WM2 Sustainable Minerals Management

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

### Soundness

SID318/S/WM2/1			Supports WM1 & WM2.	Mrs & Miss J & M Frost
----------------	--	--	---------------------	------------------------

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T1 Sustainable Access

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID343/LC/T1/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I believe that the LTP draft is legally compliant and seeks to co-operate. My query concerns whether it is sound.	Michael J Smith
SID388/LC/T1/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	York Central Partnership considers that Policy T1 is legally compliant and has been prepared in accordance with the Duty to Co-operate	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell) OBO York Central Partnership

#### Soundness

SID103/S/T1/1		Not Sound	The full range of policy objectives of concern to transport need to be addressed. In order to meet objectively assessed development and infrastructure requirements, the transport policy statements in the draft Local Plan need to be justified throughout on the basis of a full set of policy objectives, which in turn should reflect those in the Strategic Environmental Assessment. Transport policies should contribute to economic vitality, public health, safety, protection of the natural environment, reduction of severance, and improved access for the transport disadvantaged. All of these objectives can be found somewhere in the Plan (for example, 1.2, 1.13-21, 1.66, 1.67, 2.14, 3.1, 12.2-3, 14.16, 15.22-27 and Table 15.2), but they are not consistently presented as a justification for the transport policies. In order to be effective, the Local Plan needs to be deliverable over its period and assessment against these aforementioned objectives is only realistic if each is specified in terms of outcome indicators and targets. At present, the Local Plan (Table 15.2) contains no outcome indicators to reflect any of the transport policy objectives other than, indirectly, air quality. The only indicators offered are output ones such as progress in delivery of road schemes. Such an approach falls very far short of accepted good practice as cited in the Local Transport Guidance, 2009; Sustainable Urban Mobility Plan Guidance, 2014; EC Guidance on Monitoring and Evaluation, 2016.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID103/S/T1/2		Not Sound	Design standards and policy thresholds are referred to throughout the Local Plan, but are never specified; instead they are to be set out in the relevant Supplementary Planning Document, which is not yet available. Examples include minimum frequencies for public transport, safe walking and cycling distances, parking standards, and requirements to provide a Transport Assessment or Travel Plan. As a result it is impossible to judge the potential effectiveness, and hence soundness, of the Local Plan. The 2005 Development Control Policies specify a number of such standards and no explanation is given for their omission from the draft Local Plan.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T1 Sustainable Access

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID318/S/T1/1			Policies T1, T2, T5, T6, T7, T8 & T9 supported.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID343/S/T1/1		Not Sound	I believe that the LTP draft is unsound because it does not specify specific congestion-reduction strategies using control and also does not aim to justify any congestion reduction strategies using control. The Transport Topic Paper identifies the nationally recommended process for justifying strategies (by comparison). But there is no statement of actual congestion reduction control strategies to be justified, either in the Topic Paper or in the LTP.	Michael J Smith
SID345/S/T1/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID364/S/T1/1			T1 fails to meet requirements of Para 17 of NPPF. Needs of disabled and those with mobility issues/impairments is not considered.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/S/T1/2			Design standards and policy thresholds not specified. Therefore impossible to judge justification and soundness of plan.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/T1/1			T1 fails to meet requirements of Para 17 of NPPF. Needs of disabled and those with mobility issues/impairments is not considered.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/S/T1/2			Design standards and policy thresholds not specified. Therefore impossible to judge justification and soundness of plan.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/S/T1/1		Not Sound	The design principles for new developments in order to reduce the need to travel and to reduce car use are necessary but not sufficient. In particular, development needs to be of mixed use and high density; with new development designed around high qualitywalking areas and cycling routes; and with those routes providing short, safe and convenient links to a core set of community facilities	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T1 Sustainable Access

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/S/T1/2		Not Sound	Design standards and policy thresholds are referred to throughout the Local Plan, but are never specified. Examples include minimum frequencies for public transport, safe walking and cycling distances, parking standards, and requirements to provide a Transport Assessment or Travel Plan. it is impossible to judge the potential effectiveness, and hence soundness, of the Local Plan.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/S/T1/3		Not Sound	At several points qualifications are added which limit the applicability of the policy and risk undermining the effectiveness of the Local Plan.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID388/S/T1/1		Not Sound	YCP supports policy T1 in principle, but considers elements of it unsound. York Central site is such a site where this proposed policy would apply , as it is development that would be supported by public transport to link it to York City Centre. YCP are committed to ensuring that the development benefits from high quality walking, cycling and public transport routes and access. However, the ability to provide high quality public transport from first occupation may be dependent on delivery of the new access route first, which will be built whilst the first homes are also being built and potentially occupied. Additionally, in general, the provision of public transport services from first occupation (or 5 years after last occupation, whichever is sooner) may be viable for developments that build out over the lifetime of the Plan and beyond (ie. 15 years +). It is therefore considered that the approach to this policy does not allow for reasonable alternatives where the landowner / developer supports the provision of public transport provision, but needs an agreed scale of occupancy before provision is viable	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell)OBO York Central Partnership
SID419/S/T1/1		Not Sound	In paragraph 14.14, reference is made to the need to provide an electric vehicle charging point for each off street parking spaces, unless unviable, referencing both the NPPF and the Low Emission Strategy of 2012. However both NPPF and the LES neglect to mention electric bikes, in part this is due to their uptake accelerating more in recent years. E-bikes can particularly enable elderly residents, who otherwise wouldn't, take up cycling and reduce reliance on the private car.	York Cycle Campaign
SID582/S/T1/1		Not Sound	We welcome the additional flexibility added to the Policy and paragraph 14.10 since the Pre-Publication Draft, which makes reference to enhancing existing services as an alternative to the provision of new high quality public transport services, and refers to potential that such new services or enhanced existing services will become commercially viable within a shorter timeframe.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T1 Sustainable Access

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/S/T1/1			We welcome the additional flexibility added to the Policy and paragraph 14.10 since the Pre-Publication Draft, which makes reference to enhancing existing services as an alternative to the provision of new high quality public transport services, and refers to potential that such new services or enhanced existing services will become commercially viable within a shorter timeframe.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/T1/1			We welcome the additional flexibility added to the Policy and paragraph 14.10 since the Pre-Publication Draft, which makes reference to enhancing existing services as an alternative to the provision of new high quality public transport services, and refers to potential that such new services or enhanced existing services will become commercially viable within a shorter timeframe.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/T1/1		Not Sound	We welcome the additional flexibility added to the Policy and paragraph 14.10 since the Pre-Publication Draft, which makes reference to enhancing existing services as an alternative to the provision of new high quality public transport services, and refers to potential that such new services or enhanced existing services will become commercially viable within a shorter timeframe.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/T1/1		Not Sound	A projected 30% increase in travel time across the network and a 55% increase in peak hour congestion and the associated air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays for people and businesses is simply unacceptable. No analysis of what improvements should be made.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/T1/1			We welcome the additional flexibility added to the Policy and paragraph 14.10 since the Pre-Publication Draft, which makes reference to enhancing existing services as an alternative to the provision of new high quality public transport services, and refers to potential that such new services or enhanced existing services will become commercially viable within a shorter timeframe.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID343/Mod/T1/1			Suggest alternative wording in relation to congestion reduction strategies	Michael J Smith
SID364/Mod/T1/1			Redraft T1 to include new principles.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton



## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy T1 Sustainable Access

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID365/Mod/T1/1			Redraft T1 to include new principles.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/Mod/T1/1			Policy T1 and its supporting paragraphs should be redrafted. Policies DP3 on sustainable communities, SS1 on delivering sustainable growth, R4 on out of centre retail and HW7 on healthy places should also reflect these principles.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/T1/2			The Supplementary Planning Document needs to be published in time for its implications to be fully assessed in advance of the Examination in Public. Or the standards specified in the Development Control Policies, 2005 should be incorporated into the Local Plan.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/T1/3			The texts specified should be amended	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID388/MOD/T1/1			It is recommended that this policy is amended as follows (penultimate paragraph of policy): 'Where development is to be supported by frequent high quality public transport linking them with York City Centre or other key destination, developers will be required to ensure the provision of such new services or enhanced existing services as necessary, from the occupation of an agreed number of dwellings informed by a Transport Assessment, the number of households and requirements of the route / operator.'	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell)OBO York Central Partnership
SID419/Mod/T1/1			In light of the recent and increasing uptake in the ownership and use of e-Bikes, an equivalent yet separate statement should be made in Policy T1 to 14.14 with reference to the provision for secure parking / charging of e-Bikes and unconventional cycles in all developments. A separate statement being suggested on the basis that the viability assessment and thresholds for making provision for e-Bikes and unconventional cycles will differ significantly to the viability of electric vehicles and should be assessed separately.	York Cycle Campaign

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T1 Sustainable Access

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID609/Mod/T1/1			1) the conversion of the Leeman Road (marble Arch) tunnel access into a public transport priority route, and bus & cycle priorities on the proposed new York Central road access, 2) local widening of Stonebow if and when Stonebow House and the BT exchange building are redeveloped to provide sufficient space for the bus stops and passing vehicles, 3) creating a bus priority link between Manor Lane & Hurricane Way at Clifton Moor to allow through running of bus services from the currently dreadfully served Rawcliffe area through to Clifton Moor but avoiding the ring road, 4) providing a dedicated bus as well as cycle priority link from the main urban area to the proposed access over the A64 to the new Elvington airfield development (ST15), and the Elvington Airfield Industrial estate (ST26), etc. Reference should also be made to the 2014 Steer, Davies & Gleave York Bus Network Review which doesn't appear to have been taken into account and should have been.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID177/LC/T2/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Mark Knowles
SID233/LC/T2/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Green Party
SID378/LC/T2/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID610/LC/T2/1			We are not seeking to make a judgement on this question.	Andrew McGuinness CPT UK OBO CPT UK OBO Bus & Coach Operators within CPT

#### Soundness

SID14/S/T2/1		Not Sound	Insufficient improvements to transport infrastructure.	Ian Peckitt
SID33/S/T2/1		Not Sound	York is a small city and cannot accommodate expansion without significant investment in the city's infrastructure, the roads in particular. The outer ring road should have been dual carriageway from the start. Plan as it is will ruin the appeal of York as a small historic city.	N Scaife
SID61/S/T2/1		Not Sound	The provision for expanding the park and ride at Poppleton bar was built into the original application. What has been omitted from the present iteration of the Local Plan is the cumulative effect of the proposed expansion of Northminster business park, the potential for change at Poppleton garden centre and the lack of sufficient road capacity to York central. A railway halt was proposed for York business park and Poppleton park. Why has this been removed when it was a condition for the development of both sites when the developers applied for planning permission?	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID85/S/T2/1		Sound	Believe the plan to be sound, adequate in meeting all of York's future needs, prevents urban creep and protects the greenbelt. 867 should be maximum number of homes built. Only concern is that a rail station for Haxby is not scheduled until late in the plan period, this should be brought forward as it would relieve congestion on the A1237.	Robert Ridley
SID86/S/T2/1		Sound	Believe the plan to be sound, adequate in meeting all of York's future needs, prevents urban creep and protects the greenbelt. 867 should be maximum number of homes built. Only concern is that a rail station for Haxby is not scheduled until late in the plan period, this should be brought forward as it would relieve congestion on the A1237.	Jacqueline Ridley
SID103/S/T2/1		Not Sound	In order to meet objectively assessed development and infrastructure requirements, the transport policy statements in the draft Local Plan need to be justified throughout on the basis of existing and accessible documentation. Frequent reference to future transport-related documentation makes it impossible to judge the potential effectiveness, and hence soundness, of the Local Plan. York Civic Trust, however, remains committed to working with City of York Council through the use of their most up to date documentation.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID103/S/T2/2		Not Sound	The transport policies in the draft Local Plan are based throughout on the 2010 Local Transport Plan (LTP3). This is out of date and inappropriate to the vision set out in the Local Plan, and has failed to achieve its planned reduction in congestion. LTP3 specified implementation over the period 2011-16, but only set the broad context for policy beyond 2016. It was incomplete in its coverage of transport policy measures, and since its publication there has been an increase in the range of technologies and policy measures available. The Local Plan (and in due course LTP4) need to reflect the potential of all of these measures. In particular it should ensure that development facilitates the use of shared and connected vehicles, smart travel, low emission vehicles, new light rail technology, district delivery points, and freight management more generally.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID103/S/T2/3		Not Sound	Policies T2, T4, T5 and T8 [Other references: 14.16, 14.18, 14.36-38, 14.40, 14.41, 14.57] provide statements separately on public transport, highways, walking and cycling and demand management (although it is noted that no similar policies are offered on freight and servicing). All of these policies specify measures to be adopted and, in the first three cases, a timetable. In the absence of an up to date LTP, these measures are inevitably incomplete, but they also fail to include many of the measures specified in the current 2005 Development Control Policies. This in turn gives the impression that the omitted measures are no longer deemed appropriate, yet there has been no publicly available analysis to justify this. Moreover, the categorisation of measures by time period of implementation is often inappropriate.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID103/S/T2/4		Not Sound	Lack of acknowledgment of planned public transport provision, including pedestrians and cyclists. York Civic Trust is concerned by the absence of new public transport schemes that the City of York Council (and other partners) have been planning in recent years. We are committed to the expansion and accessibility of the city's public transport network in order to help meet the city's sustainable and environmental development. In its current draft from, the Local Plan fails to refer to (amongst others - there is also a wider set of schemes listed in the Development Control Policies, 2005):• the planned high frequency bus services through York Central• additional stations at the Hospital, Strensall and Poppleton Business Park• a high frequency tram-train service for these stations and Haxby• provision for bus priority, including additional infrastructure to support it (such as the Clarence Street / Lord Mayor's Walk Junction, Stonebow)• priority bus access in both directions to all enhanced junctions on the A1237• a new rail route for the Harrogate line to access York Station• park and ride sites at Clifton Moor and on the Wetherby Road.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID118/S/T2/1		Not Sound	We have concerns about the impact which the following might have upon elements which contribute to the special character and setting of the historic City:- The expansion of the Park and Ride Sites at Askham Bar and Poppleton Bar- A segregated grade-separated bus route across the 1237	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID177/S/T2/1		Not Sound	I consider that Policy T2 is not sufficiently sound as it does not go far enough to mitigate negative effects on transport and climate change for numerous sites ST26, ST32, ST36 and ST37 as highlighted in the Sustainability appraisal's table on page 9 of 18 of its own pdf document. It does not provide enough reasonable options for methods other than private car transport from these sites such as extra but infrequent bus routes or improved cycle paths around these mentioned sites.	Mark Knowles
SID231/S/T2/1		Not Sound	FPC objects to the proposal for "a dedicated public transport/cycle route linking the new settlement(ST15) to a suitable access on York's highway network in the urban centre of York."As there are nodetails of where or how this public transport/cycle route would be created FPC considers that it is premature for such a proposal to be included in the Plan, not least because its potential impacts on heritage assets and areas of environmental sensitivity have not been assessed.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID232/S/T2/1		Not Sound	The "Infrastructure Delivery Plan" is not available to be read alongside the Local Plan and so how can residents and businesses be confident that infrastructure proposals are sufficiently detailed and feasible	Stephen Lornie
SID233/S/T2/1		Not Sound	Policy T2 is inconsistent in that no evidence is presented to qualify the extent to which the strategic public transport improvements will be sufficient to adequately mitigate the predicted 30% increased travel time and 55% predicted increased delay caused by increased private car trips.	York Green Party
SID288/S/T2/1		Not Sound	By deferring a new rail station either at York Rd level crossing or Haxby North East you are ignoring decades of passenger rail access. This is not effective.	Peter Vaughan

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID296/S/T2/1		Not Sound	For transport there is no mention of plans for vehicles though there is a predicted increase in traffic. Need significant improvements to roads as already delays, and improvements to cycling lanes.	Peter & Barbara Bentley
SID318/S/T2/1			Policies T1, T2, T5, T6, T7, T8 & T9 supported.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID326/S/T2/1		Not Sound	To propose a scheme for the railway at Haxby to address real current problems in such a simplistic way and in only in ten years time does not indicate 'positive preparation' of the Plan nor consistency with national policies to promote public transport.	Johnathan Tyler
SID326/S/T2/2			Proposing to build a station without establishing whether an appropriate train service can be secured is absurd. in the case of Haxby, the present hourly frequency would be so lacking in flexibility as to make it very unattractive for journeys between Haxby and York station .	Johnathan Tyler
SID351/S/T2/3			Policy T2 identifies the Designer Outlet Park & Ride facility as being suitable for relocation in the longer term (2027-32). Although we support the principle of the enhancement and relocation of the Park & Ride facility, McArthurGlen and Aviva Investors seek to do so within the short-term (2017-22) – the proposal should be moved into the short-term list and make it clear that the facilities should continue to be associated with the YDO. The text should therefore be“... short-term (2017-22) the following highway enhancement to improve public transport reliability ...- Facilitate the enhancement and relocation of the Designer Outlet Park & Ride facility to land adjoining to the south of the YDO.”	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID364/S/T2/1			Bus and Rail improvements listed incomplete and fails to address key problems with connectivity and capacity of the current networks.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/T2/1			Bus and Rail improvements listed incomplete and fails to address key problems with connectivity and capacity of the current networks.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/S/T2/1		Not Sound	The transport policies are based throughout on the 2010 Local Transport Plan (LTP3). This is out of date, inappropriate to the vision set out in the Local Plan, and has failed to achieve its planned reduction in congestion. The Council intends to start work on a new LTP (LTP4) in early 2019	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/S/T2/2		Not Sound	Policies T2, T4, T5 and T8 provide statements separately on public transport, highways, walking and cycling and demand management. No similar policies are offered on freight and servicing. It is generally accepted that a challenge as great as the predicted 55% increase in congestion (paras 15.15-17) can only be met by a holistic set of transport policy measures including land use, public transport, walking and cycling, road network improvements, freight management and demand management.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/S/T2/3		Not Sound	As noted in our general comments, the list of new public transport schemes is incomplete. There is also a wider set of schemes listed in the 2014 SDG York Bus Network Review which doesn't appear to have been taken into account. Policy T2 also refers to the protection of disused rail alignments. This statement is unduly complex.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/S/T2/4		Not Sound	At several points qualifications are added which limit the applicability of the policy and risk undermining the effectiveness of the Local Plan.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID378/S/T2/1		Not Sound	LDP do not object to this proposition, but recommend that it should be applied to the University too, given the potential for public transport synergies between the new settlement and the University (as well as its future expansion).	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID390/S/T2/1		Not Sound	York's Quality Bus Partnership welcomes the emphasis the Plan puts on bus as a key delivery mechanism for the Local Plan, but feel that the 15% mode share figure for bus travel to and from a number of the large development sites (eg. ST14 and ST15) is laudable but ambitious, and probably not achievable without a level of concerted investment in bus infrastructure in York above that outlined in the Plan as it stands. Significantly more detail is needed to be provided in a Supplementary Planning Document about: how developers, the Council and bus operators will work together to achieve the 15% mode share outlined for large development sites in the Local Plan; what infrastructure will be provided in the City Centre, on the approaches to the City Centre and on key bus routes to give buses sufficiently attractive journey times to deliver the envisaged level of mode share and accommodate the growth in bus trips, which would stem from achieving the 15% mode share from large sites; how the Council will ensure that the public transport facilities within sites, linking new sites to the existing urban area (eg. the underpass from ST14) and revenue support for new bus services, will be provided by developers as part of their planning obligations. Operators also have a concern that the current Plan makes insufficient provision for allocating space to land uses which could be developed as new bus depots to accommodate the additional buses which are implied by the growth of York and importance of bus services meeting this growth. (These views are set out in more detail in the document accompanying the submission).	Confederation of Passenger Transport UK (Andrew McGuinness) OBO York Quality Bus Partnership

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID390/S/T2/2		Not Sound	Operator partners within the York Quality Bus Partnership highlight insufficient operating centre opportunity to support bus or coach operations, either on new sites or by utilising or expanding upon existing operating centres. Where existing operating facilities are situated, local planning policy appears to oppose the development, expansion or improvement of existing depot facilities with significant issues in gaining planning consent. In most cases, existing facilities are in historic industrial or vehicle based use and that were not originally classified as Green Belt land. Constraints on the expansion of existing facilities can result in the inefficient use of several sites and can prevent pockets of land being made available for other uses. Current land classification and insufficient appropriate site opportunities coupled with increasing land costs result in a significant barrier to any potential new operating centre, either for incumbent or new operators to the York bus and coach market.	Confederation of Passenger Transport UK (Andrew McGuinness) OBO York Quality Bus Partnership
SID404/S/T2/1		Not Sound	Still no supporting analysis of what strategic public transport, cycling and walking improvements should be made to mitigate & address traffic pressures indicated & ensure these are embedded in the Plan - why it fails soundness. No measures to give buses priority to get past congested locations, to give car drivers incentive to use buses - need identifying, so land can be identified & pp granted. Examples at the following locations submitted with the response, as follows: Leeman Road (Marble Arch); Public transport corridor over the A64 to ST15, ST26 and Elvington village; bus and cycle link between Manor Lane & Hurricane Way, Clifton Moor; Widening of Stonebow. The September 2014 Local Plan included an Annex (Annex E - Transport Infrastructure Investment Requirement Study), which included a number of schemes. Why have they not been included in the Publication document? Need to ensure that services are accessible to lower paid workers not just week day / day time services. The Plan risks causing further deterioration in services and poorer air quality.	York Bus Forum - Graham Collett
SID582/S/T2/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/T2/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/S/T2/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/T2/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/T2/1			A projected 30% increase in travel time across the network and a 55% increase in peak hour congestion and the associated air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays for people and businesses is simply unacceptable. No analysis of what improvements should be made.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID610/S/T2/1		Not Sound	Significantly more detail needs to be provided in a Supplementary Planning Document about what infrastructure will be provided in the city centre, on the approaches to the city centre and on key bus routes to give buses sufficiently attractive journey times to deliver the envisaged level of mode share, and accommodate the growth in bus trip making which would stem from achieving the 15% mode share from large sites; • How the Council will ensure that the public transport facilities within sites, linking new sites to the existing urban area (e.g. the underpass from ST14 and bridge from ST15), and revenue support for new bus services, will be provided by developers as part of their planning obligations.	Andrew McGuinness CPT UK OBO CPT UK OBO Bus & Coach Operators within CPT
SID610/S/T2/2			Significantly more detail needs to be provided in a Supplementary Planning Document about how the Council will ensure that the public transport facilities within sites, linking new sites to the existing urban area (e.g. the underpass from ST14 and bridge from ST15), and revenue support for new bus services, will be provided by developers as part of their planning obligations.	Andrew McGuinness CPT UK OBO CPT UK OBO Bus & Coach Operators within CPT
SID610/S/T2/3			Operators also have a concern that the current Plan makes insufficient provision for allocating space to land uses which could be developed as new bus depots to accommodate the additional buses which are implied by the growth of York and importance of bus services in meeting this growth.	Andrew McGuinness CPT UK OBO CPT UK OBO Bus & Coach Operators within CPT

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/S/T2/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/T2/1		Not Sound	The provision for expanding the park and ride at Poppleton bar was built into the original application. What has been omitted from the present iteration of the Local Plan is the cumulative effect of the proposed expansion of Northminster business park, the potential for change at Poppleton garden centre and the lack of sufficient road capacity to York central. A railway halt was proposed for York business park and Poppleton park. Why has this been removed when it was a condition for the development of both sites when the developers applied for planning permission?	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID14/Mod/T2/1			No more development to the north of York, fully upgrade of the A1237 outer ring road, new rail stations at Haxby and Strensall.	Ian Peckitt
SID82/Mod/T2/1			Use brownfield sites first, improve infrastructure in line with building. Dual the outer ring road and connect it directly to ST15.	Grant Cockburn
SID118/Mod/T2/1			To address concerns about the impact , suggest following amendments:(a) Policy T2, Medium Term, Criterion ii amend to read:-  “... to match rising demand subject to minimising any impact upon the purposes of the Green Belt”(a) Policy T2, Medium Term, Criterion iii amend to read:-“... to the north west of the City subject to minimising any impact upon the purposes of the Green Belt”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID177/Mod/T2/1			For Policy T2 of the Local Plan Consultation Draft (pages 212 and 213). I propose that the text under the heading 'Short Term 2017-22' have the addition of 'Provide highway enhancements to improve public transport reliability at all proposed development sites within the aforementioned Short Term dated period' . This will ensure that sites such as ST26, ST32, ST36 and ST37 are not having significant negative effects on transport and as a consequence, climate change as highlighted in the sustainability appraisal summary non-technical document.	Mark Knowles
SID233/Mod/T2/1			Policy T2 needs to be amended to refer to the forthcoming LTP4 and subsequent transport strategies, para v, traffic restraint measures in relation to ST5 and ST1 as they affect the city centre need to be identified as a short term measure. Additionally, the council needs to commit to a short term action to commission a feasibility study for modern light mass transit provision for possible inclusion within the infrastructure delivery plan.	York Green Party
SID288/Mod/T2/1			A station is needed now. It would take 5 mins to get to York railway station from Haxby level crossing yet 25-35 minutes by car.	Peter Vaughan

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID326/Mod/T2/1			The Plan should be modified to include a commitment to a comprehensive study of the benefits and costs of various public transport technologies, with particular reference to the principal corridors. This should start with a listing of all appropriate systems, including those new concepts now under development (such as ultra-light-rail as proposed elsewhere), and progressively focus on a scheme suitable for York and capable of addressing (as quickly as possible) the linked problems of congestion, fossil-fuel consumption and poor air quality.	Johnathan Tyler
SID351/Mod/T2/1			The YDO is a major tourism destination and attraction, and should be recognised as such in paragraph 1.43 (refer to visitor figures above).	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID351/Mod/T2/2			Policy T2 identifies the Designer Outlet Park & Ride facility as being suitable for relocation in the longer term (2027-32). Although we support the principle of the enhancement and relocation of the Park & Ride facility, McArthurGlen and Aviva Investors seek to do so within the short-term (2017-22) – the proposal should be moved into the short-term list and make it clear that the facilities should continue to be associated with the YDO. The text should therefore be “... short-term (2017-22) i the following highway enhancement to improve public transport reliability ...- Facilitate the enhancement and relocation of the Designer Outlet Park & Ride facility to land adjoining to the south of the YDO.”	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID364/Mod/T2/1			Redraft T2 to reflect list of schemes that emerge form work to create a LPT4.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/T2/1			Redraft T2 to reflect list of schemes that emerge form work to create a LPT4.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/Mod/T2/1			The Local Plan should acknowledge that LTP3 is now out of date and that LTP4 is in preparation.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/T2/2			In the absence of an up to date Local Transport Plan, reference to specific measures and their timing in Policies T2, T4 and T5 would be better omitted and replaced by a commitment to determine an appropriate set of measures and timeframe in the forthcoming LTP4. As an alternative the text in the current Development Control Policies should be used. A new policy on freight and servicing should be added.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/Mod/T2/3			Policy T2 should ideally be expanded to reflect the full list of schemes to be proposed in LTP4. Failing that it needs to be redrafted	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/T2/4			The texts specified should be amended	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID378/Mod/T2/1			Medium-term (2022-27)ii. Further expansion of the Askham Bar and Poppleton Bar Park & Ride facilities to match rising demand.iii. The following highway enhancements to improve public transport services and reliability• a segregated grade-separated bus (and pedestrian/cycle) route across A1237 to improve connectivity with the areas to the north-west of the city, and• a dedicated public transport/cycle route linking the new settlement (ST15) to a suitable access on York's highway network in the urban centre of York (subject to confirmation of developers access proposals to site ST15 so not shown on the policies proposals map). Synergies between ST15, the University and its proposed expansion should be exploited.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID390/MOD/T2/1			The Local Plan should be accompanied by a comprehensive Bus Infrastructure Plan, which sets out a deliverable strategy for achieving the levels of bus use envisaged in the Local Plan. This should form a Supplementary Planning Document to the Local Plan, and bus operators should be involved in developing this document through York's Quality Bus Partnership.	Confederation of Passenger Transport UK (Andrew McGuinness) OBO York Quality Bus Partnership
SID582/Mod/T2/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/Mod/T2/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/T2/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/T2/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID610/Mod/T2/1			The Local Plan should be accompanied by a comprehensive Bus Infrastructure Plan which sets out a deliverable strategy for achieving the levels of bus use envisaged in the Local Plan. This should form a Supplementary Planning Document to the Local Plan, and bus operators should be involved in developing this document.	Andrew McGuinness CPT UK OBO CPT UK OBO Bus & Coach Operators within CPT
SID848/Mod/T2/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T3 York Railway Station and Associated Operational Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/T3/1		Not Sound	Lacks an integrated transport strategy. Fails to connect ideas of all the park and ride schemes situations around the city. No P&R facility which allows overnight car parks.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID118/S/T3/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID374/S/T3/1		Not Sound	While we welcome the commitments in the policy on York Station, the following should also be added: . provision of new platforms for the Harrogate line services. enhanced priority access to southbound buses on Queen St.. improved facilities for southbound bus stops to match those provided northbound. taxi and bus access to the NW side of the station via York Central.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID582/S/T3/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/T3/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/T3/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T3 York Railway Station and Associated Operational Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/S/T3/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/T3/1			We consider the Transport Section and Policies and supportive analysis part of the document to have not been properly prepared, not been justified, and will therefore not be effective. Whilst there are some measures included in the Plan, there appears to be no overall supportive analysis of what strategic public transport measures should be needed to mitigate and address the traffic pressures indicated.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/T3/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/T3/1		Not Sound	Lacks an integrated transport strategy. Fails to connect ideas of all the park and ride schemes situations around the city. No P&R facility which allows overnight car parks.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID132/Mod/T3/1			the second footnote to Paragraph 14.27 needs updating; the East Coast Main Line Route Study draft for consultation was published in December 2017.	Network Rail - Diane Cragg
SID374/Mod/T3/1			Policy T3 needs to be redrafted	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID423/Mod/T3/1			Station has poor facilities for pick up and drop off points.	NDM 6
SID582/Mod/T3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T3 York Railway Station and Associated Operational Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/Mod/T3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/T3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/T3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/T3/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T4 Strategic Highway Network Capacity Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID378/LC/T4/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
----------------	--------------------------	-----------------------	--	---

#### Soundness

SID8/S/T4/1				Joseph Watt
SID11/S/T4/1		Not Sound	Too many houses with insufficient investment / expansion of road infrastructure. Congestion on outer ring road will be made worse still.	John Clark
SID21/S/T4/1		Not Sound	Outer ring road should have been a dual carriageway years ago. All residents know this.	Ray McDonogh
SID61/S/T4/1		Not Sound	New roundabouts block access for vehicles as there is no box junction when the traffic is heavy to allow any feed from the left.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID76/S/T4/1		Not Sound	Not enough consideration is made to the local road network, investment in the local road network must be made before this plan is justified	Richard Horner
SID147/S/T4/1		Not Sound	A1237 is overloaded and a bottleneck, the changes to roundabouts have not improved the situation much. Road needs to be duelled first.	Ann & Paul McLean
SID250/S/T4/1		Not Sound	Transport - In relation to the proposed housing development on Site ST9 and the other proposed developments along the A1237 ring road corridor, the plan is unsound because it is based on the delivery of a sustainable transport infrastructure. A sustainable transport infrastructure to support these developments would, at a minimum, involve grade separated junctions on the overloaded A1237, and without significant government or regional funding this will never be economically viable.	Michael Harrison
SID274/S/T4/1		Not Sound	The Plan admits in Policy SS12 that the location of ST14 is the most congested part of the northern ring road Although Policy T4 proposes improvements to the A1237 over three timescales this will be too little too late if the development of ST14 is given the go ahead. Local roads will also be impacted.	The Dransfield Family

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T4 Strategic Highway Network Capacity Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID318/S/T4/1			Policy T4 is UNSOUND due to highways issues.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID325/S/T4/1			Major sections of York's northern ring road cannot cope with existing traffic flows at busy times. The plan proposes the building of a further 5,000 dwelling around the northern ring road plus further employment locations -- all feeding more traffic into the current congestion.	Skelton Village Trust - Phillip Butler
SID364/S/T4/1			Issues with supporting evidence and justification.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/T4/1			Issues with supporting evidence and justification.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/S/T4/1		Not Sound	The transport policies are based throughout on the 2010 Local Transport Plan (LTP3). This is out of date, inappropriate to the vision set out in the Local Plan, and has failed to achieve its planned reduction in congestion. The Council intends to start work on a new LTP (LTP4) in early 2019	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/S/T4/2		Not Sound	Policies T2, T4, T5 and T8 provide statements separately on public transport, highways, walking and cycling and demand management. No similar policies are offered on freight and servicing. It is generally accepted that a challenge as great as the predicted 55% increase in congestion (paras 15.15-17) can only be met by a holistic set of transport policy measures including land use, public transport, walking and cycling, road network improvements, freight management and demand management.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/S/T4/3		Not Sound	The provision of additional highway capacity on its own is not an effective solution to the problems of travel growth. Yet the draft Local Plan appears to suggest that other policies will only be adopted "if this demand cannot be met by increasing highway capacity alone" (para 3.12). There is extensive evidence that new road capacity will attract additional travel. If new capacity is to be provided on the outer ring road it needs to be introduced in parallel with measures to reduce traffic in central and inner York. The inclusion of the full dualling of the Northern / Western Outer Ring Road is unsound. In addition to the general principle above that it would attract yet further traffic, the high cost and low added benefit	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T4 Strategic Highway Network Capacity Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID377/S/T4/1			I do not agree that the City is able to accommodate any more than 867 new homes each year, largely because the City's infrastructure would simply be unable to cope with the demands that would be placed on it. This particularly applies to the outer ring road: it is beyond the scope for discussion that this road is unable to cope even with the current demands that are placed on it.	John Williams
SID378/S/T4/1		Not Sound	The IDP is currently not available, and LDP reserve the right to comment further on this Policy following the publication of the IDP.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID386/S/T4/1		Not Sound	No new development should take place until the A1237 is dualled, and other local roads improved.	Alison Scott
SID392/S/T4/1		Sound	Funding from WYCA to undertake feasibility and business case development for dualling of the A1237 is very welcome. This upgrading is a major element of this LEP's aim to improve east-west connectivity across the LEP area and is key to delivering the growth in this and future Local Plans. Also important in terms of east-west connectivity is the Grimston Bar junction, which has capacity problems and faces increased pressure through proposals within the Local Plan. This LEP is keen to work with the City of York, East Riding and Highways England to achieve the required upgrading.	Rydale District Council - Julian Rudd
SID419/S/T4/1		Not Sound	Policy T4 is unsound for various reasons, rep goes into greater detail but to summarise the main points: plan does not do enough to promote sustainable transport, dualling outer ring road is poor value for money, evidence base is flawed - some errors and a fundamental bias in favour of private car, nor does it account for social and environmental costs of road building.	York Cycle Campaign
SID582/S/T4/1		Not Sound	The timings of junction upgrades in this policy need further explanation and linked back into the delivery trajectories of each strategic site. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/T4/1			The timings of junction upgrades in this policy need further explanation and linked back into the delivery trajectories of each strategic site. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T4 Strategic Highway Network Capacity Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/S/T4/1			The timings of junction upgrades in this policy need further explanation and linked back into the delivery trajectories of each strategic site. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/T4/1		Not Sound	The timings of junction upgrades in this policy need further explanation and linked back into the delivery trajectories of each strategic site. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/T4/1			A projected 30% increase in travel time across the network and a 55% increase in peak hour congestion and the associated air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays for people and businesses is simply unacceptable. No analysis of what improvements should be made.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID825/S/T4/1		Not Sound	With all the developments, fail to see how the A64 / Grimston Bar roundabout & A1079 will cope with the extra traffic.	Osbalwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
SID842/S/T4/1			York's population has doubled over the past 50 years yet the infrastructure remains the same. In a medieval city full of noteworthy buildings there seems to be no scope for building new roads or even widening existing roads.	Peter Eaves
SID848/S/T4/1			The timings of junction upgrades in this policy need further explanation and linked back into the delivery trajectories of each strategic site. Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID850/S/T4/1			At the time of writing, City of York Council had yet to revise its Infrastructure Delivery Plan and the Transport Topic Paper (an annex to the Draft Local Plan) which will include a review of SATURN traffic model results regarding the future traffic impact on the local highway network. It is expected that these reports will be issued when the Local Plan is issued in May 2018. Highways England will need to see both documents. We expect to see evidence that the remaining junctions on the A64 around York will not require further improvements during the Plan period.	Highways England

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T4 Strategic Highway Network Capacity Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID850/S/T4/2		Not Sound	We expect that the strategic sites located around the A1237 Northern Ring Road will combine to have a significant impact on the junctions of the A1237 with the A64 east and west of York. We will therefore need to have a good understanding of that cumulative impact, and the scale and nature of any improvement required, before we can state that the Plan is sound. Site Transport Assessments must demonstrate that all transport issues have been resolved and Highways England will need to agree these, in particular, at those sites likely to have the greatest impact on the A64.	Highways England
SID61/S/T4/1		Not Sound	New roundabouts block access for vehicles as there is no box junction when the traffic is heavy to allow any feed from the left.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID148/Mod/T4/1			The Plan should require developers to pay for area-specific traffic impact studies as part of the planning application process. If the studies show, as is likely given the current infrastructure, severe impacts then the developer(s) should suggest and (part)fund mitigation strategies that are put in place in time to be READY once new houses begin to be sold.	Daniel Dickinson
SID250/Mod/T4/1			To make the plan sound, these housing developments should be deferred until the improvements to the A1237 have been completed. Alternatively, the additional housing should be located on sites with access to the dual carriageway A64 bypass, which has the capacity to cope with increased traffic volumes.	Michael Harrison
SID274/Mod/T4/1			The numbers of other sites feeding into the A1237 northern ring road must be heavily reduced. The inclusion of any northern housing sites in the Plan should be SUBJECT to full dualling of the A1237 which must occur in the first instance.	The Dransfield Family
SID277/Mod/T4/1			To ease congestion in Haxby/Wigginton the A1237 needs to be dual carriageway with flyovers.	William Grainger
SID300/Mod/T4/1			More detailed planning on infrastructure prior to development taking place.	Peter Bainbridge
SID325/Mod/T4/1			In our view the plan should state that the northern housing developments are subject to the prior dualling of the A1237 with full grade separation.	Skelton Village Trust - Phillip Butler
SID364/Mod/T4/1			T4 should be rewritten to require future road scheme proposals to be judged against other modal priorities and against the overall transport strategy for the City. Needs to include commitment to providing facilities to overcome the severance effect of new roads.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T4 Strategic Highway Network Capacity Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID365/Mod/T4/1			T4 should be rewritten to require future road scheme proposals to be judged against other modal priorities and against the overall transport strategy for the City. Needs to include commitment to providing facilities to overcome the severance effect of new roads.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/Mod/T4/2			Full dualling of outer ring road should be omitted until LPT4 complete.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/Mod/T4/1			The Local Plan should acknowledge that LTP3 is now out of date and that LTP4 is in preparation.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/T4/2			In the absence of an up to date Local Transport Plan, reference to specific measures and their timing in Policies T2, T4 and T5 would be better omitted and replaced by a commitment to determine an appropriate set of measures and timeframe in the forthcoming LTP4. As an alternative the text in the current Development Control Policies should be used. A new policy on freight and servicing should be added.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/T4/3			While Policy T4 must reflect road infrastructure schemes already committed, it needs to be phrased to demonstrate an appreciation of the limited benefits of such investment. Within individual development sites, and particularly Policies SS12, 13 and 22, new access routes to the regional road network should not be provided, since these are likely to stimulate their use as dormitory villages	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID419/Mod/T4/1			Rep provides more detail but to summarise: evidence base needs re-assessing to consider full costs of car use, transport model needs to incorporate cyclists / pedestrians and where quoted 2011 census data for York needs correction. Policy fundamentally needs to move away from predict and provide paradigm of transport planning, instead taking inspiration from best practice found on the continent - Groningen in the Netherlands is flat, compact, walled city that shares many characteristics with York. Alternatively congestion charging and restrictions on parking to reduce the relative attractiveness of the private car.	York Cycle Campaign
SID582/Mod/T4/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T4 Strategic Highway Network Capacity Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/Mod/T4/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/T4/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/T4/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID842/Mod/T4/1			More roads/widening of existing roads in order to cope with congestion.	Peter Eaves
SID848/Mod/T4/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID850/Mod/T4/1			It would be helpful to include reference to the revised Infrastructure Delivery Plan alongside the Duty to Cooperate Statement (para 1.9 section 1 Background) as this should include proposals for funding and delivery of improvements to the SRN and other infrastructure with relevance to neighbouring authorities. The A64 is also part of York's strategic road network (1.64) and should be referenced here.	Highways England
SID850/Mod/T4/1			The A64 should be included with the plan definition of York's Strategic Road Network - Highways England requires that capacity enhancements and infrastructure needed to deliver strategic growth is identified at the plan making stage. As indicated in 2013, 2016 and 2017 consultation responses HE believe that spatial distribution and particularly development of land to the south and eastern parts of York should be dependent upon agreement between CYC and HE of a Management Strategy for the A64 and its junctions with the local primary road networks.	Highways England

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T4 Strategic Highway Network Capacity Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID850/Mod/T4/2			<p>At the time of writing there are no committed DfT Road Investment Strategy (RIS) schemes on the A64 trunk road in the York area. Decisions on schemes to be included in the next phase 2020-2025 are yet to be made by government however the RIS identifies one scheme for the A64 Hopgrove Roundabout that is aiming to come forward in the next phase. The main conclusion of the feasibility study for this potential scheme was that upgrading to dual carriageway standard of the A64 east of York between the Hopgrove Roundabout and the existing length of dual carriageway at Barton-le Willows should be prioritised for implementation before upgrading the Hopgrove roundabout. Reference to this scheme should be added to T4.</p>	Highways England



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T5 Strategic Cycle and Pedestrian Network Links and Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID233/LC/T5/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Green Party
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/T5/1		Not Sound	fails to recognise that the current cycle provision on the A1237, Haxby and in Poppleton is inadequate.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID103/S/T5/1		Not Sound	In terms of cycling and walking policies [T5], the list of strategic cycle and pedestrian improvements is incomplete and fails to address key inadequacies in the connectivity and capacity of the current networks. It offers no overall strategy to deliver a comprehensive high quality cycling or walking network that would achieve a significant modal shift to walking and cycling, and hence relief of congestion. In its current draft from, the Local Plan fails to refer to (amongst others – there is also a wider set of schemes listed in the Development Control Policies, 2005): • extension of the upgraded route across Scarborough Bridge to serve Bootham and the Hospital • additional infrastructure to overcome severance caused by railway lines and watercourses, including new bridges between Poppleton Rd and York Central and between British Sugar and Poppleton Business Park, and North Street and Coney Street• measures to protect the existing cycle and walking networks• further development of orbital routes• priority provision for pedestrians and cyclists at junctions to reflect the hierarchy of users• provision for enhanced cycle parking in major activity areas. • There is also a wider set of schemes listed in the Development Control Policies, 2005.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID175/S/T5/1		Not Sound	The Local Plan is based on the out-of-date LTP3 (Implementation measures 2011 – 16). In 2017, an independent Forum, called the Walk Cycle Forum, was set up to encourage members to work together to increase walking and cycling in York. Members consist of walking and cycling stakeholders across the city, including City of York Council. The Forum has developed a collective Walk Cycle Vision 2018 and is looking to develop a Walk Cycle Strategy and Implementation Plan in 2018/19 to be at the heart of the new Local Transport Plan, the LTP4. The Local Plan, based on the out-of-date LTP3, is not consistent with the principles in the Walk Cycle Vision 2018, in particular, principle 7: Walking and cycling is a priority in all new developments All of York’s new developments are planned and designed at high density with mixed land use development to ensure the easy movement of people walking and cycling as a priority, with local amenities within easy walking and cycling distance. Vehicle use is discouraged and car parking provision limited.	York's Walk Cycle Forum and York

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T5 Strategic Cycle and Pedestrian Network Links and Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID175/S/T5/2		Not Sound	The Local Plan is not consistent with National Policy, namely the Cycling and Walking Investment Strategy 2017, in that measures outlined within it are not sufficient to meet the overall aim of that Strategy – “to make cycling and walking the natural choices for shorter journeys, or as part of a longer journey”. In particular, the Local Plan notably fails to adhere to the hierarchy of transport users, which always puts walking and cycling first.	York's Walk Cycle Forum and York
SID233/S/T5/1		Not Sound	Experience has shown that cycle infrastructure needs to be continuous to have maximum impact on encouraging shift from car travel to bike, which is particularly important at the early stages of a new development. York has a history of cycle schemes that have been delayed or even reversed.	York Green Party
SID318/S/T5/1			Policies T1, T2, T5, T6, T7, T8 & T9 supported.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID364/S/T5/1			Cycle and Pedestrian improvements listed incomplete and fails to address inadequacies. Various omissions that contribute to failure of policy.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/T5/1			Cycle and Pedestrian improvements listed incomplete and fails to address inadequacies. Various omissions that contribute to failure of policy.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/S/T5/1		Not Sound	The transport policies are based throughout on the 2010 Local Transport Plan (LTP3). This is out of date, inappropriate to the vision set out in the Local Plan, and has failed to achieve its planned reduction in congestion. The Council intends to start work on a new LTP (LTP4) in early 2019	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/S/T5/2		Not Sound	Policies T2, T4, T5 and T8 provide statements separately on public transport, highways, walking and cycling and demand management. No similar policies are offered on freight and servicing. It is generally accepted that a challenge as great as the predicted 55% increase in congestion (paras 15.15-17) can only be met by a holistic set of transport policy measures including land use, public transport, walking and cycling, road network improvements, freight management and demand management.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T5 Strategic Cycle and Pedestrian Network Links and Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/S/T5/3		Not Sound	The list of strategic cycle and pedestrian improvements listed here is incomplete. It offers no overall strategy to deliver a comprehensive high quality cycling or walking network that would achieve a significant modal shift. Specific omissions include: upgraded route across Scarborough Bridge, measures to protect existing cycle routes and walking networks, provision for enhanced cycle parking in major activity areas. etc.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID403/S/T5/1		Not Sound	Transport Topic Paper: Plan is informed wholly and uniquely by an outdated transport model that fails even to mention cycling or cycling infrastructure. In fact the 'traffic model' used does not actually reflect traffic in York, but only motorised traffic. Given the overarching aims of the Council to improve accessibility to goods and services for individuals, modelling work should focus on improving the transport of people (and goods), and not simply on the optimisation of motorised traffic flows. No consideration of cycling.	Lynne & Robert Clark
SID419/S/T5/1		Not Sound	Rep goes into more detail but to summarise: proposed investments do not do nearly enough to match the rhetoric of moving to a 'low carbon economy', congestion and pollution will get worse not better, transport policies in terms of investment and road space allocated are biased in favour of private car -disproportionate when 2011 census says 20% of travel to work trips in York are by walking / cycling.	York Cycle Campaign
SID582/S/T5/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/T5/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/T5/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T5 Strategic Cycle and Pedestrian Network Links and Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/S/T5/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/T5/1			A projected 30% increase in travel time across the network and a 55% increase in peak hour congestion and the associated air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays for people and businesses is simply unacceptable. No analysis of what improvements should be made.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/T5/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/T5/1		Not Sound	fails to recognise that the current cycle provision on the A1237, Haxby and in Poppleton is inadequate.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID103/Mod/T2/2			Policies T2 and T5 should ideally be expanded to reflect the full list of schemes to be proposed in LTP4. In its current draft from, the Local Plan fails to refer to (amongst others - there is also a wider set of schemes listed in the Development Control Policies, 2005): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the planned high frequency bus services through York Central</li> <li>• additional stations at the Hospital, Strensall and Poppleton Business Park</li> <li>• a high frequency tram-train service for these stations and Haxby</li> <li>• provision for bus priority, including additional infrastructure to support it (such as the Clarence Street / Lord Mayor's Walk Junction, Stonebow)</li> <li>• priority bus access in both directions to all enhanced junctions on the A1237</li> <li>• additional infrastructure to overcome severance caused by railway lines and watercourses, including new bridges between Poppleton Rd and York Central and between British Sugar and Poppleton Business Park, and North Street and Coney Street</li> <li>• measures to protect the existing cycle and walking networks</li> <li>• further development of orbital routes</li> <li>• extension of the upgraded route across Scarborough Bridge to serve Bootham and the Hospital</li> </ul>	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID175/Mod/T5/1			We would like the Local Plan to acknowledge that the LTP3 is out-of-date and that LTP4 is in preparation, so all references to the Local Transport Plan should refer to the emerging LTP4 – which will include the Walk Cycle Vision 2018, Strategy and Implementation Plan 2018/19. We would also like the Local Plan to refer to the Walk Cycle Vision 2018 for York, the emerging Walk Cycle Strategy and Implementation Plan and the national Cycling and Walking Investment Strategy 2017.	York's Walk Cycle Forum and York

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T5 Strategic Cycle and Pedestrian Network Links and Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID233/Mod/T5/1			1) Schemes identified as extending to medium and long term (*) broken down into phases or allocated to one appropriate time frame. 2) Xiii North South and east west cycle routes through the city centre moved into short and medium term and reference made to how these link to York Central and Castle Gateway.	York Green Party
SID364/Mod/T5/1			Redraft T5 to reflect list of schemes that emerge form work to create a LPT4.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/T5/1			Redraft T5 to reflect list of schemes that emerge form work to create a LPT4.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/Mod/T5/1			The Local Plan should acknowledge that LTP3 is now out of date and that LTP4 is in preparation.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/T5/2			In the absence of an up to date Local Transport Plan, reference to specific measures and their timing in Policies T2, T4 and T5 would be better omitted and replaced by a commitment to determine an appropriate set of measures and timeframe in the forthcoming LTP4. As an alternative the text in the current Development Control Policies should be used. A new policy on freight and servicing should be added.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/T5/3			Policy T5 should ideally be expanded to reflect the full list of schemes to be proposed in LTP4. Failing that it needs to be redrafted.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID403/Mod/T5/1			1.The Transport Topic Paper should, but does not, accept cycling and cycling infrastructure as an aspect of general transport planning in the light of social, health-related, environmental and allied concerns. 2. Policy T5 of the Local Plan consultation document in fact contains no planning objectives and no plan for implementation of what it says it intends.	Lynne & Robert Clark
SID419/Mod/T5/1			Rep provides more detail but to summarise: more consideration needs to be given to York's pedestrians (details specific examples), more much ambition is needed in terms of a cycle network for York, use appropriate transport modelling tools such as Propensity to Cycle and the forthcoming Cycle Infrastructure Prioritisation Toolkit as opposed to SATURN and TEMPROO. Planners should not be afraid of re-allocating road space to cycling if they want a culture of cycling to flourish in the city.	York Cycle Campaign

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T5 Strategic Cycle and Pedestrian Network Links and Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/Mod/T5/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/T5/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/T5/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/T5/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/T5/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T6 Development at or Near Public Transport Corridors, Interchanges and Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID61/S/T6/1		Not Sound	Welcomes statement 'where development is sited close to or is likely to have an impact on existing operational lines or lines that may be reopened no new crossings will be permitted'	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID118/S/T6/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID232/S/T6/1		Not Sound	Policy T6 Fails to identify specific transport corridors, interchanges or facilities (active or disused) which are protected under the policy.	Stephen Lornie
SID318/S/T6/1			Policies T1, T2, T5, T6, T7, T8 & T9 supported.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID582/S/T6/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/T6/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T6 Development at or Near Public Transport Corridors, Interchanges and Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/S/T6/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/T6/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/T6/1			A projected 30% increase in travel time across the network and a 55% increase in peak hour congestion and the associated air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays for people and businesses is simply unacceptable. No analysis of what improvements should be made.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/T6/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID61/S/T6/1		Not Sound	Welcomes statement 'where development is sited close to or is likely to have an impact on existing operational lines or lines that may be reopened no new crossings will be permitted'	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID232/Mod/T6/1			One example of a transport corridor which ought to be specifically mentioned and protected is the route of (or new variation thereof) the York>Beverley railway line which although disused has potential for future reinstatement to provide additional regional transport links.	Stephen Lornie
SID582/Mod/T6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T6 Development at or Near Public Transport Corridors, Interchanges and Facilities

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/Mod/T6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/T6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/T6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/T6/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T7 Minimising and Accommodating Generated Trips

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID231/S/T7/1		Not Sound	Feels policy could be strengthened and suggests rewording.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID318/S/T7/1			Policies T1, T2, T5, T6, T7, T8 & T9 supported.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/T7/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID364/S/T7/1			Design standards and policy thresholds not specified. Therefore impossible to judge justification and soundness of plan.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/T7/1			Design standards and policy thresholds not specified. Therefore impossible to judge justification and soundness of plan.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/S/T7/1		Not Sound	Design standards and policy thresholds are referred to throughout the Local Plan, but are never specified. Examples include minimum frequencies for public transport, safe walking and cycling distances, parking standards, and requirements to provide a Transport Assessment or Travel Plan. it is impossible to judge the potential effectiveness, and hence soundness, of the Local Plan.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T7 Minimising and Accommodating Generated Trips

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID582/S/T7/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/T7/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/T7/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/T7/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/T7/1			A projected 30% increase in travel time across the network and a 55% increase in peak hour congestion and the associated air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays for people and businesses is simply unacceptable. No analysis of what improvements should be made.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/T7/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T7 Minimising and Accommodating Generated Trips

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID850/S/T7/1			Highways England welcomes the statement about Transport Assessments identifying impacts on the A64 Trunk Road and statement 4.52 about establishing whether joint master travel plans are required. Also welcome statements in spatial strategy SS1 3.12 about restraining future traffic increases as demand cannot be met by increasing capacity of the road network alone.	Highways England

### Proposed Modification

SID374/Mod/T7/1			The Supplementary Planning Document needs to be published in time for its implications to be fully assessed in advance of the Examination in Public. Or the standards specified in the Development Control Policies, 2005 should be incorporated into the Local Plan.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID582/Mod/T7/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/T7/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/T7/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/T7/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T7 Minimising and Accommodating Generated Trips

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/Mod/T7/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T8 Demand Management

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID388/LC/T8/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	York Central Partnership considers that Policy T8 is legally compliant and has been prepared in accordance with the Duty to Co-operate	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell)OBO York Central Partnership
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID103/S/T8/1		Not Sound	Policy T8 [others: 14.53-9, 15.15-19] covering demand management offers a wholly inadequate approach, particularly when set against the prediction of a 55% increase in congestion as a result of the planned new development. It principally considers parking standards, but limits these to long stay parking, and is therefore a significant backward step from the current Development Control Local Plan (2005) which has a comprehensive approach covering all city centre parking (public off street, private non-residential and on street). The standards proposed are not specified; instead reference is made to a York Parking Strategy review, which we understand has yet to be published. As the Development Control Policies (para 6.58) demonstrate, public parking provision is dwarfed by private non-residential parking in and close to the city centre. Thus any reliance for demand management on the control of long stay public off-street space is doomed to failure.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID318/S/T8/1			Policies T1, T2, T5, T6, T7, T8 & T9 supported.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID364/S/T8/1			Wholly inadequate when set against prediction of 30% general increase in travel times across network. Backward step from DCLP (2005).	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/T8/1			Wholly inadequate when set against prediction of 30% general increase in travel times across network. Backward step from DCLP (2005).	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/S/T8/1		Not Sound	Policies T2, T4, T5 and T8 provide statements separately on public transport, highways, walking and cycling and demand management. No similar policies are offered on freight and servicing. It is generally accepted that a challenge as great as the predicted 55% increase in congestion (paras 15.15-17) can only be met by a holistic set of transport policy measures including land use, public transport, walking and cycling, road network improvements, freight management and demand management.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T8 Demand Management

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/S/T8/2		Not Sound	Policy T8 covering demand management is wholly inadequate, particularly when set against the prediction of a 55% increase in congestion as a result of the planned new development. There is in practice a much wider range of demand management measures, including selective road closure and road space reallocation, workplace parking levies, road pricing and policies to reduce freight and servicing traffic.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/S/T8/3		Not Sound	At several points qualifications are added which limit the applicability of the policy and risk undermining the effectiveness of the Local Plan.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID388/S/T8/1		Not Sound	YCP supports policy T8 in principle, but considers elements of it are unsound (in relation to the 2nd paragraph of the policy). The York Central site is well located to include a high level of provision for sustainable travel. However, it will also include parking provision related to the existing railway station and National Railway Museum and the proposed commercial elements. All of which protects existing jobs and creates a significant number of new jobs and visitors to the area. Whilst it is anticipated that much of the travel to the development will be sustainable, using the excellent public transport availability and pedestrian and cycle links with the remainder of the city, there will be some workers and visitors who will travel by car and hence will require long stay parking provision. Whilst every effort will be made to minimise the level of parking in the future on York Central, it is imperative that an overly restrictive policy on long stay parking does not reduce its attractiveness of the commercial offer on York Central to potential occupants.	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell)OBO York Central Partnership
SID582/S/T8/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/T8/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T8 Demand Management

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/S/T8/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/T8/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/T8/1			A projected 30% increase in travel time across the network and a 55% increase in peak hour congestion and the associated air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays for people and businesses is simply unacceptable. No analysis of what improvements should be made.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/T8/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

### Proposed Modification

SID103/Mod/T8/1			Policy T8 needs to be completely rewritten, based on a critical assessment of the need for demand management to contribute to the wider objectives of the transport policy, and a series of recommendations on the application of each of the potentially available demand management measures. As a contribution to this, and in advance of the preparation of LTP4, the statement on parking policy within the current Development Control Policies 2005 should be incorporated into the Local Plan.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID364/Mod/T8/1			T8 needs to be completely rewritten, based on a critical assessment of the need for demand management to contribute to the wider objectives of the transport policy.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/T8/1			T8 needs to be completely rewritten, based on a critical assessment of the need for demand management to contribute to the wider objectives of the transport policy.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T8 Demand Management

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/Mod/T8/1			In the absence of an up to date Local Transport Plan, reference to specific measures and their timing in Policies T2, T4 and T5 would be better omitted and replaced by a commitment to determine an appropriate set of measures and timeframe in the forthcoming LTP4. As an alternative the text in the current Development Control Policies should be used. A new policy on freight and servicing should be added.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/T8/2			Policy T8 needs to be completely rewritten	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/T8/3			The texts specified should be amended	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID388/MOD/T8/1			The 2nd paragraph of Policy T8 should be replaced with the following wording: 'Development in and around the city centre should prioritise the provision of short stay parking over long stay parking.'	ARUP (Christopher Tunnell)OBO York Central Partnership
SID582/Mod/T8/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/T8/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T8 Demand Management

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID584/Mod/T8/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/T8/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/Mod/T8/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID850/Mod/T8/1			We understand that revisions to the Council's Parking Standards, contained in the Sustainable Transport for Development' SPD, have yet to be updated. Highways England wishes to be consulted on these standards.	Highways England

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T9 Alternative Fuel Fuelling Stations and Freight Consolidation Centres

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID318/S/T9/1			Policies T1, T2, T5, T6, T7, T8 & T9 supported.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID364/S/T9/1			Confusing policy. Fails to recognise growth in home delivery traffic.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/T9/1			Confusing policy. Fails to recognise growth in home delivery traffic.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/S/T9/1		Not Sound	Policy T9 is confusing in that it combines two very different facilities: alternative fuel filling stations and freight consolidation centres. The latter is the only reference to freight policy in the whole document. This is unacceptable.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID419/S/T9/1		Not Sound	Policy T9 makes references to electric and low-emission vehicles as potential options for moving freight from consolidation centres to the city centre, citing their compatibility with narrow streets and pedestrian movements. The policy however does not make reference for the potential in this area for the use of cycle based couriers to deliver freight from the consolidation centre to its final destination. 'Last-mile' deliveries by cycle are once again becoming more frequent in cities globally as an effective way of delivering freight of various sizes on-time, in a non-polluting manner and with reduced impact to & from traffic.	York Cycle Campaign
SID582/S/T9/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T9 Alternative Fuel Fuelling Stations and Freight Consolidation Centres

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/S/T9/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/T9/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/T9/1		Not Sound	Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID590/S/T9/1				ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID609/S/T9/1			A projected 30% increase in travel time across the network and a 55% increase in peak hour congestion and the associated air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays for people and businesses is simply unacceptable. No analysis of what improvements should be made.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/T9/1			Further detail on the extent of developer contributions is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

**Proposed Modification**

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T9 Alternative Fuel Fuelling Stations and Freight Consolidation Centres

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/Mod/T9/1			Policy T9 should be split into its two separate parts. That on freight needs to be replaced by a freight policy including the continuation of the stopover lorry park at Murton	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID419/Mod/T9/1			Recommends paragraph 14.62 is expanded to include specific reference to promoting and facilitating the use of cargo cycles, of all types, to deliver freight to and from consolidation centres to city centre locations. Delivery in this form will provide a cost viable and sustainable alternative to current carbon intensive delivery methods, in line with the NPPF requirement to 'accommodate the efficient delivery of goods and supplies' [para 35] and that 'encouragement should be given to solutions which support reductions in greenhouse gas emissions and reduce congestion' [para 30].	York Cycle Campaign
SID582/Mod/T9/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/T9/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/T9/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/T9/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy T9 Alternative Fuel Fuelling Stations and Freight Consolidation Centres

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID590/Mod/T9/1			The policy should refer to, and make provision for, other AlternativeFuel Fuelling stations such as hydrogen stations and electric recharging stations	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID848/Mod/T9/1			Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## **CYC Local Plan Publication Draft**

### Policy C1 Communications Infrastructure

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID118/S/C1/1		Sound	Considers the policy to be sound apart from one amendment to be made to a table.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID318/S/C1/1			Policy C1 is UNSOUND due to communication infrastructure issues.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID582/S/C1/1		Not Sound	We note the addition to this Policy since the Pre-Publication Draft regarding Next Generation Access (NGA) broadband connection. A degree of caution is required given that the inclusion of digital infrastructure is not within the direct control of the development industry, and therefore this policy could create deliverability issues.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/C1/1			We note the addition to this Policy since the Pre-Publication Draft regarding Next Generation Access (NGA) broadband connection. A degree of caution is required given that the inclusion of digital infrastructure is not within the direct control of the development industry, and therefore this policy could create deliverability issues.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/C1/1			We note the addition to this Policy since the Pre-Publication Draft regarding Next Generation Access (NGA) broadband connection. A degree of caution is required given that the inclusion of digital infrastructure is not within the direct control of the development industry, and therefore this policy could create deliverability issues.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/C1/1		Not Sound	We note the addition to this Policy since the Pre-Publication Draft regarding Next Generation Access (NGA) broadband connection. A degree of caution is required given that the inclusion of digital infrastructure is not within the direct control of the development industry, and therefore this policy could create deliverability issues.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy C1 Communications Infrastructure

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/S/C1/1			We note the addition to this Policy since the Pre-Publication Draft regarding Next Generation Access (NGA) broadband connection. A degree of caution is required given that the inclusion of digital infrastructure is not within the direct control of the development industry, and therefore this policy could create deliverability issues.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/C1/1			It would be preferable to refer to the number of designated heritage assets on the Historic England 'Heritage at Risk Register'. Table 15.2, Section 8, Indicators, second bullet-point amend to read:-"Number of designated heritage assets on the Historic England 'Heritage at Risk Register'."	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID582/Mod/C1/1			Insert reference in the Policy regarding the Council and Developers engaging with communication providers. Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/C1/1			Insert reference in the Policy regarding the Council and Developers engaging with communication providers. Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/C1/1			Insert reference in the Policy regarding the Council and Developers engaging with communication providers. Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/C1/1			Insert reference in the Policy regarding the Council and Developers engaging with communication providers. Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy C1 Communications Infrastructure

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID590/Mod/C1/1			Policy should require refurbishment and new development schemes to be future proofed to facilitate the provision of mobile, broadband and wireless communications infrastructure. This would include infrastructure in the public realm and within private buildings.	ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID848/Mod/C1/1			Insert reference in the Policy regarding the Council and Developers engaging with communication providers. Clarification on level of contribution is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DM1 Infrastructure and Developer Contributions

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID378/LC/DM1/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID55/S/DM1/1		Not Sound	Noting the requirement for developers to provide necessary infrastructure to mitigate the local impacts of their development; this is not set out in policy, only in supporting justification. Further, the policy should more clearly reflect NPPF para 173, making clear that its requirements should not be so onerous as to impact on viability.	Indigo Planning (Andrew Astin) OBO Wyevale Garden Centres
SID72/S/DM1/1		Not Sound	Bias towards development in the North, but the roads infrastructure is available in the south (dual carriageway A64) and is already heavily congested to the North (single carriageway A1237 with congested roundabouts). Mismatch between resource availability and the location of developments. Plan has unsubstantiated hopes to upgrade infrastructure after developments to the north are in place. Plan also states that the costs of required infrastructure are too high for developers to bear. The tax payer is being asked to subsidise this over development of the north. Development of infrastructure after schemes are built is too late as the infrastructure is needed before construction begins. Before any further development in the north of York, A1237 needs to be duelled with grade separated major junctions. Drainage is also a major concern. Haxby sewers cannot take the increased load and therefore requires connection to the Strensall Treatment Works (but that is at capacity). Schools, health centres, shops, local parking are all significant infrastructure issues. All are at current at or beyond capacity in Haxby and cannot accommodate the sizeable building envisaged by the plan. Jobs are not available in Haxby/ Wigginton so people will be travelling to York, Leeds and beyond for work. A plan which seeks to build thousands of homes in a location with overloaded infrastructure without first demonstrating a funded plan to upgrade the infrastructure before the building is in place cannot be considered a sound and is irresponsible.	Andrew Montgomery
SID160/S/DM1/1		Sound	Support policy.	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DM1 Infrastructure and Developer Contributions

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID318/S/DM1/1			Supports DM1 but Table 15.1 is UNSOUND as issues with content.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID345/S/DM1/1		Sound	Approach sound	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID378/S/DM1/1		Not Sound	It requires contributions towards strategic infrastructure as part of all developments. The strategic infrastructure will be set out in the IDP. This is not publicly available. LDP reserve the right to comment on the IDP, once it is available. Similarly, there is no draft Community Infrastructure Levy ("CIL") presently available, which it is intended will fund the infrastructure in the IPD. Again, LDP reserve the right to comment on the CIL when it is make available.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID582/S/DM1/1		Not Sound	Note, the table above identifies circa 30 policies where 'Developer Contributions' are referenced in the supporting 'delivery' text. While the text to support Policy DM1 makes an attempt to draw these together, it must be acknowledged they are all potentially making demands of development on matter that in the main would be covered by a CIL.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/DM1/1			Note, the table above identifies circa 30 policies where 'Developer Contributions' are referenced in the supporting 'delivery' text. While the text to support Policy DM1 makes an attempt to draw these together, it must be acknowledged they are all potentially making demands of development on matter that in the main would be covered by a CIL.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/DM1/1			Note, the table above identifies circa 30 policies where 'Developer Contributions' are referenced in the supporting 'delivery' text. While the text to support Policy DM1 makes an attempt to draw these together, it must be acknowledged they are all potentially making demands of development on matter that in the main would be covered by a CIL.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DM1 Infrastructure and Developer Contributions

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID585/S/DM1/1		Not Sound	Note, the table above identifies circa 30 policies where 'Developer Contributions' are referenced in the supporting 'delivery' text. While the text to support Policy DM1 makes an attempt to draw these together, it must be acknowledged they are all potentially making demands of development on matter that in the main would be covered by a CIL.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID609/S/DM1/1			A projected 30% increase in travel time across the network and a 55% increase in peak hour congestion and the associated air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays for people and businesses is simply unacceptable. No analysis of what improvements should be made.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett
SID848/S/DM1/1			Note, the table above identifies circa 30 policies where 'Developer Contributions' are referenced in the supporting 'delivery' text. While the text to support Policy DM1 makes an attempt to draw these together, it must be acknowledged they are all potentially making demands of development on matter that in the main would be covered by a CIL.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

### Proposed Modification

SID55/Mod/DM1/1			Draft Policy DM1 states that the council will request contributions from developers to ensure that the necessary infrastructure is in place to support future development in York. Policy should be The justification for the policy notes that developers will be required to contribute to the provision of infrastructure necessary to mitigate the local impacts of their development which is welcomed. However, this is not reflected in the actual wording of the policy that contributions will only be required where these are necessary. Furthermore, the policy does not reflect paragraph 173 of the NPPF that sites and the scale of development should not be subject to such a scale of obligations and policy burdens that their ability to be developed viably is threatened. The policy should also include reference to contributions being in accordance with the requirements of CIL Regulation 122.	Indigo Planning (Andrew Astin) OBO Wyevale Garden Centres
SID72/MOD/DM1/1			Reconsider the plan to relocate developments to the South of the city, where the roads infrastructure is better able to cope. Lower taxpayer subsidies should be achievable by moving the bias to the south of the city. Demonstrate an acceptance that infrastructure investment is a required precondition to development proceeding and identifying funding sources or make suitable communities to planning constraints that will be added to any planning approvals (ie. before the scheme proceeds stated infrastructure developments will have taken place or the developer will provide funding to the council to enable the infrastructure developments to take place).	Andrew Montgomery
SID96/Mod/DM1/1			CYC should further emphasise the conditions that are preconditions of development in order to provide adequate supporting infrastructure and adequate financial contributions from developers. These conditions are essential parts of the Local Plan.	David Mayston

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DM1 Infrastructure and Developer Contributions

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID160/Mod/DM1/1			An additional paragraph should be included within the policy setting out that developers wishing to opt out of this payment should be required to provide an open book audit as set out in Policy H10 dealing with affordable housing provision, in order to justify robustly to the satisfaction of the Council why this should be allowed.	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE
SID386/MOD/DM1/1			Absolutely no development should take place until City of York Council is in a position to enforce the planning provisions. Otherwise, developers will build exactly what they like. There will be no green spaces, cycle lanes, overbridge, primary schools, local shops or any other of the woolly provisions in the Plan. Any non-compliance with these conditions must be enforceable with massive fines and the Planning Enforcement Department should be strengthened accordingly.	Alison Scott
SID582/Mod/DM1/1			The viability work currently being undertaken by CYC needs to be vigorously tested working with the development industry including an assessment of the cumulative impact on viability is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/Mod/DM1/1			The viability work currently being undertaken by CYC needs to be vigorously tested working with the development industry including an assessment of the cumulative impact on viability is required.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Mod/DM1/1			The viability work currently being undertaken by CYC needs to be vigorously tested working with the development industry including an assessment of the cumulative impact on viability is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/Mod/DM1/1			The viability work currently being undertaken by CYC needs to be vigorously tested working with the development industry including an assessment of the cumulative impact on viability is required.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### Policy DM1 Infrastructure and Developer Contributions

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID848/Mod/DM1/1			The viability work currently being undertaken by CYC needs to be vigorously tested working with the development industry including an assessment of the cumulative impact on viability is required.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID850/Mod/DM1/1			Section 15.18 states that ‘Strong emphasis will be placed on providing improvements to public transport and more active forms of transport, particularly as access to these forms of transport were key considerations in determining the accessibility of sites for their allocation within the plan. However, it is also acknowledged that major enhancements to highway network will also be necessary.’ This should include capacity enhancement schemes on the A64. Policy DM1 should include an additional reference to the need for developers to contribute to mitigation schemes on the A64.	Highways England

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID1/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I trust the Officers who have prepared it	David Marsh
SID2/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Rachel Hallam
SID3/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Finds it inappropriate to ask the general public these questions as they do not have the knowledge or training to give an informed answer.	John Flynn
SID5/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Is just assuming compliance at this late stage.	Peter Tuffs
SID7/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Information supplied confirms this.	David Casswell
SID8/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Has contributed to the LDFWG and Local Plan Working Group so knows the council has spent years producing the document correctly.	Joseph Watt
SID19/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Unsure if it does or not.	Laura Simpson
SID11/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Has faith in York Council.	John Clark
SID14/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Due to the time it must be.	Ian Peckitt
SID15/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Meets all requirements.	Mick Wojkiw
SID18/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Sees no reason why not.	John Nichol

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID19/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Does not have the competency to say whether it is legally compliant or not.	Graham and Pat Wilford
SID20/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes information in document to be correct.	Roy Gibson
SID21/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	(blank)	Ray McDonogh
SID22/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes so.	River Foss Society - John Millett
SID23/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes council will have done everything by the book.	Kevin Graham Ogilvy
SID24/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Appears to be compliant.	Daphne Taylor
SID26/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	There has been no public consultation. Residents, community groups and councillors should be integral not an after-thought.	Andrew Dickinson
SID27/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Assumes so, otherwise it would be thrown out.	Richard Wilson
SID28/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Meets all requirements.	Karen Gegg-Brega
SID31/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Only wants to comment on H31.	Gareth Thompson
SID33/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Has no idea, not concerned with this.	N Scaife



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID34/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	(blank)	David Randon
SID36/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	As far as is understood it seems to comply.	Kay Stead
SID38/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes the plan to be fair, reasonable, deliverable and legally compliant.	Andrew Bell
SID40/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes it to be compliant.	Beatrice Wiseman
SID41/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	It preserves the green belt.	Jemma Goodrum
SID42/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Brian McClure
SID44/LC/Gen/1		Legally Compliant	Understands the plan meets government guidelines regarding housing / business needs as well as reflecting local evidence. Has also been through lengthy consultation processes, believes it to be legally compliant.	Kevin Smith
SID45/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Appears to be compliant.	W G Gambold
SID46/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Plan is lawful and follows government guidelines. Has evidence based research about number and type of homes needed and takes local feedback into account.	P J Lawson
SID47/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I believe the authors have complied with all legalities and to be fully compliant.	Kevin White
SID48/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Current planned numbers of houses reflected in the Draft Local plan meets needs having followed guidelines and reflects consultants' feedback, including public. It preserves the greenbelt and avoids urban creep	Nick Frieslaar

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID49/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Nan Harding
SID50/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Considers plan to be prepared in line with statutory regulations.	Ruth Bentley
SID51/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No Comment	Richard Bramley
SID52/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant	Considers the plan inaccessible and responses to be submitted in a short time frame. Residents opinions before landowners.	Pauline Bramley
SID55/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Indigo Planning (Andrew Astin) OBO Wyevale Garden Centres
SID57/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Chris Sutton
SID58/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Appears legal.	Judy Sutton
SID59/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Follows procedure.	John Pace
SID61/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Frequent errors in policies.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID62/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Considers it legal.	David McKeeves

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID64/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Claire Bicknell
SID65/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Plan is legal.	Daniel Sellers
SID67/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Plan is well prepared.	James Holtt
SID68/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID70/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I feel unable to make judgement as I have no legal qualification.	Clare Abraham
SID71/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Outside my area of knowledge	Joseph Abraham
SID72/LC/Gen/1			I am unable to locate the Duty to Co-Operate statement referred to on the york.gov.uk web site. I therefore cannot verify what the duty to co-operate is and form a view concerning whether or not it has been complied with	Andrew Montgomery
SID73/LC/GEN/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	I do not consider the plan to be legally compliant as it does not comply with NPPF	Peter Heptinstall
SID74/LC/GEN/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I assume technical legal details have been adhered to, this does not mean I agree with all the proposals.	Andy Mulholland
SID76/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Richard Horner
SID78/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I have trust in CYC (over 18 years)	Leonard Ogilvy

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID79/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I have trust in CYC (over 18 years)	Annabelle Ogilvy
SID80/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No detailed comment	Robert Gibson
SID81/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No known reasons to doubt legal compliance or that the Duty to Cooperate was not fulfilled.	Skelton Village Action Group
SID82/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant	Not qualified to say, assumes it is legally compliant but not sure the duty-to-cooperate has been fulfilled.	Grant Cockburn
SID85/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes the plan to be lawful.	Robert Ridley
SID86/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes the plan to be lawful.	Jacqueline Ridley
SID88/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes the plan to be compliant.	Brian Bell
SID89/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes the plan to be compliant.	Maxine Bell
SID94/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant	Has ignored residents views.	Steven Davenport
SID96/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Council has gone to great effort to ensure compliance.	David Mayston
SID97/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes it to be compliant.	Allan Ashworth

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID99/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	(blank)	Strensall with Towthorpe PC - Fiona Hill
SID103/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes plan to be compliant.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID104/LC/Gen/1		Not Legally Compliant	Plan does not meet sustainability criteria, will introduce health risks to current and future residents. Plan does not consider measures to combat emissions of nitrogen dioxide, particulates, carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gases from both transport and other sources. Plan does not suffice on flood risk, air quality or traffic congestion. It will increase congestion and this demand cannot be met by increasing highway capacity as there is no scope for the roads infrastructure to have their capacity increased.	Ann Andrews
SID107/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	(blank)	Keith Hartley
SID113/LC/Gen/1			Partially. Plan focuses on development in inner York and settlements to the south-west of the city are largely ignored. Whilst they might be in the green belt or conservation areas they still have development potential within the village envelopes. Concerned that the few amenities and services in Askham Richard, Askham Bryan, Rufforth etc will not have sufficient residents to sustain them in future if we are not mindful of the need to develop commensurately with the needs of individual communities. Planning policy should be about encouraging the 'critical mass' in development that supports the viability of a community.	Susan Rippon
SID114/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Assume the council has produced a compliant document.	Ian Anderson
SID119/LC/Gen/1			Linked to incorporation of Water Framework Directive policy into the plan. Potential issues relating to Duty to cooperate if no modification. Potential modifications suggested.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID120/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Satisfied with consultation process and plans appears to be compliant.	Martin Lumley-Holmes
SID120/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Satisfied with consultation process and plans appears to be compliant.	Deborah Lumley-Holmes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID122/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	(blank)	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse
SID124/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Happy with how the plan was put together.	Haxby And Wigginton Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Paul Firth
SID125/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Document is fundamentally unsound but is legally compliant and complies with the Duty to Cooperate.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID128/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	(left blank)	Eric Hall TDH Estates OBO Trustees Of Monks Cross Shopping Park
SID129/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Local consultation and extensive research.	Joan Fatheazam
SID130/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Supports and agrees with City of York Council's processes, procedures and justified, is satisfied that all documents are legally compliant.	Dean King
SID131/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	The latest draft has been well prepared and researched and represents the views of the localcommunity.	Shahin Fatheazam
SID132/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment.	Network Rail - Diane Cragg
SID133/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment.	M E Ramsay

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID/136/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Plan takes into account public feedback. Follows NPPF and other government guidelines.	Daniel Petty
SID/137/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Plan takes into account public feedback. Follows NPPF and other government guidelines.	Shireen Petty
SID/138/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	The plan has been subject to many consultations, amendments and agreements. It is now crucial that the plan is enacted without further delay.	John Sharpe
SID140/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Had the opportunity to comment on the plan and have had discussion with the local plan team.	Huntington Parish Council - David Jobling
SID141/LC/Gen/1		Not Legally Compliant		How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Oakgate Caddick Groups
SID142/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Considers it lawful	Rob Jones
SID144/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes it is legally complaint and fulfils duty to cooperate.	Christopher Arundel
SID146/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Supports plan	Gill Offler
SID148/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes it is legally complaint and fulfils duty to cooperate.	Daniel Dickinson
SID149/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Lawful, long consultation, supported by local council, reflects evidence based research.	Susan, Paul, Zoe, Gina and Kate Blenkiron

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID152/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	I have had to put no as I am not competent to comment on legal questions.	David Painter
SID155/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I consider the document to be legally compliant as consultation and due process of appraisal has been completed according to the regulations.	Mark Waterley
SID156/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment.	Steve Izzard
SID157/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Assumes it is.	Janet White
SID158/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Doesn't understand as not lawyer.	Dan Taylor
SID160/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment	KVA Planning Consultancy OBO The North Yorks Branch of CPRE
SID161/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	If not compliant it would have been found out by now.	Philip Turner
SID162/LC/Gen/1			Trusts councillors have verified the legality of plan.	Kathleen Turner
SID165/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Richard Frost
SID166/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Having spoken to council officers believes all to be compliant.	David Gale
SID167/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Not qualified to say, assumes the plan to be compliant.	Janet Teather



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID169/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes the plan is compliant.	Ellen Walton
SID170/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Robert West
SID171/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Believes the plan to be compliant.	Megan Taylor
SID172/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Having reviewed the documentation is satisfied they comply.	Cllr Stephen Fenton
SID173/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	The Plan has been positively prepared, is effective, justified and consistent with national policy.	Julia Garnham
SID175/LC/Gen/1				York's Walk Cycle Forum and York
SID176/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No concerns.	Household of Blackberry Station House Dr Damian Mawer
SID179/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Supports plan.	Barry O'Connor
SID181/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments
SID186/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment.	Theatres Trust

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID186/S/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment.	Theatres Trust
SID187/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No complaints from Ryedale. Have been involved enough.	Ryedale DC
SID193/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Feels that the Localism Act has not been taken into account - views and decisions on where certain types of development should go have been ignored.	Peter Murray
SID193/LC/Gen/2	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Peter Murray
SID194/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Feels that the Localism Act has not been taken into account - views and decisions on where certain types of development should go have been ignored.	Jessica Murray
SID194/LC/Gen/2	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Jessica Murray
SID195/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Feels that the Localism Act has not been taken into account - views and decisions on where certain types of development should go have been ignored.	Natasha Murray
SID195/LC/Gen/2	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Natasha Murray
SID196/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Feels that the Localism Act has not been taken into account - views and decisions on where certain types of development should go have been ignored.	Anneliese Murray

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID196/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Anneliese Murray
SID197/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Feels that the Localism Act has not been taken into account - views and decisions on where certain types of development should go have been ignored.	Mary Julie Murray
SID197/LC/Gen/2	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Feels that the Localism Act has not been taken into account - views and decisions on where certain types of development should go have been ignored. Concerns over the lack of information provided on impact of Elvington, Wheldrake and surrounding countryside regarding new infrastructure - particularly the transport links to the A64 and B1228 - as the effect will be vast.	Mary Julie Murray
SID204/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Plan developed in accordance with NPPF. Been subject to extensive and effective consultation and has been approved by elected representatives. Duty to co-operate has been discharged by extensive consultation with statutory and other interested bodies.	Chris Polack
SID206/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Minster Alexander McCallion
SID210/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID211/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	In all honesty I know nothing about legal compliance, I just wish to make comment on what is going to affect the area I live in.	Sophie Moore
SID212/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The Plan needs to take account of recently issued draft NPPF Guidance (March 2018) as it progresses given a proposed end date of 2032/33 and green belt boundaries to endure up to 2037/38	IB Planning (Iain Bath ) OBO Client
SID225/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The environment should be a primer driver taken into consideration when planning additional housing and development rather than economic factors.	Jane Granville

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID226/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Susan & Ralph Major
SID228/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	No option for "don't know"	Jason Ironside
SID229/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Brian Woods
SID230/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Anne Kerr
SID231/LC/Gen/1			Yes, it's legally compliant	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID232/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Stephen Lornie
SID235/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Alan Charlesworth
SID240/LC/Gen/1			EMAIL -- This information is not supplied.	David Boddy
SID243/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Haxby Town Council Mark Scott
SID/246/LC/Gen/1		Legally Compliant		LHL Group (Richard Hampshire) OBO Mr J Nicholson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID/246/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC			LHL Group (Richard Hampshire) OBO Mr J Nicholson
SID247/LC/Gen/1			Duty to comply requires more than meetings and consultations. Further evidence on the Duty to Cooperate and the exploration of a sub-regional approach to planning and the identification of new settlements around York to support the housing need.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge
SID250/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I do not have the expertise to know that the document is compliant but I believe City of York Council will have ensured that it is.	Michael Harrison
SID254/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Equibase Ltd (Nick Squire)
SID255/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Legally Compliant		Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID261/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	There has been no co-operation with Elvington Parish Council or the village residents as they have never been consulted on what the village actually needs.	Amanda Moore
SID262/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	There has been no co-operation with Elvington Parish Council or the village residents as they have never been consulted on what the village actually needs.	Ian Dickens
SID264/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land, Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID265/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Honary Alderman Richard Watson
SID269/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Mrs Janet Hopton
SID270/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	The co-operation should be between the local population and CYC. Where is the evidence of this? 'Based on proportional evidence' the proportional evidence is against destroying green belt farm land.	Peter Carney
SID271/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	To the best of my knowledge I believe the Plan has been prepared in line with statutory requirements. I received an explanatory leaflet at my house and I have been able to view all associated documents.	Angela Wheatcroft
SID272/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I consider all documents to be legally compliant. I support and agree with CYC processes, procedures and justification and I am satisfied that all documents are legally compliant	Rachel Cole
SID273/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I support and agree with CYCs processes, procedures and justifications and I'm satisfied all documents are legally compliant	Margaret Thomas
SID278/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I support and agree with CYCs processes, procedures and justifications and I'm satisfied all documents are legally compliant	Gillian Hinton
SID280/LC/Gen/1			This information is not supplied.	John & Dorothy Lawton
SID282/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Barrie Moore
SID284/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Alisdair & Rosie Dunn
SID286/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I support the Council's procedures and decisions. In particular, I support the Council's decision not to allow any development on the West side of Copmanthorpe.	John Martin Pickard

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID287/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I support and agree with City of York Council's processes, procedures, and justifications and I am satisfied that all documents are legally compliant.	Katherine Pickard
SID288/LC/Gen/1			This information is not supplied.	Peter Vaughan
SID289/LC/Gen/1			EMAIL -- This information is not supplied.	Terence Wilson
SID292/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Agrees it is legal.	Janice Mountford
SID298/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Assumes legal.	Sally Bruckshaw
SID301/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I support and agree with CYCs processes, procedures and justifications and I'm satisfied all documents are legally compliant	Copmanthorpe Parish Council - Diane Stones
SID302/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I support and agree with CYCs processes, procedures and justifications and I'm satisfied all documents are legally compliant	Jeffrey Clarke
SID303/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I consider all documents comprising the draft local plan to be legally compliant	Ian Moir
SID304/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	As Councillors we have followed the lengthy process of Committee Reports and Public Consultations and know that the requirements of government have been met.	Cllr K Orrell
SID305/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	The Plan has been through the correct procedures	Mr & Mrs J Peel
SID316/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Stuart Kay

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID317/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	It is not possible to answer yes in absence of the requisite evidence and spacial implications of the plan is not capable of being determined at this stage.	Geoffrey Nurse
SID318/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	The City of York Local Plan - Publication Draft February 2018 is the outcome of a number of consultations which complied with legal requirements.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID322/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Meets requirements.	Alan Kirkham
SID323/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Meets requirements.	Helene Kirkham
SID324/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Howard Perry
SID325/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Skelton Village Trust - Phillip Butler
SID326/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Johnathan Tyler
SID327/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Doesn't understand the question.	Lt Col Gyle Jones MBE
SID328/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Doesn't understand the question.	Diana Jones



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID329/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Alistair McFarlane
SID330/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I regret that I have to say that I consider the structured format whereby we are asked to comment upon the Local Plan would appear to have been devised so as to deter many people from responding!	Anthony Gregory
SID335i/LC/GEN/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I have no knowledge to suggest that the document is not legally compliant in both respects	Lionel Lennox
SID335/LC/GEN/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I have no knowledge to suggest that the document is not legally compliant in both respects	Lionel Lennox
SID336/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Contradicts statements within the Brundtland Commission 1987 and European Directive 2001/42/EC (Sustainability)	Christine McKenna
SID337/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Stephen Kirkham
SID338/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	have no reason to believe the plan is not within the law or the duty to cooperate has not been fulfilled.City of York Council have their own legal department.	Alan Cook
SID339/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID344/LC/Gen/1				Amec Foster Wheeler (Hannah Bevins) OBO National Grid

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID346/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I answered yes to the two question relating this part of the response as I do not have the legal knowledge to make a judgement or can comment if the document complies with Duty to Co-operate.	Chris Slade
SID347/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Planning Prospects (Jason Tait) OBO Miller Homes
SID348/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	It complies with legal requirements	Felicity Iredale
SID351/LC/Gen/1				NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID355/LC/Gen/1				National Railway Museum - Judith McNicol
SID357/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID364/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	We haven't examined this question in detail, and are not in a position to comment further.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID366/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services
SID369/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Julian Sturdy MP
SID370/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Make it York - Andrew Sharp
SID371/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Mr & Mrs Beckett
SID372/LC/Gen/1				Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID417/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	We haven't examined this question in detail, and are not in a position to comment further.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID375/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Residents do not feel that their submissions with regards to the previous consultation period have been taken into account therefore the Plan is unsound as it is not representative of local peoples views.	Cllr Suzie Mercer
SID378/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID378/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID379/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	It is probably fine but I don't have the technical knowledge to definitively say so, so have to default to "No"	Colin Packer
SID380/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	See "Soundness" comments.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID382/LC/Gen/1			This information is not supplied.	GVA (Christopher Jones) OBO Homes England
SID383/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Natural England still have a number of outstanding concerns around the lack of a final assessment for the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulation 2017 (HRA). Attached to rep is a letter from the 30th October 2017 detailing the issues.	Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID385/LC/GEN/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Yes, it's legally compliant	Giles Carter
SID390/LC/GEN/1			Not seeking to make a judgement on this question	Confederation of Passenger Transport UK (Andrew McGuinness) OBO York Quality Bus Partnership

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID392/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Rydale District Council - Julian Rudd
SID394/LC/Gen/1		Legally Compliant		The Planning Bureau (Stephen Courcier) OBO McCarthy & Stone Retirement Lifestyles Ltd
SID396/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Complies with legal compliance.	Roger Pierce
SID398/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Not applicable given we answered 'yes'.	York Campaign for Real Ale - Nick Love
SID399/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Local residents, local parish councils and other interest groups, as well as neighbouring local authorities, have all been fully consulted and their views fully taken into account, as required by law.	Anthony (Tony) Hainsworth Fisher
SID401/LC/Gen/1		Legally Compliant		Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID403/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Considers unnecessary.	Lynne & Robert Clark
SID404/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Haven't examined this question in detail, and are not in a position to comment further.	York Bus Forum - Graham Collett
SID406/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID406/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)
SID406/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)
SID406/LC/Gen/4	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)
SID407/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment.	Rob Littlewood
SID410/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment.	Helene Littlewood
SID411/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Meets requirements.	Lance Racey & Tracey Harrison-Racey
SID415/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	CYC needs to clarify how they intend to make transparent the conflicting requirements of being a 'not for profit' organisation and the 'best consideration reasonably obtainable'	Anthony Dennis
SID415/LC/Gen/2			The Local Plan is contributing to the Deprivation ranking discussed in the draft.	Anthony Dennis
SID415/LC/Gen/5			Very little advertising and engagement with neighbourhoods.	Anthony Dennis
SID415/LC/Gen/6			Further clarity is sought in the Plan to indicate how the Council intends adopt a proactive approach to support its 'One-Planet York' approach to development and the Achieving Sustainable Design guidance in the NPPF.	Anthony Dennis
SID415/LC/Gen/9			The Local Plan will need to more adequately address the concerns of the local residents in terms of the impact of construction leading to need for lots more HGVs and white-vans.	Anthony Dennis

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID415/LC/Gen/10			The Council is not using an up to date evidence base to inform the policies for the Local Plan, particularly as to how it may address the needs of the broken housing market.	Anthony Dennis
SID424/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment.	Val Izzard
SID583/LC/Gen/1			No Comment Made	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/LC/Gen/1			No Comment Made	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID587/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		ONEill Associates (Eamonn Keogh)OBO Shepherd Homes Land at Cherry Lane
SID593/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO Autohorn Fleet Services Ltd (Autohorn)
SID594/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID595/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID596/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	(Site-specific representations should be read in conjunction with BH's overarching representations prepared by Barton Willmore, which make comments upon the overall soundness of the emerging CYC Local Plan.)	Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes
SID598/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID603/LC/Gen/1		Not Legally Compliant	The plan is not legally compliant as it is not based upon a robust Sustainability Appraisal that includes an up-to-date assessment of alternatives spatial strategies and/or housing allocations. We have no comment in respect of Duty to Cooperate.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited
SID604/LC/Gen/1		Not Legally Compliant	The plan is not legally compliant as it is not based upon a robust Sustainability Appraisal that includes an up-to-date assessment of alternatives spatial strategies and/or housing allocations. No comment in respect of Duty to Cooperate.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID608/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment	Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Messrs N Blacker & Son
SID609/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Complies with these.	York and District Trades Union Council - Dave Merrett



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID611/LC/Gen/1		Legally Compliant		Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Northminster Business Park
SID612/LC/Gen/1		Legally Compliant	No comments to add	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO JRHT
SID613/LC/Gen/1		Legally Compliant	No comments to add	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Askham Bryan College
SID614/LC/Gen/1		Legally Compliant		Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO W Birch & Sons
SID615/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC		some of those authorities have expressed concerns that have not been fully resolved such as Hambleton, Leeds, Ryedale, Harrogate, Selby.	ONEill Associates (Philip Holmes) OBO Heworth Green Gasworks Ltd
SID618/LC/Gen/1			EMAIL -- This information is not supplied.	Julie Ainsworth
SID620/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC		With regard to the duty to co-operate it may be the case the Council has consulted with neighbouring authorities, but some of those authorities have expressed concerns that have not been fully resolved	Eamonn Keogh ONEill Associates OBO Galtres Village Development Company
SID651/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Carr

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID652/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Hind
SID653/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Oliver Hind
SID654/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Michael Fedyszyn
SID655/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Hilary Fedyszyn
SID656/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Daniel Buckley
SID657/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Timothy Duffy
SID658/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kristen Buckley
SID659/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Emily McLaughlin
SID660/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paula McLaughlin
SID661/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Christopher McLaughlin
SID662/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Margaret Moxon

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID663/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Moira Law
SID664/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robert Law
SID665/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Brian Ferguson
SID666/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Hirst
SID667/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Grace Hirst
SID668/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Findlay Wallace
SID669/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joan Wallace
SID670/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tim Harrison
SID671/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Phoebe Harrison
SID672/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Bryony Harrison
SID673/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	James Ogram

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID674/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Eric Wilson
SID675/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Diane Brownlee
SID676/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Irene Wilson
SID677/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Lenore Janet Hill
SID678/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Grewer
SID679/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robert Brownlee
SID680/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Linda Hill
SID681/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Clare Frisby
SID682/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Carol Ferguson
SID683/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Heather Heeles
SID684/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Ronald Hill

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID685/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Colin Perrott
SID686/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Ruth Perrott
SID687/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Adams
SID688/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Gillian Adams
SID689/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Michael Buckley
SID690/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Karen Buckley
SID691/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Beverley Duffy
SID692/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Greenaway
SID693/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sally Greenaway
SID694/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Abigail Sutton
SID695/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	William Marsh

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID696/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Bernadette Sutton
SID697/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sue Glenn
SID698/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Hazel Sedman
SID699/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	James Muldoon
SID700/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Karen Kingston
SID701/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Janet Muldoon
SID702/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tony Morton
SID703/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	June Morton
SID704/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jonathan Browne
SID705/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Darren Robson
SID706/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Hurst

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID707/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Hogarth
SID708/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Sutton
SID709/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Julie Tink
SID710/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Graham Tink
SID711/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Andrew Milner
SID712/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sue Nightingale
SID713/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Keren Hunter
SID714/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Gillian Hodgson
SID715/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robyn Hodgson
SID716/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Richard Muldoon
SID717/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Claire & Paul Savage

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID718/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Michael Wright
SID719/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Wendy Wright
SID720/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Alison Smithers
SID721/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joanne Todd
SID722/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joan Louise Lambert
SID723/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter William Lambert
SID724/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Woodward
SID725/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Julie Woodward
SID726/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Cuttill
SID727/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Eric Boyd
SID728/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Anne Diley



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID729/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	James Wilson
SID730/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Matthew Wilson
SID731/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Catherine Wilson
SID732/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sylvia McBriar
SID733/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Katie Savage
SID734/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Savage
SID735/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Simon Jowett
SID736/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Emily Olivia Blanehard
SID737/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter Jowett
SID738/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kay Jowett
SID739/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Christopher Green

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID740/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tony Green
SID741/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Katherine Green
SID742/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Milagres Green
SID743/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Susan Carter
SID744/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Harry & Paul Savage
SID745/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Lazonby
SID746/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Susan Smith
SID747/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Smith
SID748/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Harvey Walker
SID749/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Barbara Walker
SID750/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Claire Maton

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID751/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Emily Flood
SID752/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kate Hind
SID753/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Marshall
SID754/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Glyn Welsby
SID755/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tracey Welsby
SID756/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Freda Gill
SID757/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Elizabeth Tuxford
SID758/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	George Tuxford
SID759/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Trevor Taylor
SID760/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Conor McGilligan
SID761/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jack McGilligan

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID762/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jacqueline McGilligan
SID763/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Diana Cuthbert
SID764/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter Cuthbert
SID765/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Rita Lavender
SID766/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Judi Steel
SID767/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Keith Lavender
SID768/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Steel
SID769/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jeanette Chavda
SID770/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Nitin Chavda
SID771/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Vanessa Jowett
SID772/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Matthew Jowett

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID773/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Walters
SID774/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Rollinson
SID775/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Doug Abernethy
SID776/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joseph Glover
SID777/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Catherine Mary Driver
SID778/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Anna Rollinson
SID779/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tom Harrington
SID780/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Wilson
SID781/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jeff Brewer
SID782/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kevin Reilly
SID783/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jane Harrington

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID784/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Richard Kingston
SID785/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robert Nigel Ellenker
SID786/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Will Jennings
SID787/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Julie Jennings
SID788/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter Jennings
SID789/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Malcolm Carter
SID790/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Wales
SID791/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Holly Lee
SID792/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joan Wales
SID793/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Judy Noble
SID794/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Victoria Green

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID795/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sharon Moore
SID796/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Catherine Tomlinson
SID797/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Eric Tomlinson
SID798/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jane Cuttill
SID799/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joanne Travena
SID800/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Alan Travena
SID801/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Avril Browne
SID802/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Donald Glenn
SID803/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Ian McGilligan
SID804/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Lynda Carr
SID805/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joyce Carr

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID806/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jane Blair
SID807/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Bishop
SID808/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Karen Cariss
SID809/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Roger Blair
SID810/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Christine Walters
SID811/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jordane Thompson
SID812/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Noble
SID813/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Roger Pryor
SID814/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Carol Marshman
SID815/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stuart Auton
SID816/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Diley



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID817/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Pauline Brill
SID818/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Andrew Hodgson
SID819/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Anthony Brill
SID820/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Alice Hirst
SID821/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Pamela Ogram
SID822/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Becki Linfoot
SID823/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Fiona Hirst
SID824/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Yvonne Dodd
SID826/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment given	Thomas Pilcher Homes
SID827/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment made	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID828/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Resident pledges support for Local Plan.	E E Hannah

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID829/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Resident pledges support for Local Plan.	R B Snowball
SID830/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Resident pledges support for Local Plan.	Carol & Steve Tear
SID831/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Resident pledges support for Local Plan.	David & Lois Cuthbertson
SID832/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Resident pledges support for Local Plan.	Fiona Mullin
SID842/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Peter Eaves
SID844/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I support and agree with City of York Council's processes, procedures, and justifications and I am satisfied that all documents are legally compliant.	Copmanthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Group - Diane Stones OBO
SID847/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I consider all documents comprising the draft local plan to be legally compliant.	Luke Condon
SID848/LC/Gen/1			No Comment Made	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes
SID849/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC			Oneill Associates (Janet O'Neill)OBO University of York
SID61/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Frequent errors in policies.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

### Soundness

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID2/S/Gen/1		Sound		Rachel Hallam
SID4/S/Gen/1		Sound	Endorses the plan.	Dennis Slights
SID19/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	General area comment about Haxby / Wigginton, already a large centre of population and there should not be development to extend it further as the infrastructure, particularly the roads, cannot cope. Needs new cycle route south into town as current provision is inadequate, more parking, shops and drainage capacity.	Graham and Pat Wilford
SID22/S/Gen/1		Sound	Believes so.	River Foss Society - John Millett
SID23/S/Gen/1		Sound	Believes council will have done everything by the book. Completely agrees with the submission from Towthorpe Parish Council.	Kevin Graham Ogilvy
SID25/S/Gen/1		Sound	Tried to engage with consultation process but found it difficult to understand and time consuming, frustrated at not being able to engage further.	Roger Dickinson
SID26/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Residents have not been involved in shaping the Local Plan. The Plan as it stands only benefits developers and harms communities.	Andrew Dickinson
SID28/S/Gen/1		Sound	Plan respects needs of people living in York.	Karen Gegg-Brega
SID38/S/Gen/1		Sound	After many consultations and alterations the current plan is the best that could be expected. Will never please everyone but the majority of residents can get behind this.	Andrew Bell
SID44/S/Gen/1		Sound	Meets the needs of the community, preserves the green belt as well as York's heritage and environment. Makes appropriate and balanced provision for infrastructure, transport and public services. Supports incremental expansion of villages to the south of York as opposed to large scale poorly built estates. Supports the plan in current format.	Kevin Smith
SID45/S/Gen/1		Sound	Plan meets the needs of the city, preserves the green belt and prevents outlying villages from being absorbed into the city. Supports the plan along with most residents of Earswick village.	W G Gambold
SID46/S/Gen/1		Sound	Plan is sound. It is sustainable, protects green belt and avoids urban creep.	P J Lawson
SID50/S/Gen/1		Sound	Moor Lane is to be protected. (Former ST10).	Ruth Bentley

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID57/S/Gen/1		Sound	Balances need for housing and protection of green belt.	Chris Sutton
SID58/S/Gen/1		Sound	Answers all questions asked.	Judy Sutton
SID61/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	P.11 Background, Higher education - wants information on how university will accommodate predicted numbers.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/2		Not Sound	P.11 Background, Green Belt. New draft green belt, since the 2005 green belt boundary (current) indicates an alteration to the green belt line so it does not match the settlement line of Poppleton to the rear of station road. No consultation with parish/ justification as to why the green belt line/ settlement should be altered. Oppose this.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/3		Not Sound	P.12 Background Strategically important aspects of York - no mention of ancient snickets regarded as significant attractions by english heritage.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/4		Not Sound	Pg.12 Background Green infrastructure, these are basically the essential flood plains by the river Ouse. Clear protection against catastrophic flooding in the centre but are not mentioned in policy.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/5		Not Sound	pg.12 Background biodiversity. SINC is a way to delay building on land till the price is right. Experienced a removal of SINC on York Business Park while developing the neighbourhood plan. It was too late to include them once large premises had been built on them. Loss of habitat and increase in standing traffic causes health issues.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/6		Not Sound	PG.13 Background Education. Large housing developments (ST1 and ST2) will have a large impact on schools. Particularly manor academy (manor school) which will need to expand - there is no mention of funding or capacity in the plan. Schools are at capacity.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/7		Not Sound	Pg.13 Background Expansion of the University of York. Where will future accommodation for students be built and how will it release accommodation within the city.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID61/S/Gen/8		Not Sound	Pg.14 Background Further education - no indication of expansion at York college or askham bryan	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/9		Not Sound	pg.15 Background Rail Transport Suggestion that railway halts will be built at Poppleton park and Haxby yet it is not within the remit of the local plan or CYC to develop these as they are the responsibility of the railway authority.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/10		Not Sound	Pg.15 Background Air Quality standing traffic is a major issue for breathing difficulties. Building houses will exacerbate issue.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/11		Not Sound	Pg.16 Background A timescale for the duration of the plan apart from 20 years. Date of plan should be flexible but there are no time dates on draft.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/12		Not Sound	Pg.16 Background Sustainable modes of transport - this needs to be specifically defined.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/13		Not Sound	pg.16 Background city centre. Loss of shopping/ increase in vacated shops will decrease visitor footfall.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/14		Not Sound	pg.17 Background No mention of former civil service grounds. Was taken out of neighbourhood plan by examiner as land was within green belt. It is a green field site with no building except club house (1% of area). Former civil service site is grade 2 agricultural land and not rough grazing as plan suggests. Former playing fields should be decommissioned to local communities who have lost this.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/15		Not Sound	pg.17 Background 2.13 its primary aim will be to preserve and enhance the special character and setting of York - would like a sentence added to reflect the historic and special character villages that have been on record for over 1000 years.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID61/S/Gen/16		Not Sound	pg.19 Background protecting residents - avoid use of flood plain areas. Many of the outlying areas there is episodic flooding i.e. Park and ride in Poppleton.	Nether Poppleton PC - James Mackman
SID62/S/Gen/1		Sound	Considers it sound.	David McKeeves
SID65/S/Gen/1		Sound	Plan is sound.	Daniel Sellers
SID68/S/Gen/1			#1 entire site - Northfield Lane (Triangle) - This is for the overall site but other representations have been submitted relating to individual parcels of land within the larger area encompassed by this representation. Those representations propose the allocation of various plots of land for housing and , employment and or a caravan park.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID78/S/Gen/1		Sound	My trust in CYC over some 18 years	Leonard Ogilvy
SID79/S/Gen/1		Sound	My trust in CYC over some 18 years	Annabelle Ogilvy
SID97/S/Gen/1		Sound	Plan considers future projections for the city as well as current home and business owners.	Allan Ashworth
SID98/S/Gen/1		Legally Compliant	Opposes development around the perimeter or outer area of York, should be skilled infill only. Areas of historic and or ecological value should be protected from development.	Helen Coursey
SID102/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Parish Council feels residents have never been properly consulted as to their needs and the Local Plan has simply been a 'desktop exercise' by CYC officers. Local Plan does not reflect local public need or opinion. Chair of council wishes to speak at public inquiry.	Elvington Parish Council - David Headlam
SID103/S/T2/5		Not Sound	In its current draft form the Local Plan is not sound, as it does not adhere to the strategic structure of a hierarchy of transport users as adopted in the LTP3. This hierarchy places provision for pedestrians, cyclists and public transport users, in that order, above provision for commercial vehicle traffic and private cars. York Civic Trust strongly endorses that hierarchy, and recommend that it forms the basis for the emerging LTP4, and for the Local Plan. However, the draft Local Plan only makes one passing reference to this hierarchy in para 14.18. While some policies on new developments (SS9, 10, 12, 13, 22) propose a target of 15% of journeys by public transport, no evidence is offered to justify that target; nor is any target offered for walking and cycling. To reinforce this sense of limited aspirations, there is a clear emphasis in the investment programme in Policy T4 that solutions will where possible be based on increases in capacity for private cars and commercial vehicles.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID104/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Sites to the north of the city (ST9, ST14, ST8, ST17, ST35) will exacerbate congestion on the outer ring road, adding to travel times and pollution. Conditions in AQMAs will deteriorate further. Does not see where additional jobs are coming from. Congestion in Haxby is particularly bad as it is, schools and doctors are at capacity. Infrastructure cannot handle additional demand. The homes that get built will not be affordable for local people working in the leisure / service sector.	Ann Andrews
SID105/S/Gen/1		Sound	Fully support the plan, would like to know why it has been so delayed.	David and Elizabeth McKeever
SID106/S/Gen/1			Plan is sound. Gives good protection of Greenbelt, and provides enough houses to combat affordability issues.	NDM 1
SID109/S/Gen/1			Plan is sound. Gives good protection of Greenbelt, and provides enough houses to combat affordability issues.	NDM 2
SID110/S/Gen/1		Sound	Protects the Green Belt, provides enough houses for York given that population projections will fall, believes plan will improve housing affordability.	C Blakemore
SID111/S/Gen/1		Sound	Protects the Green Belt, provides enough houses for York given that population projections will fall, believes plan will improve housing affordability.	A E Hardcastle
SID112/S/Gen/1		Sound	Protects the Green Belt, provides enough houses for York given that population projections will fall, believes plan will improve housing affordability.	A T & S Harvey
SID114/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	City's infrastructure cannot accommodate this level of growth, doing so will reduce quality of life for residents. Accepts more houses are needed but there must be an absolute limit to any city's population.	Ian Anderson
SID117/S/Gen/1		Sound	(blank)	Eunice Coates
SID118/S/Gen/3		Sound	Background section paragraphs referencing historic environment and city's heritage assets are sound. (paras 1.32, 1.38, 1.41, 1.51, 1.54)	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/Gen/3		Sound	Background section paragraphs referencing historic environment and city's heritage assets are sound. (paras 1.32, 1.38, 1.41, 1.51, 1.54)	Historic England - Ian Smith

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/S/Gen/4		Not Sound	The Vision doesn't adequately articulate the distinctiveness of the historic city. York's character is its main sellingpoint. It. the starting point for the Vision should be to ensure that whatever happens in York, does so in a manner which not only safeguards, but also strengthens, the city's unique character.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/Gen/4		Not Sound	The Vision doesn't adequately articulate the distinctiveness of the historic city. York's character is its main sellingpoint. It. the starting point for the Vision should be to ensure that whatever happens in York, does so in a manner which not only safeguards, but also strengthens, the city's unique character.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/Gen/5		Sound	Para 2.3 iand 2.8 are sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/Gen/5		Sound	Para 2.3 iand 2.8 are sound.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID119/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	section 2.14 on Page 19 of the Local Plan Document does refer to an aspiration to achieve some of the aims of the WaterFramework Directive. It is still EA's view that specific policy wording should be present in the plan to require developers to meet the requirements of the WFD. It was discussed that wording could be added to Policy DP2. As it currently stands, if you incorporate some appropriate policy wording into your plan, we would have no reason to find the plan unsound for lack of consideration of WFD, however, if this wording is not incorporated then we would have to consider the plan unsound.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID120/S/Gen/1		Sound	(blank)	Martin Lumley-Holmes
SID121/S/Gen/1		Sound	Satisfied the plan meets all of York's development needs, is legally compliant and can be delivered. Looking forward to the railway station at Haxby.	Deborah Lumley-Holmes



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID122/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The Racecourse is keen to ensure that it has the support and ability to adapt and modernise when necessary, not only from the COYC, but also within the emerging draft Local Plan. In the future, it must be able to upgrade its facilities in order to bring them up to a suitable standard befitting of one of the UK's top racecourses. It is therefore important that these contributions of the racecourse as a key visitor and tourism generator are recognised by the COYC in the Local Plan. It is critical that the Racecourse can continue to be competitive as a global racing venue, and host significant social and cultural events. As a whole, the Publication Draft Local Plan makes little reference to the Racecourse and its contribution as a successful venue for tourism and conferencing, as well as its contributions to the economic, social and environmental sustainability of York as mentioned above. We made a number of comments in response to the pre-publication draft (letter dated 30th October 2017), and few changes appear to have resulted in the policies and sections of the Local Plan on which we commented.	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse
SID122/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	In terms of paragraph 182 of the NPPF, the Local Plan in its current form cannot be considered sound, as it does not have a proportionate evidence base for to justify the amendments to the Green Belt boundary. It is also inconsistent with national policy in relation to its approach to the Green Belt boundary, support for sustainable leisure developments, and strategic priorities for York have not been defined.	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse
SID130/S/Gen/1		Sound	Supports and agrees with City of York Council's processes, procedures and justified, is satisfied that all documents past the test of soundness. Believes the draft Local Plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs, whilst also protecting the Green Belt, preserving the unique character and setting of York, and maintaining the amenity, sustainability, and resilience of Copmanthorpe.	Dean King
SID131/S/Gen/1		Sound	It is sustainable.	Shahin Fatheazam
SID132/S/Gen/2				Network Rail - Diane Cragg
SID136/S/Gen/1		Sound	It is positively prepared, consistent with national policy, takes into account safeguarding of historic villages and is an effective plan.	Daniel Petty
SID137/S/Gen/1		Sound	It is positively prepared, consistent with national policy, takes into account safeguarding of historic villages and is an effective plan.	Shireen Petty

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID138/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan has been subject to many consultations, amendments and agreements. It is now crucial that the plan is enacted without further delay. Particularly approves the way it has dovetailed into the Earswick Neighbourhood plan and protects the countryside, green spaces and ecology in the parish.	John Sharpe
SID140/S/Gen/1		Sound	Huntington's Neighbourhood Plan had five different sites for development requests. The preferred choice of ST8 was the eventual site chosen, and the residents request for the remaining green areas to be given green belt protection was granted.	Huntington Parish Council - David Jobling
SID141/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The lack of key evidence and Council's avoidance of Officer advice raises issues of soundness.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Oakgate Caddick Groups
SID142/S/Gen/1		Sound	Considers it sound.	Rob Jones
SID146/S/Gen/1		Sound	Supports plan	Gill Offer
SID149/S/Gen/1		Sound	Proposed figure maximum the city can accommodate. Preserves environment, prevents urban creep, uses brownfield sites.	Susan, Paul, Zoe, Gina and Kate Blenkiron
SID152/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	1 I am not satisfied that there is sufficient commitment to ensure infrastructure improvements are carried out prior to developments taking place, especially with reference to ST9 Haxby.2 I am of the belief that most people will seek employment in Leeds and, as such, it seems that more development should have been planned to the South side of the City, adjacent to the A64.3 Any developments in the Haxby and Wigginton areas should be located such that construction and consequential residential traffic does not have to pass through the villages4 The road system into York from Haxby and Wigginton, and within the City Centre, is inadequate to cope with any increase of traffic at peak times5 There is no provision in the plan for railway stations at Haxby/Strensall or York Hospital, which could alleviate some of the anticipated problems	David Painter
SID155/S/Gen/1		Sound	I consider the document to be sound as the plan is a sustainable framework for future development of housing in York.	Mark Waterley
SID159/S/Gen/1		Sound	Plan has full support.	Peter Sokolow

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID161/LC/Gen/1		Sound	Good judgement has been shown in that many locations were selected initially but after careful consideration of all the available facts some have been rejected on a very sound basis and reflect future requirements and the will of the people, leaving a strong and sustainable Local Plan.	Philip Turner
SID162/S/Gen/1		Sound	It is in the best interests of the community at large and meets local requirements, which presumably is what the Local Plan is all about.	Kathleen Turner
SID167/S/Gen/1		Sound	Not qualified / has the knowledge to say, assumes the plan is sound.	Janet Teather
SID168/S/Gen/1		Sound	Professional advice makes this most likely.	Alan Terence James
SID169/S/Gen/1		Sound	Believes the plan is sound.	Ellen Walton
SID170/S/Gen/1		Sound	City of York Council have proposed a plan which enables development of the City of York which is sufficient but not excessive. It therefore demonstrates good judgement. In relationship to Copmanthorpe, the Draft Local Plan has close agreement with the draft Copmanthorpe Neighbourhood Plan.	Robert West
SID172/S/Gen/1		Sound	Believes the evidence base to be sound, that the plan sets out a deliverable vision for the provision of much needed housing.	Cllr Stephen Fenton
SID173/S/Gen/1		Sound	The Plan has been positively prepared, is effective, justified and consistent with national policy.	Julia Garnham
SID179/S/Gen/1		Sound	Supports plan.	Barry O'Connor
SID181/S/Gen/1			Sites need to be reconsidered due to timespans of delivery:ST5 -York Central which will deliver units beyond the Plan period;ST14 —Land west of Wiggington Road which will deliver units post the Plan period;ST15 —Land west of Elvington Lane which will deliver units beyond the Plan period;ST35 —Queen Elizabeth Barracks which has very many complex issues to be addressed before it is delivered and is not yet available;ST36 — Imphal Barracks which will only deliver units post the Plan period,and again is not currently available and will have very many issues to address before delivery could come forward.Emphasises failure to deliver housing now.	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID182/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Text in About the Plan require clarification re the Plan Period. Given there is no Safeguarded Land in the Plan, it is clear the Plan fails to justify the 2038 end date with the allocations as presented in Trajectory	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd
SID183/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Feels that the consultation process has been purposely complicated to put members of the public off responding. Feels previous objections should be reused.	Emma Yates
SID187/S/Gen/1		Sound	Support the proposed housing.	Ryedale DC
SID192/Mod/Gen/1				Selby District Council Clare Dickinson
SID199/S/Gen/1			CYC failed to make clear whether ST14 is a standalone sustainable settlement or a loose extension to existing urban area.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison
SID204/S/Gen/1		Sound	The document has been prepared to support the Council's strategy for the development of the city. It is evidence based, deliverable and consistent with national policies.	Chris Polack
SID213/S/Gen/1		Sound	Raises no objections to CYC's Local Plan Publication	Hambleton District Council James Campbell
SID225/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	More housing is detrimental to the environment and this should be a key consideration.	Jane Granville
SID226/S/Gen/1		Sound		Susan & Ralph Major
SID228/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Insufficient provision for smaller light-industrial business space.	Jason Ironside

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID232/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Several key issues and policies within the draft Local Plan depend to varying extent upon a number of Supplementary Planning Documents which appear as yet to be undrafted and thus far have not been subject to consultation. In the absence of these detailed supplementary documents how can government, residents and businesses be confident that the policies within the plan are or will be deliverable?	Stephen Lornie
SID235/S/Gen/1		Sound		Alan Charlesworth
SID247/S/Gen/4			The Trustees are concerned that no evidence is being presented in relation to a Green Belt Review and the limited approach to establishing a definitive Green Belt boundary along with the apparent lack of long term planning and no safeguarded land to meet the needs beyond the Plan period.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge
SID247/S/Gen/5			The Trustees consider that a more sub-regional and strategic approach to housing delivery in York needs to be considered. Such an approach would combine with the delivery of housing to meet the needs of York residents together with meeting the needs of the sub-region and deliver on the housing requirement and the economic growth aspirations for YNYER and Yorkshire and the Humber as a whole.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge
SID255/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The Local Plan document states that the plan covers the period from 2017 to 2032/33 with the exception of the Green Belt boundaries which will endure up to 2037/38. However, it is evident that other policies within the plan also include information to the period to 2037/38. This appears to provide opportunity for confusion and it is considered that it may be more appropriate to move to a consistent plan period to 2037/38.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID255/S/Gen/2		Not Sound	It is also noted that the 2032/33 plan period will not ensure a 15 year time horizon post adoption as preferred by the NPPF, paragraph 157. Whilst it is recognised this may have implications for the evidence base, site allocations and plan policies the HBF recommends that the Council considers extending the end date of the Plan.	Home Builders Federation - Joanne Harding
SID272/S/Gen/1		Sound	I consider all documents to be sound. I support and agree with CYC processes, procedures and justification and I am satisfied that all documents meet all tests of soundness. I believe the draft Plan strikes a correct balance between providing homes and jobs York needs whilst protecting the green belt, preserving the unique character and setting of York and maintaining the amenity sustainability and resilience of Copmanthorpe - the community in which I live.	Rachel Cole
SID273/S/Gen/1		Sound		Margaret Thomas
SID278/S/Gen/1		Sound		Gillian Hinton

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID280/S/Gen/1		Sound	This draft plan is as sound as it can be possibly be given the unique medieval constraints of York.	John & Dorothy Lawton
SID282/S/Gen/1		Sound	I believe the Plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs that York needs whilst also protecting the Green Belt and the unique character of York.	Barrie Moore
SID284/S/Gen/1		Sound		Alisdair & Rosie Dunn
SID286/S/Gen/1		Sound	I consider the plan meets the definitions of 'Soundness' but regret that there are no plans for employment opportunities in Copmanthorpe village.	John Martin Pickard
SID287/S/Gen/1			This information is not supplied.	Katherine Pickard
SID292/S/Gen/1		Sound	Agrees it is sound.	Janice Mountford
SID301/S/Gen/1		Sound		Copmanthorpe Parish Council - Diane Stones
SID302/S/Gen/1		Sound		Jeffrey Clarke
SID303/S/Gen/1		Sound	I consider all documents comprising the draft local plan to be sound~ In	Ian Moir
SID306/LC/Gen/1		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	Y Boynton
SID307/LC/Gen/1		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	G Greetham
SID308/LC/Gen/1		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	NDM 3
SID309/LC/Gen/1		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	Brian L Bell

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID310/LC/Gen/1		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	Richard Rafton
SID311/LC/Gen/1		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	M Ellis
SID312/S/Gen/1			Supportive of LP Publication Draft. Plan protects York's Greenbelt, provides enough housing. From 500 houses per annum to 1000 houses per annum, affordability will be improved.	Mrs & Miss J & M Frost
SID313/S/Gen/1			Supportive of LP Publication Draft. Plan protects York's Greenbelt, provides enough housing. From 500 houses per annum to 1000 houses per annum, affordability will be improved.	J Scott
SID314/S/Gen/1			Supportive of LP Publication Draft. Plan protects York's Greenbelt, provides enough housing. From 500 houses per annum to 1000 houses per annum, affordability will be improved.	NDM 4
SID315/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Overall assessment of housing requirements unsound. No feasibility work undertaken for MOD land at Strensall and Imphal Barracks. Current affordable housing policies will fall short of demand. Plan is incapable of delivery in plan period.	Robert Leslie Towner
SID316/S/Gen/1		Sound		Stuart Kay
SID317/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	2018 Plan is unsound because it is not accomodating York's housing needs. Agree that allocation for larger housing sites is required but it also remains that an allocation of smaller sites should be considered aswell.	Geoffrey Nurse
SID318/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Please refer to attached detailed comments.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID318/S/Gen/1				Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID318/S/Gen/1			Supports Gen.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID318/S/Gen/2			Vision and Development: Support of Paragraphs 2.10,2.12,2.13 & 2.15.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID318/S/Gen/2			Supports Gen.	Strensall with Towthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Steering Group - Anthony Keith Marquis
SID319/S/Gen/1		Sound	The Plan has been positively prepared in a way that meets the need for housing and other development including infrastructure and business development. The plan is based on evidence and is the most appropriate strategy. The plan is deliverable and will enable sustainable development and is consistent with the policies in the NPPF.	Raymond Barnes OBO F R & K Handley
SID322/S/Gen/1		Sound	Plan is well prepared.	Alan Kirkham
SID323/S/Gen/1		Sound	Plan is well prepared.	Helene Kirkham
SID332/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Suggested Housing Trajectory (Fig. 5.1 and Table 5.2) shows unrealistically high completion rates for 2020-2023 and the plan is therefore UNSOUND.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID332/S/Gen/2			Evidence not considered or ignored and constructive policy making has not taken place. Plan depends almost entirely on private sector. Plan is UNSOUND.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe
SID337/S/Gen/1		Sound	Strong support for the draft Local Plan including the decision to use Brownfield sites to avoid greenbelt land, the respect for biodiversity, the development of housing for the future, and the maintainence of the York's historic character.	Stephen Kirkham
SID340/S/Gen/1		Sound	We are emailing you to register our support for the current version of the Local Plan (2018).	Mr & Mrs Fisher
SID344/S/Gen/1			National Grid owns and operates the high voltage electricity transmission system in England and Wales and operates the Scottish high voltage transmission system. National Grid also owns and operates the gas transmission system. Specific Comments: Proposed sites crossed or in close proximity to National Grid infrastructure: Electricity Transmission•ST1 -British Sugar/Manor School (our reference ET186)•ST7 - Land East of Metcalfe Lane (our reference ET186) (see enclosed plan referenced ET186 at Appendix 1.) National Grid prefers that buildings are not built directly beneath its overhead lines. This is for two reasons, the amenity of potential occupiers of properties in the vicinity of lines and because National Grid needs quick and easy access to carry out maintenance of its equipment to ensure that it can be returned to service and be available as part of the national transmission system. National Grid seeks to encourage high quality and well planned development in the vicinity of its high voltage overhead lines. National Grid is happy to provide advice and guidance to the Council concerning our networks Please remember to consult National Grid on any Development Plan Document (DPD) or site-specificproposals that could affect our infrastructure	Amec Foster Wheeler (Hannah Bevins) OBO National Grid
SID346/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	I do not consider the response form to be sound as the questions are leading questions and pitched above the normal person. The on line form is also restrictive in that short time limits are imposed to get pages complete.	Chris Slade
SID346/S/Gen/2			The Local Plan document as a whole is not sound as it has not been positively prepared. It has been hurriedly prepared and despite being criticised in the past has not changed substantially since the first draft. I do not feel it meets objectively assessed development and infrastructure requirements at all and ramble areas of land have been selected taking up valuable green belt when perfectly good and usable Brownfield sites have been left out of the considerations or allocated for less appropriate uses. This is not consistent with sustainable development.	Chris Slade
SID359/S/Gen/1			Placing Clifton Moor Hospital Site in Green Belt is UNSOUND as sites does not perform any of Green Belt purposes set out in Paragraph 80 of NPPF.	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO NHS Property Services

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID364/S/Gen/1		Not Sound		York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/S/Gen/3			Issues with prosperity for all, impact on communities, healing of unequal conditions, economy, housing provision, transport, sustainable communities, risk assessment and flexibility.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/Gen/1		Not Sound		York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/S/Gen/3			Issues with prosperity for all, impact on communities, healing of unequal conditions, economy, housing provision, transport, sustainable communities, risk assessment and flexibility.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID366/S/Gen/1		Sound		Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services
SID367/S/Gen/1		Sound	Overall, I judge that the City of York Local Plan Publication Draft to be a 'sound' document.	Keith Massheder
SID367/S/Gen/2			Overall, I judge that the City of York Policies Map to be a 'sound' document.	Keith Massheder
SID367/S/Gen/3			Overall, I judge that the City of York Sustainability Appraisal and Strategic Environmental Assessment to be a 'sound' document.	Keith Massheder
SID374/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Failure to analyse the transport challenges faced by the city. The summary of the transport context and the resulting transport policies are not grounded on any comprehensive analysis of the transport challenges facing the city now and in the lifetime of the Local Plan. A clear analysis is needed of the expected impacts on congestion, accessibility, the environment and public health. The only analysis offered is in the 2017 Transport Topic Paper, whose results are presented in paras 15.15-17. This is out of date - it is incomplete.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/S/Gen/2		Not Sound	The transport policy statements should be justified throughout on the basis of a full set of policy objectives, which in turn should reflect those in the SEA.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID374/S/Gen/3		Not Sound	LTP3 adopted, as a strategic structure, a hierarchy of transport users, which placed provision for pedestrians, cyclists and public transport users, in that order, above provision for commercial vehicle traffic and private cars. We strongly endorse that hierarchy, and recommend that it forms the basis for the emerging LTP4, and for the Local Plan. However, the draft Local Plan only makes one passing reference to this hierarchy in para 14.18	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID377/S/Gen/1		Sound	I am writing in support of the draft Local Plan which is currently out for consultation.	John Williams
SID378/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The Plan does not meet the City's full objectively assessed housing needs of the City. As a consequence, the Plan is presently unsound in this aspect.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/Gen/2		Not Sound	Paragraph 3.62 to 3.68 (inclusive) relate to Policy SS13 which is not sound for the reasons outlined in the attached Representations to the City of York Local Plan Report (Quod, March 2018). Any changes to Policy SS13, may require consequent changes to the Explanation (at paragraph 3.62-3.68) of Policy SS13.	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID379/S/Gen/1		Sound	Other than my points that follow, the document seems broadly "sound" to my untutored eye.	Colin Packer
SID380/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	See following comments.	Lichfields (Lucy Bullock) OBO Hungate (York) Regeneration Ltd
SID385/S/GEN/1		Sound	Y	Giles Carter
SID392/S/Gen/1		Sound	York is the largest centre in our area and a major economic asset. It is in an important entity in its own right and exerts an influence over much the of LEP area. It has particular economic strengths and opportunities and has a key role in achieving the LEP's strategic aims of lifting productivity and wage levels through growth in high value sectors. However, the special character of the city and its traffic congestion create challenges in accommodating much needed housing and economic growth.	Rydale District Council - Julian Rudd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID393/S/Gen/1		Sound	Overall, I judge that the City of York: Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies Map, Sustainability Appraisal and Strategic Environmental Assessment to be 'sound' documents. However, more specifically, I feel the following principles within the current draft of the Local Plan are crucial for the future development of York: The plan gives good protection of York's Greenbelt, protecting our unique City. Given that population figures are predicted to be lower than estimated by the Government, the plan provides enough houses for the people of York. From delivering roughly 500 houses per annum, to nearly 1000 house per annum, I believe that through the housing delivered under the plan, affordability will be improved in York. I am confident that with the current draft of the Local Plan, York will be able to provide sustainable development across the City and deliver a balance between providing new homes and delivering more employment, whilst protecting the City's special character.	Cllr N Ayre
SID394/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The plan is not 'positively prepared' because it would not meet the city area's objectively assessed development requirements and fails to provide adequate allocations to meet the demand for specialist older persons' housing; The plan is not 'justified' because it is not based on the evidence base and is not the most appropriate strategy when considered against reasonable alternatives; The plan is not 'effective' due to lack of deliverability and flexibility; and The plan is not 'consistent with national policy' because it would not enable the delivery of sustainable development in accordance with the policies in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF).	The Planning Bureau (Stephen Courcier) OBO McCarthy & Stone Retirement Lifestyles Ltd
SID399/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan is sound and its housing need figure of 867 dwellings per annum is based on the real needs of the city.	Anthony (Tony) Hainsworth Fisher
SID401/S/Gen/1		Not Sound		Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID404/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	In relation to the Transport Topic Paper: Figure 1 identifies 'Congestion pain', but makes no reference to the use of public transport. Stage 2 (para iv) ignores any attempt to reduce demand by encouraging greater use of public transport and increasing the current range and frequency of bus and park & ride services or provision of a new railway station at Haxby or other well researched sites. A much wider study is required which a) takes into account the transport requirements of the proposals for housing, employment and industry developments set out in the Local Plan; b) Does not assume that demand should or could be met; c) Fully explores the potential for public transport interventions; d) Considers the wider impacts recommended by the Treasury's 'Green Book' - particularly on the environment and air quality.	York Bus Forum - Graham Collett

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID404/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Consider the Transport section and polices & supporting Transport Topic Paper completely inadequate, not properly prepared, nor justified, nor effective and not inline with NPPF. Issues v well explained in York Environment Forum Transport Group's submission (see submission SID 374 for more info) which is supported by this organisation. This submission will primarily focus on the public transport aspects, but are also concerned about the 30% increase in travel time & 55% increase in peak hour congestion, air quality, noise, quality of life, travel delays.	York Bus Forum - Graham Collett
SID405/S/Gen		Sound	Supports plan.	Zoe Williams
SID411/S/Gen/1		Sound	Believes document is sound.	Lance Racey & Tracey Harrison- Racey
SID415/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	See LC comments.	Anthony Dennis
SID417/S/Gen/1		Sound		Cllr Ian Cuthbertson
SID425/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	M Christian
SID426/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	K Everson
SID427/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	M Moore
SID428/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	C Forth
SID429/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	F Zannar
SID430/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Michael & June Baker
SID431/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Colin & Diana Waite
SID432/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Jane Birch

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID433/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	P A & BI Gowland
SID434/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	C & DA Bicknell
SID435/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	John Cairns
SID436/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Sarah Cunningham
SID437/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs C Pickup
SID438/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Catherine Cooper
SID439/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	K Pink
SID440/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	L Talbot
SID441/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	R Talbot
SID442/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Paula Fiona Evans
SID443/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Marjorie Rhodes
SID444/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	D Johnston
SID445/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	S Pysanczyn
SID446/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	John Richardson
SID447/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	C Hudson
SID448/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	D Foster

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID449/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs P Dobson
SID450/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	J Fell
SID451/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	V G Ridsdale
SID452/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	GR Healey
SID453/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Andy Hinds
SID454/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	AR Munday
SID455/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Jack Sargent
SID456/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	D S Boyne & MD Hudson
SID457/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	C S Hall
SID458/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Elaine Batchelor
SID459/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Robin & Carol Bardy
SID460/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Sue Nutbrown
SID461/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Jane Johnson
SID462/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Neville While
SID463/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	RG Kitt

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID464/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Donald Jamieson
SID465/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	David Braithewaite
SID466/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	B & JR Smith
SID467/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Anne Braithewaite
SID468/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	N & J Clarkson
SID469/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	K A Iveson
SID470/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	David & Emma Blockley & Waddington
SID471/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	D & S Holding
SID472/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	B Kale
SID473/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	SM & PG Ashton
SID474/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs L Stones
SID475/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	A Taylor
SID476/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	A & N Mossman & Green
SID477/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Eric Armitage
SID478/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	J Livingstone



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID479/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	T Hurley
SID480/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Pauline Ingram
SID481/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Emma Baines
SID482/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Jessica Newdick
SID483/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs D Taylor
SID484/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	K Stones
SID485/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	I Davey
SID486/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Thomas Baines
SID487/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	J Craggs
SID488/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Angela Henry
SID489/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Michael Wood
SID490/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	S Chapman
SID491/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Bulmer Haukins
SID492/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Jane & David Hardcastle & Lovell
SID493/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	B Molloy

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID494/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Helen Barrett
SID495/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs J W McKelvie
SID496/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	D N Craven
SID497/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Brian Hutton
SID498/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	JA & PA Foster
SID499/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Amanda Rhodes
SID500/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	R Rylott
SID501/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs Sage
SID502/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Elaine Hardcastle
SID503/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Michael Reeder
SID504/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Kenneth Atack
SID505/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Liam Rapp
SID506/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	C Cunningham
SID507/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Ryan Cochrane
SID508/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Graham Scott

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID509/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	HG & CM Murray
SID510/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Ken Richardson
SID511/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	John Major
SID512/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Helen Renshaw
SID513/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	O J Sherwood
SID514/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Beryl Coates
SID515/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs M Jones
SID516/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs S Briggs
SID517/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	W A Sellers
SID518/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	K Brookes
SID519/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Emma Booth
SID520/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	C Stkinson
SID521/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Jim Shanks
SID522/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Andrew & Deryn Gott
SID523/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	S Wakefield

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID524/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Susan Adams
SID525/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	V Jowitt
SID526/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	J Radford
SID527/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Pauline Bailey
SID528/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Sue Gentle
SID529/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Henry Stewart & Wendy Atkinson
SID530/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	V Duffield
SID531/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Emma Booth
SID532/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs P Jeffrey
SID533/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs J Wakes
SID534/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs GR Walker
SID535/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mrs Harrison
SID536/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Martin & Clare Bradnam
SID537/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs B Atkinson
SID538/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Christine Hainsworth

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID539/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	E Cummins
SID540/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	R Davison
SID541/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Ann Briggs
SID542/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs J Askham
SID543/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs B Hields
SID544/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Dean & Angela Cockran
SID545/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Felicity Paterson
SID546/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Jane Rhodes
SID547/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	P A Inwood
SID548/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	R Senior
SID549/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	A Woodward
SID550/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	PJ Moore
SID551/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Peter & Caroline Haynes
SID552/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Valerie Thatcher
SID553/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	W Gora

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID554/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs A Brownlie
SID555/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	L J Roberts
SID556/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	P Eastwood
SID557/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	S & I Gymer
SID558/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs Maher
SID559/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Fraser Tuddenham
SID560/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	C D Marwood
SID561/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	David Newman
SID562/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Barrie Corkill
SID563/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	M Duncanson
SID564/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	SD & AF Rose
SID565/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Lynne Callington
SID566/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs P M L Page
SID567/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Gwyneth & Peter
SID568/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	I Fletcher
SID569/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	C H Bell

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID570/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs J Whipp
SID571/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	R & CM Turner
SID572/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Kathleen Lovatt
SID573/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	David Trayhorn
SID574/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	NDM 7
SID575/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	NDM 8
SID576/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	NDM 9
SID577/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	NDM 10
SID578/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Ian & Anita Carr
SID579/S/Gen/1		Sound		M A Howarth
SID580/S/Gen/1		Sound		Steve Cruwys
SID582/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	We consider that the Publication Draft Local Plan as currently drafted fails to meet these four tests of soundness.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID583/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	We consider that the Publication Local Plan as currently drafted fails to meet these four tests of soundness.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	We consider that the Publication Local Plan as currently drafted fails to meet these four tests of soundness.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID604/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The Vision and Outcomes are not justified or effective as they are not backed by sufficient evidence and positive policies to meet the identified housing need.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID612/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The Council does not appear to have taken on board any comments made in relation to the Pre-Publication draft. We are concerned whether the Council has reviewed any comments made as part of the last round of consultation, and have serious concerns in relation to the soundness of the Plan and whether the Council has taken the consultation process seriously.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO JRHT
SID613/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The Council does not appear to have taken on board any comments made in relation to the Pre-Publication draft. We are concerned whether the Council has reviewed any comments made as part of the last round of consultation, and have serious concerns in relation to the soundness of the Plan and whether the Council has taken the consultation process seriously.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Askham Bryan College
SID616/S/Gen/1			Limited coal mining legacy in the York City area with records indicating the presence of only two mine entries. No specific comments to make.	The Coal Authority
SID618/S/Gen/1		Sound	In my opinion the careful and thoughtful planning that has gone in to the Local Plan will help support the City for many generations.	Julie Ainsworth
SID622/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Linda Beilby
SID623/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Alison & John



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID624/S/Gen/1		Sound	With reservations	D E Wetton
SID625/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Roy Brown
SID626/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Ian Richardson
SID627/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mike Sutton-Croft
SID628/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Robert Fitzgerald
SID629/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs Ruder
SID630/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	R Maher
SID631/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	S R Blackburn
SID632/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	F Skilbeck
SID633/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	NDM 11
SID634/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Victor Holt
SID635/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	Mr & Mrs M J Stannard
SID636/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	NDM 12
SID637/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	No comment made	Particia & Mark Horner
SID638/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	No comment made	R W Wood

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID639/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	No comment made	M Chapman
SID640/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	No comment made	M Evans
SID641/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	No comment made	Donald Simpson
SID642/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	No comment made	Katie & Matthew Driscoll
SID643/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	No comment made	Mrs Smith
SID644/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	No comment made	Margaret Dale
SID645/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	No comment made	Chris Winterburn
SID646/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	No comment made	Barry Metcalf
SID647/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	J Moon
SID648/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	P J Slater
SID649/S/Gen/1		Sound		Audrey Miller
SID650/S/Gen/1		Sound	No comment made	E & DM Scarlett
SID651/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Carr
SID652/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Hind

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID653/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Oliver Hind
SID654/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Michael Fedyszyn
SID655/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Hilary Fedyszyn
SID656/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Daniel Buckley
SID657/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Timothy Duffy
SID658/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kristen Buckley
SID659/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Emily McLaughlin
SID660/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paula McLaughlin
SID661/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Christopher McLaughlin
SID662/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Margaret Moxon
SID663/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Moira Law

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID664/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robert Law
SID665/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Brian Ferguson
SID666/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Hirst
SID667/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Grace Hirst
SID668/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Findlay Wallace
SID669/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joan Wallace
SID670/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tim Harrison
SID671/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Phoebe Harrison
SID672/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Bryony Harrison
SID673/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	James Ogram
SID674/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Eric Wilson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID675/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Diane Brownlee
SID676/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Irene Wilson
SID677/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Lenore Janet Hill
SID678/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Grewer
SID679/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robert Brownlee
SID680/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Linda Hill
SID681/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Clare Frisby
SID682/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Carol Ferguson
SID683/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Heather Heeles
SID684/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Ronald Hill
SID685/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Colin Perrott

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID686/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Ruth Perrott
SID687/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Adams
SID688/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Gillian Adams
SID689/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Michael Buckley
SID690/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Karen Buckley
SID691/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Beverley Duffy
SID692/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Greenaway
SID693/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sally Greenaway
SID694/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Abigail Sutton
SID695/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	William Marsh
SID696/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Bernadette Sutton

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID697/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sue Glenn
SID698/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Hazel Sedman
SID699/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	James Muldoon
SID700/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Karen Kingston
SID701/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Janet Muldoon
SID702/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tony Morton
SID703/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	June Morton
SID704/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jonathan Browne
SID705/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Darren Robson
SID706/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Hurst
SID707/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Hogarth

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID708/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Sutton
SID709/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Julie Tink
SID710/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Graham Tink
SID711/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Andrew Milner
SID712/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sue Nightingale
SID713/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Keren Hunter
SID714/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Gillian Hodgson
SID715/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robyn Hodgson
SID716/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Richard Muldoon
SID717/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Claire & Paul Savage
SID718/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Michael Wright



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID719/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Wendy Wright
SID720/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Alison Smithers
SID721/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joanne Todd
SID722/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joan Louise Lambert
SID723/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter William Lambert
SID724/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Woodward
SID725/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Julie Woodward
SID726/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Cuttill
SID727/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Eric Boyd
SID728/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Anne Diley
SID729/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	James Wilson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID730/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Matthew Wilson
SID731/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Catherine Wilson
SID732/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sylvia McBriar
SID733/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Katie Savage
SID734/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Savage
SID735/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Simon Jowett
SID736/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Emily Olivia Blanehard
SID737/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter Jowett
SID738/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kay Jowett
SID739/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Christopher Green
SID740/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tony Green

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID741/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Katherine Green
SID742/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Milagres Green
SID743/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Susan Carter
SID744/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Harry & Paul Savage
SID745/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Lazonby
SID746/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Susan Smith
SID747/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Smith
SID748/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Harvey Walker
SID749/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Barbara Walker
SID750/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Claire Maton
SID751/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Emily Flood

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID752/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kate Hind
SID753/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Marshall
SID754/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Glyn Welsby
SID755/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tracey Welsby
SID756/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Freda Gill
SID757/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Elizabeth Tuxford
SID758/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	George Tuxford
SID759/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Trevor Taylor
SID760/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Conor McGilligan
SID761/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jack McGilligan
SID762/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jacqueline McGilligan

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID763/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Diana Cuthbert
SID764/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter Cuthbert
SID765/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Rita Lavender
SID766/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Judi Steel
SID767/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Keith Lavender
SID768/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Steel
SID769/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jeanette Chavda
SID770/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Nitin Chavda
SID771/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Vanessa Jowett
SID772/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Matthew Jowett
SID773/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Walters

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID774/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Rollinson
SID775/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Doug Abernethy
SID776/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joseph Glover
SID777/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Catherine Mary Driver
SID778/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Anna Rollinson
SID779/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tom Harrington
SID780/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Wilson
SID781/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jeff Brewer
SID782/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kevin Reilly
SID783/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jane Harrington
SID784/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Richard Kingston

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID785/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robert Nigel Ellenker
SID786/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Will Jennings
SID787/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Julie Jennings
SID788/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter Jennings
SID789/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Malcolm Carter
SID790/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Wales
SID791/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Holly Lee
SID792/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joan Wales
SID793/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Judy Noble
SID794/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Victoria Green
SID795/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sharon Moore

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID796/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Catherine Tomlinson
SID797/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Eric Tomlinson
SID798/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jane Cuttill
SID799/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joanne Travena
SID800/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Alan Travena
SID801/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Avril Browne
SID802/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Donald Glenn
SID803/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Ian McGilligan
SID804/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Lynda Carr
SID805/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joyce Carr
SID806/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jane Blair



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID807/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Bishop
SID808/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Karen Cariss
SID809/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Roger Blair
SID810/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Christine Walters
SID811/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jordane Thompson
SID812/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Noble
SID813/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Roger Pryor
SID814/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Carol Marshman
SID815/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stuart Auton
SID816/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Diley
SID817/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Pauline Brill

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID818/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Andrew Hodgson
SID819/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Anthony Brill
SID820/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Alice Hirst
SID821/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Pamela Ogram
SID822/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Becki Linfoot
SID823/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Fiona Hirst
SID824/S/Gen/1		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Yvonne Dodd
SID829/S/Gen/1		Sound	Resident pledges support for Local Plan.	E E Hannah
SID829/S/Gen/1		Sound	Resident pledges support for Local Plan.	R B Snowball
SID830/S/Gen/1		Sound	Resident pledges support for Local Plan.	Carol & Steve Tear
SID831/S/Gen/1		Sound	Resident pledges support for Local Plan.	David & Lois Cuthbertson
SID832/S/Gen/1		Sound	Resident pledges support for Local Plan.	Fiona Mullin

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID833/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The Plan is not based on proportionate evidence. The evidence is not adequate to address the designations as concluded on the Proposals Maps. The Plan fails to set out reasoned justification based on evidence that lead to the conclusions which determine the location of the boundaries and the status of settlements within the York green belt.	George E Wright Combined
SID824/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	These representations relate to the green belt boundary and non-allocation of land for development at Grimston Bar and are underpinned by general comments relating to the Council's approach to the definition of green belt boundaries, to housing provision and distribution and to the lack of flexibility in the plan (see attached Statement headed "Land at Grimston Bar"). Alt site 181 including part of former ST6.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO Grimston Bar Development Group ST6 Site 181
SID839/S/Gen/1		Sound	Overall, I judge that the City of York: Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies Map, Sustainability Appraisal and Strategic Environmental Assessment to be 'sound' documents.	Della Johnson
SID842/S/Gen/2			I believe Germany-Beck should not have been approved. Fulford road is already practically grid-locked all day.	Peter Eaves
SID844/S/Gen/1		Sound	I support and agree with City of York Council's processes, procedures, and justifications and I am satisfied that all documents meet all the tests of soundness.	Copmanthorpe Neighbourhood Plan Group - Diane Stones OBO
SID845/S/Gen/1		Sound	Overall, I judge that the City of York: Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies Map, Sustainability Appraisal and Strategic Environmental Assessment to be 'sound' documents.	J M Agnew
SID846/S/Gen/1		Sound	Overall, I judge that the City of York: Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies Map, Sustainability Appraisal and Strategic Environmental Assessment to be 'sound' documents.	NDM 13
SID847/S/Gen/1		Sound	I consider all documents comprising the draft local plan to be sound. I believe the draft local plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs, whilst also protecting the Green Belt, preserving the unique character and setting of York, and maintaining the amenity, sustainability, and resilience of Copmanthorpe, the community in which I live.	Luke Condon
SID848/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	We consider that the Publication Local Plan as currently drafted fails to meet these four tests of soundness.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID849/S/Gen/1		Not Sound		Oneill Associates (Janet O'Neill)OBO University of York
SID61/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	P.11 Background, Higher education - wants information on how university will accommodate predicted numbers.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/2		Not Sound	P.11 Background, Green Belt. New draft green belt, since the 2005 green belt boundary (current) indicates an alteration to the green belt line so it does not match the settlement line of Poppleton to the rear of station road. No consultation with parish/ justification as to why the green belt line/ settlement should be altered. Oppose this.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/3		Not Sound	P.12 Background Strategically important aspects of York - no mention of ancient snickets regarded as significant attractions by english heritage.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/4		Not Sound	Pg.12 Background Green infrastructure, these are basically the essential flood plains by the river Ouse. Clear protection against catastrophic flooding in the centre but are not mentioned in policy.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/5		Not Sound	pg.12 Background biodiversity. SINC is a way to delay building on land till the price is right. Experienced a removal of SINC on York Business Park while developing the neighbourhood plan. It was too late to include them once large premises had been built on them. Loss of habitat and increase in standing traffic causes health issues.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/6		Not Sound	PG.13 Background Education. Large housing developments (ST1 and ST2) will have a large impact on schools. Particularly manor academy (manor school) which will need to expand - there is no mention of funding or capacity in the plan. Schools are at capacity.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/7		Not Sound	Pg.13 Background Expansion of the University of York. Where will future accommodation for students be built and how will it release accommodation within the city.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/8		Not Sound	Pg.14 Background Further education - no indication of expansion at York college or askham bryan	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/9		Not Sound	pg.15 Background Rail Transport Suggestion that railway halts will be built at Poppleton park and Haxby yet it is not within the remit of the local plan or CYC to develop these as they are the responsibility of the railway authority.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID61/S/Gen/10		Not Sound	Pg.15 Background Air Quality standing traffic is a major issue for breathing difficulties. Building houses will exacerbate issue.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/11		Not Sound	Pg.16 Background A timescale for the duration of the plan apart from 20 years. Date of plan should be flexible but there are no time dates on draft.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/12		Not Sound	Pg.16 Background Sustainable modes of transport - this needs to be specifically defined.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/13		Not Sound	pg.16 Background city centre. Loss of shopping/ increase in vacated shops will decrease visitor footfall.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/14		Not Sound	pg.17 Background No mention of former civil service grounds. Was taken out of neighbourhood plan by examiner as land was within green belt. It is a green field site with no building except club house (1% of area). Former civil service site is grade 2 agricultural land and not rough grazing as plan suggests. Former playing fields should be decommissioned to local communities who have lost this.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/15		Not Sound	pg.17 Background 2.13 its primary aim will be to preserve and enhance the special character and setting of York - would like a sentence added to reflect the historic and special character villages that have been on record for over 1000 years.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman
SID61/S/Gen/16		Not Sound	pg.19 Background protecting residents - avoid use of flood plain areas. Many of the outlying areas there is episodic flooding i.e. Park and ride in Poppleton.	Upper Poppleton James Mackman

### Proposed Modification

SID1/Mod/Gen/1			* More affordable homes, with gardens not flats, using green belt land*Derwenthorpe Village Plan should provide appropriate infrastructure	David Marsh
SID/Mod/Gen/1			No more housing developments in Haxby.	John Clark
SID26/Mod/Gen/1			Properly consider the implications additional traffic from proposed developments will have on congestion, road safety, air quality etc.	Andrew Dickinson

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID33/Mod/Gen/1			Dual the outer ring road, build a main hospital outside the city centre that is easily accessible from all sides of the city. Better highway planning, more infrastructure before expansion happens.	N Scaife
SID76/Mod/Gen/1			Consider further the impact on Roads, schools and Drainage. If this is done then the plan in my view is sound.	Richard Horner
SID94/Mod/Gen/1			More consultation with residents. Develop brownfield sites first.	Steven Davenport
SID103/Mod/T1/1			The Supplementary Planning Document needs to be published in time for its implications to be fully assessed in advance of the Examination in Public. Failing that, the standards specified in the Development Control Policies, 2005 should be incorporated into the Local Plan.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID103/Mod/Gen/1			The full range of policy objectives of concern to transport need to be addressed Para 2.16 needs to be redrafted to reflect the wider objectives of economic vitality, accessibility, public health and equity. Subsequent references to transport policies need to demonstrate that all of these objectives are being effectively addressed in the most cost-effective way. Achievable outcome targets need to be set for each of these objectives, and the Plan needs to be monitored against them. All such targets need to be added to Table 15.2.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID103/Mod/DP2/1			Hierarchy of transports users should provide the basis for the definition of sustainable development and sustainable communities in Policies DP2 and DP3. All transport policy measures should be selected and implemented following the hierarchy of users on which LTP3 is based, reflecting the principles of sustainable travel. This approach should determine the measures to be included under Policies T2, T4, T5 and T8, and the prioritisation in investment between these three transport policies. Based on the resulting strategy, a much more challenging target should be set for the proportion of journeys by sustainable modes.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID103/Mod/T2/1			The Local Plan should acknowledge that LTP3 is now out of date with a LTP4 in preparation, and in the absence of an up to date Local Transport Plan, reference to specific measures and their timing in Policies T2, T4 and T5 would be better omitted and replaced by a commitment to determine an appropriate set of measures and timeframe in the forthcoming LTP4. As an alternative the text in the current Development Control Policies should be used. A new policy on freight and servicing should be added.	York Civic Trust - David Fraser
SID104/Mod/Gen/1			Number and siting of developments should be reconsidered. Residents have been ignored. More consideration / action needed on air and noise pollution, drainage, sustainable transport, cycle routes, potholes. Currently unsafe to cycle from Haxby to York.	Ann Andrews

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID113/Mod/Gen/1			In the outer York villages there is an urgent need for the planning authority to work with Government and public health partners to assess the current lack of clean air zones and whether they, or similar controls, should be imposed on communities in order to improve air quality for all (but especially children).	Susan Rippon
SID114/Mod/Gen/1			Numbers of houses at many of the large sites (ST7 and ST8) need reducing to mitigate the harm they will do. A condition should be inserted that no sites to the north or north east of the city can be developed until the outer ring road is dualled.	Ian Anderson
SID118/MOD/Gen/3			It would be preferable to make it clear that the role it plays insafeguarding York’s special character and setting is the “primary” purpose of this particular Green Belt. It would also be better ifit actually used the terminology of the NPPF and saved RSS PolicyParagraph 1.49 line 8 amend to read:-“Although the York Green Belt performs a number of purposes tosome extent, its primary purpose is to safeguard the specialcharacter and setting of the historic city.”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/Gen/3			It would be preferable to make it clear that the role it plays insafeguarding York’s special character and setting is the “primary” purpose of this particular Green Belt. It would also be better ifit actually used the terminology of the NPPF and saved RSS PolicyParagraph 1.49 line 8 amend to read:-“Although the York Green Belt performs a number of purposes tosome extent, its primary purpose is to safeguard the specialcharacter and setting of the historic city.”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/Gen/4			To adequately reference the distictiveness of York, amend the beginning of the Vision as follows:- “York aspires to be aCity whose special qualities and distinctiveness are recognisedworldwide, where its unique legacy of historic assets are preserved and enhanced, and where the full potential that its historic buildings,spaces and archaeology can contribute to the economic and socialwelfare of the community is realised. The Local Plan ... etc”.Also move paras 2.8-2.11 to the vision sectin.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/Gen/4			The definition that follows was given to the upper and nether Poppleton neighbourhood plan when the made plan was agreed and supported by CYC but in the policy stated in the current local plan it has been ignored. The site ST2 was removed by the inspector of the upper and nether Poppleton neighbourhood plan based on the city of York information that this was a green belt site from the reserved regional spatial strategy RSS. The Green Belt designation of the Land by the reserved RSS YH9C. The detailed inner boundaries of the Green Belt around York should be defined in order to establish long term development limits that safeguard the special character and setting of the historic cityPolicy Y1 York Sub area policy plan strategies, investment decisions and programmes for York sub area should: C Environment1 The City of York LDF, defines the detailed boundaries of the outstanding sections of the outer boundary of the York Green Belt about 6 miles from York City Centre and the inner boundary in line with policy YH9.2 Protect and enhance the nationally significant historical and environmental character of York including its historic setting., views of the Minster and important open area'	Historic England - Ian Smith

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/MOD/Gen/5			The Government’s Core planning Principles for both the natural and historic environment are not just that they should be “protected” but rather that they should be “conserved and enhanced”. As the glossary to the NPPF makes clear, conservation is not the same as preservation. Consequently, it would be more appropriate if this Section heading was amended to more closely reflect that used in national planning guidance. It would also be consistent with the wording used in Policy DP2 Criterion iii. Amend Main heading in bold before Paragraph 2.8 amend to read: - “Conserving and enhancing the environment”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/Gen/5			The Government’s Core planning Principles for both the natural and historic environment are not just that they should be “protected” but rather that they should be “conserved and enhanced”. As the glossary to the NPPF makes clear, conservation is not the same as preservation. Consequently, it would be more appropriate if this Section heading was amended to more closely reflect that used in national planning guidance. It would also be consistent with the wording used in Policy DP2 Criterion iii. Amend Main heading in bold before Paragraph 2.8 amend to read: - “Conserving and enhancing the environment”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/Gen/6			Section 2.8 deals wholly with York’s historic environment. Moreover, it also deals with several non-built elements – such as Museum Gardens, the Strays and the Green Belt. Therefore, the heading needs to be amended accordingly. Sub-heading before Paragraph 2.8 amend to read: - “The historic environment”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/Gen/6			Section 2.8 deals wholly with York’s historic environment. Moreover, it also deals with several non-built elements – such as Museum Gardens, the Strays and the Green Belt. Therefore, the heading needs to be amended accordingly. Sub-heading before Paragraph 2.8 amend to read: - “The historic environment”	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID119/MOD/Gen/1			Specific policy wording required to ensure developers have regard to the Water Framework Directive. Potential text could be added into Policy DP2. Example wording provided.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID167/Mod/Gen/1			As an information design professional, suggests the plan be made much more accessible - making the language more direct; cutting unnecessary waffle; and structuring the headings such that people wishing to comment can find the part they wish to comment on.	Janet Teather
SID226/Mod/Gen/1			The City Centre Policies Map is incorrect. It shows an area of public green space removed from around Clifford's Tower, without necessary procedures having been followed.	Susan & Ralph Major
SID247/Mod/Gen/1			Build more houses.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID247/Mod/Gen/2			Review the approach to windfalls.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge
SID247/Mod/Gen/3			Review spatial approach to plan and the identification of small isolated new settlements.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge
SID247/Mod/Gen/5			The areas to the north of York (in Hambleton) do not lie within the Green Belt and they could provide the opportunity for a new settlement to meet part of both York's and the Sub – Region's housing needs.	Spawforths (David Rolinson) OBO The Trustees of W Bridge
SID248/Mod/Gen/1			The Cliffords Tower legal challenge has not yet been decided. It seems premature, therefore, for the Local Plan to show the proposed visitor centre as built, with the implication that the land can be freely used for this purpose, when that is still sub judice.	J Harris
SID263/Mod/Gen/1			Harrogate Borough Council is planning to deliver a step change in housing delivery over that previously planned for in the adopted Core Strategy in order to meet in full its objectively assessed need. It is not making provision to deal with undersupply elsewhere.	Harrogate Borough Council - Tracey Rathmell
SID263/Mod/Gen/2			The City of York Plan is also seeking to set an enduring Green Belt boundary beyond the Plan period. Harrogate Borough Council has previously raised concerns regarding the longevity of the boundary.	Harrogate Borough Council - Tracey Rathmell
SID297/Mod/Gen/1			Revised policy maps must clearly define all developments.	Cllr Roger Bedford
SID315/Mod/Gen/1			Uplift total housing requirement to that assessed by the government to 1027 per annum. Uplift the proportion of affordable homes to 40% minimum. Make a realistic assessment of homes likely to arise from released MOD land.	Robert Leslie Towner
SID317/Mod/Gen/1			Sires all need consideratio to meet rising demand for housing.	Geoffrey Nurse
SID332/Mod/Gen/2			Targets for housing completion is not viable. Would be better to allocate sites with a "potential" for "x" number of units with the market left to decide the build rate.	York Environment Forum - Philip Crowe

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID359/Mod/Gen/1			Clifton Park Hospital Site could accomodate a mixed used scheme across two phases that could meet the identified need for additional housing sites in York. Various Development Options Available.	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO NHS Property Services
SID360/Mod/Gen/2			Various comments from NYCC on their Strategic Transport Prospectus for North Yorkshire.	North Yorkshire Country Council - Tricia Richards
SID364/Mod/Gen/6			Produce LPT4 to replace out of date LPT3.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/Mod/Gen/7			Full dualling of outer ring road should be omitted until LPT4 complete.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/Mod/Gen/8			Either the Supplementary Planning Document needs to be published in time for its implications to be fully assessed in advance of the Examination in Public, or failing that, the standards specified in the Local Plan (Development Control) Policies, 2005 should be incorporated into the Local Plan pro-tem.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/Mod/Gen/9			LP should set ambitious targets that will help York be in the vanguard of the move to a Low Carbon economy and the jobs that will generate.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID364/Mod/Gen/10			Significant review of number of sites, high density assumptions on urban sites, housing, employment, greenfield and brownfield allocations and transportation approach.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/Mod/Gen/6			Produce LPT4 to replace out of date LPT3.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/Mod/Gen/8			Either the Supplementary Planning Document needs to be published in time for its implications to be fully assessed in advance of the Examination in Public, or failing that, the standards specified in the Local Plan (Development Control) Policies, 2005 should be incorporated into the Local Plan pro-tem.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID365/Mod/Gen/9			LP should set ambitious targets that will help York be in the vanguard of the move to a Low Carbon economy and the jobs that will generate.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID365/Mod/Gen/10			Significant review of number of sites, high density assumptions on urban sites, housing, employment, greenfield and brownfield allocations and transportation approach.	York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell
SID374/Mod/Gen/1			Prior to the Examination in Public, the Council needs to update and complete the analysis in its Transport Topic Paper. In doing so, it needs to assess the transport implications of underlying trends and proposed new development against the full range of objectives of its transport policy, develop a holistic strategy that tackles the predicted problems through a combination of measures to reduce the need to travel and reduce car use, and demonstrate that its proposed transport policies and standards are the most cost effective means of meeting those objectives.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID374/Mod/Gen/2			Para 2.16 needs to be redrafted to reflect the wider objectives of economic vitality, accessibility, public health and equity.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID378/S/Gen/1			Change paragraph 2.5 from "sufficient land for 867 dwellings" to "sufficient land for at least 953 dwellings".	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID378/S/Gen/2			Change the word "proposals map" to "policies map", where appropriate, through out the document	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
SID404/MOD/GEN/1			In relation to Section 14, a comprehensive analysis of the transport system in York and what is the right package of measures, inc demand management, to best address the existing as well as the future transport needs of the City is required - to demonstrate that the mitigation measures are sufficient to tackle the problems, & include a cost benefit analysis of different strategies. A new LTP4 should replace LTP (done in parallel with the Plan).	York Bus Forum - Graham Collett
SID415/Mod/Gen/1			One way forward therefore, would be for the Council to ensure that a financial viability assessment report is made available for the developments within the Local Plan and be open to public scrutiny.	Anthony Dennis
SID415/Mod/Gen/2			One way forward would be to make available the viability assessment report. Likewise, address the anomalies within the Local Plan regarding its self & custom build policy (Policy H4).	Anthony Dennis

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID415/Mod/Gen/4			One way forward to address the anomaly, would be to make available a viability assessment report for the development within the Local Plan so that the residual land values and profit margins can be assessed in relation to the allocation of affordable homes.	Anthony Dennis
SID415/Mod/Gen/5			Provide adequate advertising for the Self & custom housebuilding register in accordance with statutory requirements and also paragraph 159 of the NPPF.	Anthony Dennis
SID415/Mod/Gen/6			Clarify how the Plan intends to meet its 'One-Planet-York' agenda.	Anthony Dennis
SID415/Mod/Gen/7			One way forward to address the anomaly, would be to revisit space allocations for the development in the Local Plan.	Anthony Dennis
SID415/Mod/Gen/8			One way forward would be through the provision of house type designs assimilating more flexibility and adaptability into a single design; allowing designs to be easily 'grown' at a later date with the introduction of additional elements as the owner's circumstances, and finances.	Anthony Dennis
SID415/Mod/Gen/9			One way forward would be to make more use of innovative approaches to construction such as the use of modular offsite housing (for the whole site, including any public buildings involved), which provides a route to designs that can be both flexible, affordable, as well as saving time and disruption on site;	Anthony Dennis
SID415/Mod/Gen/1			One way forward would be to put land back into economics and policy/initiate changes to the national accounting process.	Anthony Dennis
SID583/Mod/Gen/1			Para 2.5 should be reworded to inform that sufficient sites that are viable and deliverable are identified now, at the start of the plan period (not by the end) and be clear about the end of the plan period.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/Gen/1			Para 2.5 should be reworded to inform that sufficient sites that are viable and deliverable are identified now, at the start of the plan period (not by the end) and be clear about the end of the plan period.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID590/Mod/Gen/1			The document could be shortened by including some policies in supplementary documents. For example, many of the policies in the Health and Wellbeing section are aspirational and do not relate directly to land use. The aspirations are well intentioned and would be supported by all, but question whether they should be included as policies, particularly given the uncertainty over their delivery.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID590/Mod/Gen/2			Should be explanatory text (an 'idiots' guide) to the Plan to assist people's understanding.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO York & North Yorkshire Chamber of Commerce Property Forum
SID619/Mod/Gen/1			Resident is asking for all correspondence regarding "revised boundary applications" to be sent to him rather than his son. Contact details in the rep.	Patrick Trimble
SID827/Mod/Gen/1			Re run the Call for sites and create a ranked list of all greenfield land in terms of its Agricultural Land Value Classification, complying with NPPF Para 112 - the list should contain all sites and not just those approved by the Local Plan Working Group	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID830/Mod/Gen/1			The plan needs to be accompanied by proper supporting infrastructure.	Carol & Steve Tear
SID842/Mod/Gen/1			The Germany-Beck should not have been approved.	Peter Eaves
SID848/Mod/Gen/1			Para 2.5 should be reworded to inform that sufficient sites that are viable and deliverable are identified now, at the start of the plan period (not by the end) and be clear about the end of the plan period.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID56/S/ALT/2		Not Sound	Alternative Site at Dauby Lane. Would have easier access to the B1228 and would unite the two halves of the village.	Judith Hodgson
SID92/S/ALT/1		Not Sound	Objects to H39 development, was deemed to serve green belt purposes by a previous inspector. Extra traffic generated would have a detrimental impact on existing Beckside residents quality of life. Site should be replaced by H26 Dauby Lane, this would link the two residential areas of the village.	Jonathan Shaw
SID122/S/ALT/1		Not Sound	The COYC are relying on around 169 dwellings each year to be delivered through windfall development sites. The Racecourse is constantly reviewing its Estate and there are two sites which could conceivably accommodate residential accommodation in order to meet the Objectively Assessed Need of the City of York through windfall development. Rep goes on to provide detail about the 'Middlethorpe Village Site' (Alt site 982) and 'Stables Site' on how they relate to green belt policies in the plan and the NPPF.	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse
SID122/S/ALT/2		Not Sound	The COYC are relying on around 169 dwellings each year to be delivered through windfall development sites. The Racecourse is constantly reviewing its Estate and there are two sites which could conceivably accommodate residential accommodation in order to meet the Objectively Assessed Need of the City of York through windfall development. Rep goes on to provide detail about the 'Stables Site' (Alt site 988).	Turnberry Consulting Limited (Susannah Byrne) OBO York Racecourse
SID125/S/ALT/1		Not Sound	Alternative site - Whiteland Field/Usher Park Road (Former H49). Whiteland Field, Usher Park Road, Haxby - rep goes into detail on green belt criteria in relation to the site, argues for its inclusion. Concludes with - Whiteland Field does not meet any the Green Belt criteria and should be allocated for residential development. Persimmon Homes previously has put forward a number of reports in support of its allocation including transport, services, archaeology and masterplan. Persimmon owns the land and is keen to progress development of the site once a satisfactory planning position has been obtained. The site should be allocated for residential development to make a rational Green Belt boundary and provide a deliverable site and to contribute to meeting the City's widespread housing needs. 1.3 hectares, 49 dwellings, Short term.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID125/S/ALT/2		Not Sound	Alternative Site - New Lane, Huntington (Former ST11) - New Lane, Huntington - rep goes into detail on green belt criteria in relation to the site, argues for its inclusion. Concludes with - The site should be allocated for residential development in accordance with the boundaries of ST11 in the halted 2014 Local Plan to make a deliverable site and thus contribute to meeting the City's widespread housing needs. 13.7 hectares, 336 dwellings, Short to Medium Term.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID125/S/ALT/3		Not Sound	Alternative Site - Pond Field (alt site 170) - Pond Field, Field Lane - rep goes into detail on green belt criteria in relation to the site, argues for its inclusion. Concludes with - Pond Field does not meet any of the criteria for Green Belt. The reality is that Pond Field is now a field surrounded by development. It has to be inappropriate to seek to retain a field in agricultural use when it is surrounded by development. The Green Belt designation should be removed and Field Lane used to define this part of the inner Green Belt boundary with a rational boundary. The site should be allocated for residential development to provide a deliverable site and thus contribute to meeting the City's widespread housing needs. 5.7 hectares, 140 dwellings, Short term.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID125/S/ALT/4		Not Sound	Alternative Site - Lime Tree Farm, Common Lane, Heslington - rep goes into detail on green belt criteria in relation to the site, argues for its inclusion. Concludes with - Lime Tree Farm does not meet any of the criteria for Green Belt designation. Lime Tree Farm has development on three sides with limited views into it from the southern boundary. The Green Belt designation should be removed and Common Lane used to define this part of the inner Green Belt boundary with a rational boundary. The site should be allocated for residential development to provide a deliverable site and thus contribute to meeting the City's widespread housing needs. 2.7 hectares, 90 dwellings, Short term.	Persimmon Homes - Robin McGinn
SID181/S/ALT/1		Not Sound	Alternative site suggested for the plan as residential development – site 221 - land on the north-eastern side of Sim Balk Lane to the north of the A64;	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments
SID181/S/ALT/2		Not Sound	Alternative site suggested for the plan as residential, education, employment (B1a) or hotel uses – site 222 - land on the south-western side of Sim Balk Lane to the north of the A64;	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments
SID181/S/ALT/3		Not Sound	Alternative site suggested for the plan for residential – site 223 - land to the west of Bishopthorpe, north of Copmanthorpe Lane;	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID181/S/ALT/4		Not Sound	Alternative site suggested for the plan for residential – site 224 - land to the north of Bishopthorpe, north of Church Lane.	Gateley Plc York Limited (Andrew Piatt) OBO Gateway Developments
SID221/S/ALT/1		Not Sound	CYC has not consulted the residents of Elvington and specifically ignored village proposals for an alternative site (H26) that the vast majority of villagers support as it would unite the two halves of the village.	Sally Firth
SID316/S/ALT/1			H30 Intake Lane. Not deliverable. No road access. Development in Greenbelt.	Stuart Kay
SID357/S/ALT/1		Not Sound	It is considered my clients site off North Lane in Huntington is suitable to meet this need given it is in a sustainable location within walking distance of local facilities.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID581/S/ALT/1		Not Sound	Land at Moor Lane, Woodthorpe (previously ST10) should be allocated for housing.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP

### Proposed Modification

SID40/Mod/ALT/1			Objects to the deletion of strategic site ST12. Passed site selection criteria at Preferred Options but has since been removed. The current reasons relating to the Green Belt were not considered relevant to exclude this site at PO, it has been consistently allocated for development in the past. The objectively assessed housing need figure is an under-estimate, also the density assumptions used are inappropriate in rural settings. Therefore requests ST12 be reinstated in the Local Plan.	Beatrice Wiseman
SID56/Mod/ALT/1			Objects to ST15, ST26 and suggest using fmr site H26 Dauby Lane as alternative housing site.	Judith Hodgson
SID68/Mod/ALT/1			#1 entire site - Northfield Lane (Triangle) - This is for the overall site but other representations have been submitted relating to individual parcels of land within the larger area encompassed by this representation. Those representations propose the allocation of various plots of land for housing and, employment and or a caravan park.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID68/Mod/ALT/3			#3 Northfield Lane (south of garden centre) - It is anticipated that the consultation process for the Draft Local Plan will establish that a number of sites allocated for housing are not viable or deliverable within the plan period. Consequently, alternative sites will need to be allocated by the Council in order to meet its housing targets for the Plan period. It is considered that the site (land east of Northfield Lane) should be brought forward for allocation to assist in meeting these housing targets.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID68/Mod/ALT/4			Remove from the Green Belt and allocate for housing or for employment or as safeguarded land.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID84/Mod/ALT/1			In line with residents and the parish council's views, former H26 should be put forward for development.	Tim Tozer
SID91/Mod/ALT/1			H37 Land adjacent to Greystones Court Haxby should be re-instated. Rep goes into great detail about the history of H37 at various consultation stages in the past.	Strathmore Estates (Debbie Hume) OBO Westfield Lodge and Yaldara Ltd (H37)
SID92/Mod/ALT/1			Former site should be replaced by H26 Dauby Lane, this would link the two residential areas of the village.	Jonathan Shaw
SID95/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	Former H26 Dauby Lane is a much better alternative, is preferred by majority of residents and parish council.	Eileen Roberts
SID102/Mod/ALT/1			Nearly all residents support removing H39 from the plan and replacing it with H26 Dauby Lane. H26 should contain a better mix of housing type, especially larger houses to meet a clearly identified local need. Council officers are ignoring local residents needs / wishes.	Elvington Parish Council - David Headlam
SID141/Mod/ALT/1			The site to the east of the designer outlet (Naburn Business Park) should be allocated as an employment site for B1a office floorspace. There is a strong economic case for a new business park at Naburn, providing easy access to the ring road and university, choice in the market and noting its proximity to ST15. Transport constraints could be addressed and traffic impacts mitigated. The site is in single ownership and capable of development in the short term. Technical issues previously raised by Officers have been addressed with further work currently being undertaken by Oakgate/Caddick Groups. The site is suitable to accommodate a business park (with appropriate mitigation measures).	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Oakgate Caddick Groups
SID182/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	Land West of Chapelfields should be allocated for housing for 89 dwellings.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO KCS Development Ltd

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID183/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	Parish councils would prefer H26 which has been removed from the plan.	Emma Yates
SID184/Mod/ALT/1			I propose that H39 is withdrawn from the Local Plan and is replaced by:H26. Dauby Lane. Approximately a third of homes are currently to the west of the school. H26 would provide a link between the two parts of the village, so helping to integrate them into one community.	Philip Rees
SID185/Mod/ALT/1			I propose that H39 is withdrawn from the Local Plan and is replaced by:H26. Dauby Lane. Approximately a third of homes are currently to the west of the school. H26 would provide a link between the two parts of the village, so helping to integrate them into one community.	Helen Rees
SID191/Mod/ALT/1			The vast majority of villagers believe that H26, land at Daubly Lane, is a better site [in respect of site H39] offering capacity for more houses in the village. That land at H26 would unite the two halves of the village [Elvington], provide better access and importantly provide a mix of housing, including affordable housing, much better suited to the needs of Elvington.	Martin Moorhouse
SID193/Mod/ALT/1			The two residential areas of Elvington should be linked, as per H26. H26 should contain a better mix of housing, particularly larger homes which are identified as locally needed. Approximately 60 residences would be appropriate for the site. CYC are imposing H39 rather than H26 against the wishes of the local community.	Peter Murray
SID194/Mod/ALT/1			The two residential areas of Elvington should be linked, as per H26. H26 should contain a better mix of housing, particularly larger homes which are identified as locally needed. Approximately 60 residences would be appropriate for the site. CYC are imposing H39 rather than H26 against the wishes of the local community.	Jessica Murray
SID195/Mod/ALT/1			The two residential areas of Elvington should be linked, as per H26. H26 should contain a better mix of housing, particularly larger homes which are identified as locally needed. Approximately 60 residences would be appropriate for the site. CYC are imposing H39 rather than H26 against the wishes of the local community.	Natasha Murray
SID196/Mod/ALT/1			The two residential areas of Elvington should be linked, as per H26. H26 should contain a better mix of housing, particularly larger homes which are identified as locally needed. Approximately 60 residences would be appropriate for the site. CYC are imposing H39 rather than H26 against the wishes of the local community.	Anneliese Murray
SID197/Mod/ALT/1			The two residential areas of Elvington should be linked, as per H26. H26 should contain a better mix of housing, particularly larger homes which are identified as locally needed. Approximately 60 residences would be appropriate for the site. CYC are imposing H39 rather than H26 against the wishes of the local community.	Mary Julie Murray

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID203/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	Land to the East of Wheldrake Lane, Wheldrake, York, YO19 6NA: The site could be fully developed to intergate into the existing urban edge, akin to allocated site SS18, and contribute towards meeting housing requirements. (Alt site 961)	Savills (M Boyce ) OBO Mr Allen and Mrs Dorothea Park
SID205/Mod/ALT/1			Land to the South of Southfield Close, Rufforth, York: This site could be included for residential purposes rather than the proposed green belt and should be considered to meet housing requirements. The site has no technical constraints and is advantageously located with excellent transport routes. There is no reason to justify sites inclusion within the new boundaries of the York Green Belt. The site is available immediately for development and can come foward in the period of 0-5 years. (Alt site 965)	Savills (R Housam) OBO Private landowner
SID207/Mod/ALT/1			Keep Elvington Rural (KER) believe that H39 should be replaced by H26 which would better meet the needs of Elvington residents.	Keep Elvington Rural Action Group - Martin Moorhouse
SID209/Mod/ALT/1			The opportunity posed by the development of this site (ST12) is unique. Askham Bryan College is the landowner of the site and consequently the funds from the development proposals will be used directly to enhance investment in the provision of education within the City, a key objective of the Council's strategy for a future prosperous City. This is supported by Policy DP1 and ED7 within the Publication Draft (February 2018) whereby the contribution of the college towards the economic growth and provision of Education within the City and wider region is acknowledged and supported in terms of its future expansion.	ELG Town Planning (Kim Eastwood) OBO Askham Bryan College
SID210/Mod/ALT/1			Land at The Brecks, Strensall has been excluded from draft Green Belt boundaries on numerous occasions and designated for possible future development. The Council has also concluded that it serves none of the purposes and objectives of such a designation as set out in the Framework10. This is recognised in the fact that the site had been allocated for development within the emerging YLP for a considerable period of time. It is incorrect for the Council to now rely on the conclusions reached by the SoS and Inspector in relation to a call-in Inquiry to justify the deletion of Brecks Lane as a housing allocation. The SoS and Inspector's decision was made in an entirely different context to its proposed allocation and does not preclude a proper consideration of whether the site should be located within the Green Belt and its contribution to Green Belt purposes. Land at Brecks Lane is a suitable site for housing development that would have no unacceptable environmental impacts or create unacceptable impacts upon amenity of new and existing residents. There are no insurmountable constraints to the site or its development and is deliverable within the next five years. Separate evidence has been provided as to how the proposed OAHN for York is not robust and is inadequate to meet need and demand within the Housing Market Area. As such, the housingsite allocations put forward in the LPP would fail to deliver a housing supply sufficient to achieve the sustainable growth of the City. It is therefore important for the Council to allocate additional land, particularly the site at Brecks Lane, to meet the housing needs of the community. Drawing these points together, it is requested that Policy H1 of the LPP is amended to include Land at Brecks Lane as a Housing Allocation.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID91/Mod/ALT/2		Not Sound	It is considered that the site at Southfields Road Strensall, represents a sustainable location for housing development. It is suitable, available and achievable for residential development for market and affordable dwellings and there are no insurmountable constraints to delivering housing on the site. The site is able to come forward for development in the short-term (years 1 – 5) and therefore represent a deliverable site as defined by the Framework. In order to assist the Council in delivering its housing land requirement it is considered that the site at Southfields Road, Strensall should be allocated for housing development and brought forward for development in the short term. If the site is not identified for allocation it should be identified as Safeguarded Land.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID91/Mod/ALT/3		Not Sound	It is considered that the site at Princess Road, Strensall represents a sustainable location for housing development which could assist the council in delivering its housing target. It is suitable, available and achievable for residential development for market and affordable dwellings and there are no insurmountable constraints to delivering housing on the site. The site is able to come forward for development in the short-term (years 1 – 5) and therefore represent a deliverable site. If the site is not identified for allocation it should be identified as Safeguarded Land.	Lichfields (Nicholas Mills) OBO Wakeford Properties Limited
SID212/Mod/ALT/1			Remove the site (site at Mitchell's Lane Fulford) from the green belt and include it within Policy H1 of the Plan as a housing allocation.	IB Planning (Iain Bath ) OBO Client
SID214/Mod/ALT/1			The site West of Landing Lane should be allocated to address the shortfall in housing supply - Alternatively, or in combination with a housing scheme, the site west of Landing Lane could also accommodate a care home and retirement village complex to meet the immediate and pressing need for elderly person accommodation in the city.	O'Neill Associates (Eamonn Keogh ) OBO Wendy & Richard Robinson
SID217/ALT/H31/1			Reconsideration of sites H737 (Stock Hill Field, West of Church Balk, Dunnington) and H744 (Bull Balks) using the same criteria as used for H31.	Peter Moorhouse
SID220/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	Site 768 (formerly SF5) should be allocated for housing. Site is Land to the West of Moor Lane, Copmanthorpe. Extensive supporting evidence supplied. Site is 15.34ha.	O'Neill Associates (Philip Holmes)OBO Mr M Ibbotson
SID221/Mod/ALT/1			Cancel plan for building on H39 in favour of the more suitable, and supported, H26 site.	Sally Firth
SID222/Mod/ALT/1			Listen to local residents, including myself, who have already said that the Dauby Lane site (H26) would be more appropriate & enable more houses of the right mix to be built.	Joanne Wedgwood

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID223/Mod/ALT/1			H26 is a better site and it is supported by the local community.	Jonathan Hailstone
SID224/Mod/ALT/1			Elvington sits within the Greenbelt and should therefore be exempt from the building of 28/32 houses. These houses could easily be added onto the larger 3339 dwellings H26 Site.	Colin Skelton
SID227/Mod/ALT/1			Listen to residents and choose the previously proposed Dauby Lane site (H26) as an alternative.	Matthew Wedgwood
SID228/Mod/ALT/1			In order to make the plan more sound use the land adjacent to The Bull Commercial Centre, Stockton Lane, as smaller light-industrial space.	Jason Ironside
SID246/Mod/ALT/1			Land north of Elvington Industrial Estate should be allocated for employment uses B1c/b2/B8 to make the Plan sound by offering greater flexibility in the choice of small sites. The 5.4 ha site would make a logical extension to the existing industrial estate, it is accessible, has clearly defined boundaries and has a willing landowner. Previously considered by the Council as site 864.	LHL Group (Richard Hampshire) OBO Mr J Nicholson
SID252/Mod/ALT/1			It is our view that the reinstatement of the allocation of land to the south of Boroughbridge Road ('the Site') for housing would help to ensure the delivery of an effective housing development on the edge of the City of York boundary. The Site would help meet government targets on the delivery of new housing and its inclusion would demonstrate an understanding of the importance of deliverable housing sites as a central component of the new local plan. Although the new local plan identifies this area as Green belt land, it is evident that this area of land does not display the characteristics necessary for Green belt designation, and as such it should not reasonably be classified as Green belt for the purposes of this local plan. The 2016 Greenbelt Assessment Addendum, which assesses the reasons for the sites removal as a housing allocation, concludes that the site does not fulfil these functions as laid out in the Preferred Options Consultation. Specifically, the Addendum states that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Site does not impinge upon the setting of York. It is 3 kilometres away from the historic core of the city, and is surrounded by other largely developed areas, and as such will does not serve this greenbelt purpose; and</li> <li>• The Site does not impede on greenbelt rules that aim to ensure that towns and cities do not merge.</li> </ul>	Arcus Consulting (Clare Walters) OBO Cobalt Housing York Limited
SID254/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	Site at Milestone Ave has substantial local support which has been demonstrated through the proposed allocation of the land in the proposed Rufforth with Knapton Neighbourhood Plan. Indeed, it is considered that the Council's failure to allocate our Clients land is in direct conflict with the requirements of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and the Planning Practice Guidance (PPG), which place great weight in enabling local communities to plan positively for growth in their areas through Neighbourhood Planning. Alt site 956.	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Equibase Ltd (Nick Squire)

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID259/Mod/ALT/1			Land at Manor Heath Copmanthorpe (Owned by Askham Bryan should be removed from the green belt and allocated for housing.	Paul Butler Planning OBO David Wilson Homes
SID260/Mod/ALT/1			Former site H30 and SF1. The Land to the South of Strensall is made up of a parcel of land which covers an area of approximately 29 hectares. The site is located outside the development limits of Strensall however is bounded by residential development to the west, the railway line to the north, residential properties to the east and adjoining Flaxton Road to the south. The site is a greenfield site currently used for agricultural purposes. Mature planting exists on some of the site boundaries, particularly to the southern boundary along Flaxton Road. The site whilst currently located in the open countryside and outside the development limits of the village, is relatively central in relation to Strensall village centre and has good access to village facilities and service. This makes it a sustainable site. The site is located within Flood Zone 1, and accommodates no other site specific constraints.	Pegasus Group - Matthew Mortonson
SID262/Mod/ALT/1			I suggest removing site H39 from the plan and replacing with H26 for consideration. H26 is supported by the residents and Parish council and will provide a greater number of houses.	Ian Dickens
SID267/Mod/ALT/1			Land south of Foxwood Lane, Acomb should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing – evidence provided - In response to the three key transportation issues to be considered as part of the process access Suitable access arrangements for vehicles, pedestrians and cyclists can be provided at the development site, as indicated in Drawing A088531/ C001 - Accessibility The site is accessible on foot or by bike to a range of useful local destinations, and - there are public transport options available for journeys further afield. Traffic Impacts The site is expected to generate 68 motor vehicle trips in the AM peak hour and 76 in the PM peak hour. This level of additional traffic is not expected to result in any capacity problems but if necessary, mitigation measures can be delivered. The development site satisfies the key transportation issues, and is suitable for allocation in the City of York Local Development Framework Submission Draft Core Strategy for residential development.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID284/Mod/ALT/1			We would like to offer the land at North Carlton Farm, Sandy Lane, Stockton on Forest, York, YO32 9UT, for housing as part of the CYC Local Plan. This comprises the Farmhouse, farm yard, buildings and adjacent fields. Fields No. 2975, 6186, 6900 and 8900.	Alisdair & Rosie Dunn
SID289/Mod/ALT/1			I propose that this development is withdrawn and replaced with a site from a previous local plan H26 Dauby Lane. Most of the traffic to and from this site will not have to enter the already heavily used Main Street.	Terence Wilson
SID317/Mod/ALT/1			Land at Brook Nook, Murton Way, Osbaldwick, York: Site should have site visit. Preferable uses: Social/Affordable Housing, Care Home/Respite or Commercial Units.	Geoffrey Nurse

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID317/Mod/ALT/2			Land to the Rear of Brook Nook & Adjoining Holly Tree Farm, Murton Way, Osbaldwick, York, YO19 5UN. Indicative plan attached for Social/Affordable housing proposal. Freehold owners of properties would like to offer land for the plan.	Geoffrey Nurse
SID333/Mod/ALT/1			CYC should reinstate the proposal for development at Dauby Lane (H26) to address my concerns over the development at Church Lane site H39. The Dauby lane site H26 has the advantages of linking the two halves of the village building on a site which currently is semi derelict and which is ideally situated between the school and the multipurpose site with doctors surgery/sports & social club and year round afterschool facilities.	Alison Stead
SID334/Mod/ALT/1			I consider that the CYC should reinstate the Dauby Lane site H26 to address concerns for the development of the H26 Church lane site. This has the advantage of linking the 2 halves of the village, providing more housing and having less impact on the local environment.	David Stead
SID339/Mod/ALT/1			It is noted that the Council continue to omit our Clients sites – Manor Heath, Copmanthope (ref: ST12)	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID339/Mod/ALT/2			It is noted that the Council continue to omit our Clients sites – Riverside Gardens, Elvington (ref: SF10)	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID339/Mod/ALT/3			It is noted that the Council continue to omit our Clients sites – New Lane, Huntington (ref: ST11).	Barton Willmore (Chris Atkinson) OBO Barratt & David Wilson Homes
SID349/Mod/ALT/1			I propose site H39 is withdrawn from the Local Plan and is replaced by H26 – Dauby Lane.	Laura Good
SID350/ALT/H1			Land at Kettlestring Lane, Clifton, SHLAA ref. 959 should be designated as a housing allocation.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Picton Capital

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID351/Mod/ALT/1			We support the exclusion of the YDO and the 20 acre land to its south from the Extension of the Green Wedge (Figure 3.1: Historic Character and Setting of York). This helps support our further representations to remove the 20 acre site from the Green Belt. The 20 acre site should also be removed from being defined as part of the green infrastructure corridor (Figure 3.2: York's Green Infrastructure - Nature Conservation, Green Corridors, Open Space) as that land is better suited for the enhanced and relocated Park & Ride facility, consistent with Policy T2.	NTW Planning (Niall Roberts) OBO York Designer Outlet & Aviva Investors
SID353/Mod/ALT/1			Replace H39 with Dauby Lane	Matthew Colven
SID354/ALT/H1/1			Given that the land to the south of Poppleton Park & Ride is now allocated as 'White Land' (without any designation) in the Neighbourhood Plan, the land should properly be considered as a housing allocation. The site could be considered for employment or mixed use purposes, but given the proposed employment allocation to the south of the Northminster Business Park, and proximity to the Poppleton Bar Park and Ride, its most appropriate predominant use is residential.	Peter Vernon Vernon & Co
SID356/Mod/ALT/1			By changing the site from H39 to H26, would comply with the wishes of the local residents including the parish council, would allow more houses to be built in a more suitable location without exasperating an already overcrowded estates.	Jonathan Laverack
SID357/Mod/ALT/1			It is considered my clients site off North Lane in Huntington is suitable to meet this need given it is in a sustainable location within walking distance of local facilities.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID357/Mod/ALT/2			The Fulford site along with land to the north extending towards Heslington Lane would comprise a sustainable urban extension to this part of York with land to the west comprising white land within the settlement limits and therefore the sites would comprise a natural extension to the settlement.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments
SID358/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	Site 795 Greenacres Should be allocated for employment purposes. Landscape reasons were given as the reason for previously rejecting the site. Landscape and tranport assessments were submitted in 2016 which concluded that the site was suitable.	Doug Jennings Planning OBO Mark Miller
SID359/Mod/Alt/1		Not Legally Compliant	Clifton Park Hospital Site could accomodate a mixed used scheme accross two phases that could meet the identified need for additional housing sites in York. Various Development Options Available within 3.6ha site. See accompanying representation titled 'York Local Plan Publication Draft Consultation - Representationon behalf of NHS Property Services Ltd: Clifton Park Hospital' (ref: 50794/MHE/AJk/15677426v2)	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO NHS Property Services



## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID362/Mod/ALT/1			The proposed site H39 should be withdrawn and excluded, and instead H26 should be considered instead as most inhabitants of the village support this area for development, despite the village services already being at almost full capacity. If a site must be considered in Elvington, H39 should be the only site considered.	Dominic Stevens
SID366/Mod/ALT/1			Should any part of the Peppermill Court site be declared as surplus to the operational healthcare requirements of the NHS in the future, then the site should be considered suitable and available for alternative use, and considered deliverable within the period 5 - 10 years.	Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services
SID366/Mod/ALT/2			Should any part of the Cherry Tree House site be declared as surplus to the operational healthcare requirements of the NHS in the future, then the site should be considered suitable and available for alternative use, and considered deliverable within the period 5 - 10 years.	Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services
SID366/Mod/ALT/3			Should any part of the Limetrees site be declared as surplus to the operational healthcare requirements of the NHS in the future, then the site should be considered suitable and available for alternative use, and considered to be deliverable within the period 5-10 years. The site does not contribute to the purposes of the Green Belt (SS2) and hence is a candidate for release from it. Policy SS2 provides some flexibility in relation to the redevelopment potential of the previously developed site at Limetrees development of which would be considered limited infilling. The site is allocated as 'existing open space', (GI5) it is currently private land and thus access to this 'open space' is restricted and not publicly accessible.	Iceni Projects (Isobel McGeever) OBO NHS Property Services
SID371/S/ALT/1		Not Sound	We submitted a site for consideration as a draft allocation for housing in November 2017. It has not been given due consideration, nor has it been appraised by the Council, not even for the SHLAA process. The site is in a sustainable location on the edge of the village of Rufforth. The whole of the site is currently in agricultural use and therefore considered to have a low potential of providing the necessary characteristics for a suitable habitat for any protected species. It is a small Greenfield site and any development proposal will be carefully designed in order to minimise any harm to the character and appearance of the village. Measures would be taken to mitigate the further effect development would have on the countryside and landscape setting of the village. The site is within the SSSI Impact Zone of Askham Bog SSSI and Clifton Ings and Rawcliffe Meadows SSSI. The site is located solely within flood zone 1. Our client maintains that this site is a logical site for development and it is our opinion that the Council should modify the plan and include this site as a housing allocation.	Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Mr & Mrs Beckett
SID371/Mod/ALT/2			We disagree with the draft allocations. We believe that site ref. land off Wetherby Road, Rufforth should be supported and included as a housing allocation in the Local Plan and should be modified to meet the test of soundness. Attached is a representation that was submitted to the Council in November 2017 containing further information and a site plan.	Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Mr & Mrs Beckett

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID376/Mod/ALT/1			Taylor Wimpey UK Ltd proposes the release the land at Galtres Farm shown in Figure 1 (Site 999) from the Green Belt for residential development. The site has been promoted previously and was considered in the 2017 SHLAA (sites 891 & 922) alongside land to the north and east but was not taken forward. The boundaries of the 'Galtres Garden Village' (Site 964) should be refined to include the remainder of the land at Galtres Farm (Site 999) which extends to approximately 27 hectares and could accommodate a significant amount of new homes as well as providing significant open space and increasing the size and usability of the proposed country park to the north. This would be beneficial in providing a larger the Garden Village the more, services and would enable access from the A1237.	ELG Planning (Steven Longstaff) OBO Taylor Wimpey Ltd
SID389/Mod/ALT/1			I would suggest it is replaced by the previous submission: H26. Dauby Lane. This would have the beneficial effect of connecting the two residential areas of the village.	Sandra Atkinson
SID394/Mod/ALT/1			We consider that the Local Plan needs to bring forward additional sites to meet the City of York's Objectively Assessed Housing Need. It is considered that our client's land to the 'west of Common Road, Dunnington' should be allocated for older persons housing to help meet the OAN within the city area.	The Planning Bureau (Stephen Courcier) OBO McCarthy & Stone Retirement Lifestyles Ltd
SID401/S/Mod/Alt/1			Additional land needs to be allocated to ensure enough houses will be built. Consequently, sites such as 789 (extention to H39) should be removed from the Green Belt and included in the list of draft housing allocations noted in Draft Policy H1.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes ) OBO Mr & Mrs Sunderland and Mr & Mrs Wilson
SID407/Mod/ALT/1			If development in Elvington is necessary then the previous proposed site in Dauby land would be a more sensible option due to more housing opportunity and would link the two ends of the village.	Rob Littlewood
SID410/Mod/ALT/1			If further Elvington development is necessary then the previous proposed site in Dauby Lane would be a preferred option in that it offers significantly more housing opportunity, and of the more appropriate type. It would also provide a link between the two ends of the village and give better access to the main B1228 and A1079 routes.	Helene Littlewood
SID412/Mod/ALT/1			The proposed site H39 should be withdrawn and excluded, and H26 should be considered instead as most inhabitants of the village support this area for development, despite the villageservices already being at almost full capacity. If a site must be considered in Elvington, H26 should be the only site considered.	Louisa Stevens

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID422/Mod/ALT/1			Site allocation proposed for housing by landowners. Site is east of the A19 Selby Road, north of A64, west of Cherry Wood Crescent (provides map). Approx 2.1ha and is flat agricultural land. No planning history. Has been rejected previously due to fulfilling green wedge function. Considers that it would be possible to retain green edge to site with housing development behind. Accessible site. Other proposed allocations in plan are green belt land. Land is available and deliverable for housing within 5 years.	NDM 5
SID586/Mod/ALT/1			New site submission. Land North of Harewood Close, Windsor Drive, Wigginton (previously submitted at pre-publication stage). The site is well related to the village of Wigginton and could be developed to fully integrate into the existing urban edge, much like land allocated to the north of Haxby (ST9). The site can be designed to ensure any development does not allow further encroachment into the Green Belt and is an achievable and deliverable site that can contribute to the much needed additional housing for York, as identified within the Government's recent Consultation Paper.	Savills (M Boyce) OBO Mr Thomas & Mr Allen Park
SID587/Mod/ALT/1			The housing requirement figure for the Plan Period should be increased to at least 1,100 dwellings per annum. Land south of Cherry Lane, Dringhouses is suitable for development and should be included as a housing allocation to help meet the city's housing need (Rep goes into further detail on site suitability, provides evidence.)	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh)OBO Shepherd Homes Land at Cherry Lane
SID589/Mod/ALT/1			Malton Road Business Park and land to north east - The site outlined red on the Plan at Appendix A should be identified on the Local Plan Proposals Map as an employment allocation; The 14.66 hectares at the Malton Road Business Park should be included as an employment allocation.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Malton Road Developments Ltd
SID592/Mod/ALT/1			H33 Land to the south of the water tower, Dunnington should be re-allocated in the plan for housing development. The site is suitable for development as demonstrated by the council's own evidence base and the fact it has been allocated for housing in the past. H33 could contribute towards meeting the housing need of the city. Two boundaries are proposed the original previous allocation 1.8ha and the extended wider site 2.4ha. The sites are put forward for housing and associated uses such as parking and open space.	ONEILL Associates (Graeme Holbeck) OBO Yorvik Homes
SID595/Mod/ALT/1			We object to the site (Former SF10: Riverside Gardens Elvington) being rejected as a potential housing option within CYC's Publication Draft Local Plan. The development proposals are situated in a suitable and highly sustainable location there are no technical or environmental (built and natural) constraints that would preclude the development of the site. Additional housing allocations to those currently proposed by CYC will need to be identified in order to meet the City's housing needs over the proposed plan period. Which is why we fully support CYC's Officer's recent recommendation to allocate the site for residential development. Though we would suggest that a quantum of 110 homes be applied to the site. See also supporting evidence provided by Barton Wilmore for this site together with previous reps on this site.	Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID595/Mod/ALT/2			Object to former ST11 being rejected as a potential housing option within CYC's Publication Draft Local Plan. The site represents one of the most sustainable locations for new residential development in the City, benefits from strong defensible boundaries, and there are no technical or environmental (built and natural) constraints that would preclude the development of the site. We believe that there is a compelling case for the release of additional land as housing allocations within the CYC Local Plan in order to meet the City's full objectively assessed housing needs. Consequently, the New Lane, Huntington proposals have the potential to provide up to 250 new homes, public open space, green wedges and associated infrastructure. See also supporting evidence provided by Barton Wilmore for this site together with previous reps on this site.	Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID598/Mod/ALT/1			Rep goes into further detail but to summarise - housing provision in the Local Plan should be higher and their client's site SF1 Land North of Flaxton Road, Strensall should be included for housing provision. Rep details proposal for 30 homes at density of 30dph that can be delivered in the next five years.	Paul Butler Planning OBO Mr K Chan
SID598/Mod/ALT/1			H26 Dauby Lane should have been included before H39 in order to help meet the city's housing need. Should have been included in the plan either as an allocation or safeguarded land (rep goes into further detail).	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/Mod/Alt/1			Former site H26 Dauby Lane should be allocated.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/Mod/ALT/1			Site 814 / formerly SF4 Land north of Haxby should be included in the plan as safeguarded land	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/Mod/ALT/4			Site 859 / formerly SF15 Land north of Escrick should be included in the plan either as a housing allocation or as safeguarded land.	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID598/Mod/ALT/5			Site 872 / formerly ST12 Manor Heath, Copmanthorpe should be allocated in the plan for housing or as safeguarded land. (Further detail provided in rep)	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/Mod/ALT/6			Site 882 - Askham Lane, Acomb and Land south of Foxwood Lane, Askham should be allocated in the plan for housing. The site can contribute to meeting the city's housing need and make the plan sound without doing harm (further detail provided in rep).	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID598/Mod/ALT/7			Site 926 - (formerly H28) North Lane, Wheldrake should be allocated in the plan for housing. The site can contribute to meeting the city's housing need and make the plan sound without doing harm (further detail provided in rep).	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Linden Homes Strategic Land
SID600/Mod/ALT/1			Site 131 - (formerly ST13) Moor Lane, Copmanthorpe should be allocated in the plan for housing. The site can contribute to meeting the city's housing need and make the plan sound without doing harm (further detail provided in rep).	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Shepherd Property Group Site
SID601/Mod/ALT/1			Site 903 - (formerly H34 Land north of Church Lane) should be allocated in the plan for housing or as safeguarded land. The site can contribute to meeting the city's housing need and make the plan sound without doing harm (further detail provided in rep).	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO PJ Procter
SID602/Mod/ALT/1			Site 187 (formerly ST30) Land North of Stockton Lane and The Wider Site - should be allocated in the plan for housing or as safeguarded land. The site can contribute to meeting the city's housing need and make the plan sound without doing harm as well as providing an improved sporting facility of the City of York Hockey Club and Heworth Cricket Club (further detail provided in rep).	DPP Planning (Claire Linley) OBO Strata Homes Ltd
SID603/Mod/ALT/1			We suggest that SHLAA Site Refs. 861 and 862 should be allocated for housing. This could be achieved in asensitive manner in respect of heritage assets (please see below) and potentially contribute an estimated 250dwellings to supply on what is previously developed land within the urban part of York. This would assist TheRetreat in providing a new hospital replacing the current underused and obsolete facilities.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO The Retreat Living Limited

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID604/Mod/ALT/1			Proposed land at North Field, York for allocation for housing. The land is Site Reference 871 within the Strategic Housing Land Availability Assessment (SHLAA). Extensive supporting information provided. (Site 871)	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID605/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	Northminster Business Park Allocaton ST19 (Policy SS23) should be extended to include Site 687 to the east of Northfield Lane. Site 687 should be released from the General Extent of Green Belt to be allocated for employment land. It currently comprises the former Oakwood Farmhouse and Oakwood Business Park itself, comprising 5 large, portal frame units. The southern part is wholly taken up with caravan storage	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Mr D Lancaster & Oakwood Business Park
SID606/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	The redundant Yorkshire Water facility located off Landing Lane to the north of Water End in Acomb should be allocated for housing. Extensive supporting evidence provided. Brownfield site capable of delivering 150 apartments. There are options for alleviating flooding on site. Alt site 130.	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO KeyLand Developments Ltd
SID607/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	Allocate land at Malton Road (previously H50) for housing. Site is 7.1ha	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO Taylor Wimpey
SID608/Mod/ALT/1		Not Sound	Land at Park Farm, Skelton should be allocated as mixed use (housing and employment)	Lister Haigh (Zoe Harrison) OBO Messrs N Blacker & Son
SID613/Mod/ALT/1			Additional land should be allocated to address housing need. Respondents suggests that sites such as 'ST12: Land at Manor Heath, Copmanthorpe' should be allocated in order to provide sufficient land to accommodate an increased housing target.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO Askham Bryan College
SID620/Mod/ALT/1			Land north east of Huntington (Galtres Garden Village - ref 964) should be allocated as a new settlement. The site will accommodate 1,753 residential units which includes a 64-person care home on 77.37 hectares of land with an additional 15.6ha provided as a country park. The representation contains extensive supporting information relating to: Green Belt, Highway Impact and Access, Landscape, Ecology, Archaeology, Heritage, Flood Risk and Drainage as well as Sustainability Appraisal, Viability and Deliverability.	Eamonn Keogh ONeill Associates OBO Galtres Village Development Company

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID826/Mod/ALT/2			The site known as Huntington North (Site 191) should be included in the revised draft Local Plan sites because it complies with criteria 1,2,3 & 4 and the technical officer assessment for transport, geo-environmental, historic environment, landscape and design. It is a superior site to other allocations	Thomas Pilcher Homes
SID826/Mod/ALT/3			Site H28 is an obvious site for inclusion which is superior to current allocations.	Thomas Pilcher Homes
SID827/Mod/ALT/1			Planning applications on the Huntington North Site (Ref ??) have been refused solely on the grounds of greenbelt. Site 191 Huntington North should be removed from the greenbelt as the secretary of state wrote (APP/C2741/W16/3149489) that the proposed development would not harm the landscape character and setting of York and that it could deliver a more successful urban edge than that which currently exists and screen existing and future housing in a relatively short timeframe. Previously rejected site 191 Land North of Avon drive should be allocated in preference to sites ST7, ST8, ST9, ST14, ST15 and ST31 on the basis of agricultural land value. As 25% of site 191 is inaccessible and fenced off to protect a water pipe line and 75% is rented by a tenant farmer for set aside the land not being worth the efforts for grazing or arable farming in contrast with accepted higher value on other sites. Ecological surveys have been submitted alongside previous refused planning applications. The site complies with site selection criteria 1,2,3,4 and technical officer assessments. The technical officer assessment that land at the site is required for duelling and grade separation of the ring road/roundabout affecting the viability of the site is not true and plans of the land actually required have been submitted.	Pilcher Homes Ltd
SID824/Mod/ALT/1			The land edged red on the attached plan at Grimston Bar should be excluded from the green belt and allocated for mixed use development to include residential, employment, educational and leisure/recreational uses under a discrete site-specific policy. It is accepted that development under any such allocation would be subject to criteria dealing in particular with landscaping, building heights and the apportionment of built development and open space across the site. Alt site 181 including part of former ST6.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO Grimston Bar Development Group ST6 Site 181
SID836/Mod/ALT/1			The site identified as Site 752 on the plan attached to the previous representations dated 30th October 2017 and 1st September 2016 should be identified as a housing site or as safeguarded land in the Local Plan.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO REV Sir T Forbes Adams Combined
SID837/Mod/ALT/1			The green belt boundary should be re-drawn to follow the road leading to the former North Selby Mine and the land between the mine road and Escrick village, as defined in the attached submissions should be allocated for residential development in total or in part and, if the latter, the balance should be identified as safeguarded land.	Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO Escrick Park Estates Combined

## CYC Local Plan Publication Draft

### ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID838/Mod/ALT/1			Land south of Foxwood Lane, Acomb should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing – evidence provided - In response to the three key transportation issues to be considered as part of the process access Suitable access arrangements for vehicles, pedestrians and cyclists can be provided at the development site, as indicated in Drawing A088531/ C001 - Accessibility The site is accessible on foot or by bike to a range of useful local destinations, and - there are public transport options available for journeys further afield. Traffic Impacts The site is expected to generate 68 motor vehicle trips in the AM peak hour and 76 in the PM peak hour. This level of additional traffic is not expected to result in any capacity problems but if necessary, mitigation measures can be delivered. The development site satisfies the key transportation issues, and is suitable for allocation in the City of York Local Development Framework Submission Draft Core Strategy for residential development.	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID848/Mod/ALT/1			Avant Homes wish to promote the land to the North of the A59 and west of the A1237, East of Station Road Poppleton as a housing site to be included within the local plan. The site is estimated at circa 200 homes (30% affordable), with significant openspace and a new car park to serve poppleton railway station. The car park could relieve current pressures as well as create extra capacity in line with increased train frequencies upon electrification of the line, it could also open up the adjacent former coal yard for retail or community uses as the station expands. The development could also provide an upgrade to the level crossing which network rail are currently unable to fund. Planting schemes are proposed to protect areas of greenbelt and maintain open aspects of Poppleton, these areas are also proposed to contain SuDs. An indicative framework for the site is shown in appendix 1	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes



## Policies Map

### Policy SS1 Delivering Sustainable Growth for York

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID13/S/SS1/1	Sound	Sound	Considers the plan sound because it designates the land surrounding Askham Bog as Green Belt, this area should remain so as it is an important nature reserve.	Barbara Roberts
SID342/S/SS1/1	Not Sound	Not Sound	It is not clear from the Policies/Proposals Maps what is existing Employment and Residential Land or where the approx. Inner and Outer Green Belt boundaries lie or what currently has detailed Green Belt boundaries as outlined in one of the previous Part B's of this document. The impact of allocated Housing and Employment Sites on existing areas cannot be visually appreciated without this, for instance it would be inappropriate to allocate Housing Sites on, around or too close to Light Manufacturing Industrial Estates.	Andy Bell

#### Proposed Modification

SID267/Mod/SS1/4			The site at Foxwood Lane, Acomb should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited
SID342/Mod/SS1/1			Include pre and post Policies/Proposals Maps that provide clarity on where existing Residential and Employment land lies, Employment land should be shown in different colours to represent the type Employment Land it is, this is done to some extent in the Central Policies/Proposals Map. Include the approx. location of the Inner and Outer Green Belt boundaries.	Andy Bell

## Policies Map

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID68/S/SS2/1			#1 entire site - Northfield Lane (Triangle) - This is, however, an utterly erroneous assumption because the Green Belt boundaries around York are being defined (or established) for the first time. They are not being altered. In this case, paragraph 85 of the NPPF is therefore the Key advice to be considered. In defining/ establishing boundaries the Council must meet the identified requirement for sustainable development i.e. it must allocate land to meet identified needs for housing, employment, leisure and other needs. In other words, it is not a question of what land should be taken out of the Green Belt. The Council is at the point of deciding what land should not be included in the Green Belt in order to meet the identified requirements for sustainable development.	SBO Lands - Stephen Otley
SID259/S/SS2/1		Not Sound	Former ST12 should be removed from the green belt and allocated for housing.	Paul Butler Planning OBO David Wilson Homes
SID833/S/SS2/5		Not Sound	The outer boundary of the green belt needs to be 6 miles from the city centre. This is not inline with the revocation order of RSS. Any exceptions to this need to be justified.	George E Wright Combined
SID833/S/SS2/6		Not Sound	Unnecessary to include strays and green wedges in green belt. They would be better protected through a green wedge policy.	George E Wright Combined
SID833/S/SS2/7		Not Sound	There is no justification for a policy to prevent coalescence between the urban core and the nearer outlying settlements. To do so would be contrary to policy in para 84 NPPF.	George E Wright Combined

#### Proposed Modification

SID259/Mod/SS2/1			Former ST12 should be removed from the green belt and allocated for housing.	Paul Butler Planning OBO David Wilson Homes
SID267/Mod/SS2/4			The site at Foxwood Lane, Acomb should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing	Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited

## Policies Map

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID849/Mod/SS2/2			Amend green belt boundary to reflect submitted rep (noting Plan in appendix 5)	Oneill Associates (Janet O'Neill)OBO University of York

## Policies Map

### Policy SS5 Castle Gateway

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID269/LC/SS5/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	I am questioning the legality of the map - not the procedural requirements of the Local Plan.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID406/LC/SS5/2				York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)

#### Soundness

SID269/S/SS5/1		Not Sound	The policies map indicates a small area at the base of Clifford's Tower is no longer marked with the rest of the mound as open/public space - this leaves it vulnerable to development. There is currently an appeal associated with is area - until legal outcome is made surely this area must be shown as Open Space.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID406/S/SS5/2		Not Sound	Local Plan Evidence Base document : Open Space and Green Infrastructure update Sept.2017, pages 30 –32, Guildhall Ward: map shows 426 the motte and green space around Cliffords Tower with small dent. Incorrect - the whole area is amenity greenspace and there is no legal justification for its removal.	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)

#### Proposed Modification

SID269/Mod/SS5/1			The policies map indicates a small area at the base of Clifford's Tower is no longer marked with the rest of the mound as open/public space - this leaves it vulnerable to development. There is currently an appeal associated with is area - until legal outcome is made surely this area must be shown as Open Space.	Mrs Janet Hopton
SID406/Mod/SS5/2			Amend SS5 map to include all of the green space around Clifford's Tower as amenity greenspace.	York Green Party (Cllr Denise Craghill)

## Policies Map

### Policy SS8 Land Adjacent to Hull Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID231/S/SS8/1	Not Sound		Undue concentration of major development in the SE quadrant of the city. Cumulative impact of these proposals would cause harm to this area of the city. There would not only be a significant loss of open land and visual outlook but also greatly increased traffic congestion, traffic noise, air pollution and community severance.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson

## Policies Map

### Policy SS10 Land North of Monks Cross

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID595/LC/SS10/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID234/S/SS10/1		Not Sound	Proposed building sites (ST14, ST9, ST35 and ST8), as well as the granary site in Clifton and the stadium being built all feed into the A1237. The sites would create too much congestion on the A1237.	Mary Crawford

## Policies Map

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID234/S/SS11/1	Not Sound		Proposed building sites (ST14, ST9, ST35 and ST8), as well as the granary site in Clifton and the stadium being built all feed into the A1237. The sites would create too much congestion on the A1237.	Mary Crawford

## Policies Map

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID234/S/SS12/1	Not Sound	Proposed building sites (ST14, ST9, ST35 and ST8), as well as the granary site in Clifton and the stadium being built all feed into the A1237. The sites would create too much congestion on the A1237.	Mary Crawford
-----------------	-----------	---	---------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID199/Mod/SS12/1		Proposal Map identifies boundary of ST14. In light of SID199 representations, Proposals Map should be altered to exclude ST14 and access road locations entirely.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison
-------------------	--	---	---



## Policies Map

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID231/S/SS13/1	Not Sound		Undue concentration of major development in the SE quadrant of the city. Cumulative impact of these proposals would cause harm to this area of the city. There would not only be a significant loss of open land and visual outlook but also greatly increased traffic congestion, traffic noise, air pollution and community severance.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
-----------------	-----------	--	--	--

#### Proposed Modification

SID378/Mod/SS13/1			The strategic road link linking the garden village with the A64, and providing its primary access, is indicated on the Policies Map on an alignment that is technically undeliverable. The Policies Map should be updated to show the appropriate alignment (see Plan at Appendix 14).	Quod (Tim Waring) OBO Langwith Development Partnership Limited
-------------------	--	--	--	---

## Policies Map

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID234/S/SS19/1	Not Sound		Proposed building sites (ST14, ST9, ST35 and ST8), as well as the granary site in Clifton and the stadium being built all feed into the A1237. The sites would create too much congestion on the A1237.	Mary Crawford
SID345/S/SS19/15	Not Sound		Policies map should reflect the boundary suggested by DIO. See Figure 1, Appendix 4. [See modification SID345/MOD/SS19/1]	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## Policies Map

### Policy SS20 Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID231/S/SS20/1	Not Sound		Undue concentration of major development in the SE quadrant of the city. Cumulative impact of these proposals would cause harm to this area of the city. There would not only be a significant loss of open land and visual outlook but also greatly increased traffic congestion, traffic noise, air pollution and community severance. The increased traffic through Fulford Village would seriously damage the special character of the Fulford Conservation Area.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson
SID345/S/SS20/14	Not Sound		Policies map should reflect the boundary suggested by DIO. See Appendix 5. [See modification SID345/MOD/SS20/1]	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## Policies Map

### Policy SS22 University of York Expansion

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID231/S/SS22(ST27)/1	Not Sound		Undue concentration of major development in the SE quadrant of the city. Cumulative impact of these proposals would cause harm to this area of the city. There would not only be a significant loss of open land and visual outlook but also greatly increased traffic congestion, traffic noise, air pollution and community severance.	Fulford Parish Council Rachel Robinson

## Policies Map

### Policy EC1 Provision of Employment Land

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID358/Mod/EC1/2

The site 795 Greenacres should be allocated for employment on the Policies Map.

Doug Jennings  
Planning OBO Mark  
Miller

## Policies Map

E16 Poppleton Garden Centre

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
Soundness				
SID55/S/E16/2	Sound		Supports the removal of the site from the green belt and its inclusion within the defined settlement limit of Upper and Nether Poppleton.	Indigo Planning (Andrew Astin) OBO Wyevale Garden Centres

## Policies Map

E18 Towthorpe Lines, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

### Soundness

SID345/S/E18/3	Sound	Sound	Support boundary as drawn on policies map north	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
----------------	-------	-------	---	--

## Policies Map

### Policy R4 Out of Centre Retailing

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID245/S/R4/1			York City Centre should be retained as a City Centre and sit at the top of the retail hierarchy. Its role and function strengthened within the City of York Local Plan.	Pegasus Group (Kate Lowe ) OBO Asda Stores Ltd
SID245/S/R4/2			ASDA supports the protection of city/district/local centres through Policy R4 however believe that out of centre shopping centres should be recognised in the retail hierarchy.	Pegasus Group (Kate Lowe ) OBO Asda Stores Ltd
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID245/Mod/R4/1			The ASDA Layerthorpe store should be retained within the proposed city centre boundary.	Pegasus Group (Kate Lowe ) OBO Asda Stores Ltd
SID245/Mod/R4/2			The ASDA Store, within the Monks Shopping Centre, should be recognised and designated as a retail destination.	Pegasus Group (Kate Lowe ) OBO Asda Stores Ltd



## Policies Map

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID837/LC/H1Policy /2	Does not comply with DtC			Jennifer Hubbard Planning OBO Escrick Park Estates Combined
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID359/S/H1Policy/ 2		Not Sound	See accompanying representation titled 'York Local Plan Publication Draft Consultation - Representation on behalf of NHS Property Services Ltd: Clifton Park Hospital' (ref: 50794/MHE/AJk/15677426v2)	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO NHS Property Services
SID620/S/H1(Policy) /2		Not Sound	Land north east of Huntington (Galtres Garden Village - ref 964) should be allocated as a new settlement. The site will accommodate 1,753 residential units which includes a 64-person care home on 77.37 hectares of land with an additional 15.6ha provided as a country park. The representation contains extensive supporting information relating to: Green Belt, Highway Impact and Access, Landscape, Ecology, Archaeology, Heritage, Flood Risk and Drainage as well as Sustainability Appraisal, Viability and Deliverability.	Eamonn Keogh ONeill Associates OBO Galtres Village Development Company
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID220/Mod/H1(Policy)/2		Not Sound	Site 768 (formerly SF5) should be allocated for housing. Site is Land to the West of Moor Lane, Copmanthorpe. Extensive supporting evidence supplied. Site is 15.34ha.	O'Neill Associates (Philip Holmes)OBO Mr M Ibbotson
SID359/Mod/H1/2			See accompanying representation titled 'York Local Plan Publication Draft Consultation - Representation on behalf of NHS Property Services Ltd: Clifton Park Hospital' (ref: 50794/MHE/AJk/15677426v2)	Lichfields (Adam Jackson) OBO NHS Property Services
SID594/Mod/H1 (policy)/2			Site ST7: Alternative Site Size proposed: Option A: 845 houses in an area of 43.53ha, 60% net developable area 26.4Ha at 32dph.	Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7
SID594/Mod/H1 (policy)/5			Option 2. 945 houses on an area of 43.53Ha, 70% net developable area - 30.47 Ha net site area at 32dph.	Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7

## Policies Map

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID594/Mod/H1 (policy)/8			Option 3: 1,225 Homes on an area of 57.27 Ha, 70% net developable area – 40.1 Ha net site area at 32dph.	Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7
SID620/Mod/H1(Policy)/2			Land north east of Huntington (Galtres Garden Village - ref 964) should be allocated as a new settlement. The site will accommodate 1,753 residential units which includes a 64-person care home on 77.37 hectares of land with an additional 15.6ha provided as a country park. The representation contains extensive supporting information relating to: Green Belt, Highway Impact and Access, Landscape, Ecology, Archaeology, Heritage, Flood Risk and Drainage as well as Sustainability Appraisal, Viability and Deliverability.	Eamonn Keogh ONEILL Associates OBO Galtres Village Development Company

## Policies Map

Policy ED7 York College and Askham Bryan College

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

### Proposed Modification

SID613/Mod/ED7/1

Proposals map should better reflect recent construction at the site consented under 16/01095/FUL. This includes student and teaching areas as well as the erection of additional animal shelters, which are important areas of the campus' teaching facilities.

Directions Planning  
(Kathryn Jukes) OBO  
Askham Bryan  
College

## Policies Map

### Policy G11 Green Infrastructure

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID271/Mod/G11/1

To make the Plan consistent with national policy the area identified in submitted rep. (Part of Peasholme Green) should be given a site reference and name, be defined on the Policies map as open space i.e. Common land and be described in the Local Plan Publication Draft

Angela Wheatcroft

## Policies Map

### Policy GI5 Protection of Open Space and Playing Fields

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID825/LC/GI5/2	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Osboldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
-----------------	-------------------	-----------------------	--	---

#### Soundness

SID271/S/GI5/1		Not Sound	GI5 refers to... Protection needed from unsuitable development. An area of common land covered by this policy has been omitted from the policies map and is part of Peasholme Green hatched green on map provided in the rep. The area is public common land. As common land its fairground rights were still exercised during the 1950s.	Angela Wheatcroft
SID612/S/GI5/1		Not Sound	The Policies map does not reflect planning consent currently under construction at 'New Lodge', New Earswick. The Plan would be out-of-date on adoption where this error to remain unresolved.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO JRHT

#### Proposed Modification

SID612/Mod/GI5/1			Amend policies map to remove open space at 'New Lodge', New Earswick, to reflect planning consent 15/00758/FULM, which is currently under construction.	Directions Planning (Kathryn Jukes) OBO JRHT
------------------	--	--	---	--

## Policies Map

### Policy T2 Strategic Public Transport Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID6/LC/T2/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Main objection is due to the additional traffic that will be generated by new housing / residents, existing road infrastructure will not be able to cope.	Anthony Paylor
--------------	--------------------------	-----------------------	---	----------------

#### Soundness

SID6/S/T2/1		Not Sound	Main objection is due to the additional traffic that will be generated by new housing / residents, existing road infrastructure will not be able to cope.	Anthony Paylor
-------------	--	-----------	---	----------------

## Policies Map

### Policy T4 Strategic Highway Network Capacity Improvements

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID6/LC/T4/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Current upgrades to outer ring road are inadequate. A1237 needs to be a dual carriageway and the roundabouts replaced with fly-over junctions if the additional traffic from new residents is to be accommodated.	Anthony Paylor
SID239/LC/T4/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Terence John (Terry) Crawford

#### Soundness

SID6/S/T4/1		Not Sound	Current upgrades to outer ring road are inadequate. A1237 needs to be a dual carriageway and the roundabouts replaced with fly-over junctions if the additional traffic from new residents is to be accommodated.	Anthony Paylor
SID239/S/T4/1		Not Sound	There is an imbalance between the excessive quantity of proposed development along the A1237 corridor, particularly to the north of York, versus relatively few proposals to the south along the A64 corridor.	Terence John (Terry) Crawford

#### Proposed Modification

SID6/Mod/T4/1			A1237 needs to be a dual carriageway and the roundabouts replaced with fly-over junctions if the additional traffic is to be accommodated.	Anthony Paylor
SID239/Mod/T4/1			To make sound, prioritise development to the south-west, south and south-east of York.	Terence John (Terry) Crawford

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID13/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Appears to be compliant.	Barbara Roberts
SID54/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Read relevant information.	Richard Smith
SID63/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Cliffords Tower shows a section of Clifford's Tower motte that has been removed for the building of the visitor's centre. This decision is subject to a court hearing in april 2018.	John Hayes
SID234/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Mary Crawford
SID245/LC/Gen/1			EMAIL -- This information is not supplied.	Pegasus Group (Kate Lowe ) OBO Asda Stores Ltd
SID272/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I consider all documents to be legally compliant. I support and agree with CYC processes, procedures and justification and I am satisfied that all documents are legally compliant	Rachel Cole
SID285/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	The plan has been through the correct procedures.	E Peel
SID297/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Map provides misleading information.	Cllr Roger Bedford
SID335/LC/GEN/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I have no knowledge to suggest that the document is not legally compliant in both respects	Lionel Lennox
SID364/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	We haven't examined this question in detail, and are not in a position to comment further.	York Labour Party - Harry Thornton



## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID417/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	We haven't examined this question in detail, and are not in a position to comment further.	Dave Merrett OBO York Environment Forum Transport Group
SID394/LC/Gen/1		Legally Compliant		The Planning Bureau (Stephen Courcier) OBO McCarthy & Stone Retirement Lifestyles Ltd
SID404/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Haven't examined this question in detail, and are not in a position to comment further.	York Bus Forum - Graham Collett
SID594/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7
SID595/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID620/LC/Gen/2	Does not comply with DtC		With regard to the duty to co-operate it may be the case the Council has consulted with neighbouring authorities, but some of those authorities have expressed concerns that have not been fully resolved	Eamonn Keogh O'Neill Associates OBO Galtres Village Development Company
SID651/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Carr
SID652/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Hind

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID653/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Oliver Hind
SID654/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Michael Fedyszyn
SID655/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Hilary Fedyszyn
SID656/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Daniel Buckley
SID657/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Timothy Duffy
SID658/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kristen Buckley
SID659/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Emily McLaughlin
SID660/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paula McLaughlin
SID661/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Christopher McLaughlin
SID662/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Margaret Moxon
SID663/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Moira Law

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID664/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robert Law
SID665/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Brian Ferguson
SID666/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Hirst
SID667/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Grace Hirst
SID668/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Findlay Wallace
SID669/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joan Wallace
SID670/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tim Harrison
SID671/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Phoebe Harrison
SID672/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Bryony Harrison
SID673/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	James Ogram
SID674/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Eric Wilson

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID675/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Diane Brownlee
SID676/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Irene Wilson
SID677/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Lenore Janet Hill
SID678/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Grewer
SID679/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robert Brownlee
SID680/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Linda Hill
SID681/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Clare Frisby
SID682/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Carol Ferguson
SID683/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Heather Heeles
SID684/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Ronald Hill
SID685/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Colin Perrott

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID686/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Ruth Perrott
SID687/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Adams
SID688/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Gillian Adams
SID689/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Michael Buckley
SID690/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Karen Buckley
SID691/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Beverley Duffy
SID692/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Greenaway
SID693/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sally Greenaway
SID694/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Abigail Sutton
SID695/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	William Marsh
SID696/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Bernadette Sutton

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID697/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sue Glenn
SID698/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Hazel Sedman
SID699/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	James Muldoon
SID700/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Karen Kingston
SID701/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Janet Muldoon
SID702/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tony Morton
SID703/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	June Morton
SID704/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jonathan Browne
SID705/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Darren Robson
SID706/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Hurst
SID707/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Hogarth

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID708/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Sutton
SID709/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Julie Tink
SID710/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Graham Tink
SID711/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Andrew Milner
SID712/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sue Nightingale
SID713/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Keren Hunter
SID714/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Gillian Hodgson
SID715/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robyn Hodgson
SID716/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Richard Muldoon
SID717/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Claire & Paul Savage
SID718/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Michael Wright

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID719/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Wendy Wright
SID720/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Alison Smithers
SID721/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joanne Todd
SID722/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joan Louise Lambert
SID723/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter William Lambert
SID724/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Woodward
SID725/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Julie Woodward
SID726/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Cuttill
SID727/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Eric Boyd
SID728/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Anne Diley
SID729/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	James Wilson



## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID730/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Matthew Wilson
SID731/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Catherine Wilson
SID732/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sylvia McBriar
SID733/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Katie Savage
SID734/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Savage
SID735/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Simon Jowett
SID736/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Emily Olivia Blanehard
SID737/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter Jowett
SID738/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kay Jowett
SID739/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Christopher Green
SID740/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tony Green

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID741/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Katherine Green
SID742/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Milagres Green
SID743/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Susan Carter
SID744/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Harry & Paul Savage
SID745/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Lazonby
SID746/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Susan Smith
SID747/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Smith
SID748/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Harvey Walker
SID749/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Barbara Walker
SID750/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Claire Maton
SID751/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Emily Flood

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID752/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kate Hind
SID753/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Marshall
SID754/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Glyn Welsby
SID755/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tracey Welsby
SID756/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Freda Gill
SID757/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Elizabeth Tuxford
SID758/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	George Tuxford
SID759/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Trevor Taylor
SID760/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Conor McGilligan
SID761/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jack McGilligan
SID762/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jacqueline McGilligan

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID763/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Diana Cuthbert
SID764/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter Cuthbert
SID765/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Rita Lavender
SID766/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Judi Steel
SID767/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Keith Lavender
SID768/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Steel
SID769/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jeanette Chavda
SID770/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Nitin Chavda
SID771/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Vanessa Jowett
SID772/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Matthew Jowett
SID773/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Walters

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID774/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Rollinson
SID775/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Doug Abernethy
SID776/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joseph Glover
SID777/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Catherine Mary Driver
SID778/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Anna Rollinson
SID779/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tom Harrington
SID780/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Wilson
SID781/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jeff Brewer
SID782/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kevin Reilly
SID783/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jane Harrington
SID784/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Richard Kingston

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID785/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robert Nigel Ellenker
SID786/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Will Jennings
SID787/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Julie Jennings
SID788/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter Jennings
SID789/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Malcolm Carter
SID790/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Wales
SID791/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Holly Lee
SID792/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joan Wales
SID793/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Judy Noble
SID794/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Victoria Green
SID795/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sharon Moore

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID796/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Catherine Tomlinson
SID797/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Eric Tomlinson
SID798/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jane Cuttill
SID799/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joanne Travena
SID800/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Alan Travena
SID801/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Avril Browne
SID802/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Donald Glenn
SID803/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Ian McGilligan
SID804/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Lynda Carr
SID805/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joyce Carr
SID806/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jane Blair

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID807/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Bishop
SID808/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Karen Cariss
SID809/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Roger Blair
SID810/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Christine Walters
SID811/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jordane Thompson
SID812/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Noble
SID813/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Roger Pryor
SID814/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Carol Marshman
SID815/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stuart Auton
SID816/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Diley
SID817/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Pauline Brill



## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID818/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Andrew Hodgson
SID819/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Anthony Brill
SID820/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Alice Hirst
SID821/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Pamela Ogram
SID822/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Becki Linfoot
SID823/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Fiona Hirst
SID824/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Yvonne Dodd

### Soundness

SID54/S/Gen/1		Sound	Relevant communications sent relating to Building Proposals off Moor Lane Woodthorpe.	Richard Smith
SID63/S/Gen/1		Sound	Cliffords Tower shows a section of Clifford's Tower motte that has been removed for the building of the visitor's centre. This decision is subject to a court hearing in april 2018.	John Hayes
SID118/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	It is not sufficient simply to indicate the general location of aConservation Area by means of a star. In order to assist those using the Plan know exactly where the Plan's Policies relating toConservation Areas apply, the Proposals Map should show theprecise boundaries of each of York's Conservation Areas.	Historic England - Ian Smith

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	It is not sufficient simply to indicate the general location of a Conservation Area by means of a star. In order to assist those using the Plan know exactly where the Plan's Policies relating to Conservation Areas apply, the Proposals Map should show the precise boundaries of each of York's Conservation Areas.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/Gen/2		Not Sound	Policies maps do not show Areas of Archaeological Importance and SAMs to reference with policies. Needs to be on Policies map clearly.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/Gen/2		Not Sound	Policies maps do not show Areas of Archaeological Importance and SAMs to reference with policies. Needs to be on Policies map clearly.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID306/LC/Gen/2		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	Y Boynton
SID307/LC/Gen/2		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	G Greetham
SID308/LC/Gen/2		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	NDM 3
SID309/LC/Gen/2		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	Brian L Bell
SID310/LC/Gen/2		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	Richard Rafton
SID311/LC/Gen/2		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	M Ellis
SID364/S/Gen/2		Not Sound		York Labour Party - Harry Thornton
SID365/S/Gen/2		Not Sound		York Labour Party - Rachael Maskell

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID393/S/Gen/1		Sound	Overall, I judge that the City of York: Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies Map, Sustainability Appraisal and Strategic Environmental Assessment to be 'sound' documents. However, more specifically, I feel the following principles within the current draft of the Local Plan are crucial for the future development of York: The plan gives good protection of York's Greenbelt, protecting our unique City. Given that population figures are predicted to be lower than estimated by the Government, the plan provides enough houses for the people of York. From delivering roughly 500 houses per annum, to nearly 1000 house per annum, I believe that through the housing delivered under the plan, affordability will be improved in York. I am confident that with the current draft of the Local Plan, York will be able to provide sustainable development across the City and deliver a balance between providing new homes and delivering more employment, whilst protecting the City's special character.	Cllr N Ayre
SID417/S/Gen/2		Sound		Cllr Ian Cuthbertson
SID588/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Rep relates to land off Albermarle Road shown on attachment to rep. On the 11th May 1992 Planning Permission was granted for use of the site as a car park in connection with the offices at Mill Mount. (Permission ref. 7/09/2508H/PA.) That permission was implemented and the site was used as a car park. The lawful use of the site is a car park. However, the land is designated along with All Saints RC School as an educational establishment on the Local Plan Policies Map. The site has no education use and has not been in education use since it was acquired by Mill Mount Properties Limited over 24 years ago The designation of the site for education use is not justified as it is not in education use and the owner has no intention making it available for education use. (Rep provides further documentation / evidence)	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Mill Mount Properties Ltd
SID651/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Carr
SID652/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Hind
SID653/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Oliver Hind
SID654/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Michael Fedyszyn
SID655/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Hilary Fedyszyn

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID656/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Daniel Buckley
SID657/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Timothy Duffy
SID658/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kristen Buckley
SID659/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Emily McLaughlin
SID660/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paula McLaughlin
SID661/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Christopher McLaughlin
SID662/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Margaret Moxon
SID663/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Moira Law
SID664/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robert Law
SID665/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Brian Ferguson
SID666/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Hirst

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID667/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Grace Hirst
SID668/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Findlay Wallace
SID669/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joan Wallace
SID670/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tim Harrison
SID671/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Phoebe Harrison
SID672/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Bryony Harrison
SID673/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	James Ogram
SID674/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Eric Wilson
SID675/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Diane Brownlee
SID676/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Irene Wilson
SID677/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Lenore Janet Hill

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID678/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Grewer
SID679/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robert Brownlee
SID680/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Linda Hill
SID681/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Clare Frisby
SID682/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Carol Ferguson
SID683/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Heather Heeles
SID684/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Ronald Hill
SID685/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Colin Perrott
SID686/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Ruth Perrott
SID687/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Adams
SID688/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Gillian Adams

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID689/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Michael Buckley
SID690/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Karen Buckley
SID691/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Beverley Duffy
SID692/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Greenaway
SID693/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sally Greenaway
SID694/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Abigail Sutton
SID695/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	William Marsh
SID696/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Bernadette Sutton
SID697/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sue Glenn
SID698/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Hazel Sedman
SID699/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	James Muldoon

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID700/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Karen Kingston
SID701/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Janet Muldoon
SID702/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tony Morton
SID703/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	June Morton
SID704/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jonathan Browne
SID705/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Darren Robson
SID706/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Hurst
SID707/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Hogarth
SID708/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Sutton
SID709/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Julie Tink
SID710/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Graham Tink



## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID711/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Andrew Milner
SID712/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sue Nightingale
SID713/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Keren Hunter
SID714/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Gillian Hodgson
SID715/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robyn Hodgson
SID716/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Richard Muldoon
SID717/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Claire & Paul Savage
SID718/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Michael Wright
SID719/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Wendy Wright
SID720/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Alison Smithers
SID721/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joanne Todd

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID722/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joan Louise Lambert
SID723/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter William Lambert
SID724/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Woodward
SID725/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Julie Woodward
SID726/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Cuttill
SID727/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Eric Boyd
SID728/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Anne Diley
SID729/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	James Wilson
SID730/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Matthew Wilson
SID731/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Catherine Wilson
SID732/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sylvia McBriar

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID733/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Katie Savage
SID734/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Savage
SID735/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Simon Jowett
SID736/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Emily Olivia Blanehard
SID737/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter Jowett
SID738/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kay Jowett
SID739/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Christopher Green
SID740/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tony Green
SID741/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Katherine Green
SID742/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Milagres Green
SID743/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Susan Carter

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID744/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Harry & Paul Savage
SID745/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Lazonby
SID746/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Susan Smith
SID747/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Smith
SID748/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Harvey Walker
SID749/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Barbara Walker
SID750/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Claire Maton
SID751/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Emily Flood
SID752/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kate Hind
SID753/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Marshall
SID754/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Glyn Welsby

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID755/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tracey Welsby
SID756/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Freda Gill
SID757/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Elizabeth Tuxford
SID758/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	George Tuxford
SID759/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Trevor Taylor
SID760/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Conor McGilligan
SID761/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jack McGilligan
SID762/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jacqueline McGilligan
SID763/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Diana Cuthbert
SID764/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter Cuthbert
SID765/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Rita Lavender

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID766/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Judi Steel
SID767/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Keith Lavender
SID768/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Steel
SID769/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jeanette Chavda
SID770/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Nitin Chavda
SID771/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Vanessa Jowett
SID772/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Matthew Jowett
SID773/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Walters
SID774/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Rollinson
SID775/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Doug Abernethy
SID776/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joseph Glover

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID777/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Catherine Mary Driver
SID778/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Anna Rollinson
SID779/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tom Harrington
SID780/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Wilson
SID781/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jeff Brewer
SID782/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kevin Reilly
SID783/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jane Harrington
SID784/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Richard Kingston
SID785/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robert Nigel Ellenker
SID786/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Will Jennings
SID787/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Julie Jennings

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID788/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter Jennings
SID789/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Malcolm Carter
SID790/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Wales
SID791/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Holly Lee
SID792/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joan Wales
SID793/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Judy Noble
SID794/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Victoria Green
SID795/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sharon Moore
SID796/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Catherine Tomlinson
SID797/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Eric Tomlinson
SID798/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jane Cuttill



## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID799/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joanne Travena
SID800/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Alan Travena
SID801/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Avril Browne
SID802/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Donald Glenn
SID803/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Ian McGilligan
SID804/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Lynda Carr
SID805/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joyce Carr
SID806/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jane Blair
SID807/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Bishop
SID808/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Karen Cariss
SID809/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Roger Blair

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID810/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Christine Walters
SID811/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jordane Thompson
SID812/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Noble
SID813/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Roger Pryor
SID814/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Carol Marshman
SID815/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stuart Auton
SID816/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Diley
SID817/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Pauline Brill
SID818/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Andrew Hodgson
SID819/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Anthony Brill
SID820/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Alice Hirst

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID821/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Pamela Ogram
SID822/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Becki Linfoot
SID823/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Fiona Hirst
SID824/S/Gen/2		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Yvonne Dodd

### Proposed Modification

SID54/Mod/Gen/1			I wish to register the fact that I am against any proposal for building new properties on green belt land off Moor Lane Woodthorpe.	Richard Smith
SID63/Mod/Gen/1			To conform with legislation CYC must carry out a period of advertisement in the local press and consider the objections they receive for the disposal of this land.	John Hayes
SID118/MOD/Gen/1			It is not sufficient simply to indicate the general location of aConservation Area by means of a star. In order to assist those using the Plan know exactly where the Plan's Policies relating toConservation Areas apply, the Proposals Map should show theprecise boundaries of each of York's Conservation Areas.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/Gen/1			It is not sufficient simply to indicate the general location of aConservation Area by means of a star. In order to assist those using the Plan know exactly where the Plan's Policies relating toConservation Areas apply, the Proposals Map should show theprecise boundaries of each of York's Conservation Areas.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/MOD/Gen/2			(a) The Proposals Map should show the precise boundaries ofeach of the Scheduled Monuments insofar as the scale of themaps allow. Where it is not possible to show the precise extent, a symbol should identify the location of that Scheduled Monument.(b) The Proposals Map should show the extent of the 'Area ofArchaeological Importance'	Historic England - Ian Smith

## Policies Map

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/Mod/Gen/2			(a) The Proposals Map should show the precise boundaries of each of the Scheduled Monuments insofar as the scale of the maps allow. Where it is not possible to show the precise extent, a symbol should identify the location of that Scheduled Monument. (b) The Proposals Map should show the extent of the 'Area of Archaeological Importance'	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID234/Mod/Gen/1			Focus building to the south of York where there are direct connections with the A64, A59 and A1079.	Mary Crawford
SID383/Mod/Gen/1			NE recommends that the policies map is updated to clearly distinguish between nationally and internationally designated sites of ecological value.	Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID383/Mod/Gen/2			NE note that there are a number of woodlands on the Ancient Woodland Inventory within the City of York Council Area which we would like to see included in the policies map. For mapping please see Magic: <a href="http://magic.defra.gov.uk/">http://magic.defra.gov.uk/</a>	Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID588/Mod/Gen/1			To make the plan sound the education designation on the site edge red on the attached plan should be removed from the site and the site should be shown as white land on the Local Plan Policies map.	ONEILL Associates (Eamonn Keogh) OBO Mill Mount Properties Ltd

# Policies Map

ALT Alternative Site

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

## Proposed Modification

SID838/Mod/ALT/4

The site at Foxwood Lane, Acomb should be removed from the Green Belt and allocated for housing

Savills (Jennifer Longstaff) OBO York Diocesan Board of Finance Limited

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS2 The Role of York's Green Belt

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID127/LC/SS2/1	Not Legally Compliant	Council did not adequately or transparently develop its green belt policies in preparation for the Sustainability Appraisal. As a result, the SA methodology and analysis of alternative sites is flawed in respect of its treatment of Green Belt issues.	Chris Stapleton
-----------------	-----------------------	--	-----------------

#### Soundness

SID127/S/SS2/1	Not Sound	Sustainability Appraisal Appendix G Paragraph 2.5 sets out SA criteria 1 to 4 (covering environmental considerations). They do not include green belt and this is an error of omission. SA methodology does not explain why sites must score 22, also fails to incorporate a weighting of the scoring according to the relative importance of the individual sustainability criteria. Not realistic to assume all criteria are of the same importance.	Chris Stapleton
----------------	-----------	--	-----------------

SID127/S/SS2/2	Not Sound	SA Appendix K page K103 sets out the approach to development in the green belt but given the absence of green belt as sustainability criteria there is no clarity over the influence of green belt in the SA process. Given the green belt status of H39, the continuing apparent lack of such a definition has a direct and overriding bearing on the suitability of this site, and yet there has been no indication as to whether this has been addressed. This goes against a fundamental principles of SA which is that all alternative housing sites should be appraised comprehensively and consistently against the same sustainability objective criteria for a fair comparisons. Page K108 referring to consultation responses from Preferred Options (June 2015) states that there were a mixture of objections to wording of the green belt policy, there is nothing in Regulation 19 SA (February 2018) to demonstrate these objections have been addressed. Overall lack of clarity, definition and consistency in the application of Green Belt policy within the SA process.	Chris Stapleton
----------------	-----------	---	-----------------

SID127/S/SS2/3	Not Sound	Green Belt policy has been inappropriately subsumed and considered in an inadequate and inconsistent way in the SA, under the wider and less well defined (than Green Belt) concept of landscape protection. It has to be said that landscape and setting are more nebulous and subjective than greenbelt which has been thoroughly tested by a great deal of scrutiny and case law.	Chris Stapleton
----------------	-----------	--	-----------------

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS4 York Central

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID118/Mod/SS4/2			Table 6.2, Site ST5 (York Central) against SAO6 (Reduce the need to travel) and SAO 7 (Greenhouse Gassses) - When originally proposed, this site was proposed to be linked to a Park and Ride site on the northern edge of the City by a light rail link. With the removal of this element of the scheme, it is increasingly likely that people will access this site by car. The impact of the development of this site upon SOA6 and SAO7 should be amended to "negative"	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/Mod/SS4/3			Table 6.2, Site ST5 (York Central) against SAO14 (Cultural Heritage) - We remain to beconvinced that the quantum of development being proposed (a total greater than the last iteration of the Plan proposed) is actually deliverable in a manner which will, not only, safeguard the significance of the numerous heritage assets in its vicinity but also not have significant knock-on effects upon the remainder of the historic core of York. The impact of the development of this site upon SOA14 should be amended to "uncertain".	Historic England - Ian Smith

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS9 Land East of Metcalfe Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/SS9/2			Table 6.2, Site ST7 (Land East of Metcalfe Lane) against SAO14 (Cultural Heritage) - Firstly, this site is prominent in views from the ring road. The development of this area would reduce the gap between the A64 and the edge of the built-up area from 1.3km, at its narrowest point, to just 575 metres. Secondly, this allocation will, in effect create a new freestanding settlement within the ring road under 160 metres from edge of the existing built-up area.	Historic England - Ian Smith
----------------	--	--	---	------------------------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/SS9/2			The impact of the development of this site upon SOA14 should be amended to "serious harm"	Historic England - Ian Smith
------------------	--	--	---	------------------------------



## SA/SEA

### Policy SS10 Land North of Monks Cross

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/SS10/2			Table 6.2, site ST8 (Land to the North of Monks Cross) against SAO14 (Cultural Heritage) - Firstly, the development of this site would substantially reduce the gap between the edge of the built-up area and the Ring Road and, as such, would adversely affect its rural setting of the City in this location. Secondly, it would start to enclose the western edge of the green wedge that is centred on Monk Stray. These wedges have been identified as one of the defining features of the special character of York. Thirdly, the open areas either side of Monk's Cross Link Road with the remnants of its historic field patterns contribute to the character of this area.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID357/S/SS10/1		Not Sound	A review of the Sustainability Appraisal for the proposed allocation and the alternative boundaries that have been put forward raises further questions over the proposed boundary of ST8 being put forward by the Council.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/SS10/2			The impact of the development of this site upon SOA14 should be amended to "serious harm".	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID357/Mod/SS10/2			This site should therefore form part of alternative site 914 as together these sites would naturally extend Huntington with the A1237 providing a strong defensible boundary.	ID Planning (Rachel Flounders) OBO Green Developments

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS11 Land North of Haxby

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID236/LC/SS11 (ST9)/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Beverley Jarman
SID384/LC/SS11/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Alan Christopher Price
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID115/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Surface water drainage is a problem here, Lowfield Drive area has been designated as a flood plain by the Environment Agency. 735 additional houses will have a huge impact on the infrastructure of the village, particularly the roads but also schools and health care. There is no room for expansion of the shops or parking facilities. Haxby and Wigginton health centre already at capacity. Impacts on congestion and air pollution are unacceptable, will diminish residents quality of life.	Louise Serra
SID236/S/SS11 (ST9)		Not Sound	The proposed development will overwhelm local infrastructure in terms of schools, NHS facilities, and roads.	Beverley Jarman
SID384/S/SS11/1		Not Sound	Haxby is experiencing congestion, strain on public services and pollution. Sustainability it not addressed in the plan.	Alan Christopher Price
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID115/Mod/SS11/1			Development should be focused around Poppleton which has a train station and new park and ride. If development must happen in Haxby an expansion of school facilities is needed, as is investment in roads and drainage capacity.	Louise Serra
SID236/Mod/SS11 (ST9)/1			1) Reduce the scale of the development amenities 2) Provide additional essential services and 3) Re-open Haxby railway station 4) Increase bus services to and from York	Beverley Jarman
SID384/Mod/SS11/1			There would have to be a major increase in the number of routes in and out of Haxby but seen as this is impossible the only feasible alternative is to reopen the rail station	Alan Christopher Price

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS12 Land West of Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID199/S/SS12/2			Significant change in Sustainability Appraisal Scoring between Preferred Sites and Pre-publication consultations. ST14 not sustainably appropriate to take forward for allocation.	Laura Fern Airedon OBO Mr J Harrison
-----------------	--	--	--	---

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID37/LC/SS13/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	3000 extra homes is not environmentally sound. Pollution and congestion is unacceptable. Infrastructure cannot cope and would be damaging to wildlife.	Becky Lingwood
SID413/LC/SS13/1/1		Not Legally Compliant		Richard Schofield
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID37/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Elvington is a peaceful village, this will be ruined by the development of ST15. There is already a lot of HGV traffic through the village and this will only get worse. Infrastructure cannot cope and wildlife will suffer. Very few of the houses will be affordable anyway.	Becky Lingwood
SID163/S/SS13/3		Not Sound	Contrary to National Planning Policy Framework – 1) To conserve and enhance the natural environment and reduce pollution 2) Allocations should prefer land of lesser environmental value 3) Ecological surveys must be less than 3 years old Sustainability Appraisal SA08 Biodiversity - This is assessed negatively as amber and unknown in the City of York Council Sustainability Appraisal. There is clearly potential impact on a SSSI and a SINC site as well as disturbance and destruction of habitat for protected species (barn owls and bats) and priority species (brown hares). The threat comes from 1. The necessary infrastructure to be developed both the process of developing and the outcome of additional heavily trafficked roadways 2. The building of ST15 over many years 3. The influx of people into the area Sustainability Appraisal SA09 Land Use - This is assessed negatively as red in the City of York Council Sustainability Appraisal. ST15 is partially a brown field site but it also includes green belt land and the creation of new infrastructure across virgin arable land is clearly contrary to the SA parameters for land use because 1. It requires a large amount of undeveloped land 2. It will introduce pollution 3. It does not safeguard soil quality but actively tarmacs over the best and most versatile agricultural land.	Catherine Rose Hilton
SID164/S/SS13/1		Not Sound	Most of my evidence is with supporting documents which I am sending to you as I cannot scan them. The main thrust is that Grimston Wood, on the north boundary of ST15 has been totally ignored - risking the progress it is making towards York biodiversity targets, and perhaps how support for this privately funded restoration could help mitigate the damage of the development, and help meet some of the access to nature reserve targets that are published. Action should be taken now to prevent friction with my grazing cattle in the restored pasture woodland in the future.	Ralph Hoyle
SID413/S/SS13/1/1		Not Sound	There is the clear potential that the site will disturb and destroy the natural habitats of protected species.	Richard Schofield

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID413/S/SS13/1/2			ST15 is partially a brown field site but it also includes green belt land and the creation of new infrastructure across virgin arable land is clearly contrary to the SA parameters for land use.	Richard Schofield
SID582/S/SS13/2		Not Sound	ST15 has been subjected to a Sustainability Appraisal but appears to score no differently to other Strategic Sites in terms of accessing all local services. Given its remoteness, this would suggest there is a flaw in the scoring system.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Michael Glover LLP - GM Ward Trust, Curry & Hudson
SID583/S/SS13 (ST15)/1			ST15 has been subjected to a Sustainability Appraisal but appears to score no differently to other Strategic Sites in terms of accessing all local services. Given its remoteness, this would suggest there is a flaw in the scoring system.	Johnson Mowat OBO Redrow Homes, GM Ward Trust, K Hudson, C Bowes & E Crocker
SID584/S/SS13(ST15 )2			SA scores ST15 no differently from other sites in spite of its remoteness to local services and distance from transport corridors. This would suggest a flaw in the scoring system.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Redrow Homes & Linden Homes
SID585/S/SS13(ST15 )2		Not Sound	SA scores ST15 no differently from other sites in spite of its remoteness to local services. This would suggest a flaw in the scoring system.	Johnson Mowat (Mark Johnson) OBO Taylor Wimpey UK Limited
SID848/S/SS13(ST15 )2			SA scores ST15 no differently from other sites in spite of its remoteness to local services and distance from transport corridors. This would suggest a flaw in the scoring system.	Johnson Mowatt OBO Avant Homes

**Proposed Modification**

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS13 Land West of Elvington Lane

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID163/Mod/SS13/2			In general, the revised local plan is an improvement on earlier unacceptable plans, but there are caveats. Mitigation measures need to be started 5 years before development as stated in SS13 (vii) not less than 4 years before as implied in 3.62 p 56. The council should clearly identify and justify the number of hectares of green belt arable land which will be lost to infrastructure for ST15 in addition to 139 Hectares in OS10 based on current realistic population forecasts for York. The access for pedestrians and cyclists to ST15 should be alongside the proposed new vehicle access to the A64 at Heslington East Campus, with no access at all from ST15 onto Langwith Stray, Langwith Lane or Long Lane. This would enable the existing single track lanes used by residents, farm machinery and existing businesses to continue unobstructed, better protect the SSSI, minimize the number of different greenbelt sites that are disrupted by infrastructure, and ensure that important habitats for barn owls and bats are retained with minimal disturbance. A full ecological survey of ST15, OS10 and the proposed infrastructure routes should be undertaken maximum 3 years prior to development commencing	Catherine Rose Hilton
SID164/Mod/SS13/1			Consideration given to Grimston Wood - how to protect the gains made, how to encourage further advancement to meet York's biodiversity targets, and whether a compromise can be found to allow access to nature for residents	Ralph Hoyle
SID383/Mod/SS13/2			Natural England notes and welcomes the assessment against objective 8 in the Sustainability Appraisal which we consider to be detailed and accurate. We agree with the scoring given and the weighting applied alongside other sustainability concerns. We note para 7.1.9 states that no appropriate alternatives could be found and the reasons for this and that the spatial strategy and allocation are determined to be the most sustainable option despite the potential impacts identified in relation to the biodiversity objective. Natural England defers to City of York council on these matters but would welcome further elucidation regarding how competing sustainability concerns were weighed against each other.	Natural England - Merlin Ash
SID413/Mod/SS13/1/1			The council should clearly identify and justify the number of hectares of green belt arable land which will be lost to infrastructure for ST15 in addition to 139 Hectares in OS10.	Richard Schofield
SID413/Mod/SS13/1/2			All access to ST15 should be via proposed new roadways with no access at all from ST15 onto Langwith Stray, Langwith Lane or Long Lane.	Richard Schofield
SID413/Mod/SS13/1/3			A full ecological survey of t ST15, OS10 and the proposed infrastructure routes should be undertaken maximum 3 years prior to development commencing.	Richard Schofield

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS16 Land at Tadcaster Road, Copmanthorpe

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/SS16/3			Table 6.2, Site ST31 (Land to the south of Tadcaster Road, Copmanthorpe) against SAO14 (Cultural Heritage) - Firstly, this site is perceived as being very much a part of the swathe of open countryside to the south of the ring road. Although the railway runs to the south of Site ST31, the perception is of a rail line running through open countryside rather than an area which has been severed from the surrounding landscape by the railway. Secondly, the relationship of the historic city of York to the surrounding villages is one of the elements identified as contributing to the special character of York. This relationship relates to not simply the distance between the settlements but also the size of the villages themselves, and the fact that they are freestanding, clearly definable settlements.	Historic England - Ian Smith
-----------------	--	--	---	------------------------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/SS16/1			The impact of the development of this site upon SOA14 should be amended to "serious harm".	Historic England - Ian Smith
-------------------	--	--	--	------------------------------

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS18 Station Yard, Wheldrake

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID35/S/SS18/1			As children who live in the village have already been turned away from the Primary School as it is full, it is only fair the school is expanded before any more development. Village is growing faster than the infrastructure can provide, roads cannot handle this and will cause considerable air pollution, The site has previously been refused by an inspector.	David Dick
SID342/S/SS18/2		Not Sound	Each SA objective (1 to 15 including summary) has been referenced (see response) and has been highlighted as being inappropriately assessed for this site.	Andy Bell
<b>Proposed Modification</b>				
SID342/Mod/SS18/2			Remove ST33/Site 855 from the plan, the SA is incorrect and it appears to be based on the site as H49 which failed the SA. There is no reason to think it is still suitable for development	Andy Bell



## SA/SEA

### Policy SS19 Queen Elizabeth Barracks, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID345/S/SS19/16	Not Sound		Objective 9 - DIO opposes only a + scoring on this objective. It is submitted that the site is previously developed and redevelopment of the site would therefore 're-use previously developed land' and a ++ score is considered more appropriate for this indicator. The Sports Ground for example within the site boundary is not proposed for redevelopment, and therefore the concept masterplan submitted in relation to the QEB site should not attract a negative score in relation to this land use objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS19/17	Not Sound		Objective 13 - CYC SA score '?/0' DIO proposed score '+/0'.DIO has produced a Flood Risk Appraisal (December 2017) to support redevelopment of the site. As such is considered that a +/0 scoring is considered more appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

#### Proposed Modification

SID345/MOD/SS19/11	Not Sound		Objective 9 of SA - CYC SA score '+/-' DIO proposed score '++/-'.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS19/12			Objective 13 - CYC SA score '?/0' DIO proposed score '+/0'.DIO has produced a Flood Risk Appraisal (December 2017) to support redevelopment of the site. As such is considered that a +/0 scoring is considered more appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS20 Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID345/S/SS20/15	Not Sound		Objective 6 - CYC SA score ‘+/-’ DIO proposed score ‘+/-’.The Transport Appraisal produced by DIO for Imphal Barracks (December 2017) concluded that “in principle, there are no overriding reasons, from a transportation perspective, that could prevent this site from being redeveloped and thus being allocated for residential development within the emerging City of York Local Plan. The Site is an occupied brownfield site with existing traffic generation and situated in a highly sustainable location for redevelopment into residential.” As such it is submitted that a score of ‘+/-’ is considered more appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/16	Not Sound		Objective 9 - CYC SA score ‘+/-’ DIO proposed score ‘+’. DIO opposes –ve scoring on this objective. The site is previously developed and redevelopment of the site would therefore ‘re-use previously developed land’. The Sports Ground for example within the site boundary is not proposed for redevelopment, and therefore the concept masterplan submitted in relation to the IB site should not attract a negative score in relation to this land use objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/SS20/17	Not Sound		Objective 13 - CYC SA score ‘?’, DIO proposed score ‘+/-’.A Flood Risk Appraisal was prepared by DIO to support Imphal Barracks in December 2017. The report acknowledges that Flood Risk Assessment will be required as part of any future planning application and that provided appropriate mitigation measures are incorporated into the final layout and design, then the site can be developed in a way that manages flood risk. The report thus concludes that “Imphal Barracks is suitable for residential allocation within the CYC Local Plan, and the flood risk issues can be mitigated accordingly.” As such a ‘+/-’ score is considered appropriate. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

#### Proposed Modification

SID345/MOD/SS20/7			Objective 6 - CYC SA score ‘+/-’ DIO proposed score ‘+/-’.The Transport Appraisal produced by DIO for Imphal Barracks (December 2017) concluded that “in principle, there are no overriding reasons, from a transportation perspective, that could prevent this site from being redeveloped and thus being allocated for residential development within the emerging City of York Local Plan. The Site is an occupied brownfield site with existing traffic generation and situated in a highly sustainable location for redevelopment into residential.” As such it is submitted that a score of ‘+/-’ is considered more appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/SS20/8			Objective 9 - CYC SA score ‘+/-’ DIO proposed score ‘+’. DIO opposes –ve scoring on this objective. The site is previously developed and redevelopment of the site would therefore ‘re-use previously developed land’. The Sports Ground for example within the site boundary is not proposed for redevelopment, and therefore the concept masterplan submitted in relation to the IB site should not attract a negative score in relation to this land use objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS20 Imphal Barracks, Fulford Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/MOD/SS20/ 9			Objective 13 - CYC SA score '?', DIO proposed score '+/0'.A Flood Risk Appraisal was prepared by DIO to support Imphal Barracks in December 2017. The report acknowledges that Flood Risk Assessment will be required as part of any future planning application and that provided appropriate mitigation measures are incorporated into the final layout and design, then the site can be developed in a way that manages flood risk. Te report thus concludes that "Imphal Barracks is suitable for residential allocation within the CYC Local Plan, and the flood risk issues can be mitigated accordingly." As such a '+/0' score is considered appropriate. Achange to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS22 University of York Expansion

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/SS22/2			Table 6.2, Site ST27 (University of York Expansion Site) against SAO14 (Cultural Heritage) - Firstly, this area is prominent in views from the A64. The expansion of the University to the extent of the area identified would bring development very close to the Ring Road. This will fundamentally change the relationship which the southern edge of York has with the countryside to its south. It will also alter people's perceptions when travelling along this route about the setting of the City within an area of open countryside. Secondly, the expansion of the university towards the ring road could also harm the relationship which the historic city of York has to the surrounding villages.	Historic England - Ian Smith
-----------------	--	--	---	------------------------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/SS22/2			The impact of the development of this site upon SOA14 should be amended to "serious harm".	Historic England - Ian Smith
-------------------	--	--	--	------------------------------

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS23 Land at Northminster Business Park

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/SS23/1			Table 6.2, Site ST19 (Northminster Business Park) against SAO14 (Cultural Heritage) - In order to retain the separation between the Business Park and nearby villages, the southern extent of this area should not extend any further south than the existing car park to the south of Redwood House.	Historic England - Ian Smith
-----------------	--	--	---	------------------------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/SS23/2			The impact of the development of this site upon SOA14 should be amended to "serious harm".	Historic England - Ian Smith
-------------------	--	--	--	------------------------------

## SA/SEA

### Policy SS24 Whitehall Grange, Wigginton Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/SS24/2

Table 6.2, Site ST37 (Whitehall Grange) against SAO14 (CulturalHeritage) - The loss of this site and its subsequent development would result in the considerable narrowing of this wedge and harm one of the key elements identified in the Heritage Topic Paper as contributing to the special character and setting of York.

Historic England -  
Ian Smith

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/SS24/2

The impact of the development of this site upon SOA14 should be amended to "serious harm".

Historic England -  
Ian Smith

## SA/SEA

### E16 Poppleton Garden Centre

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID118/S/E16/1			Table 6.3, Site E16 (Poppleton Garden Centre) against SAO14 (Cultural Heritage) - Whilst we have no objection to the redevelopment of that part of the site which is currently occupied by buildings, residential development should not be allowed in the undeveloped area to the south of the existing buildings.	Historic England - Ian Smith
----------------	--	--	---	------------------------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID118/Mod/E16/1			The impact of development of this site upon SOA14 should be amended to "serious harm".	Historic England - Ian Smith
------------------	--	--	--	------------------------------

## SA/SEA

### E18 Towthorpe Lines, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID345/S/E18/4	Not Sound		Objective 3 - YC SA score ‘-’ DIO proposed score ‘+/0’.Given proposed retention of existing employment use, suggest a +/0 scoring is most appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/E18/5	Not Sound		Objective 5/6 - CYC SA score ‘ ’ DIO proposed score ‘ /0’.Given proposed retention of existing employment use, suggest a neutral scoring is most appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/E18/6	Not Sound		Objective 8 - CYC SA score ‘--’ DIO proposed score ‘-’.Given site is previously developed land and seeks to retain the existing employment use, a - scoring is considered more appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/E18/7	Not Sound		Objective 15 - CYC SA score ‘--’ DIO proposed score ‘-’.Existing employment use will not change, and therefore - impact is considered more appropriate. Scale and massing considerations need to be taking into account, but in general terms redevelopment will have a neutral change on surrounding landscape. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

#### Proposed Modification

SID345/MOD/E18/4			Objective 3 - YC SA score ‘-’ DIO proposed score ‘+/0’.Given proposed retention of existing employment use, suggest a +/0 scoring is most appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/E18/5			Objective 5/6 - CYC SA score ‘ ’ DIO proposed score ‘ /0’.Given proposed retention of existing employment use, suggest a neutral scoring is most appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation



## SA/SEA

### E18 Towthorpe Lines, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID345/MOD/E18/6			Objective 8 - CYC SA score '--' DIO proposed score '-'. Given site is previously developed land and seeks to retain the existing employment use, a - scoring is considered more appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/E18/7			Objective 15 - CYC SA score '--' DIO proposed score '-'. Existing employment use will not change, and therefore - impact is considered more appropriate. Scale and massing considerations need to be taking into account, but in general terms redevelopment will have a neutral change on surrounding landscape. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## SA/SEA

### Policy H1 Housing Allocations

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID115/S/H1(policy)/1	Not Sound		Objects to development. Building on green belt, will harm habitats for wildlife, Haxby infrastructure (drainage, roads, health care, schools) cannot cope, brownfield should be prioritised. Development should be focused around Poppleton which has a train station and new park and ride. Development here will exacerbate existing congestion problems and negatively impacts residents quality of life.	Louise Serra
-----------------------	-----------	--	--	--------------

#### Proposed Modification

SID594/Mod/H1 (policy)/3			Site ST7: Alternative Site Size proposed: Option A: 845 houses in an area of 43.53ha, 60% net developable area 26.4Ha at 32dph.	Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7
SID594/Mod/H1 (policy)/6			Option 2. 945 houses on an area of 43.53Ha, 70% net developable area - 30.47 Ha net site area at 32dph.	Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7
SID594/Mod/H1 (policy)/9			Option 3: 1,225 Homes on an area of 57.27 Ha, 70% net developable area – 40.1 Ha net site area at 32dph.	Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7

## SA/SEA

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID127/S/H39/1		Not Sound	SA methodology states 'whilst the general extent of the draft Green Belt was indentified in the former RSS and is retained as applicable policy for York, the emerging Local Plan will be setting detailed Green Belt boundaries for the first time.' this was taken to mean parcels of land around York were being assessed to understand the significance and contribution that is made towards Green Belt objectives by such parcels. Not aware of the results or if such an assessment took place, it remains the case however that until the Plan is adopted H39 is greenbelt. Statement that '... the site represents a modest extension to the existing village of Elvington and would provide a logical rounding off of the settlement limits. Therefore the site is not considered to serve greenbelt purposes' seems to pre-empt the above assessment. Unclear whether this assessment has been carried out in a way that has been the subject of public consultation, also the 'rounding off of settlements' seems a subjective analysis that appears convenient when looking at a map but not negate the contribution of land thus lost from the green belt. Variability of the urban fringe is a quality that contributes to the character of landscape around villages in the greenbelt.	Chris Stapleton
SID127/S/H39/2		Not Sound	SA Appendix F - H39 is not a strategic site, it is approximately 1.25 ha and would make a small contribution to the house-building target, yet it would have a disproportionate effect on the openness of the greenbelt in this part of Elvington.	Chris Stapleton
SID127/S/H39/3		Not Sound	SA Appendix J GB1 to GB4 Page J110 states there are 'potential negative effects' on the green belt without explaining what these negative effects would be. The significance of these negative effects is ignored. This appendix also states that 'monitoring (the effects of housing on the green belt) can be applied' without saying whether the monitoring will actually be carried out, or how and when this would be carried out in time to have a meaningful influence on the SA process. Given the Green Belt status of site H39 this is a significant omission which undermines the soundness of the plan.	Chris Stapleton
SID127/S/H39/4		Not Sound	Appendix B of the SA sets out a schedule of responses received to the various consultations, in this it states I have failed to give details of the negative effects of developing site H39. It is not for me to do the council's job but I would refer to my comments on referred to in the Preferred Sites Consultation Document July 2016 which state a planning inspector has previously concluded the site 'served greenbelt purposes and that this development would radically alter the character of the village'. Emphasis on radical. My point is that the council has failed to adequately address green belt issues in the SA and there is no clarity over the influence of green belt in the SA process. What I am saying is that the council's lack of a settled Green Belt policy (including boundaries) undermines the SA's conclusion that site H39 is suitable for development. The SA scoring system fails to give sufficient weight to green belt issues. Furthermore, para 6.6.47 of the SA states 'No significant negative effects were identified during the appraisal of Green Belt policies'. What this does not address is whether the development of sites like H39 would have negative effects on the green belt in those locations. As green belt issues are not directly addressed by the SA we can only reasonably anticipate such significant negative effects.	Chris Stapleton

### Proposed Modification

## SA/SEA

### Site H39 North of Church Lane Elvington

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID37/Mod/H39/1			ST15 is not acceptable. Building 32 houses at H39 is more reasonable and will have an acceptable impact on the village of Elvington. The Travelling Show people should be allowed to stay as they bring diversity to the village without causing pollution or impacting the environment.	Becky Lingwood
SID127/Mod/H39/1			SA methodology states 'whilst the general extent of the draft Green Belt was indentified in the former RSS and is retained as applicable policy for York, the emerging Local Plan will be setting detailed Green Belt boundaries for the first time.' this was taken to mean parcels of land around York were being assessed to understand the significance and contribution that is made towards Green Belt objectives by such parcels. Not aware of the results or if such an assessment took place, it remains the case however that until the Plan is adopted H39 is greenbelt. Statement that '... the site represents a modest extension to the existing village of Elvington and would provide a logical rounding off of the settlement limits. Therefore the site is not considered to serve greenbelt purposes' seems to pre-empt the above assessment. Unclear whether this assessment has been carried out in a way that has been the subject of public consultation, also the 'rounding off of settlements' seems a subjective analysis that appears convenient when looking at a map but not negate the contribution of land thus lost from the green belt. Variability of the urban fringe is a quality that contributes to the character of landscape around villages in the greenbelt.	Chris Stapleton
SID127/Mod/H39/2			SA Appendix F - H39 is not a strategic site, it is approximately 1.25 ha and would make a small contribution to the house-building target, yet it would have a disproportionate effect on the openness of the greenbelt in this part of Elvington.	Chris Stapleton
SID127/S/H39/3			SA Appendix J GB1 to GB4 Page J110 states there are 'potential negative effects' on the green belt without explaining what these negative effects would be. The significance of these negative effects is ignored. This appendix also states that 'monitoring (the effects of housing on the green belt) can be applied' without saying whether the monitoring will actually be carried out, or how and when this would be carried out in time to have a meaningful influence on the SA process. Given the Green Belt status of site H39 this is a significant omission which undermines the soundness of the plan.	Chris Stapleton
SID127/Mod/H39/4			Appendix B of the SA sets out a schedule of responses received to the various consultations, in this it states I have failed to give details of the negative effects of developing site H39. It is not for me to do the council's job but I would refer to my comments on referred to in the Preferred Sites Consultation Document July 2016 which state a planning inspector has previously concluded the site 'served greenbelt purposes and that this development would radically alter the character of the village'. Emphasis on radical. My point is that the council has failed to adequately address green belt issues in the SA and there is no clarity over the influence of green belt in the SA process. What I am saying is that the council's lack of a settled Green Belt policy (including boundaries) undermines the SA's conclusion that site H39 is suitable for development. The SA scoring system fails to give sufficient weight to green belt issues. Furthermore, para 6.6.47 of the SA states 'No significant negative effects were identified during the appraisal of Green Belt policies'. What this does not address is whether the development of sites like H39 would have negative effects on the green belt in those locations. As green belt issues are not directly addressed by the SA we can only reasonably anticipate such significant negative effects.	Chris Stapleton

## SA/SEA

### Site H56 Land at Hull Road

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Soundness</b>				
SID418/S/H56/1	Not Sound		Objecting to the sustainability appraisal for site H56. Rep goes into great detail on HIA violating criteria 3 and 6, lack of strategic environmental assessment.	Save Windmill Lane Playing Fields - Chris Wedgwood

## SA/SEA

### Site H59 Queen Elizabeth Barracks – Howard Road, Strensall

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Soundness

SID345/S/H59/2	Not Sound		<p>Objective 5/6 -CYC SA score ‘ ’ i.e. ‘depends on policy implementation’ DIO proposed score ‘+ ’. The Transport Appraisal (Dec 2017) in support of the QEB site concludes that “in principle, there are no overriding reasons, from a transportation perspective, that would prevent this site QEB from being redeveloped for residential purposes at the scale proposed in the draft allocation. Any improvements required to the local highway and existing bus service would need to be subject to consultation with the Local Highways Authority.” (Section 7, Page 31). As such a +  score is considered more appropriate. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.</p>	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/S/H59/3	Not Sound		<p>Objective 13 - CYC SA score ‘-’ DIO proposed score ‘+ ’. The Flood Risk Appraisal (December 2017) produced by DIO for QEB includes the H59 Local Housing Allocation to support redevelopment of the site. The report notes that constraints identified (i.e. management of surface water and ground water flood risk) can be overcome through appropriate design and mitigation measures within the proposed development. As such is considered that a +  scoring is considered more appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.</p>	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

#### Proposed Modification

SID345/MOD/H59/2			<p>Objective 5/6 -CYC SA score ‘ ’ i.e. ‘depends on policy implementation’ DIO proposed score ‘+ ’. The Transport Appraisal (Dec 2017) in support of the QEB site concludes that “in principle, there are no overriding reasons, from a transportation perspective, that would prevent this site QEB from being redeveloped for residential purposes at the scale proposed in the draft allocation. Any improvements required to the local highway and existing bus service would need to be subject to consultation with the Local Highways Authority.” (Section 7, Page 31). As such a +  score is considered more appropriate. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.</p>	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation
SID345/MOD/H59/3			<p>Objective 13 - CYC SA score ‘-’ DIO proposed score ‘+ ’. The Flood Risk Appraisal (December 2017) produced by DIO for QEB includes the H59 Local Housing Allocation to support redevelopment of the site. The report notes that constraints identified (i.e. management of surface water and ground water flood risk) can be overcome through appropriate design and mitigation measures within the proposed development. As such is considered that a +  scoring is considered more appropriate for this objective. A change to the scoring to reflect this is requested.</p>	GVA (Tim Collard) OBO Defence Infrastructure Organisation

## SA/SEA

### Policy GI5 Protection of Open Space and Playing Fields

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
--------------------	---------------------	------------------------	--	---------------

#### Legal Compliance

SID825/LC/GI5/3	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Osboldwick Parish Council Meadlands Residents Association
-----------------	-------------------	-----------------------	--	---

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
<b>Legal Compliance</b>				
SID17/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Would answer don't know if there was the option to. Doesn't have the knowledge / information to answer	Frank Ingledew
SID115/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Residents have been informed throughout.	Louise Serra
SID119/LC/Gen/2			Linked to incorporation of Water Framework Directive policy into the plan. Potential issues relating to Duty to cooperate if no modification. Potential modifications suggested.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID163/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Contrary to Wildlife and countryside act 1981- Illegal to disturb protected species or destroy their resting places and breeding sites. Contrary to the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006, section 40, to conserve biodiversity.	Catherine Rose Hilton
SID164/LC/Gen/1	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant	Not qualified to judge these, had to fill in to complete the form.	Ralph Hoyle
SID233/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		York Green Party
SID272/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	I consider all documents to be legally compliant. I support and agree with CYC processes, procedures and justification and I am satisfied that all documents are legally compliant	Rachel Cole
SID316/LC/Gen/2	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Stuart Kay
SID372/LC/Gen/2				Gladman Developments - Helen Ball
SID383//LC/Gen/2	Does not comply with DtC	Not Legally Compliant		Natural England - Merlin Ash



## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID404/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Haven't examined this question in detail, and are not in a position to comment further.	York Bus Forum - Graham Collett
SID594/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO TW Fields ST7
SID595/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant		Paul Butler Planning OBO Barratt Homes & David Wilson Homes
SID651/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Carr
SID652/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Hind
SID653/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Oliver Hind
SID654/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Michael Fedyszyn
SID655/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Hilary Fedyszyn
SID656/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Daniel Buckley
SID657/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Timothy Duffy
SID658/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kristen Buckley

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID659/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Emily McLaughlin
SID660/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paula McLaughlin
SID661/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Christopher McLaughlin
SID662/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Margaret Moxon
SID663/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Moira Law
SID664/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robert Law
SID665/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Brian Ferguson
SID666/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Hirst
SID667/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Grace Hirst
SID668/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Findlay Wallace
SID669/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joan Wallace

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID670/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tim Harrison
SID671/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Phoebe Harrison
SID672/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Bryony Harrison
SID673/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	James Ogram
SID674/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Eric Wilson
SID675/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Diane Brownlee
SID676/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Irene Wilson
SID677/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Lenore Janet Hill
SID678/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Grewer
SID679/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robert Brownlee
SID680/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Linda Hill

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID681/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Clare Frisby
SID682/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Carol Ferguson
SID683/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Heather Heeles
SID684/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Ronald Hill
SID685/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Colin Perrott
SID686/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Ruth Perrott
SID687/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Adams
SID688/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Gillian Adams
SID689/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Michael Buckley
SID690/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Karen Buckley
SID691/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Beverley Duffy

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID692/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Greenaway
SID693/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sally Greenaway
SID694/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Abigail Sutton
SID695/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	William Marsh
SID696/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Bernadette Sutton
SID697/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sue Glenn
SID698/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Hazel Sedman
SID699/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	James Muldoon
SID700/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Karen Kingston
SID701/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Janet Muldoon
SID702/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tony Morton

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID703/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	June Morton
SID704/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jonathan Browne
SID705/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Darren Robson
SID706/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Hurst
SID707/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Hogarth
SID708/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Sutton
SID709/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Julie Tink
SID710/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Graham Tink
SID711/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Andrew Milner
SID712/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sue Nightingale
SID713/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Keren Hunter

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID714/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Gillian Hodgson
SID715/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robyn Hodgson
SID716/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Richard Muldoon
SID717/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Claire & Paul Savage
SID718/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Michael Wright
SID719/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Wendy Wright
SID720/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Alison Smithers
SID721/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joanne Todd
SID722/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joan Louise Lambert
SID723/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter William Lambert
SID724/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Woodward

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID725/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Julie Woodward
SID726/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Cuttill
SID727/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Eric Boyd
SID728/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Anne Diley
SID729/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	James Wilson
SID730/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Matthew Wilson
SID731/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Catherine Wilson
SID732/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sylvia McBriar
SID733/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Katie Savage
SID734/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Savage
SID735/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Simon Jowett



## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID736/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Emily Olivia Blanehard
SID737/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter Jowett
SID738/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kay Jowett
SID739/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Christopher Green
SID740/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tony Green
SID741/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Katherine Green
SID742/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Milagres Green
SID743/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Susan Carter
SID744/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Harry & Paul Savage
SID745/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Lazonby
SID746/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Susan Smith

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID747/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Smith
SID748/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Harvey Walker
SID749/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Barbara Walker
SID750/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Claire Maton
SID751/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Emily Flood
SID752/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kate Hind
SID753/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Marshall
SID754/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Glyn Welsby
SID755/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tracey Welsby
SID756/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Freda Gill
SID757/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Elizabeth Tuxford

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID758/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	George Tuxford
SID759/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Trevor Taylor
SID760/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Conor McGilligan
SID761/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jack McGilligan
SID762/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jacqueline McGilligan
SID763/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Diana Cuthbert
SID764/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter Cuthbert
SID765/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Rita Lavender
SID766/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Judi Steel
SID767/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Keith Lavender
SID768/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Steel

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID769/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jeanette Chavda
SID770/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Nitin Chavda
SID771/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Vanessa Jowett
SID772/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Matthew Jowett
SID773/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Walters
SID774/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Paul Rollinson
SID775/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Doug Abernethy
SID776/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joseph Glover
SID777/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Catherine Mary Driver
SID778/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Anna Rollinson
SID779/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Tom Harrington

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID780/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Wilson
SID781/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jeff Brewer
SID782/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Kevin Reilly
SID783/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jane Harrington
SID784/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Richard Kingston
SID785/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Robert Nigel Ellenker
SID786/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Will Jennings
SID787/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Julie Jennings
SID788/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Peter Jennings
SID789/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Malcolm Carter
SID790/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	David Wales

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID791/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Holly Lee
SID792/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joan Wales
SID793/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Judy Noble
SID794/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Victoria Green
SID795/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Sharon Moore
SID796/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Catherine Tomlinson
SID797/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Eric Tomlinson
SID798/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jane Cuttill
SID799/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joanne Travena
SID800/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Alan Travena
SID801/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Avril Browne

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID802/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Donald Glenn
SID803/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Ian McGilligan
SID804/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Lynda Carr
SID805/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Joyce Carr
SID806/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jane Blair
SID807/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Mark Bishop
SID808/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Karen Cariss
SID809/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Roger Blair
SID810/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Christine Walters
SID811/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Jordane Thompson
SID812/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stephen Noble

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID813/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Roger Pryor
SID814/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Carol Marshman
SID815/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Stuart Auton
SID816/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	John Diley
SID817/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Pauline Brill
SID818/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Andrew Hodgson
SID819/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Anthony Brill
SID820/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Alice Hirst
SID821/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Pamela Ogram
SID822/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Becki Linfoot
SID823/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Fiona Hirst



## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID824/LC/Gen/3	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	Support and agree with CYC processes, Procedures and justifications	Yvonne Dodd
SID827/LC/Gen/1	Complies with DtC	Legally Compliant	No comment made	Pilcher Homes Ltd

### Soundness

SID17/S/Gen/1		Sound	Would answer don't know if that was an option.	Frank Ingledew
SID118/S/Gen/6		Sound	On the whole, we would broadly endorse the evaluation of the likely impact which the Policies and proposals of the Plan might have upon the historic environment and, where an adverse effect has been identified, the proposed mitigation measures which have been proposed to reduce that harm. pleased to note that many of the comments which we made to the previous version of the Appraisal have been incorporated into this latest iteration of the document	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/Gen/7		Not Sound	Para 1.7.2 et seq - As part of the Reg. 18 Consultation on the Pre- Publication Draft last year, views were invited on the content of the Heritage Impact Appraisal. However, it does not appear that there has been any consideration by the local planning authority of any of the comments submitted by consultees regarding that document nor has the appraisal been updated. Moreover, as one of the key documents which underpins the Sustainability Appraisal, the Heritage Impact Appraisal should have been included as an appendix to the SA.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID118/S/Gen/8			Table 6.2, SAO14 (Cultural Heritage) - The Heritage Impact Appraisal evaluates the impact of each of the allocations against each of the six Principal Characteristics of the City which are set out in the Heritage Topic Paper. However, Heritage Impact Appraisal does not make an overall conclusion about the likely impact of each of those sites upon the historic environment. Consequently, it is not clear how Table 6.2 (or, indeed, any of the tables in Appendix I) has arrived at its assessment of the likely impact of each of the sites upon SAO14.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID119/S/Gen/2			Welcome additions to baseline 4.14 and Objective 10 (section 5.2) based on previous comments made.	Environment Agency - Nick Beyer
SID127/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Whole process of developing the Local Plan - the complexity, volume of detail and technical information has been an exercise in excluding all but the most persistent, informed and skilled professional practitioners. Whole process has been hostile to members of the public, leaves the general impression of working back from the preferred site options and an emphasis on 'process over product'.	Chris Stapleton

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID233/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The sustainability indicators proposed are too generic when compared with indicators set out in LTP3 Table 6.2,6.3. Reference should be made in SA Appx L obj 6 to infrastructure within the Local Plan not LTP3 which is out of date.	York Green Party
SID306/LC/Gen/3		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	Y Boynton
SID307/LC/Gen/3		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	G Greetham
SID308/LC/Gen/3		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	NDM 3
SID309/LC/Gen/3		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	Brian L Bell
SID310/LC/Gen/3		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	Richard Rafton
SID311/LC/Gen/3		Sound	I judge that the Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies map, SA/SEA to be sound.	M Ellis
SID393/S/Gen/1		Sound	Overall, I judge that the City of York: Local Plan Publication Draft, Policies Map, Sustainability Appraisal and Strategic Environmental Assessment to be 'sound' documents. However, more specifically, I feel the following principles within the current draft of the Local Plan are crucial for the future development of York: The plan gives good protection of York's Greenbelt, protecting our unique City. Given that population figures are predicted to be lower than estimated by the Government, the plan provides enough houses for the people of York. From delivering roughly 500 houses per annum, to nearly 1000 house per annum, I believe that through the housing delivered under the plan, affordability will be improved in York. I am confident that with the current draft of the Local Plan, York will be able to provide sustainable development across the City and deliver a balance between providing new homes and delivering more employment, whilst protecting the City's special character.	Cllr N Ayre

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID404/S/Gen/2		Not Sound	Specifically in relation to the Transport aspects of the SA: Para 4.11.9 - pleased that the Council recognise that "Co-location of development with sustainable transport is paramount and without policy intervention, may not be achieved, negatively affecting the City's ambition to become a more sustainable and environmentally friendly city" - no clear proposals to provide bus services to serve these developments. Para 4.11.10 - not clear what policy interventions are proposed to address issue of net inward commutes to work creating an imbalance which impacts on the road network esp at peak times. Spatial Strategy Policies 6.5.8 - note that these policies include the "promotion of substantial transport solutions inc cycling and pedestrian routes" -needed to be accompanied by a significant increase in bus services. Para 6.5.11 - concerned that limited work has been done on reducing the need to travel (SA Objective 6), except in the NE area of York, particularly with the increase in the use of private cars in new developments. Also, despite recognition that "some of the strategic policies include sites set away from key areas of higher order service provision" there are no specific provisions to provide bus services to these areas. Strategic sites 6.5.26 - very concerned that 3 of the sites are "identified to have significant negative effects as they will likely exacerbate already congested roads (ST32 & ST36) or have limited transport options limiting accessibility using alternative modes to the car (ST26)". Para 6.5.27 - concerned that ST26, ST32 & ST36 were identified as having significant negative effects on air quality as result of transport. Para 6.5.28 - ST26 was assessed as having a significant negative effect on SA Objective 7, but apparently no proposals in the Plan to address the problem.	York Bus Forum - Graham Collett
SID404/S/GEN/3		Not Sound	Specifically in relation to the Transport aspects of the SA Appendix D (Baseline Analysis): Section on Sustainable Transport Modes - Bus Travel: No proposals to provide a better bus service to address the issue of providing a better bus service from areas of the City with the highest number of households without a car to other parts of York such as out of town developments. Section 6.2: Local Transport Plan: Note that since publication of LTP3, City of York Council has made successful bids to the national government's Local Sustainable Transport Fund (LSTF) and Better Bus Area Fund to implement various packages of sustainable transport measures to help realise this vision. Welcome the LSTF funded 'i-Travel York' programme which seeks to influence travel behaviour in favour of more sustainable and active forms of travel and thereby reduce the dependency on the private car. However, this has focused mainly on the north-east sector of York and there is no indication whether it will be extended more widely. Moreover the Plan does not appear to contain any evidence of the results of the programme.	York Bus Forum - Graham Collett
SID417/S/Gen/3		Sound		Cllr Ian Cuthbertson
SID581/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	The sustainable environmental assessment (SEA)/sustainability appraisal (SA) and site selection process that the council have undertaken through each stage of the Local Plan publication is unsound as it has been inconsistent, retrofitted with no evidence available to demonstrate that a reasonable range of alternative approaches have been evaluated in an SEA context prior to choices being made.	How Planning (Emma Jones) OBO Barwood Strategic Land II LLP

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID604/S/Gen/1		Not Sound	Whilst the Sustainability Appraisal considers the strategic sites against each other it fails to reassess them against legitimate alternatives such as the proposed urban extensions. In effect, the Sustainability Appraisal fails to provide a comparative assessment of urban extension Site 871: Land at North Field, York as a reasonable alternative against the selected sites.	Carter Jonas (Simon Grundy) OBO Gallagher Estates
SID651/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Carr
SID652/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Hind
SID653/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Oliver Hind
SID654/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Michael Fedyszyn
SID655/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Hilary Fedyszyn
SID656/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Daniel Buckley
SID657/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Timothy Duffy
SID658/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kristen Buckley
SID659/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Emily McLaughlin
SID660/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paula McLaughlin

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID661/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Christopher McLaughlin
SID662/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Margaret Moxon
SID663/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Moira Law
SID664/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robert Law
SID665/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Brian Ferguson
SID666/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Hirst
SID667/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Grace Hirst
SID668/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Findlay Wallace
SID669/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joan Wallace
SID670/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tim Harrison
SID671/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Phoebe Harrison

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID672/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Bryony Harrison
SID673/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	James Ogram
SID674/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Eric Wilson
SID675/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Diane Brownlee
SID676/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Irene Wilson
SID677/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Lenore Janet Hill
SID678/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Grewer
SID679/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robert Brownlee
SID680/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Linda Hill
SID681/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Clare Frisby
SID682/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Carol Ferguson

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID683/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Heather Heeles
SID684/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Ronald Hill
SID685/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Colin Perrott
SID686/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Ruth Perrott
SID687/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Adams
SID688/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Gillian Adams
SID689/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Michael Buckley
SID690/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Karen Buckley
SID691/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Beverley Duffy
SID692/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Greenaway
SID693/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sally Greenaway

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID694/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Abigail Sutton
SID695/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	William Marsh
SID696/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Bernadette Sutton
SID697/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sue Glenn
SID698/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Hazel Sedman
SID699/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	James Muldoon
SID700/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Karen Kingston
SID701/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Janet Muldoon
SID702/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tony Morton
SID703/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	June Morton
SID704/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jonathan Browne



## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID705/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Darren Robson
SID706/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Hurst
SID707/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Hogarth
SID708/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Sutton
SID709/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Julie Tink
SID710/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Graham Tink
SID711/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Andrew Milner
SID712/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sue Nightingale
SID713/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Keren Hunter
SID714/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Gillian Hodgson
SID715/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robyn Hodgson

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID716/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Richard Muldoon
SID717/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Claire & Paul Savage
SID718/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Michael Wright
SID719/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Wendy Wright
SID720/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Alison Smithers
SID721/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joanne Todd
SID722/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joan Louise Lambert
SID723/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter William Lambert
SID724/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Woodward
SID725/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Julie Woodward
SID726/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Cuttill

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID727/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Eric Boyd
SID728/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Anne Diley
SID729/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	James Wilson
SID730/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Matthew Wilson
SID731/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Catherine Wilson
SID732/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sylvia McBriar
SID733/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Katie Savage
SID734/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Savage
SID735/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Simon Jowett
SID736/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Emily Olivia Blanehard
SID737/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter Jowett

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID738/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kay Jowett
SID739/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Christopher Green
SID740/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tony Green
SID741/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Katherine Green
SID742/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Milagres Green
SID743/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Susan Carter
SID744/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Harry & Paul Savage
SID745/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Lazonby
SID746/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Susan Smith
SID747/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Smith
SID748/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Harvey Walker

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID749/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Barbara Walker
SID750/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Claire Maton
SID751/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Emily Flood
SID752/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kate Hind
SID753/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Marshall
SID754/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Glyn Welsby
SID755/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tracey Welsby
SID756/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Freda Gill
SID757/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Elizabeth Tuxford
SID758/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	George Tuxford
SID759/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Trevor Taylor

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID760/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Conor McGilligan
SID761/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jack McGilligan
SID762/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jacqueline McGilligan
SID763/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Diana Cuthbert
SID764/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter Cuthbert
SID765/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Rita Lavender
SID766/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Judi Steel
SID767/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Keith Lavender
SID768/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Steel
SID769/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jeanette Chavda
SID770/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Nitin Chavda

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID771/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Vanessa Jowett
SID772/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Matthew Jowett
SID773/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Walters
SID774/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Paul Rollinson
SID775/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Doug Abernethy
SID776/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joseph Glover
SID777/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Catherine Mary Driver
SID778/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Anna Rollinson
SID779/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Tom Harrington
SID780/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Wilson
SID781/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jeff Brewer

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID782/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Kevin Reilly
SID783/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jane Harrington
SID784/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Richard Kingston
SID785/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Robert Nigel Ellenker
SID786/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Will Jennings
SID787/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Julie Jennings
SID788/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Peter Jennings
SID789/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Malcolm Carter
SID790/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	David Wales
SID791/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Holly Lee
SID792/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joan Wales



## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID793/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Judy Noble
SID794/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Victoria Green
SID795/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Sharon Moore
SID796/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Catherine Tomlinson
SID797/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Eric Tomlinson
SID798/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jane Cuttill
SID799/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joanne Travena
SID800/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Alan Travena
SID801/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Avril Browne
SID802/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Donald Glenn
SID803/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Ian McGilligan

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID804/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Lynda Carr
SID805/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Joyce Carr
SID806/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jane Blair
SID807/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Mark Bishop
SID808/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Karen Cariss
SID809/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Roger Blair
SID810/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Christine Walters
SID811/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Jordane Thompson
SID812/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stephen Noble
SID813/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Roger Pryor
SID814/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Carol Marshman

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID815/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Stuart Auton
SID816/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	John Diley
SID817/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Pauline Brill
SID818/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Andrew Hodgson
SID819/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Anthony Brill
SID820/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Alice Hirst
SID821/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Pamela Ogram
SID822/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Becki Linfoot
SID823/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Fiona Hirst
SID824/S/Gen/3		Sound	The plan strikes the right balance between providing the homes and jobs York needs while protecting the greenbelt & historic character and setting of the city. The plan maintains amenity, sustainability and resilience of copmanthorpe	Yvonne Dodd
SID827/S//1		Not Sound	The SA and the SHLAA do not present sites in a heirarchy of Greenfield land for development and do not rank land according to agricultural land value and therefor do not comply with NPPF Para 112	Pilcher Homes Ltd

Proposed Modification

## SA/SEA

### General Comments

Unique comment ref	Complies with DtC ?	Legal Compliant/Sound?	Comments relating to Legal Compliance / DtC /Soundness or proposed modifications	Submitted By:
SID118/Mod/Gen/7			There needs to be a closer correlation between the conclusions of the Heritage Impact Appraisal and the SA.	Historic England - Ian Smith
SID233/Mod/Gen/1			SA Indicators Obj 6 amended to include key local indicators that monitor sustainable travel behaviour and access to public transport services year on year.	York Green Party